City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related June 12, 2018

City Commission Chambers 405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

City Commission

Mayor Raul Valdes-Fauli Vice Mayor Frank Quesada Commissioner Pat Keon Commissioner Vince Lago Commissioner Michael Mena

City Staff

City Manager, Cathy Swanson-Rivenbark
Assistant City Manager, Peter Iglesias
City Attorney, Miriam Ramos
City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman
Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia
Assistant Economic Development Director, Leonard Roberts
Historic Preservation Officer, Dona Spain
Parks and Recreation Director, Fred Couceyro

Public Speaker(s)

Gene Prescott Steven Gonzalez Alex Markel

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related [1:40 p.m.]

Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel.

A Resolution authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership (the "Hotel") in regards to the City-owned property located at 1200 Anastasia Ave, Coral Gables,

FL to redirect up to 50% of the Hotel's rental payments towards capital

improvement necessary to preserve the Hotel's historic landmark designation.

A Resolution authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management LLC,

with regards to the City owned property located at 1210 Anastasia Avenue, Coral

Gables, FL.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: (INAUDIBLE) have a presentation there.

Vice Mayor Quesada: I don't think your mike is on.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: It's okay. We'll...

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Okay, so the City leases The Biltmore

Hotel to The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership. The lease has been in effect since 1986 and

has been amended a couple of times, one of which resulted in (INAUDIBLE). One of the

requirements of the lease is to operate the hotel and the premises as a luxury first-class

destination resort hotel and conference center in the manner in which other similar class

destination hotels and conference centers are operated. The luxury standards (INAUDIBLE)

World Travel Guide. The City wanted to verify the hotel meets the luxury standards, so the City

worked with The Biltmore, and they selected HCI Consulting to provide a full assessment of the

luxury standard, compare the financials and capital expenditures to other hotels. The owner of

HCI, Thomas O'Neill, has a degree in real estate development vesting. He is an MAI certified

appraiser and expert witness in hotel management and has over 40 years' experience in the hotel

industry. The lease states the lessee and the City should select three hotels for comparable hotels

that are historic and considered luxury first class. The consultant reviewed several hotels'

descriptions with three most notable being the Breakers Hotel that was built in 1896, the Vinoy

Park Hotel, in St. Petersburg, built in 1925, and the Waldorf Astoria, in Boca Raton, built in

Page 2

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to

1926. Unfortunately, data was not available for many of the hotels, including these three, so the

consultant selected seven hotels as comparable with data that was available through Smith

Guide. He determined that these hotels were comparable based on the hotel classification,

performance indicators (INAUDIBLE) operations. Part of the review process included

reviewing the guest reviews on a variety of websites, such as Facebook, Trip Advisor, Expedia,

Hotels.com. Out of the 106 reviews, the consultant noted that 100 percent recommended The

Biltmore. The overall guest rating was 4.44, with the lowest score attributed to the hotel's

location and the highest score attributed to the hotel's value.

Vice Mayor Quesada: What does that "since last month" mean? How much it's gone up or

down in the last month, I guess?

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Yeah.

Vice Mayor Quesada: From...

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Yeah, so that -- yes. They rate it on a

monthly basis, so that's increased over the ratings from one period to the other.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Got it. So, it's actually gone down, the location score.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Yes.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Got it.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Forbes Travel Guide rated the hotel four-

star in 2018 based on its 900 objectives and standards. The leading hotels of the world, LHW, is

one of the world's largest luxury hotel collections and ranked The Biltmore 9 out of 20 luxury

hotels in Florida and provided a score rank of 82.2, while the average score rank was 82.3. The

Page 3

City Commission Meeting

last testing of that was done in January 2017. The consultant made five out of its seven visits as a mystery appearance. He used the audit tools provided by LHW to inspect and verify the rating. Based on his testing, he scored the hotel a 91.6, significantly higher than LHW's rating of 82.2. An idiosyncrasy of the audit methodology is that each criteria carries the same weight. So, a perfectly served cup of coffee would have the same weight and score as a more complex tasting offer from the Palm d' OR restaurant. The scoring is primarily based on guest experience and less on maintenance issues. His individual observation noted there was maintenance deficiencies and scored those areas lower. But the overall rating still maintained a luxury standard and concluded that they're at minimal risk of losing their designation. And here's the dates that he provided those testings. The consultant also concluded the hotel performed in line with the comparable hotels, except for the operating and capital costs, which were significantly higher. The industry's average capital reserve rate is approximately 3 to 4 percent of revenues. The hotel's average capital expenditure has been 8 percent in the last 25 years. One contributing factor is a higher cost of repairs versus replacement, as a requirement by the historical landmark designation. Higher occupancy translates to higher maintenance costs, so one strategy the hotel implements is sacrificing occupancy to maintain a lower maintenance expense. This chart shows a projection of the capital reserve based on 4 percent over the next five years, which results in a \$12.5 million shortfall for their capital expenditures they had projected. And due to lender constraints, reserving more than 4 percent of capital would impact the company's cash flow. This chart shows the projection of capital reserve at 6 percent and the City contributing half of its received over the next five years, resulting in a \$2.9 percent shortfall, substantially less than the \$12 million. Here are some images of the lobby renovations that are completed. The City's Historic Preservation Officer and Arva Parks reviewed the design before the work was started.

Commissioner Keon: Leonard, could you go back one. On the paper that we have, it says capital funding based on 4 percent reserve and City's contribution.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: So, the first one is 4 percent and the second one is 6 percent.

City Commission Meeting June 12, 2018

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Is your mike...

Commissioner Keon: We don't have one that has -- we don't have one...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Is your microphone on, Commissioner?

Commissioner Keon: That has -- I'm sorry. We don't have one that has 6 percent on it, do we?

Capital funding based on 4 percent reserve. This one says capital funding based on 4 percent

reserve with City's contribution.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, I'm watching it on my laptop, and I see the capital

funding based on 4 percent reserve, and then the next page being with City funding and how it

has reduced. It may not have been printed, but we're happy to make copies of...

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: I apologize for that.

Commissioner Keon: Yeah. Is that right?

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: One of them is for -- the first one is for 4

percent, and the second one that was provided by the consultants on 6 percent, and I have a copy

right here.

Commissioner Keon: Okay. The copy I have says -- and City's -- it's still 4 percent with City's

contribution.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: I'm not sure what happened there.

Commissioner Keon: Did you give me an old paper?

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Commissioner Keon: Okay. Okay, thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Thank you, sir.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: I'm fine. I don't need one.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: So, if you look at that slide, it shows -- the

4 percent shows a \$12.5 million shortfall. And with a 6 percent reserve and the City

contribution, roughly a \$3 million shortfall, which 6 percent would be substantially larger than

what the norm is and so that would be kind of hard for them to achieve, especially with their

lender requirements.

Commissioner Keon: Okay.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: The hotel has a budget of about \$8.3

million, roughly \$30,000 a room towards the room renovations. And here's a picture of the

before and after rendering. The windows project is budgeted to about \$5.5 million, which

includes hurricane impact windows and that meets historic requirements.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Which I certainly know is an issue. I know we got a number of

complaints during Irma with water coming in.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: The door outside was historic. And one of

the outcomes from this testing has been the hotel's request for contribution towards their capital,

City Commission Meeting

which brings me to the next agenda item. But before we go on, any questions related to the

assessment?

Vice Mayor Quesada: Nope.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You have next here in the capital costs, structural issues that we should --

that we could take care of because of the property and it belongs to Coral Gables. And then

regular hotel maintenance whether it's a new hotel or an old hotel, like rooms, room hallways,

room bathroom refresh, banquet space, lobby décor. That has nothing at all to do with the

historic nature of the property. That is the operation of a normal hotel; and you know, what are

they going to use the money that we may be giving them for?

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: So, that brings me to the next...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And who's going to supervise that?

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: And we're going to discuss that right now.

So, the US Department of Interior designated the hotel as a national historic landmark and

requires them to comply on a biannual basis with a certain historic preservation within the

monument. And so, the City received a list of their \$23 million approximately of line items of

capital expenditures. Dona, myself and The Biltmore reviewed that list and determined roughly

about \$10.5 million of that \$23 million pertained to the historic monument.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Where is that?

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Where is the list? I can provide the list.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Because it's not this list.

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to

to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: No. It's...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: I don't think its part of your packet. But they had a detailed

list, and I went through it because some of the items -- such as the furnishings of the lobby was

something that they would have done anyway. They had fallen in disrepair, so that wasn't

counted.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: The rooms, the lobby.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: The rooms weren't counted, you know. They replaced the

baseboard, which did need to be replaced, but they took original fabric -- original baseboards out

and added ones back in. I didn't count that.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'd like to see that list.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Absolutely.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'd like to see the list (INAUDIBLE).

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: We went through it with them and didn't allow anything

that was just regular maintenance. But there were some things that went above what an ordinary

hotel would have to do...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Like what?

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Because of the historic nature of it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Like what?

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to

Commissioner Keon: Windows.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: The -- pardon me?

Commissioner Keon: The windows.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: The windows. They did an amazing job on those windows. It was back to what they were originally, and now they're impact windows.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Now they are?

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: They are. They're going to -- they're in the process of doing that.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, they're in the process, but...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Mr. Prescott gave me a tour and showed me a very, very impressive...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Shop, you know, engineering space where they were building the windows and doors, et cetera.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: That's right.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And at the rate of meticulous detail that they were going through, I would

estimate that it'll be 2030 before they finish that. Doing two windows at a time -- very

meticulous and very, very good. I'm very...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Impressed, but they won't get it done.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Well, I think they can answer that question later if you

would like to have them because they will get it done in -- when?

Gene Prescott: Remember, we made half and then we bought the other half.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: There's a manufacturer that's making the identical windows

to them, and so they're purchasing some of those windows to get them done.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: When will the windows be replaced?

Mr. Prescott: Pardon me?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: When will all the windows be replaced?

Mr. Prescott: By December 1.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: December 1.

Commissioner Keon: Of this year?

Mr. Prescott: This year.

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: All the windows.

Mr. Prescott: We really need to do a big effort to get this done. We had -- as you heard, I think

Vice Mayor Quesada mentioned we had a lot of problems -- we had a lot of problems with --

during the hurricane. It was terrible.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I know you did.

Mr. Prescott: It was terrible. So, we must do that. And also, on windows, even though it's a

large amount, five and a half million dollars to replace all the windows, is that we get moisture

intrusion as well as when it rains, we get water intrusion.

City Attorney Ramos: Gene, could you state your name so we have the record complete?

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Your name. Who are you?

Mr. Prescott: I wonder at times. Gene Prescott, with The Biltmore Hotel.

City Attorney Ramos: Thank you.

Mr. Prescott: Thank you.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Mr. Mayor, just as further clarification, it was important for

us to have confirmation that the condition, the luxury level of that hotel and the promise for that

hotel to continue to be successful, and that's what J-7 was. Thomas O'Neill is a highly respected

hospitality evaluation expert, and so he conducted that review. We had The Biltmore be the

client because some of the information was going to be proprietary and this way they would be

able to speak freely with him while not jeopardizing the evaluation.

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to

to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: And I have a list here of -- you know, it's

more of a hand script list here and I could provide you a full detail. Window replacements...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Five point five.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Yeah. We have the 40-year recertification.

We have roof replacement.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Remember that that structure of The Biltmore is a steel

structure, but it's infilled with hollow clay tile, so it's not...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It's what?

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Hollow terra cotta tile is the -- you know, it's not a concrete

block, so it's very difficult -- the stucco repair alone is costly, and that's part of the 40-year

recertification.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: We have window replacement/construction.

We have balcony doors replacement in there. We have the elevators -- the historic elevators

have been included in that.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: The elevators that they redid in the lobby they had to do to

replicate the original and they really went above and beyond. You know, I've -- in the past

years, since I've been here for over 20 years; I've been one of their strongest critics. But I can

tell you they have really stepped up and they're trying to do the right thing for the hotel, in my

view.

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to

to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: And just to kind of give you an idea of

some of the things that were excluded. We had hallway renovations that were excluded,

improvements to ballrooms, room renovation, digital signage, garage systems. These are all

items that were excluded after review.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: And it was a two-tiered test. It had to be acceptable to Dona

Spain as Historical Resources Director in terms of protecting the historic nature of the monument

and then Assistant City Manager Peter Iglesias in terms of the structural enhancements. And so,

it was physical improvements for the historic monument that guided this, not the important

refreshment that is happening with the hotel itself.

Vice Mayor Quesada: I mean, and this was also done in conjunction with the independent

consultant...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Yes, sir.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Analysis of the current operations together.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And is the refreshment being done?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: The -- yes. So, it's my understanding -- and correct me if

I'm wrong -- that The Biltmore is going to put \$22.5 million into renovating the hotel. Of that,

approximately what, 9 or \$10 million is for the historic monument and it's that conversation that

we wanted to focus on reinvesting up to our recommendation, 50 percent of the revenues that the

City would receive for a five-year period based on those capital improvements that are

acceptable to Dona and Peter, but also, each year, it is a reimbursement grant or is it a...

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: So, what we're asking for is the City

Commission to give us authorization to finalize the details. The business terms would be that we

Page 13

City Commission Meeting

would contribute up to 50 percent of the revenues -- or redirect 50 percent of the revenues that

we receive.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: The annual revenues.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Correct.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, and when is the other non-50 percent -- I mean, the rooms, et cetera.

When is that going to be done?

Commissioner Keon: They're doing it concurrently.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Should we have someone from The Biltmore, if you could...?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Just stay up at the microphone so we can address all these points at the

same time?

Mr. Prescott: Sure. December 1.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: By December 1, the rooms and...

Mr. Prescott: We are -- what we need to do, Mayor, is really do a massive change. The product

is -- from the point of view of a hotel, is tired. We've got more competition. We, in 2017, were

down 6 percent in revenue. And you all heard the report of Bill Talbert and myself for the

Bureau, where the market was up. We were down. So, and the reason why is our product is not

up to snuff. So, there's obviously these issues that we're just talking about, the structure. You

all have seen and experienced some of the problems we've had on the -- particularly, the water

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with

The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

intrusion, which is really destructive. But it's also -- we need to get our product better.

Otherwise, we'll continue to lose revenue.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: December 1.

Mr. Prescott: Yes, sir. If not, we'll have...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: This year?

Mr. Prescott: Yes, this year. You're right with some skepticism, but that's the plan. We have a

detailed plan.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No. I -- okay, do I hear a motion?

City Attorney Ramos: Excuse me, sir. Let me read it into the record. It's a resolution

authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The

Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership in regards to the City-owned property located at 1200

Anastasia Ave, Coral Gables, FL to redirect up to 50% of the Hotel's rental payments toward

capital improvements necessary to preserve the Hotel's historic landmark designation. I have

previously given an opinion that this does not impact the Procurement Code because it is

essentially redirecting monies that the City's getting. It's in the vein of an expenditure and not

an amendment to the lease agreement.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Do I hear a motion?

Vice Mayor Quesada: Well, I have just one question on this. The five -- I just want to make

sure -- what's the rationale for the five-year term on this?

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: So, the projections they provided to us were

based on a five-year period, so we used that as a basis for up to five years. So, that \$22 million

or \$23 million, the intention is for -- we know what those funds are, so we want a timeframe of

five years to redirect that. Anything over and beyond that, right, is not part of this discussion.

So, anything beyond five years will probably be projected for other items that are not in this list.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Madam Manager, what's before us today is to grant staff to discuss and

finalize an agreement with The Biltmore, right? Is that what you're talking about? And that you

guys would work out whatever material terms are left over.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Right. And we provided a dollar amount as

a basis for discussion so that you -- you know, the goal is to have the City Manager and City

Attorney finalize an agreement, but you authorize based on that \$5.25 million projection over

five years, not to exceed.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: The five-year period, our Finance Director will say, is also

important because it allows us to include it as a part of our capital plan from a funding

standpoint. We don't have \$4.5 million sitting around waiting. We're going to take the money

that they would be giving us. We're going to recommend that you allow us to give them back

half -- up to half of it and we would like to iron out this negotiation itself.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Okay. Look, I'm in favor of it. I mean, I think Chip Withers has talked

to me that he's been trying to work something out with The Biltmore related to this for many

years, even before -- when he was still on the dais. I just want to make sure that you guys can

continue to discuss those items, including the timeframes because, my understanding, The

Biltmore is -- they may not be 100 percent in agreement with the five-year term. So, I'm just

Page 16

saying discuss that as well.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Absolutely.

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Commissioner Lago: I have just one quick comment before...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: Is staff going to be reviewing this on a year-to-year basis or is it going to

be a project to project basis?

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: So, they have an annual audit that they do,

and so what we're going to ask is that this be included within the footnote disclosure of the

annual audit. So, the list of capital expenditures will meet the criteria of what we consider a

historic monument, and we'd have to see that list in order to get -- for them to get the money.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Commissioner Lago: Not that I do not trust our friends at The Biltmore.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: They've been great partners, but I want to make sure that if it's needed and

required, that you have the ability to bring in, you know, somebody who may have a little bit of

background in regards to construction and design and give you kind of an audit in regards to

what they have spent. So, if they tell you they spent a million dollars on windows and give you a

price or some sort of estimate telling you -- you know, actually giving you some backup so that

the backup actually is concurrent...

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Supports.

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to

to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Commissioner Lago: To what the expenditures The Biltmore's stating they've done.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: And we can all negotiate as part of the final

agreement.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: And you know, they pull permits for all of this, so we have

what they put down on the permit also.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah, but that doesn't...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: I understand.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: We can hire...

Commissioner Lago: We all know what that...

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: They're finally pulling permits.

Commissioner Lago: I don't want to talk about that right now. But we know that what happens

in a lot of municipalities is they do not put the exact number, obviously, because they pay less

for a permit.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: And we'll ensure we incorporate all that in

the final agreement so that we can have an audit trail.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

City Commission Meeting June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Any other comments? Will you call the roll, please?

City Attorney Ramos: I don't think there's been a motion.

Commissioner Keon: I'll move it.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So moved.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: There was...

Commissioner Keon: I second it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. Will you call the roll, please?

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes.

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

(Vote: 5-0)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright, next item is J-9.

City Attorney Ramos: J-9 is a resolution authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management LLC, with regards to the City owned property located at 1210 Anastasia Avenue, Coral Gables, FL. This resolution does require two votes. One would be a four-fifth vote to waive the Procurement Code, and the second would be a majority vote to pass the resolution.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright, presentation.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: And can you...

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: So, the City has...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Excuse me, one second. And Madam City Attorney, can

you explain why the Procurement Code would need to be waived in this instance?

City Attorney Ramos: Yes. And so, the Procurement Code for sale, lease and purchase of City-

owned land has a number of different requirements that would need to be followed. None of that

makes sense in this case. This is akin to a sole source procurement in a way. They're already in

agreement -- they're already in an agreement with the City. We're simply extending that

agreement. Management agreements are exempt from the Procurement Code; however, only if

they're for under three years and this is for fourteen years.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: So, the City entered into a management

agreement related to the golf course in 2004. That lease or management agreement, I apologize,

expires in September 2028. The hotel plans on restoring the course to a Donald Ross Golf

Course, with a budget of approximately \$2.5 million. Their renovations would not only establish

it as a Donald Ross Golf Course, but also meet the Professional Golf Association standards. And

due to this investment, the hotel is recommending extending the management agreement for an

additional 14 years. And the timeframe for expiration would expire on the hotel's initial term,

which is August 2042. So, their lease expires currently in 2028, and to coincide it with the

Biltmore's lease expiration in 2042, but in no way will this be tied to any of the lease terms in

The Biltmore Hotel. The 14-year extension would be recommended on the basis of the timely

development of the actual Donald Ross Golf Course, provide PGA standards of maintenance

operations and invest a minimum of \$2.5 million into the actual course.

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to

to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Commissioner Lago: I just...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Commissioner Lago: I have a quick question. Well, two points. And we have somebody here

from the Junior Orange Bowl, and I think they wanted to make some comments.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, they have.

Commissioner Lago: (INAUDIBLE).

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: And the second concern -- second question I have or concern is -- I'm not

a golfer. I know that we have certain people on this Commission who are golfers. So, I --

Donald Ross -- I did a little bit of background in looking into who that individual is as a

designer. It's pretty impressive and I think it'll bring a lot of cache not only to the golf course,

but to the City. But I think \$2.5 million seems a little light. Again, I haven't seen the scope.

Are we sure that we're covered under that 2.5? If it ends up becoming \$4 million, are they going

to come back to the City and say, hey, you know, we want a portion of that to be paid by the

City? Is that something that's being under consideration? Or is it going to be up to The

Biltmore to assume that additional cost?

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: So, what we're asking today is on the

premise of that \$2.5 million, if anything changes related to that, then it can come back to

Commission for further discussion. But as of right now, the discussion is for 2.5, 14 years

extension.

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Now, Commissioner Lago, Fred Couceyro had supervised

the Granada Golf Course renovations. He has reviewed the plans for Donald Ross. Yes, it was a

part of George Merrick's original plan, with the Donald Ross Golf Course behind The Biltmore

Hotel. So, it is exciting that that type of historic golf course is being returned to the property.

But Fred, in your review of the plan, it's not the entire golf course that is being renovated. Do

you feel that this is an adequate amount of investment?

Parks and Recreation Director Couceyro: It should be. Based on what we've seen -- what we

saw at Granada, which, obviously, was a much smaller project, but with this project, they're not

taking on the full 140 acres. They're only taking on a portion. And what they're really looking

at is they're kind of doing a few adjustments to the course. They're increasing the length of

some of the holes so it's more conducive to tournaments, more conducive to competitive play.

So, that's just adding tees. And they are taking away some of the bunkers and adding new

bunkers that were originally in the design. So, it's not a full-scale -- whereas, Granada, we kind

of -- we took from beginning to the end, the entire course.

Commissioner Lago: When was...

Parks and Recreation Director Couceyro: This one is they're kind of just making adjustments to

the course.

Commissioner Lago: When was the last time you had a professional company do an estimate on

what's going to take it to bring it to the standards?

Parks and Recreation Director Couceyro: We have not -- in terms to bring it up to the

standard...

Commissioner Lago: Yeah, whatever the Donald Ross...

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to

to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Parks and Recreation Director Couceyro: Or to bring it up to the Donald Ross design...

Commissioner Lago: And there's a reason why I'm asking.

Parks and Recreation Director Couceyro: I cannot give you an answer. I'm not sure in terms of

us...

Commissioner Lago: The reason why I'm asking is...

Parks and Recreation Director Couceyro: In terms of the City contracting a company, no.

Commissioner Lago: The reason I'm asking is because construction costs have gone up between

20 and 40 percent in the last six months across the board on all the line items. Again, like I said,

I'm not a...

Vice Mayor Quesada: So, you're saying the \$2.5 million that they're talking about, maybe it

might be \$5 million today?

Commissioner Lago: That's why I prefaced my statement. I am not...

Unidentified Speaker: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: A golf expert. I leave that up to Quesada and Commissioner Keon.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: I've never even played golf out there once.

Unidentified Speaker: Right.

Commissioner Lago: I've ridden in a cart one time, and I think it was with you or something.

My point is that I think we need to be very careful what we agree on today. Maybe it's just a

cap. Two point five, we can do this. And if we can't do the rest of the course -- but I think it

would be a shame to only do a portion of the course and then have to come back in say, maybe a

year later, and say, okay, we're going to do the course for X amount because we fell short. And

just costs have gone up across the board.

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: I just confirmed with them. They've costed

it out already and so it's 2.5.

Commissioner Lago: Okay, you costed it out?

Commissioner Keon: They have costed it out.

Commissioner Lago: That's why I'm asking...

Commissioner Keon: Can someone --- yes.

Commissioner Lago: That's why I'm asking all these questions just to make sure.

Mr. Prescott: The cost went out to a full bid. Full bid, three -- I think we had what, three

responsive bids. We've chosen one.

Commissioner Lago: When was that -- when was it bid?

Mr. Prescott: When?

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Mr. Prescott: About a month ago.

Commissioner Lago: Oh, then you're in good shape.

Mr. Prescott: A month and a half ago.

Commissioner Keon: Yeah.

Mr. Prescott: A month ago now.

Commissioner Lago: Then you're in good shape. That's my only concern. That's it.

Mr. Prescott: Yeah. No, I -- (INAUDIBLE) got a few extra dollars above the 2.5.

Commissioner Lago: And you've made sure to put a line item in their contract that they'll hold that price for X amount?

Mr. Prescott: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: Sometimes...

Mr. Prescott: We'll have...

Commissioner Lago: They'll say they'll hold it for 30 days, two months.

Mr. Prescott: We'll have an appropriate contract with the contractor, yeah.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good. Anything else?

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

City Attorney Ramos: With regard to the four-fifths, I'd also like to add that the Commission

may do so if it finds that it's in the public interest to do so.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, we have two people who wish to speak. Basically, the same card.

Alex Gonzal -- Alex Markel and Steven Gonzalez. The Junior Orange Bowl thanks the City of

Coral Gables for Commission -- for support of the International Golf Championship. Yes, sir.

Steven Gonzalez: Ladies and gentleman of the Commission, first, the Junior Orange Bowl --

sorry, Steve Gonzalez, vice president of the Junior Orange Bowl and chair of the International

Golf Tournament. First, we'd like to thank you for your support and the City for its support of

our festivities, and specifically, the golf tournament. Over the past five years or so, I've been

working with Gene, Matthias (phonetic) and Bob and consider them great advocates and allies

for the golf tournament. And the golf tournament itself is very excited about the renovations.

We would be in support of extending the lease agreement and doing the renovations. And we

look forward to showcasing the renovations at this year's golf tournament for the 2018 -- from

December 26 'til the 31st. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Alex Markel: And I'm Alex Markel, the director of the Junior Orange Bowl. I just want to

reiterate Steven's comments. We want to thank the City and the Commission, the

Administration for all the support. The golf tournament is going into its 55th year this year. It's

got a lot of history and we think the renovation of the golf course will bring a great -- some great

impacts -- positive impacts to the City, to the golf course, and to the Junior Orange Bowl for

which we're very thankful.

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to Vice Mayor Quesada: That's great. You said the tournament's...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Vice Mayor Quesada: In January?

Mr. Gonzalez: It runs from December 26 to December 31.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Will the renovations be done by then?

Commissioner Lago: Yep.

Mr. Prescott: Yes.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Oh, yeah? Great.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It looks wonderful.

Mr. Gonzalez: And hopefully, the tournament will be the first to showcase it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Wonderful.

Mr. Gonzalez: We're looking forward to it.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you. Thank you for being here.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So moved.

Commissioner Keon: Second.

City Attorney Ramos: Are you moving to waive the Procurement Code?

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes.

City Attorney Ramos: Is there a second?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: This is a four-fifths.

Commissioner Keon: I'll second.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes. Alright, will you call the roll, please?

Assistant Economic Development Director Roberts: Thank you.

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Yes.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

(Vote: 5-0)

City Attorney Ramos: Now, we need a second motion to adopt the resolution.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So moved.

Commissioner Keon: Second it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Will you call the roll, please?

Commissioner Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Yes.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes.

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

(Vote: 5-0)

Vice Mayor Quesada: I just want to say thank you to The Biltmore and to staff.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Vice Mayor Quesada: I know there's been a lot of work on both sides, so thank you to everyone.

Commissioner Lago: Good job.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And I hope you stay...

Commissioner Keon: It's exciting.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: For the rest of the meeting and enjoy your afternoon.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Mr. Mayor, there is an item...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes, time certain.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Where the Cultural Development Board is recommending

an action, but you very well may wait and ask us to discuss that more when we're negotiating

with The Biltmore. It's your prerogative.

City Attorney Ramos: That's correct. That is Item I-1.

Commissioner Keon: I think they're in agreement.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Why don't we take the time certain, and then we'll go back to that?

Commissioner Keon: Well...

City Attorney Ramos: Only because The Biltmore's present, sir.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Oh, because it's related to Gables Station.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, I-1.

City Attorney Ramos: I-1 is a resolution that's being proposed by the Cultural Development

Board, and they're asking you to adopt a resolution approving the recommendation of the board

for the sole use of the theater space at The Biltmore Hotel as live theater or performance venue

for a not-for-profit organization.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: So, this is from the Cultural Development Board. Gables

Stage, as you know, is leaving The Biltmore, but that's not going to be any time in the near

future. I believe they're going to the Coconut Grove...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Coconut Grove Playhouse, but that's quite a...

City Commission Meeting

June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to

to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.

Historic Preservation Officer Spain: Playhouse, but that's, you know, up in the air. So, I would

suggest that we have that discussion while we're talking about the other things with The

Biltmore Hotel so that we can come to some kind of conclusion on this item.

Commissioner Keon: Okay.

City Attorney Ramos: In that case, you need to take no action at this time.

Commissioner Lago: Okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright. Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you, Dona.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

City Commission Meeting June 12, 2018

Agenda Items J-7, J-8 and J-9 are related -Presentation of recent evaluation of Biltmore Hotel and resolutions authorizing the City Attorney and City Manager to negotiate and draft an agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Limited Partnership and authorizing the City Manager to negotiate an extension to to the golf course Management Agreement with The Biltmore Hotel Golf Management, LLC.