# HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD REGULAR MEETING <br> CITY COMMISSION CHAMBERS 405 BILTMORE WAY CORAL GABLES, FLORIDA <br> THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 15, 2018 4:00 P.M. 

PARTICIPANTS:
VENNY TORRE, Chairperson
ALEJANDRO SILVA, Board Member RAUL RODRIGUEZ, Board Member

ALBERT MENENDEZ, Board Member
ALICIA BACHE-WIIG, Board Member
BRUCE EHRENHAFT, Board Member
JOHN FULLERTON, Board Member
JANICE THOMPSON, Board Member
ROBERT PARSLEY, Board Member
DONA SPAIN, Historic Preservation Officer


|  | Page 3 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | registration shall prohibit your ability to |
| 2 | present to the Historic Preservation Board on |
| 3 | applications under consideration this afternoon. |
| 4 | A lobbyist is defined as an individual, |
| 5 | corporation, partnership, or other legal entity |
| 6 | employed or retained, whether paid or not, by a |
| 7 | principal who seeks to encourage the approval, |
| 8 | disapproval, adoption, repeal, passage, defeat, or |
| 9 | modification of any ordinance, resolution, action |
| 10 | or decision of any city commissioner, any action, |
| 11 | decision, recommendation of the city manager, any |
| 12 | city board or committee, including, but not |
| 13 | limited to, quasi-judicial, advisory board, trust, |
| 14 | authority, or council, or any action, decision or |
| 15 | recommendation of city personnel during the time |
| 16 | period of the entire decision-making process, and |
| 17 | the action, decision or recommendation which |
| 18 | foreseeably will be heard or reviewed by the City |
| 19 | Commission or a city board or committee, |
| 20 | including, but not limited to, quasi-judicial, |
| 21 | advisory board, trust, authority or council. |
| 22 | Presentations made to this Board are subject |
| 23 | to the city's False Claim Ordinance, Chapter 39 of |
| 24 | the City of Coral Gables City Code. |
| 25 | I will officially call the City of Coral |


|  | Page 4 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Gables Historic Preservation Board Meeting of |
| 2 | November 15th, 2018 to order. The time is 4:09 |
| 3 | p.m. |
| 4 | Present today, to my left, Janice Thompson, |
| 5 | Mr. Raul Rodriguez, Mr. Robert Parsley, Mr. |
| 6 | Alejandro Silva; to my right, Mr. Albert Menendez, |
| 7 | Mr. John Fullerton, Bruce Ehrenhaft, Ms. Alicia |
| 8 | Bache-Wiig. |
| 9 | The next item on the agenda is the approval |
| 10 | of the meeting minutes for the meeting held on |
| 11 | October 18th, 2018. |
| 12 | Are there any changes or corrections or those |
| 13 | meeting minutes? |
| 14 | If there are none, can I have a motion for |
| 15 | approval. |
| 16 | MS. THOMPSON: I move to approve the meeting |
| 17 | minutes from last meeting. |
| 18 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: Thank you. Is there a |
| 19 | second? |
| 20 | MR. EHRENHAFT: I second. |
| 21 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: There is a second. All |
| 22 | those in favor, please say aye. |
| 23 | (Ayes were heard.) |
| 24 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: Unanimous. Thank you. |
| 25 | The notice regarding ex parte communications |





|  | Page 8 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | the criteria in the code. Staff has determined |
| 2 | that the property at 1236 Asturia Avenue is |
| 3 | eligible as a historic landmark based on three |
| 4 | significance criteria: Historical cultural |
| 5 | significance; it exemplifies the historical |
| 6 | cultural, political, economic, or social trends of |
| 7 | the community. |
| 8 | Also, based on its architectural |
| 9 | significance, it portrays the environment in an |
| 10 | era of history characterized by one or more |
| 11 | distinctive architectural styles and embodies |
| 12 | those distinguishing characteristics of an |
| 13 | architectural, style, period, or method of |
| 14 | construction. |
| 15 | We also reviewed qualifications for Coral |
| 16 | Gables Cottage Classification. Just to remind |
| 17 | you, those are that the structure be one-story in |
| 18 | height; zoned a single family residence; be on one |
| 19 | of the smaller lots with the frontage no less than |
| 20 | -- no more than 65-feet; include family dwelling |
| 21 | built before 1940; and then, in the Code, there is |
| 22 | a list of 19 character defining features for a |
| 23 | cottage, and, to classify, it must have a minimum |
| 24 | of 12 of those. We determined that it is, and |
| 25 | I'll go through what those are, a little bit |


|  | Page 9 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | later. |
| 2 | The last piece of the qualification is that |
| 3 | it be designated as a historical landmark. So, if |
| 4 | you decide to designate it, tonight, then we will |
| 5 | be classifying it as a Coral Gables cottage. |
| 6 | So, what means is that the owner understands |
| 7 | that, then, moving forward, the structures all |
| 8 | must remain one-story, he has to maintain those 12 |
| 9 | character defined features that we have |
| 10 | identification, and then, he then qualifies for |
| 11 | the status of cottage, which means he can have a |
| 12 | little higher lot coverage, that helps keep |
| 13 | everything one- story on the property, and some |
| 14 | reductions in the setbacks. |
| 15 | So, this property was permitted in 1925. The |
| 16 | architect was Lee Wade. We have a number of |
| 17 | structures in Coral Gables built by him. He |
| 18 | started building an area predominantly in Miami |
| 19 | through his father's firm, which was the |
| 20 | construction firm AB Wade \& Sons. He started off |
| 21 | as the construction manager. Then, following a |
| 22 | newspaper article, you can see he became junior |
| 23 | designer, moved very quickly into becoming lead |
| 24 | designer, and then, by 1926, he became a member of |
| 25 | the American Institute of Architects. |




|  | Page 12 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | homes on the street, which is a little different |
| 2 | with how he developed other streets where they |
| 3 | tended to be all modest or all larger. This was |
| 4 | one of the streets where he had -- it was first |
| 5 | done. And the home at 1236 is actually one of the |
| 6 | earlier examples of when he recruited someone to |
| 7 | do this on these streets. |
| 8 | So, after 1930, we don't see much development |
| 9 | on this street. You can see, in 1948, it's pretty |
| 10 | much what we saw up to 1930. And then, as was |
| 11 | typical in the city, the street was built out in |
| 12 | the 1950s. |
| 13 | It was predominantly designed with single- |
| 14 | family homes and have retained that context to |
| 15 | today. |
| 16 | Now, as I said, the original owner, Frederick |
| 17 | Prax, was recruited by Merrick as a real estate |
| 18 | investor. We see, up until 1930, that property |
| 19 | has a different occupant every year, according to |
| 20 | city directories, showing that it was an |
| 21 | investment property for him. |
| 22 | Then, in 1930, Clifford and Phoebe Clark |
| 23 | purchased the property and they keep the home for |
| 24 | 47 years, in their family. It eventually passes |
| 25 | down to their grandson, and then their son. |



Page 14
technology. He, evidently, was quite the speaker around Coral Gables in the '60s.

So, as we said, we looked at the property as classifying it as a Coral Gables cottage. These are the 12 character defining features that the home holds. It has a stucco finish; a combination of roof types; a front porch; projecting bay on the front elevation; masonry arches on the front elevation; predominant chimney; a detached garage at the rear of the property; similar decorative features, in this case the parapet that is on the garage in accordance with what is also going on in the main house; barrel tile roof; varied height between projecting and recessed portions of the front elevation; first floor above crawl space; and sash windows.

You have the initial building permit at the back of your designation report. The microfilm is not too clear, but it is clear enough that we can see that, initially, they were sash windows. You can see that, also, in the historic photo. And there is enough of that permit visible that we can see that what is on the property today is very much what was built.

So, as we walk around the property here, you

|  | Page 15 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | can see that the stucco texture is pretty rough. |
| 2 | You can see that projecting chimney, variety of |
| 3 | roofs, flat (inaudible) shed, see the arched |
| 4 | windows. The tile on that front entry stoop and |
| 5 | the front stairs is original to the home. |
| 6 | Moving around to the side, you can see the |
| 7 | back. That front porch where the arch is, that |
| 8 | was a screened front porch. That was enclosed at |
| 9 | a date that we don't know. Here, you have got |
| 10 | another view of the side of that porch that was |
| 11 | enclosed, and you can see that shed, sort of |
| 12 | (inaudible) shed roof coming off the front of the |
| 13 | front porch. |
| 14 | The windows were replaced in 2003 with impact |
| 15 | resistant, maintaining the same openings and same |
| 16 | style of the sashes. |
| 17 | Moving around, looking, now, towards the |
| 18 | front of the property, this rear portion was |
| 19 | initially a sleeping porch that was enclosed. You |
| 20 | can see it is glass block on the side and the |
| 21 | single-hung windows on the rear. Maintaining, |
| 22 | again, the original openings from that porch. |
| 23 | This is a view of the rear elevation. Then, |
| 24 | stepping back, again, the original tile, there, on |
| 25 | the steps. And then, looking back the other side. |



|  | Page 17 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | the other structures that shaped the new city in |
| 2 | the early '20s. |
| 3 | This home, with its original detached garage |
| 4 | and its larger intact cottage, retains a high |
| 5 | degree of historic integrity. Thus, the property |
| 6 | at 1236 Asturia Avenue significantly contributes |
| 7 | to the historic fabric of the City of Coral |
| 8 | Gables, and the staff is recommending approval. |
| 9 | The owner is in the audience tonight if you |
| 10 | have any questions. |
| 11 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: Would you like to speak? |
| 12 | You don't have to if you don't want to. |
| 13 | MR. JUAN RODRIGUEZ: No, no, I'm sorry. |
| 14 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: Okay. If there are no |
| 15 | further questions from staff or from the public |
| 16 | hearing? Okay. Commentary is closed. |
| 17 | Discussion? |
| 18 | MR. RODRIGUEZ: I make a motion. |
| 19 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: You're making a motion? |
| 20 | MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes. |
| 21 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: I love it. |
| 22 | MR. RODRIGUEZ: Motion for designation. |
| 23 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: There is a motion for |
| 24 | approval of the designation. Is there a second? |
| 25 | MR. FULLERTON: I'll second the motion. |




|  | Page 20 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | meetings, we should give them their plaque. So, I |
| 2 | think we should unwrap one of the plaques, just |
| 3 | have it to show, and then give them a package, |
| 4 | because I just undid the whole thing. |
| 5 | So, we have, also (inaudible) home. |
| 6 | Congratulations. |
| 7 | MR. JUAN RODRIGUEZ: Thank you very much. |
| 8 | MS. GUIN: Thank you very much. |
| 9 | So, moving on to consider the certificate of |
| 10 | appropriateness, the proposal has to do only with |
| 11 | the garage structure. There is no work being |
| 12 | proposed on the home. |
| 13 | You can see the garage at the southwest back |
| 14 | corner, the proposal is essentially to demolish |
| 15 | that front north faキade, move it forward five |
| 16 | feet, and then to raise the overall height of the |
| 17 | structure two feet-two inches. |
| 18 | There are no variances requested with this |
| 19 | application. The application was approved by the |
| 20 | Board of Architects in August, and the only |
| 21 | comment that the board had is that they wanted our |
| 22 | department to approve the garage doors that were |
| 23 | to go in here, either by you all or by staff. |
| 24 | And that, the garage door that was chosen was |
| 25 | laid on the dais this morning, so you can see the |




CHAIRPERSON TORRE: Thank you.
MS. GUIN: We have a few conditions. We can talk about those now, or? Okay.

So, we wanted to put on the record that allowing the front wall to come down, but the side walls must remain up and intact.

We talked about how to handle the stucco, differentiating the new from the old, and this is, you know, a little more difficult since we're raising (inaudible) the parapet. So, what we agreed on is that they would look to match the stucco but not exactly, so that, looking at it from a distance, you may not see the difference, but, a little bit closer up, you would.

So, instead of doing lines and reveals or, you know, none of that sort of made sense here. So, just enough of a differentiation in the stucco that, up close, you would be able to tell.

The window on the west side is proposed as a horizontal roller, which we, as a rule, they are not appropriate in 1920s structures. We are asking that it be double-casement because it appears that is what it was originally. However, it is very close on the setback and the windows in the home are single- hung. So, actually, we would



|  | Page 26 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | it happening presently, in the near future, when |
| 2 | we put the new one in. The rest is just cement. |
| 3 | MS. THOMPSON: Yeah. |
| 4 | MR. JUAN RODRIGUEZ: The only thing we're |
| 5 | going to do around the cement or the concrete, |
| 6 | we're going to make it larger. That is going to |
| 7 | be like a tie-beam which you just pour cement on |
| 8 | the top, which, if anything, we might pour some |
| 9 | cement down some of the -- the cement -- what do |
| 10 | you call it? The block? |
| 11 | MS. THOMPSON: The block. |
| 12 | MR. JUAN RODRIGUEZ: That will make it |
| 13 | stronger and able to hold the walls, or the roof, |
| 14 | the new roof. The new roof is going to be there, |
| 15 | as well. |
| 16 | MS. THOMPSON: Thank you. |
| 17 | MR. FULLERTON: Some of the little houses |
| 18 | were built with weak cement. |
| 19 | MS. THOMPSON: Yeah. |
| 20 | MR. FULLERTON: And so, the steel inside has |
| 21 | rusted and -- |
| 22 | MS. THOMPSON: Right. My grandfather has |
| 23 | told me about that, because they owned a house |
| 24 | back in 1927 or something like that. |
| 25 | MS. GUIN: The other thing that we talked |



|  | Page 28 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | MS. GUIN: No. That is not our purview. |
| 2 | MR. EHRENHAFT: Right. I just wanted to -- |
| 3 | MS. GUIN: As long as it, the structure |
| 4 | remains standing and intact, he can do what he |
| 5 | likes. |
| 6 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: Okay. If there is |
| 7 | nothing else, we will close the public hearing. |
| 8 | Thank you, sir. Any discussion? |
| 9 | MR. SILVA: I'll move for approval on staff |
| 10 | conditions. |
| 11 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: There has been a motion |
| 12 | from Mr. Silva. Is there a second? |
| 13 | MS. THOMPSON: What was the motion? |
| 14 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: For approval. |
| 15 | MR. SILVA: With staff conditions. |
| 16 | MR. MENENDEZ: Second. |
| 17 | MS. GUIN: And that means this garage door? |
| 18 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: It says staff full review |
| 19 | and approval. That is the way it is written, |
| 20 | right? |
| 21 | MS. GUIN: Okay. |
| 22 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: We have a motion, and we |
| 23 | have a second from Mr. Menendez. Any further |
| 24 | discussion? Roll call? |
| 25 | MS. DIAZ: Mr. Rodriguez? |


|  | Page 29 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes. |
| 2 | MS. DIAZ: Mr. Menendez? |
| 3 | MR. MENENDEZ: Yes. |
| 4 | MS. DIAZ: Ms. Thompson? |
| 5 | MS. THOMPSON: Yes. |
| 6 | MS. DIAZ: Mr. Fullerton? |
| 7 | MR. FULLERTON: Yes. |
| 8 | MS. DIAZ: Ms. Bache-Wiig? |
| 9 | MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes. |
| 10 | MS. DIAZ: Mr. Parsley? |
| 11 | MR. PARSLEY: Yes. |
| 12 | MS. DIAZ: Mr. Silva? |
| 13 | MR. SILVA: Yes. |
| 14 | MS. DIAZ: Mr. Ehrenhaft? |
| 15 | MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes. |
| 16 | MS. DIAZ: Mr. Torre? |
| 17 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: Yes. |
| 18 | MR. JUAN RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. |
| 19 | MS. BACHE-WIIG: And what timeliness. This |
| 20 | may have been the fastest meeting we have had |
| 21 | here. |
| 22 | So, I have a few announcements. Just for |
| 23 | your information, there are a bunch of events |
| 24 | coming up for the holiday season. |
| 25 | On November 28th at 5:30 p.m. on the Giralda |


|  | Page 30 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Plaza, there is the dedication of the art there, |
| 2 | Sibylle Pasche, that is being installed very soon. |
| 3 | So, November 28th, we are dedicating. (Inaudible) |
| 4 | Historic Preservation, it's also called |
| 5 | (inaudible) Art in Public Places. |
| 6 | On November 30th, there is a Midsummer |
| 7 | Night's Dream dedication at the Plaza. That is |
| 8 | also at 5:30. |
| 9 | On December 9th, there is the Merrick House |
| 10 | Holiday Open. That is a Sunday, from 1:00 to |
| 11 | 4:00. |
| 12 | And just be on the lookout for the Art Basel |
| 13 | installation that we are doing, Hank Willis |
| 14 | Thomas. There will be speech bubbles along |
| 15 | Miracle Mile on four benches, throughout the city, |
| 16 | and the installation title is, "The Truth is I |
| 17 | Welcome You." So, that's the exciting. That's |
| 18 | all I have. |
| 19 | MS. THOMPSON: I have a question? |
| 20 | MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes? |
| 21 | MS. THOMPSON: This has to do with our |
| 22 | beautiful flowers. When are they getting mist? I |
| 23 | never -- I live right outside, right there, and I |
| 24 | never see -- |
| 25 | MS. BACHE-WIIG: I know. |




|  | Page 33 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | meeting. |
| 2 | CHAIRPERSON TORRE: And we have a second. |
| 3 | All those in favor? |
| 4 | (Ayes were heard.) |
| 5 | MS. BACHE-WIIG: Have a wonderful |
| 6 | Thanksgiving. |
| 7 | (Thereupon, the proceedings were concluded at |
| 8 | 4:43 p.m.) |
| 9 |  |
| 10 |  |
| 11 |  |
| 12 |  |
| 13 |  |
| 14 |  |
| 15 |  |
| 16 |  |
| 17 |  |
| 18 |  |
| 19 |  |
| 20 |  |
| 21 |  |
| 22 |  |
| 23 |  |
| 24 |  |
| 25 |  |


|  | Page 34 |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1 | CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER |
| 2 |  |
| 3 | STATE OF FLORIDA |
| 4 | COUNTY OF MIAMI-DADE |
| 5 |  |
| 6 | I, Rufo Lyons, Reporter, certify that I was |
| 7 | authorized to and did report the foregoing |
| 8 | proceedings, and that the transcript is a true and |
| 9 | correct record of my notes. |
| 10 | I further certify that I am not a relative, |
| 11 | employee, attorney, or counsel of any of the |
| 12 | parties, nor am I a relative or employee of any of |
| 13 | the parties' attorneys or counsel connected with |
| 14 | the action, nor am I financially interested in the |
| 15 | action. |
| 16 | Dated this 30th day of November 2018. |
| 17 |  |
| 18 |  |
| 19 |  |
| 20 |  |
| 21 ( |  |
| 22 |  |
| 23 |  |
| 24 |  |
| 25 |  |

