

City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting
Agenda Item F-7
January 28, 2020
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

City Commission

Mayor Raul Valdes-Fauli
Vice Mayor Vince Lago
Commissioner Pat Keon
Commissioner Michael Mena
Commissioner Jorge Fors

City Staff

City Manager, Peter Iglesias
Assistant City Manager, Ed Santamaria
City Attorney, Miriam Ramos
City Clerk, Billy Urquia

Public Speaker(s)

Silvia Pinera Vazquez
Robert Ruano
Josefina Carreno
Thomas Snook
Henry Bell
Janet Perez
George Volsky
David Howard
Rocky Vazquez
Veronica Cervera Goeseke
Steve Stein
Sofia Powell-Cosio
Guido Conill
Maria Cruz
Ted Dieffenbacher
Desiree Caskill

City Commission Meeting
January 28, 2020

Agenda Item F-7 - Resolution of the City Commission of the City of Coral Gables, Florida, directing the City Manager and City Staff to cease further consideration of bicycle lanes on Alhambra Circle as part of the Alhambra Circle Complete Streets Project.

Claudia Perez
Kenneth Mase
Roberta Neway
Lucy Alas
Kenneth Garcia
Marvin Ross Friedman

Agenda Item F-7 [10:57 a.m.]

A Resolution of the City Commission of the City of Coral Gables, Florida, directing the City Manager and City Staff to cease further consideration of bicycle lanes on Alhambra Circle as part of the Alhambra Circle Complete Streets Project.
(Sponsored by Mayor Valdes-Fauli)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. We'll take now F-7, a time certain of 10 o'clock. And -- no, no, no. Sit down. I'll give you a call. Thank you. I want to give our City Clerk documentation that we have here, letters, emails, et cetera, to make it part of the record. I'm going to read the cards of the people that are here and that do not wish to speak. Alicia Arner, Elena Estalella, Olga, Lagomasino, Bertha Lorente.

Commissioner Mena: Mayor, I think -- if you could speak into the microphone. Some people are saying they can't hear.

Vice Mayor Lago: I think there's someone that may want to speak.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We have a lot here that want to speak, but not -- fill out the right card and I'll let you speak. Bertha Lorente, she's an opponent. Opponent, Olga Lagomasino, opposed the bike path. Elena Estalella, opponent. Alicia Arner, opponent. She does not wish to speak; opponent of the bike path. Proponent, Josefina Martinez, proponent. No name here. Proponent, Aida Lazzarin. Maria Bradley, opponent. Opponent -- proponent, Francisco Garza. Catherine

Anderson, proponent; bike path is masquerading as a green initiative. Josefina DeVarona O'Sullivan, proponent. I'm in favor of the resolution.

Commissioner Mena: Can I make a suggestion? Maybe just have everybody raise their hand who's in favor...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Well, do you wish to be recognized?

City Attorney Ramos: And I think we should clarify proponent of the resolution or proponent of the bike paths...

Commissioner Mena: Sure.

City Attorney Ramos: Because they're opposites.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, opponent of the resolution, Christopher Field. Jean D'O Field, opponent of the resolution. Isabel Esperanza Martinez, proponent of the resolution. Alina Conill, proponent of the resolution. Sheryl Gold, doesn't say here what she is. Betsy Hoover-Thomas, it doesn't say. Maria Egues Martinez [sic], please save our Alhambra Circle. Jose Egues, please do not put bike paths. Bernardo Romero, I'm against the removal of greenspace. Gail Mase, please no bike lanes. Peter Mendiola, I'm in favor of the resolution. Yamila Abay-Giullone, in favor of the resolution. Nora Diaz Agudo, in favor of the resolution. Carlos Giullone, keep Gables green. We don't want bike paths. Pierluigi and Mabel Galoppi, no to bike paths. Andrea England, the safety of our residents should be paramount. Bike paths improve safety. John Swain, the City is in the middle of this whatever. Please do not stop vote. Yvette Patino, no bike paths. Victoria Garrigó, it doesn't say. Agnes Taylor, bicycle lanes should be installed. Susan Snook, bike lanes are a safety necessity. Gabriel De La Campa, no bike paths. Ted Dieffenbacher, connecting to the Underline safely for the bike paths. Lisa and Colin Murphy, ridiculous we're here since it was already passed in 2014. Heileen Bell, against bike paths. Debra Swain, like -- let the people vote.

And Robert Petzinger, I'm against placing bike paths. So, these are the cards that were given to me that people that do not wish to speak. Now, I have cards here of people that do wish to speak, and I will recognize you, two minutes each, in the order in which I have them here, which was the order that our City Clerk gave me. As I said before, we will have two people for proponents of the resolution and two people for opponents of the resolution to speak. And I will let the proponent of the resolution to speak first five minutes and then at the end I will let the proponent of the resolution speak first, five minutes. And then at the end, I will let the opponents of the resolution speak first and the proponents speak last. Silvia Pinera Vazquez is speaking -- representing the proponents of the resolution. Ms. Vazquez.

Silvia Pinera Vazquez: Good morning, Mayor Valdes-Fauli, Vice Mayor Lago and Commissioners, City Manager Iglesias and Coral Gables residents. First of all, thank you so much for placing this item on the agenda for today. The first thing I'd like to do because I spoke in December and I was quite lengthy in my presentation and got into a lot of details. So, I have a PowerPoint presentation to hopefully streamline the process. And there's only two issues that I'm going to speak on because there's plenty of people here. I'm going to speak on the process briefly and on safety. So, what brings us here today? I sent an email to all of you because I've never been involved in such an acrimonious situation in my little peaceful city that I thought was really like the hallmark little town showcases that we see for Christmas. And all of a sudden, I find myself involved and I really couldn't understand why until I went back and did a little bit of digging as to why people get mad. People get mad when they're not notified, when they lack due process, when they don't feel like they're treated equally to other neighbors in the Gables. And this takes us back to 2015. Now, I believe that only Commissioner Keon and then Commissioner Lago was on the Commission at the time. And it boils down to a grant that was obtained by the City in 2015, an application that was submitted by Jessica Keller, who I believe is here today. And that grant is really where this anger stems from because back in 2015 none of us received notification, and if you notice, the grant requires community support. Two of the areas of the grant -- and this is all submitted in my letter of December 6 -- require public awareness meeting and require community support. This was submitted with community support that was manufactured. I prepared this

timeline because this is really important. Basically, the day before the grant was submitted on March 20, on March 19, at 9 o'clock in the morning, Jessica Keller sends an email to three people who are proponents of bike path; John Swain, Debbie Swain and Robert Ruano. And I'm going to read it for the record. She specifically says, I'm submitting two applications for the Transportation Alternatives Board Program due tomorrow at 5 p.m. I understand you may not be able to provide BWCG, which is Bike Walk, endorsement letter without board meeting, but a resident letter with signatures would be great. Interested? He responds 10 minutes later. I think that can be arranged. By the way, you know, would you like one for University? I mean, you guys can read it. A minute later, Keller responds, one is better. At 9 o'clock at night, here you go. And then, all of a sudden, we've got the community support. So, I want to be very clear, which is the reason I did this timeline. Let me go back. In 12 hours, on March 19, the community support for bike lanes on Alhambra Circle was decided by two people, John Swain and Jessica Keller. Twelve hours brings us here today and a room full of people against the bike path, 12 hours. Now why? Why didn't Ms. Keller go, why didn't the City ask what the community wanted on Alhambra Circle because this is a grant specific to Alhambra Circle. Rather than do that -- because based on what I've discovered, there's an agenda within the City to create these bike paths. She found it easier to just call her buddy at Bike Walk, get a letter and make up or manufacture the community support. That's why we're angry. Twelve hours brings us here. Twelve hours. Five years later, what happens? Yeah, we get the grant, \$600,000. Does any community support or any awareness meetings happen after those 12 hours, between 2015 and 2019? Nothing. We don't even know what's going on. We have no idea a grant was even approved, at least all my neighbors, we had no idea.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Your time is running.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Okay. Billy, give me a minute, please.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, no, no. It's fine but go ahead.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: So, what happened? The first meeting was September 25, 2019. This was after this Commission meeting -- this Commission had already rejected Riviera Drive as a bike path. The Commission had said that the stakeholder had not received sufficient notification and therefore they took the bike path out of the master plan for Riviera Drive. Despite that, the City waited another year and a half to try to give us notice. They gave us notice, yeah, sure, September 25, 2019, five years after it had already obtained the grant. Then we had a walkthrough October 19, and then last Saturday, we had a community meeting, okay. Now, let me explain to you why this lack of due process is important because I've heard a lot of people say, let the process continue. Let the ballots go out. The reason we can't let that happen, let the ballots go out, is for three reasons.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: One more minute.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Okay. First of all, the process was tainted from the beginning. Second of all, there were no ballots on Riviera Drive. And third of all, the ballots will dilute the Riviera residents. Let me just get to safety real quick. There's significant safety issue. Mr. Ruano asked at the last meeting, who is for safety for children? Who wants their children to be safe? We all want our children to be safe and that's what we can agree on. We want our children to be safe and that's why putting a bike path on a narrow area with winding roads and a bridge area would be significantly dangerous for not only our children, for vehicles, for bikers, but for emergency vehicles that as we just heard right before response time is key. And what will -- and narrowing the lanes of Riviera -- of Alhambra Drive do? What will creating islands on Alhambra Drive do - - Alhambra Circle do, which is a collector street? It will delay the fire, ambulance and police getting to a...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: To a house. Thank you, Mayor.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

(APPLAUSE)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, no, come on. Please. I'm going to clear the room if you clap again or if you do other thing. This is a very civil meeting. I don't want it to be like you had the meeting in Alhambra Circle. Let people speak and we will signify your approval or disapproval in your comments. Mr. Ruano, it's your turn. Five minutes, plus one.

Robert Ruano: Good morning again. Good morning again, Mayor, Vice Mayor, Commissioners. Robert Ruano, 1544 Mercia Avenue. If this item is approved, bike lanes will be dead and the City would have wasted all the money spent on the vote and rejected nearly \$600,000 in grant money for bike lanes. Don't kill the voice of residents. That's all we're asking. In order for the vote to have meaning, this item has to be voted down. I spoke in front of you almost a year ago on a similar item and Vice Mayor Lago asked me what I thought about how the Riviera vote happened, saying that he struggled with that decision. I told you then what I'll tell you now. The problem with getting bike lanes and sidewalks in Coral Gables is not for lack of right-of-way. In fact, throughout much of Alhambra, an extra 12 inches of asphalt on either side of the road would make enough room for the bike lanes, still leaving 10 feet for cars. No, our policy -- I'm here today to ask you not to disenfranchise the 800-plus residents that live on the side streets of Alhambra, many like me that live on a dead-end road, and therefore, Alhambra is the only way to access the rest of the city. These residents, the majority in favor, along with quite a few that live on Alhambra, are afraid to go against their neighbors, all just want a voice in this decision. They want to vote on whether bike lanes on Alhambra will be installed here and let the Commission decide. I like Commissioner Mena's suggestion the best. Let all voters vote. Let the Commission see the numbers separated between Alhambra and side streets and let the Commissioners decide. That method seems the fairest and the most democratic. The opponents, however, are afraid of that vote

since they fear they will lose. Well, let's do it and find out like what's promised. Let's talk about trees for a minute. Three trees. According to City staff, only three trees will be removed in the current plan.

Vice Mayor Lago: Who's that?

Mr. Ruano: I'm sorry?

Vice Mayor Lago: Who's the --

Commissioner Mena: And we'll give you extra time. Who's the staffperson that said that?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I counted 22 trees on Saturday.

Mr. Ruano: Is the clock stopping?

Commissioner Mena: Yeah, stop the clock. Stop the clock.

Mr. Ruano: Sorry, I just want to know.

Commissioner Mena: You -- because listen, when you were here last meeting, you said three trees. You said it earlier today. You said it again.

Mr. Ruano: Brook Dannemiller.

Commissioner Mena: Okay, so...

Mr. Ruano: I mean, if you let staff present, I'm sure they can present very well. I know staff isn't allowed to present today but they could...

Commissioner Mena: Let's...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, make your presentation.

Commissioner Mena: I just want to...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You're making your point.

Mr. Ruano: I'm just answering a question, sir.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: I just have that question because...

Mr. Ruano: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: That's not a number I've been given. And when I've asked the question, my understanding is -- just a moment -- that we don't really have an answer to that question yet. So, I just want to be careful. There's a lot of information being put out there. And I just want to make sure that whatever information is out there, I try -- I'm trying not to live in the post facts world that we seem to live in these days. I believe in facts. If we don't know how many trees are going to go down -- if we don't know that, which I don't believe we do, then I just want to be careful that we don't put numbers out there that indicate that staff says we do. So, if you could just respond to that very minute question and then we'll let Mr. Ruano finish.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Assistant City Manager for Operations and Infrastructure. The trees and the trees that will be impacted by this project, that full impact is yet to be determined.

We do know of four trees, one that is sick, another one that is deceased and two invasive species that we will be removing.

Commissioner Mena: But those would come down anyways.

Assistant City Manager Santamaria: Those would come down anyways. Perhaps Mr. Ruano is...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I counted 22 trees in a very informal, non, you know, horticultural, I counted -- but go ahead, please. We're interrupting you. We're getting lost in the trees.

Commissioner Mena: Yeah, I don't want to -- and I'm not...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: (UNINTELLIGIBLE) forest.

Commissioner Mena: Trying to derail -- please proceed with your presentation. But I want to be careful with...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: Putting out a number that's -- the source is staff if that's not a verified number.

Mr. Ruano: It is a verified number and I told you who told me.

Commissioner Keon: Well, but it's a verified...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It isn't.

Commissioner Keon: Number that need to be removed because of disease.

Commissioner Mena: Regardless of whether there's a sidewalk.

Commissioner Keon: But it doesn't need to be removed because of a bike path.

Commissioner Mena: Correct.

Commissioner Keon: So, there is no number from staff as to how many need to be removed due to a bike path.

Mr. Ruano: I'm sorry.

Commissioner Keon: We do know how many need to be removed because they are invasives or they are diseased and sick. So those are two different...

Mr. Ruano: Well, actually...

Commissioner Keon: Those are two different numbers.

Mr. Ruano: No, what I have heard from...

Commissioner Keon: That's what they just confirmed.

Mr. Ruano: What I have heard from staff is that...

Commissioner Keon: Okay.

Mr. Ruano: According to plan, what he sees only three trees would be removed.

Commissioner Keon: No. I...

Vice Mayor Lago: Okay, wait, wait.

Commissioner Keon: But they've just told you...

Vice Mayor Lago: That's enough.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Come on.

Commissioner Fors: We've clarified it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Enough of trees.

Vice Mayor Lago: Robert.

Mr. Ruano: I'm just telling you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let him continue.

Vice Mayor Lago: Mr. Ruano.

Mr. Ruano: The gentleman's right there, Brook Dannemiller.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Ruano, please continue.

Mr. Ruano: Okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You're losing the audience. Come on, please continue.

Mr. Ruano: I lost a long time ago, sir.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You're losing the audience's interest...

Mr. Ruano: Okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Talking about trees so much.

Mr. Ruano: Okay, so trees, okay -- so even if there was no plan -- even if there is not a number, 22 is not something that staff has said. A hundred is not something staff has said. Half of the trees is not something that staff has said.

Commissioner Mena: Agreed.

Mr. Ruano: These are numbers that are being made up.

Commissioner Mena: I agree with you.

Mr. Ruano: Let's talk about process. 2004, a plan was adopted by the City Commission. In 2010, the comp plan further supported this plan and said that the Alhambra bike plan would be incorporated, should be required into any public development project. And then 2014, the plan was passed. And then after that, which I actually came up here and spoke against, is you did a level of service study, another plan. And the plan said, yes, Alhambra is important. So, we've done all this plan and spent all these money, all these community meetings along with them, and now we're here questioning whether we should do it or not. If we would allow staff to present today on the Alhambra project, you would hear the facts of this important public safety project. You would hear how concerns about the width of the bridge would be handled. You would hear about studies that show bike infrastructure as a positive impact on all users of the road. Like this

UM student right here, right around my house going around that curve, if you see she has to commute to school, but she's sharing the space with cars. This is what staff is trying to do. The notion that the street is unsafe so you can't make it safer doesn't make sense. If the street is unsafe for this person, this cyclist and the pedestrians that we've shown you, then make it safer. That's what staff is trying to do. So, especially around the curves, obviously. I want to take just a minute to address false allegations about Bike Walk Coral Gables. Our nonprofit organization has been attacked repeatedly with smoke and mirrors. They know the facts don't support their allegations and that's why they don't want staff to present and that's why they don't want a vote of affected residents. Finally, I want to encourage this Commission to stand up for its resolutions it has passed over the years and to be honest with residents about what it believes. Case in point, the resolution earlier today which says the City will continue its climate leadership. Let's be honest, Mr. Mayor, you can't support the words that you passed earlier while asking to remove bike lanes from the Alhambra project simply because a few swales will become smaller. An emergency is just that, a critical path, an urgent need to change the way we are doing business and our residents deserve elected officials that stand up for the words they signed onto on this dais. And that's why I urge you all to let the residents vote. Don't throw away good grant money. What do you have to lose?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please. Whoever clapped, don't do it again. I will now call in the order in which I have them here, which is the order, I guess, the City Clerk received them. People, you have two minutes each, and there will be a speaker for the proponents of the resolution and for the opponents of the resolution at the end. You have two minutes. Josefina Carreno, 4725 Alhambra Circle. Good morning.

Josefina Carreno: Good morning. Good morning, Mr. Mayor, Commissioners, Mr. Vice Mayor. I want to start by saying that this is the first time that I have ever had an opportunity to come to a

meeting like this. And the reason for that, that I'm here is because I feel so strongly about what Coral Gables represents to all of us. My name is Josefina Carreno. My husband and I have lived at 4725 Alhambra Circle for over 39 years. We recently became aware of a proposal to create a bike path on Alhambra. We had no idea that this was being considered. Alhambra Circle is one of those beautiful iconic streets that symbolize what Coral Gables is all about. The preservation of our amazing trees, greenery, unique houses and beautiful yards should be a priority for all of us regardless of outside influences. We have a duty to do this for the present and the future generations. Over the years, we have seen traffic on Alhambra increase to a level where cars back up in front of our house during certain hours of the day. This has made it very difficult to get in and out of our driveway. Thus, cutting into the swale and narrowing the street to add a bicycle path, will make it even more of a challenge to navigate this traffic and will no doubt create additional safety problems for residences. In addition, a perfectly good bike path exists one block west of Alhambra on Red Road. Why would anyone not be satisfied with using this path? I urge you all to make the right decision for our citizens and for our beautiful Coral Gables and approve this resolution.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am. Thank you very much. Thomas Snook, 1454 Mendavia.

Thomas Snook: Good morning, Mr. Mayor, your honor, Mr. Vice Mayor and Commissioners. I'm Thomas Snook. I've been a resident of Coral Gables for 25 years. My wife and I live on Mendavia Avenue, four houses from Alhambra Circle. We moved here 25 years ago after I retired from the Coast Guard, where I was a Coast Guard JAG officer. I'm a Coast Guard Academy graduate, Vietnam combat veteran, former chief trial judge with the Coast Guard, former president of the Coast -- Coral Gables Army Navy Club, and I have bicycled every single street in Coral Gables. This is a safety issue and a right of the people to vote issue. And from what I've heard, it's also a lack of the true facts issue. With regard to safety, after practicing maritime law in Coral Gables for three years, I was appointed to the United States Administrative Law judge with the Social Security Administration, in downtown Miami. I bicycled the eight miles from -- to my office from my home daily. I had to stop because it became too dangerous. No one -- too many

Miami drivers don't look right to turn right. They're over there and you're there, the cross streets. And to paraphrase Dave Barry, too many Miami drivers think using a turn signal is a sign of weakness. I have bicycled Alhambra Circle above Coral Way, where there are bicycle lanes. It is much safer than below Coral Way, where there are no lanes. I drive Alhambra Circle every single day, living only four houses from it. The suggestion about Red Road -- Red Road is a busy commercial street.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Sir, one minute. Please finish up.

Mr. Snook: Alright. Red Road is a busy commercial street. It'd be -- it's unsafe even with bicycle lanes. With regard to the right to vote, I fought in Vietnam for the American public to have the right to vote. My understanding there was supposed to be a vote. I think -- I join those who oppose this. Let the people vote on this issue first and reaffirm the master plan that was passed by the Commission.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Mr. Snook: And let's get the facts before that's over with.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Mr. Snook: You're welcome.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Mr. Snook: Yes, sir.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Henry Bex, 3612 Alhambra Circle.

Henry Bell: Actually, it's Henry Bell, and thank you, Commissioner.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Bell.

Vice Mayor Lago: Good morning.

Mr. Bell: And Mayor, for allowing us to speak. I'll be brief because I know there's a lot of people. I'm sorry?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It looks like an "x."

Mr. Bell: My wife says my handwriting is horrible and so did my school teachers.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It is.

Mr. Bell: I'll be brief. But I'd respectfully request that you support the resolution to cease consideration of bike paths on Alhambra Lane. And I'll be brief and I'll give you an anecdote about our street and my end of the street on 3612. We have three or four -- we have four big trees in the front yard of our house. Three of them are clearly up on the swale. We decorate them every year for Christmas. I think our neighbors are happy that we do that, and it adds to the charm of the canopy, if you will. Without the canopy, I don't think anyone is going to really want to walk or ride through Alhambra Circle. One year, someone stopped, parked in our lawn, came over -- actually, in the driveway, knocked on the front door and asked for permission to ask his girlfriend to get married under those trees with the lights. And the reason I'm here is and speaking to you today is because I really don't have any real confidence that our trees are not at risk. Of those three trees, one of them -- in my estimation -- clearly lies in the path of where a sidewalk would be put as a part of this project. As a result, I'm here today and asking you to vote in support of this resolution. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you, sir.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alexander Adams. 50 Minorca Avenue.

Vice Mayor Lago: He left.

Commissioner Keon: He left.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Huh?

Vice Mayor Lago: He left.

Commissioner Keon: He left. He had to leave.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Oh, he left.

Vice Mayor Lago: Is he opposed or in favor?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: In favor.

Commissioner Keon: He's in favor.

Commissioner Mena: I mean, I'm sorry. Opposed, right?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, no. He's opposed.

Vice Mayor Lago: He's opposed to the resolution.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: He's opposed to the resolution. Okay, Janet Perez, 3519 Alhambra Circle.
Good morning.

Janet Perez: Good morning. My name is Janet Perez. I live at...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Can you --? Perfect.

Ms. Perez: I live at 3519 Alhambra Circle. I've lived there 38 years. I want to focus on three areas. Number one, safety. Right now, the residents that live in Alhambra Circle have problems exiting their driveway. That street is a two-way street. People drive very fast. The City is planning to install bike lanes as well as sidewalks. That's basically adding two more lanes of traffic that we will have...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We're talking about bike lanes, not sidewalks.

Ms. Perez: Yeah, I know, but that -- we will have to navigate over those lanes to get to the street. We -- in addition, we have the problem that there is a curve there. There is a bridge and our line of sight is diminished as well. Second item has to do with speed. We've been told that the reduction of the width of the street will reduce speed. The facts show that it does reduce speed, but by only four percent. What does that mean to you and me? That's only one and a half miles per hour less. That's all the narrowing of that street will do. So, we're going to tear up beautiful Alhambra for that. Number three, the grant. There's been a lot of discussion on misinformation on the grant. I just want to focus on the proof of community support that was used. It was a letter from Bike Walk. Was anyone surprised that a bike organization would support bike lanes? I don't think so. Is the Pope Catholic? Is water wet? That was the most ridiculous example I could even think of. But of interest, the City already has data on what the residents think. At the September 25 meeting, they presented a community wide survey. Citizens -- residents were asked to vote on 30 items; bike lanes was one of them. They were asked to prioritize them. Guess what. Did bike

lanes rate as the top five? No. Top 10? No. Top 15? No. It was number 20. Guess how many residents voted for it? Six, only six thought it was...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am.

Ms. Perez: A priority.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much, Ms. Perez.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: George Volsky, 1008 Alhambra Circle. Good morning, George.

Vice Mayor Lago: Good morning.

George Volsky: Good morning, Mayor and Commissioner. I would like to ask you to give me 30 seconds about something happened before, which I think is just as important if not more than this. You all passed a resolution (UNINTELLIGIBLE) this was aspirational. It is your duty to aspirational because this City is inspirational. If you all know, and I think you do, history of urban growth, this city was created, planned to do something. It was an inspiration. Therefore, whatever you do is inspirational so it's being said. I live on 100 Alhambra Circle and with my other residence I have lived on Alhambra Circle for about 60 years, 60 years as an adult. And recently because this issue came up, I've even observing what is going on on my street, which has had a bike path and a sidewalk for maybe longer, maybe half a century because it was built at the very beginning of the creation of this city. And I can say someone came here and said, if you approve this, it's going to be dead. My street, Alhambra Circle, (UNINTELLIGIBLE) where I have bike path and sidewalk as being proposed by Ms. Jessica Keller (UNINTELLIGIBLE) why isn't she here? She should be here.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: She's here.

Mr. Volsky: But anyhow...

Commissioner Keon: She's here.

Mr. Volsky: Is dead, is in total disuse. Why?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'm sorry, what?

Vice Mayor Lago: Not in use.

Mr. Volsky: It's in total disuse.

Commissioner Keon: Nobody uses it.

Mr. Volsky: In other words, nobody uses it and I watch it every day. I've been watching this now for -- pretty closely for months. Nothing is happening. Why? A number of reasons. Principal, traffic. It's unsafe, unsafe and I used to cycle as that gentleman who came here, very often. Now I don't do it again not only because I'm older but simply -- it's simply too unsafe. Second, there is something interesting. Change of lifestyle. People who thought that cycling was good for you and for your health now realize maybe it's only partially good. And they used to -- some people didn't go to gyms because gyms were for people like Arnold Schwarzenegger. Now they go to gyms. It used to be one gym. Now there are four gyms. Well, since I've been...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Finish up, George.

Mr. Volsky: Reduced, I can say that Coral Gables was never meant to be Copenhagen, tropical Copenhagen. It is what it is. And people wants to -- want to be quiet, safe. They should be.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much, George.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Volsky: I'm not going to recommend because I think you're wise enough to know what's going on. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: George, matter of curiosity. How old are you?

Mr. Volsky: In (UNINTELLIGIBLE) months, I'll be 99.

(APPLAUSE)

Mr. Volsky: And Mayor, I fought for nine years in World War II. And first, I saw this city in 1948 when I was still in active service in the Royal Air Force. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you, George.

(APPLAUSE)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Paula and David Howard, 2601 Alhambra Circle. Good morning, sir. David Howard. You're not Paula, huh?

David Howard: No. She's in the audience.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good morning.

Mr. Howard: I live at 2601 Alhambra. That's the corner of Valencia and Coral -- one block south of Coral Way. Our yard -- we have a six-foot sidewalk, a 17-foot swale, and a 19-foot-wide street there. It is not intended ever to have had a bike path on that street with that width. However, we also have been the victim of numerous car accidents on this corner. This is a dangerous intersection because of commuter traffic and traffic from Saint Teresa in the morning. I have a video I can show you of what goes on every morning, Monday through Friday. If it was daylight out at night, I could show you another video of what goes on every evening from 4 to 7 o'clock. The point I'm making is that this massive traffic -- and it's all changed in the 41 years I've lived there -- is a danger to any bicyclist at any time. And secondly, with that sidewalk that we have, I see bicyclists, families with children using that bicycle -- using that sidewalk to ride a bicycle on. And nobody has a problem with that. And I don't want anybody to think that I'm hostile to bicycle riders. There's bicycles in our house, but the point I'm making is this is not a good street for a bicycle path. This -- demographics have changed with the volume of cars that use that street to commute. And I understand there's apparently no way to deal with that other than to try to come up with some calming devices. But the bottom line is you add those paths, you're not making it safer. You're making it worse. And I think that anybody who wants to ride a bike in front of my house can ride on that sidewalk all day long and it isn't going to bother me. And I don't think it would bother any of my neighbors who have the benefit of a sidewalk. So, I would ask that you all vote for this resolution. I have a bunch of pictures I'd like to give you all of accidents that have occurred on our corner, including rollover accidents. This is a rough street right now.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Why don't you pass it around and then we'll give it back. Mrs. Howard.

Mr. Howard: (UNINTELLIGIBLE).

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you, sir.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Mrs. Howard, do you agree with your husband?

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good. Good for you. Thank you, sir.

Mr. Howard: Well, we got...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Howard: I'd like that to be made a part of the record. I also have a DVD of one Monday morning of traffic on our corner. And just to get an idea of what goes on and how difficult it is to regulate, in November, we had three accidents on our corner within 24 hours, one of which was that rollover accident.

Commissioner Keon: We'll give it to the Clerk.

Mr. Howard: (UNINTELLIGIBLE).

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes, sir.

Mr. Howard: Lastly...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Sir, please finish up.

Mr. Howard: Lastly, I have all the accident reports that have occurred there in the last three years, except for the ones that took place in November, one of which is that rollover. The point I'm making is...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please, please finish up.

Mr. Howard: We do the best we can here. But I ask you to please vote for that resolution and not make things worse than they are already by adding...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Howard: A bike path.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much. Rocky Vazquez, 3516 Alhambra Circle. Rocky Vazquez.

Rocky Vazquez: Good morning. How are you doing?

Vice Mayor Lago: Good morning, sir.

Mr. Vazquez: So, I am Rocky Vazquez. I am 27 years old. I live on Alhambra Circle, and I'm actually one of those UM students that Mr. Ruano referenced. I bike to campus via Alhambra Circle and I've also used Red Road. And I am very much a proponent of this resolution to cancel the bike path because I don't think it deals with the realities of the street, the realities of what the community members want. And just an additional thing, I've lived in Copenhagen for about six months. I've traveled to Amsterdam and Berlin. These are biking capitals of the world, but what do they have in common? They barely have any trees, right. Their environment is completely depleted in favor of more concrete paths and bikes. That's their reality. Our reality, based on what George Merrick envisioned, is having a city with broad swales, with trees, with canopies and having that in favor of having concrete paths. So, I think this resolution should go through. The process has been tainted from the beginning, from especially 2015 with Ms. Keller not actually having community support and having it manufactured. I mean, just being a -- having done the first year of law school at UM, it's clear to me that this has been a tainted process and it wouldn't pass any muster anywhere based on the community support that was manufactured. And even until today where it seems like lobbyists and City staffers know what's best for the community, so

you have to go along with what they think as opposed to what Mr. Mena said, which is we represent the community. We meet people where they are, not where certain staffers and lobbyists want to force them to be. So, I just urge you to pass this resolution to cancel the bike paths. It's been tainted from the beginning and it should not go through. Thank you very much for your time.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much. Alicia Cervera Lamadrid. Alicia? She's not here.

Vice Mayor Lago: Proponent?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: She's a proponent. She's for. Alicia Cervera? Okay, Veronica Cervera Goeseke, 3801 Alhambra Court.

Veronica Cervera Goeseke: (UNINTELLIGIBLE) two homes in that area; 3801 Alhambra Court and 3700 Alhambra Court. And I actually ride my bike, and I ride my bike to mass every Sunday and I feel quite comfortable riding my bike. I'm opposed to the bike paths. I think they're dangerous. I think they'd bring unwanted additional traffic. They're going to change the neighborhood. They're going to endanger some of our trees. I'm opposed. And as a bicycle rider, I already feel pretty comfortable with the situation that we have. I don't feel we've had enough notification, and I think we're wasting a lot of our time here. Though I do respect the fact that everybody should be heard. So, I'm comfortable with the way we are, and I hope you'll see it that way and keep our neighborhood the way it is. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Steve Stein, 1538 San Rafael Avenue.

Steve Stein: Thank you for the opportunity to discuss this issue. Unlike most of the speakers...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We're talking about bike paths, not sidewalks.

Mr. Stein: What?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We're talking about bike paths, not sidewalks.

Mr. Stein: I understand. No, no, bike paths, yes. Unlike most of the speakers today, I did not come with prepared remarks, but I walk -- I live half a block off Alhambra Circle. I walk almost daily on the sidewalks that do exist. And I drive the Alhambra, of course, like many of us do because that's where we live. And every day in a sense prepares me, I think, to see the problems with this issue. And the problems with the issue are that I see as a driver and as a walker how cars are constantly avoiding cyclists because the cyclists are -- they're in the road. They -- that's what they have. I see almost daily when I'm walking potential accidents where because there is no bike lane, there is no space for the bikes, people are taking dangerous driving decisions for the rest of the traffic as well as for the cyclists. So, as a person who essentially experienced this on a daily basis, I oppose the proposition and I support the bike lanes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir. Thank you very much. Sofia Powell-Cosio. Good morning.

Sofia Powell-Cosio: Thank you for the opportunity of being able to come and address you today. I live at 3601 Alhambra Court, so I'm not exactly on Alhambra, but I do live right next to the bridge and I am very aware every single day how the cars come screeching around the bridge on that corner. And it's also very difficult for me to turn into my house because of the amount of traffic that there is on Alhambra going over the bridge. And I have four children of my own. Obviously,

safety has always been very important. We've lived in that house since my eldest daughter was born. And I let my children ride their bikes in that area. We walk in that area. We walk to mass; we walk to the parks. And even though, you know, I understand the need perhaps for sidewalks - - we're not talking about sidewalks today -- but I really think that it's a bad idea to widen the streets there. Number one, it's going to take a lot of our green spaces away and it's really definitely not a safe area for bikers. Apart from that, one of the trees that they say is sick is one of the trees that's on my yard that actually fell into the canal and I brought a arborist out specifically to save that tree and the tree is coming back and the tree is not sick and the tree is not dying and the tree is there. And if they build the thing that goes around the bridge, they will actually kill the tree that I spent about \$3,000 trying to save. Apart from that, we -- there have been numerous accidents on Alhambra and Bird Road. And I understand that there's a light there and there shouldn't be accidents, but the people on Bird Road take that light on a continuous basis and most of the accidents are caused because the light has been taken. And if you have people that have to cross Bird Road on Alhambra on this wonderful bike path, I really feel that it's extremely dangerous. One thing that is really of concern to me is the fact that the community support that was supposedly obtained was obtained under false premises. And I really believe that if the City of Coral Gables has an ethics committee, the person who did this should be brought before the ethics committee because that is neither ethical nor right. And they basically lied on a public grant to the government.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Sofia.

Ms. Powell-Cosio: And I don't think that any of us should support that or in any way have an employee that does not respect the ethics.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am. Thank you very much. Guido Conill, 3711 Alhambra Circle. Good morning.

Guido Conill: Morning.

Vice Mayor Lago: Good morning sir.

Mr. Conill: Can you hear me? I came here to ask a question. My name is Guido Conill. I live at 3711 Alhambra Circle. And the question is, is this worth it going through with this project? Isn't it the right time to just kill the bike project and approve the resolution? We have a project which is not Coral Gables. It's not Merrick. It's done for a very small minority. We have a project which obviously is going to damage the trees, kill swales. Nobody can believe that there's no safety problem with bikes next door. I lived on Key Biscayne for many years and I know the problem between bikes and cars. And with a narrower street, there's no doubt that we're going to get problems between the bikes and the cars. You have to go in your house, you have to go out your house over a shared path or over a bike path. That's going to be a mess on our street. Alternative, there is -- they have an alternative. Bikers have an alternative. It's been mentioned here many times. On 57 Avenue; that doesn't work? Well, they say that it doesn't work, but it's 30 yards from -- or 50 yards from our street. And to do a census, it'd be so unfair. My vote, which I'm on Alhambra Circle, cannot be the same as the vote from somebody who lives even a block away from Alhambra Circle, it's my property. It's my swale. It's my house. It's my property value. It's not the same as somebody who lives a block -- if I lived a block or two blocks from Alhambra Circle, I wouldn't give a hoot about bicycle paths being done or not. It's just not my problem. It's their problem. So, putting it all together, I think it's just not worth it to get into this mess, get into this bickering and this politic and this fighting. Let's just kill it once and for all. And I just ask you to approve the resolution of the (UNINTELLIGIBLE).

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Conill: Thank you so much.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much. Good presentation. Maria Cruz. You're a fixture here, Maria.

Maria Cruz: Maria Cruz, 1447 Miller Road. As you can see, I do not live on Alhambra Circle. But you know what? This concerns every one of us. We -- somebody brought up the 2014 study. Well, I want to remind you if you haven't read it, who the stakeholders were, not residents, not people that drive cars, but bikers, Bike Walk Gables, Max Cycle, the Dutch Consulate. I'm still trying to figure out why the Dutch Consulate had anything to do with what we needed to do in the City of Coral Gables. But something is more important. At the beginning, this grant was written specifically for bike paths and sidewalks on Alhambra Circle. When we started pushing back, slowly but surely it became traffic calming. Now we're not interested -- now we're not bringing up the things that we don't want. Now, we're talking about traffic calming. None of us would be against traffic calming. I think if anybody gets a ballot that says, would you like traffic calming in front of your house, everybody will jump for it. But there's a problem. We had four streets close to me, south of Bird Road, Algardi, Cantoria, Garcia and Dorado. They wanted traffic calming. You know who voted? Not the people on Alhambra, not the people on Miller, not the people on Bird Road. Only their blocks. If Algardi wanted traffic calming, the people from Red Road to San Amaro, I believe, were the only ones that voted because it will be in front of their homes. They voted no because they thought they were going to have all the signs that they were promised. The people on Garcia and Dorado, 50-50. If you reach 50, you got it. They got it. But only the people that live in those streets. Why should the Alhambra people have the world voting? Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am. I -- one of the cards from a person wishing to speak was misplaced. Ted Dieffenbacher, 709 Majorca.

Ted Dieffenbacher: You all heard of the Highline in New York City, and I think we have in Miami the equivalent that's going to be in Coral Gables called the Underline. Right now, though, I don't think there's any way that you can safely get on a bicycle between where I -- where we are right now and to go to that Underline, which is going to be quite an attraction, I think. Commuters, people that just want to bike, people wanting to go to the University of Miami, whether this is the

way you do it that's been proposed or there's some other way, but I think the City is really missing out if you don't find a way, some way for people to get safely down to the Underline. I speak, by the way, as a biker who has been hit by a car on Alhambra in my bike lane. So, it's not -- and I'm not one of the statistics that was -- that I've seen listed. So, I think we're missing out if we don't find some way to be bicycle friendly at least to get to the Underline because it -- commuters would -- I think commuters would really use it. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir. Desiree Caskill, 2715 Alhambra Circle. Good morning.

Desiree Caskill: Thank you for this opportunity. My name is Desiree Caskill and I have lived at 2715 Alhambra Circle...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Can you get a little closer to the microphone?

Ms. Caskill: I have lived at 2715 Alhambra Circle since 1991. I was a member of the Historic Preservation Board and of the Merrick House governing board. I had my home historically designated in the early nineties. When we drive into Coral Gables, the rest of Miami-Dade County is left behind. We enter George Merrick's dream of a romantic cultured city filled with exceptional architectural styles, wavering streets and lush tree canopies. Thanks to preservation, we are all able to enjoy the original plan of this city. Alhambra Circle is one of the main streets that contributes to the Coral Gables classic appeal. The historic district of Coral Gables, which part of it is part of what we are discussing, contains homes that were carefully designed with columns, coral tiles, loggias, porte cocheres, and wrought iron work, which is all part of the City Beautiful's identity. By implementing more concrete on the swales of Coral Gables and Alhambra Circle, Public Works is forcing a transformation of the street which will diminish the aesthetic and historic value of Alhambra Circle. This project would sacrifice the significance of the historic district in favor of making Alhambra an ordinary commercial roadway. So, let me ask you, what is more

important to the City Beautiful? Its history and appearance, which everyone loves and is so proud of, or the addition of a bike path that would surrender the dignity of the street to mainly benefit people who don't live here. I urge you to drop this project and allow the spirit of George Merrick to continue to live and breathe on our wonderful Alhambra Circle. Thank you for your time.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Claudia Perez, 2715 Alhambra Circle.

Claudia Perez: Good morning.

Vice Mayor Lago: Morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good morning.

Ms. Perez: My name is Claudia Perez, and I've lived at 2715 Alhambra Circle since I was born. I would like to talk to you about the disconnect between the homeowners and the Public Works Department. I attended the meeting that took place at the Youth Center a few months back. And the attendance of those that live on Alhambra Circle was slim. We were notified of the meeting through a letter, but apparently not everyone on Alhambra received one. Since then, several of us have gone door to door to spread awareness of this possible addition to our street. Through our efforts, we have found that there was an overwhelming majority of homeowners who were against the bike paths, as you can see on the boards handed to you now, and an even larger number of people who were not aware of this plan at all. The City was going to speak for the homeowners without speaking to the homeowners. This is a clear example of a lack of communication between the two parties. Instead of giving us what you think we want, I ask that you actually listen to us, the homeowners, and drop this project. Thank you for your time.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Ms. Perez. Maria Souto, 2505 Alhambra Circle. She left? Okay.
Raymond Burkemper, 7266 Southwest 53rd Court. Kenneth Mase, 3017 Alhambra Circle.

Vice Mayor Lago: Good morning.

Kenneth Mase: Morning, Mr. Mayor and the Commissioners. Can't see too good without my glasses.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: If you don't hurry up, it's going to be afternoon.

Mr. Mase: I'm under two minutes. My name is Ken Mase, and I'm a veteran and also a retired airline captain. I've been a taxpaying homeowner in Coral Gables for over 50 years, moving here from Texas. And after visiting for only two days in Coral Gables, we purchased a home. We only looked in Coral Gables because we were captivated by the beautiful trees and the unique houses. Our house on 3017 Alhambra has two 50-year-old black olive trees on the swale and a vital storm drain between the tree and the road. My concern is not only for the trees but also for the existing drains. They are critical in keeping the volume of water to manageable levels. Additional concerns are our streetlights, house water lines, water meters, fire hydrants and sprinkler systems. I commend the City for its program of counting and knowing the location of its 38,000 trees. However, when the staff was asked how many and which trees will be impacted by the project, their answer was we don't know, but we'll do our best to save them. Not very reassuring after surveyors had been working all summer. Incidentally, on last Saturday's presentation, the staff had the width of Alhambra wrong. Coral Gables has been designated as a Tree City USA for the past 34 years. What a rich and valuable legacy. What makes Coral Gables Coral Gables? It's the trees and the grass. This Alhambra project in fact will kill and will damage trees. How many, we don't know, and will replace a lot of grass with concrete. This reminded me of the song, Big Yellow Taxi by Joni Mitchell. A few of the lyrics goes like this: "I said, don't it always seem to go; that you don't know what you got till it's gone. They paved paradise and put up a parking lot."

I respectfully request that you remove Alhambra from consideration for a bike lane. Thank you very much.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much, Mr. Mase. Roberta Neway.

Roberta Neway: Hello again. Roberta Neway, 1236 South Alhambra Circle, does not connect to Alhambra. I'm glad that you have acknowledged that climate change is a crisis and we are all in this together. When I hear someone say, my swale, my street; yes, your opinions need to be considered, but I don't own my swale. I don't own my street. The streets and the swales are for everyone, for the public good. I know from experience that walking and cycling are not only good forms of exercise, they're valid modes of transportation. And every time we choose to walk, to ride a bike, to take public transit, instead of using a car, we're doing something to slow climate change. We need -- we're also making our community a more pleasant place. Everybody knows we have too much traffic. That's something everybody in this room agrees on. So, the more we can get people cycling and walking, the better for everyone, the safer for everyone. Cycling and walking to get from point A to point B need to be encouraged, not discouraged. People who choose to walk or cycle to commute or to get to public transportation deserve to have a reasonable degree of safety. They deserve to have pleasant cycling, walking conditions. They need to be rewarded for doing the right thing instead of given paths that aren't safe, ways that aren't convenient. And I do trust the City that we will preserve the tree canopy. If you truly want to slow climate change, you need to support complete streets. And I think the least you can do is let project go for a vote to everybody who's affected. Thank you for your time.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am.

Ms. Neway: And have a great day.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Commissioner Fors: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And now Judy Alas. Judy Alas -- maybe I'm mispronouncing.

Vice Mayor Lago: Lucy.

Commissioner Mena: Lucy.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Lucy. Lucy, 3909 Alhambra Circle [sic]. I could swear it says Judy here.

Lucy Alas: Lucy, thank you. I wasn't planning on speaking, so I'm ill prepared. I live now at 3909 Alhambra Court, but I've been a resident of Coral Gables since 1967. You all might have read my email that I sent out to you yesterday with regards to a little bit of background. I've heard all the facts and they're quite exhausting actually. And I thought maybe bringing a human aspect behind this -- this is my city. Everybody's giving their addresses and whatnot, but I consider Coral Gables my home. This is my city. Every milestone that I've ever had in my life has been in this city. I recognize streets by trees. I know when to make a turn by the tree. Basically, it's not just the people on Alhambra Circle that are being affected. It's not going to impact me directly, but it impacts my life as a resident, as someone that has known this city. We pride ourselves on preserving history. There are certain things that we should not touch, and this is one of them. Leave it alone. Leave our residential streets alone. I'm pleading with you. My father loved this city more than anything in the world. I'm sorry. He pride -- he just loved this city. He loved everything about it. Please don't cut up our streets. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much, ma'am. Thank you. I have no more cards for speakers.

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You did? Come up.

Kenneth Garcia: Oh, (INAUDIBLE) five minutes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: What?

Vice Mayor Lago: Yeah, but you could...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, no. Come on and speak.

Vice Mayor Lago: You could fill that out after.

Commissioner Mena: He's the...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Did you fill a card?

Commissioner Mena: Closing argument, if you will.

Vice Mayor Lago: Closing.

Commissioner Keon: He was the one that was going to speak.

Vice Mayor Lago: He's the closing.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, I know. If you're the closer, I haven't called you yet so calm down. Okay, let me ask again. Anybody else from the members of the public that wish to speak other than the two closers? Okay, nobody. So now I will have the two closers speak. First, Mr. Kenneth Garcia, 20 Alhambra Circle, Apartment 8, I guess. You will have five minutes to close, sir.

Mr. Garcia: Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Mayor, Mr. Vice Mayor, Commissioners. My name is Kenneth Garcia. I'm at 20 Alhambra Circle. Thank you for taking the time to listen to us. I'm a bicyclist who bikes to work every day on Alhambra Circle. I bike from roughly downtown Coral Gables to roughly downtown South Miami. And for me, this is personal because I use the street every day as a bicyclist. And the streets of Coral Gables to me are very special. The beauty of Coral Gables is very special. The trees and the shade are very important to me. And it's my life that we're talking about. This is about safety. And I've been listening to the opponents of this project and there really seems to be kind of three main arguments about this. And one is the public process and the claim is that the public process was not done correctly. Whether it was or it wasn't, this is part of the public process. We are in the public process. We've had a lot of meetings about this. The neighbors are here because they heard about this through the public process. And this resolution -- the resolution specifically seems intended to cut that public process short. And we're asking you to not do that, to continue the public process on this important project. The other claim used by opponents seems to be about safety. And they -- the -- our neighbors claim to be concerned about safety and I appreciate that they claim that. But I believe that this -- the reason -- the very reason for this project is safety and the -- if there are safety issues that are part of this road right now, we should do things -- we should do everything we can to fix those issues and make it safer for everybody, for people walking, for people biking and for people driving as well. And lastly, the opponents of this project seem to be putting a lot of effort to make this discussion a trees versus bikes discussion. Why is that? The answer is simple because if I have a neighbor knocking on my door and telling me the City is planning to tear down the trees in front of your house to put in a bike lane, I am going to be alarmed about that. But let me be very clear about this. There is absolutely nobody asking you have to tear down trees to put in a bike lane. I'm not asking for it. The residents are not asking for it. There's no safety advocate that I've talked to that has asked for you to tear down trees to put in bike lanes. You have professionals working on this project. If the professionals working on this project, through real dimensions and real surveying and professional analysis, find out that you can't put a bike lane on this street without killing the trees, then fine, I'm okay with that. But don't kill the bike lanes because of fearmongering and misinformation. Don't

kill the bike lanes because somebody on this street seems to hate bicyclists and pedestrians in front of their house. That's not the reason.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Come on, please.

Mr. Garcia: This is about safety. This is about preserving our city and making it safer for everyone. If you want to do something about this and make a resolution, then direct staff to make sure that the trees are saved as part of this project. And if that means killing the bike lanes, let them determine that. But don't kill the bike lanes prematurely. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you, sir.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much. And now we have, on behalf of the proponents of the resolution, Marvin Ross Friedman, 3417 Alhambra Circle.

Marvin Ross Friedman: (UNINTELLIGIBLE) respond to the gentleman.

Vice Mayor Lago: Microphone.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Use the microphone. We can't hear you.

Mr. Ross Friedman: Before you start my clock, Mr. Mayor, I just want to reply to the gentleman's concern about the Underline. The Underline is a terrific thing. It's going to be a terrific park. The bike path one block away on 57th Avenue ties directly into that Underline. We do not need the Alhambra Circle to tie into the Underline to bring all of these people -- and again, none of us have anything against bikers, but to bring these people from outside and disturb our peace down...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Go ahead, please.

Mr. Ross Friedman: Alhambra Circle...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please start. Your time is starting.

Mr. Ross Friedman: Thank you. I started to come here today, and I had a whole legal argument that I was going to make about this bike path and the lack of due process and the misrepresentation, but I threw it away. I wanted to ask this Commission a question. What are we doing here? How did this happen to us? It's outrageous that we even have to be here today. It's outrageous that we have to be here to protect the green in front of our residences. It's outrageous that we have to be here to protect the canopy and the trees. And while we're talking about the trees because it's a central issue, there's absolutely no question that we are going to lose trees. During the walkthrough, Jessica Keller walked through -- I said -- and I think it's on tape -- how about the trees? We're going to go around the trees. Impossible. I asked Mr. Santamaria, how about the trees? His answer was, we're only taking out the sick ones. Later on, in the newspaper, Mr. Santamaria said, I can't promise you we won't lose trees. And in the Coral Gables website, Jessica says, we'll take as few trees as possible, which is a tacit admission that the trees are going. When she was there, I pointed to a tree. I said, how about this tree? It's a big solid old beautiful tree, takes up the entire swale. She walked away from me. So, the trees -- and I'd like -- these are pictures of our canopy -- to just bring them up and show that to you, but that is a very real issue. The next issue is it's outrageous that we have to fight to protect Coral Gables and its aesthetics. Why do we have to fight a concrete ribbon? We're talking about a concrete ribbon on both sides of the street, eight feet wide. And Saturday, Jessica Keller said the least invasive path is this eight-foot wide ribbon, which is going to go through -- pass the front of our house on our front lawn. Granted, it's a swale. The City owns the swale. We understand the City owns the swale, but it has infrastructure on it. We're going to lose all of our parking on Alhambra Circle. They're going to have to move light poles. They're going to have to move fire plugs. There are storm sewers in the way. There is no possible way to do this without destroying an awful lot of green and also all of

the beautiful landscaping. The City may own it, but we residents pay for the maintenance, the installation and the beauty of this beautiful landscape, which makes it so important and so beautiful. This is an eight-foot ribbon of concrete on both sides of the street, the length of three major airport runways. It's as long as three runways at Kennedy airport. At LaGuardia airport, the average runway is 7,000 to 12,000 feet. That's the -- the average is actually around 10,000 feet, so we're looking at three runways of cement going past the front of the residences, destroying everything that Coral Gables represents. As far as due process -- or as far as process should run its course, the vote, the residents and the voters of Coral Gables respectfully disagree. The process must be stopped now because it should have never been started. The process -- there's no question that it is based on flawed and untrue information and lack of due process. To continue along this path will only result in the additional loss of taxpayer's money and possible future litigation. There's are good reason they want to shut down the process and that reason is the vote. Let me tell you about the vote that they want taken. They want to vote -- there are 174 houses on Alhambra Circle. The corridor where they want to send the vote is an additional 857 residences. They want to ask those 857 residences, "What do you want to put over here on Alhambra Circle, on a street where you don't live?" More importantly, because of the misrepresentation and the misdirection of the staff, these people think bike path is a line painted on the road. They don't realize what -- that this is a very invasive -- that they're going to cut down trees. The trees are going to go. There's absolutely no doubt about it -- about that. I want to continue, please, just as far as the vote. There's a very -- it's devious.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, go ahead for two more minutes.

Mr. Ross Friedman: It's devious. It's Machiavellian that they want to ask the people on Alhambra -- not on Alhambra Circle what we have going to have in front of our house. And it's a clearly orchestrated, intentional position to diminish and delete and take away the objection. They can then come to the Commission and say, well, these 500 people voted for this, even though it's not in front of...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Finish up, Marvin.

Mr. Ross Friedman: Okay, I'll finish up. There's precedent, University Drive, the last vote. They voted for side -- whether or not they wanted sidewalks in front of University Drive. That vote went only to the residents of University Drive. It did not go to the residents on Maggiore or any of the other streets, saying, "Hey, you want to put a sidewalk in front of University Drive?" So...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Mr. Ross Friedman: That is the Coral Gables...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Marvin.

Mr. Ross Friedman: Precedent.

Vice Mayor Lago: Can you do me a favor? No, Marvin, just keep going. I mean, let's just finish. Just bring it to an end because we need to give Mr. Ruano his additional minute to a minute and a half because the last thing I want to hear is that we weren't fair.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Vice Mayor Lago: Yeah, but obviously he's basically hyperventilating over there saying that we're not providing him with the two minutes. So -- and I think we need to be...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Marvin, finish up.

Vice Mayor Lago: Step up here.

Mr. Ross Friedman: Okay, yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Finish up.

Mr. Ross Friedman: All right

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'm going to cut you off.

Mr. Ross Friedman: Vice Mayor Lago, I actually saw the clock here go back to five minutes after you'd been speaking three minutes. So, I will finish up and say that nobody in our community asked for a bike path. It is something that is being imposed upon us. It is something that virtually not only our neighborhood, but all of the residents object to. It is something that decimates the community. It is something that takes a historic road and turns it into a recreational area. It is something that puts cement down one of the most historical beautiful streets in the city. It is something that brings increased bike traffic to the City and to Alhambra Circle. And it's something that is a very bad idea. And we urge you to vote...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Marvin.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Mr. Ross Friedman: For the resolution and thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you. Mr. Ruano, you got two minutes and your sign is falling off.

Mr. Ruano: Thank you, sir. Vice Mayor Lago, I'm not hyperventilating, but you do see -- I mean, at least we do see that the opponents are allowed to speak first. They're allowed to speak (UNINTELLIGIBLE).

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That is not true, sir.

Mr. Ruano: And they get more time.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That is not...

Mr. Ruano: So, all I have to say is...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You were allowed to...

Mr. Ruano: That's what happened.

Commissioner Mena: Robert, that's nonsense.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Robert, that is not true.

Commissioner Mena: You're being -- you're -- that's unbelievable that you would say that.

Mr. Ruano: I'm sorry, but it's...

Commissioner Mena: It's really unbelievable.

Mr. Ruano: But wait, isn't that true?

Commissioner Mena: It's unbelievable. It's unbelievable.

Mr. Ruano: But wasn't it true?

Commissioner Mena: It's -- what?

Mr. Ruano: That the opponents spoke first and last.

Commissioner Mena: Somebody -- in the world?

Mr. Ruano: No, no, no.

Commissioner Mena: Listen, let me finish, let me finish. Somebody has to go first.

Mr. Ruano: No, I understand.

Commissioner Mena: So, would it be unfair if you went first to them? It's nonsense.

Mr. Ruano: I'm just making a note because...

Commissioner Mena: Do you think it's going to make a difference...

Mr. Ruano: No.

Commissioner Mena: To our decision if you spoke first or second...

Mr. Ruano: No, no, no, no.

Commissioner Mena: Or third? That's petty nonsense.

Mr. Ruano: No, no, no.

Commissioner Mena: So, let's stop with that.

Mr. Ruano: No, the petty -- no, no.

Commissioner Mena: Get to the...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: They went first.

Commissioner Mena: Substance.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Initially...

Mr. Ruano: Commissioner...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: He went first.

Mr. Ruano: I will get to the substance, but the problem is when...

Vice Mayor Lago: Mr. Ruano, Mr. Ruano, just stop for one second, please. The reason why I asked the Mayor to give you a few moments is because I want there to be equity amongst everybody, okay. And I think this is what the entire Commission wants. I know this is what the entire Commission wants. So, get to the substance...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Get to the substance.

Vice Mayor Lago: And let us, again, deliberate after. I think we've heard from everybody.

Mr. Ruano: Sure.

Vice Mayor Lago: We've given everybody equal time. Take the two or three minutes that you need right now to add additional substance to the discussion.

Mr. Ruano: I will, please. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Mr. Ruano: We've been at this a long time. Some of us have been at this promoting bike lanes and sidewalks in the city now for 10 years now. Not usually here, not usually advocating things, but trying to make events or making events, like Gables Bike Day, for some of them, a lot of people that are here have been there, like bike tours that promote the City, promote the canopy, promote the history of the city. We all believe in the canopy. We believe in the history. I would challenge a lot of people here on what their knowledge of George Merrick is. And I think that if George Merrick were here, I think he'd want a city that worked for everybody because that's what he set up. A city with big houses, small houses, apartment buildings, commercial area. And all we're doing here, all we're trying to do, it's make a city that's more walkable, is make a city that is more mobile and people can get around. Maybe not everybody that goes through our city can afford a big expensive house or big expensive car, but I think we need to move our -- we need to...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please.

Mr. Ruano: We need to move our residents from place to place, and that's all it's about. And it's all supporting -- and Commissioner, I'm on your side, quite frankly. I mean, you may not believe that. I'm on the side of the resolutions that were passed at this Commission and the words that I've heard from this Commission about the importance of both the climate, of transportation, of getting people around and complete streets. So, finish the complete streets. And all I ask right now is don't even decide. All I ask is let the people vote. Let the residents vote. And like Commissioner Mena said, look at both sides and determine. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir. Thank you. Nobody else wishes to speak. I will start with the closing comments. Comments have been made about resolutions in the past, complete streets, the 2014 -- this Commission has the power to overrule past Commissions, and the future

Commissions have the power to overrule this Commission. We've been elected by the people. We were elected in 2019 to determine what is best for the City in our opinion. And maybe what is best for the City today is not what was best for the City in 2014, '16, '18, whatever. The monies spent in this and the \$625,000, we have to put that in context. I've heard today that the process is suspect, that the notice given for the application of the grant was not sufficient and that the procedure, the public hearings, et cetera, was -- were suspect or was suspect. I'm very upset. I'm very upset at the confrontation, at the uncivility, at the screaming that took place at the corner of Coral Way and Alhambra Circle the other day. That is not Coral Gables. And the people -- I understand the Alhambra Circle people being upset at their -- the front of their house and the street being changed -- not going to say destroyed but changed. But the cyclists with all your claim as to livability and sustainability and whatever, there has to be civility in this process. We are in Coral Gables and I'm very proud of that. Coral Gables was planned by George Merrick 95 years ago in a very creative way. He had -- we had Chinese Village, Dutch South African Village, the French Provincial Village and several -- the Chinese Village and many other villages, very creative on his part, the Mediterranean look, the Mediterranean style. He received Spain's highest decoration, including one that's given to heads of state and nobody else from King Alfonso XIII, Alfonso the 13th, because of what he was doing in Coral Gables. But he planned a city 95 years ago, a city where car traffic was not...

Commissioner Keon: And they're listening to you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: They're listening to me.

Commissioner Keon: Alexa.

Commissioner Mena: Siri.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: He planned it for a different time, for a different time. And a city that exists today and I'm very proud of the city that exists today with our streets, as they were designed. They

would have been designed differently. Look at Doral, look at other new cities. They would have been designed differently had he been doing it today, but he didn't. We have what we have and I'm very proud of what we have and I am against -- I refuse to change what we have in order to try to improve it. Sometimes improvements backfire and they backfire. You say let the people vote. Yes, let the people on Alhambra Circle vote. The people on Alhambra Circle are the ones that are directly affected and not the side streets and not the nearby streets. Let's take a vote on Maggiore or on Blue Road, Country Club Prado. Let's put a bike path on San Amaro or in Granada, University, Anastasia. Let them vote on bike paths and let's not make that binding. They will vote against it. Why should streets near Alhambra Circle get to vote on how -- what some -- what residents on Alhambra Circle view as a destruction of their city, the destruction of their street? There are other City experiences that we have had. Somebody mentioned University. We voted down Riviera because 52 of the 55 neighbors in Riviera were here opposing the bike paths in Riviera. And the other three weren't here, so it's not that they were supporting it. I am -- again, I am for this resolution. I am for the resolution for the reasons I've stated. I am against the vote as it is currently presented including streets that are not Alhambra Circle, the people most affected. And I would urge you to vote for this resolution. Vice Mayor.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you, Mayor. First off, I'd like to thank everyone on both sides, all the residents who are advocating on behalf of what they truly believe is in the best interest of not only their community but the city as a whole. I think the Mayor made some great comments in regards to this weekend's meeting. We always have to keep in mind that we're representing the City Beautiful and that we are the true envy of every city, of every community, not only in South Florida but throughout the state of Florida. So, I know it's tough and we're passionate. That's what sets us apart. But I know that we could do much better. I'm going to be very brief. A lot of my points have already been made for me, so I congratulate you on both sides. One of my biggest concerns is the trees. Everyone is aware that outside of design and the aesthetic beauty of the City of Coral Gables, George Merrick's vision was a planned community. He planted those trees. To me, along with the rest of this Commission, we advocate on doing everything in our power to protect the canopy. If you look down -- up and down Alhambra, my in-laws live a stone's throw away from

Bird Road on Alhambra. And you can sense the difference in temperature. You can sense the difference of livability with a canopy about three blocks that is missing from the beautiful shaped archways, which are so robust heading towards Miller and obviously heading once you pass Bird Road. So, to us -- at least to me there's no compromise in regards to the trees. I think we need to do everything in our power to ensure that those trees are not only protected, but that they're giving everything -- every ability to continue to grow in a majestic fashion. So, I will not under any circumstances vote to approve anything that puts the trees in danger. I don't know how many visits we've made to Alhambra, maybe three, maybe four. The last visit I made was last week on Thursday or Friday. And I witnessed firsthand looking down, as the residents explained to me, look at the roots. They're sticking six to eight inches outside of the soil. The roots running all the way from an existing sidewalk to the street or from a non-existing sidewalk to a property line all the way to the street. How are we going to implement sidewalks? And I'm a big proponent of sidewalks. I've spoken to everyone on both sides of this issue saying that sidewalks are a big necessity for the disabled, for the elderly, for people in this community who need accessibility, especially with the addition of the Betsy Adams Park on Alhambra. It's a shame that you see people walking in the middle of the street with their children and not being able to get to that park. Another point that I want to make, which is important, that was made before, which is the issue of examples of previous balloting efforts. If you look at, especially in my neighborhood, a stone's throw away, probably four or five blocks away, you have streets, like Cantoria, Garcia, Mendavia, and certain streets around City Hall that you see currently are implementing traffic calming initiatives. That balloting occurred for the properties that are directly impacted by that proposed traffic calming initiative. And I know it's hard to believe, but there are one -- I think one, maybe two streets, correct me, Mr. Manager if I'm wrong, that they didn't want traffic calming. And when that traffic calming was implemented in their neighbor's street, they've come back now and says we would like to have traffic calming and they will be considered and given the opportunity to reballot, and hopefully, they'll have the votes necessary to institute that traffic calming in their street. But it wasn't the neighboring street that was deciding basically what happened in front of the residents. That to me is ensuring property values, ensuring that we respect people's property rights. Who voted on these balloting issues? Again, the front door property owners. When you

look at Alhambra, like Mr. Friedman mentioned, you have 175 to 170 members on Alhambra. I had over 700-plus on the neighboring side streets who could potentially vote. That to me is going to tilt the scale and to me it's a problem. If you want to vote on this issue, I don't have a problem voting. Let's make it a vote directly just for the residents on Alhambra. I believe the process is flawed and I'll tell you why the process -- besides all of this. The process is flawed because this is the third attempt at handling this issue in a piecemeal fashion. We attempted to do it in Riviera. We attempted to do it in University, and now we're moving in Alhambra. If you look at Resolution Number 2018-21, this was a unanimously supported resolution by this Commission which allowed for the City to proceed with the implementation of the bicycle master plan but exclude Riviera Drive. That to me sends a precedent. How am I going to allow the residents in Riviera to exclude themselves from the bicycle master plan and then tell the residents that are in front of us, no, I have to force this down your throat. I find that very difficult and I won't vote for that. So, what now? What do we do now as a community? How do we make our streets safer? How do we implement sidewalks which I view as critical for the future of the city? I'm of the belief that we need to amend this resolution as presented by the Mayor. And what I would like to see is that our bicycle master plan and pedestrian master plan be updated. The last time it was done was in 2014; we're in 2020. Have it updated by our City staff. Bring it before the residents, have four or five meetings. When I mean updated, let's have stakeholders, let's have HOAs, homeowner associations, call them, get them involved and get their input. Let's talk to University of Miami. Let's talk to all the residents.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Excuse me.

Vice Mayor Lago: Yes, sir.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That's a different resolution, and I would support it, but the resolution before us is killing the bike paths.

Vice Mayor Lago: That's fine. But if it -- it's your resolution and I respect it. And I'm just offering a friendly amendment. If my colleagues don't support it, it's perfectly fine. If not, I will propose that resolution at the next Commission meeting or I'll propose it here.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: This one has (UNINTELLIGIBLE) bicycle lanes on Alhambra Circle.

Vice Mayor Lago: I understand.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You're talking about changing it and including other areas. Let's vote on this one first.

Vice Mayor Lago: Not a problem. I'm also...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I would support yours.

Vice Mayor Lago: I'm also taking up the opportunity since we never have the opportunity to be in the sunshine and get our opinions on the record. I'd like to put my opinion on the record.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Vice Mayor Lago: So, besides contacting HOAs, University of Miami, having four or five meetings with the community, rolling out this plan, explaining to them what this plan is. And then, like Mr. Ruano said, don't kill the voice of the residents. Perfect. Let's put it to a referendum. The same thing that we did with the trucks; put it to a referendum citywide...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Citywide.

Vice Mayor Lago: Which will then allow everybody to take a vote on bicycle and pedestrian -- the master plan and ensure that everybody has a vote and it's recorded.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Lago: Because the -- almost done. Give me one second, Mayor, please. So, it's simple. We've tried to do this piecemeal three times. We've failed. I'm not -- I'm going to support the Mayor's resolution today, and I will continue to support that because we need to put the residents first on this issue. And I'm concerned about diluting the vote via the balloting process. Because what you're seeing now is University voted just on University. When you talk about traffic calming, traffic calming just on those streets that had the opportunity to implement traffic calming and met the requirements of traffic calming. I think we're deviating and offering different scenarios for different parts of the community and I don't think that works. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you. Commissioner Fors.

Commissioner Fors: Yeah. So, when I first started to frame this resolution that was presented by the Mayor, I didn't view it as a vote for or against bike paths on Alhambra. I could become one vote of being against it. However, we could have a situation where we can continue with the process, take the poll and later determine it's not something we were going to do. As the volatility continued to increase and we started hearing from more and more neighbors and we started having these community meetings, I started to wrestle with my initial position of taking the poll no matter what and deciding later. I asked myself, why should we -- what are the reasons not to take the poll? One is -- which I agree with strongly is what Vice Mayor Lago just explained -- that we're diluting the opinion of the people most affected by it and most -- perhaps even more importantly, the precedent of not polling areas apart from those directly affected in the context of sidewalks and other bike plans. Secondly, the issue of due process concerned me. I've heard all the different allegations of how the notice was less than perfect, how Alhambra residents found out late in the day, how the grant stated that there was community support when there really wasn't. I don't necessarily agree with all of those. However, when it comes to due process, equally as important as actual due process is the impression of due process that our residents have. And whether or not

our residents did receive due process, they feel like they didn't. And when the residents feel like they didn't, we have to take a time out, adjust and make sure that they do. Secondly, a reason to not say what's the harm in proceeding to a poll is that there's no denying that the proponents of the bike paths on Alhambra have potential conflicts of interest, not all of them. There's residents like Roberta Neway, who I know is always in favor of pedestrians and cyclists and complete streets and has no financial interest in it. However, here and there, we've noticed that even going down to the last gentleman that spoke, Mr. Kenneth Garcia, works for urban planning companies. I don't know if there's conflicts of interest there. They have an equal say. They are residents of Coral Gables, but it's similar to due process. Actual conflict of interest is a problem, but so is the impression of conflict of interest. Finally, two things really bring it home for me in terms of my motivation to continue on this path or not continue on this path when it comes to Alhambra. The first being the trees. I, like my colleagues, value the canopy, value our 35-year designation. It's something that makes us unique and truly an oasis in Miami-Dade County and we shouldn't do anything unless we're certain that it won't affect it. I've looked at the plans for the Alhambra bike path and I simply don't believe that as hard as we try, we're going to be able to do it on that particular street in a manner that doesn't jeopardize any trees or doesn't put them at unnecessary risk. Finally, and here's really a real big one for me, this would be an entire different conversation if we were talking about implementing a bike path that provided protected bike paths, where people would truly feel safe to ride with their children on those paths. Me personally, I would never put myself or any of my children on an unprotected bike path. There's many folks that are braver than me, but I think the vast majority truly won't use that path unless it's protected. If the plan -- if it was possible to do a protected bike path on Alhambra, it'd be a different conversation. In this case, I think an unprotected bike path, which amounts to just a designation on the side of the road, it's not something that will truly result in an uptick of folks using bicycle transportation instead of vehicles no more than already do.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Commissioner.

Commissioner Fors: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you. Commissioner Keon.

Commissioner Keon: This is obviously a very divisive issue, but I think that when issues are divisive, it isn't a good thing to silence people. I think that's the time that people need to talk and I think it's when you need more conversation and more open conversation. So, I'm glad that we're here today and I'm glad we can talk about it. You know, there's -- I have some conflicting feelings. I would tell you, yes, because you live on a street, you maybe have more right to say as to what happens on that street. But when you live along collector roads and you're trying to -- or attempt to create networks or pathways, the likelihood is they are going to go along collector roads. So, part of -- some of the fact that they happen to be collectors really affects your input to some extent because they are shared pathways through a city. I -- you know, the part of Alhambra that, you know, meets LeJeune, you know, is a very wide right-of-way and there is ample room to stripe a bike path. The area along Alhambra from Coral Way, you know, coming north and then east from that direction is really a much more narrow right-of-way. You have to have -- we need to have at least 28 feet of right-of-way -- it's my understanding -- in order to put in a bike path. You need 10 feet for each lane in each direction and you need a minimum of 4 feet on each side. So, I think to staff, when you don't have 28 foot of right-of-way, you really -- you may -- you shouldn't include that for consideration upfront. I mean, maybe at the end there is a way to deal with it, but I really don't think -- I don't -- those are rights-of-way that are really too narrow to effectively put in bike paths without invading the swales and without, you know, affecting the trees along those paths. I do believe, you know, that we -- the City needs to maintain the -- our control of the swales that although a number of years ago one Commission asked that individual residents would maintain their swales, those swales belong to the City and are City property. They are there so -- as public easements. They are there to be able to install sidewalks at some point, and they do support the glorious canopy that we have in the city. But, to City staff, you know, you need to maintain your control over those swales. When people put driveways that go all the way to the street, when people plant in the swales, you need you need an agreement from them that they are not on their property, that they are on City property, so that if something happens and you need that property,

you can go back and obtain that property. But I think that one section of Alhambra that is -- it isn't wide enough to be able to do what we're going to do without invading the swale and without then disrupting the tree roots that would support the health and the well-being of those trees. So, I -- you know, for that area where there isn't adequate space to be able to place a -- two lanes of traffic and stripe bike paths on each side, I would ask you to look for an alternative to that to connect to maybe possibly the area of Alhambra that can support that width and those swales. You know, the only reason I would like to see a vote is I guess I would like to see the level of interest in bike paths. And I think that there is support in the City for bike paths if we can figure out where to put them. So, I think maybe the problem is we haven't found the place for bike paths, but I don't want us to stop the initiative to provide alternative modes of transportation for people that would choose to use that means of transportation. So, I think it's a matter of looking for where those corridors - - where they can work, and obviously, when there isn't the distance and there isn't the space to put them in. I really don't want to see us add pavement or more hardscape to our city streets. I know we're working with some areas in the city, particularly north of 8th Street, where we're trying to take concrete out of the right-of-way because they are so hard and so desolate, and they don't reflect the aesthetic of the City of Coral Gables. So, I don't want to then put hardscape where we don't already have it. I don't want to add hardscape.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Commissioner.

Commissioner Keon: You know, the problem with my support for your resolution is it -- I don't think it should end Alhambra in its entirety because there are -- there is an area of Alhambra that could be used and it could connect to -- in through some other cities where there is the right-of-way. So, I would -- you know, I would -- rather than vote for this resolution, I really would rather give direction to staff that -- as to how we would like to see bike paths go forward and where we don't want to see bike paths.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Commissioner, the resolution is...

Commissioner Keon: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: The bicycle lanes on Alhambra Circle as part of the specific Alhambra Circle Complete Streets Project.

Commissioner Keon: Well, I think we also need to have a discussion about complete streets.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We will...

Commissioner Keon: Because with complete streets...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We will do that later, but let's...

Commissioner Keon: You're talking about...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We're talking about this resolution.

Commissioner Keon: It -- on both sides. I mean, you're talking about having sidewalks on both sides, when in a lot of instances, a sidewalk on one side of the street is adequate. You don't need to do on both sides. So, there is a lot here. And I think, you know, to staff's credit, they did what -- they just enacted the policies that we set. So, if we're going to change those policies, we go back, we change the policies and we redirect staff. And I don't think...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Commissioner Keon: All of Alhambra Circle -- I think there's aspects of Alhambra Circle that could continue to serve with a striped bike path.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. That's your opinion.

Commissioner Keon: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Vice -- I mean, Commissioner Mena.

Commissioner Mena: So, I'll try to be as minimally repetitive as possible because we've talked...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good.

Commissioner Mena: About the issue. But I will take as much time as I need, Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Of course.

Commissioner Mena: You know, one of the things that's troubled me about this issue is, you know, a lot of the complaints stem from process and notice, and I think there's some fair concerns that were brought up about the initial process. But what I had hoped would happen here is that, you know, you could sort of course correct, allow an actual process to play out where we get feedback. Today I think was a very productive exercise where we got to hear everybody. And so, my thought has always been let people -- and I hate the word "vote" because it indicates that it's going to be a true vote where if it's 50 plus one, then there's a bike path and that's not what it is. It's a poll. It's a poll that will give us information that we can then act upon. And again, I said this earlier, but -- and be held accountable based on our decision with real information. We have a lot of issues that come before us where we see buttons and the t-shirts and people try to convey that there is support one way or another, and I appreciate all of you taking your time to do that. But even sitting here today with all of you here, I don't really know. I don't really have actionable data for how many people, even that just live on Alhambra, are opposed to this. So, you know, I always tend to side on giving the residents a voice and having them be heard. And so, that's my challenge right now is that this is short circuiting that process, Mr. Mayor. And while sitting here today for the reasons that Vice Mayor Lago described about the tree canopy, which I value, I'll be honest

with you, where I am right now is that I don't -- I'm not thinking that bike paths are appropriate here because I don't have a grasp on how many trees will be lost, right. I think that it's pro -- let me be clear. I hear you. I made the point earlier. It's clearly not three trees. I think that's a -- just totally like out of line estimation. But is it 10 or is it 50? My -- I see you (UNINTELLIGIBLE). I've gone out and done site visits and I agree with the Vice Mayor's comments. There's clearly a lot of trees where the roots go out to the -- and so, I'm very concerned about the impact. But again, my issue is why not let the residents be heard in terms of a poll. The other part that I think, Mr. Mayor, is missing from this conversation, it's like the 800-pound gorilla in the room that we're ignoring, is you've, you know, bifurcated sidewalks.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Absolutely.

Commissioner Mena: Right, but...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Absolutely.

Commissioner Mena: Clearly.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And that's the way it is.

Commissioner Mena: And I see that.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let's respect the way I presented it.

Commissioner Mena: Well, I'm going to talk about it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Commissioner Mena: Because I suspect -- and I have spoken to many of the residents here who are opposed to the bike path. A lot of you are probably also opposed to sidewalk. If we're being honest and having a real conversation, let's have it. And so, I'm not really sure I follow, Mr. Mayor, why you would bifurcate sidewalks when most of the people here are opposed to the bike path, I believe -- again, just a straw poll, if you will, from the people I've spoken to, they don't want a sidewalk either, and they're equally concerned about the impact of the sidewalk on the trees. So, you've taken that issue off the table to just vote on the bike paths...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes, sir.

Commissioner Mena: To effectively pull the plug on the grant portion of this, which I understand, but you're not talking about other issues. For example, you know, we have parks. We have a brand-new park, relatively brand new, on Alhambra Circle, Betsy Adams Park. I've had mothers reach out to me who say, you know, I want to go to the park with my kids. It's hard to get there. There's no sidewalk. I'm not talking about bike lanes. And you're kind of sweeping that off to the side, but that's an important part of this discussion.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And that's why -- it is an important part of any discussion, and that's why it's not included in my resolution.

Commissioner Mena: Right. But you're -- but it should be the same discussion. It's been the same discussion...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, it isn't.

Commissioner Mena: Up until this point.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I chose not to make it...

Commissioner Mena: So...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: The same discussion. Please respect my choice.

Commissioner Mena: No, I do respect your choice.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, so let's...

Commissioner Mena: But that doesn't mean I support your resolution, so I'm having a conversation. I really want to have a feel for what the residents think about sidewalks. I know Vice Mayor Lago's a big proponent of sidewalks.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: So am I.

Commissioner Mena: We've had this conversation.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: So am I.

Commissioner Mena: So, are you telling the individuals here are against the bike path that you're in favor of a sidewalk on Alhambra?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'm not telling anybody anything except...

Commissioner Mena: That's what I'm saying.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: What I said.

Commissioner Mena: You're not...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please...

Commissioner Mena: Telling them.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let's not speculate on what I'm telling or not telling.

Commissioner Mena: I'm asking you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please finish up. No, I'm not going to answer that.

Commissioner Mena: Okay. I think that's problematic. I think we're not having -- you know, we talk about notice and due process. I want to have a real conversation with the residents about the broader issue and make a final decision. Because what's going to happen, I'm going to tell you right now, it's probably going to be three votes in favor of this resolution, and you'll be happy about that with the bike path. We'll probably be back here in six months having the same conversation about sidewalks.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Fine.

Commissioner Mena: And that's, to me, not ideal.

Vice Mayor Lago: And that's why I mentioned before...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, shall we call...

Commissioner Mena: So...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: The question?

Vice Mayor Lago: If I may. Just...

Commissioner Mena: I'm sorry?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let's call the question.

Commissioner Mena: We will in a moment.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Vice Mayor Lago: Let's -- we're having -- this is the point.

Commissioner Mena: We're trying to have a dialogue. We're here.

Vice Mayor Lago: Dialogue, this is the point of...

Commissioner Mena: I've sat here and really respectfully...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, but we're speculating as to...

Commissioner Mena: Listened to everybody and it's been very valuable, and I really appreciate it. And I have some questions for some of you actually that I really want to hear your opinion on. So, for example, I had a question -- Mr. Garcia spoke a little bit -- you spoke that you take Alhambra Circle on your bike every day. And I guess my question for you is if -- it would seem to me that if you thought it was really dangerous, you probably may or may not do that. And the other question, which has hung in the balance for me and a lot of people have brought it up, so there's a bike lane on 57th, a lot of people have mentioned that. So, I guess my question for you -- because I'm not somebody that bikes to work or anything like that is -- so you're -- when you go,

you told me you come from downtown Gables to downtown South Miami, you elect to go down the street without the bike path, even though there's a street, a block away with a bike path. So...

Mr. Garcia: And...

Commissioner Mena: Hold on. So, as a decision maker on this issue, you understand how that sort of presents a little bit of a conflict for me. So, can you explain that to me because it would just help me understand.

Mr. Garcia: When you're behind your wheel of a vehicle, your experience of driving down a street is always traffic because there's always cars in front of you and cars behind you because of the way traffic lights work. But when you're biking down the street on a street like Alhambra, what happens is that there is a line of cars that pass you, and then you're -- you have the street to yourself and it's actually really pleasant until the next line of cars comes through. What bike lanes would do for me is allow me to get out of the way of the cars that are behind me...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: What about Red Road?

Mr. Garcia: And not disturb them. On Red Road, unlike Alhambra Circle, the traffic is constant. There is no break. There is always traffic and it's always very fast.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: But there is a bike lane there.

Mr. Garcia: There is a bike lane, yes, but on Alhambra Circle...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please.

Mr. Garcia: It is a lot more comfortable because there is large periods of time when there is simply no traffic that I have to deal with.

Commissioner Mena: Folks, folks, please, please stay, stay, stay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please.

Commissioner Keon: Please stay.

Commissioner Mena: Stay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Respect.

Commissioner Mena: Please just have respect for his answers. This is all -- again, we're trying to hear from everybody. Again, I'm really trying to hear you out and understand your...

Mr. Garcia: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: Position because I'm in a position right now where...

Mr. Garcia: I understand.

Commissioner Mena: I am very concerned about the impact on the trees and that leads me...

Mr. Garcia: Right, and so am I.

Commissioner Mena: And that leads -- and you mentioned that, and I appreciate that.

Mr. Garcia: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: And that leads me to vote in favor of this resolution cause I'm concerned about the impact of the trees.

Mr. Garcia: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: But so I'm trying to understand your side of the issue and whether or not to have a vote from the residents on it because...

Mr. Garcia: I would suggest that you vote to direct staff to make sure that whatever happens, it doesn't harm the trees.

Commissioner Mena: No, I appreciate that. But I think like if we're having a realistic dialogue, there's going to be a lot of trees impacted.

Mr. Garcia: And if they...

Commissioner Mena: Whether...

Mr. Garcia: And if the professionals determine...

Commissioner Mena: Whether it...

Mr. Garcia: That...

Commissioner Mena: I don't have a number and that bothers me.

Mr. Garcia: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: I wish I did have a number. I think we should have a number by now.

Mr. Garcia: I agree.

Commissioner Mena: But we don't.

Mr. Garcia: And if the professionals determine that...

Commissioner Mena: And I've asked for it and I've been told we just don't have it yet.

Mr. Garcia: Then I don't want bike lanes if...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Mr. Garcia: It'll get rid of trees.

Commissioner Mena: But you -- okay, so that's interesting because I think we are going to get rid of a decent amount of trees, right?

Mr. Garcia: Right.

Commissioner Mena: So...

Mr. Garcia: But I would love to hear from staff about that.

Commissioner Mena: But what's also sort of curious about what you're telling me is, you know, to use your words, you said it's pretty pleasant actually as it is now to ride down.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Mr. Garcia: Yeah, for large periods of time, yes.

Commissioner Mena: Right. And then there's periods of time where there's cars and maybe it's not as pleasant.

Mr. Garcia: Right.

Commissioner Mena: And so, I'm -- that -- you know, that makes it difficult for me to understand your side of the issue because if it's mostly pleasant with -- and you have the trees and then you're telling -- you're in favor of obviously having bike paths here.

Mr. Garcia: Yeah, if you can save the trees in the process.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. Can we...

Commissioner Mena: Okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Can we call this a close, please, Commissioner?

Commissioner Mena: I still have...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Go ahead.

Commissioner Mena: Some questions but...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That's it?

Commissioner Keon: I think he has questions.

Commissioner Mena: I have some questions. I wanted to ask Ms. Pinera, actually, quickly, and then I have...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Go ahead.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Just so you know because we were also sort of perplexed as to this bike lane on Red Road, and we called FDOT and we asked, is it safe? And of course -- and I told City Manager Iglesias -- the response was we don't put bike paths in places that are not safe. So, they studied it and they put it in a safe place. That's my first point. My second point, I think you raised a very valid point. Why don't we know how many trees? It's been five years. This bike lane grant came across five years ago. Why don't we know? Why haven't there been any studies? And I think that's a big problem with this thing. There has not been any environmental, traffic or safety studies. Why? It's been five years.

Commissioner Mena: So, let me ask you a question.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Why?

Commissioner Mena: And it sort of dovetails with the other question I was going to ask you. You've made a lot of very fair, valid points about process. Why not evaluate that?

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Evaluate what?

Commissioner Mena: How many trees.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Because we know that the process was flawed. I actually agree with what...

Commissioner Mena: No, I'm asking now. Whatever we think about the prior process, I'm asking from now -- today...

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Because we shouldn't be here.

Commissioner Mena: Going forward.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: We should start fresh. You want to do that? I agree with what Vice Mayor said. Let's just -- and scrap the pro -- you know, let's pass this resolution and let's start from the beginning, since none of us participated in the 2014 master bicycle plan, let's redo it. Let's -- why don't you let us vote, the voters vote.

Commissioner Mena: I want to.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Which I think is a great idea.

Commissioner Mena: You don't want to have a vote on this issue, even of the Alhambra Circle residents.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: No, I do -- I respect the Mayor and his wisdom and I think we should vote on this resolution, and at this juncture, get the bike lanes out.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You can bring it next time.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: And I think -- but I think...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You know, start the process again.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: It's a great idea what Vice Mayor raised. I think there should be -- maybe you get a referendum. Maybe you're right and bring it up and let us, not the Dutch Embassy, not the Back Cycle, not Bike Walk. Let us, the voters, have a say in it and where we want bike paths.

Commissioner Mena: Here's what -- which is what I'm...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: But the voters...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Voters in Alhambra Circle, but also in Campo Sano and in Granada, and the rest of the city. Let's have the city vote.

Commissioner Mena: Well, but let's...

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: And do studies.

Commissioner Mena: But let's -- okay.

Vice Mayor Lago: I think what...

Commissioner Mena: I heard that suggestion from the Vice Mayor. If we have a citywide referendum on a bike plan and that ends up with a bike path on Alhambra, you're still not going to want a bike path on Alhambra, right?

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Well, but if that's what the referendum is the...

Commissioner Mena: No, no. I'm being honest.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: But then there's a process.

Vice Mayor Lago: But Commissioner...

Commissioner Mena: Right, right, right.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: There's a process.

Commissioner Mena: Fine, but let's say we had that process.

Vice Mayor Lago: Commissioner, what I was...

Commissioner Mena: What I'm saying is you should still have a say because you live on Alhambra.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Well, that's concurrency. I think there should be a hundred percent...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Concurrency. I don't think...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: There should be zero concurrency. I think it should be a hundred percent concurrency just like every other street in Coral Gables. I think that that's something I spoke with the City Manager on and there should be a hundred percent concurrency. Otherwise, it's not fair for the people who live on Alhambra Circle.

Vice Mayor Lago: Listen...

Commissioner Mena: So...

Vice Mayor Lago: Commissioner, to your point...

Commissioner Mena: Yeah.

Vice Mayor Lago: To your point...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Vice Mayor Lago: When you were talking...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let's finish up, please.

Commissioner Mena: Mayor...

Vice Mayor Lago: This is an important issue.

Commissioner Mena: Mayor, honestly, you're not going to rush us through this.

Vice Mayor Lago: This is important.

Commissioner Mena: We're going to have a real dialogue.

Vice Mayor Lago: We need to have a real discussion.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It's an important issue (INAUDIBLE).

Commissioner Mena: I know.

Vice Mayor Lago: But let's have a discussion here.

Commissioner Mena: We're having a real dialogue.

Vice Mayor Lago: Everybody here has taken time out of their day to be here on both sides, and I think we need to have a serious discussion about this. Look, when I was on the Planning and Zoning Board for the short time -- I don't want to say how long it was because that's been up for debate on previous occasion. I think it was about 18 or 19 months. One of the hot topic buttons that came up was the issue of should we allow trucks, pickup trucks in the City of Coral Gables. Our Planning and Zoning Board -- I know it sounds ridiculous now -- voted. I requested that we put it to a referendum, and the Commission -- I think it was a 3-2 vote -- the Commission obliged and they put it before the voters. I've actually had people to this moment today come up to me and tell me you supported pickup trucks. And my response was we put it to a referendum.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: I have a pickup truck. My husband...

Vice Mayor Lago: Put it to a refer...

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: I don't really like it.

Vice Mayor Lago: So I think...

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: I don't really like it, but I live with him.

Vice Mayor Lago: Listen...

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: And I've got to put up with it.

Vice Mayor Lago: So, the point is that I think the referendum is really an option. I mean, I know it doesn't go into obviously the Mayor's resolution today, but there are options. Study the trees

that will be impacted throughout the city in the proposed area of the existing master plan. Revamp the master plan, and then take it to a referendum because the answer's simple. When we take it to a referendum, we have hard evidence that states the community overall supports it or is against it.

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Do studies.

Vice Mayor Lago: And I -- again, but we have answers. Right now, what we're doing is we're doing piecemeal, which again, doesn't work in any front. We are not allowing certain areas of the city to implement bike paths and sidewalks, while other areas, we're getting as far as this today. Why just -- that to me is just not what I think is in the best interest of the community. I think that the entire Commission agrees with me on that fact.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Vice Mayor Lago: And I don't want to come back and have another discussion here on sidewalks, even though I've been very clear with everybody in this room that has talked to me about what we're debating today. I'm a big proponent of sidewalks, and it's -- I mean, it's...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We all are.

Vice Mayor Lago: Much needed, and we need to find ways. Case in point, what was implemented in front of my home on San Amaro with University of Miami. Where there's a curb, I know we may not be able to do a curb on Alhambra, and that may not be what the residents want, but there's got to be a way that we have to find a way that we don't obviously affect the trees, the canopy, and that we can deliver on certain parts of sidewalks that are necessary for people to be able to enjoy portions of the city that they currently access.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Can I...

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Do I sit down?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That -- I started my discussion...

Ms. Pinera Vazquez: Do I sit down or do you want me to stay here?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Wait, wait, wait.

Commissioner Mena: Whatever you'd like.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I started my discussion saying that one Commission cannot bind the future. We can make that part of next Commission's agenda, if you'd like. But let's focus on what's before us at this point. This does not foreclose discussions on master plans. This does not foreclose discussions on sidewalks. This is on this specific issue, on this specific...

Commissioner Mena: I'm going to be honest. I think that -- I think as it comes to bike paths that that's disingenuous. I'm sorry. You're...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: (UNINTELLIGIBLE).

Commissioner Mena: I already said I may vote in favor of it. I'm not -- but I'm being -- but I'm going to be honest with everybody in this room. You are pulling the plug on bike paths.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: On Alhambra Circle.

Commissioner Mena: No, altogether.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, I'm not.

Commissioner Mena: No, yes, you are because -- and here's what's going to happen. You're going to come back on the next site, whenever that is, and now you're not only going to point to Riviera, you're going to point to Riviera and Alhambra Circle.

Vice Mayor Lago: University.

Commissioner Mena: And each time you go through this exercise...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Right. So, that's what's going to happen. So, I just think doing a referendum -- and by the way, I think it would be unfair to these people if we do a referendum that leads to a bike path on their street in a master plan, and we do this circus all over again for no reason.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. But will you -- come on, come on.

Commissioner Mena: So, I think we should be honest about it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright, I'm being honest.

Commissioner Mena: So...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: This is my resolution.

Commissioner Mena: Yeah.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And I would like to hear a motion on this resolution. Are you going to move (UNINTELLIGIBLE).

Commissioner Fors: I'll move.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Vice Mayor Lago: I'll second it for discussion.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. It's been moved and seconded.

Vice Mayor Lago: Any other discussion?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We've had three hours of discussion.

Vice Mayor Lago: Anything else?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, we...

Vice Mayor Lago: I made it very clear we're going to -- it's going to continue moving forward. We're going to piecemeal every single project until we're ready to attack this...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Will you call the roll, please?

Vice Mayor Lago: Holistically with a referendum. I'm willing to do that and I'm willing to revamp. I want to put that on the record. I'm willing to revamp the entire master plan.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Vice Mayor Lago: If you're willing to do it.

Commissioner Mena: Okay. Listen, we'll...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Will you call the roll, please?

City Clerk Urquia: Vice Mayor Lago?

Commissioner Mena: We'll try it your way. But I'm just being honest that I think we're going to have -- this is going to be Groundhog Day and we're going to do this all over again.

Vice Mayor Lago: Give me one second, Commissioner.

Commissioner Mena: That's my concern.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Come on, please.

Vice Mayor Lago: No, no, but listen -- and I want -- Mayor, one second, okay. I agree with you 110 percent, but I just cannot look these residents in the face -- and I know that you...

Commissioner Mena: Agreed.

Vice Mayor Lago: Can't either...

Commissioner Mena: Agreed.

Vice Mayor Lago: And say, I'm going to allow the Riviera neighborhood, the neighbors, along with University to say no, and then I'm going to basically force you to have bike lanes and sidewalks. It's just a tough situation.

Commissioner Mena: Agreed.

Vice Mayor Lago: Even when I'm 100 percent in favor of the sidewalks, I just think it's a tough situation.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, and we're not talking about sidewalks.

Commissioner Mena: Oh, and I'm also -- and my other concern is I'm not going to -- my -- the difficulty I have with the poll of the residents is we don't know the impact on the trees. So...

Commissioner Keon: Well...

Commissioner Mena: You know...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Commissioner Keon: We do know. Excuse me.

Commissioner Mena: Yeah, go ahead.

Commissioner Keon: We do know that there's not 28 foot of right-of-way.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Keon: In a lot of that area.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Keon: And we know you need at least 25 -- I'm sorry, 28 feet of right-of-away.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Keon: And we know that's not there. So, I would direct staff that you cannot put bike lanes down unless they're (UNINTELLIGIBLE). You cannot create bike lanes where you don't have 28 feet of right-of-way.

City Manager Iglesias: I think...

Commissioner Keon: So, you know, if you want to just take that out, you know, please study other streets, but not 28 -- because we're not going to add additional asphalt or concrete or whatever to the roads. They are the existing roads and where we can put in bike paths in the existing infrastructure, we'll look at that. So, you know, rather than say, you know -- I mean, Alhambra is a very long street. Alhambra is -- Alhambra from, you know, the University of Miami, all the way to LeJeune Road, it's -- it goes South Alhambra; you go -- it goes through the downtown, from LeJeune all the way to Douglas. I mean, it's a huge road, so to say no bike paths on Alhambra, there's sections of Alhambra that may be perfectly suitable for a bike path.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Commissioner Keon: But the section that does not have enough right-of-way isn't appropriate for a bike path.

City Manager Iglesias: And I believe...

Vice Mayor Lago: There already...

City Manager Iglesias: I believe Commissioner...

Commissioner Keon: So...

Vice Mayor Lago: There already is bike...

Commissioner Keon: So, you know...

Vice Mayor Lago: There is bike paths already on Alhambra, as you...

Commissioner Keon: That's right.

City Manager Iglesias: To clarify...

Vice Mayor Lago: There already is.

City Manager Iglesias: To clarify Commissioner...

Commissioner Keon: So, you're not going to take them off.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: But Commissioner...

Commissioner Keon: You're not going to...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And nobody uses them.

Commissioner Keon: Take them off so...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, Billy, will you...

Commissioner Keon: I mean, I can't support...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Call the roll, please?

Commissioner Keon: Your resolution for that reason.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please. Billy, will you call the roll?

Commissioner Keon: I have another resolution.

Commissioner Mena: Go ahead. What's your other resolution?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please call the roll.

Commissioner Keon: I would not consider bike paths in any area that doesn't have at least a minimum of 28 feet right-of-way.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That's a different resolution.

Commissioner Keon: He asked me what my resolution would be.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Would be.

Commissioner Keon: I'm telling him...

City Manager Iglesias: And just to clarify, Commissioner...

Commissioner Keon: What it would be.

City Manager Iglesias: You mean 20 feet of pavement, not right-of-way.

Vice Mayor Lago: Yeah, 20 feet.

Commissioner Keon: I'm sorry, 28 feet of pavement.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Will you call the roll, please?

Commissioner Mena: So -- okay, go ahead.

Vice Mayor Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Yes.

Commissioner Fors: Yes.

Commissioner Keon: I don't -- I think it's...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You have to vote, please.

Commissioner Keon: I think it's crazy.

Vice Mayor Lago: Vote no.

Commissioner Keon: I really...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: What?

Commissioner Keon: I really think...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Vote.

Vice Mayor Lago: Vote no.

Commissioner Keon: You have put people in a position where, you know, you're...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, Commissioner...

Commissioner Keon: Damned if you or you're damned...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You have to vote.

Commissioner Keon: If you don't. Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

(Vote: 5-0)

Commissioner Keon: I think you're wrong.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

(APPLAUSE)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You wanted to take up...

Vice Mayor Lago: Now, I'd like to -- if I may, I'd like to...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We'll take up G-8.

Vice Mayor Lago: Yeah, before we move...

Commissioner Keon: That is not the answer.

Vice Mayor Lago: Before we move on to G-8, I'd like to...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Come on, folks.

Vice Mayor Lago: Listen, this is an issue that's going to keep on occurring as long as we embark on complete streets. So, I want to make sure that this Commission, we set up a sunshine meeting to have a discussion about this for any -- obviously, open to the public. We need to address this because this is already the third time this comes before this Commission.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And it was a very flawed process.

Vice Mayor Lago: Let's -- I want to make sure that we address this, that this gets dealt with in the Commission and we make a decision on how we're going to address this. I don't want to have this come before the Commission and have residents like this ever again, with like, you know, with this significant of a divide amongst the community that I think that if we, as the Commission, take a move to revamp the master plan -- Can you give me one second?

(COMMENTS MADE OF THE RECORD)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We'll take a break. This is not...

Vice Mayor Lago: One second.

Commissioner Keon: Take a break. Are you going to...

Vice Mayor Lago: I think you...

Commissioner Keon: (INAUDIBLE).

Vice Mayor Lago: Okay, so I would like to have a sunshine meeting, if my colleagues would support me on that.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

Vice Mayor Lago: And I think it's important to do this.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: But not here. We'll do it in...

Vice Mayor Lago: Obviously, but I need obviously support from my colleagues.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes. All right. Bring it up next time and we'll have a sunshine meeting and there's no problem with it, and it's a very good idea.

Commissioner Mena: I'm fine. I support whatever Vice Mayor Lago's approach is on that.

Vice Mayor Lago: Okay.

[Later...]

City Manager Iglesias: Mr. Mayor, we have Jessica Keller that would just like to clarify her position concerning the FOT grant. If we could allow her just a couple of minutes to...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Of course, welcome. Good morning.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Good afternoon. I'm Jessica Keller, Assistant Public Works Director for the City of Coral Gables. Today, there were a number of things that were mentioned, and I wanted to have the opportunity to speak about this because it impacts my professional integrity. And a lot of you had questions about the grant and I wanted to have the

opportunity to address those very specific questions. There are things that were said today -- and you did not get the complete picture of what was going on in this grant. I don't know if you had the opportunity to look at the grant, but I have it here. It's online, it's publicly available. What you kept hearing over and over again was that, under the cloak of darkness, I conspired with another resident and generated a letter of support which represented the community support of this particular project. I want to give you the full picture. I won't go through every single question that is on the grant application, but I'm going to start with number four, which was not brought to your attention in the diagrams earlier today. The question is, "Have any public awareness activities or community meetings been held, scheduled or planned?" The application says "yes." Next, it says, "If yes, please describe." The application answers, "This project is part of the Commission adopted Coral Gables Bicycle and Pedestrian Master Plan. The plan was presented at public meetings held on November 13, 2013, the Traffic Advisory Board, on May 20, 2014, and adopted at the Commission meeting on June 10, 2014." I was subsequently made aware that there was another meeting. I have to remind you, not all of you are aware, but I was not part of the development of the Pedestrian and Bicycle Master Plan, so I have to rely on information that's provided by people that were actually involved in the Pedestrian and Bicycle Master Plan. So, those were the public activities -- the awareness activities that were listed on the grant that were not brought to your attention today. Number five, "Is there public and/or private support for the project? For example, petitions, written endorsements, resolutions and letters of support. Please describe." What was attached is the Coral Gables Resolution 2014-123. It's the adoption of the master plan. The second thing that was attached to the grant was the letter of support from Bike Walk Coral Gables. You did not get all of the information today, and I needed to set the record straight.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Do you have any questions?

Commissioner Mena: Thank you.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Happy to answer them or we can end it.

Commissioner Mena: I'll just say thank you. And for what it's worth, I will say that my decision was not in any way based on that part of the discussion.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: I appreciate that.

Commissioner Mena: But I want -- but I appreciate you coming up here and addressing it. And I think it's the right thing to do professionally on your part. So...

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Good for you.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: I appreciate that. Because what was on record today were things -- there were false accusations and that affects any future employment that I may have where I am investigated and there's something on the record that says I falsified documents, that I've made misrepresentations, and I really needed to clear that up today.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No. We have no suspicion, any thought that you did something wrong.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: I appreciate that.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We really don't. And people on both sides of the issue, one will say one thing, one will say whatever justifies their position. My decision had nothing at all to do with their allegations. And I dedicated -- I don't know how long I spoke, 15 minutes. I dedicated 30 seconds to that part of the -- or less to that part of the meeting. The problem we have with bicycles and

things, I mean this is a perfect illustration of the NIMBY principle, not in my backyard. I mean everybody's for bicycles but not in my street. But they have to go in some street.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And you're in a very difficult position and they will make things up to make you look bad and to bolster their position, things that are not true.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: And I really do appreciate you saying that. And I also wanted to take a moment to thank you, Commissioner Keon, because you mentioned that staff was carrying out direction of the Commission.

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: And that is really important to me because, as you know, it's a personal issue and it has been largely targeted on me. And so, I appreciate you recognizing that.

Commissioner Keon: Thank you.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Commissioner Mena: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And thanks for your good work.