

CITY OF CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida Thursday, 4:01 p.m., September 19, 2019.

- PARTICIPANTS: BRUCE EHRENHAFT, Chairperson CESAR GARCIA-PONS, Board Member ALBERT MENENDEZ, Board Member XAVIER DURANA, Board Member RAUL R. RODRIGUEZ, Board Member MIKE SARDINAS, Board Member JANICE THOMSON, Board Member DONA SPAIN, Historic Preservation Officer KARA KAUTZ, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer GUSTAVO J. CEBALLOS, Assistant City Attorney YESENIA DIAZ, Administrative Assistant ---

1 "Lobbyist" is defined as an individual, 2 corporation, partnership or other legal entity employed or 3 retained, whether paid or not, by a principal who seeks 4 to, excuse me, seeks to encourage approval, disapproval, 5 adoption, repeal, passage, defeat or modifications of: 6 A, any ordinance, resolution, action or 7 decision of any city commissioner; 8 B, any action, decision, recommendation of 9 the city manager, any city board or committee, including, 10 but not limited to, quasi-judicial advisory board, trust, 11 authority or council; 12 Or, C any action, decision or recommendation 13 of city personnel during the time period of the entire 14 decision making process on the action, decision or 15 recommendation which foreseeably will be heard or reviewed 16 by the city commission or a city board or committee, 17 including, but not limited to, quasi-judicial advisory 18 board, trust, authority or council. 19 Presentations made to this board are subject 20 to the city's false claims ordinance, Chapter 39 of the 21 City of Coral Gables city code. 22 I now officially call the City of Coral 23 Gables Historic Preservation Board meeting of September 24 19, 2019, to order. The time is 4:04 p.m. 25 To my right are the following board members,

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Good afternoon. 2 Welcome to the regularly scheduled meeting of the City of 3 Coral Gables Historic Preservation Board. 4 We are residents of Coral Gables and are 5 charged with preservation and protection of historic or 6 architecturally worthy buildings, structures, sites, 7 neighborhoods, artifacts which impart a distinct 8 historical heritage to the city. 9 The board is comprised of nine members, seven 10 of whom are appointed by the commission, one by the city 11 manager, and the ninth is selected by the board and 12 confirmed by the commission. 13 Five members of the board constitute a 14 quorum, and five affirmative votes are necessary for the 15 adoption of any motion. 16 Any person who acts as a lobbyist pursuant to 17 the City of Coral Gables Ordinance Number 2006-11 must 18 register with the city clerk prior to engaging in lobbying 19 activities or presentations before city staff, boards, 20 committees, and/or city commission. A copy of the 21 ordinance is available in the city clerk's office. 22 Failure to register and provide proof of registration 23 shall prohibit your ability to present to the Historic 24 Preservation Board on applications under consideration 25 this afternoon.

1 Alicia Bache-Wiig, Xavier Durana, Cesar Garcia-Pons, and 2 to my left, Albert Menendez, Raul R. Rodriguez, Mike 3 Sardinas, and Janice E. Thompson. I am Bruce Ehrenhaft. 4 Staff present today from the Historical 5 Resources and Cultural Arts Department are department 6 director, Dona M. Spain, the city historic preservation 7 officer; department assistant director, Kara N. Kautz, the 8 city assistant historic preservation officer; and 9 departmental administrative assistant, Yesenia Diaz. 10 Okay. We will go on to approval of the 11 minutes. Are there any changes or corrections to be noted 12 by any member of the board? 13 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Yes. I have one. I saw a 14 word that was incorrect on my testimony on Page 67, Line 15 Ten. The word in the notes says "distant," and it was 16 meant to be "district." 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you. Are there any 18 other changes? Okay. If not, there's a -- the chair will 19 entertain a motion for approval of the minutes. 20 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I'll move with the 21 correction. 22 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. 23 MR. MENENDEZ: Second. 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Absent any further 25 discussion, may we call the voice vote then? All in

Page 5

1 favor of approval of the minutes, say Aye.
 2 THE BOARD MEMBERS: Aye (collectively).
 3 MR. EHRENHAFT: Any opposed, say Nay. Okay.
 4 Motion passes unanimously. Okay, right, okay.
 5 Regarding ex parte communications, please be
 6 advised that this board is a quasi-judicial board and the
 7 items on the agenda are quasi-judicial in nature which
 8 requires board members to disclose all ex parte
 9 communications.
 10 An ex parte communication is defined as any
 11 contact, communication, conversation, correspondence,
 12 memorandum or other written or verbal communication that
 13 takes place outside a public hearing between a member of
 14 the public and a member of the quasi-judicial board
 15 regarding matters to be heard by the quasi-judicial board.
 16 If anyone has made any contact with the board
 17 member, when the issue comes before the board, the member
 18 must state on the record the existence of the ex parte
 19 communication, the party who originated the communication,
 20 and whether the communication will affect the board
 21 member's ability to impartially consider the evidence to
 22 be presented regarding the matter. Okay.
 23 Miss Spain, I think I'll ask item by item if
 24 anybody has any ex parte communication.
 25 MS. SPAIN: That's fine.

Page 6

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Or should we just do them --
 2 MS. SPAIN: You can do it item by item. I
 3 don't know. That's a city attorney thing.
 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: What's clearer for you for
 5 the notes?
 6 THE COURT REPORTER: Item by item.
 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Item by item? Okay, all
 8 right. Then we'll do that. Okay, all right.
 9 I note from the revised agenda, Miss Spain,
 10 that there's one item that's been deferred. Are there any
 11 other deferrals?
 12 MS. SPAIN: Yes, let me just read the
 13 deferral. Case File COA (SP) 2019-012, that's a special
 14 certificate of appropriateness for the property at 700
 15 Alhambra Circle. That's been deferred.
 16 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, okay. Thank you.
 17 Okay, all right. Persons who are going to be testifying
 18 today need to be sworn in, so if there is anyone in the
 19 audience who will be testifying today, please rise to be
 20 sworn.
 21 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Please raise
 22 your right hand. Do you swear to tell the truth and
 23 nothing but the truth?
 24 (The audience members who will be testifying stated in the
 25 affirmative.)

Page 7

1 MS. SPAIN: I received an e-mail from John
 2 Fullerton. He's asking to be excused.
 3 He says, "I'm sorry that I'll be unable to
 4 attend today's board meeting as I have to take my wife to
 5 an appointment."
 6 I don't know whether he wants me to read this
 7 into the record, but it's a medical appointment, and so he
 8 is not able, he's not able to make it tonight.
 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Can I interject and
 10 ask if should we do a motion for an excused absence then?
 11 MS. SPAIN: Yes, yes.
 12 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Is there a motion?
 13 MR. RODRIGUEZ: So moved.
 14 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I'll second it.
 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. All in favor, say Aye.
 16 THE BOARD MEMBERS: Aye (collectively).
 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Anybody opposed? I can't
 18 imagine. Okay. No? Okay. Thank you. All right.
 19 Okay.
 20 Well, we will now proceed to public hearings
 21 on each of the cases that's on the agenda. The first
 22 group of properties are local historic designations, and
 23 the first case is Case Number --
 24 MS. KAUTZ: Can I interrupt you for a moment?
 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: I'm sorry. Certainly.

Page 8

1 MS. KAUTZ: We're going to do it a little, a
 2 little bit differently.
 3 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 4 MS. KAUTZ: Because the first three items
 5 share historic context and Country Club Prado context.
 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 7 MS. KAUTZ: We're going to present that first
 8 as applicable to all three and then start the designation.
 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 10 MS. KAUTZ: So you don't have to vote on
 11 anything I'm about to tell you. It's just the context
 12 portion of each report sort of consolidated, so we're
 13 going to start there.
 14 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you.
 15 MS. KAUTZ: Put the first item up on the
 16 Power Point, please.
 17 So again, we're presenting the historic
 18 context of the city and the Country Club Prado area first
 19 as a precursor to the three local historic designations as
 20 they're shared between them.
 21 The information should be considered as part
 22 of the complete record for each of the LHD case files to
 23 be considered today, which are LHD 2018-12, which is 2520
 24 Country Club Prado; LHD 2019-006, which is 1224 Country
 25 Club Prado; and LHD 2019-007, which is 1822 Country Club

1 Prado.

2 So for the Coral Gables developmental

3 history, it's divided broadly into three major

4 historic periods. The first is the Coral Gables initial

5 planning and development, the Florida land boom, all prior

6 to the hurricane of 1926.

7 And then the aftermath of the 1926 hurricane,

8 followed by the Great Depression, then the New Deal and

9 wartime activity happens between roughly 1927 and 1944.

10 And then the post-World War II and modern

11 period which is roughly between 1945 to 1963.

12 So the three properties under consideration

13 today, 2520, 1224 and 1822 Country Club Prado, were all

14 constructed in the '20s in the city's boom years.

15 When George Merrick began planning and

16 developing Coral Gables, he envisioned, envisioned it --

17 easy for me to say -- as a cohesively designed city that

18 relied heavily on an architectural styling derived from

19 Spanish precedents as he felt this was the type of

20 architecture that harmonized best with South Florida's

21 climate and lifestyle.

22 He drew from the Garden City and City

23 Beautiful movements of 19th and early 20th century to

24 create his vision for a fully-conceived,

25 Mediterranean-inspired city which is now considered one of

1 the first modern planned communities in the United States.

2 Merrick also wholeheartedly incorporated the

3 Garden City precepts of comprehensive planning with

4 defined areas for different uses, offering housing for

5 different income levels without sacrificing any of the

6 quality as well as providing a wealth of public

7 facilities.

8 So landscape architect Frank Button drew the

9 first comprehensive map of what later would become Coral

10 Gables in 1921. It was based loosely on an infrastructure

11 of an inherited grid of fruit trees from the Merrick

12 family's plantation as well as the native pineland.

13 Merrick envisioned the city with Old World

14 style and purposely set aside vast amounts of valuable

15 land for plazas, boulevards, scenic spots, parkways and

16 entrances. He realized that automobile ownership was

17 becoming increasingly commonplace and wanted Coral Gables

18 to embrace the motorist without sacrificing any of the

19 beauty of the community.

20 He implemented a series of wide parkways with

21 center planting medians that were major thoroughfares

22 across the development as well as wide parkways with

23 substantial swales for tree planting, but provided

24 internal access and also scenic routes. This is

25 including, among others, Country Club Prado.

1 Merrick also included numerous public and

2 community amenities as well as grand place-making

3 features. The street grid was opened up at very strategic

4 locations to include grand entrances, plazas and fountains

5 in order to give major arteries and vistas and provide

6 visible -- visual interest for pedestrians and motorists.

7 The broad boulevards were curved around

8 planned features that include vast parkland, golf courses,

9 monumental public and community buildings as well as other

10 amenities.

11 As Coral Gables expanded, George Merrick

12 employed another Garden City precept which was a distinct

13 separation of sections based on use.

14 Numerous sections in the city are dedicated

15 solely to single family residences. The Douglas section

16 was dedicated to multi-family. Commercial activities were

17 restricted to the business section or along major

18 thoroughfares such as Ponce de Leon Boulevard. An

19 industrial section was implemented along the eastern

20 border just north of U.S. 1, and a specialized live-work

21 Craft section was also planned.

22 A business section originally called

23 St. Augustine business district was initially placed at a

24 three-and-one-half-acre area at the western edge of

25 Sections D and G.

1 It boasted a wide boulevard with a large

2 central median park. At each end, the roadway flared into

3 V shape, making a large triangular land plots as the plaza

4 met the prominent parkways of Coral Way at the north and

5 Alhambra Circle at the south.

6 Unlike the residential lots that were a

7 minimum of 50 feet wide, the lots in this business section

8 were restricted to 25 feet wide.

9 Architect H. George Fink published his first

10 design for Plaza Augustine in early 1922.

11 However, by April of that same year, George

12 Merrick had acquired a 1940 acre addition west of Le Jeune

13 -- east of Le Jeune to Douglas Road, and he moved the

14 business section to that area.

15 Plaza Augustine was renamed Country Club

16 Prado, and Merrick slated it to be a prominent residential

17 section of the city.

18 So you can see here, this is the initial

19 configuration of Plaza Augustine. As seen on the left, it

20 was restricted to Sections D and G, and it's blown up

21 there for you on the right, and all the lots being 25 feet

22 wide.

23 Accounts indicate that expanding the

24 development north to Tamiami Trail was a priority as well

25 as a hard-fought endeavor for George Merrick.

Page 13

1 On Button's 1921 map, Granada Boulevard
 2 connected up to the Tamiami Trail, but Merrick only owned
 3 very small strips, basically one lot deep on either side
 4 of Granada Boulevard.

5 Over the next few years, Merrick worked
 6 diligently to acquire various tracts of land above Sorolla
 7 Avenue, and finally in 1924, with most of the area
 8 secured, he renamed it the Granada Section.

9 Acquiring land in this section afforded
 10 Button, Merrick and Denman Fink the opportunity to revamp
 11 and expand the Country Club Prado.

12 So what happened was the southern section of
 13 Section G was absorbed by enlarging the Biltmore golf
 14 course, and then the new plan extended the Prado north all
 15 the way to Tamiami Trail or Eighth Street through Section
 16 E and the Granada section with an associated grand
 17 entrance feature at the new northern end.

18 And so in this map, again on the left is the
 19 first iteration of the Country Club Prado just limited to
 20 Sections D and G, and the map on the right shows it in its
 21 current and expanded form of going all the way up to
 22 Eighth Street.

23 This is an early aerial that we have that
 24 shows current and post-1924 configuration as well.
 25 Country Club Prado is up on the top.

Page 14

1 So Country Club Prado became and still
 2 remains a one-and-a-half-mile-long and 240-feet wide with
 3 a triangular entrance that intersects Tamiami Trail. At
 4 this northern end, the pillared avenues lead to a formal
 5 Italianate fountain complex designed by Denman Fink.

6 Near the southern end towards Coral Way,
 7 there are four angled one-way streets with each forming
 8 the side of a diamond. In between the four angled streets
 9 on Coral Way are two large triangular green space areas.

10 So for the rest of the Prada, for 1923,
 11 Merrick began developing the Prada as a prominent
 12 residential section and commissioned 15 homes along the
 13 street to be by prestigious architects Keihnel and Elliott
 14 and Walter De Garmo.

15 In June of 1923, Keihnel and Elliott
 16 submitted drawings for the first five homes. In July of
 17 that same year, they generated three more sets for
 18 drawings for homes, but on this, these three, the lot,
 19 block and section numbers recorded on the plans are not
 20 where the homes were actually built.

21 They were shifted from Section E up to the
 22 Granada section, and we think this may correspond with
 23 George Merrick actually acquiring that portion of Granada
 24 at the time of construction. 1224 Country Club Prado was
 25 one of these first eight.

Page 15

1 In August of 1923, Walter De Garmo produced
 2 plans for seven more homes in Sections D and E on the
 3 Prado, and 2520 Country Club Prado was one of these first
 4 15 homes.

5 This again got the ball rolling as he
 6 intended and drew potential homeowners to purchase lots
 7 along the Prado and hire architects to design their own
 8 homes, and between 1925 and 1929, nine additional homes
 9 were designed and built along the Prado, and 1822 Country
 10 Club Prado was designed by Lee Wade and built in 1926 as
 11 one of these nine.

12 So here is a diagram of where the Keihnel and
 13 Elliott houses from 1923 were built. They're in green.
 14 The 1923 De Garmo houses are in orange, circled in orange,
 15 and in blue are the homes by other architects, the light
 16 blue.

17 So the orange star indicates 2520 Country
 18 Club Prado which is on your bottom left in the Section D.

19 The green star at 1224 Country Club Prado is
 20 on the top which is the Granada section, and the blue star
 21 is 1822 Country Club Prado on the bottom right which is
 22 Section E.

23 So about the Prado, a circa-1925 promotional
 24 brochure noted that, "Magnificent plazas and the generous
 25 parkway treatment of wider residential streets are

Page 16

1 tasteful and tropic glory.

2 "The crowning touch of a master hand is
 3 evidenced in the Country Club Prado, particularly in the
 4 Prado entrance where there will be a formal Italian garden
 5 covering the length of a city block."

6 The Prado was the last of the parkways to be
 7 built and is the grandest of all the city boulevards.

8 The entrance feature designed by landscape
 9 architect Frank Button and artist Denman Fink was finally
 10 completed in 1927. It turned out to be Merrick's final
 11 grand historic feature.

12 It was constructed in the style of a formal
 13 Italian garden, consisting of pillars, urns, lamps,
 14 fountains, pergolas and a reflecting pool, and was
 15 constructed at a cost of a million dollars at the time.

16 Between 1923 and 1929, 24 homes were built
 17 along Country Club Prado. As the Prado roadway and
 18 entrance feature were some of the latest to be
 19 constructed, historically this area lagged behind the rest
 20 of Coral Gables development just slightly.

21 By the 1930s, there still remained only
 22 scattered development along Country Club Prado, and a lot
 23 of the lots still retained their through-lot to Red Road.

24 The majority of Country Club Prado's
 25 residences were constructed following the conclusion of

Page 17

1 World War II, primarily during the 1950s. This is an
 2 aerial from 1948.

3 So to this day, Country Club Prado is
 4 recognized as unique to and a signature of the City of
 5 Coral Gables and retains its character defined -- its
 6 character as a promenade of single family homes, and that
 7 is the context for all three.

8 MS. SPAIN: So if you can queue up the Power
 9 Point again.

10 2520 Country Club Prado, this is a
 11 consideration of the local historic designation of the
 12 property at 2520 Country Club Prado, legally described as
 13 Lots Nine to 13, inclusive, Block 15, Coral Gables Section
 14 D, revised plat, according to the plat thereof as recorded
 15 in Plat Book 25 at Page 74 of the public records of
 16 Miami-Dade County, Florida.

17 And this is an early photograph. I believe
 18 this is from 1924. I'm sure Kara will correct me.

19 This is Kara's home, and she and her husband
 20 Drew, who is here in attendance -- and I can't tell you
 21 how happy I am that she finally found a historic home
 22 because the department has been suffering with her when
 23 she's found a home and then for some reason or other, it
 24 didn't happen, but I think it was because this home was
 25 meant for her.

Page 18

1 This is a location map showing it in the
 2 bottom left, and obviously this was requested by the
 3 owner. This is a present-day photograph.

4 So Article Three, Section 3-1103 of the Coral
 5 Gables zoning code, criteria for designation of historic
 6 landmarks or historic districts:

7 "A local historic landmark must have
 8 significant character, interest or value as part of a
 9 historical, cultural, archaeological, aesthetic or
 10 architectural," "architectural heritage of the city, state
 11 or nation."

12 And remember, to designate something as a
 13 local historic landmark or a landmark district, a property
 14 must meet one criteria. It doesn't have to meet all of
 15 them. It can meet just one.

16 And your job here is to determine whether it
 17 meets the criteria. That's your only job when we're
 18 talking about designating properties.

19 So staff believes that 2520 Country Club
 20 Prado is eligible as a local historic landmark based on
 21 the following five significance criteria:

22 Historical, cultural significance because it
 23 exemplifies the historical, cultural, political, economic
 24 or social trends of the community, which Kara just went
 25 over for Country Club Prado.

Page 19

1 Architectural significance: It portrays the
 2 environment in an era of history characterized by one or
 3 more distinctive architectural styles.

4 Two: It embodies those distinguishing
 5 characteristics of an architectural style, or period, or
 6 method of construction.

7 Three: Is an outstanding work of a prominent
 8 designer or builder.

9 Four: Contains elements of design, detail,
 10 materials or craftsmanship of outstanding quality which
 11 represents a significant innovation or adaptation to the
 12 South Florida environment.

13 So this is an amazing photograph of the house
 14 under construction in 1923. We have only a handful of the
 15 residential properties under construction, and this is one
 16 of them.

17 It was Permit Number 612, and the drawings
 18 were dated August 4th, 1923, by Walter De Garmo, and then
 19 the original owners hired Phineas Paist in 1925, Permit
 20 Number 1477, September 18th, 1925, for, to do an addition,
 21 a second garage and a servant's quarters, and it was an
 22 unknown builder.

23 So this is the location. It's on the corner
 24 of Valencia and Country Club Prado, originally called
 25 Plaza Augustine. It was platted as a business district,

Page 20

1 What's interesting about this map is that it shows the
 2 25-foot lots.

3 So Walter De Garmo, in 1900 he received a
 4 Bachelor of Arts in architecture from Cornell University.
 5 He went to work for John Russell Pope in New York,
 6 specializing in Beaux Arts design.

7 In 1904 he moved to South Florida and was
 8 credited with being the first registered architect in the
 9 Miami area.

10 His practice thrives, and in 1906, De Garmo
 11 drafts building laws for the City of Miami.

12 By 1923, he was working with George Merrick
 13 developing Coral Gables. He continued to practice in
 14 Coral Gables and the Miami area through the 1940s.

15 He's responsible for the Women's Club of
 16 Coconut Grove, 1907, known originally as the Housekeepers
 17 Club; Miami Beach Community Church, 1921 in Miami Beach;
 18 the Coral Gables Bank and Post Office in 1924, which I
 19 believe is this photograph; St. Theresa's School with
 20 Phineas Paist in 1924; the Colonnade building with Phineas
 21 Paist and Paul Chalfin; and Douglas Entrance with Phineas
 22 Paist and Denman Fink.

23 So the owner history: It's remarkable that
 24 this home is as intact as it is, and I think it's because
 25 there were so few owners.

Page 21

1 The original owners, 1925 to 1928, were John
 2 T. and Helen Vickery. He was a businessman with homes, as
 3 it states in the designation report, around the country;
 4 followed in 1930 by George and Leah Merdes; Bruce and
 5 Pearl Hayden in 19 -- in '31; Robert H. and Margaret Cook,
 6 1932; 1933 to 1935, Richard D. and Eloise Hunt; 1936 to
 7 1940, Mary L. and Lawrence Oliver Casey, who was an
 8 attorney; and then from 1940 to 1962, J. Randolph and Lula
 9 Padgett Shaner; and then 1963 through '69, Mina E.
 10 Padgett, the sister of Lula.
 11 1969 to 2012 was Ora L. "Dave" and Jane L.
 12 Walters, and 2012 to 2018 was William H. and Robert
 13 Walters.
 14 And I believe the bottom right photograph is
 15 of the Vickerys at a party in Coral Gables, I think a
 16 horse show, and they are on the far right. She is in a
 17 riding outfit and her husband is standing behind her.
 18 And then the people of the left bottom I
 19 think are Ora L. and Jane Walters, yes.
 20 So this shows the photograph in 1924, and
 21 compare it with the same view of the current photograph,
 22 amazingly intact.
 23 So this is the front facade. On the top you
 24 see the original architectural drawings. There is
 25 projecting recessed planes, complexity of massing, roofs

Page 22

1 of varying heights and types, and projecting front porch
 2 area.
 3 This is another view up on the southwest
 4 corner, first floor above a crawl space, textured stucco,
 5 casement windows, deeply recessed windows when protruding
 6 sills. They're all retained the original size and
 7 location, stone columns on the porch and iron balconies.
 8 This is decoratively grouped vents which is
 9 very typical in Coral Gables on these Mediterranean
 10 buildings, arched openings, shallow arches at garage
 11 doors, full arch under stairs, and gothic arch at azotea,
 12 which is a new term for me. It's a roof terrace.
 13 Decorative iron pot rings, and cap-n-pan
 14 barrel tile.
 15 Again, roofs of varying heights and types, a
 16 prominent chimney with decorative corbelling and pierced
 17 openings, iron star tie rod holders, iron balconies, cast
 18 concrete ornamentation, curved raftered ends, covered
 19 veranda.
 20 French doors with transom, buttressed walls,
 21 exterior stairs, knee wall extending up the staircase as a
 22 sculptural element, which is very cool, on the front
 23 facade.
 24 There were no additions to this property
 25 through the years other than the original one by Phineas

Page 23

1 Paist. Two original windows and two original doors were
 2 replaced. Other than that, they are the original windows,
 3 and Kara is going to restore them.
 4 Two windows altered from the original size at
 5 the rear courtyard. I want to see Drew's expression when
 6 I say that.
 7 Alterations to the laundry and service area,
 8 jalousies installed on the front veranda, iron railings
 9 removed. There's a permit to remove the jalousies,
 10 uninstall one garage door which was replaced but saved in
 11 the garage, and the clay tile floor installed over the
 12 oolitic limestone as you can see in the right photograph
 13 is still visible at the front.
 14 So there have been very few changes to the
 15 character-defining features of this home and it retains a
 16 high degree of historic integrity.
 17 1924 photograph at top and then the current
 18 photograph on the bottom.
 19 So in summary, situated on the picturesque
 20 and prominent Country Club Prado, this single family
 21 residence at 2520 Country Club Prado sits on a corner lot
 22 in Coral Gables Section D.
 23 The home was designed by Walter De Garmo. In
 24 1923, the first owners, Captain John T. and Helen Vickery,
 25 hired Phineas Paist in 1925 to add an attached second

Page 24

1 garage and servant's quarters.
 2 As a member of George Merrick's initial
 3 design team, De Garmo was one of the architects who was
 4 instrumental in creating the fabric of 1920s Mediterranean
 5 revival architecture which characterizes the City of Coral
 6 Gables. His design aided in the fulfillment of George
 7 Merrick's vision and goal of a planned
 8 Mediterranean-themed community whose architecture was
 9 adapted to the southern Florida climate.
 10 This home, built during the boom years and
 11 prior to the incorporation of the city, is an excellent
 12 example of the Mediterranean revival style. It is one of
 13 the early structures that characterized both Merrick's
 14 vision and De Garmo's contribution to shaping the City of
 15 Coral Gables as well as Merrick's plan to develop Country
 16 Club Prado as a prominent residential section.
 17 The property at 2520 Country Club Prado
 18 retains a high degree of historic integrity and thus
 19 significantly contributes to the historic fabric of the
 20 City of Coral Gables, and the staff recommends approval of
 21 the local historic designation for the property at 2025
 22 Country Club Prado based on its historical, cultural and
 23 architectural significance. Are there any questions?
 24 MS. THOMSON: No.
 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Well, if the board

1 wants to engage in some discussion.
 2 First, is there any member of the board
 3 that's had any ex parte, ex parte communications or site
 4 visits to disclose regarding this property?
 5 MR. SARDINAS: No.
 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: None? I only, that I drive
 7 past on my way because it's in my neighborhood, so.
 8 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I drove by as well.
 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. If there are no
 10 questions to staff by the board, any questions to the
 11 applicants?
 12 MS. SPAIN: I think you need to open it up
 13 for public comments if there's no --
 14 MR. EHRENHAFT: I'm sorry?
 15 MS. SPAIN: You need to open it up for public
 16 comments --
 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right, right.
 18 MS. SPAIN: -- if there's not any discussion.
 19 MR. EHRENHAFT: Exactly. So if there's any
 20 individual who would like to speak in favor of the case,
 21 please come forward to the microphone and state your name
 22 and address for the record. Okay.
 23 If there's anybody who wants to speak in
 24 opposition, please come forward to the microphone and
 25 state your name and address for the record. Okay.

1 plaque.
 2 MS. KAUTZ: Yay. I have to tell you this.
 3 So the woman, Jane Walters, who I know is a, was a realtor
 4 with EWM for years and years, and she was a
 5 preservationist without actually knowing it or doing it.
 6 She wouldn't let anybody touch the house, so
 7 any time anything went wrong or they replaced anything,
 8 they put it in the garage, so I have the original garage
 9 doors. I have extra windows. I have extra doors. I have
 10 every last knob that fell off. I mean, it's amazing, and
 11 it's mine.
 12 MS. SPAIN: It's perfect for you.
 13 MS. THOMSON: It's sitting there for you.
 14 MR. EHRENHAFT: That's phenomenal.
 15 MS. KAUTZ: I owe it to her. They didn't
 16 touch it, so.
 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Kara, you want me to
 18 announce then the next case, or are you going to read it
 19 in? Okay.
 20 The next local historic designation case we
 21 have is File LHD 2019-006, consideration of the local
 22 historic designation of the property at 1224 Country Club
 23 Prado legally described as the south 15, the S south 15
 24 feet of Lot Ten and the S south 15 feet of Lot 23, and all
 25 of Lots 11 to 13, inclusive, and all of Lots 20 to 22,

1 Hearing none, then if there's no further
 2 board discussion, the chair will entertain a motion.
 3 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I'd like to move it.
 4 MR. MENENDEZ: Second.
 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, all right. May we call
 6 the roll, please?
 7 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss
 8 Bache-Wiig?
 9 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
 10 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr.
 11 Garcia-Pons?
 12 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Yes.
 13 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Rodriguez?
 14 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
 15 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Durana?
 16 MR. DURANA: Yes.
 17 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss Thomson?
 18 MS. THOMSON: Yes.
 19 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Menendez?
 20 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.
 21 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Sardinas?
 22 MR. SARDINAS: Yes.
 23 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Ehrenhaft?
 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 25 MS. SPAIN: Congratulations, Kara. You get a

1 inclusive, Block 77, Coral Gables Granada section,
 2 according do the plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book
 3 Eight at Page 113 of the public records of Miami-Dade
 4 County, Florida.
 5 MS. KAUTZ: Thank you. So this is a 1940s --
 6 I'm sorry. This is a 1920 -- no, I brought it. It's a
 7 1924 photo, a fiche file photo, taken shortly after
 8 construction.
 9 Location map, located on the west side of
 10 Country Club Prado between Venetia Avenue and San Benito
 11 Avenue, one block south of the Country Club Prado entrance
 12 at Eighth Street.
 13 It's located in the Granada section and
 14 remains as one of the few properties that retains its
 15 initial configuration as a through-lot all the way to Red
 16 Road.
 17 So the application came to us through a
 18 historic significance determination that was received on
 19 June 26th, 2019. The applicant is interested in
 20 purchasing the property.
 21 On July 15th, 2019, a determination letter
 22 was issued by staff stating the property does meet the
 23 minimum eligibility criteria for designation as a local
 24 historic landmark.
 25 And I did want to note that the photos in the

Page 29

1 report and in the Power Point were all taken either from
 2 the right of way from the historic significance
 3 application or from the listing photos of the property.
 4 So as Dona mentioned earlier, Article Three,
 5 Section 3-1103 of the Coral Gables zoning code states that
 6 a local historic landmark must have significant character,
 7 interest or value as part of the historical, cultural,
 8 archaeological, aesthetic or architectural heritage of the
 9 city, state or nation.
 10 So again, for designation, a property must
 11 only meet one of the criteria outlined in the code. We
 12 find that this property meets four. They are the
 13 historical or cultural significance in that it exemplifies
 14 the historical, cultural, political, economic or social
 15 trends of the community as evidenced in the context
 16 portion that I explained earlier.
 17 Architectural significance in that it
 18 portrays the environment in an era of history
 19 characterized by one or more distinctive architectural
 20 styles, it embodies those distinguishing characteristics
 21 of an architectural style, or period, or method of
 22 construction.
 23 It also contains elements of design, detail,
 24 materials or craftsmanship of outstanding quality or which
 25 represent a significant innovation or adaptation to the

Page 30

1 South Florida environment.
 2 So this is the photograph of the house under
 3 construction in 1923. It was issued Permit Number 609
 4 after being commissioned by George Merrick in July 1923.
 5 Kiehnel and Elliott were the architects.
 6 In September 1924, the first owner is adding
 7 a sleeping porch to the rear of the property prior to
 8 moving in.
 9 The builder is unknown. It's either one of
 10 the three, Markley brothers, John Bond or John Stabile.
 11 And that information, just so you know, is
 12 based on an August 1923 Miami News article that stated
 13 that 17 new homes were under construction by the
 14 contracting firms listed here and that ten of these homes
 15 are, in quotes, "Being built on Country Club Prado, Coral
 16 Gables' newest and most exclusive section. Kiehnel and
 17 Elliott and and Walter De Garmo drew the plans."
 18 So it's one of those three builders who
 19 constructed this house.
 20 So this is the Granada section plat map.
 21 Again, the home was commissioned by George Merrick. It
 22 was one of the first eight homes built along Country Club
 23 Prado.
 24 In June of 1923, Kiehnel and Elliott
 25 submitted drawings for five homes. In July of 1923,

Page 31

1 Kiehnel and Elliott then generated three more sets of
 2 drawings for homes Numbers 608 through 610, and this home
 3 was included with that was Number 609.
 4 So Kiehnel and Elliott were the architects.
 5 In 1906, John Elliott and Richard Kiehnel in Pittsburgh,
 6 Pennsylvania, founded their firm, were successful in
 7 Pittsburgh.
 8 And then 1917, Kiehnel and Elliott accepted a
 9 commission from John Bindley who was the president of the
 10 Pittsburgh Steel Company to design his Florida estate in
 11 Coconut Grove known as El Jardin, and there's a photograph
 12 on the right, now recognized as the earliest known
 13 Mediterranean revival work remaining in Miami. It's the
 14 home of the Carrollton School of the Sacred Heart today.
 15 Kiehnel supervised construction of El Jardin
 16 and provided an elaborate antiquity for the house by using
 17 ageing techniques to get the desired effect. Merrick
 18 would employ that similar techniques a few years later in
 19 Coral Gables.
 20 In El Jardin, referred to as the progenitor
 21 of the modern Mediterranean style home, Kiehnel introduced
 22 an architectural mode to South Florida which would prove
 23 to be the most influential in the area's history, a mode
 24 that Merrick adopted as the basis for Coral Gables.
 25 Merrick commissioned Kiehnel to design a

Page 32

1 number of the earliest buildings in Coral Gables to aid in
 2 his endeavor to create a Mediterranean-inspired city.
 3 In 1923, he hired Kiehnel and Elliott to
 4 design the first church in the city, which is the Coral
 5 Gables Congregational Church -- it's on the top right --
 6 and also the first school within the city, which is the
 7 Coral Gables Elementary School on the bottom right.
 8 Of the first eight houses in Country Club
 9 Prado, in order to set the tone for this boulevard that he
 10 was promoting as a prominent residential area, he again
 11 hired Kiehnel and Elliott. This home at 1224 Country Club
 12 Prado was one of those first eight.
 13 So permit plans have not been located to date
 14 for this property, but an article in the October 1924
 15 issue of National Builder magazine contains a photo of the
 16 house under construction and its floor plan, along with
 17 the following description of the house:
 18 "Aside from its picturesqueness, this design
 19 is interesting because it demonstrates that an extremely
 20 long unbroken facade offers no difficulties to a competent
 21 designer.
 22 "The columns of the window arcade and the
 23 lattice-like railings of the balconies are of cast cement,
 24 and the lintels of the porch and of the laundry are of
 25 heavy timbers painted to match the windows and doors.

1 "The heavy, squat chimney at one end is
2 balanced by the off-center position of the entrance and by
3 the break in the roof level at the other end.

4 "The plan is an adaptation of a type that is
5 common in some rural districts of the South in which an
6 open gallery separates the important rooms of the house,
7 thus providing for free circulation of air and forming a
8 delightful outdoor sitting room in hot weather.

9 "Note the compact arrangement of the three
10 bedrooms, all with cross-ventilation and grouped around
11 the bathroom. There is an attached garage and a
12 convenient storage room and laundry opening from the
13 kitchen."

14 So that was the description of the house at
15 the time, and it is what's called the dog-trot passage
16 type home, which the center was a screen gallery, screen
17 porch, which is extremely rare in Coral Gables.

18 Oh, as noted already, records indicate that
19 this home was one of the first eight single family houses
20 commissioned by George Merrick to encourage development of
21 the Country Club Prado as a prominent residential
22 boulevard.

23 Historic photos show us that the home was
24 nearing completion by October 1923. The home thus had
25 four owners with two families holding it for over 30 years

1 Porto, and the family still owns that to this day.

2 So there are four notable sets of plans
3 associated with this home.

4 The original plans were designed by Kiehnel
5 and Elliott and dated July of 1923. On the picture on the
6 screen, they're noted in orange. This is a tax card that
7 the city has on file.

8 The newspaper article, as I mentioned,
9 reports that Morton Milton purchased the home in January
10 of 1924, and they added a sleeping porch prior to moving
11 in. That's the appendage on the rear that's blue.

12 In 1946, Permit 7134 was issued for an
13 addition and alterations to the home by architect Edward
14 Rempe, Jr. The plans have not been located, but based on
15 later permits, it can be surmised what the work entailed.

16 A tax card indicates that the carport was
17 added at this time, which is in green on the right, and
18 most likely the rear auxiliary structure was built at that
19 time as well. Those additions are noted in green.

20 And then alterations to the home at this time
21 appear to have occurred we believe at the same time
22 because the permit was for additions and alterations, and
23 that the original rear-facing garage which is outlined in
24 green was enclosed for living space and also the back
25 terrace was enclosed, and so you can see the orange

1 each.

2 So in 1924 to 1931, Morton Milford and
3 Florence Milford were the first owners. He was the editor
4 of the Miami Daily News, and it was announced that he was
5 moving from Tampa to take that position.

6 In September of 1924, another article reports
7 that the Milfords had purchased the home and were going to
8 be putting in a sleeping porch on the rear prior to them
9 moving in.

10 They retained the property until 1961 where
11 it passed to their daughter in 1961 through 1963.

12 Leslie Coombes was a prominent businessman
13 and a close associate of George Merrick, also an avid
14 gardener. He moved to the Gables in 1925. In 1926 he was
15 a secretary to the Coral Gables Corporation.

16 In 1930 to 1940, he was appointed the trustee
17 and manager of the Coral Gables, Inc., which was a
18 liquidating trust formed by the creditors of the Coral
19 Gables Corporation. He served in this role until 1940.

20 In 1941, he opened his own real estate firm
21 in Coral Gables which he operated until his death in 1961.

22 The property then again went to his daughter
23 and after that to Bernard Linn and Margaret Linn. They
24 owned the property for 25 years.

25 And then in 1988, to Manuel Porto and Yolanda

1 surrounding in green, that's the original garage which was
2 rear facing.

3 The last addition to the home occurred in
4 1966 by architect William Tschumy. It included converting
5 the detached garage into a studio and a covered walkway
6 that connected the house to the studio as indicated in
7 red.

8 The openings of the 1946 auxiliary building
9 were modified, and in addition the carport was enclosed
10 with a new garage door and masonry screen grills installed
11 on the north facade.

12 So this is the front, the east facade of the
13 home. It's asymmetrical in design and reads as four bays
14 under separate roofs of varying heights. The northernmost
15 section on your far right is the enclosed carport under a
16 north-sloping shed roof.

17 The remaining three bays are part of the
18 original house, contain the living spaces of the home and
19 are under cross-gabled roofs.

20 So the central bay is the largest and
21 contains the front entry and has the highest roof. The
22 front entry ensemble retains the spirit of the original
23 screen gallery porch, is a tripartite division which
24 harkens back to the original three-screen openings. The
25 heavy timber lintel painted to match the stucco facade is

1 above.

2 So between the small recessed southern bay on

3 your left and the adjacent large central bay is a heavy,

4 squat sculptural chimney capped with barrel tile.

5 Small lattice grills are inserted on the

6 chimney faces, on all four, underneath the cap, and the

7 chimney gives the impression of growing out of the

8 southern bay to meet the front facade of the central bay.

9 This is the Mediterranean revival style. It

10 has those characteristics, predominant sculptural chimney

11 as I just mentioned, varied low-pitched roofs, curved

12 rafters tails in the eaves. They are obscured by the

13 gutters, but they exist.

14 Recessed windows of varying sizes arranged

15 for cross-ventilations. Most of the window sizes retain

16 their original size and shape. Projecting sills.

17 To the north and south of the front entry are

18 masonry balconies with railings of concrete lattice-work.

19 Originally a single pair of French doors led onto the

20 balcony at the north, and three pairs of French doors open

21 onto the southern balcony.

22 The doors were removed in the 1940s and the

23 openings were enlarged to become square, to become -- they

24 were were shortened and then squared off to make windows.

25 Between the southern windows are engaged

1 columns with stylized capitals that, original to the home.

2 The rear has several -- this is the the west

3 side -- several distinct components. At the southern end,

4 which is to your far right, is the back of the small end

5 bay of the cross-gabled roof, the front facade, so that's

6 part of the original, the original house.

7 Moving to the north is a small projecting

8 band or a hip roof. That was the 1924 sleeping porch

9 addition which is now enclosed.

10 To the north of the sleeping porch is an area

11 that was once a covered terrace that has been enclosed by

12 a continuous bank of casement window.

13 Higher, at the higher roof above that bank of

14 windows is the original living room area of the house, if

15 I'm right, or the central area of the house.

16 Adjacent to the enclosed terrace is another

17 small, slightly projecting bay under a flat roof that you

18 can see with the coping and one window. That was the

19 original rear-facing garage.

20 And then at the northern end, the far, the

21 far left on your screen, you see the shed roof slide-away

22 of the carport, and again, sort of in front of that is the

23 covered walkway connecting the home's auxiliary building,

24 and that shed roof is supported by double posts and large

25 openings on the north facade that contain grills.

1 This is the south side of the house, of the

2 original house. This is just a side entry door and a

3 single narrow window.

4 At the rear of the house on the bottom

5 picture looking north is the 1924 sleeping porch

6 immediately on the right with the hip roof, and then

7 beyond that is the 1920 -- 1946 garage addition and the

8 1966 covered walkway connection.

9 This is the north side of the property, and

10 it's comprised of a series of masonry lattice-like screens

11 along the enclosed carport, which I believe are the first

12 one or two, and then the covered walkway beyond.

13 So I already noted some of the alterations to

14 the residence.

15 In 1946, the arched French windows and doors

16 and curved window to the far right were altered. In 1946

17 a chimney cap was also added.

18 In 1991, single hung windows were installed

19 throughout, and at some point S tile was installed on the

20 property, and the bottom picture is a 1940s photo so you

21 can see that changes have been made.

22 So the first -- not the first owners. The

23 later owners, the second owners were Leslie Coombes and

24 Daisy Coombes. They were avid gardeners. They had full

25 use of the through-lot that went to Red Road, and this was

1 actually a common feature on most of the Prado houses at

2 the time.

3 And actually my house had the five behind it,

4 but before we bought our house, they sold them off, so it

5 had its back lots also.

6 There's a coral rock wall and garden features

7 that you can see on the survey that are still exist and

8 they are noted there, and there's a coral rock wall that

9 runs along the rear of the property line at Red Road which

10 is here.

11 In the backyard are coral rock features that

12 were once part of a 1930s formal garden. The garden

13 showcased Coombes's rare plant collection and contained a

14 central pergola flanked by inter-connecting walkways, a

15 pond, grotto and barbecue, all constructed of native coral

16 rock, so these are features that still remain that were

17 visible.

18 So 1224 Country Club Prado retains the

19 dominant character-defining features of the property and a

20 significant degree of historic integrity.

21 Situated on the picturesque and prominent

22 Country Club Prado, this single family residence sits on

23 interior lots in the Granada section.

24 Founder, George Merrick, envisioned Coral

25 Gables as a planned Mediterranean-themed community whose

Page 41

1 architecture was adapted to the southern Florida climate.
 2 In 1917, architect Richard Kiehnel designed
 3 the El Jardin estate in Coconut Grove, a project that is
 4 recognized as the progenator of Mediterranean-inspired
 5 architecture in the Greater Miami area.
 6 In 1923, as Merrick began implementing his
 7 designs, several high-profile buildings -- I'm sorry,
 8 implementing his comprehensive plan for Coral Gables, he
 9 engaged Kiehnel and his partner, John Elliott, to design
 10 several high-profile buildings to set the tone.
 11 These included Coral Gables's first church,
 12 the Congregational Church; the community's first school,
 13 which is Coral Gables Elementary School; as well as the
 14 first eight homes along Country Club Prado, a boulevard he
 15 was launching as Coral Gables's prominent residential
 16 section.
 17 The home at 1224 Country Club Prado is one of
 18 these initial homes. Built during the boom years and
 19 prior to incorporation of the city, the home is a
 20 noteworthy example of the Mediterranean revival style that
 21 characterized both Merrick's vision and Kiehnel and
 22 Elliott's contribution to developing the character of the
 23 Prado as well as to the founding premise of the City of
 24 Coral Gables.
 25 In 1924, the home was illustrated in National

Page 42

1 Builder as a model for homes of its type.
 2 Additionally, it remains as one of the few
 3 properties that retains its initial configuration as a
 4 through-lot to Red Road.
 5 In the 1930s, the rear of the property was
 6 developed as a formal garden by the owner, Leslie Coombes,
 7 a close associate of George Merrick, who served as the
 8 secretary to the Coral Gables Corporation and was
 9 appointed as an appointed trustee and manager for Coral
 10 Gables, Inc., trust of the corporation.
 11 The garden showcased his rare plant
 12 collection and contained a central pergola flanked by
 13 walkways, a pond, grotto and barbecue, all constructed of
 14 native coral rock. These features are extant amongst the
 15 vegetation at the rear yard.
 16 The property at 1224 Country Club Prado has
 17 maintained a significant degree of historic integrity and
 18 thus continues to contribute to the fabric of the City of
 19 Coral Gables, and we recommend approval.
 20 MS. SPAIN: I have e-mails that I'd like to
 21 read into the record.
 22 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes, please.
 23 MS. SPAIN: The first one is from Brett
 24 Gillis.
 25 "Dear Mrs. Spain and the Historic

Page 43

1 Preservation Board:
 2 "I regret that I am unable to attend the
 3 meeting for 1224 Country Club Prado.
 4 "Any time a structure of this caliber comes
 5 up, I am compelled to attend or write in.
 6 "The cottage size of this house shows
 7 Mr. Kiehnel's capacity as a competent designer of a petite
 8 structure. He was born in Prussia -- that's how old he
 9 was.
 10 "Having designed El Jardin, he is generally
 11 considered the father of Miami Mediterranean style. This
 12 is part of the portfolio of the architect who was probably
 13 Greater Miami's most prominent architect of the 1920s and
 14 this design received national recognition. The style and
 15 design are still intact and deserve to be preserved and
 16 celebrated.
 17 "Looking at the list of designated buildings
 18 in the city, I see all the buildings that the Historic
 19 Preservation Board has designated that are more altered
 20 than this one, so the few alterations shouldn't be an
 21 issue. We cannot expect a building that's almost 100
 22 years old to be perfect.
 23 "I live in this neighborhood and think there
 24 may be some confusion. Some seem to think the designation
 25 would not allow the non-historic additions to be removed

Page 44

1 and that the interior would be designated, but my
 2 understanding is that this is not the case and staff would
 3 work with the owner if they wanted to remove non-historic
 4 additions or update the interior.
 5 "I would make a strong recommendation to this
 6 board to designate this house based on its criteria. If
 7 this one isn't historic, then I don't know what is.
 8 "Thank you, Brett Gillis, 915 Ferdinand."
 9 This is from Vicki Cerda. "To the members of
 10 the Historic Preservation Board:
 11 "I have written you about several other
 12 historic properties in the the past, some of which, to our
 13 total shame as a supposedly historic city, were
 14 unfortunately demolished, and once again I am writing you
 15 on a similar matter.
 16 "Due to a conflict with my work schedule, I
 17 am unable to attend the upcoming meeting. I strongly
 18 would like to support the preservation of the the
 19 historically significant Kiehnel-designed home located at
 20 1224 Country Club Prado.
 21 "The historic architecture of Coral Gables
 22 matters very much to me and I would hope to all residents
 23 who are so unhappy with what we see currently going on in
 24 Coral Gables with concrete everywhere as the norm now, out
 25 of place McMansions and demolitions so prevalent.

Page 45

1 "I hope you will preserve this house and also
 2 2520 and 1822 Country Club Prado, which are also up for
 3 designation on the same date, for future generations.
 4 These are three beautiful Prado homes from the 1920s.
 5 "Shame on our city and this board and our
 6 commissioners if we let this happen yet once again.
 7 Thank you, Vicki Cerda, Coral Gables resident."
 8 Rolando Rivas-Camp, "I am writing to support
 9 the designation of the home at 1224 Country Club Prado
 10 since I am presently in Washington, DC, and will not be
 11 able to attend your upcoming meeting.
 12 "I have worked for the federal government for
 13 many years, serving as the historic preservation officer
 14 for the General Services Administration. In this
 15 position, I was in charge of more than 500 federal
 16 historic buildings in the U.S. and the territories.
 17 "Later I served for more" -- "for over ten
 18 years as the deputy chief architect in charge of design
 19 and construction for over 2,000 federal buildings. During
 20 this time I was also a member of the President's Advisory
 21 Council on Historic Preservation in Washington, DC,
 22 serving President Clinton, Bush and Obama.
 23 "I know the importance and value of our
 24 historic buildings. This Kiehnel-designed home, while
 25 small, is quite significant and a valuable historic asset

Page 46

1 to the great City of Coral Gables.
 2 "I urge not only to consider, but also to
 3 grant its designation to help insure its protection and
 4 its place as a significant local historic structure.
 5 "I also urge you to consider giving the same
 6 protection to the two other buildings on the same street
 7 being considered, 1822 and 2520 Country Club Prado.
 8 "With much sincere thanks, Rolando
 9 Rivas-Camp, FAIA, 720 Northeast 69th Street, Residence, in
 10 Miami."
 11 "To the members of the historic board, I am
 12 unable to attend this meeting on Thursday, September 19,
 13 2019, but would like to support the preservation of the
 14 historically significant Kiehnel-designed home located at
 15 1224 Country Club Prado. The historic architecture of
 16 Coral Gables matters to me.
 17 "I hope you will preserve this treasure for
 18 future generations. Thank you, Norma Arenas, 1231 Madrid
 19 Street."
 20 "To the members of the Coral Gables Historic
 21 Preservation Board:
 22 "This letter is in support of the designation
 23 of the property located at 1224 Country Club Prado.
 24 "As you know, the residence was designed by
 25 Richard Kiehnel, one of the most prolific and prominent

Page 47

1 architects at work on our city in the 1920s and beyond.
 2 He is perhaps only rivaled in period stature by Addison
 3 Mizner.
 4 "In addition to the Country Club Prado house,
 5 Kiehnel designed La Brisa in Coconut Grove; El Jardin in
 6 Coconut Grove; Coral Gables Elementary School; Coral
 7 Gables Congregational Church; Miami Senior High School;
 8 the Seybold building; the Coconut Grove Playhouse; 647
 9 North Greenway.
 10 "The house at 1224 Country Club Prado is yet
 11 another signature piece of architecture by Richard Kiehnel
 12 -- an original creator of the Coral Gables built
 13 environment who possesses what we would today call marquee
 14 value.
 15 "Respectfully submitted, Bruce Fitzgerald,
 16 Coral Gables resident and preservationist."
 17 Jane Maranos. "I'm unable to attend the
 18 meeting today, but would like to support the preservation
 19 of the historically significant Richard Kiehnel-designed
 20 home located at 1224 Country Club Prado.
 21 "Any preservation-minded person can clearly
 22 see that this home is worthy of the designation status.
 23 Historic preservation matters.
 24 "Every home presented to the board for
 25 historic preservation is of the utmost importance as we

Page 48

1 are losing so much of our city's history to demolition and
 2 alterations.
 3 "Please consider protecting this home and
 4 others for future generations. Respectfully, Jane
 5 Maranos, Coral Gables resident and supporter of historic
 6 preservation in the City Beautiful."
 7 Patricia Button. "To the members of the
 8 Historic Preservation Board:
 9 "I urge the preservation of the
 10 Kiehnel-designed home at 1224 Country Club Prado. This
 11 historic architecture matters to me. I have lived at my
 12 home on Obispo Avenue since 1975. I have seen the loss of
 13 too many historic buildings.
 14 "I have been a member of the Coral Gables
 15 UCC, a Kiehnel-designed church, for 35 years. This
 16 historic architecture matters to me.
 17 "I hope you will preserve this treasure for
 18 future generations. Sincerely, Patricia Button, 1245
 19 Obispo Avenue."
 20 "Dear members: Regrettably, I'm out of town
 21 and unable to attend the September 19th board meeting.
 22 "I am writing to support the preservation of
 23 the historically significant Kiehnel-designed home located
 24 at 1224 Country Club Prado.
 25 "The prominence of the architect and the

Page 49

1 nationally recognized design of this six-room bungalow
 2 meets the criteria for designation.
 3 "I urge you to preserve this worthy building
 4 so that current and future Coral Gables residents will
 5 continue to benefit from the city's history and character.
 6 Thank you for your consideration, Sheryl Gold, 721
 7 Biltmore Way."
 8 "To the members of the Historic Preservation
 9 Board:
 10 "I'm unable to attend the meeting but would
 11 like to support the preservation of the historically
 12 significant Kiehnel-designed home located at 1224 Country
 13 Club Prado. The historic architecture of Coral Gables
 14 matters to me.
 15 "I hope you will preserve this treasure for
 16 future generations. Thank you, Joyce Nelson."
 17 "Ms. Spain, Good afternoon. Hope you're
 18 well. Please pass this e-mail on to the members of the
 19 Historic Preservation Board.
 20 "While I am not able to attend the meeting
 21 tomorrow, I would like to support the preservation of the
 22 historically significant Kiehnel-designed home located at
 23 1224 Country Club Prado. I was just recently informed of
 24 this proposed designation, though I have seen this home
 25 for years as I walk Country Club Prado regularly.

Page 50

1 "This home is special, not only because of
 2 the firm that designed it, but also because it is one of
 3 the few homes in the Gables that looks almost exactly as
 4 it did when it was built.
 5 "Looking at it, some people may think it is
 6 not flashy or looks rundown. While it may need a little
 7 TLC, it has tremendous opportunity and sits on a big
 8 enough lot that other amenities like a pool could be added
 9 and will be enticing to the new owners. With new paint
 10 and some historically sensitive upgrades, this home will
 11 be a gem for the neighborhood.
 12 "My fear with this designation, looking at
 13 the state of the house, is that someone is hoping that it
 14 is not historically designated. If that is the case, we
 15 would lose another important structure in our city with no
 16 way of ever getting it back.
 17 "Finally, we are a city that values our
 18 history and our architecture. Please vote to designate
 19 this property and save it from demolition so that future
 20 generations will not have to go to a book or on line to
 21 see our historic buildings. Thank You, Robert Ruano."
 22 I'm almost done. Wait a minute. This is
 23 from Renee Belair. "Please keep 1224 Country Club Prado."
 24 This is, "To the members of the Historic
 25 Preservation Board:

Page 51

1 "I support the preservation of the
 2 Kiehnel-designed 1920s home located at 1224 Country Club
 3 Prado. The historic architecture of Coral Gables matters
 4 to me. I hope you will accept the city's preservation
 5 staff's well-researched designation report.
 6 "The home is one of a few model homes that
 7 achieved national attention in 1924.
 8 "I also support the historic designation of
 9 1822 and 2520 Country Club Prado."
 10 That is Karelia Martinez Carbonell, 532
 11 Altara Avenue.
 12 "To the members of the Historic Preservation
 13 Board:
 14 "I am unable to attend the meeting, but would
 15 like to support the preservation of the historically
 16 significant Kienel-and-Elliott-designed home located at
 17 1224 Country Club Prado.
 18 "The historic architecture of Coral Gables
 19 matters to me and my family and all who appreciate good
 20 architecture and design.
 21 "I hope you will preserve this significant
 22 architectural treasure for future generations that live in
 23 Miami-Dade County.
 24 "Thank you for your consideration of this
 25 request. Sincerely, Sonia Chao, co-principal

Page 52

1 investigator, U-LINK University of Miami Grant,
 2 Identifying, Prioritizing and Validating Green
 3 Infrastructure Approaches to Enhance Coastal Resilience,
 4 Implementation of a Data-driven Test Bed on Miami Beach."
 5 She's a faculty at the University of Miami
 6 architecture school.
 7 This is to, "The members of the Historic
 8 Preservation Board:
 9 "I am unable to attend the meeting but would
 10 like to support the preservation of the historically
 11 significant Kiehnel-designed home located at 1224 Country
 12 Club Prado.
 13 "The historic architecture of Coral Gables
 14 matters to me. I hope you will preserve this treasure for
 15 future generations. Alice Goldhagen, 6395 Maynada
 16 Street."
 17 And this is from Dolly MacIntyre. "This is
 18 an important historic property which should be saved. As
 19 a former member of the preservation board for eight years,
 20 I would like to point out that your job is to protect the
 21 history of our community, not to cater to builders of
 22 mega-mansions. There are a number of ways to preserve the
 23 house while allowing expansion if that is the goal.
 24 "Please do the right thing and designate
 25 1224. Dolly MacIntyre, 409 Viscaya Avenue, Coral Gables."

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you. Okay. Miss
 2 Spain, may I ask, was the designation originated through
 3 the department, or at the request of a party?
 4 MS. SPAIN: They filed a historic
 5 significance designation contemplating demolition.
 6 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Who is "they"?
 7 MS. SPAIN: The prospective buyers of the
 8 house.
 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, okay.
 10 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I have a question for
 11 staff.
 12 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 13 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I have a question for
 14 staff. Based on -- it's the question I have, but it's
 15 also in the Brett Gillis e-mail and the wording, the
 16 verbiage he uses is the designation, he thinks that people
 17 think that the designation would not allow the
 18 non-historic additions to be removed, and he says that's
 19 not the case.
 20 MS. SPAIN: That's right, it's not the case.
 21 MR. GARCIA-PONS: So --
 22 MS. SPAIN: If there's an addition to any of
 23 the properties that is not deemed historic in its own
 24 right, we allow them to demolish that. They come forward
 25 to you all for a certificate of appropriateness for

1 demolition.
 2 MR. GARCIA-PONS: And in this particular
 3 case, the original house was in 1924, and there are a
 4 couple additions in the '40s or '50s after that.
 5 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 6 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Would those be -- the 1946
 7 additions would not be historic?
 8 MS. KAUTZ: They could be removed.
 9 MS. SPAIN: Yes. We believe they can be
 10 removed if that's what the owner wants, and in addition to
 11 that, we don't designate interiors, so you can do whatever
 12 you want to the interior of your own home.
 13 MR. GARCIA-PONS: And then the second
 14 question, I know the designation is for the property.
 15 There were some photographs of coral rock walls and wells.
 16 Are those elements also --
 17 MS. SPAIN: Well, again, those would come to
 18 you for a certificate of appropriateness for demolition.
 19 We designate the entire property, and then
 20 anything that the owner would want to demolish would come
 21 back to you, and it would also go to the board of
 22 architects.
 23 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Thank you.
 24 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Would that also be true --
 25 MS. SPAIN: But thank you for asking that.

1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Would that also be true for
 2 the additions made in 1946?
 3 MS. SPAIN: Yes, yes.
 4 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I have one other, one
 5 question of staff. Are the current owners notified?
 6 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 7 MR. RODRIGUEZ: And have they participated in
 8 any way?
 9 MS. SPAIN: I have not talked with them.
 10 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Oh, they're here, okay.
 11 MS. THOMSON: Oh, they're here.
 12 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Changes that were
 13 made, some of the significant ones that you note on the
 14 frontal facade is that the windows to the left of the
 15 central opening used to be arched.
 16 MS. SPAIN: Uh-huh.
 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Things like that --
 18 MS. SPAIN: They could bring that back if
 19 they wanted, or they could leave it.
 20 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- I would imagine that they
 21 could do that administratively or through the board, they
 22 could, if they wanted arched windows back --
 23 MS. SPAIN: Yes, absolutely.
 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- or to bring back any of
 25 the other historic elements that were --

1 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 2 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- were original to 1924 --
 3 MS. SPAIN: Yes, that's right.
 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- they could work with us.
 5 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Can any of that be done
 6 administratively?
 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 8 MS. SPAIN: Yes. Kara is right, and that
 9 would qualify as restoration, and so if they did a large
 10 addition on this home, it would qualify with for an ad
 11 valorem tax break, and that means that the taxes on the
 12 addition or any of the restoration work, that is set at
 13 zero for ten years. Those are city taxes and county
 14 taxes.
 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 16 MS. SPAIN: So that's a perfect, that's a
 17 perfect thing to do --
 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: So there are significant
 19 benefits to --
 20 MS. SPAIN: -- to restore those arches.
 21 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 22 MS. SPAIN: So you can get a tax break for an
 23 addition.
 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, and if there were
 25 other, other questions, in the rear, then -- I mean, they

1 probably wouldn't have FAR problems because the lot is so
 2 huge, I would imagine, so they could, they could apply for
 3 additions to --
 4 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- the historic structure.
 6 MS. SPAIN: And that would all come to the
 7 board of architects and to you.
 8 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, okay. Thank you.
 9 Okay, okay. Well, I'll open the matter to input from the
 10 public. If the owner is present, should we -- okay. I
 11 don't know how to -- okay.
 12 So if there's anybody in the audience who
 13 wishes to speak in favor of the case who is present, would
 14 you please come forward to the microphone and state your
 15 name and address for the record?
 16 MS. JUDE: Sallye Jude, 416 Viscaya Avenue.
 17 I have lived in historic properties for over 60 years in
 18 the Gables, and I have to tell you that the admiration
 19 that people have from this locale and from around the
 20 world is tremendous, and we, when we let that go, we take
 21 a piece of our history that we can never regain again, and
 22 that should be a lot of your thinking in looking at the
 23 properties we have.
 24 I think in the past we've been rather
 25 complacent about saying all things should go, but with

1 So with my interest in history and all the
 2 reading I have done about George Merrick, I have come to
 3 appreciate his true vision. He wasn't just about building
 4 houses.
 5 He was about creating an entire
 6 infrastructure for an entire city based on a dream that he
 7 developed while riding his mule to sell vegetables way
 8 back when. He had a lot of time to read about the tales
 9 of the Alhambra.
 10 And I mention that because when I think about
 11 the master architects that he brought together, they
 12 weren't just trying to copy a design. They put so much
 13 care into what they built.
 14 For example, I always knew that the floor in
 15 my living room, the tiles that I have in the floor in my
 16 living room are the exact same tiles that surround the
 17 openings at Venetian Pool. I thought that was pretty
 18 cool.
 19 But then this past May, I went over to Spain,
 20 and the exact same tiles are in the home studio of the
 21 artist Sorolla in Madrid, the exact same one, and the
 22 exact same tiles are in one of the ancient hotels that,
 23 the Parador Hotel that we stayed it.
 24 I was just blown away by this. They took
 25 such care. They weren't just about slapping up a bunch of

1 important architecture such as this, it is really
 2 important that we pay attention. Thank you.
 3 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Thank you.
 4 MS. SPAIN: And Sallye Jude is like The
 5 Preservationist in Miami-Dade County and in Coral Gables.
 6 I didn't realize you were here. I appreciate you coming.
 7 MS. MEAGHER: Hello. Joanne Meagher, 1225
 8 Valencia Avenue. I come to you with my Villager's hat on,
 9 a proud member of the Villagers along with Sallye and
 10 other members who are here. I'm also a docent at the
 11 Merrick House, and I'm chair of the board of governors at
 12 the Merrick House.
 13 I live in a 1925 old Spanish home. I've
 14 always appreciated it.
 15 I told the previous owners that I would be a
 16 caretaker of their home. The previous owners were very
 17 much involved with historic preservation here, and they
 18 took particular attention to bring the home -- although
 19 they did an addition, they kept our home -- they kept the
 20 original footprint of the kitchen instead of making a huge
 21 one, and I could go on and on.
 22 And actually I think, listening to Kara's
 23 presentation about designating her own home, has me
 24 thinking that it's time for me to designate mine, or to
 25 come before you to do that.

1 homes in order to make money, and you know, and to build a
 2 city and move on.
 3 It was a dream. It was a vision. It's our
 4 responsibility and your responsibility I believe as a
 5 board to preserve that.
 6 My daughter had the opportunity to, to see El
 7 Jardin up close and personal because she was privileged
 8 enough to be able to attend Carrollton School, and I'm
 9 sure, I would hope, that all of you had the opportunity to
 10 tour El Jardin and to listen to the lectures that happened
 11 last year as part of its 100th anniversary so you
 12 appreciate the architects that we're speaking of today.
 13 I wholeheartedly support historic
 14 preservation and designation for this house. Thank you.
 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you.
 16 MS. MARTINEZ CARBONELL: Good afternoon. I'm
 17 here, my name is Karelia Martinez Carbonell, and I'm
 18 president of the Historic Preservation Association of
 19 Coral Gables, and I represent 300 plus preservation-minded
 20 citizens here in Coral Gables and beyond.
 21 And you know, just listening to the pedigree
 22 that this home comes from, obviously there's three of them
 23 being considered today, you know, it's if not this home
 24 worthy of preservation, I really don't know which home
 25 could be.

1 It's like throwing away Frank Lloyd Wright
 2 architecture because, you know, one of the windows don't
 3 fit or was changed.
 4 But, so, as far as the significance of the
 5 property, it's as clear as it could be, and knowing that
 6 if it's not designated, it will be demolished, so it's
 7 something that we do have to consider as a city whose DNA
 8 is, has historic in its DNA.
 9 So again, please consider designating 1224
 10 Country Club Prado. Thank you.
 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Is there any other
 12 person who wishes to speak in favor of this case? Okay.
 13 Any persons in the audience who wish to speak
 14 in opposition, please come forward to the microphone and
 15 state your name and address for the record.
 16 MR. PARKER: Good afternoon, everybody. My
 17 name is Tom Parker, and I live with my wife and family at
 18 1200 Country Club Prado, two doors away, and our three
 19 daughters are in the public school system here in Coral
 20 Gables. I'm a huge fan of Coral Gables, its sense of
 21 community, its history and architecture, and we plan to
 22 stay here for many years to come no matter what happens
 23 today, so we'll see how it goes.
 24 I'm a huge fan of Sallye Jude as well, and
 25 I'm sorry I'm on the wrong side as far as she's concerned

1 because I know her from 20 years ago.
 2 My wife and I are under contract to purchase
 3 the 1224 Country Club Prado home, and the owners or owner
 4 representatives are here behind me.
 5 We were drawn to this property primarily
 6 because of the size of the lot, which has already been
 7 explained, and its beautiful backyard.
 8 Our expectation was to demolish the home and
 9 build a Mediterranean-style house of about 4,500 square
 10 feet, not a McMansion, where the current structure stands,
 11 leaving the backyard to develop a beautiful and full
 12 garden, which again is why we would like to purchase.
 13 We certainly appreciate this historical
 14 review process and appreciate the presentation made by the
 15 staff. They're great people.
 16 I congratulate Kara, honestly, on her
 17 historic preservation. I almost got up at first to
 18 support her because, in my mind, her home is one that
 19 needs to be preserved. It's, in my mind, totally
 20 different than the one we're talking about right now.
 21 We do certainly understand the 1224 house was
 22 designed by Mr. Kiehnel and that he is a renowned
 23 architect. He and his firm certainly designed many
 24 beautiful buildings and homes in South Florida, and I
 25 brought some examples here, although they've already been

1 shown.
 2 So clearly this firm did some amazing work.
 3 It's just that this is not one of them.
 4 The issue I've got is that this particular
 5 house at 1224 is just not in the league of
 6 Mr. Kiehnel's great works.
 7 There remain today none of the arched windows
 8 or the architectural beauty that signified his other
 9 designs.
 10 The unusual winged window on the north side
 11 is long gone. The previous owner tacked on the low-slung
 12 carport and added a room off the back and enclosed the
 13 open-air porch.
 14 The exterior of the house as it exists today
 15 is unremarkable. There's no arches, no decorative
 16 finishes on the columns or doorways. There's no massive
 17 facade like Kara's house or many other Mediterranean
 18 revival houses in our neighborhood.
 19 To an untrained eye like mine, the house
 20 appears to be like so many other Spanish designs that we
 21 find all over South Florida.
 22 The floor plan of this house is, as already
 23 stated, a six-room, a six-room bungalow that appears to be
 24 unique because we can't find anything like it, but I can
 25 only assume that's because it wasn't very popular. It is

1 definitely not usable in today's modern world.
 2 You walk in the front door, and it's about 15
 3 feet to the back wall. It's just not, it's not a usable
 4 structure for a family.
 5 From the outside, it appears to be a plain
 6 and unremarkable work of architecture that I do not
 7 believe fits the body of work by Mr. Kiehnel.
 8 Unfortunately, my architect, Eddie Ahno
 9 (phonetic), is out of town today and unable to be here to
 10 assist me with more technical arguments, but it is hard
 11 for me to see how the 1224 house exemplifies historic,
 12 cultural, political, economic or social trends of the
 13 community.
 14 This house is unremarkable Spanish style.
 15 The architecture is not distinctive and bears no floral or
 16 other decorative stucco or coral wall features that make
 17 many other of our neighbors truly Mediterranean revival.
 18 I too walk my dog on the Prado every morning,
 19 and there are many beautiful houses that deserve to be
 20 preserved, but this one is definitely different from
 21 those.
 22 Also, the historic character of the property
 23 really was not preserved over the years as already talked
 24 about.
 25 There's been quite a few changes to the

1 house, the windows, the garage, the enclosed back porch,
 2 the chimney, the cupola on top was added sometime we think
 3 in the '60s, and none of those changes have acquired
 4 historic significance over time.
 5 The structure is without decorative finishes
 6 that signify the historic beauty of Mr. Kiehnel's later
 7 work, and as it stands, it simply does not embody any
 8 distinguishing characteristics.
 9 The only way forward with this house would be
 10 to spend significant amount of funds to restore the
 11 original house and add on to the back, which as staff has
 12 already said is possible, but is a major project that
 13 really would take away from the historic feature of this
 14 2,000-square-foot house up front.
 15 And finally and most interesting to me, of
 16 course, and maybe not relevant, but the real estate it
 17 sits on is unique to the Prado because it is undeveloped
 18 in the backyard, and unfortunately there's an FP & L line
 19 that runs in between all the houses on our block, so you
 20 actually can't build a McMansion.
 21 You can't move the FPL lines. You can't bury
 22 them. I ran that out. It's just not possible. You have
 23 to do the whole block, and it's not going to happen.
 24 So my fear is that if I don't buy this
 25 property under the terms that I'm hoping for, the next

1 person may do that, but they'll develop the four -- the
 2 three lots that face 57th, and this parcel will be gone
 3 forever. That would really be a shame.
 4 And I sincerely hope that this board will
 5 look carefully at this structure, consider the lack of
 6 historical significance of its actual design,
 7 notwithstanding the fact it has a great architect, and
 8 find that it's not worthy of historic preservation.
 9 The family is here, and that's the other
 10 thing, is that I really -- because of the uniqueness of
 11 this property, because of the size of this property and
 12 this weird FPL line that cuts it in half, it's just so
 13 unlikely that the family that owns it is going to be able
 14 to get the value that is there. I really think they're
 15 going to struggle to get that value, and I think they've
 16 got an associate that is going to stand up.
 17 So thank you very much for your time, and I
 18 appreciate all of your volunteering.
 19 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you. All right, all
 20 right. Hearing no other commentary from the audience --
 21 MR. MENENDEZ: The owners.
 22 MR. EHRENHAFT: The owners.
 23 MR. MENENDEZ: Are the owners going to speak?
 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: They didn't approach. Are
 25 the owners wishing to -- no?

1 MR. PARKER: The owners, they're
 2 unsophisticated. They're a little bit antsy about it.
 3 But the one other thing I could add is that
 4 the neighbors on both sides, they're friends of mine.
 5 They're both, for the proposal, they're out of town as
 6 well, for what that has to do --
 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: All right, okay.
 8 MR. PARKER: They're not here.
 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 10 MS. THOMSON: Where are they?
 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: All right, okay.
 12 MR. PARKER: But they're here to step -- one
 13 of the owners.
 14 MS. SELEM: Hi. My name is Melissa Selem.
 15 I'm the granddaughter of Yolanda Porto. I don't really
 16 like public speaking. This makes me extremely anxious, so
 17 that's why I didn't want to come forward.
 18 My grandmother is 88. She is very elderly.
 19 She's moved in with me and my mother who is also an owner
 20 of the house.
 21 This was an investment for her. She really
 22 just had a place to live, and she lived out her life, and
 23 now she -- her time has come, and we really don't have
 24 much choice but to sell it, and we really do like his
 25 ideas and what he would like to do.

1 This historic preservation is completely new
 2 to me, so I had no idea that any of this even existed, and
 3 my grandmother really didn't either.
 4 So we do support Tom and it not being
 5 historic because that is really the only way we see being
 6 able to move forward. Thank you.
 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you. Kara, do you have
 8 additional comments before we --
 9 MS. KAUTZ: I just did want to note that any
 10 sort of economic hardship claim that designation would put
 11 on the property is not germane to the discussion.
 12 It comes at a later date when they're denied
 13 an application for something.
 14 MS. SPAIN: And the city attorney's office
 15 has been very clear on that, that any claim of economic
 16 hardship, that's done after the designation. They can
 17 come back.
 18 It's just like a certificate of
 19 appropriateness for demolition. If they think it's an
 20 unsafe structure, it comes back to you, but you have to
 21 follow the criteria.
 22 MR. EHRENHAFT: The criteria, right.
 23 MS. SPAIN: That's what you're here for, so
 24 if it doesn't meet the criteria, it's what you're here,
 25 and then we can deal with the other on separate

1 applications after the fact.
 2 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Yes, sir?
 3 MR. BYRD: Am I still allowed to speak?
 4 MS. SPAIN: Sure.
 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: Sure, certainly.
 6 MR. BYRD: My name is Jimmy Byrd. I'm
 7 offering support to Tom. I'm also his realtor on this.
 8 And when I first saw the house, I told him
 9 that we're probably going to have some hurdles because of
 10 the age of the house, and I knew that, you know, there was
 11 going to have to be some investigation done on this.
 12 The more information we got, the less likely
 13 I thought that we were going to be opposed on this because
 14 the house has just been so altered. I talked to different
 15 people, different real estate agents in town. They can't
 16 understand how, in the condition it's in now, that it
 17 would actually get the historical designation.
 18 Actually my mom, who has been a real estate
 19 agent here since 1972, asked me to send the information to
 20 Arva Parks because she's a family friend, so I did.
 21 She called me back. She said, "Jimmy, I'd
 22 hate to see them tear down a Kiehnel house, but it's been
 23 so changed."
 24 She thought that there was actually coral
 25 rock on the outside of the house from the original

1 They added a garage on the side. I think
 2 that takes away from it. They enclosed the laundry room.
 3 There's just -- they put the extra cupola on top of the
 4 chimney. There's a lot of alterations that have happened
 5 to this house.
 6 I think it would be too expensive for
 7 somebody to come in and restore it. I don't think Bob
 8 Vila would want to do it.
 9 But as far as I'm concerned, that house would
 10 be better restored and moved if it was that important.
 11 The City of Coral Gables can buy it as a park.
 12 But I just, I don't think that not every
 13 house that's built in 1924 to 1926 or what have you, more
 14 than 50 years old, deserves to be saved.
 15 These guys are spectacular architects. This
 16 is not their best work, and maybe that's the reason why
 17 they just went ahead and did all the alterations in 1946.
 18 If I was taking somebody around town and
 19 showing them all the Kiehnel and Elliott properties,
 20 there's no doubt that we would pass by that one and they
 21 would ask, "What were they going for there?"
 22 I don't get it, compared to all the other
 23 ones. They did eight homes. I assume seven of them are
 24 still standing. Hers is a De Garmo. I just don't think
 25 this one deserves historical designation.

1 pictures.
 2 You can see the slope that adds the balance
 3 on -- from the chimney, the slope on the north side of the
 4 house, the curved wall, has been completely built over.
 5 There's a lot of those beautiful features that I would
 6 look for in an old house.
 7 I like the charming houses. I've lived in
 8 the Grove. I'm watching what's going on in the Grove
 9 right now with the lot splitting and the building of the
 10 new Modern Haus. I look for older houses with a lot of
 11 charm.
 12 This house has been pasted over, and it
 13 doesn't deserve to be historically designated, it really
 14 doesn't.
 15 There are other homes like hers that I would
 16 be on the human circle around that house before they
 17 brought a bulldozer over to it. That house deserves to be
 18 preserved. This one has been altered.
 19 Since 1946, George Merrick's story did not
 20 change between 1923 and 1946 when most of that work was
 21 done. It was still one of the first 15 houses
 22 commissioned by him, and yet, the city, or the people at
 23 that time, let them change the house in such a way that it
 24 doesn't look anything like the original. There's a couple
 25 features that do.

1 THE COURT REPORTER: Can you state your name?
 2 MR. BYRD: Jimmy Byrd, B-Y-R-D.
 3 MS. SPAIN: So just a clarification, we're
 4 not requiring them to do the restoration to bring it back
 5 to what it was originally.
 6 We believe that it's historically significant
 7 in its present condition, so all of that, you know, work
 8 does not have to be done. That's all I've got.
 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, all right. Well, that
 10 closes the public portion of the discussion, and we'll
 11 commence the board discussion. Okay.
 12 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I'd like to say that I walk
 13 by there, drive by there, ride my bike by there, you know,
 14 constantly, so I'm very familiar with the property. I've
 15 never stopped, I've never asked questions, never talked to
 16 anyone about it.
 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Does anybody other,
 18 have any other ex parte communications or visits?
 19 MR. SARDINAS: I'm the same, same lines.
 20 We've walked through there, driven by there. I've always
 21 admired that house actually.
 22 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 23 MR. SARDINAS: But I've never spoken to
 24 anybody on that property related --
 25 MR. MENENDEZ: You know, I drove by the

Page 73

1 property this weekend, you know, and it's a beautiful
 2 property.
 3 And I think that you have to look at not just
 4 the house, but the property as a whole and what that
 5 property and what that house contributes to the rest of
 6 the neighborhood.
 7 I think it would be catastrophic to demolish
 8 that house. I think that house has a lot of potential for
 9 the person who wants to put the time and the effort into
 10 it.
 11 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I have a question. In one of
 12 the pictures, it seemed to appear that it was coral
 13 rock --
 14 MR. SARDINAS: Construction.
 15 MR. RODRIGUEZ: -- construction. Has that
 16 been plastered over, or was that just a quality of the
 17 picture?
 18 MS. KAUTZ: The quality of the picture, we
 19 can't tell. By 1924, the Fischbaugh (phonetic) photo, it
 20 was stucco, so within a year, if it was constructed out of
 21 coral, we can't tell from the photograph. I can't tell if
 22 it's -- we couldn't locate the original magazine, so if it
 23 were coral, we don't know if the intention was for it to
 24 stay coral or be stuccoed because it's very early to have
 25 stuccoed a coral rock structure by 1924, by a year later.

Page 74

1 It may have just been a method of
 2 construction that they were still under.
 3 MR. EHRENHAFT: You're referring to Figure 11
 4 on Page 12, I guess.
 5 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 7 MS. KAUTZ: The National Builders. It's
 8 still under construction in that photo.
 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right.
 10 MS. KAUTZ: So the intent, the intent and the
 11 construction material isn't clear, but by 1924, it exists
 12 in its current state.
 13 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right, so just a year
 14 later --
 15 MS. KAUTZ: Yes.
 16 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- or less, it shows, I think
 17 Figure 11 shows --
 18 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
 19 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- stucco.
 20 MS. KAUTZ: Correct.
 21 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 22 MS. THOMSON: So my understanding is that
 23 this has been owned by a single family for quite a few
 24 years now?
 25 MS. SPAIN: Yes.

Page 75

1 MS. THOMSON: Is that what I was
 2 understanding them saying? Okay. So it's not like recent
 3 owners, and all of a sudden, they want to change it?
 4 MS. KAUTZ: No. It's for sale, so that's the
 5 reason why it's before you now.
 6 MS. THOMSON: Oh, it's for sale. Okay,
 7 great.
 8 MR. EHRENHAFT: Any concerns that they
 9 expressed regarding easements, wires in the back, or
 10 that's not pertinent to this, or?
 11 MS. SPAIN: No. That isn't pertinent to
 12 whether or not it fits a criteria, and I had never heard
 13 that Florida Power and Light requires the whole block to
 14 be underground. I don't know enough about Florida Power
 15 and Light and burying that to know whether that's the
 16 case.
 17 MS. KAUTZ: But that's not part of the
 18 criteria.
 19 MS. SPAIN: But it's not part of the
 20 criteria, so I don't think you should take that into
 21 consideration.
 22 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, okay.
 23 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I do have one question for
 24 staff, and I can -- I think the presentation talking about
 25 the historic being a dog-trot and that being a unique

Page 76

1 typeology and it's no longer that or that no longer
 2 functions as that, they closed in the back porch, they
 3 changed the arched windows to the front windows and the
 4 columns.
 5 There are some significant changes to the
 6 building, and I would imagine that whoever wrote the
 7 report did identify all those things.
 8 My question is always, "How much?" Right?
 9 I'm sure that you guys went through the same thought
 10 process, and I can struggle a little bit with this
 11 particular home, although I agree that it is, the massing
 12 of it, the location of it, some of the detailing of it,
 13 but it did lose a lot of its original character with those
 14 really, I believe, important elements being removed, and
 15 we do live differently now than we did back in 1926,
 16 sleeping porches and dog trots, So I could understand the
 17 comments made by the potential future owner of the
 18 property, and I share them.
 19 It's just going to be difficult, in fact, it
 20 is difficult for me to find out how much is too much.
 21 One thing that I, the question that I did ask
 22 based on the e-mail from, I think it was Mr. Gillis about
 23 can you make alterations to the existing home to go back
 24 towards a more historic approach to it, or even your
 25 comment responding back to us, which is, "It's just a

1 certificate of appropriateness, if you want to make
 2 alterations to the property, it would come back to this
 3 board," and then we get to decide the significance of the
 4 alteration.
 5 MS. SPAIN: Yes. I mean, honestly, if they
 6 were going to just do the arched windows, we would sign
 7 off on that administratively.
 8 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Administratively, but if
 9 they do want to make an addition --
 10 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 11 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- say a thousand square
 12 feet --
 13 MS. SPAIN: They would have to come back.
 14 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- they would still have to
 15 come back to us --
 16 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 17 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- as opposed to not
 18 designating, and it would not be a regular lot zoned --
 19 MS. SPAIN: If you don't designate it --
 20 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- potentially.
 21 MS. SPAIN: -- then it will be demolished,
 22 and I'll sign the demolition permit. That's what kicked
 23 this in --
 24 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Yes.
 25 MS. SPAIN: -- because any demolition, total

1 demolition permit in Coral Gables requires our review, and
 2 if it's historically significant in our view, we bring it
 3 to you within 60 days, so that's why it's here before you.
 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: I would imagine with respect
 5 to the comment about the FPL lines in the rear, that, that
 6 lines like that can be buried. If there's going to be
 7 other work done for construction to enlarge a home, I
 8 would think that they could be put subterranean. I don't
 9 know. Sure.
 10 MR. PARKER: If they could, believe me, I've
 11 tried.
 12 MR. EHRENHAFT: Sure.
 13 MR. PARKER: I've been on line with FPL. No
 14 go unless you do the whole block which is in line with a
 15 million dollars, which is just not do-able.
 16 MR. MENENDEZ: But that has no bearing on our
 17 decision.
 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: On this, right, right.
 19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I appreciate that.
 20 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes, yes.
 21 MR. PARKER: I just want to make sure the
 22 record is straight.
 23 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right, yes. That's true.
 24 Okay, all right. Any further questions or comments from
 25 the board? Okay.

1 MR. MENENDEZ: I move for designation.
 2 MS. THOMSON: I second it.
 3 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Hearing no further
 4 discussion, may we call the roll, please?
 5 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Durana?
 6 MR. DURANA: Yes.
 7 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss Thomson?
 8 MS. THOMSON: Yes.
 9 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss
 10 Bache-Wiig?
 11 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
 12 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Sardinas?
 13 MR. SARDINAS: Yes.
 14 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Rodriguez?
 15 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
 16 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr.
 17 Garcia-Pons?
 18 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Yes.
 19 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Menendez?
 20 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.
 21 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Ehrenhaft?
 22 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 23 MS. SPAIN: Thank you.
 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. The next item on the
 25 agenda is Case File LHD 2019-007, consideration of the

1 local historic designation of the property at 1822 Country
 2 Club Prado, legally described as Lots Five and Six, Block
 3 27, Coral Gables Section E, according to the plat thereof
 4 and as recorded in Plat Book Eight at Page 86 of the
 5 public records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
 6 MS. KAUTZ: Thank you. This is a historic
 7 photo of the property at 1822 Country Club Prado. It's
 8 from the 1940s, early photograph.
 9 Location map, it's Section E on the west side
 10 of Country Club Prado on the corner of Cadiz Avenue and
 11 Country Club Prado.
 12 So this application is being brought to you
 13 at the request of the current owners.
 14 So again, Article Three, Section 3-1103 of
 15 the Coral Gables Zoning Code states that, "A historic
 16 landmark must have significant character, interest or
 17 value as part of the historical, cultural, archeological,
 18 aesthetic or architectural heritage of the city, state or
 19 nation," must meet only one of the criteria outlined in
 20 the code.
 21 We believe 1822 Country Club Prado is
 22 eligible on four criteria, those being historical,
 23 cultural significance, and that it exemplifies the
 24 historical, cultural, political, economic or social trends
 25 of the community;

1 Architectural significance in that it
 2 portrays the environment in an era of history
 3 characterized by one or more distinctive architectural
 4 styles;
 5 Embodies those distinguishing characteristics
 6 of an architectural style or period or method of
 7 construction;
 8 And contains elements of design, detail,
 9 materials or craftsmanship of outstanding quality or which
 10 represent a significant innovation or adaptation to the
 11 South Florida environment.
 12 1822 Country Club Prado was Permit Number
 13 2348 in the city. It was permit -- it was permitted in
 14 June 5th, 1926. The architect of the property is Lee L.
 15 Wade. The builder was John Hunt, and the original owners
 16 were Milton and Jessie Garris.
 17 So that as described the beginnings of the
 18 Country Club Prado context earlier, this is the location
 19 map of Section E showing where the earliest houses in that
 20 particular section of the Prado were located.
 21 The green again are 1923 and Kiehnel and
 22 Elliott, the orange is 1923 De Garmo, and the blue are
 23 1925 to 1926, other architects that came to the Prado.
 24 The star indicates the property in question.
 25 So the architect for the residence is Lee L.

1 Wade, who by the 1920s worked in construction management
 2 for his father's firm, A.B. Wade and Son Construction.
 3 By 1922, he is designing architect and junior
 4 architect for the firm and responsible for eight to ten
 5 Spanish bungalows that were constructed in the Shenandoah
 6 area.
 7 In 1926, Wade became a member of the American
 8 Institute of Architects and established his own firm with
 9 an office in Coral Gables located at 2302 Ponce de Leon
 10 Boulevard.
 11 In the late 1920s, he took on a partner, C.H.
 12 Oemler, who was responsible for construction management.
 13 This partnership does not seem to have been
 14 long lived, but we have designated properties by Wade and
 15 Oemler before.
 16 Wade continued to practice in the greater
 17 Coral Gables area until 1941 when he accepted a position
 18 of naval architect and moved to Norfolk, Virginia.
 19 The following is a list of some of Wade's
 20 contemporaneous Coral Gables commissions, which I'm not
 21 going to read all of them to you, many of which are
 22 designated single family homes, also includes 2326 -- I'm
 23 sorry, 263, 265 Aragon Avenue, which is the original
 24 Wyland (phonetic) Clinic, which is Books and Books, and
 25 then other properties throughout the city that are

1 designated as historic landmarks.
 2 In 1926, Milton Garris, a prominent civil
 3 engineer, hired architect Wade to design his new home on
 4 the Prado. The Garris family resided in the property for
 5 49 years.
 6 Garris came to Miami in 1913 and was the
 7 chief engineer in development of many of the islands in
 8 Biscayne Bay, including Indian Creek, Bay Harbour Island
 9 and Golden Beach, among others.
 10 He also served as a Coral Gables commissioner
 11 for eight years, from 1929 to 1937. In the photograph,
 12 you can see him standing in the second to the left.
 13 He, after that he served as chair of the
 14 Coral Gables Planning and Zoning Board in the 1940s, and
 15 this is a commission meeting from 1931 in this very room.
 16 The home is constructed in the Mediterranean
 17 revival style. Some of the character-defining features of
 18 the style found on the residence include projecting and
 19 recessed planes, retrolinear massing and floor plan,
 20 arched and decorative openings, a series of low-pitched
 21 roofs covered in two-piece barrel tile, textured stucco
 22 and arched entry, prominent and distinctive chimneys, a
 23 balcony with spindled railings, decorative masonry inserts
 24 and screens, turned columns and spindles, group-around
 25 vents, recessed casement windows at various shapes and

1 sizes, projecting sills.
 2 This is actually a very interesting house.
 3 It's quite charming. It has quite a few really very
 4 interesting details.
 5 This is the north, this is the north front
 6 elevation -- I'm sorry. This is the east elevation, the
 7 front, and you can see some of the features that are here,
 8 the projecting and recessing planes, the projecting front
 9 porch on the far right -- sorry, the front entry with the
 10 arched opening, the projecting porch on the far right, the
 11 decorative openings, the varied roofs, the textured
 12 stucco.
 13 This is the north end of the front elevation,
 14 and you can see the auxiliary structure to the rear.
 15 The wing wall on the right-hand side is not
 16 original to the house, but copies two that are found in
 17 the rear.
 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: I'm sorry. It copies --
 19 MS. KAUTZ: Two, two original wing walls that
 20 are in the rear of the house.
 21 MR. EHRENHAFT: That are in the rear, okay.
 22 MS. KAUTZ: That's a replica --
 23 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 24 MS. KAUTZ: -- of the ones in the back. They
 25 added that, but they did recess it off the corners, so

Page 85

1 whoever did it, did it right.
 2 So this is walking around the south side of
 3 the house. There's the wood balcony. It has the
 4 buttressed projections, which is very interesting because
 5 those are the same ones that are found on my house which I
 6 don't really see very often, turn posts and spindles, the
 7 arched openings supported by engaged twisted columns,
 8 built-in planter, and then the distinctive round window
 9 with the metal, the iron grate.
 10 This is the front entry with highly
 11 decorative masonry insets also found around the windows on
 12 the front, you see on the right and the top, the lintel in
 13 between the windows, and then of the porch on the far
 14 right, you see the wooden spindles and these brick, the
 15 brick detailing underneath the windowsill.
 16 So the upper floor is a sleeping porch. It's
 17 since been enclosed, but it retains the decorative
 18 spindles. You can see the heavy wooden timber, the lintel
 19 down below.
 20 This is the front and then also the north,
 21 north side on the right.
 22 So this is the rear of the property, and you
 23 can see on this on the right-hand side, the trellis, the
 24 grouped vents.
 25 You can also see the loggia that's in the

Page 86

1 rear, the balcony that's original to the house with the
 2 cast sort of detail, and then also the detail at the top.
 3 It's very, very nicely done, and that curved
 4 element that you see on the left is repeated on the right
 5 side, so it's got these two curved pieces at the rear
 6 which is very unusual.
 7 It has this covered arcade that leads to the
 8 auxiliary structure with really beautiful decorative
 9 chords above, and the wing wall that you see on the left
 10 picture on the left side is original to the house and
 11 that's the one that was copied on the front.
 12 This is an up-close detail of the auxiliary
 13 structure with the decorative parapet, the grouped, the
 14 grouped vents, and also that really unusual cat slide roof
 15 on the right-hand side.
 16 So alterations to the house, comparison of
 17 the permit plans and the historic photographs with the
 18 existing home demonstrate the high degree of integrity the
 19 property has retained over the years, very few alterations
 20 to the home and none that detrimentally impact the
 21 character-defining features.
 22 So on the right-hand, on the right-hand side
 23 is a drawing of the north facade of the house, and on this
 24 side when they did the windows, when they redid the
 25 windows, one, the sort of window that's above on the first

Page 87

1 floor that's kind of like mid-space, it was a butler's
 2 pantry, that was removed. That was blocked up, and then
 3 the window to its right was reduced in size.
 4 On the left-hand side is another drawing.
 5 The front entry, the opening was reduced slightly when the
 6 new grill was installed.
 7 So other alterations include the wing wall
 8 and the fence to the right that you see on the bottom
 9 left, the carport, pergola, the circular driveway at the
 10 front.
 11 The wing wall, again, like I said, was added
 12 at the front to match. You'll see the wing wall at the
 13 rear, the one they matched, down below, and the pool.
 14 And so the pool, it's interesting, it was
 15 added in 1991, but the current owner is actually a mosaic
 16 tile artist who resurfaced the pool in a tile pattern
 17 that's drawn from the cast decorative elements on the
 18 front of the house that you see on the top right, so the
 19 current owner did this himself.
 20 So 1822 Country Club Prado retains its
 21 dominant character-defining features and a high degree of
 22 historic integrity.
 23 It's situated on the picturesque and
 24 prominent Country Club Prado. This single family
 25 residence at 1822 Country Club Prado sits on a corner lot

Page 88

1 in Coral Gables Section E.
 2 The home was designed by Lee Wade in 1926 for
 3 the first owners, Milton B. Garris and Jessie Garris who
 4 owned the house for 59 years.
 5 Lee Wade's designs aided George Merrick in
 6 fulfilling his vision and goal of a planned
 7 Mediterranean-themed community whose architecture was
 8 adapted to the southern Florida climate.
 9 This home, built during the boom years, is an
 10 excellent example of their Mediterranean revival style.
 11 It is one of the early structures that
 12 characterized both Merrick's vision and that shaped the
 13 City of Coral Gables as well as Merrick's plan to develop
 14 Country Club Prado as a prominent residential section.
 15 It's maintained a high degree of its
 16 integrity and contributes to the fabric of the City of
 17 Coral Gables, and we recommend approval.
 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: You have nothing more?
 19 MS. KAUTZ: That's it.
 20 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Would the applicant
 21 care to address the matter?
 22 MS. KAUTZ: They're not here.
 23 MR. EHRENHAFT: They're not here?
 24 MS. KAUTZ: They're out of town.
 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.

1 MS. KAUTZ: They knew we were bringing it
 2 forward.
 3 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 4 MS. KAUTZ: They were fine with us taking it
 5 today, so.
 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, all right. Is there
 7 anyone in the audience that wants to speak in favor of the
 8 case, or anyone who wants to speak in opposition? Okay.
 9 Hearing none, this closes the public hearing
 10 portion of the case, and we will proceed to board
 11 discussion.
 12 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I'd like to move the item.
 13 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Second it.
 14 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Hearing no further
 15 discussion, may we please call the roll?
 16 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss
 17 Bache-Wiig?
 18 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
 19 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Sardinas?
 20 MR. SARDINAS: Yes.
 21 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Durana?
 22 MR. DURANA: Yes.
 23 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Menendez?
 24 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.
 25 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Rodriguez?

1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
 2 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss Thomson?
 3 MS. THOMSON: Yes.
 4 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr.
 5 Garcia-Pons?
 6 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Yes.
 7 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Ehrenhaft?
 8 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 9 MS. KAUTZ: Thank you.
 10 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. I have a question of
 11 the board. Is there anybody that needs a five-minute
 12 break?
 13 MS. THOMSON: Yes.
 14 MR. EHRENHAFT: Or maybe seven. May we have
 15 seven, Dona? Thank you.
 16 (Thereupon, a brief recess.)
 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. We're ready to
 18 reconvene. It's 5:59 p.m.
 19 The next category of cases are special
 20 certificates of appropriateness, the first of which is
 21 Case Number -- Case File COA (SP) 2017-012, Revised, an
 22 application for the issuance of a certificate of --
 23 special certificate of appropriateness for the property at
 24 927 Valencia Avenue, a local historic landmark, legally
 25 described as Lots 17, 18 and 19, Block Nine, Coral Gables

1 Section A, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in
 2 Plat Book Five at Page 102 of the public records of
 3 Miami-Dade County, Florida.
 4 The application requesting design approval
 5 for additions and alterations to the residence and site
 6 work was granted approval with conditions on August 17,
 7 2017.
 8 Revisions requiring design approval for
 9 landscape mitigation were approved on December 21, 2017.
 10 This application requests design approval for
 11 revisions to the approved certificate of appropriateness
 12 necessitated by deviations from the approved scope of
 13 demolition on the historic residence. Okay.
 14 MS. SPAIN: So this is the location. It's on
 15 Valencia. This is pre-demolition, very few. This is a
 16 1940s photograph of the home. This again is
 17 pre-demolition.
 18 This is what it looked like when it came to
 19 you for a certificate of appropriateness, also
 20 pre-demolition, and this is what it looks like now. I'm
 21 going to turn it over to the architects.
 22 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Dona, could you go back to
 23 that one slide, let me see that again, the existing
 24 conditions? Thank you.
 25 MS. SPAIN: If you remember correctly, you

1 deferred it off of the agenda because there were
 2 discrepancies in the plans, and that's all been fixed, so
 3 the ones you have before you are accurate.
 4 And I think the intent is just to change the
 5 plans so that they can go forward with what they had
 6 originally planned to do. Right? Okay.
 7 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Thank you. Good evening,
 8 board members and Mr. Chairman. My name is Eduardo Calil
 9 from Calil Architects. This is my son, Eduardo Calil,
 10 also from Calil Architects as well, also a registered
 11 architect.
 12 And he's going to do a brief presentation of
 13 what was originally approved by this board in particular
 14 and what was actually demolished and we intend to rebuild,
 15 what we intend to rebuild what was actually removed from
 16 the original permit set, so.
 17 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Good evening, members of
 18 the board. I am Eduardo Calil, Junior, from Calil
 19 Architects, 1728 Coral Way, Miami, Florida.
 20 So what I have -- what we have in front today
 21 here is -- let's see. Okay. These are pictures of the
 22 existing residence as it stands today.
 23 Our intention here today is to present the
 24 areas of the historic residence that were unintentionally
 25 demolished per the originally approved permit set of

Page 93

1 plans, to present what was originally intended to be
 2 demolished and preserved, and that -- and our proposal to
 3 reconstruct what was intended to be initially preserved
 4 and rebuilt with greater clarity.
 5 These photographs here and before this, this
 6 is what was presented to the original board of architects
 7 of the neighboring properties and the residence. It's a
 8 little small as you can see here, but this is what was
 9 presented originally.
 10 And here we have photographs of the existing
 11 residence as of the end of August.
 12 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: This year.
 13 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Of this year. This is
 14 after shoring had already commenced prior to the
 15 hurricane, and they also started to reinforce prior to the
 16 hurricane. More pictures of the same.
 17 And here we have the original set, or the
 18 original plans in the City of Coral Gables of the 1926
 19 house, which was actually constructed as a mirror image of
 20 the original set of plans.
 21 And again, our intent is to actually
 22 reconstruct the, at least the contour of the residence to
 23 reflect what was originally there in 1926.
 24 This is the original demolition plan that we
 25 submitted to the City of Coral Gables. For emphasis, we

Page 94

1 highlighted certain areas. In orange we highlighted the
 2 areas that are to be demolished, and in green are the
 3 areas that that are to remain.
 4 You can see that a significant portion to the
 5 north was going to be demolished, including an addition of
 6 a storage area up top. Lots of areas to the east were
 7 going to be demolished in order to reflect what was
 8 originally designed in 1926, which I don't know if you
 9 could see the pointer, point it up, but just go upwards of
 10 where I'm pointing there.
 11 You see the, like a little wall and then the
 12 orange wall going vertical, that's where the original 1926
 13 house would then break and go upward up to where you see
 14 those two green walls on the right side right there,
 15 there's a little hip roof right there -- not a hip roof; a
 16 shed --
 17 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: A gable, a gable.
 18 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: -- a shed, a shed tiled
 19 roof on top. That portion was to remain.
 20 However, all of that was demolished, and
 21 again, we intend to rebuild that portion.
 22 This is the original existing plan as it was
 23 when we initially submitted for permitting. This is the
 24 same before the roof plan, and here we have the existing
 25 conditions as they are today.

Page 95

1 You could see that everything upwards of
 2 where the chimney is was demolished.
 3 This is the site plan reflecting the same
 4 thing existing prior to demolition, and this is a new plan
 5 that we made existing today.
 6 These are the original permit set of plans.
 7 However, we did highlight in a gray, in a gray color in
 8 the center the areas that are to be rebuilt.
 9 Moving forward, we did the same with the
 10 floor plan. That entire area is to be rebuilt.
 11 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Yeah. I would like --
 12 yeah. Let me add a couple of things.
 13 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Yeah, one of the things
 14 that I would also like to add is that the floor of that
 15 area was always intended to be rebuilt from the beginning,
 16 and the areas of the residence that had a flat roof were
 17 intended to be rebuilt completely.
 18 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Right.
 19 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Okay. The roof plan
 20 showing, again, the gray hatches, everything that just
 21 needs to be rebuilt regardless of whether it was to be
 22 demolished or not.
 23 And here, well, again, this is part of the
 24 original permit set. However, I'm going to skip ahead to
 25 the last couple of pages right now, so these sheets are

Page 96

1 new.
 2 These, we created these sheets in order to
 3 emphasize, to put an emphasis on the historic residence
 4 while also outlining the new addition in dashed lines
 5 around the historic residence.
 6 So one thing that if you look at the plans in
 7 front of you, it's probably a lot easier than seeing it
 8 here, you'll notice that the openings in the west and east
 9 facades and that of the north rear facade were always
 10 intended to be redesigned with new openings to reflect the
 11 redesign.
 12 The front facade of the original 1926 house
 13 is intended to be preserved to reflect the design of the
 14 original 1926 residence. The front facade, an emphasis
 15 was again that the front facade remains to this day.
 16 We intend on preserving the original
 17 finishes, fenestrations, railings, chimney and pre-cast
 18 molding on that facade.
 19 Again, I'm going to emphasize that the intent
 20 of this presentation is to rebuild the areas that were
 21 unintentionally demolished in order to reflect the design
 22 intent of the originally-approved permit set of plans.
 23 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: That's about it.
 24 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: That's it.
 25 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Yeah.

1 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Thank you.
 2 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: I mean, like I said, I
 3 understand it's -- you know, this present -- you know,
 4 what we've done is pretty quick for all the materials that
 5 we have presented, so I would, you know, definitely, you
 6 know, if you have any questions for us to clarify.
 7 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I have one question.
 8 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Yes.
 9 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Is there anything different
 10 today than what was approved in the 2017 certificate of
 11 appropriateness?
 12 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Oh, on the part of the
 13 certificate of appropriateness, no.
 14 MR. GARCIA-PONS: No.
 15 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: There's nothing
 16 different.
 17 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Thank you.
 18 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: No problem.
 19 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: That's correct, right,
 20 Dona?
 21 MS. SPAIN: As far as I know.
 22 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Right.
 23 MS. SPAIN: I will check the drawings.
 24 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: No, no, no, no, as far as
 25 the drawings, yeah, I mean other than besides we're

1 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: That was the one interior
 2 condition that was --
 3 MS. SPAIN: -- interior condition --
 4 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Yeah.
 5 MS. SPAIN: -- they were building a wall.
 6 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Right.
 7 MS. SPAIN: -- inside the historic wall so
 8 that it would --
 9 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: There were abutting wall
 10 conditions, but the wall no longer exists, so.
 11 MR. GARCIA-PONS: So the answer was yes?
 12 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Not part of the -- was
 13 that part of the certificate of appropriateness?
 14 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 15 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Yes?
 16 MS. SPAIN: That was part of the, that was
 17 part of the plans that you submitted and that they
 18 approved.
 19 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Then yes. Sorry. Thank
 20 you.
 21 MR. EHRENHAFT: So if I may interrupt, so
 22 what I understand is that as an initial phase, what you're
 23 going to do is take the original plans from the house to
 24 the extent that they can be --
 25 MS. SPAIN: Well, they've redone them now.

1 rebuilding the house as --
 2 MS. SPAIN: They just want to start so they
 3 can finish what they got the approval for.
 4 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I just wanted to hear it.
 5 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Yeah, that's proper.
 6 MS. SPAIN: We want to make sure that the
 7 drawings were accurate going forward.
 8 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: We've met, you know, a
 9 couple of times --
 10 MS. SPAIN: Yes, we've met a couple of times.
 11 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: -- with the historical
 12 board and this caused the entire --
 13 MR. MENENDEZ: So did this go back to the
 14 board of architects as well?
 15 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: It did.
 16 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Yes.
 17 MR. MENENDEZ: Okay.
 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 19 MR. RODRIGUEZ: So this is just a
 20 clarification of what they were going to do to begin with?
 21 MS. SPAIN: That's right.
 22 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Correct.
 23 MS. SPAIN: But it needs to be accurate --
 24 well, there is a couple of differences because it was a
 25 double wall because you were saying --

1 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Yes.
 2 MS. SPAIN: These are going to go through the
 3 permit process --
 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right.
 5 MS. SPAIN: -- so they have those new areas
 6 included.
 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right. I'm not talking about
 8 the new areas, though. I'm talking about the historic
 9 structure itself --
 10 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Yes.
 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- that was to remain.
 12 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 13 MR. EHRENHAFT: So your intention is to
 14 rebuild that entire historic structure, including the
 15 entirety of the tile roof, everything, the entire
 16 envelope.
 17 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Correct.
 18 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Exactly as it was
 19 supposed to be, the envelope as it was.
 20 MS. SPAIN: But the existing structure that's
 21 there now will remain.
 22 MR. EHRENHAFT: No, I understand that.
 23 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Right.
 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: But you're going to --
 25 MR. RODRIGUEZ: There's not much there.

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: So I'm concerned that the
 2 reconstruction be as close in method and style as possible
 3 to the original.
 4 Now, I understand that, you know, if you've
 5 got -- you don't have original stucco, it's not going to
 6 match, but, but I would hope that you are using methods
 7 for that reconstruction that are not cutting corners and
 8 using, you know, metal over plastic beads and --
 9 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: And beads, et cetera,
 10 yes.
 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: In other words, old-style
 12 work --
 13 MS. SPAIN: Yes, and we've discussed that.
 14 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- the way it had been done
 15 in the first instance, at least for the historic portion.
 16 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Correct.
 17 MS. SPAIN: And we've discussed that with
 18 them.
 19 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 20 MS. SPAIN: And that's the intent, and they
 21 know that if there's any question, they can call us.
 22 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Exactly.
 23 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 24 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Now, do understand that
 25 we do have, you know, on the proposed approved originals

1 that there were new fenestrations, et cetera, so possibly
 2 the entire -- you know, most of the walls, especially, not
 3 on the original facade, but the east --
 4 MS. SPAIN: On the additions?
 5 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: -- and south and -- yeah,
 6 and also on the rebuilding, remember, some we had to --
 7 MS. SPAIN: Oh, yes, yes, yes.
 8 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: -- knock down part and
 9 redo it. That has to be re-stuccoed no matter what.
 10 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right.
 11 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: I mean, so that was the
 12 original.
 13 MR. MENENDEZ: But that would be new
 14 construction anyway.
 15 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: It's actually, before we
 16 need to restore it also, a portion of the house, that was
 17 actually added upon, so we actually had to actually, you
 18 know, stucco details, et cetera, as he's saying, so the
 19 intention is, yes, it's to do it specifically like or very
 20 close to what it was --
 21 MS. SPAIN: And on stucco, we have become
 22 fanatics, so we would ask them to do it on a board.
 23 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Right, like a test.
 24 MS. SPAIN: A test, and we come out and we
 25 initial it so that --

1 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Right, and approve it.
 2 MS. SPAIN: -- so they get the texture right.
 3 MR. MENENDEZ: To approve it, okay.
 4 MS. SPAIN: Correct.
 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: Now, that's for the
 6 reconstruction --
 7 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 8 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- of the demolished.
 9 MS. SPAIN: But we also do it with the new
 10 addition because I think it's supposed to be
 11 differentiated, and so we go out and we approve that also.
 12 Actually Kara will do that.
 13 MR. EHRENHAFT: But the new stuccoing could
 14 mimic what the original stuccoing was. Is that correct?
 15 MR. MENENDEZ: It should be different,
 16 shouldn't it?
 17 MS. SPAIN: On the addition, typically it's
 18 slightly different --
 19 MR. MENENDEZ: Right.
 20 MS. SPAIN: -- on the new addition, but on
 21 that portion of the historic home that they demolished, I
 22 believe it should match what was there originally.
 23 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Right. I think that's what
 24 the chair was asking.
 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: That's what I was asking,

1 yes.
 2 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Is that somehow written
 3 somewhere? Or I just want to make sure, particularly with
 4 the area that was mistakenly demolished --
 5 MS. SPAIN: You might want to put that in a
 6 motion.
 7 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: I'm clarifying it now,
 8 I'm clarifying whether I wrote it.
 9 MR. MENENDEZ: It should state it on the
 10 drawings.
 11 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: I put textured stucco
 12 finish, but however I should have put textured stucco
 13 finish to match existing residence.
 14 MR. MENENDEZ: Right.
 15 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: The rest -- the new
 16 addition is smooth stucco finish --
 17 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 18 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: -- just to show that
 19 clarification.
 20 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Right.
 21 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 22 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: But we will gladly put,
 23 "To match existing residence."
 24 MS. SPAIN: Because that makes sense.
 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: And I have only one other

1 question.

2 So is the reconstruction of the historic

3 portion going to go forward first and then thereafter the

4 other, or --

5 MS. SPAIN: I don't think it matters. I

6 would imagine they would do it whatever is easier for you

7 all, you know, so if you get the block guy out there, you

8 only get to do the block. It doesn't matter to us.

9 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Well, the problem at this

10 time, it's red tagged, so you know, they cannot, the

11 contractor cannot continue building until we are approved

12 here, so there's nothing going on.

13 MR. EHRENHAFT: I would just want to make

14 sure that you don't go down a path where then you have to

15 back up again. You know? So okay.

16 MS. THOMSON: But weren't there some design

17 changes to the new addition that -- there's something

18 Venny was talking about last time that there's some little

19 changes that now they would make. No?

20 MS. SPAIN: I don't know about changes.

21 MR. GARCIA-PONS: That was the question we

22 asked, and the answer is no.

23 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: No, we have not done

24 changes.

25 MS. THOMSON: Okay. We've got your answer,

1 no.

2 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: No. We actually met

3 twice and --

4 MS. THOMSON: I just remember --

5 MS. SPAIN: Yes, we keep meeting.

6 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: -- to make sure that

7 there are no changes.

8 MR. MENENDEZ: Anything else?

9 MS. BACHE-WIIG: So the original proposed

10 design, maintain the original house, and there were just.

11 you're going to do interior modifications, right?

12 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: And a large addition as

13 well.

14 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Right, and then that's what

15 got mistakenly demolished.

16 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: The portion of the north

17 side of the house.

18 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Yeah, because the north

19 side had new fenestrations, new openings. There was -- it

20 was blocked up by a storage addition that they did

21 sometime in the '50s, I believe, and we were just opening

22 up again to work with that area, was done to work with the

23 new plan.

24 But the east side, at least the contour was

25 being redesigned to make it look like the original 1926

1 residence to best of our knowledge, based on the plan and

2 based on what we had.

3 MS. BACHE-WIIG: You were working within that

4 envelope for the new --

5 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Correct.

6 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: That's correct.

7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Is there anybody else

8 other than the two of you here to speak? Okay.

9 MR. MENENDEZ: I move to approve.

10 MR. DURANA: I second.

11 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I'd like to make a

12 recommendation to that approval, that the architect

13 include that the portion of the home that was demolished

14 erroneously have a textured stucco finish to match the

15 existing residence. Does the mover accept that?

16 MR. MENENDEZ: That's fine.

17 MR. DURANA: I second.

18 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. If there's no further

19 discussion, may we call the roll, please?

20 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr.

21 Garcia-Pons?

22 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Yes.

23 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Rodriguez?

24 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

25 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss Thomson?

1 MS. THOMSON: Yes.

2 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Sardinas?

3 MR. SARDINAS: Yes.

4 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Durana?

5 MR. DURANA: Yes.

6 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss

7 Bache-Wiig?

8 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.

9 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Menendez?

10 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.

11 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Ehrenhaft?

12 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.

13 MR. CALIL, JUNIOR: Thank you very much.

14 MR. CALIL, SENIOR: Thank you, thank you very

15 much. Thank you. I know you worked very hard.

16 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I have a question for

17 staff. Can I ask that now, or should I wait till new

18 business?

19 MR. EHRENHAFT: Please, please do.

20 MR. GARCIA-PONS: So related to this

21 application, I know that the last meeting I asked if there

22 was any word from your colleagues as to what we can do in

23 the future.

24 MS. SPAIN: You know, I sent an e-mail to all

25 the certified local government historic preservation

1 officers in the State of Florida and got varying
 2 responses.
 3 I specifically asked whether something like
 4 this could void a certificate of appropriateness, and no
 5 one answered that they did that.
 6 They were interesting in the code provisions
 7 for if something like this happens, for the penalties
 8 involved, and I've sent those e-mails to the city
 9 attorney's office and we're working on it. That's a
 10 separate portion of the zoning code. That's not part of
 11 the historic preservation ordinance.
 12 So I think that we're able to toughen it up a
 13 little bit, and we're having those discussions. That will
 14 come back to you all.
 15 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Great. Thank you.
 16 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Just a comment: I went along
 17 with this because it's a proper thing to do, but this is
 18 not the first time this same owner and home has been
 19 before us when there's been a mistake, and there have been
 20 two very serious mistakes and we've excused them.
 21 And I'm just wondering what kind of mechanism
 22 do we have to protect against this happening, either
 23 another mistake by them or by someone else.
 24 MS. THOMSON: Exactly.
 25 MS. SPAIN: Well, that's what we're talking

1 with the city attorney's office on.
 2 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I mean, it really takes a lot
 3 of gall to come back after what they did before.
 4 MS. SPAIN: And I want to have that
 5 discussion with code enforcement also, and I have had
 6 discussions with the city attorney's office about the code
 7 enforcement issues.
 8 In the past, if someone, if a contractor goes
 9 beyond the scope of work and there's an existing open
 10 permit, they're not cited by code enforcement because they
 11 can go back to the city and correct it.
 12 And my argument is they can't, because on a
 13 historic property, the fabric is gone, and so we're having
 14 that discussion and I think that will be remedied, so.
 15 MR. RODRIGUEZ: And keep a tight eye on what
 16 they're doing.
 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 18 MS. SPAIN: I will keep a tight eye for the
 19 next two months.
 20 MR. RODRIGUEZ: And then Kara can follow.
 21 MS. SPAIN: And then Kara's eye will be on
 22 it, and hers is tougher than mine. All right. So the
 23 next, queue up, okay, 717 North Greenway.
 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. The next item is Case
 25 Number -- Case File COA (SP) 2019-014, an application for

1 the issuance of a special certificate of appropriateness
 2 for the property at 717 North Greenway Drive, a
 3 contributing resource within the Country Club of Coral
 4 Gables Historic District, legally described as Lots 23 and
 5 24, Block 23, Coral Gables Section B, according to the
 6 plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book Five at Page 111 of
 7 the public records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
 8 The application requests design approval for
 9 an addition to the residence, alterations to the
 10 residence, and auxiliary structure and site work.
 11 MS. SPAIN: So I'm going to turn this over to
 12 the architect. Staff is recommending approval.
 13 A motion to approve the design proposal for
 14 the property located at 717 North Greenway Drive, a
 15 contributing resource within the Country Club of Coral
 16 Gables Historic District, and the issuance of a special
 17 certificate of appropriateness, and there are no
 18 conditions that are recommended by staff.
 19 MR. JAUREGUI: Good afternoon. My name is
 20 Luis Jauregui. I'm with Eastshore Architects, 2727
 21 Salzedo Street in Coral Gables. Is this my presentation
 22 or yours?
 23 MS. SPAIN: Is this yours? Oh, okay. So
 24 this is a historic photograph from the 1940s. Here, this
 25 is yours. Right?

1 MR. JAUREGUI: Okay. Here we go. Okay, so
 2 this is mine. All right.
 3 So in this first page here, we see various
 4 pictures of the house from the Fischbaugh photograph which
 5 is in the sepia tone to the 1940s photograph.
 6 This property is one of -- a very unique
 7 property that it's only been two owners, so this new
 8 owner, Kathy Marlin, is the third owner for the property.
 9 The first one was there for roughly 40 years
 10 and the second one there for 50 years.
 11 The house is amazing inside, and it's been
 12 kept, kept really well. Kathy is going to restore all the
 13 existing windows which are very, very nice, and they have
 14 transoms on top that are stained glass. The windows that
 15 have been replaced with non-significant or inappropriate
 16 single hung windows and shutters and stuff like that,
 17 we're going to put more appropriate casement windows on
 18 the property.
 19 So the original house and detached garage
 20 with dwelling unit above was built in 1927 by architect
 21 H.B. Taylor. The principal building was added to in the
 22 rear which we will -- wait. I keep going to your
 23 photographs.
 24 MS. KAUTZ: Go right, right arrow.
 25 MR. JAUREGUI: So this is the location map of

1 the property. The principal building was added onto the
2 rear which we will be removing. It's the section right
3 there. If you look at the existing and demolished site
4 plan, there's, where it says principal building, you see
5 two little, two little jutting-out areas.

6 That is one story, and we'll remove it.
7 You'll see it more clearly in the elevations.

8 We will also be removing the interiors that
9 were chopped up with the advent of air-conditioning and
10 the need for multiple bathrooms.

11 So inside the house -- well, let me get --
12 let me do the site plan first. So in the site plan,
13 there's a principal building which basically the main
14 core, we're keeping. The one story addition in the back
15 is being removed.

16 There's a series of walls. There was a
17 screen enclosure and a swimming pool that was added onto,
18 and there's the original three-car detached garage with
19 dwelling unit on top that throughout the years got a bunch
20 of variances, and they added this very long covered porch
21 or breezeway and put a screen enclosure on top of it.

22 So we're not going to add any square foot to
23 the accessory building at all. What we're going to do is
24 try to improve that so that it's a little more compatible
25 and simpatico with the existing structure.

1 Also the bathroom -- the house originally had
2 only two bathrooms, one bathroom downstairs and one
3 bathroom upstairs, and they took this two-story foyer
4 entrance and they put a bathroom on the second floor
5 covering the master.

6 So, so what we're going to do is we're going
7 to eliminate the existing bathroom that's intertwined
8 there with the grand staircase.

9 And then the room all the way to the right
10 that has all the windows, it's -- three of the windows
11 have been blocked up, and we're going to recapture those.

12 It also has an amazing terrazzo floor with
13 this border all around it, and luckily when they put the
14 partitions there to make the closet and the dressing room,
15 they didn't destroy that, so we're going to repurpose that
16 to an upstairs family room for the family.

17 We're taking the far left bedroom and
18 converting that into the master bath, and then on top of
19 what's the kitchen and bathroom below, we're going to put
20 closets and the master bedroom.

21 And that's the extent of the addition, so
22 historically what we've done is we've taken the addition
23 away from the corner so that that corner is expressed.
24 We're going to use different motifs there, which I'll show
25 you in the elevation.

1 On the right where you see the proposed site
2 plan, you see that we're adding a 1,200-square-foot wing
3 to the house. On the first floor it's going to be a
4 kitchen and a family room, and on the second floor it's
5 going to be the master bedroom suite.

6 We're going to take the original three-car
7 garage that's now a playroom and get back two of the
8 garages, then relocate the playroom and the kitchen and
9 the bar and the cabana that's there.

10 So here on the floor plan, this is the first
11 floor plan, you see the section that's being removed which
12 is the breakfast room, the kitchen, the mechanical room
13 and the laundry.

14 Where you see the fireplace, to the right of
15 the fireplace, there's this beautiful elliptical entrance
16 into the dining room.

17 Well, on the left side, there's a same
18 elliptical entrance into the dining room, but they needed
19 to get air-conditioning in, so they closed that completely
20 down, and they put a cupboard on there and put a pantry.

21 So we're going to -- and we've done some
22 exploratory demolition, and that elliptical arch is in
23 perfect shape. There's floor underneath, there's
24 everything there, so we're going to use that as a gallery
25 to expand into the new family room and kitchen.

1 Some of the pictures on the right there, you
2 see the original stained glass, and then you see
3 nonoriginal stained glass that's being removed which is
4 the vase with the orchids on there.

5 Also an interesting thing is that the house
6 has amazing iron work, and we're going to keep all the
7 iron work and we're going to, you know, help it out, it's
8 a little tired, and make it nice.

9 In the room over here that we're calling the
10 living room, that room originally only had iron work and
11 these big awnings on there, and it was obviously no
12 air-conditioning. It has an amazing ceiling. You see it
13 there in that middle photograph.

14 That was actually exposed and open air, so
15 what we're going to do is we're going to remove the
16 jalousie windows that are there and put storefront windows
17 so that that wrought iron comes through and you can see it
18 again from the street.

19 It needs to be air-conditioned, so we're
20 going to try to make it feel more like it originally was,
21 an open, an open room there.

22 This is the front elevation. On top you see
23 that we're removing the awnings, the jalousie windows, and
24 on the very upper, upper right, there's some single hung
25 windows that are being removed, and we're replacing those

1 single hung windows with more appropriate casement
2 windows, and then down below where the two arches are,
3 that's where the storefronts are going, and the iron work
4 is behind those windows. You can kind of see it there in
5 that photograph.

6 Over here in this photograph you get to see
7 the addition from the west side. This is the carport
8 side, so basically it follows the roof line.

9 We are keeping the same pitch. We're using
10 the same tile material. We're using the same proportion
11 of windows that the house, the existing house has.
12 Unfortunately I forgot to take off the sills in the
13 addition. They'll go off so that there's no relationship
14 to the original house.

15 And what we're doing is that the existing
16 house has these very nice outlookers made out of wood, and
17 they have a certain proportion and style, and what I'm
18 doing is I'm going to put a cove molding underneath the
19 eave that's the same depth and width but has nothing to do
20 with the outlookers that are in the house, but just sort
21 of to memorialize that and keep the house functioning
22 together.

23 This is the rear elevation, so you can see up
24 there the one story portion that's all hacked up. Right?
25 It's been cut back. We're removing all of that.

1 We're going to expose the windows that are in
2 the dining room that were going through another room, so
3 that will go out to a dining terrace, and the family room
4 will also go out to that terrace also, and the house will
5 be a little bit more formal.

6 A curious note, the porch on the left was a
7 later addition, but it's very well done, so we're going to
8 keep that.

9 This is the east side, so here you're seeing
10 the addition on the other side, the two, the two doors
11 from the family room, the kitchen windows, and then the
12 master bedroom and closet windows all lining up together
13 with the windows below, the doors below.

14 And now we get to the auxiliary building. So
15 originally, as you can see, there was a three-car garage
16 with a dwelling unit above. The three-car garage has gone
17 through -- that whole auxiliary building has gone through
18 a lot of variances and permitting.

19 So they've converted the three-car garage
20 into a playroom, a cabana bath, a kitchen, and then that
21 bar, and that bar is just made out of pecky cypress wood.
22 It's just sitting below the covered porch.

23 So that's all going to go away, and what
24 we're going to do is, as you can see below, we're going to
25 capture two of the garages. We are going to put a masonry

1 wall between the garage and the bar function that was
2 originally there and create a bar, and just move the
3 playroom over to the right so that everything that was
4 there is still there, but we're recapturing the garage.

5 Then to book-end that very long covered
6 porch, what we're doing is we're adding a storage and a
7 barbecue area, and the barbecue will have a chimney that
8 comes through, and adding a gabled end where you see the
9 four columns, and that's right in axis with the new
10 swimming pool and the doors coming out of the dining room.

11 So now when you go to this house that's very
12 formal and you look out the dining room, you'll be able to
13 see straight through, and you'll have an empillade
14 (phonetic), if you will, where you'll have some
15 foreground, some mid-ground and some background.

16 The elevations of the accessory structures
17 are -- in the top you see what's there. The back of it is
18 a low four-foot wall, I want to say. I think that might
19 have been the original property wall of the house, and
20 then FP & L gave them the last five -- the five feet that
21 they were having, so they added that.

22 The original garages have sliding glass doors
23 now and an aluminum canopy which we're going to take off.

24 The dwelling unit on top luckily hasn't been
25 touched, and we're just going to keep everything the way

1 it is. We are going to change out the windows there
2 because the owner is looking for one space that's serviced
3 by a generator and is totally hurricane proof since she's
4 going to keep all of the windows in the house that are
5 original. She wants to go there should a hurricane hit.

6 So down below you see, you see the new
7 breezeway converted. On the right there's a massing of
8 building with a window that anchors that. Then it's all
9 open.

10 The gabled end that's going to be in line
11 with the new pool, the two windows for the playroom, the
12 memory of the garage, because we are recessing back the
13 wall with the window there, and then the two, two garages
14 on there.

15 And as you go around, you see on the right,
16 that's not changing except that we're having to replace
17 that stair and we're going to replicate it completely
18 because it's falling apart.

19 And on the bottom you see where there's the
20 lattice-work and the open, and the open breezeway, and
21 what we're doing is adding a small storage room to it.

22 In the pictures you see the awning and all
23 the walls that are around there.

24 This is the inside of the pictures. You see
25 the inside of the existing garage, all pecky cypress, the

1 bar, and that's it. That's my presentation. You guys
 2 have any questions?
 3 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Go back to that last slide
 4 for a second.
 5 MR. JAUREGUI: How do I do that? There we
 6 go.
 7 MR. GARCIA-PONS: The next one, please.
 8 MR. JAUREGUI: Yes.
 9 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Sorry. Can I --
 10 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes, please, of course.
 11 MR. GARCIA-PONS: The bottom is the new?
 12 MR. JAUREGUI: The bottom is the new.
 13 MR. GARCIA-PONS: And I think I misread in
 14 the plans. Is there a screen behind that wall between
 15 those two blank openings?
 16 MR. JAUREGUI: No. There used to be a screen
 17 enclosure. We're taking it down completely. That --
 18 MS. SPAIN: Like a pool enclosure.
 19 Mr. JAUREGUI: Like a pool enclosure, yeah.
 20 MR. GARCIA-PONS: The reason I ask is three
 21 slides back --
 22 MS. SPAIN: I think it's the other way.
 23 MR. JAUREGUI: Yes.
 24 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Is that note, is that what
 25 that note says on top on of where that little arch, the

1 This is a single family residence, and so what I'm reading
 2 is you're putting two kitchens in.
 3 MR. JAUREGUI: Oh, so this house has a
 4 Veteran's Card, and you know, there was a nanosecond in
 5 Coral Gables' history after World War II where they
 6 allowed people to do that.
 7 MS. THOMSON: Right.
 8 MR. JAUREGUI: And this is one of those
 9 cases.
 10 MS. SPAIN: So it's grandfathered in.
 11 MR. JAUREGUI: Yeah.
 12 MS. THOMSON: So this is existing. They're
 13 not putting a new one in.
 14 MS. SPAIN: That's right.
 15 MR. JAUREGUI: There's three kitchens in the
 16 house --
 17 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 18 Mr. JAUREGUI: -- the principal residence,
 19 the one below, and the one above, but two were rentals.
 20 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 21 MS. SPAIN: Yes, so that's -- and they're
 22 very well documented when you start going back into the
 23 permit history and you find those from the 1940s after the
 24 war, you know.
 25 MS. THOMSON: But don't they -- doesn't the

1 little gable is?
 2 MR. JAUREGUI: What does it say?
 3 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I think our set -- and the
 4 reason I'm asking is I can't read the note here, but I
 5 think it says --
 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: On the bottom, on the
 7 bottom --
 8 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Eight, and
 9 reconfigure openings.
 10 Mr. JAUREGUI: Oh, so what happens is that's
 11 an old-fashioned screen gutter type situation.
 12 So they used to make these gutters for the
 13 water to come down and they would put a piece of wall like
 14 this so that the screen enclosure would attach to, so
 15 right now when you see, when you see in that upper
 16 right-hand picture, there's beautiful rafters coming
 17 through, but it's being hidden by that thing that would
 18 hold the old screen enclosure, and that's what's being
 19 removed.
 20 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Thank you.
 21 MR. JAUREGUI: Yes.
 22 MS. THOMSON: Okay. I wanted to ask about
 23 the kitchen in the A2 --
 24 MR. JAUREGUI: Which one?
 25 MS. THOMSON: A2 03. Exactly, which one?

1 grandfathering go away? Did they change ownership of the
 2 house?
 3 MS. SPAIN: That does not go away.
 4 Mr. JAUREGUI: It doesn't go away.
 5 MS. THOMSON: It doesn't go away?
 6 MR. MENENDEZ: It stays with the property.
 7 MR. JAUREGUI: It stays with the property.
 8 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 9 MS. SPAIN: Now, if it's removed, you can't
 10 put it back.
 11 MS. THOMSON: Okay, got it. That's what I
 12 was thinking.
 13 MR. JAUREGUI: Exactly, exactly, and you pay
 14 two garbage and two fires, or three or whatever it is.
 15 MS. SPAIN: This is a wonderful project. I
 16 think you need to convince the owner to apply for ad
 17 valorem tax relief.
 18 MR. JAUREGUI: She's going to do that.
 19 MS. SPAIN: Because it absolutely will
 20 qualify, and you need to do the first part before you
 21 start construction.
 22 MS. MARLIN: You don't have to tell me.
 23 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 24 MR. GARCIA-PONS: You need to open it up to
 25 the public.

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: There's no further discussion.
 2 Would you like to speak?
 3 MS. MARLIN: I guess. Hi, I'm Kathy Marlin.
 4 Hi, I'm Kathy Marlin, the homeowner. My husband and I
 5 love historic houses, and this is the third one for us and
 6 this is our forever home. It's a house that, growing up
 7 here, I used to pass all the time, and I've always loved
 8 it from afar, and that the fact it has come our way is
 9 really, it's amazing.
 10 And so we're happy to bring her back to life
 11 and we're very excited.
 12 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Thank you.
 13 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you.
 14 MS. THOMSON: Great. Thank you.
 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Any further discussion
 16 from the dais? Okay.
 17 MS. THOMSON: No.
 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: The chair will entertain a
 19 motion.
 20 MS. THOMSON: I move that we approve the
 21 design approval -- the design proposal for this property
 22 and based -- and also considering staff recommendations,
 23 and the issuance of a special certificate of
 24 appropriateness.
 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: Is there a second?

1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
 2 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Durana?
 3 MR. DURANA: Yes.
 4 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss Thomson?
 5 MS. THOMSON: Yes.
 6 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Menendez?
 7 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.
 8 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Sardinas?
 9 MR. SARDINAS: Yes.
 10 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Ehrenhaft?
 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
 12 MS. SPAIN: Thank you, very nice project.
 13 MS. THOMSON: Beautiful, love it.
 14 MS. SPAIN: Okay. If you can queue up the --
 15 all right.
 16 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Next item on the
 17 agenda is Transfer of Development Rights. We have both a
 18 sending site and a receiving site, so it's Case Number
 19 File -- Case File TDR 2019-001, consideration of the
 20 Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 348
 21 Miracle Mile, legally described as Lots 8 through 11,
 22 Block One, Coral Gables Craft Section K, according to the
 23 plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book Ten, Page 40, of the
 24 public records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
 25 The application requests approval of a

1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Second it.
 2 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I'll second the --
 3 MS. SPAIN: Did anyone second it?
 4 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes. Two people seconded.
 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: Two people seconded.
 6 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Doesn't matter.
 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, okay. May we call the
 8 roll, please?
 9 MS. SPAIN: But who gets the second? We need
 10 to know.
 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: Oh, I'm sorry. I think --
 12 MR. SARDINAS: Raul was first I think.
 13 MR. EHRENHAFT: Raul was first. I'm sorry.
 14 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Now worries.
 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 16 MR. RODRIGUEZ: We can toss a coin.
 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yessie, could you call the
 18 roll, please?
 19 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss
 20 Bache-Wiig?
 21 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
 22 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr.
 23 Garcia-Pons?
 24 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Yes.
 25 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Rodriguez?

1 maintenance plan, authorization for the transfer of the
 2 unused development rights, and the issuance of
 3 Certificates of Transfer.
 4 MS. SPAIN: So this is a little different.
 5 The Transfer of Development Rights, it's a very simple
 6 thing that the city put into place to help the historic
 7 property owners maintain their property, and the concept
 8 is if you have a historical property -- and it has to be
 9 in certain areas of the city, not for single family homes.
 10 There are some apartment buildings on North Ponce that
 11 would qualify, but if you have a property that has a
 12 historic building on it, there are air rights.
 13 Let's say that there's no building on it.
 14 There are certain maximum amount that you can build on
 15 that property, including incentives, so if the existing
 16 historic property were to be able to be demolished, then
 17 they could build this maximum FAR on the site.
 18 So what the TDR ordinance does, it takes into
 19 consideration the size of the historic building. It
 20 subtracts that from the maximum amount that they could
 21 build, and what you have left over are your air rights,
 22 and they're able to sell them to a development.
 23 And again, the development has to be within a
 24 certain area of the city.
 25 So this first portion is about the

1 transferring of development rights, and let me get to --
 2 and I included in your packet the portion of the code that
 3 applies to Transfer of Development Rights.
 4 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Quick question: Are these
 5 contiguous, 340 and 348?
 6 MS. SPAIN: I have a map. Let me see. One
 7 of the properties -- there's two properties. One of the
 8 properties -- they were designated together. 348, 350 and
 9 340 Miracle Mile are contiguous.
 10 MR. RODRIGUEZ: They are contiguous?
 11 MS. SPAIN: Yes, uh-huh. So as you know,
 12 Miracle Mile was not developed by George Merrick. It was
 13 developed by the Zains, George Zain and Rebyl Zain. They,
 14 after World War II, developed Miracle Mile.
 15 And when the sending site was first
 16 designated, it was designated as two properties. It is
 17 now known as 348 Miracle Mile, so it's a little confusing,
 18 but that's what happened on that.
 19 It was the intent of the Zains to have this
 20 strip of commercial properties to be modern, high-end
 21 boulevard. It was not their intent to have it be a
 22 Mediterranean street.
 23 340 Miracle Mile was designed by Upton Ewing
 24 who was a notable local architect, and it's constructed on
 25 two lots. It's Art Deco/Moderne architectural style, and

1 this evening.
 2 I had a pretty lengthy presentation, but I
 3 think you've had a long agenda and staff has done a great
 4 job.
 5 Just with me this evening is the property
 6 owner, Mr. Stephen Bittel, the chairman of Terranova, of
 7 Terranova; along with Mindy McIlroy, the president of
 8 Terranova and also the past president of the Coral Gables
 9 Business Improvement District; and Bernardo Fort-Brescia
 10 from Arquitectonica who has designed the project at 220
 11 Miracle Mile site which is the old Starbucks location that
 12 I'm sure many of us have frequented in the past.
 13 And we're here before you, as Dona said, for
 14 two items. One is to obtain your approval of the
 15 maintenance plan and the certificate of transfer for the
 16 340 and 350 Miracle Mile projects.
 17 We have engaged Richard Heisenbottle who is a
 18 well-known and well-respected historian and architect to
 19 prepare the maintenance plan.
 20 The plan said that both buildings were in
 21 excellent condition, but there were a few items that
 22 needed to be addressed, and I'm happy to actually report
 23 that as of today, we've gone and addressed all those
 24 items, so all of the items that were mentioned in that
 25 report, we've gone ahead and fixed, so hopefully we'll --

1 there is a maintenance plan that was done by Rich
 2 Heisenbottle that is in your packet; the same with 348
 3 Miracle Mile that was also designed by Upton Ewing. Now
 4 they're known both as 348 Miracle Mile.
 5 So the condition assessment report and
 6 maintenance plan that was done by Rich, it was dated
 7 August 13, 2009. It has a general conditions report and
 8 recommendations on how to maintain the properties. It's
 9 actually very well maintained.
 10 What they're asking for is 7,509 square feet
 11 to be transferred. There was prior transfers in 2001 of
 12 22,415 square feet, so they only have 7,509 feet left to
 13 be transferred to the new proposal.
 14 And staff is recommending approval of the
 15 conditions assessment report and maintenance plan and
 16 approval of the issuance of a certificate of transfer of
 17 7,509 square feet, and my recommendation, but I understand
 18 there is -- they have something to say about it, but the
 19 recommendation to the city commission that no building
 20 permit for the receiving site at 220 Miracle Mile be
 21 issued until the remedial work that is in this report is
 22 completed. I'm going to turn it over to the applicant.
 23 MR. NAVARRO: Good evening, Mr. Chair, board
 24 members. For the record, George Navarro, office at 333
 25 Southeast Second Avenue. It's great to be here before you

1 MS. SPAIN: I'll check on that.
 2 MR. NAVARRO: Yes. So we have an e-mail from
 3 Mr. Heisenbottle that we'd like to submit into the record
 4 saying he inspected the site today and all the work had
 5 been done, so we're very proud of.
 6 And we're also very proud for the building
 7 that we are constructing at 220 Miracle Mile. We feel
 8 it's going to be a great contribution not only to the
 9 businesses along Miracle Mile, it's going to bring a lot
 10 of pedestrian activity, a lot of visitors to enjoy all the
 11 shops, all the restaurants, and all entertainment venues.
 12 We're asking to transfer 7,509 square feet
 13 from the two historically designated sites at 340 and 350
 14 Miracle Mile over to the 220 Miracle Mile project.
 15 This is going to be a seven-story hotel.
 16 It's a boutique hotel. It has ground floor retail, so
 17 we're activating the ground floor. It has some upper
 18 level amenity space and some ancillary commercial uses for
 19 the hotel.
 20 The site fully complies with all the
 21 requirements for the transfer of TDRs. It's located
 22 within the CBD. The sending site has already been
 23 designated as historic in 2001, and the maintenance plan,
 24 we're in full compliance.
 25 This project has gone through a very lengthy

1 review process. We still have one more stop which is city
 2 commission, but we've gone through DRC. This project was
 3 twice unanimously approved by the board of architects as
 4 to architectural design and for the Level One
 5 Mediterranean bonus.
 6 And I'm happy to say that as of last week, we
 7 went before the planning and zoning board who also
 8 recommended approval of the project.
 9 We've worked very hard with your historic
 10 preservation officer. We have positive staff
 11 recommendation, and we would ask that you please uphold
 12 the staff recommendation and approve our certificates of
 13 transfer so that we can move forward with this project.
 14 Our entire team is here to answer any
 15 questions that you may have.
 16 MS. SPAIN: I do have one e-mail that was
 17 sent late today.
 18 "Dear Preservation Board: Using TDRs to
 19 alter the character of Miracle Mile seems like a misuse of
 20 the concept. The 220 Miracle Mile is out of scale and
 21 lacks compatibility with the Mile. Please deny the
 22 transfer."
 23 And that's from Dolly McIntyre, 409 Viscaya
 24 Avenue.
 25 MR. NAVARRO: And the process we're

1 following, just to kind of respond to that comment, is
 2 there's been several TDR transfers already approved along
 3 the Mile, actually one from this site I believe as well.
 4 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 5 MR. NAVARRO: So this is something that's
 6 commonly done, and what it is, is to promote the
 7 preservation of properties and to, you know, allocate some
 8 of that unused development capacity. As opposed to
 9 putting it on that site, we're putting it somewhere else,
 10 so we're hoping to get your support here today.
 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 12 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Are we, are we doing --
 13 we're doing one item at a time, correct?
 14 MS. SPAIN: I think so.
 15 MR. GARCIA-PONS: How does that --
 16 MS. SPAIN: But you can change that. I mean,
 17 I didn't want it to get confusing.
 18 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Are we legally required to
 19 do it a certain way?
 20 MR. CEBALLOS: I would highly suggest that
 21 the maintenance and the preservation plan be addressed
 22 first.
 23 MS. SPAIN: Right.
 24 MR. CEBALLOS: And the receiving site be
 25 treated as a separate matter.

1 MS. SPAIN: That's what I thought.
 2 MR. NAVARRO: Could we have the dialogue on
 3 both and then just take both items separately for a vote
 4 since they're both kind of interrelated?
 5 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Well, and discussion.
 6 MS. SPAIN: No.
 7 MR. NAVARRO: And discussion, yes.
 8 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Right.
 9 MS. SPAIN: Yes, I agree.
 10 MR. NAVARRO: Because without the approval of
 11 one, we --
 12 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I have a quick question.
 13 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Did you read them, did you
 14 read them both in?
 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: No.
 16 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Okay, so --
 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: I read only the first in.
 18 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- we're only --
 19 MS. SPAIN: Right now you're only doing the
 20 maintenance plan.
 21 MR. EHRENHAFT: The maintenance plan and then
 22 approval --
 23 MR. RODRIGUEZ: The sending property --
 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- to the issuance of a
 25 certificate.

1 MS. SPAIN: Right.
 2 MR. RODRIGUEZ: -- if they were able to apply
 3 for a building permit to add to the top of the building,
 4 would they be able to go up seven stories?
 5 MR. NAVARRO: No, no, not on the --
 6 MS. SPAIN: On the sending site, no --
 7 MR. RODRIGUEZ: On the sending site.
 8 MR. EHRENHAFT: No.
 9 MS. SPAIN: -- because they don't have the
 10 required square footage.
 11 MR. NAVARRO: Yeah, we could go up on it.
 12 We'd have to obviously come before this board to get a
 13 certificate of appropriateness.
 14 MS. SPAIN: Yes, and that would be difficult
 15 to do.
 16 MR. NAVARRO: We'd have to go to the board of
 17 architects. We'd have to --
 18 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Okay.
 19 MR. NAVARRO: -- design a plan that would
 20 fit. I don't know if structurally you could do it, but
 21 you know, the idea was to not promote that, promote to
 22 have square footage transferred off site.
 23 MS. SPAIN: That's what's good about
 24 transferring the air rights.
 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right.

1 MS. SPAIN: Because you really keep the
 2 historical integrity of the building intact because
 3 they're not allowed to do the additions.
 4 MR. MENENDEZ: Right.
 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right.
 6 MS. SPAIN: They've sold off the ability to
 7 do that.
 8 MR. GARCIA-PONS: So the only thing that
 9 we're reviewing as part of this item is approval of the
 10 maintenance plan and approving the 7,500 square feet.
 11 MS. SPAIN: That's right.
 12 MR. GARCIA-PONS: And that's it for this one.
 13 MS. SPAIN: That's it.
 14 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Okay.
 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 16 MS. THOMSON: And the 7,500 square feet that
 17 you're talking about adding to this building, where is the
 18 parking going to be?
 19 MS. SPAIN: Okay.
 20 MR. MENENDEZ: It's got to be off site,
 21 isn't it?
 22 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I think --
 23 MS. SPAIN: Yes, but right now, we're only
 24 talking about the sending sites.
 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right.

1 them.
 2 MS. SPAIN: Right.
 3 MS. THOMSON: Uh-huh.
 4 MR. MENENDEZ: Zoning code for that area is
 5 maximum 70 feet height?
 6 MR. NAVARRO: So you have, there's --
 7 MS. SPAIN: Okay, but we're only talking
 8 about the sending sites now. I'm sorry. I want to keep
 9 you on track.
 10 MS. THOMSON: Yeah, but we --
 11 MR. MENENDEZ: But the sending site is
 12 maximum 70 feet?
 13 MS. SPAIN: I think that's all of Miracle
 14 Mile.
 15 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes. I'm just verifying.
 16 MR. NAVARRO: So there's -- from a zoning
 17 perspective, that is the minimum.
 18 If you take advantage of Level One, that
 19 bonus, you're allowed to go to 83 and a half feet, and if
 20 you go to Level Two Med bonus, you do a pure Mediterranean
 21 building, you're able to add an additional story, so
 22 you're able to go to a total of eight stories.
 23 It was historically at 190 feet, but when it
 24 was down-zoned a long time ago they put these caps in, but
 25 you still have the Mediterranean bonus requirements in

1 MR. GARCIA-PONS: We're approving, we're
 2 approving just on the sending site, whether the
 3 maintenance plan as provided to us is appropriate --
 4 MS. SPAIN: Right.
 5 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- to sending 7,500 square
 6 feet somewhere?
 7 MR. MENENDEZ: Right.
 8 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Not specifically to the
 9 next item? So this first item is just the maintenance
 10 plan --
 11 MS. SPAIN: The maintenance plan.
 12 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- and the number?
 13 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right.
 14 MS. THOMSON: It's just sending 7,500 square
 15 feet somewhere out there?
 16 MR. GARCIA-PONS: We're approving that they
 17 can do it.
 18 MS. THOMSON: That they can do it, okay.
 19 MR. CEBALLOS: It is basically the
 20 issuance --
 21 MS. THOMSON: I got it.
 22 MR. CEBALLOS: -- of the certificate of
 23 transfer.
 24 MS. THOMSON: I got it.
 25 MR. CEBALLOS: They have two years to use

1 your code and the special bonus.
 2 MS. SPAIN: And Level One is just for design.
 3 It's not for Mediterranean. It's called Mediterranean. I
 4 don't know why. It's very confusing.
 5 MS. THOMSON: Yeah, I'm confused. Are we
 6 talking about, are we talking about approving the design
 7 at this point, or is this just --
 8 MR. SARDINAS: No.
 9 MS. THOMSON: -- the feet out there in Never
 10 Never Land?
 11 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Excuse me. Can you just
 12 take that drawing down? Right. So we're not talking
 13 about the next project at all.
 14 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 15 MR. GARCIA-PONS: We're only talking about
 16 the maintenance plan and the 7,590 square feet. That is
 17 all that's being asked of us.
 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: On the property that is
 19 sending the air rights.
 20 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 21 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay?
 22 MS. SPAIN: So they could, they can -- you
 23 could issue the certificates of transfer, and if the
 24 proposal that we're not talking about now doesn't go
 25 forward, they have two years to use the transfer to

1 another site, so it's not about the receiving site.
 2 MS. THOMSON: Okay, and these people own this
 3 property and the air rights? They already own that?
 4 MS. SPAIN: Yes, yes.
 5 MR. GARCIA-PONS: The current owner. Do we
 6 have a picture of the existing building? Maybe that would
 7 help.
 8 MS. SPAIN: We do.
 9 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Can we pull just that, just
 10 the 220?
 11 MR. NAVARRO: Yes. These are, it's the
 12 bridal store and the Men's Wearhouse, so if you're
 13 familiar with those two.
 14 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
 15 MR. GARCIA-PONS: So what we're approving
 16 then is that that property --
 17 MS. THOMSON: Yes, I'm real familiar with
 18 them.
 19 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- that that property will
 20 never change --
 21 MS. SPAIN: Right.
 22 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- the one that they're
 23 going to show us now?
 24 MS. SPAIN: That's exactly right. Can you --
 25 I don't think she can see it.

1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I think you have to try
 2 again.
 3 MS. THOMSON: So I'm sorry if I'm confused.
 4 MS. SPAIN: That's okay, no, no, no.
 5 MS. THOMSON: I'm confused on this.
 6 MS. SPAIN: It's a little complicated, but --
 7 MS. THOMSON: Because this came out of
 8 nowhere.
 9 MS. SPAIN: -- the sending sites -- well,
 10 it's been around for quite some time. They used it on
 11 these same buildings in 2001.
 12 MS. THOMSON: But this project has come out
 13 of nowhere.
 14 MS. SPAIN: Oh, well, I don't know. I've
 15 been dealing with it. DRC, planning and zoning board,
 16 board of architects --
 17 MS. THOMSON: Has it gone through the
 18 protocol of steps to get approvals?
 19 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 20 MS. THOMSON: Or has it gone to like another
 21 area and gotten approval that it should have come here
 22 before?
 23 MS. SPAIN: No, no. It's appropriately
 24 before you.
 25 MS. THOMSON: Okay.

1 MS. THOMSON: I can't see it over here.
 2 MR. EHRENHAFT: May I interject and one --
 3 ask a sub-question?
 4 MS. SPAIN: Sure.
 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: So they have a two-year
 6 window to use that certificate of transfer. If that
 7 expires, does it all go away and they're back to status
 8 quo?
 9 MS. SPAIN: It expires in two years, right?
 10 MR. CEBALLOS: Yes.
 11 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 12 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 13 MR. RODRIGUEZ: So it would have to come back
 14 again.
 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: It would have to come back,
 16 right?
 17 MR. RODRIGUEZ: They send it.
 18 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 19 MS. THOMSON: Okay. So we're talking about
 20 adding height to these buildings here?
 21 MS. SPAIN: No.
 22 MR. MENENDEZ: No.
 23 MS. THOMSON: We're not talking about that at
 24 all.
 25 MR. MENENDEZ: You're taking away height.

1 MR. GARCIA-PONS: And we're not dealing with
 2 that project --
 3 MS. SPAIN: No.
 4 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- this time.
 5 MS. SPAIN: So a sending site -- you have air
 6 rights. If you have a property, a commercial property --
 7 MS. THOMSON: Yeah.
 8 MS. SPAIN: -- and you could build 5,000
 9 square feet on it and your building is 1,000 square feet,
 10 then you have 4,000 square feet that you could build on
 11 that property, but instead of doing that, they're selling
 12 those air rights. They're getting a certificate that
 13 allows them to sell them to a developer, and that money is
 14 used to maintain the historic property.
 15 MS. THOMSON: Okay. I understand that.
 16 MR. EHRENHAFT: Then the historic property
 17 will stay in its same posture and elevation.
 18 MS. THOMSON: Same footprint?
 19 MR. EHRENHAFT: Same footprint, yes.
 20 MS. SPAIN: Yes, yes, everything.
 21 MR. EHRENHAFT: They're foregoing the ability
 22 to build higher.
 23 MS. THOMSON: Alleyways will remain historic?
 24 MS. SPAIN: These sending sites will then not
 25 be able to add any square footage --

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right.
 2 MS. SPAIN: -- because they won't have any
 3 more buildable area to build.
 4 MR. GARCIA-PONS: They're going to go from
 5 7,500 to zero change.
 6 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 7 MS. SPAIN: Right. So that's a good thing
 8 for the sending sites.
 9 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 10 MS. SPAIN: Okay.
 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 12 MR. GARCIA-PONS: We need to open it to the
 13 public, or how do we do it?
 14 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes. So is there anyone
 15 present in the audience who wishes to speak in favor of
 16 this case? Anybody in opposition? Okay.
 17 So that closes the public hearing portion,
 18 and is there any further discussion from the board?
 19 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I would like to put forward
 20 a motion to approve staff recommendations as to designate
 21 this a sending site for the 7,500 square feet, 7,509
 22 square feet, and approve the maintenance plan as proposed
 23 by the applicant.
 24 MS. THOMSON: It's being ramrodded.
 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: Is there a second?

1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Second it.
 2 MR. DURANA: I second.
 3 MR. RODRIGUEZ: You have the second this
 4 time.
 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, okay. May we call the
 6 roll, please?
 7 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Sardinas?
 8 MR. SARDINAS: Yes.
 9 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Durana?
 10 MR. DURANA: Yes.
 11 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss
 12 Bache-Wiig?
 13 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
 14 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Menendez?
 15 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.
 16 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Rodriguez?
 17 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
 18 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss Thomson?
 19 MS. THOMSON: No.
 20 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr.
 21 Garcia-Pons?
 22 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Yes.
 23 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Ehrenhaft?
 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes. Okay. Next we have
 25 Item Nine, Transfer of Development Rights for receiving

1 site.
 2 The proposed development receiving site is
 3 located at 220 Miracle Mile, legally described as Lot 17
 4 to 24, inclusive, Block Two, Coral Gables Craft Section
 5 according to the plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book
 6 Ten, Page 40, of the public records of Miami-Dade County,
 7 Florida.
 8 The following historically designated
 9 properties are within 500 feet of the proposed development
 10 located at 220 Miracle Mile:
 11 280 Miracle Mile, the Miracle Theater. A
 12 lengthy legal description is on file at the Historical
 13 Resources and Cultural Arts Department.
 14 136 Miracle Mile, legally described as Lot
 15 13, Block Three, Coral Gables Craft Section, according to
 16 the plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book Ten, Page 40, of
 17 the public record of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
 18 130 Miracle Mile, legally described as Lots
 19 14 and 15, Block Three, Coral Gables Craft Section
 20 according to the plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book
 21 Ten, Page 40, of the public record of Miami-Dade County,
 22 Florida.
 23 Next, 2506 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, the H.
 24 George Fink Studio, legally described as Lots 22 and 23,
 25 Block Seven, Coral Gables Craft Section, according to the

1 plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book Ten, Page, 40 of the
 2 public record of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
 3 Finally, 169 Miracle Mile/180 Aragon Avenue,
 4 the Colonnade Hotel. A lengthy legal description is on
 5 file in the Historical Resources and Cultural Arts
 6 Department.
 7 Therefore, per Section 3-1006 of the Coral
 8 Gables Zoning Code, the Historic Preservation Board's
 9 review and approval of the proposed development is
 10 required to determine if the proposal adversely affects
 11 the historic architectural or esthetic character of the
 12 historic property.
 13 MS. SPAIN: Okay. So typically if there were
 14 no historic properties within 500 feet of this proposed
 15 site, the proposal would not come to this board, but the
 16 zoning code requires, if there's any historic properties
 17 within 500 feet of a development that's receiving TDRs,
 18 that it come to this board for review, so that's what this
 19 is about.
 20 The proposed development received board of
 21 architects preliminary approval on August 22nd. It was
 22 determined at that meeting that it meets Level One
 23 Mediterranean bonus, but that doesn't mean it has to be
 24 Mediterranean. It -- Level One bonus is a standards for
 25 all types of architectural design.

1 And I remember when that was put in the code
 2 because they wanted the ability to do something other than
 3 a Mediterranean bonus and have it just be incentive for
 4 good design, so that's what that was about, and it
 5 qualifies for that. That's the purview of the board of
 6 architects.
 7 Again, Miracle Mile was conceived by George
 8 Zain at the end of World War II, and it was interesting,
 9 he suffered from glaucoma, so when it was finally done he
 10 was blind, which I find --
 11 MS. THOMSON: He never could see it.
 12 MS. SPAIN: I know. He didn't get a chance
 13 to realize it, but he was convinced that Miracle Mile
 14 should be a modern street. He did not want it to be
 15 Mediterranean, and they went to the board of architects.
 16 And it was interesting, and I searched for
 17 something at the commission meeting because all the
 18 commission meetings from 1925, we have all of them, and so
 19 I tried to find where they talked about the board of,
 20 Coral Gables board of supervising architects, but they, in
 21 a special ruling, declared all buildings on Coral Way --
 22 it wasn't named Miracle Mile yet -- be modern, artistic
 23 and substantial, so I believe that this design actually
 24 qualifies as that.
 25 And staff is recommending a motion to

1 determine that the proposal does not adversely affect the
 2 historic, architectural or esthetic character of the
 3 historic properties located within 500 feet of the site
 4 and move the proposal of 220 Miracle Mile with the
 5 understanding that it requires further review and approval
 6 by the city commission.
 7 And again, what you're looking at is whether
 8 or not this design affects the historic properties. It's
 9 not about parking. It's about this design. If they --
 10 MR. SARDINAS: Which is the historic
 11 properties?
 12 MS. SPAIN: -- if they go to -- the five
 13 historic properties within 500 feet.
 14 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Which are they?
 15 MR. MENENDEZ: He just read them.
 16 MS. SPAIN: Sure.
 17 MR. GARCIA-PONS: It's the map right here.
 18 MS. SPAIN: They are the Colonnade Hotel, the
 19 Miracle Theater, Burger-Fi, 130 Miracle Mile which is A
 20 Well-Groomed Gentleman, and the H. George Fink building
 21 which is owned by the city.
 22 And as far as the parking goes, if they get
 23 to the city commission and the city commission requires
 24 them to provide parking, then this design is going to
 25 change so it will have to come back to you.

1 MS. THOMSON: Yes, it will.
 2 MS. SPAIN: So I -- we don't need to discuss
 3 the parking because that's a commission item.
 4 MS. THOMSON: That's fine. We don't have to
 5 discuss the parking, but --
 6 MS. SPAIN: Well, it's not in your purview.
 7 MS. THOMSON: No, right, but we're talking
 8 about a lot more development going in on the Mile than is
 9 there now, and there's something in there that says that
 10 parking, the parking be remote.
 11 MS. SPAIN: Yes. That's a code provision
 12 that's in the new code that's allowable.
 13 MS. THOMSON: Remote parking.
 14 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 15 MS. THOMSON: I mean, where is that going to
 16 be? Do they have any idea?
 17 MS. SPAIN: It needs to be within 1,000 feet,
 18 but again --
 19 MS. THOMSON: Uh-huh.
 20 MS. SPAIN: -- you're looking at this design
 21 and you're saying, and you're asking yourself does this
 22 design, regardless of what it has on the inside, affect
 23 the historic properties, and that's all you're looking at.
 24 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 25 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Again, just for

1 clarification on the purview of this board --
 2 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 3 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- regardless of whether
 4 this design requires variances and changes and any of
 5 that, that is not in our purview.
 6 MS. SPAIN: That's not. That's right.
 7 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Only the purview is if this
 8 design affects these properties --
 9 MS. SPAIN: That's right.
 10 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- that are adjacent.
 11 MS. SPAIN: That's exactly right.
 12 MS. THOMSON: Right.
 13 MS. SPAIN: Yes. It's only -- you're looking
 14 at those five properties, and you're asking whether or not
 15 this design, if it's built, will affect their historic
 16 integrity.
 17 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Thank you.
 18 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I have a quick question. On
 19 the map, it shows that there is a walkway between the Lots
 20 18 and 17, and then your plan looks like you shifted it
 21 over to the end. Is that correct?
 22 MR. NAVARRO: Yeah, correct. So we wanted --
 23 so we're actually widening it.
 24 Right now where it's located, it doesn't give
 25 a very good access. It's very close to, like to the

1 intersection, so whether you took the paseo or you
2 actually walked around the edge, you're not really getting
3 a lot of benefit, so we moved it, in working with planning
4 staff, as far west as possible so it could be closer to
5 the middle of the block. I think it serves a much better
6 purpose.

7 MS. THOMSON: And how long have you been
8 working with this?

9 MR. NAVARRO: Well, this project has been in
10 the works for over a year and a half.

11 MS. THOMSON: Over a year and a half.

12 MR. NAVARRO: With staff, we've been working
13 with staff, with DRC, I think we filed in June, so it's
14 been a while.

15 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Is there going to be a
16 presentation from the architect? Did you offer -- do you
17 have one?

18 MR. NAVARRO: We'd be happy to walk you
19 through the plan if you like. We did have an elevation.
20 We have Bernardo in the audience to answer any questions
21 that you may have, so.

22 MR. GARCIA-PONS: So I think now that we're
23 on this item, I would like to see the elevation back up --

24 MR. NAVARRO: Okay.

25 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- and any information you

1 rules of -- that apply to this location. It has a podium
2 that you see here at the base of the building that is 17
3 feet high.

4 It is -- it contains retail and it hugs the
5 street as is required by code along the entire length of
6 Miracle Mile and does the same as it turns the corner into
7 Ponce.

8 Recessed from the facade of the retail is the
9 hotel. The hotel has set-backs on both Miracle Mile and
10 Ponce as required by code as well. It follows the
11 formula.

12 And on the west side there is a different
13 rule that is based on the height of the building, and
14 there is a triangle that, depending on the height of the
15 building, you have to follow, and that is why that is a
16 larger set-back because it's what is called a side yard.

17 The building on the second floor has somewhat
18 of food and beverage and some small meeting rooms that
19 open into to a courtyard in the center, and then it has
20 two wings that come forward to the set-back, but the
21 middle section is significantly set back way beyond what
22 is required by code.

23 In other words, one could have chosen to fill
24 in that, but instead we created that recess in the center,
25 actually quite similar in composition to many of the

1 have on this.

2 I do have a couple of questions. My specific
3 one is regarding the properties, and I would also
4 appreciate that map, George, if you keep that one up
5 there, is the properties particularly catty-corner to
6 that, you know, the relationship of this building to that
7 building.

8 And I was just going to check through the
9 drawings again, a street elevation of the south side of
10 Miracle Mile, if I can ask you to either focus on that or
11 go through your presentation, however you want to do it.

12 MR. NAVARRO: Did you want the street section
13 on Ponce, or on Miracle Mile?

14 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Miracle Mile.

15 MR. NAVARRO: On Miracle Mile.

16 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Or again, if you want to do
17 your presentation, please go ahead.

18 MR. NAVARRO: Sorry. You'd like to see a
19 straight-on elevation?

20 MS. THOMSON: I can't hear you. Just turn it
21 on. Thank you.

22 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: This is the view in the
23 context of the balance of the neighborhood. Oh, Bernardo
24 Fort-Brescia from Arquitectonica.

25 The project follows the set-backs and all the

1 buildings that have existed in the past in Coral Gables
2 where there's -- including the building catty-corner,
3 including the building at the Biltmore where there's a
4 center courtyard recessed and two wings that come forward.

5 Generally in an arrangement where there's
6 always an odd organization, there is never a pair. It's
7 always the center is the window, so there's three and
8 three and seven, actually exact number as the buildings I
9 mentioned, the three, seven and three, and it creates
10 these two sort of pilasters that create that recessed
11 courtyard that you see here shaded that is further back.

12 And this is the podium that is done in shell
13 stone, and then the rest of the building is in stucco.

14 And then on the roof there is a recessed
15 pavilion that is the rooftop restaurant and bar that is at
16 the center of the building, so that creates an arrangement
17 of a base and then sort of a center middle portion of the
18 building, and then a crown that is further recessed where
19 there's terraces that surround on all four sides of the
20 building.

21 It is -- so that shows you these are all the
22 dimensions, and this is all as per is allowed by the
23 envelope that is permitted.

24 And it's all occupied space so there's no
25 evidence of cars, garage or anything. It's all rooms.

1 These are the two food and beverage operations. In the
 2 opening to the courtyard are the meeting rooms, and then
 3 these are four levels of rooms, but they're combined to
 4 give the vertical appearance of tall windows like in a
 5 more classical composition, and I think that's a summary.
 6 You asked about the facade of the building.
 7 There's one important feature in the design. You see it
 8 here in this elevation, is that there is a paseo that is
 9 being introduced.
 10 Currently the site has a paseo in the center
 11 of the site, and it is dark and is a tunnel essentially
 12 through the building. It is quite close to the corner so
 13 the function is hardly necessary because you're almost at
 14 the corner; might as well go to Ponce.
 15 So the idea of the paseo is to move the paseo
 16 as close as possible to the center of the block because
 17 these are very long blocks so it allows you to take a
 18 short-cut.
 19 This paseo normally required at ten feet is
 20 fifteen feet, and it is open to the sky so it has natural
 21 light so it's not a dark corridor, so to speak. Instead
 22 it's a real, like the word says, paseo that is open to the
 23 air, and it has light and air and flow.
 24 And that is where we have also provided
 25 bicycle parking, scooter locations and benches and other

1 elements, and we have an art wall over to the side, and it
 2 is, it has a portion of the paseo that the required paseo
 3 is ten feet, it is 15. This portion is covered so that it
 4 protects, if one chooses to, in case of a rainy day or if
 5 there's cafe tables or whatever. You know?
 6 So these are some of the features. You see
 7 the planters that form the gardens on the terrace that
 8 goes the entire length, and the terrace wraps to one side
 9 and wraps to the other side towards Miracle Mile.
 10 When I mentioned the angle, there's actually
 11 a code calculation that gets this corner that creates that
 12 larger distance to the next-door neighbor. Here these are
 13 the required set-backs, of course, that is per code.
 14 So this, this penthouse is permitted to be 13
 15 and a half feet that's shown, and then the rest is as
 16 allowed. There's no variances or specific other requests
 17 when we went to the zoning board or the board of
 18 architects. This is exactly complying in the envelope
 19 that is permitted.
 20 MR. EHRENHAFT: So may I interject and ask a
 21 couple questions, please?
 22 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Sure, please.
 23 MR. EHRENHAFT: So the ground floor, the
 24 front facade is going to butt up to the sidewalk just as
 25 the buildings do today in that site. Is that correct?

1 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Correct. It is a
 2 requirement, and we're following it.
 3 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 4 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: You have to be at the
 5 edge.
 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, and from there then, at
 7 the top of your 17-foot level, you have some garden space
 8 so there is set-back further?
 9 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Correct.
 10 MR. EHRENHAFT: And when I was reading the
 11 documents, I had the impression that the core where you've
 12 got your bay of seven as opposed to the threes on the
 13 ends, the threes come out a little bit further forward.
 14 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: A lot further, yes.
 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: And then about -- was it 35
 16 feet that --
 17 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: I believe so. I have the
 18 floor plans if you like to see them, yes.
 19 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- that the -- but the center
 20 core is set back significantly further than the two, two
 21 groups of --
 22 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Correct.
 23 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- of structures that are
 24 just three bays wide, right, three windows?
 25 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: That is correct, way more

1 than what the code requires, but we were looking to create
 2 that effect of the two wings and the courtyard.
 3 You can see it, yes, this is, this is the
 4 second floor -- bring me the typical floor. You know,
 5 this is the second floor and it is correct -- I'm sorry,
 6 I'm getting on the way to everybody, everybody.
 7 This is the second floor where you see here
 8 the set-back where the terrace is and it wraps around and
 9 comes back this way, and yes, you are correct, it's 24 and
 10 a half feet plus the set-back, so it's 35 and a half feet.
 11 And that set-back continues, but in the
 12 middle there is a significant retreat from the edge which
 13 you can see in this effect here, and you can see here the
 14 arrangement of the rooms. You are correct, the rooms
 15 project forward on the two side wings, and in the middle
 16 they're recessed.
 17 And maybe I'll take this over there so that
 18 everybody can see it's far away.
 19 See the center portion of the building is
 20 recessed beyond the required set-back. The required
 21 set-back is that line that you see there, and that is that
 22 we create therefore that courtyard that is used for
 23 outdoor dining overlooking Miracle Mile, although the
 24 outdoor dining would also surround here. There's one
 25 restaurant on this side and one on this side, and the

1 meeting space opens to that garden, and that is the way it
 2 is, it is planned.
 3 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Can you leave that one up?
 4 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Excuse me?
 5 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Can you leave that plan up?
 6 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Sure.
 7 MR. GARCIA-PONS: And can you get the ground
 8 plan as well? Do you have the ground level?
 9 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes. I can move it over
 10 there, somebody can see it. This is the ground level --
 11 oh, this is the second floor. Sorry.
 12 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Right.
 13 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: And on the ground floor --
 14 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Put it right --
 15 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: This is the ground floor.
 16 Sorry, it's upside down.
 17 But this is, that's the paseo that I'm
 18 referring to. The paseo used to be here in the center,
 19 but you can see it was almost at the corner, had no
 20 purpose. Instead the paseo is being moved closer to the
 21 center of the block, and it's open air and natural light
 22 and something that the planning department has been hoping
 23 in the future people also do instead of doing it as a
 24 corridor internal to a building, and that is what we have
 25 done here.

1 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes, yeah, they will, as
 2 needed. We don't know the tenants' layout yet, but the
 3 idea is that along this edge, they can have cafe tables
 4 and activate and be glass, you know, that, the enclosed
 5 wall.
 6 MS. THOMSON: So right now in the back where
 7 you have all -- see, I consider Miracle Mile the front in
 8 that.
 9 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: This is Miracle Mile.
 10 MS. THOMSON: That's Miracle Mile, and
 11 that's --
 12 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: This is the alley.
 13 MS. THOMSON: -- the alley, okay, that's what
 14 I'm talking about, the alley. Okay, so what you're doing
 15 is you're using the alley for patio space --
 16 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: No.
 17 MS. THOMSON: -- back there?
 18 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: We're just making it look
 19 prettier. Like many other cities are doing, we're --
 20 you're using -- we are following the pattern that has been
 21 already done.
 22 We're taking it down the paseo around Ponce,
 23 and we are actually making nice pavers in the alley to
 24 make it more attractive. It is a different kind of paver
 25 because it is thicker. It looks the same because of the

1 We have bike positions both at the entrance
 2 on both ends. If somebody is coming and parks here, they
 3 can tie it here or here, depending whether they come from
 4 which side.
 5 And this, this is the whole frontage of
 6 retail, and the only place where we're setting back is
 7 where the doors are because you're not allowed to open the
 8 door and slam somebody, you know, so you have to recess,
 9 and you'll notice in most stores they have that recess
 10 where the doors are, these positions, of course, depending
 11 on the leasing when it's completed, you know, so these
 12 doors do have to recess.
 13 And -- but it's all lined with retail as is
 14 the preference of the planning department to enhance the
 15 retail activity on Miracle Mile.
 16 MR. EHRENHAFT: Two more questions: The
 17 paseo is exclusively pedestrians?
 18 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes, yeah, and/or bikes,
 19 yeah.
 20 MR. EHRENHAFT: And for commercial spaces
 21 that are on the ground level, do they have, along the
 22 paseo --
 23 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Windows.
 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- windows, but do they have
 25 openings to go into those commercials spaces?

1 weight of vehicles and trucks that go.
 2 But the idea is to make alleys a little bit
 3 more pleasant and like they've been doing in Miami Beach
 4 on Lincoln Lane behind Lincoln Road to try to enhance the
 5 alley and make it eventually a nicer place because it's
 6 actually visible by people going from the garages to
 7 Miracle Mile, so you actually cross through a rather dingy
 8 place.
 9 And instead what we've done is unlike --
 10 well, in the future it probably will be a requirement, is
 11 that we have made all our trash refrigerated and closed
 12 and concealed instead of doing it in big bins out in the
 13 open, and these are some improvements that we're trying to
 14 make to make the alley a little nicer.
 15 MS. THOMSON: Okay. So your alley is nice
 16 behind your building, but --
 17 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Of course, the next guy
 18 hasn't done anything.
 19 MS. THOMSON: The next guy needs to do
 20 something then.
 21 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yeah. Hopefully,
 22 hopefully we set the example so in the future buildings
 23 will have refrigerated trash that is not smelly, because
 24 in the end, people do cross the alley when they go from
 25 the garage to Miracle Mile, so we're trying to make the

1 alley a little bit more of a liveable, acceptable place.
 2 MS. THOMSON: Now, there's been talk about
 3 renovating the garage and there's been plans that have
 4 been presented, and like two of the commissioners -- I
 5 know all this stuff -- two of the commissioners have
 6 knocked it down and the developers have come in and spent
 7 like two million dollars just trying to satisfy these two
 8 commissioners.
 9 And my question is what is happening with the
 10 garage space? Because you don't --
 11 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Well, there's a garage now
 12 and another proposals to do a better, more modern, a
 13 larger garage.
 14 MS. THOMSON: Do you have that proposal?
 15 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Well, we -- do I have --
 16 Ms. THOMSON: Uh-huh.
 17 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It's not in our purview,
 18 but we've seen proposals --
 19 MS. THOMSON: Got you.
 20 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- by the plan -- by the
 21 parking authority to do a better garage, and I know they
 22 are --
 23 MS. THOMSON: Uh-huh.
 24 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- looking forward to
 25 actually --

1 Miracle Mile.
 2 Ms. THOMSON: Uh-huh.
 3 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: So now then they know our
 4 plans, of course they are thinking how to coordinate
 5 because the paseo is a big feature for the garage access.
 6 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 7 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: And they want to make it
 8 as pleasant as possible, and of course, we're putting the
 9 nice pavers so people will be able to cross easily from
 10 the garage to Miracle Mile once the new garage is
 11 implemented.
 12 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 13 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Also there is a new,
 14 there's a Cheesecake Factory I think or something going on
 15 here next door to us, so that's being also improved.
 16 But of course what we would like to
 17 encourage, that that new garage is built because it would
 18 be nice for also, for our restaurants and for that and
 19 exploit the --
 20 MS. THOMSON: And of course, the city is
 21 supposed to build the new garage, I understand.
 22 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Correct, and they're --
 23 apparently they have plans to do it, and what we want to
 24 do is that we don't want our paseo that we're dedicating
 25 to the city to be built for no reason. You know?

1 MS. THOMSON: Are you Mr. Bittel --
 2 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: No.
 3 MS. THOMSON: -- by the way?
 4 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: I'm Bernardo Fort-Brescia.
 5 I'm the architect.
 6 MS. THOMSON: Bernardo.
 7 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yeah.
 8 MS. THOMSON: Is Mr. Bittel here?
 9 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes, here.
 10 MS. THOMSON: Okay. I didn't know -- I was
 11 confused as to who these people were.
 12 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: No, sorry. No, we know
 13 that the planning department, they've expressed in the
 14 previous hearings that their intent is some day --
 15 MS. THOMSON: Uh-huh.
 16 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- to do, their plan is to
 17 do a nicer garage which we would encourage them.
 18 MS. THOMSON: Uh-huh.
 19 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: And I think that they're
 20 trying to, since we're offering such a nice wide and
 21 open-air paseo, they're trying to, their plan is trying to
 22 match the descent from the garage --
 23 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 24 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- to be in front where
 25 the elevators come so people can just cross directly into

1 Ms. THOMSON: Right.
 2 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It should be coordinated
 3 with the garage so that since we're providing nice access.
 4 MS. THOMSON: I figured there was something
 5 going on like that. Okay.
 6 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It's a -- and I think it
 7 will be a lot more pleasant than today.
 8 MS. THOMSON: Sure.
 9 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It's rather dingy and
 10 dark --
 11 MS. THOMSON: Sure.
 12 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- and musty to go through
 13 the building.
 14 MS. THOMSON: Thank you.
 15 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: So that is, that is the
 16 ground floor plan, and you can see in the elevation this
 17 is where you would emerge, close to the middle of the
 18 block which is what the purpose of the paseo.
 19 MS. THOMSON: What about the tenants, the
 20 people that, that, the small businesses and like dentists
 21 and stuff that are down there, are they going to still be
 22 down there on the, in this block?
 23 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Actually, no, there's no
 24 tenants. The building has already been largely vacated.
 25 MS. THOMSON: Really?

1 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yeah.
 2 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 3 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yeah, this has been --
 4 MS. THOMSON: Got it.
 5 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- in preparation for a
 6 long time.
 7 MS. THOMSON: Uh-huh, okay.
 8 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: And only finally that the
 9 tenants are all cleared that we can do this.
 10 MS. THOMSON: Great. Thank you.
 11 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: And some of the
 12 restaurants are looking forward to the second -- to
 13 entering below and going up to the second floor because
 14 the idea of a terrace overlooking Miracle Mile, outdoor
 15 dining, is quite attractive for many of the potential
 16 tenants that are excited about moving here.
 17 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Mr. Chairman, I have a
 18 couple more questions. There's a Sheet A 22 or A 23 which
 19 is kind of street section or the street elevation. I
 20 don't know if you have those boards, but that's the ones
 21 I'm going to refer to in our package.
 22 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: This is the street,
 23 Miracle Mile.
 24 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Right, but this is the
 25 longer version showing more of the street, not just the

1 my question --
 2 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Oh, yes.
 3 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- specifically my question
 4 is the incrementality, if that is even a word, of the
 5 facade.
 6 You know, there's the parcelization of
 7 Miracle Mile which has buildings of a certain width and
 8 height that vary in texture, color, massing, et cetera,
 9 and this particular building is all one height, one mass
 10 and one plane.
 11 I don't know if there's -- is there any
 12 thoughts moving forward as to the relationship of that
 13 facade to the street, or is that it? And the question
 14 specifically is awnings or any other materiality that
 15 projects from that glass curtain wall that you have.
 16 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes. Of course, Miracle
 17 Mile is rather eclectic because there's regular buildings,
 18 the little Swiss chalet, then that long building here.
 19 You know, it switches from -- the dimensions are very --
 20 it's not intended to be uniform. Right? And it's -- so
 21 there's very large buildings that are very long, and other
 22 ones that are very short.
 23 The awnings that we hope we could get
 24 approved eventually will be presented, depending on the
 25 tenant. We are presenting what is a base building, and

1 elevation of your building.
 2 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Oh, the rest, yeah, yeah,
 3 we have them, yes.
 4 MR. GARCIA-PONS: So in our package for
 5 everyone on the board, it's A 22 and A 23 --
 6 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes.
 7 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- which really it's A 22
 8 which talks about --
 9 MS. SPAIN: So is it that one?
 10 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- the building character.
 11 That's correct.
 12 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes.
 13 MR. GARCIA-PONS: So my questions are going
 14 to be the relationship of the 17-foot high podium in
 15 relation to the rest of the street, and it appears to
 16 be --
 17 MS. THOMSON: Higher.
 18 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- in line with the
 19 character and height of the existing buildings on the
 20 street.
 21 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes. It is -- we have a
 22 podium --
 23 MR. GARCIA-PONS: My comment --
 24 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- that comes forward.
 25 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- my question, Bernardo,

1 the building is doing what the code requires, which is
 2 this linear, it has to stay on the edge of the street, and
 3 actually it is not -- it's a very good policy because in
 4 many cities when people created deep recesses, those
 5 stores die. They're far away. You don't have eye contact
 6 with the storefront, you know, that is really close to
 7 you.
 8 But you are asking whether we would
 9 contemplate awnings in front and coming forward. If the
 10 city allows, you know, that they come forward, we would
 11 like it a lot, you know.
 12 This is for rain protection. Actually, this
 13 is the north side so it's more for esthetics and for other
 14 reasons than the sun, but it is -- yeah, we would not
 15 object, but I think it depends on the tenant, because I
 16 don't know if we would want it all uniform because it
 17 would look maybe too much like a strip center.
 18 Ms. THOMSON: This --
 19 MR. GARCIA-PONS: The second question --
 20 sorry. Can I --
 21 MS. THOMSON: No, it's okay. Go ahead, and
 22 I've asked enough.
 23 MR. GARCIA-PONS: The second question is do
 24 you have anything that shows this project in context with
 25 the Colonnade across the street as far as the podium and

1 the building? Is there any -- I don't see any drawings in
 2 the package that show the Colonnade in any way, shape or
 3 form.
 4 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Actually we have a view
 5 from the Colonnade if I can pull it up.
 6 The Colonnade, of course, has the same
 7 composition at its base, but of course it's so much
 8 taller. It's like 13 feet -- 13 stories. It's just
 9 actually --
 10 MS. THOMSON: But it's beautiful.
 11 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- it's a much larger
 12 building than what --
 13 MS. THOMSON: This thing.
 14 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Right, so I think the
 15 question, I'm trying -- and the reason I'm asking the
 16 question is, and this is --
 17 MS. THOMSON: I understand.
 18 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- a question for staff --
 19 MS. THOMSON: Right.
 20 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- is again what our
 21 purview is, it's very tightly written, is how does this
 22 project fit, my understanding, this, does it affect the
 23 historic properties, and I'm trying to think of --
 24 MS. THOMSON: Right.
 25 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- if this building, if

1 MS. SPAIN: Right.
 2 MS. THOMSON: Uh-huh.
 3 MR. GARCIA-PONS: The ground floor --
 4 MS. SPAIN: The rotunda, the rotunda portion
 5 of it.
 6 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- rotunda, in fact, the
 7 historic portion of the building.
 8 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 9 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yeah. Well, there are
 10 some similarities and some differences, and of course, the
 11 composition of that two solids and the void is quite
 12 similar in the way it is composed with the fact is that
 13 you see where the end of that detailing of the pillars is,
 14 is about the height of our podium, but under the current
 15 code, you're not to create a recess. You know?
 16 So our property does come here to this height
 17 and the void occurs here above the ground floor, because
 18 the ground floor in this case is void, and actually this
 19 was intended originally as a bank, and it's quite
 20 different than retail.
 21 Actually it hurts the retail that it's set
 22 back behind the columns.
 23 MS. THOMSON: The bank.
 24 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It's really tough space
 25 for that reason. It feels dark and recessed.

1 designed and built this way in this location, would affect
 2 the historic properties specifically designated in this
 3 report which includes that building, and I would like to
 4 know in context perhaps what the height of the existing
 5 building would have been, the character of that building
 6 in relationship, like what is the relationship of these
 7 two corners.
 8 And again, I just don't see a drawing that
 9 talks about it. I don't know if you have any --
 10 MS. THOMSON: No.
 11 MR. GARCIA-PONS: -- information about that.
 12 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Well --
 13 MS. SPAIN: That's a larger building. That's
 14 a two-story.
 15 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It's a so much larger
 16 building.
 17 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 18 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It's like --
 19 MS. SPAIN: That's pushed way back, though.
 20 MR. GARCIA-PONS: So I'll even narrow the
 21 question.
 22 MS. SPAIN: The front part of it is the
 23 historic portion of it.
 24 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Right. I'll narrow it to
 25 just the historic portion of the building.

1 So in our case we do have the arrangement of
 2 two symmetrical pillars. We have a void, but we don't
 3 have -- but we do have an occupied base to the edge which
 4 actually the code requires.
 5 It's not our choice to create a courtyard in
 6 the middle, but I think a courtyard would be detrimental
 7 to the retail success, so, but in every other respect, we
 8 tried to follow the compositional arrangement of that
 9 building, and I think we do propose what is a good
 10 relationship.
 11 Now, needless to say, we don't have the
 12 adjacency to this building like this one has, but this,
 13 even though it's, I can't believe 13 stories -- I guess
 14 that was at some point considered compatible with the
 15 Florida National Bank -- we are a much lower building.
 16 We're just this height.
 17 MS. SPAIN: And I'd like to also point out
 18 that the existing building -- do you have a photograph of
 19 the existing building that's on 220 now? Because that's
 20 one long building.
 21 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes.
 22 MS. SPAIN: You know?
 23 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: There is a two-story --
 24 MS. SPAIN: Right.
 25 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- existing building as

1 you all know where Starbucks used to be.
 2 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 3 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Which is actually far less
 4 compatible. I mean, it's, that's sort of a mint color
 5 building.
 6 MS. THOMSON: Starbucks and Einsteins?
 7 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Excuse me?
 8 MS. SPAIN: I'm sorry, Starbucks and
 9 Einsteins?
 10 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes, that's right.
 11 MS. SPAIN: Yes, yes, that one --
 12 MS. THOMSON: Okay.
 13 MS. SPAIN: -- that building.
 14 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes. It's not a beauty,
 15 but it's, that is from -- you know.
 16 MS. SPAIN: That's all right. It doesn't
 17 matter. People know that building.
 18 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It's not going to be
 19 there, but it's largely empty as you know.
 20 MS. THOMSON: I think, didn't it used to be
 21 like a Three Sisters store and Jean Nicole, or is that
 22 another block?
 23 MS. McILROY: No. Three Sisters was at the
 24 far corner and (inaudible).
 25 MS. SPAIN: You're right. You're good.

1 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Wow, Jesus.
 2 MS. THOMSON: I grew up here.
 3 MS. SPAIN: I'm sorry. If you're going to
 4 testify --
 5 MS. McILROY: I'm sorry, Mindy McIlroy,
 6 Terranova.
 7 MR. BILLET: Three Sisters and Jean Nicole
 8 were the same company.
 9 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes. The proposed
 10 building is actually not even as long and of course not as
 11 high or any of it. You know, it's, in fact, a much more
 12 parcel as you can see from the plans, and there's -- I
 13 don't know if anything else that you'd like to see, and I
 14 have full drawings of everything else if you like.
 15 MS. SPAIN: So I think the Colonnade is the
 16 anomaly on Miracle Mile because it's a Mediterranean style
 17 ornate building, which I think is fine, surrounded by
 18 modern buildings. That's my view on the Colonnade. It's
 19 an interesting question.
 20 MS. THOMSON: When was the Colonnade built?
 21 I don't even know.
 22 MS. SPAIN: In the '20s.
 23 MS. THOMSON: In the '20s?
 24 MR. RODRIGUEZ: It predates the Miracle Mile
 25 concept --

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yeah.
 2 MR. RODRIGUEZ: -- at the time.
 3 MS. THOMSON: It predates it.
 4 MS. SPAIN: Yes, it does, absolutely.
 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: By about 25 years.
 6 MS. SPAIN: By the time the 1940s, after the
 7 war came around, the original 1920s buildings that were
 8 there apparently had all been demolished, and so it was
 9 like a do-over. They wanted it to be modern.
 10 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: I mean, it was, I read
 11 some story --
 12 MS. THOMSON: Convenient.
 13 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- it was done by one of
 14 the -- what's his name, my gosh -- the banker that started
 15 Florida National Bank that came from the DuPont family,
 16 and it was intend to be some grandiose --
 17 MS. SPAIN: I believe it was George Merrick's
 18 sales office originally.
 19 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Oh, yeah?
 20 MS. THOMSON: Was it? Yeah.
 21 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Oh, is that where he
 22 started?
 23 MS. SPAIN: Yes, that's where he started.
 24 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Wow, so you know better,
 25 of course.

1 MS. SPAIN: Not really.
 2 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It says, of course you
 3 know, and that's the cover.
 4 MS. SPAIN: Okay.
 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: I have just a couple of
 6 personal comments. I like the fact that the set-backs
 7 have been included in the upper stories.
 8 There are other buildings that have been
 9 built in the Gables in the last half decade that are just
 10 masses of concrete that rise straight from the sidewalk
 11 from -- with almost no, no set-back, so at least when
 12 you're on the street, you're not being slammed in the face
 13 by that rising facade, and the fact that the center,
 14 center court recedes even farther I think is a plus.
 15 And I see the columns that are on the podium
 16 below in your structure are round and limestone.
 17 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Yes.
 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: So that was intended to
 19 recapitulate what was --
 20 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Excuse me.
 21 MR. EHRENHAFT: Was that chosen to
 22 recapitulate or nod, give a nod towards what the facade of
 23 the Colonnade was?
 24 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Correct. You got it
 25 right.

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.

2 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It was, there are circular

3 columns here, and we picked up on that and tonally the

4 sand color as well.

5 But you're correct, they're circular. You

6 picked up a very important part and aspect, and they are

7 in the shell stone material.

8 MS. THOMSON: See, if this one, this building

9 -- you talk about modern and George Zain created Miracle

10 Mile with a modern flare. This looks Georgian to me.

11 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: I see. Well, I think that

12 clean lines are modern. There's not --

13 MS. THOMSON: Okay.

14 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: -- there's not an -- I

15 mean, there's sort of clean geometry.

16 MS. THOMSON: This kind of struck me, when I

17 first saw the rendering here, it struck me, there's this

18 shopping center on Coral Way and 32nd Avenue that's like

19 ugly, and so that's what this struck me as.

20 MR. RODRIGUEZ: That's what --

21 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: I don't think so.

22 MS. THOMSON: It's like a wall that hits your

23 face.

24 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: This is a lot smaller, a

25 lot smaller.

1 MS. THOMSON: Yeah.

2 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: It's a fraction of that

3 for you, and it's solid. This has windows. It has glass.

4 It has details that's borders to the windows. I don't

5 imagine there's a comparison, frankly.

6 MS. THOMSON: I still think there's a lot of

7 thought that has to go into the parking for this because

8 you're talking about a lot of people, a lot more people

9 coming in.

10 MR. RODRIGUEZ: That's not for us.

11 MS. THOMSON: And I understand it.

12 MS. SPAIN: Again, that's not your purview.

13 MR. EHRENHAFT: That's not --

14 MS. THOMSON: I know, I know, I know, but it

15 still needs to be considered.

16 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: What is important in terms

17 of compatibility is that if this building would have had

18 parking up to here and the building here, I don't think

19 anybody wants a parking garage facing our block.

20 MS. THOMSON: No.

21 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: And that would be been --

22 MS. THOMSON: But I'm sure the developer will

23 come up with something.

24 MR. FORT-BRESCIA: Oh, sorry. I think if the

25 building contained parking, it would be extremely

1 unattractive to have two levels of parking. I don't think

2 anybody -- and then the building, I think that people

3 would not appreciate parking garages on Miracle Mile.

4 MS. THOMSON: Okay.

5 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.

6 MR. RODRIGUEZ: We're ready.

7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Is there anybody else in the

8 audience that intends to speak to the issue? Okay. Any

9 further discussions from the board? Chair will entertain

10 a motion.

11 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I move that we approve the

12 plans as recommended by staff.

13 MR. EHRENHAFT: Is there a second?

14 MR. DURANA: I second.

15 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. May we call the roll,

16 please?

17 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Menendez?

18 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.

19 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Durana?

20 MR. DURANA: Yes.

21 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Sardinas?

22 MR. SARDINAS: Yes.

23 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss

24 Bache-Wiig?

25 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.

1 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Rodriguez?

2 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

3 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Miss Thomson?

4 MS. THOMSON: No.

5 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr.

6 Garcia-Pons?

7 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Yes.

8 THE ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT: Mr. Ehrenhaft?

9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.

10 MS. SPAIN: Thank you.

11 MS. THOMSON: I knew, I knew too much.

12 MR. NAVARRO: Thank you very much. We

13 appreciate it.

14 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. There are going to be

15 some other items to discuss.

16 Dona, are there any other board items or city

17 commission items or city project updates?

18 MS. SPAIN: The property at -- the Catalonia

19 property, 333 Catalonia that was not designated has been

20 appealed by residents that live within 1,000 feet of that,

21 so that is going to be heard by the city commission on the

22 second commission meeting in October, which is -- wait --

23 I believe is October 22nd.

24 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.

25 MS. SPAIN: And also I sent you all an e-mail

1 requesting that these meetings starting in November could
 2 be held on, instead of the third Thursday, the third
 3 Wednesday. ElizaBeth Guinn has a conflict with Thursday.
 4 She does most of the designation reports. It's important
 5 that she be here.
 6 And so I would really much like to switch it
 7 to Wednesday, if it's all right with you all. It would
 8 just be a day before.
 9 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.
 10 MR. RODRIGUEZ: That will be going forward?
 11 MS. SPAIN: Going forward, not next month;
 12 starting November.
 13 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes, November.
 14 MS. SPAIN: Because in October, the planning
 15 and zoning board is taking that slot because of a Jewish
 16 holiday. That's on the second Wednesday, so we need to
 17 start in November.
 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: So you'll be able to capture
 19 the Wednesday in perpetuum?
 20 MS. SPAIN: Yes, and I've already checked it
 21 with the city clerk's office.
 22 MR. EHRENHAFT: Nobody else can have it.
 23 MS. SPAIN: No one can have it.
 24 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Going into 2020 and so on?
 25 MS. SPAIN: Yes. I would very much

1 MR. GARCIA-PONS: Thank you.
 2 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you. Okay. Well, is
 3 there any other business? Okay. Then I'll entertain a
 4 motion to adjourn.
 5 MR. GARCIA-PONS: So moved.
 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: Second?
 7 MR. MENENDEZ: Second.
 8 MR. EHRENHAFT: Everybody say aye.
 9 THE BOARD MEMBERS: Aye (collectively).
 10 MR. EHRENHAFT: Any Nays? We are adjourned.
 11 (Thereupon, proceedings were concluded at 7:45 a.m.)
 12
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

1 appreciate it. Thank you.
 2 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
 3 MS. SPAIN: And I'll send that out.
 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Is there anybody that can't,
 5 can't comply with that, or? Okay.
 6 MS. SPAIN: Thank you so much. I really
 7 appreciate it.
 8 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, thanks, okay.
 9 MS. SPAIN: That's it.
 10 MR. EHRENHAFT: All right, and you had one
 11 other item?
 12 MR. GARCIA-PONS: New business, and it's
 13 really maybe old business.
 14 There was a memo that you sent out about
 15 being contacted by the press.
 16 MS. SPAIN: Yes.
 17 MR. GARCIA-PONS: I just -- if you can just
 18 clarify what we are to do.
 19 MS. SPAIN: No. It's just easier if you all
 20 are contacted by the Miami Herald or a magazine, it's just
 21 easier to have those questions directed to staff because
 22 they'll start asking questions and we may have information
 23 that you all don't have.
 24 So it's just in order to make it easier for
 25 you, just tell them to call us.

1 CERTIFICATE
 2 STATE OF FLORIDA)
 3 COUNTY OF DADE)
 4 I, DOREEN M. STRAUSS, do here by certify that
 5 the foregoing pages, numbered from 1 to including 188,
 6 represent a true and accurate transcription of the record
 7 of the proceedings in the above-mentioned matter.
 8 WITNESS my hand in the City of Miami this 15th
 9 day of October, 2019.
 10
 11
 12 Doreen M. Strauss
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

