

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, April 15, 2010, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:

M J J A S O N D J F M A

Dorothy Thomson	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E
Margaret Rolando	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P+	P	E	P	P
Ernesto Santos	P	P	P	P	P	P	P-	P-	P	P	P	P
Venny Torre	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P-	P	P	E	P
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
Richard Heisenbottle*			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P
Deborah Tackett*											P	P
Gay Bondurant*		P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P

APPOINTED BY:

Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Comm. Maria Anderson
Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
Historic Preservation Board
City Manager
City Commission
City Commission

+ Ms. Rolando recused herself from discussion of one application at the special February meeting, and two applications at the December meeting.

- Ms. MacIntyre arrived at 6:53 p.m. (August); Mr. Santos arrived at 4:50 p.m. (November); Mr. Torre arrived at 5:40 p.m.; Mr. Santos and Ms. Bondurant departed at approximately 6:00 p.m. (December).

STAFF:

Kara Kautz, Historic Resources Officer
Simone Chin, Historic Preservation Administrator
Ricardo Herran, Historical Resources Assistant

A = Absent

P = Present

E = Excused

*** = New Member**

^ = Resigned Member

GUESTS: J.C. and Waldo Toyos, Paul George, Lowell Kuvn, Nelson de Leon, Diana Blanco

RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Dolly MacIntyre at 4:03 p.m. A quorum was present.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Ms. MacIntyre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. She then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

MINUTES: MEETING OF MARCH 18, 2010:

The minutes were unanimously approved as presented without objection by voice vote.

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan swore in audience members who planned to testify during the meeting.

DEFERRAL:

Ms. Kautz requested deferral of Board consideration of the historic designation removal for 1044 Coral Way, as the applicant submitted supportive documents after Board packets were delivered, providing insufficient time for Board members to study the materials.

Homeowners J.C. and Waldo Toyos agreed to defer the application until the May meeting.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Mr. Heisenbottle made a motion to excuse the absence of Ms. Thomson. Ms. Bondurant seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATION:

CASE FILE LHD 2010-002:

Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at **802 Milan Avenue**, legally described as Lot 11, Block 9, Coral Gables Granada Section, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 113, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

During a PowerPoint presentation, Ms. Kautz reviewed the history of the property and displayed photographs and original plans. She noted that many features were not built as originally designed, and alterations were made over the years. She reviewed the condition of the house when purchased by current owners, Robert Koltun and Diana Blanco, extensive work they did after they purchased the house in complete disrepair, and detailed alterations recommended by staff to be reversed as a condition of designation, as follows: the smooth window sills that were removed from the house need to be returned; the tower roof needs to be returned to its original appearance as a small hip roof; a replication of the wooden gate at the arched wing wall needs to be installed.

Ms. Kautz said staff recommended approval of the application due to its architecture with stated recommendations. She praised the owners for saving the house, and expressed sorrow that they weren't eligible to apply for ad valorem tax relief since the house was not designated prior to their multiple restorative efforts.

Ms. Blanco briefly addressed the Board, and indicated agreement with staff recommendations as previously stated.

Ms. MacIntyre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests to speak, she closed the public hearing. Board members praised the homeowners for their efforts to restore the house

Mr. Santos made a motion to approve the local historic designation with staff recommendations. Ms. Bondurant seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

AD VALOREM TAX RELIEF:

CASE FILE AV 2007-01:

An application requesting ad valorem tax relief for the property at **4320 Santa Maria Street**, a contributing structure within the "Florida Pioneer Village Historic District," legally described as Lots 21 and 22, less the South 15 feet of Lot 22, Block 93, "Amended Plat of Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Five", according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 23, at Page 55, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The related Certificates of Appropriateness (listed below) were granted approval by staff or the Historical Preservation Board – Case File COA (ST) 2005-10 (March 27, 2006), Case File COA (SP) 2006-09 (June 15, 2006), Case File COA (SP) 2006-17 (November 16, 2006), Case File COA (ST) 2006-76 (November 16, 2006), Case File COA (SP) 2007-10 (June 21, 2007) Case File COA (ST) 2007-72 (August 16, 2007).

Mr. Torre recused himself as this property was his previous residence.

Ms. Kautz reviewed the historic background of the property as well as multiple restorations, alterations and additions undertaken over the years, all of which were approved by the Board or staff, as she displayed numerous photographs.

Architect Nelson de Leon described the comprehensive effort made by previous owner, Venny Torre. Gary Brown, current homeowner, briefly addressed the Board. As no further audience comments were requested, Ms. MacIntyre closed the public comment period.

Mr. Heisenbottle made a motion to approve the application for ad valorem tax relief for 4320 Santa Maria Street. Ms. Bondurant seconded the motion.

**Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Tackett, Ms. MacIntyre.
Nays: None. Recused: Mr. Torre.**

BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE:

McFarlane Homestead Update: Ms. Kautz reported that a ribbon-cutting ceremony for the four new homes was recently held, and displayed photographs of the ceremony and four families who now occupy the homes. Mr. Santos was praised by the Board for his valuable consultation on this project.

Coral Way House: At the Board's request, Ms. Kautz further detailed staff's reasons for recommending deferral of the 1044 Coral Way application. She volunteered to provide Board members with relevant transcripts of past meetings. Ms. MacIntyre commented that the applicants' late-submitted materials appeared to include documents regarding the financial hardship issue. Ms. Kautz will provide Board members with additional financial hardship educational materials. Ms. Rolando urged Board care regarding inconsistencies related to applicants' claims of hardship, and Ms. Kautz advised that the onus was on applicants to provide concrete support for their financial hardship position.

Letter to Joyce Meyers: On behalf of the Board, Ms. Kautz will send a letter to Ms. Meyers thanking her for her years of outstanding Board service.

City Hall Windows and Coral Rock Walkway: Ms. Kautz reported that Public Works was looking at the walkway, but that there are no immediate plans to address the windows. At the direction of the Board, Ms. Kautz will request that repair or restoration work will be added to the priority list.

Historic Markers: A discussion was held about previously-discussed historical property markers. Ms. Kautz said the Board approved in 2007 a new bronze plaque design to phase out older ceramic markers, and the attendant volume requirements for pre-ordering and numbering them. She advised there was insufficient volume to qualify for reasonable pricing, adding that manufacturing individual plaques was quite cost prohibitive. Staff will revisit the issue and seek a foundry that will create the markers in smaller amounts and at more reasonable prices.

2003 Alhambra Circle: Ms. Kautz reported that barrel tile is being installed on the home; therefore, this issue will not return for Board consideration.

ADJOURNMENT: 4:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz
Historic Preservation Officer