



The City of Coral Gables

Historical Resources Department

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, April 16, 2015, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	A	M	J	J	A	S	O	N	D	J	F	M	A	APPOINTED BY:
	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	15	15	15	15	
Dorothy Thomson	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Mayor Jim Cason
Margaret Rolando	-	P	P	P	P	E	E	E	P	P	P	P	P	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Alejandro Silva	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Commissioner Patricia Keon
Venny Torre	-	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Commissioner Frank C. Quesada
Tony Newell	-	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	E	^	^	^	Commissioner Vince Lago
John Fullerton*	-											E	P	Historic Preservation Board
Robert Parsley*	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	City Manager
Dolly MacIntyre	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	City Commission
Judy Pruitt	-	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission

LEGEND: A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; * = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member; - = No Meeting

STAFF:

Kara N. Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Emily Ahouse, Historic Preservationist
Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant
Miriam S. Ramos, Deputy City Attorney

GUESTS: Angel Navarro, Lourdes Mangas Navarro, Raul R. Rodriguez, Herbert Brito, Robert Sanchez, Laura Russo, John Guzzo, Eduardo Goudie, Jose Bolanos, Richard Heisenbottle

RECORDING AND PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant, Historical Resources

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:05 p.m. A quorum was present.

MINUTES: MEETING OF MARCH 19, 2015:

A motion to defer approval of the minutes of the March 19, 2015 meeting to the next meeting was made by Ms. Thomson, seconded by Ms. Pruitt and unanimously approved by voice vote.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex-parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

DEFERRALS: Ms. Kautz reported the following deferral at the request of the applicant: Request by Temple Judea to Waive Art in Public Places Fee.

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Jessica A. Donnelly, court reporter, administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2015-003:

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1217 North Greenway Drive, a contributing resource within the "Country Club of Coral Gables Historic District," legally described as Lots 21 and 22, Block 4, Coral Gables Section "E," according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 13 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for an addition and alterations to the residence.

Ms. Ahouse gave a historic and photographic report reviewing the areas noted on the application. She stated that staff felt the proposed addition and alterations met the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. Ms. Ahouse also added the design was compatible but it was distinct from the original historic form of the building. Because the addition was set back, the street view along North Greenway, would still retain its historic appearance. She went on to say that the applicant would go into further details about the design. Ms. Ahouse then relayed that staff recommended a condition be added to the design. The condition being that a score line be added to the stucco in the line between the addition and the existing structure on the west elevation as the current plan showed the area as being flush and a subtle distinction was favored.

Robert Sanchez, co-owner of the property explained that the extra space was needed due to their expanding family. Ms. Ahouse assisted in presenting the images and gave an overview of the intended design displaying the existing floor plans for the first and second floor and then presenting the proposed floor plans showing the addition. Ms. Ahouse explained that the one car garage would become useable space and the interior would be reconfigured. She showed the proposed second floor plan which included a new playroom and displayed the plan for the addition and roof.

During board discussion Mr. Silva asked about the tile on the roof being true barrel. The owner stated that the addition would have true barrel as it was original to the property. Also casement windows and egress were discussed at length.

Mr. Torre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests for further input, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1217 North Greenway Drive with the condition that the addition have true barrel tile, that the stucco on the new addition be delineated by a line, and that there be double casement windows to the extent that the building code allows. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Fullerton, Ms. MacIntyre , Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2015-006:

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 290 Alhambra Circle, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lots 1 to 4 Inclusive, Block 28, Coral Gables Section "K," according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 33, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requested design approval for alterations to the structure.

During a PowerPoint presentation, Ms. Ahouse explained the proposal for exterior alterations to the building on the southeast corner of Salzedo Street and Alhambra Circle with the addition of two new windows, and removal of the existing non-historic walk up teller and night drop box to be replaced with the installation of windows. Also removal of the non-historic signage. She gave a background of previous alterations to the property presenting the existing survey and historic photographs.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, April 16, 2015

Continued

In staff's evaluation, the minor additional alterations would not diminish the buildings overall historic integrity. The north elevation would be restored to resemble its original historic appearance. The alteration to the west elevation would not significantly impact its interior. Staff recommended approval.

Richard Heisenbottle, on behalf of the applicant, addressed the board and presented the application, stating that at one point the property was a car dealership and had undergone numerous alterations. He welcomed any questions from the board.

Ms. Thomson asked about TDRs to which Mr. Heisenbottle responded that they had all been sold.

Mr. Torre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests for further input, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the design alterations to the property at 290 Alhambra Circle and to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Torre Nays: None

STANDARD CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (ST) 2015-038:

An application for the issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 611 North Greenway Drive, a contributing resource within the "Country Club of Coral Gables Historic District," legally described as Lot 18 Less ELY 57.78 FT and Lots 19 & 20, Block 22, Coral Gables Section "B," according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 111, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requested design approval for the installation of a wall and gates, the installation of a new front walkway and fountain, and the relocation of the front steps.

Ms. Kautz conducted a PowerPoint presentation reviewing photographs of the property, site survey, and original plans. The walkway comprised of coral rock that was being proposed for removal was original to the property and was drawn in the original plot plan. She stated that there were two parts to the application, 1.) Construction of a perimeter wall four feet high concrete topped with one foot decorative aluminum fence, pedestrian vehicular gate at the front of the property line and aluminum picket fence at the eastern property line. 2.) The relocation of the front walkway, and the front entry steps relocated to the front of the three arches.

While displaying the proposed site plan, Ms. Kautz explained that the removal and relocation of the front steps was in anticipation of a future application to relocate the front door to the center bay of the three arches, which staff was not in favor of. She stated that typically perimeter walls are administratively approved, but due to the nature of the walkway being removed and relocated it was brought to the board for review.

She concluded by stating that staff had no issues with the wall, gates, and the fence. However, staff disagreed with the removal and relocation of the front walkway and steps. She stated that the homeowner was in attendance and would be presenting.

Eduardo Goudie, the homeowner, introduced himself and stated the significance of the home. He explained that due to recent safety issues, and the amount of traffic at night, the wall was needed. Furthermore, that the removal and replacement of the front walkway was needed because it had a better architectural language.

The board discussed the design of the gate. Mr. Torre suggested that the caps be constructed in real keystone rather than pre-cast. Mr. Goudie agreed. Ms. Rolando voiced her concern with the massing of the wall and how it will overwhelm the home. Ms. Kautz informed that with their future plan of moving the pool to the front side of the home, the Zoning Department requires a solid four foot wall in front of the pool. Mr. Goudie stated that it was needed for noise reduction

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, April 16, 2015

Continued

due to the increased traffic. Ms. Rolando suggested using landscaping to deter the lights and noise. Mr. Parsley suggested having the wall continue all the way back and that the fountain and steps align in the center of the window. He also recommended for the pickets to be reduced on the right hand side of the driveway. Mr. Silva stated his concern in regard to the treatment of the pickets and the future relocation of the front door.

Mr. Torre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests for further input, he closed the public hearing.

Mr. Parsley made a motion to approve with the following conditions: 1) That the wall caps and column bases be constructed with Dominican or native keystone in lieu of precast concrete, with the base being stucco, 2.) The fountain and pedestrian gate be centered on the two-story section of the front facade. 3.) The spears to be removed. Mr. Fullerton seconded the motion.

Discussion continued, during which Ms. Pruitt voiced that she would not be in favor of all the changes. Mr. Goudie argued that it was just the walkway that was going to be changed. The wall was discussed. Ms. Rolando suggested the motion be withdrawn to consider the wall and the walkway as separate items.

Mr. Parsley withdrew his motion.

The board continued to discuss the item in regard to the wall and whether or not it should be moved back with landscaping to be positioned at the front of the wall to reduce lights and noise.

Mr. Parsley made a motion to approve with the following conditions: 1.) Substitute the column precast caps and bases on the wall with native keystone; 2.) The fountain and pedestrian gate be symmetrical on the second story massing, balcony, and window elements; 3.) If code allows, the wall panels flanking the driveway gate be symmetrical; 4.) The spears be removed from the wall; and to approve issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness to the property at 611 North Greenway Drive. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Fullerton, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Torre. Nays: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Rolando

HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE DETERMINATION:

Historical Significance Determination of the property at 325 Madeira Avenue, legally described as Lots 12 and 13, Block 1, Coral Gables Section "K" Revised Plat, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 30, Page 60, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Kautz presented the application and stated staff had not made a determination on the property and requested Board review. She relayed the history of the property, designed by Architect H. George Fink. It was originally constructed as a single family residence and became a multi family residence over time. Staff did acknowledge that the house had undergone numerous alterations over the years.

Ms. Kautz informed the board, while presenting PowerPoint images, that in February of 2005, five properties were brought to the board for demolition request: 315 Madeira Avenue, 317 Madeira Avenue, 335 Madeira Avenue, 341 Madeira Avenue, and 343-349 Madeira Avenue. Out of those, three were considered for demolition: 335 Madeira Avenue, 341 Madeira Avenue, and 343 Madeira Avenue. While they were considered to be significant, it was not enough to warrant designation and were deemed eligible for demolition. 315 Madeira Avenue and 317 Madeira Avenue were deferred from the meeting and eventually demolished, while 335 Madeira Avenue and 341 Madeira Avenue still remain.

With the history of the street, and decisions made by the previous board in the past, Ms. Kautz stated that staff felt uncomfortable making the decision to whether the property was significant or not and wanted the board to make that determination.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, April 16, 2015

Continued

Laura Russo, representing the owner, Raul Rodriguez, addressed the Board and stated that they were requesting that the board deem the property as not being historically significant. Ms. Russo introduced their consultant, architect Herbert Brito. She explained Mr. Brito's background and qualifications.

Mr. Brito addressed the board and conducted a PowerPoint presentation, displaying current and historic photographs as he reviewed the history of the property. He presented a timeline and the evaluation of criteria for designation stating that the building does not convey original architectural style due to post-1940 alterations. He explained that the building had lost its sense of time and place and concluded that the building did not warrant historical significance.

Mr. Torre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests for further input, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to deem the property at 325 Madeira Avenue not historically significant due to significant alterations. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Fullerton, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Torre.
Nays: Mr. Silva

BOARD ITEMS / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE:

New Board Member: Mr. Fullerton was welcomed back to board service.

Nancy Morgan: Ms. Thomson stated that she was aware that Ms. Morgan was in a car accident and suggested that the board or staff send her a card. Ms. Kautz stated that staff would do so.

Florida Trust Conference:

Ms. Kautz reported that the Florida Trust Conference would be held this year in Miami and would begin May 7th. She encouraged board attendance. Ms. MacIntyre informed that registration was available online and that there would be tours—one of which she would be conducting in Coral Gables. Ms. Kautz informed the board that she would e-mail a link to the agenda.

Staff Member Resignation:

Ms. Ahouse stated that she accepted a job as the Historic Preservation Officer for Covington, Kentucky and would be resigning from the Historical Resources Department. She expressed her sadness to leave, having taken great pleasure in working for the City. Ms. Kautz added that staff would miss Ms. Ahouse.

NEW BUSINESS:

None

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting adjourned at 5:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Dona M. Spain
Historic Preservation Officer