



City of Coral Gables
CITY COMMISSION MEETING
October 28, 2025

ITEM TITLE:

Case File COA (SP) 2024-027:

An Appeal to the Coral Gables City Commission from the decision of the Historic Preservation Board on September 18, 2025, to deny a claim of undue economic hardship and a certificate of appropriateness for demolition for the property located at 1258 Obispo Avenue, a contributing resource in the "Obispo Avenue Historic District", legally described as Lots 1 and 2, Block 3, Coral Gables Section "E," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 13 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

SUMMARY OF APPEAL:

The Historic Preservation Board, at a regularly scheduled meeting on Thursday, September 18, 2025, approved a motion to deny the claim for undue economic hardship and the application for a certificate of appropriateness for the demolition of the existing residence on the property located at 1258 Obispo Avenue, a Contributing Resource within the "Obispo Avenue Historic District", legally described as Lots 1 and 2, Block 3, Coral Gables Section "E," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 13 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0, Excused: 2)

Jennifer Ruiz and Javier Avila, the "Property Owners", have appealed that decision.

BACKGROUND:

In May of 2008, the "Obispo Avenue Historic District" was listed in the Coral Gables Register of Historic Places. It is comprised of residences abutting Obispo Avenue between Cortez Street on the east and Ferdinand Street on the west. 1258 Obispo Avenue is considered a contributing structure within the "Obispo Avenue Historic District." The residence, permitted in 1945 (permit #7110), was designed by architect William Merriam. The residence has undergone minor alterations over the years and retains a high level of historic integrity.

In 2014, a Special Certificate of Appropriateness (SCOA) was approved for a one-story addition to the residence. It was not built, and the COA expired.

In 2019, a SCOA for additions and alterations to the residence and sitework was approved with conditions by the Historic Preservation Board. It was not built.

In 2021, the Historic Preservation Board reviewed a request for a revision for the removal and replacement of the roof and floor framing due to their poor condition. The Board deferred the request and suggested a structural engineer be present at the next meeting. The applicant did not return to the Board and the proposal did not proceed.

Staff met with the current owners prior to their purchase of the property and explained the outcomes of the previous Board reviews.

The Historical Resources & Cultural Arts Department received a complete Certificate of Appropriateness application on December 8, 2022, from the Property Owners requesting design approval for the demolition of the existing residence.

On December 21, 2022, the Historical Preservation Board approved a motion to deny the demolition of the existing residence as the demolition is historically inappropriate, detracts from the integrity of the historic structure and the historic district, and is inconsistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The motion passed 9-0.

On December 28, 2022, the Property Owner submitted a Notice of Intent to Appeal the Board's Decision to the City Clerk. On February 7, 2023, the Property Owner submitted the completed appeals package to the City Clerk.

On February 28, 2023, the City Commission heard the Appeal and found that the decision of the Historic Preservation Board, to deny the special certificate of appropriateness for demolition of the Property, was based on competent substantial evidence, that due process was properly afforded to all interested parties, and that the essential requirements of law were met, specifically, that the Historic Preservation Board appropriately applied the guidelines for issuance of certificates. The appeal was hereby denied, and the decision of the Historic Preservation Board is affirmed, thereby upholding the denial of the issuance of a special certificate of appropriateness for demolition for 1258 Obispo Avenue.

The Historical Resources and Cultural Arts Department received an incomplete Certificate of Appropriateness application in March 2024 from the Property Owners claiming undue economic hardship and requesting design approval for the demolition of the existing residence. Staff worked with the applicant to meet all submittal requirements.

On September 18, 2025, the Historical Preservation Board rejected the claim of undue economic hardship, as it was not established the owner has been denied all reasonable beneficial use or return on the property per the findings and staff report AND denied the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the existing residence. (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0, Excused: 2)

On September 22, 2025, the Property Owner submitted a Notice of Intent to Appeal the Board's Decision to the City Clerk. Payment and application received on September 23, 2025.

ADVISORY BOARD/COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION(S):		
Date	Board/Committee	Recommendation
12/21/2022	Historic Preservation Board	Deny the application for the demolition of the existing residence at the property at 1258 Obispo Avenue (Ayes: 9, Nays: 0)
2/28/2023	City Commission	Deny the appeal and affirm the decision of the Historic Preservation Board to deny the issuance of a special certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of the property.

9/18/2025	Historic Preservation Board	Finding that the applicant has not met the standards for undue economic hardship and deny the application for the issuance of a special certificate of appropriateness for the demolition of the property.
-----------	-----------------------------	--

PUBLIC NOTIFICATION(S):

Date	
9/4/2025	Notice of Public Hearing to residents within a 1,000 foot radius for 10/16/2024 HPB meeting
9/8/2025	Posting on Miami Dade County's Legal Notices Website for 09/18/2025 HPB meeting
9/8/25	Posting of property for 09/18/2025 HPB meeting
10/2/25	Legal Ad Published for 10/14/2025 CC Meeting
10/2/25	Notice of Public Hearing mailed to residents 1,000 foot radius for CC meeting
10/14/25	Item was deferred to the 10/28/25 CC Meeting
10/17/25	Posting on Miami Dade County's Legal Notices Website for 10/28/25 CC meeting

ATTACHMENT(S):

See attached.