City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting Agenda Item J-6 **November 13, 2018 City Commission Chambers** 405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

City Commission

Mayor Raul Valdes-Fauli Vice Mayor Vince Lago **Commissioner Pat Keon Commissioner Michael Mena Commissioner Frank Quesada**

City Staff

City Manager, Peter Iglesias City Attorney, Miriam Ramos City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia Assistant Public Works Director, Jessica Keller **Public Works, Mark Brown Procurement Officer, Celeste Walker**

Public Speaker(s)

Brian Noe, Representing Spin Scooters Jose Felix Diaz, Representing Bird Scooters

Agenda Item J-6 [2:22:11 p.m.]

Discussion regarding next steps for scooters in Coral Gables

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Good afternoon Commission, I'm Jessica Keller, Assistant Public Works Director and we have Mark Brown, he's going to give a short presentation on what our experience has been with the scooters, their operation in the City.

Mr. Brown: Thank you. Mark Brown with Public Works and while we are waiting for the PowerPoint to come up. This is a brief update on our dockless mobility program. I'll talk briefly about Spin and Bird and give you better data on how they've been doing. So, beginning with Spin, they have 90 scooters jointly deployed in Coral Gables, 99 bikes currently deployed. They've had about 11,500 scooter trips total and 2,200 bike trips total since they've began here in Coral Gables, with an average bike ride of about 1.2 miles and the average scooter ride of City Commission Meeting

about point nine miles. Bird – they are relatively newer. They currently have 24 scooters deployed. I believe they have about 42 about a month ago; they've dropped that number down quite a bit; 2,800 total rides and average ride of 1.3 miles. Let me preference this saying, the figures this year, they assume that all scooter trips would have been taken by automobile. Admittedly, that's a very big assumption, make it of what you will, but making that assumption other vehicle trips travel diverted about 14,000 overall. The vehicle trips diverted to bikes and scooters about 15,000 and about seven metric tons of carbon dioxide prevented, because of our dockless mobility program. A couple of issues we've had overall. We did have one complaint about scooters being parked on private property in the Colonnade on Aragon Avenue and I'll show you a photo of that in a minute. I had one complaint about scooters outside of a home. We resolved that. I contacted the vendor and they relocated the scooter. I've had several instances of a scooter blocking the full length of a sidewalk. It is in our MOU that we will allow ADA compliance wherever the scooters are parked. I contacted the vendor about that and they relocated that scooter. We've had one reported occurrence of a scooter parked mid-block on Miracle Mile, again, in violation of our MOU. We contacted the vendor and it was relocated in a timely manner. And we have one reported collision; a woman riding a scooted collided into a parked car. She had minor injuries, I thought she went to the ER and minor damage to the vehicle. And here at 10 Aragon, I have the device being parked on private property. Looking at fan mail and negative feedback, we've gotten Chamber of Commerce, they've really had no strong opinions either way, but they are supportive of additional mobility options. I spoke to the Miracle Mile Business Improvement District. Again, they are not very pro or con yet, but they do plan to do a survey of the owners on the Miracle Mile to see how they are reacting to the bikes and scooters.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: I did want to add that one of the points that the B.I.D. made was, while they haven't gotten their survey back, overall they are supportive of additional mobility options in the City of Coral Gables to help reduce congestion, but they also are not necessarily supportive of only having scooters on sidewalks mixing with pedestrians.

Mr. Brown: We haven't gotten a lot of feedback from the public either pro or con. Overall the vendors have been cooperative when I've called or e-mailed them to have them relocate a device. They've done it in a pretty timely manner. Looking at where people are picking the devices up and where they are taking them to. With Spin, they are mainly beginning and ending in the downtown area. The ridership doubled between August and October. The Bird is more popular around the UM campus and the Metro Station and Bird ridership has been relatively flat, but they are relatively newer. Looking at a couple heat maps. Spin ridership where people are travelling to and from. Again, namely around the Miracle Mile and the downtown area and Coral Way. Where people are picking up the devices. Again, mainly around the Miracle Mile, downtown. Looking at Bird, where people are picking up the devices, a bit different from Spin, they are

picking them up mainly around UM, a bit near the Douglas Metro, so more scattered than Spin overall. And where people are taking them too. Again, UM being very popular with Bird.

Commissioner Quesada: University of Miami hasn't formerly adopted scooters yet, have they?

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: No, they have not. They did provide us some feedback just yesterday or Friday.

Commissioner Quesada: Anything helpful or...

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: They were critical of one of the vendors.

Commissioner Quesada: OK. For what reason?

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: That they did not feel that they were as proactive as the other vendor. They didn't check with them first before deploying scooters.

Commissioner Quesada: Did they have the same line of communication with that vendor?

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Based on – I did not speak directly to the representative at UM. They forwarded a letter and a memo that I can circulate to you.

Commissioner Quesada: OK. I just want to make sure – I think my experience so far, tell me if I'm wrong, both vendors have been great, is that accurate?

Mr. Brown: I would say they've been definitely responsive to any issue we've had.

Commissioner Quesada: OK. So is UM going to continue to wait before they bring in...

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: They haven't provided information about that.

Mr. Brown: Looking at Bird ridership by week – oh sorry.

Commissioner Quesada: I'm sorry, someone wanted to speak. I told them when you guys are done.

Mr. Brown: Bird ridership has been relatively flat as you can see from the graph.

Commissioner Mena: But they've been operating for 30 days though, right?

Mr. Brown: Right. And then here we have Spin. You can see the scooter ridership doubling in about a two-month period.

Commissioner Quesada: Its surprising to me. I feel like I see less scooters moving around. I thought maybe the novelty of something new, people trying it out, but people are continuing to use it. I'm surprised by the numbers which is great.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Yes. I'm sure they'll be able to explain why we are seeing this trend.

Commissioner Quesada: OK.

Mr. Brown: They go into more detail about this. So, recommendations – we recommend we move forward with the RFP. Dockless mobility does support our sustainability goals, so we are all for it. We recommend creating dockless parking areas around Miracle Mile to alleviate pressure on the sidewalks. Right now I'm working with Kevin Kinney in identifying areas where we may be able to park the dockless devices without affecting parking, we're looking at...

Commissioner Quesada: You are just saying for where they get dropped off in the mornings.

Mr. Brown: Where they get dropped off in the mornings.

Commissioner Quesada: It's the deployment area in the morning, not that individuals have to leave at an exact spot throughout the day.

Mr. Brown: Correct. We recommend working with Florida State Legislature to allow scooters on roadways, and as well as slow lanes; slow lanes is another term for bike lanes because really, bike lanes is an ideal place to ride a scooter, better alternative than running on the sidewalk, better than running in traffic. So if we are looking at a bike lane network, we are also accommodating other mobility options, so we think slow lanes is...

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Yes, because it captures all modes of transportation.

Mr. Brown: And finally, a sample of a parking area in Minneapolis did on one of their parking lots. Maybe we can do something like that...with one parking space, it could fit between five and eight dockless devices, so that could be one opportunity. Thank you.

Commissioner Quesada: Mr. Mayor, if it's OK with you, if we have representatives from both, I don't know if they want to speak, each one of those vendors. What I do want to know is, I guess

the uptick, see Bird and Spin it's a little bit different. Is there somebody here from Bird, is that you?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Do you have a representative Servando Esparza from Bird.

City Attorney Ramos: We had told each provider they would have an opportunity to address the Commission.

Commissioner Quesada: If there are additional points you want to add please, now is your opportunity, if not.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes sir – Servando Esparza.

Mr. Esparza: There is a PowerPoint that we provided, but if that's not available.

City Attorney Ramos: It should be.

Vice Mayor Lago: Give it a moment.

Mr. Noe: Mayor Valdes-Fauli, members of the Commission, thanks for having me again, I'm Brian Noe, Head of Public Policy at Spin. So just give you a quick update, but also here to answer any and all questions. Pretty much over the past three months, we are happy to report that we've seen the community really embrace Spin scooters and we are really sort of feeling excited about that. The number of rides actually is over 14,500 as of yesterday, so we are seeing pretty steady growth. That's also because, as you know, we did a very slow gradual phased increase of our...and we've been at about 80 to 90 scooters every day for the past, I would say month or so, and I think that's definitely been contributing to more and more people being accustomed to it and more and more people trying it out. And I think, just to go back to the other slide, we've been working really hard to continue to collaborate with City staff on ways to make adjustments, to be responsive to any sort of complaints or issues that may arise. We've obviously gotten location requests and complaints, luckily – especially as a proportion of the number of rides and users, we are pretty pleased that we've been trying to minimize and make sure that does not negatively impact the community in any way; and that the community members here in Gables really see our scooters as a value-add and a positive thing for the community in terms of mobility. Another thing that we worked very closely with the City Manager was outfitting our kickstands with rubber sleeves to make sure that they protect the sidewalks. So, that was one neat thing that we actually hadn't done before in any other cities. So, we are happy to come up with the little solution to that. And we've already kind of gone through this; one thing I just want to give you a quick update on is, it was recently announced that we are now part of the Ford family and just to provide, answer any questions about that, what all that means is really not much, in terms of what our relationship is with the City and hopefully the City doesn't view our relationship any differently. We are a whole independent subsidiary of Ford Smart Mobility and we are actually excited. I think what this means for us is that Ford has seen our, sort of partnership first approach and they really want to invest in a company that will make sure that scooters are a long term sustainable business model, instead of being solely just a VC – kind of rat race so-to-speak. And so, we are really excited to work with Ford. I'm going to be investing and working with us, obviously very closely and one thing, for instance, that we are excited about is, we get to work with one of the biggest manufacturers in America to continue to iterate and improve our products going forward. That's basically my brief update. I think it's been very clear that to see his leadership invest in the state hasn't gone unnoticed, whether its Tampa or Miami, a lot of these various jurisdictions is taking cues from the City and I think it's to the City's credit and leadership that they are doing that.

Commissioner Quesada: So, you are saying we are between 80 and 90 scooters now? What do you think our highest number volume of scooters is going to be in the City? Where do you think it's going to end?

Mr. Noe: Its always an imperfect answer. I was actually just talking to our operations manager.

Commissioner Quesada: I'm not holding you to it, your best guess.

Mr. Noe: Here right now is just based on the numbers that we are seeing and based on what the City obviously, besides being a UM alum, he actually thinks maybe around 200 overall might be the saturation point for the City, but its...that's our initial working assumption at the moment.

Commissioner Quesada: OK. I'm assuming also we have not gone into the southern part of the Gables.

Vice Mayor Lago: Bird has.

Commissioner Quesada: Bird has. If you're done, we'll ask them. Thank you so much.

Vice Mayor Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Mr. Diaz: Jose Felix Diaz on behalf of Bird Scooters. It was very clear to us, abundantly clear that because Spin had started earlier and they had spent most of their efforts focusing on the downtown Coral Gables corridor, and the Vice Chairman had suggested maybe even segregating the sectors, one of the first things that we did is on October 8th, the week that we launched, we

met with the University of Miami, we met with their External Affairs Department, we met with their General Counsel, we met with their Transportation Department and we kind of given a general lay of the land of how these scooters work on campuses. On October 23rd they released a memo that they submitted to us based on proposed language we gave them as to how they should govern parking regulations, towing of these vehicles and we have been complying with that memorandum. The memorandum says that we cannot initiate the rides on campus or we cannot have hubs, we call them nests on campus. So instead, if a student rides the scooter on campus, we get a call or sometimes the school calls us and we pick it up or the student takes it off campus. But the machines do not turn on, on campus as in the original ride. So, that's why you see that footprint larger in the southern part of the Gables. We were really not trying to replicate what Spin was doing and something that we abide by and Servando who's here from Bird is going to go over is, we generally try to find the saturation point in a community and we don't want to have scooters in a community if they are not being ridden at least three times a day. So, that's why our numbers have been artificially suppressed. We are in a new part of the City, have only been there for just about 30 days. So, that's answering your question and I'll let Servando give you a higher level.

Commissioner Quesada: Let me understand something. The University of Miami doesn't want to house any scooters on campus.

Mr. Diaz: Not yet. They want the student leadership to embrace it first and so we are working with student council. I'm going through that process, because they are the ones that initiated the e-bikes and there is a whole process that we need to go through.

Vice Mayor Lago: Let me ask you a question in regards to that.

Commissioner Quesada: They have e-bikes on campus?

Vice Mayor Lago: That's what I wanted to ask you. Why are they – and it works.

Commissioner Quesada: It would just make sense that they would want them more than anybody else.

Vice Mayor Lago: Yes. I don't understand why – was there an issue of some sort?- was there a problem?

Mr. Diaz: They had started a conversation with a third company, which is neither Spin nor Bird and you guys live this, so I'm not going to go over the history of what was said or not said, but they had negotiated something and then they were trying to introduce e-scooters, but since that company wasn't picked it kind of got complicated. So now there's a new process in place,

because this was a pilot and they didn't know what you were going to do today. They wanted to see what the City was going to do. If you are going to extend it, if you are going to have a new procurement, they want to cooperate with you and I've been in constant communication with Sarah Artecona who is the V.P. of External Affairs, to keep here in touch.

Mr. Noe: Just a point of clarification. We had a meeting with UM's Transportation and Parking Department in August, where we introduced ourselves and we talked about the campus' concerns and considerations when it comes to our scooters. We've agreed to have open lines of communication. They said at the time and remains the case that they understand that some students will probably bring a Spin scooter onto campus, but we are not supposed to deploy and we obviously have been doing that very well.

Mr. Diaz: And, another concern for the university and was a concern for this Commission also, so we've been proactive is, South Miami, what happens with South Miami. So, one of our principals have already met with the Mayor of South Miami and they are coming up with their own internal machinations of how they'll handle.

Commissioner Quesada: Have there been any issues at all with scooters going into South Miami?

Mr. Diaz: No, not to the best of our knowledge.

Commissioner Quesada: Just because most people don't realize that that's both South Miami and Coral Gables.

Mr. Diaz: Your staff has been very vigilant and they've encouraged us not to nest by U.S.-1, so we are nesting north of U.S.-1 so as to not create issues.

Commissioner Quesada: But it can happen though. It's still right there.

Mr. Diaz: Yes, it's going to happen, but there's a big difference from where you nest and where the end and you create patterns where you nest. We also are having conversations with the County, we've been working with the County to see if we can set shop at some of the Metro locations. The University of Miami actually suggested the University Metro Station is a good sample place, where not only can you dock them, but you could probably even charge them there, but that's obviously the County that has a part in that as well. So we are continuing those conversations, but it's a lot that's been going on in 30 days and I do want Servando to give you a higher level of review of how it's been for us at Bird.

Mr. Esparza: And, if that doesn't come up then I can just kind of go through some of the metrics. A little bit about it is just an introduction of the company itself. We have individuals that staff here has interacted with, dealing with legal, dealing with people that provide data...who does our community engagement in the region; and wanted to just provide a little bit of background that Bird was the first dockless scooter company that was solely dockless. A lot of what we are seeing in the market in the industry is either companies that will bike share have introduced either e-bikes or scooters into their fleets or have focused their business model on that. We've seen ride share companies that have been focused on ride share, getting into the scooter game. We've seen now Ford getting into it, so we've seen a lot of exploration. The reason why is because it's so popular, it's something that's affordable for a lot of people and its green. If it replaces a car ride it is green. So one of the things is, is that we've expanded to almost 100 cities worldwide and some of the metrics on being green, you can see there, but I'm just going to move through on the metrics here so that you can go through is, number one talks a little bit about safety. One of the things that Bird does is, we give out free helmets – this is our photo of one of the events we've done. Also anyone that's a Bird user can go into the app and order their own helmet. All you have to do is go through the app, follow the instructions on safety and I only ask for is \$1.99 for shipping and you'll get a scooter, depending on whatever size. Whatever the deal is of course we are sharing data with the City. As was already mentioned, we've been operating for at least a month; our rides are 2.8 per Bird and an average ride is about 1.3 miles. To go through a little bit about what Jose was talking about is, in a lot of other markets what they've done is, they want to see a specific number, say we are just going to have 250. What they'll do is, they'll build into an agreement, what they call utilization rate to say, if you have three rides per scooter per day on average for either week or a month, then it sort of tells you, yes, you can grow slowly and working with either the City Manager or the Counsel, whomever, you can grow; and they'll say you can add 50 or 100, but if you ever get into a situation where you are under three, either you have to stop goal, or if you get under one you have to take out some scooters from the fleet. So, that kind of allows you to have the flexibility based on actual usage. So, you get to that magic number that you were talking about. Again, with safety, we want to encourage folks that checking for I.D., driver's license I.D.'s is important to ensure that folks know the rules of the road, picking up scooters by 9 p.m. to ensure that there is no riding in the dark there; and then again, providing helmets and capping the speed for 15 miles per hour. As more companies get into the industry, we want to make sure that there is sort of some safety standards put in place. I'm also informing users about how to use it properly and these are sort of some of the rules. Again, doing what we can to be as responsive to any issues. One of the things that's being rolled out on the Bird app itself is to report, hey someone parked this scooter in the wrong place or this is not where it's supposed to be, that can get to us a lot faster than what some other issues where they've gone to, someone will call 311 for another type of service, then they'll try to find the right person and so this will get the direct report to us in a timely manner. One of the things that I wanted to mention is just the fact that there are other cities around you, thank you guys for taking the lead on introducing e-scooters into a city in Florida. Now we've seen Ft. Lauderdale has introduced its program, Tampa is starting its program in January. We are waiting for the City of Miami to introduce its permit application after passing the Bird ordinance.

So we are seeing a lot of different growth, both on the industry side, a lot of changes, different companies; and then we are seeing a lot of different growth within cities of Miami in terms of should it be allowed on the sidewalks. We have cities all over the U.S. that do different rules. So, I encourage you guys, the Council, the Commission, sorry, if you continue the pilot program, I think it's worth learning a lot more about what happens in other cities and how this could best serve Coral Gables.

Commissioner Quesada: Thank you for the time. Thank you for the information. Mr. Mayor, I think both these companies have been great pilot partners so far. Pretty impressive the whole level of compliance — we had what?- four complaints or three. So I think we've done, I think staff has done a great job making it happen, so thank you. I know it hasn't been easy. I want to move to something more permanent, I just don't want to do it just yet, just because, I think it's got to be in line with the University of Miami. I think that's very important, because if they get one company and we do something else, I think it creates a mess for everyone. So what I would like to do is and I'm looking at you, Jessica Keller, to guide us here. I think I want to extend the pilot for both exactly the same until we get real detailed feedback from the University of Miami, so that we are in lock-step with them. Ideally, I'd like to move forward with these two permanent fulltime. I don't know if Procurement, that creates issues for us or not. I don't know.

City Attorney Ramos: Commissioner, I do know that some other companies have expressed interest, so if we are going to go to something permanent, I would suggest that we go through the procurement process and allow...to complete.

Commissioner Quesada: I don't want to...yet then. We need to be on the same page with UM. Does that make sense to you?

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Yes. I would like to see us extend the pilot to keep scooters on the street and accessible to our residents until we get to that point where we would go through an RFP process. We also want to make a couple of changes to the regulations that put in place in the existing MOU, particularly as it relates to the time of day which can be operated. Right now 9 o'clock is dark. We don't want the scooters on the streets after dark and that's something we would have to address if we extend the pilot program.

Commissioner Quesada: Have we had issues though?

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: No.

City Attorney Ramos: But the time just changed, like a week ago.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Yes.

City Commission Meeting

Commissioner Quesada: You know what happened – I wanted to use one coming out of City Hall and it was like 7 o'clock and they were gone already, and I said, it would be nice if the scooter was here right now. I'm OK with leaving it out to existing time, unless you see a major issue. And, I think most big municipalities throughout the country do that, that they pick them up late at night, specifically it's Spin and Bird. Throughout the country it's the normal trend to take it out.

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: I've been in different states and I have personally ridden them at night in other states...but in other states across the country, yes.

Commissioner Quesada: I would like to keep it to the same time, unless anyone has an objection for that. To be used in the pilot another 30 or 60 days, but in the meantime to make sure we have a goal to start drafting what the RFP would be and at the same time have an aggressive, not aggressive, but let's meet with Sarah at the University of Miami, speak with whoever we need to meet with, so we are lined up; and also, what we were just saying about the Metro Stations makes a lot of sense as well, with the County as well.

City Manager Iglesias: Commissioner, I think they want to partner with what we are doing, and so I think they will be successful.

Commissioner Quesada: OK. By that time so that it's confirmed, so that we are all on the same page.

Vice Mayor Lago: Do you want to extend 30 or 60 days?

Commissioner Quesada: Whatever staff recommends.

City Attorney Ramos: I recommend 60 to 90, we have the holidays coming up, I don't think anything is going to get done.

Vice Mayor Lago: I'm fine with 90 days.

City Manager Iglesias: I think for procurement; I think 90 days would be good.

Commissioner Quesada: 90 days extending the pilot – so moved.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You made a motion, is there a second?

Vice Mayor Lago: Second.

City Commission Meeting

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Will you call the roll please?

Commissioner Keon: Can we also check with South Miami to see where they are, so we can avoid that issue.

Commissioner Quesada: Yes...

Assistant Public Works Director Keller: Yes. I actually, I reached out when they were mentioning they were speaking with South Miami to follow up with them, because my last conversation was that they were not interested, but that was two months ago.

Commissioner Keon: I have heard again that they have some interest now.

Commissioner Mena: How long would it take you to put a procurement process together for something like this?

Procurement Officer Walker: The procurement process is already in place, so it's just a matter of developing the scope that we would use and then probably at least two to three months for the process to play out for us to do the evaluation and the award.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Will you call the roll please?

Commissioner Keon: Yes Vice Mayor Lago: Yes Commissioner Mena: Yes Commissioner Quesada: Yes Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes

(Vote: 5-0)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Commissioner Quesada: And, thanks to Spin and Bird for doing a great job so far.

[End: 2:52:05 p.m.]