CITY

OF

CORAL GABLES

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MEETING

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida Wednesday, 4:11 p.m., February 19, 2020.

PARTICIPANTS:

BRUCE EHRENHAFT, Chairperson JOHN FULLERTON, Board Member XAVIER DURANA, Board Member RAUL R. RODRIGUEZ, Board Member ALICIA BACHE-WIIG, Board Member PEGGY ROLANDO, Board Member

KARA KAUTZ, Historic Preservation Officer

ELIZABETH GUIN, Historic Preservation Coordinator

GUSTAVO J. CEBALLOS, Assistant City Attorney

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Good afternoon.

- 2 Before we commence, those persons who will be addressing
- 3 the Historic Preservation Board during the public hearing
- 4 portion of this meeting should legibly record their name
- 5 and address on the sign-in sheet and indicate the item or
- 6 items about which they'll speak. If -- the primary
- 7 purpose of the sign-in sheet is to record the attendance
- 8 and also to assist in the accurate recording of minutes,
- 9 so if you have not already done so, please go to the
- 10 secretary's desk and sign in.
- 11 So welcome to the regularly,
- 12 regularly-scheduled meeting of the City of Coral Gables
- 13 Historic Preservation Board. We are residents of Coral
- 14 Gables and are charged with the preservation and
- 15 protection of historic or architecturally-worthy
- 16 buildings, structures, sites, neighborhoods and artifacts
- 17 which impart a historic -- a distinct historical heritage
- 18 of the city.
- The board is comprised of nine members, seven
- 20 of whom are appointed by the commission, one by the city
- 21 manager, and the ninth is selected by the board and
- 22 confirmed by the commission.
- Five members of the board constitute a quorum
- 24 and five affirmative votes are necessary for the adoption
- 25 of any motion.

1 Any person who acts as a lobbyist pursuant to

- 2 the City of Coral Gables Ordinance Number 2006-11 must
- 3 register with the city clerk prior to engaging in lobbying
- 4 activities or presentations before the city staff, boards,
- 5 committees or the city commission. A copy of the
- 6 ordinance is available in the office of the city clerk.
- 7 Failure to register and provide proof of registration can
- 8 prohibit your ability to present to the Historic
- 9 Preservation Board on applications under consideration
- 10 this afternoon.
- "Lobbyist" is defined as an individual,
- 12 corporation, partnership, or other legal entity employed
- or retained, whether paid or not, by a principal who seeks
- 14 to encourage the approval, disapproval, adoption, repeal,
- 15 passage, defeat or modifications of, A, any ordinance,
- 16 resolution, action or decision of any city commissioner;
- B, any action, decision, recommendation of
- 18 the city manager, any city board or committee, including,
- 19 but not limited to, quasi-judicial advisory board, trust,
- 20 authority or council;
- Or C, any action, decision, action, or
- 22 recommendation of city personnel during the time period of
- 23 the entirety of the decision making process on the action,
- 24 decision or recommendation which foreseeably will be heard
- 25 or reviewed by the city commission or a city board or

1 committee, including, but not limited to, quasi-judicial

- 2 advisory board, trust, authority or council.
- 3 Presentations made to this board are subject
- 4 to the city's false claims ordinance, Chapter 39 of the
- 5 City of Coral Gables code.
- 6 I now officially call the City of Coral
- 7 Gables Historic Preservation Board meeting of February 19,
- 8 2020 to order. The time is 4:15 p.m.
- 9 We have three members who are absent and have
- 10 requested excused absences.
- 11 Those present to my right are Alicia
- 12 Bache-Wiig, Xavier Durana, John P. Fullerton; to my left,
- 13 Raul R. Rodriguez, and Margaret A. Rolando who goes by the
- 14 name "Peggy." Okay.
- 15 Staff present today from the Historic,
- 16 Historical Resources and Cultural Arts Department are Kara
- 17 N. Kautz, the city's historic preservation officer, and
- 18 ElizaBeth B. Guin, the city historic preservation
- 19 coordinator. Also present is Gustavo Ceballos, our
- 20 assistant city attorney.
- 21 So we're going to need to have a motion for
- 22 excused absence for Cesar Garcia-Pons, Albert Menendez,
- 23 who is our vice chair, and Mike Sardinas. Is there a
- 24 motion?
- MR. FULLERTON: I so move.

- 1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Second it.
- 2 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- MR. FULLERTON: And also might mention to the
- 4 people presenting today that we will need five of the six
- 5 of us. I'm sorry.
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: I told them already.
- 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yeah. Thank you.
- 8 MR. FULLERTON: Sorry.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you for the reminder.
- 10 So I'll call for a voice vote. Any -- all in favor?
- 11 THE BOARD MEMBERS: Aye (collectively).
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Any opposed? Aye. I forgot
- 13 to speak. So motion passes. Okay.
- 14 Next agenda item is approval of minutes from
- 15 our last meeting held on January 15th, 2022 -- 2020. Are
- 16 there any changes or corrections? Okay. Peggy, you were
- 17 not present, so.
- MS. ROLANDO: I will abstain.
- 19 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right, yes. Okay. Chair
- 20 calls for a motion to approve the January 15 minutes.
- 21 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Motion to approve.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Second?
- MR. DURANA: Second.
- 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. All in favor, say
- 25 "aye."

- 1 THE BOARD MEMBERS: Aye (collectively).
- 2 MR. EHRENHAFT: Aye. Any opposed? Okay.
- 3 The motion passes.
- 4 Notice regarding ex parte communications:
- 5 Please be advised that this board is a quasi-judicial
- 6 board and the items on the agenda are quasi-judicial in
- 7 nature which requires board members to disclose all ex
- 8 parte communications.
- 9 An ex parte communication is defined as any
- 10 contact, communication, conversation, correspondence,
- 11 memorandum or other written or verbal communications that
- 12 takes place outside a public hearing between a member of
- 13 the public and a member of the quasi-judicial board
- 14 regarding matters to be heard by the quasi-judicial board.
- 15 If anyone has made any contact with a board
- 16 member, when the issue comes before the board, the member
- 17 must state on the record the existence of an ex parte
- 18 communication, the party who originated the communication,
- 19 and whether the communication will affect that board
- 20 member's ability to impartially consider the evidence to
- 21 be presented regarding the matter. Okay.
- 22 Chair has a question for staff. Is there any
- 23 item on today's agenda that might be deferred?
- MS. KAUTZ: No, sir.
- 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Thank you. Okay. So

1 if any persons in the audience are going to be testifying

- 2 today, please rise to be sworn.
- 3 (Thereupon, all audience participants were duly sworn on
- 4 oath.)
- 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: We will now proceed to the
- 6 public hearings on cases on the agenda. First is a local
- 7 historic designation, Case File LHD 2020-001 for property
- 8 located at 416 Garlenda Avenue.
- 9 MS. GUIN: Can you put the Power up, the
- 10 Power Point up, please?
- 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: I need to read into the
- 12 record the specifications for the property, I believe. Is
- 13 that right?
- 14 Consideration of the local historic
- 15 designation of the property at 416 Garlenda Avenue legally
- 16 described as Lots Four to Six, Block 265 --
- MS. GUIN: Can you put the other Power Point
- 18 up, please? I'm sorry.
- 19 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- Revised Plat, Riviera
- 20 Section Part Two, according to the plat thereof, as
- 21 recorded in Plat Book 28 at Page 23 of the public records
- 22 of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
- MS. GUIN: So here is the location of the
- 24 property under consideration at 416 Garlenda Avenue. It's
- 25 a north-facing home on Garlenda Avenue, running between,

- 1 Garlenda running between Le Jeune and San Vicente.
- 2 It is just west of Merry Christmas Park to
- 3 orient you, and just a couple blocks north of Cocoplum
- 4 Circle, It's located on an interior area that is 155 by
- 5 100.
- The home was permitted in December 1925 by
- 7 Architect Frank Wyatt Woods, and here you can see a
- 8 photograph dated to April 12th, 1926 with the caption,
- 9 "Construction nearing completion."
- 10 So this application came to us as a historic
- 11 significance determination which we received on December
- 12 4th, 2019, and that was a result of a discussion at the
- 13 board of architects, the owner and architect to come
- 14 forward with plans for the property.
- 15 The board looked at it, realizing that it was
- 16 a unique early '20s property in the southern part of our
- 17 city and had a discussion with the architect and the owner
- 18 about its significance and discussed with them the fact
- 19 that the work they were doing, if they included
- 20 restoration work, they could receive ad valorem if the
- 21 property was designated.
- So at that point the owner submitted an
- 23 application to determine if it was significant. We
- 24 determined that it did meet the minimum eligibility,
- 25 issuing a letter on January 22nd, and as you know, by code

1 we need to bring it forward to be considered for

- 2 designation.
- For the record, all observations about this
- 4 property were done from the public right of way. There
- 5 was no access to the property. All photos were supplied
- 6 by the applicant, the architect, or were found on line as
- 7 listing photos.
- Reading for the record, in accordance with
- 9 Article Three, Section 3-1103 of the Coral Gables zoning
- 10 code, criteria for designation of historic landmarks,
- 11 local historic landmark must have significant character,
- 12 interest or value as a part of the historical, cultural,
- 13 archaeological, aesthetic or architectural heritage of the
- 14 city, nation or state.
- 15 For designation, a property must meet one of
- 16 the criteria outlined in the code. 416 Garlenda Avenue is
- 17 eliqible as a local historic landmark based on four
- 18 significance criteria.
- 19 The historical, cultural significance, it
- 20 exemplifies the historical, cultural, political, economic
- 21 or social trends of the community.
- 22 Architectural significance, portrays the
- 23 environment in an era of history characterized by one or
- 24 more distinctive architectural styles.
- 25 Embodies those distinguishing characteristics

1 of an architectural style, or period, or method of

- 2 construction.
- 3 And Four, contains elements of design,
- 4 detail, materials or craftsmanship of outstanding quality
- 5 which represents a significant innovation or adaptation to
- 6 the South Florida environment.
- 7 So Coral Gables is divided broadly into three
- 8 major historical periods. The home at 416 Garlenda was
- 9 built during the initial development period of Coral
- 10 Gables and exemplifies the Mediterranean ideals espoused
- 11 by Coral Gables founder George Merrick.
- 12 Coral Gables was originally conceived as a
- 13 suburb of Miami and attracted visitors from across the
- 14 nation during the South Florida real estate boom of the
- 15 1920s. Excuse me. Merrick drew from the Garden City and
- 16 City Beautiful movements of the 19th and early 20th
- 17 century to create his vision of a fully-conceived
- 18 Mediterranean-inspired city which is now considered one of
- 19 the first modern planned communities for the United
- 20 States.
- 21 During the 1920s, careful attention was paid
- 22 by his development team to ensure that the buildings and
- 23 streetscape elements conformed to his Mediterranean
- 24 ideals. Merrick felt that this type of architecture
- 25 harmonized best with South Florida's climate and

- 1 lifestyle. The goal was to create architectural splendor
- 2 in a Spanish suburb of tropical luxuriance.
- 3 As you're aware, Merrick's initial
- 4 development of Coral Gables in the early '20s was centered
- 5 around his plantation on Coral Way. This property is of
- 6 particular interest of historical significance since it
- 7 represents the beginning of Merrick's suburban expansion
- 8 that began in 1925.
- 9 In March of 1925, Merrick announced the
- 10 purchase of 6,000 acres to the southeast along Biscayne
- 11 Boulevard -- Biscayne Bay, including Cocoplum Beach, the
- 12 property from James and Charles Deering. With this
- 13 acquisition, Merrick and Button were able to employ the
- 14 vast network of waterways they had envisioned including
- 15 the yacht basin just west of the property on Garlenda
- 16 Avenue which is indicated here by the red arrow.
- On May 3rd, 1925, Merrick announced in a
- 18 Miami News article that with the purchase of this
- 19 development, he was now calling it Coral Gables, Miami
- 20 Riviera with 40 miles of waterfront, and the map here
- 21 accompanied that announcement.
- 22 A 1925 advertisement describes the Riviera
- 23 section proposed features and institutions that included
- 24 the University of Miami, University High School, golf
- 25 course, sports center, clubhouse, the Temple of the Mahi

1 Shrine, Riviera Sanitarium, Coral Gables Railway Station,

- 2 electric railway cars, beautiful roads and drives with
- 3 emphasis placed on the University Concourse as well as the
- 4 waterways and the yacht basin, and Coral Gables' greatest
- 5 plaza, Cocoplum.
- In order to spur development in this area, he
- 7 started three of his thematic villages: In 1925, the
- 8 Dutch African Village, which you can see the bottom
- 9 sketch here done by the architect, located in Part 11 of
- 10 the Riviera section which is the part where this home is
- 11 located; also in 1925, the French Country Village also
- 12 located in Part 11; and then in February 1926, the French
- 13 City Village in Part Nine.
- 14 Unfortunately, much of what was promised for
- 15 the Riviera section was never delivered due to the
- 16 economic downturn following the 1926 hurricane, and the
- 17 area remained sparsely populated for decades.
- In 1927, the Riviera section was replatted to
- 19 revert the locations of these planned amenities to
- 20 residential blocks, and it was divided into 14 parts.
- 21 This map shows the re-plat of Part 11 with
- the location of 416 Garlenda indicated by the red arrow
- 23 and the villages circled in purple with the Dutch Southern
- 24 African Village to the south and the French Country
- 25 Village to its north.

1 This 1930 aerial photograph demonstrates how

- 2 sparsely populated the area was at that time. Note the
- 3 heaviest concentration of buildings are the thematic
- 4 villages constructed in the 1920s. The Dutch African
- 5 Village is south of the home and the French City Village
- 6 to its north. The red arrow indicates the location of the
- 7 home at 416 Garlenda, which was one of the few
- 8 single-family residences in the area, and the sole
- 9 residence for many in the blocks of its vicinity.
- In general, construction of the City of Coral
- 11 Gables boomed until the combination of the hurricane of
- 12 '26 and the Depression. During the Depression era of the
- 13 '30s, few single-family homes were built. With the
- 14 implementation of The New Deal and other incentives, the
- 15 building industry finally experienced a small resurgence
- in the late '30s and the early 1940s, only to abrupt to a
- 17 grind, to a grinding halt during the war years.
- 18 The Post-War prosperity that followed these
- 19 lean years created an optimism which regained through the
- 20 1950s and '60s that resulted in the unprecedented building
- 21 boom that we all know.
- During this time, the building of
- 23 single-family homes in the City of Coral Gables followed
- 24 the national trends in both numbers and style.
- The blocks in the vicinity of 416 Garlenda

- 1 roughly followed these trends. Construction was a little
- 2 more sparse during the '40s and picking up into the 1950s.
- 3 Here you see an aerial of 1948 and 1955, and
- 4 then as we move through the 1950s, there were very few
- 5 vacant lots present by the time this aerial photograph was
- 6 taken in 1963.
- 7 To date this section retains its context of
- 8 single-family residences, and the home at 416 Garlenda
- 9 Avenue remains the sole example of Mediterranean Revival
- 10 style in the area.
- 11 416 Garlenda Avenue was designed by prominent
- 12 architect Frank Wyatt Woods. In the mid-1920s, George
- 13 Merrick heavily recruited nationally-acclaimed architects
- 14 to help build his dream community. Frank Wyatt Woods was
- 15 one of these architects.
- 16 Woods was a graduate of Brown University and
- 17 the Rhode Island School of Design. Several of his
- 18 buildings from his early career in Providence contribute
- 19 to the Wayland Historic District which is listed on the
- 20 National Register of Historic Places. These include the
- 21 Buena Vista Apartments, built in the Spanish Revival style
- 22 shown here.
- Woods moved his practice from Rhode Island to
- 24 Miami in 1924. His first commissions for Coral Gables
- 25 included a residence for the city manager as well as two

1 groupings of homes in the Italian style as seen here.

- Woods took on a business partner, John
- 3 Tracey, and together they were responsible for designing
- 4 Mediterranean Revival homes throughout Coral Gables.
- 5 Permitted records indicate that they designed over 33
- 6 homes between 1925 and 1927, including the home at
- 7 Garlenda as well as the Sidonia Garden Apartments which is
- 8 also on our agenda today.
- 9 Built during the boom years, the home at 416
- 10 Garlenda is an example of Mediterranean Revival style that
- 11 characterized Merrick's vision and Frank Wyatt Woods'
- 12 contribution to developing the founding premise of Coral
- 13 Gables.
- 14 Walter Tappen was the owner-builder of the
- 15 home. Tappen was a retired teacher from Brooklyn who
- opened a construction business. It's speculated that he
- 17 capitalized, he hoped to capitalize on Merrick's southern
- 18 expansion. He teamed up with one of the most important,
- 19 prominent architects in Coral Gables at the time. He
- 20 built his home in the essentially uncharted territory of
- 21 the Riviera section, and as discussed earlier, Merrick's
- 22 plans and Tappen's hopes for the area never materialized.
- 23 As a result, the home at 416 Garlenda stands
- 24 alone in this section of the city as an example of Woods'
- 25 design his interpretation of the Mediterannean Revival

- 1 style.
- 2 It is surmised from newspapers that Walter
- 3 and Florence Tappen traveled back and forth from Brooklyn
- 4 to this home, splitting their time, until about 1930. The
- 5 last newspaper article mentioning them in Coral Gables
- 6 shows them posting an ad saying that they're moving back
- 7 to Brooklyn and they're looking for a chauffeur to drive
- 8 their Chrysler.
- 9 Walter passed away in 1935, and at some point
- 10 the property passed to Walter's sister-in-law, Emily
- 11 Seaman Tappen. From 1930 to 1941, there are at least two
- 12 tenant. At this point, because this was so sparsely
- 13 populated, this received only rural delivery so there's
- 14 very little records of who was living in the home at these
- 15 times.
- 16 Thus, the property stayed with the Tappens
- 17 for 18 years, and in 1943 Emily sold it to Martin and
- 18 Lillian Neary where it remained with them and their
- 19 relations for 46 years. We had two long-term owners.
- 20 Major Martin Neary served in both World Wars,
- 21 and from all accounts he was a highly respected army
- veteran and was very active and high ranking in the
- 23 American Legion.
- 24 His 1961 obituary stated that he moved to
- 25 Florida in 1941 after retiring from the police force in

- 1 New York.
- In 1946, the Nearys hired H. George Fink to
- 3 design an addition to the garage.
- 4 The property then has passed through several
- 5 hands to the present-day owner, and it's worth noting in
- 6 1993 a building site determination was done on the
- 7 property and the result of which was that Lots Four, Five
- 8 and Six must be held together as one building site.
- 9 The single-family home was originally
- 10 permitted as a two-bedroom home with a screened porch at
- 11 its northwest corner, a sleeping porch at its southeast
- 12 corner, and a detached garage off the southwest corner.
- The home honors Merrick's vision for adapting
- 14 residential design to the rigors of South Florida's
- 15 climate while maintaining the integrity of its style.
- Built over a crawl space to provide
- 17 ventilation and separation from the high water table, the
- 18 home has thick masonry walls which aid in keeping the home
- 19 cool, along with light-colored stucco exterior walls which
- 20 reflect the sun's heat, and the varied windows arranged to
- 21 provide much needed cross-ventilation and light in the
- 22 tropical environment.
- 23 Here you can see a series of photos that
- 24 shows you the evolution of the home through time and how
- 25 much it has retained its historic integrity.

In this annotated floor plan, which was drawn

- 2 by Albert Poza who is in the audience -- he'll be
- 3 presenting to you later -- the original home is
- 4 highlighted in blue.
- 5 As mentioned previously, H. George Fink was
- 6 hired in 1946 to expand the garage for the servants'
- 7 quarters. His plans, which are included in the appendix
- 8 of your designation report, indicate that the second story
- 9 of the garage, which you can see in the 1946 picture, was
- 10 already in place by the time of his addition. He did the
- one-story addition, and that is indicated in green on the
- 12 plans.
- The main house has seen one campaign of
- 14 additions in 1999, which is indicated in orange. It
- 15 Included a master bedroom addition at the southeast corner
- 16 and a western wing containing a family room, side-facing
- 17 garage, and a covered patio.
- Note that the longer street -- that the lot
- 19 has a longer street presence than it has the depth, the
- 20 lot size being 150 by 100. Thus, any addition would need
- 21 to be lengthwise, and the 1999 addition was added in such
- 22 a way that the original 1925 home still reads, thereby
- 23 retaining the integrity of the original portion of the
- 24 home.
- 25 With the addition of the 1999 detached -- or

1 attached garage, the original detached garage then became

- 2 an auxiliary building and was converted to a workshop.
- 3 There is a fair amount of vegetation in front
- 4 of the 1925 portion of the home so it was difficult to
- 5 photograph the eastern portion of the home, but you can
- 6 see the extant features on this elevation drawing, again
- 7 courtesy of Mr. Poza.
- 8 The home is built in the Mediterannean
- 9 Revival style. Prominent in the defining features of the
- 10 home include projecting and recessed planes; rectilinear
- 11 massing and floor plan; floors -- roofs of varying heights
- 12 and types; two-piece barrel tile which cover the pitched
- 13 roofs and edge the flat roofs; the first floor above the
- 14 crawl space; recessed windows of varying shapes and sizes
- 15 with projecting sills; the textured stucco; the
- 16 distinctive chimney; the series of arched openings; the
- 17 front entry ensemble, which includes a covered archway
- 18 entry and a wing wall; the front porch which is now
- 19 enclosed; exposed rafter tails; and decoratively grouped
- 20 round vents.
- 21 So in this shot you can see some of the
- 22 characteristics that I just mentioned: The projecting and
- 23 recessed planes of the 1925 portion; the roofs of varying
- 24 heights and types; the two-piece barrel tile; the series
- 25 of arched openings of the front porch; and the front entry

- 1 ensemble with its arched entry and its wing wall.
- 2 In this photo you can see a few more details
- 3 such as the exposed rafters, and the drawing at the top
- 4 right, again courtesy of Mr. Poza, documents the existing
- 5 west facade of the 1925 portion so that you can see how
- 6 much of that facade was actually retained with the 1999
- 7 addition.
- 8 Here you can see the distinctive chimney
- 9 stack and the series of arched openings on that facade.
- In looking at the front, the north and the
- 11 side/west facades, you can get a pretty good look of that
- 12 1999 addition with its side-facing garage under a shed
- 13 roof and the covered patio with its arched openings on the
- 14 flat roof to the rear.
- In the bottom slide, this is a view of that
- 16 1992 covered patio from the rear. I included this map to
- 17 sort of help you orient yourself. What you're, on the
- 18 bottom photo what you're seeing in the foreground is
- 19 actually the south facade of the auxiliary building.
- 20 And this slide shows you the rear elevation.
- 21 Due to the location of the auxiliary building, you can't
- 22 really see, you can't really photograph the back facade,
- 23 but here Mr. Poza's drawing gives you an indication of
- 24 what that facade looks like. In this case I flipped the
- 25 plan so that you can easier, more easily orient yourself.

1 The photo on the bottom shows the -- in the

- 2 foreground, that is the converted sleeping porch from the
- 3 original portion, and then what you're seeing with the
- 4 shed roof is the 1999 master bedroom suite addition.
- 5 There is the east elevation. You can see the
- 6 distinction easily between what was the original home,
- 7 which is, has the rectilinear windows, and then the 1999
- 8 master bedroom suite which has the arched windows and
- 9 projects out, is what you can see in that bottom photo.
- Now, as you know, we don't designate the
- interiors, but if you decide to designate the property
- 12 tonight, one of the proposals that will be coming forth in
- 13 the COA is that they're going to be restoring that front
- 14 porch back into a porch area, and this photo shows you
- 15 that that original cracked floor which Mr. Woods actually
- 16 outlined very nicely in his drawings is still there.
- 17 The bottom photo shows you an arched opening
- 18 that leads into that front entry.
- 19 Again, because of the location of the
- 20 auxiliary structure, it's sort of tough to photograph, but
- 21 this sort of gives you some, the semblance of what that
- 22 looks like with Fink's top terrace and the railings which
- 23 he detailed in his drawings and which are still extant.
- 24 Besides the additions, the most dominant
- 25 alterations to the home are the windows. The windows were

- 1 originally wood casements. They were changed to awning or
- 2 jalousies -- and jalousies at an unknown date, and then in
- 3 1989, those were replaced with the single home --
- 4 single-hung windows that we see now. The windows sizes
- 5 for the most part have been retained, and the window
- 6 placements are in their original locations.
- 7 Other alterations include, as mentioned
- 8 before, the enclosing of the front porch and the enclosing
- 9 of the rear sleeping porch.
- 10 And in 1950 a four-foot coral rock wall was
- 11 built along the east and the west sides of the property,
- 12 which this photograph gives you a glimpse of, and the
- 13 coral rock is considered part of the designation of the
- 14 property.
- 15 So comparison of the original permit plans,
- 16 historic photos and other building records with the
- 17 property indicate this residence retains a high amount of
- 18 historic integrity. Thus, the property at 416 Garlenda
- 19 contributes to the historic fabric of the City of Coral
- 20 Gables and is considered to be part of a collection of
- 21 quality residences that contributes to the story and the
- 22 city's sense of place over time.
- In conclusion, the single-family residence at
- 24 416 Garlenda Avenue was built in 1925 in the Mediterannean
- 25 Revival style. Founder George Merrick envisioned Coral

1 Gables as a planned Mediterannean-themed community whose

- 2 architecture was adapted to the southern Florida climate.
- 3 The home was designed by architect Frank
- 4 Wyatt Woods, a nationally acclaimed architect who worked
- 5 closely with George Merrick's design team in the
- 6 mid-1920s. Woods has several buildings listed on the
- 7 National Register of Historic Places.
- 8 It was one of the first homes constructed as
- 9 Merrick began expanding the city to the south, and it
- 10 appears that it was built by owner-builder Walter Tappen
- 11 as an example of his work.
- 12 Unfortunately, due to the drastic downturn in
- 13 construction after the '26 hurricane, the area was not
- 14 developed. The home remains as the sole example of
- 15 Merrick's Mediterranean Revival vision in this area of the
- 16 city.
- 17 The property at 416 Garlenda Avenue has
- 18 maintained a significant degree of historic integrity, and
- 19 thus contributes to the historic fabric of the City of
- 20 Coral Gables. Staff is recommending approval of the local
- 21 historic designation of the property at 416 Garlenda
- 22 Avenue based on its historical, cultural and architectural
- 23 significance.
- 24 MR. EHRENHAFT: Is there to be any
- 25 presentation by owners or agents on their behalf?

- 1 MS. GUIN: The owner is not here. If you
- 2 decide to designate, then the architect will present the
- 3 certificate of appropriateness application.
- 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Understood. Okay. Does
- 5 anybody in the audience wish to speak in support or in
- 6 opposition to this case? If so, please come forward to
- 7 the microphone and state your name and address.
- 8 MR. POZA: Hello, board members. Albert
- 9 Poza, architect.
- I guess one of the most significant reasons
- 11 why this is historical is, as staff mentioned, I've worked
- in a lot of, several historical properties, but never one
- 13 this far south, and if you look at one of those slides, it
- 14 was a lonely little house out there, and it's almost sad
- 15 because obviously it was projected to have many other
- 16 homes, like you know, you can't drive two blocks, one
- 17 block almost in Coral Gables without seeing something
- 18 similar, equivalent to this, but in that area, there isn't
- 19 anything, and that first slide that staff showed, it was
- 20 amazing.
- 21 It was like by itself, and that alone is
- 22 almost like, you know, why is it there? How come it's
- 23 still there? So that is -- obviously there's more other
- 24 reasons, but that in itself is almost enough to sway one
- 25 that really values this sort of architecture in the

- 1 direction for approval. Thank you.
- 2 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you. Okay. If there's
- 3 nobody else that wishes to speak, that will close the
- 4 public hearing portion of the case.
- 5 Does any board member have ex parte
- 6 communications, site visits or other statements relating
- 7 to the case to disclose at this time? None, okay. The
- 8 chair will entertain discussion by the board.
- 9 MS. KAUTZ: Not all at once.
- 10 MR. RODRIGUEZ: How about a motion?
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, okay. If there's no
- 12 discussion, chair will entertain a motion.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: I'll make a motion to
- 14 approve.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Second?
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Second it.
- MS. KAUTZ: So we're going to --
- 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: So may we call the roll?
- MS. KAUTZ: Miss Bache-Wiig?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
- MS. KAUTZ: Mr. Durana?
- MR. DURANA: Yes.
- MS. KAUTZ: Mr. Fullerton?
- MR. FULLERTON: Yes.
- MS. KAUTZ: Mr. Ehrenhaft?

- 1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
- MS. KAUTZ: Mr. Rodriguez?
- 3 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
- 4 MS. KAUTZ: Miss Rolando?
- 5 MS. ROLANDO: Yes.
- 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Motion passes
- 7 unanimously. Thank you. All right, so.
- 8 MS. GUIN: Can you put the second Garlendo
- 9 Power Point up?
- 10 MR. EHRENHAFT: So I'll go ahead and announce
- 11 for the record --
- MS. KAUTZ: Sure.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: -- the COA. So the applicant
- 14 is also requesting the issuance of an accelerated special
- 15 certificate of appropriateness and design approval for an
- 16 addition and alterations to their residence. Specifically
- 17 it is COA (SP) 2020-003 for an accelerated special
- 18 certificate of appropriateness for an addition and
- 19 alterations to the residence, alterations to the detached
- 20 auxiliary structure, and site work.
- 21 MS. KAUTZ: Thank you. So as noted earlier,
- 22 just a second ago, this residence has been altered in the
- 23 past. The majority of the proposed work occurs in the
- 24 later additions.
- 25 It consists of a one-car garage to the west

of an existing garage addition. They're also requesting

- 2 design approval for alterations to the single-family
- 3 residence, the detached garage structure, and an addition,
- 4 as well as site work.
- 5 The architect is here so I'll let him walk
- 6 you through it.
- 7 This was approved by the board of architects
- 8 on January 22nd of this year with no comment. No
- 9 variances have been requested, and we have some comments
- 10 at the end that we'd like to address, but I'll let the
- 11 architect give his presentation.
- 12 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I have a quick question.
- MS. KAUTZ: Sure.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: The accelerated certificate
- 15 of appropriateness --
- MS. KAUTZ: Yes.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: -- what is that?
- 18 MS. KAUTZ: It means that we're taking them
- 19 at the same time, so instead of doing a special
- 20 certificate at a later date, we call it an accelerated
- 21 because they're designating and doing it at the same
- 22 meeting.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Got it.
- MS. KAUTZ: Okay. The pointer does not work.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: And if you could again,

1 please state your name and your address for the record?

- MR. POZA: Albert Poza, architect, 1900
- 3 Ferdinand Street, Coral Gables.
- 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you.
- 5 MR. POZA: So like previously stated, it's
- 6 kind of like the only little house in the area, and I
- 7 really want to comment, irregardless of the outcome of
- 8 this, on staff because of what you have just mentioned,
- 9 the accelerated schedule.
- 10 Originally this house, its initial design,
- 11 when the owner bought the property, he was -- at the time
- 12 it wasn't historical, so when he calls in, it's not
- 13 historical, so he goes ahead and purchases the property.
- 14 He has intentions of doing some sort of a --
- 15 saving the historical portion, but kind of hybrid. He
- 16 really wanted a more modern looking house, but he was
- 17 going to preserve the building as it stands now.
- So it was then suggested by the board, why
- 19 isn't this historical, the board of architects, so it had
- 20 to somehow be looked over by staff.
- 21 As you know, staff does now have not in full
- 22 capacity in terms of the personnel that they have, and
- 23 they did a wonderful job in accelerating the process,
- 24 because between the time that it went to the board and the
- 25 time that we're here now, it was extremely difficult, not

only for me as the architect to complete all the drawings

- 2 and everything else and redesign the project from the
- 3 initial non-historical building there to what is now being
- 4 proposed, it was quite an undertaking, and we didn't
- 5 really know if that was going to be possible because of
- 6 the accelerated schedule.
- 7 So I want to commend staff for that. They
- 8 have been very helpful and really did a wonderful job.
- 9 So anyway, the house has had several
- 10 additions, remodelings to it, and it really has somewhat
- 11 preserved the initial portion of the historical portion of
- 12 the house, but somewhat it really has not architecturally
- 13 addressed correctly some of the items, like the garage may
- 14 be a little bit lacking detail, a little bit lacking some
- 15 of -- elements that might make it historical, you know,
- 16 single-hung windows that don't really have anything to do
- 17 with historical because it wasn't historical, it wasn't
- 18 treated or designed as historical, any of the additions.
- 19 They were just, they preserved what was
- 20 there, but they didn't really enhance or grow the
- 21 historical aspects of the house.
- 22 So what I was trying to do in the design was
- 23 to somehow reemphasize the historical aspects and add
- 24 portions to it that enhance that little cute house that
- 25 was there, and one of the main aspects in the design,

1 maybe I could get to -- if you see in some of the earlier

- 2 pictures -- I don't want to bore you in taking you back --
- 3 some of, those three arches were originally open, and one
- 4 of the suggestions by staff and then simultaneously to the
- 5 client was, "You need to surrender this AC area."
- 6 Not too many people were willing to do that,
- 7 but he was finally convinced to go ahead and surrender
- 8 square feet. He's using that square feet, AC space, and
- 9 turn it back in time to what it originally was, the open
- 10 patio.
- 11 So as it stands forward, it will remain, you
- 12 see in the floor plan there with the three arches and the
- 13 arches on the side, that will be an enclosed, enclosed in
- 14 terms of roof covered, but open air. It's got a screen
- 15 enclosure, but it's no longer be air-conditioned.
- 16 And likewise there is a wing wall that is
- 17 being -- there's a wing wall that encloses kind of that
- 18 chimney garden area, and that was a way to somehow merge
- 19 the proposed with the existing in a manner that would not
- 20 be what you currently see in the previous pictures, that
- 21 long facade that became part of the garage and part of
- 22 what was there.
- So in the concept on the inside, the house
- 24 has become fairly open. It has become, shall I say, you
- 25 know, almost with some reservation, a little bit more

- 1 modern to today's standards, but the outside, it's
- 2 actually more in keeping with the latter-day standards, so
- 3 it opens it up, but by the same token, it also preserves
- 4 it a little better than it had in the past.
- We're trying to use -- all the windows will
- 6 be casement, as I said, and you see it in the elevations
- 7 there. The railings are being either produced new or
- 8 restored as they were in the original pictures. There was
- 9 one picture there where the railings were almost going to
- 10 be installed or they were being removed, but the pictures
- 11 show the existing railings on the French door on the
- 12 left-hand side of the elevation, the front elevation, and
- 13 also the same railings on the archway.
- 14 So those will all be new, all restored,
- 15 casement windows, raised muntins, so forth, no longer the
- 16 non-historical aluminum mill, aluminum windows that it
- 17 currently has throughout the property.
- 18 We've also, as I've learned to, through the
- 19 years, sat down with staff to really try to work out the
- 20 proportions on the muntins so it relates. I know how
- 21 important this is, and it's almost like a little pet peeve
- 22 that staff has about muntins and the proportions and so
- 23 forth, so that's something that that has been considered
- 24 throughout the elevations.
- There's a significant amount of flat tiles

- 1 and parapets, so we've continued that. The only thing
- 2 that we've minimized their detail. Where previously there
- 3 may have been in the original house banding, the new areas
- 4 have a smaller banding or just a sill projected out, a
- 5 stone sill, so it speaks to the architectural style but it
- 6 doesn't copy it. It doesn't try to make it any better or
- 7 anything. It just tries to blend in with it.
- 8 Okay. You see in the certain facades, the
- 9 two-part barrel tiles are being used throughout, but not
- 10 to the point where it becomes so much use of it that it's
- 11 going to overwhelm the existing.
- 12 Sometimes when you do these things, you say
- 13 "Oh, you know, let's use barrel tile," and it becomes that
- 14 the addition, it becomes more important than the
- 15 historical part, so that was one of the key elements:
- 16 When you use the barrel tile, don't use it where it
- 17 overpowers the existing.
- 18 "Oh, barrel tile is very significant in an
- 19 elevation, " it really tends to overpower, so in this case
- 20 it was just used as a token of a reflection of the past.
- 21 Some of the elevations there, again the use
- 22 of the muntins. We introduced some of the parapet, barrel
- 23 tiles on the parapet. Those are only being reintoduced or
- 24 kept in the existing portions but not in the new.
- 25 Therefore, you can distinguish, if it doesn't have barrel

1 tile on the parapet, chances are that it's a new portion.

- 2 It hasn't been mentioned, the original
- detached garage, currently it's not being used well in
- 4 today's lifestyle of living, so the bottom floor is kind
- 5 of being opened up. It opens up through almost like a
- 6 breezeway type of situation. Let me go back to that.
- 7 So as you see, the pair of French doors, so
- 8 that way it can talk to the new rear terrace back there
- 9 and to the left, and on the right it communicates with the
- 10 existing pool. As it stands right now, it's just a room,
- 11 so right now it's actually going to be used without really
- 12 interfering with its architecture to a great degree.
- So basically in a quick summary, we tried to
- 14 make sure that that little lonely house stays still little
- 15 and lonely, but it has some, some sort of proportions and
- 16 additions that enhance it, and I think in previous
- 17 editions, it's almost overwhelmed it, and now I think it's
- 18 kind of back to where its original intent was.
- 19 It's obviously originally a very small house,
- 20 two/two. You know, it just doesn't make any sense in
- 21 today's living and prices, to be honest, so we tried to
- 22 somehow make it work with the historical preservation
- 23 aspect of it and enhancing it with the additions in a
- 24 manner that works for the client and works for what, you
- 25 know, historical board standards would be and just

- 1 historical design. Thank you.
- 2 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you.
- MS. KAUTZ: We can go over staff comments
- 4 now, or do you want to do a public hearing first? It's up
- 5 to you.
- 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: It might be useful to hear
- 7 the staff comments first, I think.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Does everybody agree?
- MS. ROLANDO: Why don't you ask the architect
- 11 about which -- if he accepts staff recommendations, or are
- 12 there a few, are there any to which he objects?
- MS. KAUTZ: Did you read them?
- MR. POZA: Yes. No, I didn't have any
- 15 problems with them.
- 16 MS. KAUTZ: He's fine with them he says.
- 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 18 MS. KAUTZ: So if you can put the Power Point
- 19 back up where it was. Perfect. Okay. So the only -- I
- 20 just wanted to describe this to you and see if you guys
- 21 are okay with this.
- 22 So on the rear elevation, the existing
- 23 historic house is to your right on the middle, on the
- 24 middle elevation, so the part that's sort of shaded gray.
- 25 And typically we don't like window, you know,

- 1 openings to be altered significantly in the historic
- 2 portion. The rest of the house is retaining all of its
- 3 original openings and sizes, but on the back they're all
- 4 being proposed to be changed to these, these French doors
- 5 that line the whole back of the house, and then the one on
- 6 the right, which is the kitchen window, is being raised
- 7 up. They're all being enlarged up.
- If you look at the floor plan of that space,
- 9 it's one continuous room, so I have, had no suggestion on
- 10 how to make that look okay from an interior point of view
- 11 and still retain those openings.
- So I was sort of okay with it. I just wanted
- 13 to make sure you guys are too. I just couldn't, I
- 14 couldn't figure out how to make it work within that room
- 15 and not be awkward having windows that are different
- 16 heights, so I don't know if you want to address it or not.
- 17 We talked about it before too.
- MR. POZA: Yes. We've talked about it a lot.
- 19 It's very difficult to, you know, open up the house to the
- 20 rear yard and so forth and keep the same small windows
- 21 that it had, and there's almost, almost no way to do it.
- There's another thing that happens, if you
- 23 were to put other openings, the rear existing auxiliary
- 24 building is so close to the existing that what we tried to
- 25 do was to minimize the usage of doors and introduce some

1 fixed doors or windows so that we don't create more steps

- 2 and it becomes, be so much circulation and steps used up.
- 3 So what we tried to do was somehow work in
- 4 the proportion of the existing opening to the extent that
- 5 we could, working with the new, more open interior, and
- 6 we've tried to center -- if you see in the slide in the
- 7 bottom being the existing, there's a window there, it's
- 8 kind of rectangular, so the new doors or pair of doors on
- 9 the top which are actually fixed, they are center line
- 10 with what was there originally, so it's somewhat of the
- 11 same. It doesn't shift to the side. It still keeps that.
- 12 And likewise on the other two, there's two
- doors there and there's two doors again, so try to
- 14 somehow, as much as possible, if not using the center line
- 15 as a basis for the design, to make it work.
- 16 But we went back and forth on different
- options, and none of them seemed to really be the perfect
- 18 solution with the existing conditions.
- 19 MS. KAUTZ: I just wanted to bring it to your
- 20 attention only because we typically -- that's not
- 21 something that we do, and you know, we'd like them to be
- 22 either exist -- if you're going to do a French door, just
- 23 cut down, you know, cut down the window, but in this case,
- 24 you know, they're changing it a little bit, but I honestly
- 25 couldn't come up with any other solution to it, so in that

- 1 respect I'm okay with it.
- The only other condition that I wanted to add
- 3 after listening to ElizaBeth's presentation is that the
- 4 cracked tile floor on the porch is to remain when they
- 5 open it back up, so.
- 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Could you also provide
- 7 some clarification? He discussed the use of flat tiles at
- 8 the parapets where it was not the original 1920s
- 9 structure.
- 10 MS. KAUTZ: Right. It's not, it's not flat
- 11 tile. It's a stucco band, so right now there's, there's
- 12 tile coping all along the parapet of the existing house
- 13 and the 19 -- the later addition.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 15 MS. KAUTZ: And so he's taking off the tile
- 16 coping at the additions and doing a stucco band so that
- 17 only the house in that early 1920s photo where you can see
- 18 the tile coping will have it, so it sort of identifies the
- 19 existing original house through that coping. Everything
- 20 else is going to be a little bit different.
- 21 Same with the window sills, they're all going
- 22 to be a little bit different, the module of the window is
- 23 a little bit different, so they're trying to distinguish
- 24 the two.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: I see. Okay.

1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Kara, you mentioned in your

- 2 recommendations that the front door, if it's original, is
- 3 to remain. Do we know whether it's original?
- 4 MS. KAUTZ: Right. We didn't have a chance
- 5 to look at it. All of the observations we sort of made
- 6 were from the right of way, so we would like to
- 7 investigate it and see.
- 8 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Do you consider it to be
- 9 original?
- 10 MR. POZA: Yeah, it's really hard to tell. I
- 11 mean, maybe it's not "original original." It's certainly
- 12 not new. I don't know if it merits keeping or not.
- One thing that we did do is in the reclaiming
- 14 of the front porch, the front door is actually being
- 15 repositioned to where it originally was because it
- 16 actually moved inward.
- 17 MR. RODRIGUEZ: So now it will be in the
- 18 front?
- MR. POZA: So, yeah. The front door is
- 20 currently forward. It's actually moving back to where it
- 21 originally was.
- MS. KAUTZ: Yeah. There's a vestibule that
- 23 they sort of pushed it out to enclose the vestibule.
- 24 That's going to come back too.
- 25 But the front door should be a fairly easy

- 1 thing if we can go out and look at it to see if the
- 2 hardware is low and if it's the original hardware. It's
- 3 fairly easy to tell if it's an original door or not. We
- 4 can do that.
- 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: Can you tell me whether it
- 6 currently swings in or out?
- 7 MS. KAUTZ: In.
- 8 MR. POZA: It swings in.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: It swings in?
- 10 MR. POZA: Yeah.
- 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: When you move it back to the
- 12 original position, is there the possibility of engineering
- 13 it so that it will be an out-swing door, you know, for
- 14 hurricane purposes?
- 15 MR. POZA: Well, no. If it's, if they're
- 16 using the original door, they'll have to shutter it.
- 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, they'll shutter it,
- 18 okay.
- 19 MS. KAUTZ: You need, you need an NOA. It
- 20 needs to be a hurricane-rated door --
- MS. KAUTZ: Okay, yeah.
- MS. KAUTZ: -- to swing out. So if it is the
- 23 original door and we're going to move it back to where
- 24 it belongs, then they will have to shutter that opening --
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.

1 MS. KAUTZ: -- which is, it's also protected

- 2 within that vestibule, so.
- 3 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Thank you.
- 4 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I have a couple
- 5 observations. Question: There's like a new step. Is
- 6 that a new step being added to what you're giving back to
- 7 the porch, the original porch?

8

- 9 MS. KAUTZ: On the west side?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
- MR. POZA: Yes, back to the garden area.
- 12 Yes, those are new steps --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Okay.
- MR. POZA: -- to go down to that garden area,
- 15 and that garden area is somewhat enclosed --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Right.
- 17 MR. POZA: -- because otherwise it would be
- 18 too open with the thin wall, and it's not a really ornate
- 19 wall like it may have been done back then, but since it's
- 20 now new, it's a very simple curve and just basically makes
- 21 that a little more private garden.
- 22 MS. BACHE-WIIG: So there's no screen there?
- MR. POZA: There's screen throughout that
- 24 front porch.
- 25 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Okay, but how do you access

- 1 those steps? If there's no screen -- if there's a screen,
- 2 how do you access the steps?
- MS. KAUTZ: Are you going to screen the
- 4 porch, or are you going to leave it open?
- 5 MR. POZA: It's intended to be screened.
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: Okay. So then they'd have to put
- 7 some screen there.
- 8 MS. BACHE-WIIG: So it will have a screen.
- 9 MR. POZA: Yeah. It will have a little door.
- 10 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Okay.
- 11 MR. POZA: Only because if it's open -- I
- 12 mean, we really had to --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Well, I know, because AC.
- MR. POZA: -- we really had to work the
- 15 client over to give up --
- 16 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Sure, yeah, the security.
- 17 MR. POZA: -- AC area.
- 18 MS. BACHE-WIIG: And then I guess -- and this
- 19 is just an observation and I guess I have a guestion about
- 20 it.
- 21 So the existing auxiliary building, you know,
- 22 it made sense when, in the original plan because it was,
- 23 you know, it had access for a car to approach it, you
- 24 know, frontally. Through the iterations when you put an
- 25 addition in front of it creates like an awkward, you know,

- 1 space situation where you have essentially two buildings
- 2 -- what is it? -- not even, what, like seven, eight feet
- 3 apart, essentially.
- 4 So I guess my question is -- and this
- 5 auxiliary building has been modified, you know, many
- 6 times, so why wouldn't you just connect to that space from
- 7 the original residence and just create like one large
- 8 space? I'm just curious.
- 9 MR. POZA: The client really didn't require
- 10 that, and I don't know, I would have to look into the code
- 11 to see if then it's no longer an auxiliary building --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Correct.
- MR. POZA: -- and it may have a -- I may be
- 14 then modifying in a way that it might be a non-compliant
- 15 and as opposed to existing.
- 16 So I don't know if Mr. Fullerton may have
- 17 some insight on that, but.
- 18 MS. KAUTZ: I mean, they may have had -- you
- 19 know, if it's part of the house --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Right.
- MS. KAUTZ: -- because then it becomes part
- 22 of the elevation --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah. The elevation is
- 24 different.
- 25 MS. KAUTZ: -- then you have to raise the

- 1 floor up.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah.
- 3 MS. KAUTZ: Then you have to raise the
- 4 ceiling, and --
- 5 MR. POZA: And right at the time, which is,
- 6 you know -- years ago, it was a five-foot setback on the
- 7 rear. Now it's ten feet, so they say I touch it, now I
- 8 got to -- you know, I might have to then apply for a
- 9 variance. Who knows what could happen?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah.
- MR. FULLERTON: A VR maybe.
- MR. POZA: Yeah.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: It just, it creates such a
- 14 strange -- it continues the odd situation condition
- 15 between the primary residence and that auxiliary building,
- 16 I mean, it just, it does.
- 17 MR. POZA: Sure.
- MS. KAUTZ: We looked for any like, any
- 19 zoning comment, any, anything that allowed that to sort of
- 20 remain a guest house, an auxiliary structure that's not
- 21 attached when that addition was done; could not find
- 22 anything that even addressed making this non-conforming
- 23 building back there exist, so I think they're just trying
- 24 to leave it alone.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah.

- 1 MR. POZA: Yeah.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: I know, and I mean --
- MR. POZA: We don't know how it got there, so
- 4 we don't want to open that can.
- 5 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I know. I just, I'm sure
- 6 there's some way, some how to open the can and make it
- 7 beneficial, but hey, that's just --
- 8 MR. POZA: As long as it can be expedited
- 9 again.
- 10 MS. KAUTZ: Have you read the zoning code?
- 11 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I mean, yeah. I just, I
- 12 think you would -- it would benefit the residence, you
- 13 know, but anyways, and the pool, the pool remains the
- 14 same?
- MR. POZA: Yeah.
- 16 MS. BACHE-WIIG: There's no new pool design?
- MR. POZA: Nothing's changed.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Okay.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 20 MR. RODRIGUEZ: If we accept all the
- 21 recommendations, you're fine with it?
- MR. POZA: Yes.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 24 MS. ROLANDO: By the way, I love your plan
- 25 for the little house on the prairie. I think it's -- when

- 1 I saw the aerials, I was pretty shocked at that, how many
- 2 years that house stayed out there. I mean, it must have
- 3 been really lonesome and spooky living there.
- I only -- to follow up on Kara's comment with
- 5 regard to those windows on the proposed south elevation,
- 6 the ones that are, read as doors but are really windows,
- 7 that always makes me a little uncomfortable. It seems to
- 8 me they should be windows, or doors.
- 9 So I -- the only -- I'm going to vote for
- 10 your plan, so this is a mere suggestion, is consider
- 11 raising -- so that the windows, say, reads about a foot
- 12 above the floor rather than at floor level, because I
- 13 just, I -- you did a great job.
- MR. POZA: Thank you.
- 15 MS. ROLANDO: And I don't -- I hate second
- 16 guessing or making unsolicited comments.
- 17 MR. POZA: Well, I think as a token gesture
- 18 to what's there, it makes sense, but then again,
- 19 architecturally, you might say why is this one, one foot
- 20 short of all the others? So you might say, you know,
- 21 damned if you do, damned if you don't, and I think that
- the fact that it's on center, right now it doesn't compete
- 23 too much.
- 24 And then, you know, the next standard size
- 25 will make it about baseboard up from the floor, so it's

- 1 going to look more like a mistake --
- MS. ROLANDO: Okay.
- 3 MR. POZA: -- than anything else from an
- 4 architectural point of view.
- 5 MR. FULLERTON: I'll just add two cents'
- 6 worth of backing up what Peggy said, that I appreciate
- 7 your sensitivity to the question of the roof tiles and
- 8 additional use thereof, and I think using them
- 9 intelligently and with sensitivity to that possibility of
- 10 overwhelming the elevation is really well done.
- 11 And I think all in all you've done a nice job
- 12 of taking care of this little place, and we appreciate
- 13 that.
- MR. POZA: Thank you.
- 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. I presume there's
- 16 nobody else in the audience that wants to speak.
- MS. KAUTZ: There is.
- 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: There is?
- MS. KAUTZ: Uh-huh.
- 20 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you. Please state your
- 21 name and address.
- 22 MR. COOK: I'm Terry Cook. I live at 415
- 23 Garlenda, directly across the street. My living room
- 24 overlooks this property, and I'm thrilled to see what
- 25 we're looking at today. You know, you go into this and

1 when a property sells in Coral Gables or in any city, the

- 2 land is at a premium, so I'm thrilled to see what they're
- 3 doing and I'm in full support of it.
- 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Great. Thank you very much.
- 5 MS. EBBERT: And I want to say one thing.
- 6 There is one house around the corner that was built in
- 7 1926. I live at 6510 San Vicente, between --
- 8 MS. KAUTZ: State your name for the record.
- 9 MS. EBBERT: Oh, I'm Marlen Ebbert. I live
- 10 at 6510 San Vicente, and between Garlenda and Aurelia, and
- 11 the house next to me at 6500 was built in 1926, so there
- 12 were two of them, so they did have a neighbor, so.
- 13 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you. Okay, okay. So
- 14 this closes the public hearing portion of the case. We've
- 15 had ample discussion. Does anybody have any other
- 16 comments? Okay. Chair will entertain a motion.
- MS. ROLANDO: I move that we approve the
- 18 accelerated special --
- 19 MR. EHRENHAFT: Special certificate of
- 20 appropriateness.
- 21 MS. ROLANDO: Special certificate of
- 22 appropriateness with the conditions noted by staff plus
- 23 the crazed floor.
- MS. KAUTZ: Perfect.
- MS. ROLANDO: Thank you.

- 1 MR. EHRENHAFT: And when they're selecting
- 2 the final decisions on the windows and doors, they will
- 3 come to you and you'll approve it administratively.
- 4 MS. KAUTZ: Yes.
- 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: Is that correct?
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: Yes.
- 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you.
- 8 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I'll second the motion.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, okay. If there's no
- 10 other discussion, let's call the roll.
- 11 MS. KAUTZ: You want me to do it?
- MS. GUIN: Yes. Miss Bache-Wiig?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Mr. Durana?
- MR. DURANA: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Mr. Fullerton?
- MR. FULLERTON: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Mr. Rodriguez?
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Miss Rolando?
- MS. ROLANDO: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Mr. Ehrenhaft?
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes. Passes unanimously.
- 24 Thank you.
- 25 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I love this picture.

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: I'll wait for just a moment.

- 2 Okay. Kara, you set?
- MS. KAUTZ: Yes. Thanks.
- 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. So next on the agenda
- 5 is a special certificate of appropriateness, Case COA (SP)
- 6 2019-021, property at 4600 Brooker Street. This was an
- 7 item that was previously deferred, so it is under that COA
- 8 (SP) number.
- 9 It's an application for the issuance of a
- 10 special certificate of appropriateness for the property at
- 11 4600 Brooker Street, a vacant parcel within the MacFarlane
- 12 Homestead Subdivision Historic District, legally described
- 13 as Lot 24, Block 3-A, MacFarlane Homestead, according to
- 14 the plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book Five at Page 81
- of the public records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
- 16 The application requests design approval for
- 17 the construction of a new two-story residence.
- 18 MS. KAUTZ: Put the Power Point up, please.
- 19 Location map, this is MacFarlane Homestead Historic
- 20 District. The property is located on the corner of Oak
- 21 Avenue and Brooker Street.
- This parcel was included as a
- 23 non-contributing resource within the MacFarlane Homestead
- 24 Subdivision Historic District when it was established in
- 25 1989. At the time of designation, a one-story masonry

- 1 residence that is believed to have been built in the 1950s
- 2 was located on the property. In early 2017, the residence
- 3 located on the parcel was demolished. It was an unsafe
- 4 structure.
- 5 So this is for in-fill construction of the
- 6 two-story residence on the property, and no variances have
- 7 been requested as part of the application.
- 8 This is a context photo. You can see the row
- 9 of shotguns that line Brooker Street. This, the property
- 10 in question is directly beyond these four, these four
- 11 shotguns.
- 12 So the proposal was reviewed by the board of
- 13 architects on September 12th of last year with comments.
- 14 There are -- which were attached to the back of your
- 15 report. All of them were incorporated, changing the
- 16 carport roof to a hip roof, the design of the front door,
- 17 and suggesting the introduction of engaged pilasters at
- 18 the carport wall.
- 19 The only one that wasn't fully incorporated
- 20 was the window muntin that was requested by the board.
- 21 That was not shown on these drawing.
- I also wanted to point out that we required
- 23 that the applicant present the proposed residence to the
- 24 Lola B. Walker Homeowners Association prior to scheduling
- 25 a meeting in front of the board. It's a typical practice.

- 1 We do that with all construction projects within
- 2 MacFarlane.
- 3 They did review it on January 22nd and have
- 4 submitted a letter that they have no objection to the
- 5 project. That is part of your application as well.
- 6 We have some staff comments which I can
- 7 address at the end, and the architect will walk you
- 8 through the presentation.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you, Kara.
- 10 (Thereupon, Ms. Villabonna was duly sworn on oath.)
- 11 MS. VILLABONNA: My name is Paola Villabonna.
- 12 I represent -- I'm the owner's representative. I've been
- 13 working with the architect for the design of this house.
- 14 The owners lives in the area. He's a painter
- 15 and he's in love in the area, so we've been trying to work
- in this house for him to live there as a painter, yeah.
- 17 So basically based on the style of the area
- 18 and the shotgun houses in the area, we've tried to make a
- 19 proportional house with some interests to try to
- 20 proportion the height and to be more into, related to the
- 21 area.
- THE COURT REPORTER: Can you state your name
- 23 again, please?
- MS. VILLABONNA: Paula, P-A-U-L-A,
- 25 Villabonna, V-I-L-L-A-B-O-N-N-A.

- 1 He loved the area because of the Key West
- 2 style, so we integrate several elements of the Key West
- 3 style in the architecture, and it's very open, flowing
- 4 house in three rooms.
- 5 MR. MELENDEZ: It's new construction.
- 6 MR. RODRIGUEZ: You need to be up at the
- 7 mike.
- 8 MR. EHRENHAFT: You need to approach so they
- 9 can hear.
- MR. MELENDEZ: Yes.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: And could you state your name
- 12 again and your address?
- MR. MELENDEZ: Alejandro, Alejandro Melendez,
- 14 13818 Southwest 16 Terrace, Miami, Florida, 33175. I'm
- 15 the architect of record for the project.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you.
- 17 MR. MELENDEZ: Yes, sir. Thank you. Being
- 18 new construction, basically the only gauge that we had
- 19 developing the design was the context, obviously. The
- 20 previous home was demolished.
- 21 So most of the design work in tandem with the
- 22 historic preservation staff was done by Paula, and my
- 23 scope of work was the incorporation of those elements into
- 24 the drawings and make sure that they went through along
- 25 with tertiary details, secondary details that would also

1 further enhance the context with the remainder of the

- 2 subdivision, of the historic district.
- 3 So what seems to me like one of the big
- 4 challenges was how do we get these two stories down enough
- 5 and tight so that it can merge a little better with what
- 6 was happening around, and that was a lot of the back and
- 7 forth that we had with the board of architects.
- 8 As far as I understand, there are no
- 9 variances required or anything like that. No, we're fully
- 10 compliant with zoning regulation as it states for that
- 11 district, and it's just basically being the challenge of
- 12 going back and forth that Paula can speak a little bit
- 13 more to that.
- 14 MS. VILLABONNA: If you see the style of the
- 15 house has all the Key West elements.
- 16 MR. EHRENHAFT: Could you speak into the
- 17 microphone, please?
- MS. VILLABONNA: I'm sorry.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Thank you.
- 20 MS. VILLABONNA: The house is a very simple
- 21 Key West style. We tried again to do a proportional
- 22 height, not only at the entrance, but in the back of the
- 23 house so it relates to the area and to the shotgun houses
- 24 that are next to us.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: You said that a lot of back

1 and forth with the board of architects was the height, the

- 2 initial height that you had proposed?
- 3 MS. VILLABONNA: More or less with the
- 4 asymmetrical part, we have a little bit of a division. We
- 5 didn't have the entrance on center with both roofs, so
- 6 they were -- they wanted us to be very symmetrical on
- 7 center of everything in the house. That's why we actually
- 8 change it, so some details in the windows, but not major
- 9 things.
- 10 MR. MELENDEZ: Yeah, but the primary -- the
- 11 first couple of designs were considerably top-heavy at the
- 12 beginning, and we were able to squeeze the finished floors
- 13 down.
- MR. FULLERTON: Did you achieve that by
- 15 changing your roof pitches to be more in keeping with the
- 16 neighborhood?
- MR. MELENDEZ: That, that, and obviously also
- 18 trying to squeeze the interstitial, the interstitial
- 19 space, you know, the floor, joists, try to get it as tight
- 20 as possible and the roof as well.
- 21 MR. DURANA: What's the material that you're
- 22 using for the outside envelope? Is it just stucco, like
- 23 smooth stucco, or are you going to do any --
- MR. MELENDEZ: Stucco finish.
- MR. DURANA: And no sidings, planks or

- 1 anything?
- MS. VILLABONNA: No; smooth covering.
- 3 MR. MELENDEZ: Smooth stucco finish.
- 4 MR. FULLERTON: Did the architects board have
- 5 any comments about that? Because the neighborhood would
- 6 have a lot of wood siding, I would imagine.
- 7 MR. DURANA: Yeah, or at least stucco
- 8 simulated siding maybe.
- 9 MR. MELENDEZ: We had comments on the
- 10 structural columns on the terrace in the back and the
- 11 front porch. We were proposing at the beginning, I
- 12 believe it was --
- MS. VILLABONNA: Wood, just wood.
- MR. MELENDEZ: -- it was just wood, and we
- 15 did get comments on that as far as going to concrete,
- 16 going to concrete columns.
- 17 MR. FULLERTON: You did?
- MR. MELENDEZ: Yes.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: That was from the
- 20 neighborhood, or from the board of architects?
- MR. MELENDEZ: From the board.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- MR. MELENDEZ: The board, also a couple of
- 24 gable ends, I believe one of the sides was a hip in the
- 25 beginning, and then, you know, they moved us more to the

- 1 gable end in the back, in the rear.
- 2 MS. KAUTZ: This did go to the board of
- 3 architects quite a few times before it got to you all.
- 4 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Number one under the staff
- 5 conclusions is the recommendation that the proposed metal
- 6 roof not be painted. Are you accepting that condition?
- 7 MR. MELENDEZ: I'm sorry, can you say that
- 8 again?
- 9 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Under the staff conclusions,
- 10 the recommendations number one is that proposed metal roof
- 11 is not to be painted. Are you accepting that?
- MR. MELENDEZ: I don't know yet.
- MS. VILLABONNA: Yeah, that's fine.
- 14 MS. ROLANDO: Did the board of architects
- 15 comment at all along about the massing of the home or the
- 16 facade that's faced Brooker Street?
- 17 It seems like it's very out of scale with the
- 18 rest of the neighborhood. It's not so pronounced on the
- 19 elevation along Oak Street.
- 20 MR. MELENDEZ: We went back and forth with
- 21 that, yes, and at some point we had a larger rough opening
- 22 on the ground floor there.
- MS. ROLANDO: I'm sorry, could you speak a
- 24 little louder?
- 25 MR. MELENDEZ: Yes. We went, we went there a

- 1 couple of times.
- 2 At one point that gable end there in that
- 3 corner was not there. It was just a full gable roof -- I
- 4 mean a hip roof on that side, and we reverted back to the
- 5 gable end. Maybe that's what's bringing it up a little
- 6 bit on the top, the symmetrical look.
- 7 And then the other thing was on the ground
- 8 floor we had a rough opening, like a large glass sliding
- 9 door to break that up, but at some point --
- 10 MS. VILLABONNA: They didn't recommend.
- 11 MR. MELENDEZ: They didn't recommend. We
- 12 went back to this.
- MS. KAUTZ: Yeah. They didn't want it to
- 14 read as a secondary entrance on the -- because it's
- 15 platted to face Oak even though the address is on Brooker,
- 16 so they didn't want it to read as a separate entrance
- 17 feature.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Do you have a rendering like
- 19 looking at from Brooker? Yeah.
- 20 MS. ROLANDO: But it doesn't -- it's not
- 21 juxtaposed against the other homes on Brooker.
- MS. KAUTZ: There is a, there's a, there's a
- 23 street elevation.
- MS. ROLANDO: Yeah, I see the street
- 25 elevation.

- 1 MS. KAUTZ: Okay.
- MS. ROLANDO: It's on Sheet A Three.
- 3 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I think that balcony helps
- 4 on that side.
- 5 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes, it does.
- 6 MS. BACHE-WIIG: It breaks up that --
- 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
- 8 MS. BACHE-WIIG: -- volume nicely. I think
- 9 going back to some of the comments about the stucco, I
- 10 think it's just a lot of wall all of a sudden, you know,
- 11 and it's hitting you with concrete.
- 12 So you have the small, you know, contextual
- 13 historic homes that have the siding that's soft to the
- 14 eye, and then you have two-story mass with concrete. I
- 15 think it's why it maybe is clashing a little bit.
- MS. KAUTZ: There might be a way to introduce
- 17 stucco siding. They did that on the new houses --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah.
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.
- 20 MS. KAUTZ: -- that are further down the
- 21 street, like on the upper, just on the upper floor or
- 22 something, or all around, and do a band.
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Right.
- 24 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I think so, maybe a
- 25 continuation of that balcony happening on the top. I

1 think the balcony is great because it starts relating back

- 2 to that porch space that's happening along this area, so I
- 3 think --
- 4 MS. VILLABONNA: Do you see there that with
- 5 this one?
- 6 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah.
- 7 MS. VILLABONNA: So that's what we did with
- 8 the balcony for that area.
- 9 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I think when you start
- 10 introducing texture, scale, you start changing the scale
- 11 when you look at, you know, the overall of the elevation
- of the street, so I don't know, Kara, what you think.
- MS. KAUTZ: Yeah, I think, I think that's a
- 14 good suggestion. I think that's something that we had
- 15 brought up that maybe there was a chance to introduce a
- 16 little bit more.
- 17 So right now the fascia is just solid, so
- 18 maybe it's exposed rafter ends that's a little bit more
- 19 typical instead of just sort of a newer introduction of a
- 20 closed fascia, or perhaps a more vibrant color scheme than
- 21 gray and gray and white. You know, I like the idea of
- 22 continuing some sort of siding at least on a portion of it
- 23 to break it up.
- MR. DURANA: And the stucco siding, I mean,
- 25 it's not a huge number. I mean, like the outlookers might

- 1 be a little bit pricier because you have to use new cedar,
- 2 but the stucco siding, I mean, the stucco prices you're
- 3 going to get to go smooth in siding, especially just like
- 4 a band or something, it's not significant. It's not going
- 5 to, you know, break the budget, but that's just a
- 6 suggestion, but.
- 7 MR. FULLERTON: And you might just do
- 8 portions, I mean, of the whole facade. The conditions on
- 9 the outside of the main two-story pod, that area that
- 10 comes out on the south and on the north and on the east,
- 11 those elements could be possibly, with a more, a more, a
- 12 texture more in keeping with the existing.
- MS. KAUTZ: Do you mean the front, like the
- 14 front entry piece?
- 15 MR. FULLERTON: Yes, those elements that
- 16 project out from the main, the main box.
- 17 MR. DURANA: Yeah, like on the front porch,
- 18 I think, right? Is that what you're saying?
- MR. FULLERTON: Yes.
- 20 MR. DURANA: Just like that little section,
- 21 something like that I think would help.
- MS. KAUTZ: Maybe, maybe do this with the
- 23 band, you know, that breaks the corner, and then do -- the
- 24 only -- so the comment that I wanted to ask you all about,
- 25 so on the board of architects, the back of your staff

- 1 report, you can see it in red.
- They had asked for a single vertical muntin
- 3 to be added to the upper portion of the windows where
- 4 these are all clear glass, if that's something you want to
- 5 be incorporated. I would actually prefer it to be added,
- 6 if you guys --
- 7 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah, I like it. It makes
- 8 sense.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: So it would be just, the
- 10 vertical muntin would only be on the upper portion --
- 11 MS. KAUTZ: It's -- yeah. They asked --
- MR. EHRENHAFT: -- of each --
- MS. KAUTZ: -- for one, for one vertical on
- 14 the top so the bottom is clear, distinguishing it from the
- 15 upper portion.
- 16 MR. EHRENHAFT: That would happen on each
- 17 window throughout the structure?
- MS. KAUTZ: Uh-huh, uh-huh.
- 19 Ms. BACHE-WIIG: You know, it would make a
- 20 big difference.
- MS. KAUTZ: I think so.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah.
- MS. KAUTZ: Because typically the houses
- 24 there don't have, you know, divided lights all over, but
- 25 they do have -- it's a typical detail, so, and that's it.

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Would you be willing to

- 2 explore that suggestion with staff?
- 3 MS. KAUTZ: It's one of our conditions.
- 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Oh, so that is your
- 5 condition.
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: If you make it part of the
- 7 motion, then it's one of the conditions already.
- 8 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Thank you.
- 9 MS. KAUTZ: And on my, on my -- sorry. I'm
- 10 just finding this. On the staff recommendations, there's
- 11 a typo. It's supposed to be Sheet A 500 for Number
- 12 Four --
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Oh, okay.
- 14 MS. KAUTZ: -- not 300. I apologize. The
- 15 window schedule on 500 shows the previous ones. That just
- 16 needs to be coordinated.
- MS. ROLANDO: What sheet is it?
- 18 MS. KAUTZ: A 500 is the window schedule.
- 19 MS. ROLANDO: And the muntin that you are
- 20 requesting to be added, it corresponds to the vertical?
- 21 MS. KAUTZ: It's a single, it's a single
- 22 vertical that the board of architects has noted on their
- 23 drawings. You see it? I can ask for the horizontals,
- 24 yeah.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: On a 500, I see all of

- 1 horizontals, so.
- 2 MS. KAUTZ: Right. That's what was presented
- 3 to the board of architects.
- 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Right, okay. So you --
- 5 MS. KAUTZ: And they struck them out and
- 6 wanted just the single.
- 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 8 MS. KAUTZ: So I just need that to be
- 9 coordinated within the set.
- 10 MS. ROLANDO: So is it the board's
- 11 recommendation that the applicant have the vertical --
- 12 excuse me, horizontal --
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Stucco siding?
- MS. ROLANDO: Stucco siding on the portion of
- 15 the building that protrudes from the front elevation,
- 16 two-story elevation?
- MR. FULLERTON: That was a suggestion.
- 18 MS. ROLANDO: Well, I think we should
- 19 incorporate it into the conditions.
- 20 MR. FULLERTON: I guess on that elevation
- 21 right there, the two white elements on the --
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: On the first floor.
- MS. ROLANDO: So it would be --
- 24 MS. KAUTZ: On the back side and the front
- 25 side.

1 MR. FULLERTON: All the way around.

- 2 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.
- 3 MS. ROLANDO: Okay, and then the size of the
- 4 stucco siding would be left up to the applicant to
- 5 coordinate with the staff?
- 6 MR. DURANA: Or the board of architects or
- 7 staff, yeah, whatever.
- MS. KAUTZ: Okay. Well, so that becomes a
- 9 bit problematic because there's no step-back on the other
- 10 side of the rear. You don't have that? You want to get
- 11 it?
- 12 MS. VILLABONNA: We have an elevation.
- MS. KAUTZ: It's a flush facade, so where do
- 14 you end it?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Where do you end it?
- MS. ROLANDO: Oh, okay. So it wouldn't wrap.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: We could just end it --
- 18 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I was looking at that.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: I mean --
- 20 MR. FULLERTON: If you could make a four or
- 21 an or eight-inch recess out of that --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah.
- MR. FULLERTON: -- intersection, it would be
- 24 nice.
- 25 MS. KAUTZ: Yeah. Can you put the Power

1 Point back up, I'm sorry, please? Yeah, that's where the

- 2 stair is.
- MS. ROLANDO: So the siding, the siding would
- 4 dead end in the two-story volume?
- 5 MR. FULLERTON: No; only the one story.
- 6 MR. DURANA: Brooker Street. Hang on. The
- 7 Brooker Street, all right, you would need -- that part
- 8 sticks out, but on the other side.
- 9 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes. Well --
- 10 MS. ROLANDO: Can you just describe in a
- 11 little more detail what you're thinking about, Alicia,
- 12 Jose?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah. I think if you look
- on the floor plan on the Brooker side, what we're saying
- 15 is the two volumes on either side --
- MS. ROLANDO: Where they meet?
- 17 MS. BACHE-WIIG: -- are recessed back. You
- 18 know, we're trying figure out how to end the texture, so
- 19 does it end on that plane and it does not wrap, or does it
- 20 turn and wrap?
- 21 MS. ROLANDO: Doesn't it make sense for it to
- 22 turn and wrap and then dead-end in the two story --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah. Well --
- 24 MS. ROLANDO: -- where the two story and the
- 25 one story join?

1 MR. FULLERTON: At this point right here,

- 2 could you just do a small push-back?
- 3 MR. MELENDEZ: Sure.
- 4 MR. FULLERTON: And then you could engage --
- 5 MR. MELENDEZ: And then we can can start from
- 6 there.
- 7 MR. FULLERTON: Yes. You already have a
- 8 set-back here, don't you, from the porch, right?
- 9 MS. KAUTZ: John --
- 10 MR. MELENDEZ: Right.
- 11 MS. KAUTZ: -- John, John --
- MR. FULLERTON: Sorry.
- MS. KAUTZ: -- you need to show everybody
- 14 what you're doing, so take the Power Point down, please,
- 15 because on the other side is where the stair runs that
- 16 whole -- so you can't recess that side. I get what you're
- 17 trying to do, but you can't push a recess on here.
- 18 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I bet he can, I bet he can.
- MS. ROLANDO: What sheet should we be
- 20 looking at --
- MS. KAUTZ: I don't know.
- MS. ROLANDO: -- to best understand?
- 23 MR. FULLERTON: It was on 3 -- A 30, 3.01.
- MS. ROLANDO: Okay.
- 25 MR. FULLERTON: And the top elevation, just

- 1 continue a line straight down from the two-story element
- 2 that's gray on the drawings and go straight down to the
- 3 ground with just a small recess so that you can --
- 4 MR. DURANA: Yeah, vertical.
- 5 MR. FULLERTON: -- so that you can, yeah, so
- 6 you can just --
- 7 MS. BaCHE-WIIG: Yeah.
- 8 MR. FULLERTON: Can you see that?
- 9 MR. DURANA: You can probably go vertical,
- 10 stucco back.
- 11 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah. I would go vertical.
- MS. ROLANDO: Oh, yeah.
- MR. DURANA: Like a vertical --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Right here, right here and
- 15 right here.
- 16 MR. FULLERTON: This is already recessed.
- 17 MS. BACHE-WIIG: This is your set-back.
- 18 MR. FULLERTON: There wasn't a line here.
- 19 MS. KAUTZ: Wait. You only get -- wait.
- 20 Only one conversation.
- 21 MS. ROLANDO: Right, got it. So what would
- 22 you do, strike a line from top to bottom here?
- MR. FULLERTON: No, no. They would just
- 24 recess this wall --
- MS. ROLANDO: Oh, like --

1 MR. FULLERTON: -- four inches if it doesn't

- 2 engage -- screw up your floor plan.
- 3 MR. MELENDEZ: A little bit.
- 4 MR. FULLERTON: You can make it, you can make
- 5 it work.
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: Can you just show me?
- 7 MS. ROLANDO: Yes.
- 8 MR. FULLERTON: I'll sign this if you want,
- 9 sign and seal it.
- 10 MR. DURANA: So basically the front porch,
- 11 you're saying --
- MR. FULLERTON: Yeah.
- MR. DURANA: -- just take four inches, shave
- 14 it back.
- MR. FULLERTON: Yeah.
- MR. DURANA: If anything, you can take it off
- 17 on both sides.
- 18 MR. FULLERTON: This is already recessed
- 19 here.
- 20 MS. KAUTZ: So this is the front porch --
- MR. FULLERTON: Right.
- 22 MS. KAUTZ: -- on this side, which I get
- 23 because there's a little -- you can do that there, but on
- 24 this side, if you, if you wrap it around the back
- 25 underneath the carport, where do you end it on the back

- 1 side because there's no volume?
- 2 MR. FULLERTON: Oh, wait. I thought there
- 3 was --
- 4 MR. DURANA: I think that's open air.
- 5 MS. KAUTZ: It's an open-air carport.
- 6 MR. MELENDEZ: It was enclosed at one time.
- 7 MR. FULLERTON: Oh, there's a line back
- 8 there. There's a wall back there of some sort.
- 9 MR. DURANA: She's saying over here now.
- 10 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I know, and do the same
- 11 here.
- MR. FULLERTON: Okay. Well, I guess you
- 13 can't do it on the carport side.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Sorry.
- 15 MR. FULLERTON: So if that's just open there,
- 16 I think it -- you just don't do anything yet.
- MS. KAUTZ: You mean you wrap it through the
- 18 carport and end on the corner?
- MR. FULLERTON: No, no.
- 20 MS. KAUTZ: Or just that one side?
- 21 MR. FULLERTON: Just the one side I guess.
- 22 I'm sorry. I --
- MS. KAUTZ: Sorry.
- 24 MR. MELENDEZ: There are a couple of
- 25 structural columns right on that wall. We can wrap it

- 1 around and then let it die on the third column.
- MS. KAUTZ: Of the carport?
- 3 MR. MELENDEZ: Of the carport.
- 4 MR. FULLERTON: Well, I think the architect
- 5 has an idea ---
- 6 Mr. MELENDEZ: Yeah.
- 7 MR. FULLERTON: -- of how to maybe --
- 8 Mr. MELENDEZ: Yes.
- 9 MR. FULLERTON: -- make this happen.
- 10 MR. MELENDEZ: I do.
- 11 MR. FULLERTON: I'd like to leave it up to
- 12 him.
- MR. MELENDEZ: Sure.
- MR. FULLERTON: And make sure that it goes to
- 15 you.
- 16 MR. EHRENHAFT: So is the suggestion that
- 17 that would be replicated on other facades where possible?
- 18 MR. FULLERTON: Wherever possible. I think
- 19 you should make some decisions about it.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 21 MR. MELENDEZ: It needs it. It needs to get
- 22 broken up. There's a lot. It's an ocean of stucco.
- MR. FULLERTON: Now, if you have to go back
- 24 to the architect boards with that, they might say, "Oh, we
- 25 can't have simulated wood siding out of stucco."

1 MS. KAUTZ: They've done that in MacFarlane

- 2 in the past.
- 3 MR. FULLERTON: Oh, they have?
- 4 MS. KAUTZ: There were three new in-fill
- 5 construction that was done ten years ago that they had it
- 6 on the fronts, underneath the roof, they did an upper
- 7 portion that was stucco.
- 8 MR. FULLERTON: Oh, okay. That's good.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. Any further
- 10 discussion?
- 11 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Ali, what about if you did,
- on the column of the balcony, if you just kind of brought
- 13 that down? You know what I mean?
- MS. KAUTZ: To make a corner?
- 15 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah, to make a corner. You
- 16 can catch it and end it there. You don't have to turn.
- 17 It looks like that column goes beyond the wall.
- 18 MS. KAUTZ: Like this, like bring it down a
- 19 little bit? And then do --
- 20 MR. EHRENHAFT: Which drawing are you looking
- 21 at, Alicia?
- MS. BACHE WIIG: A 2.0.
- MS. KAUTZ: Yeah. It makes a trim, to make
- 24 it a trim piece.
- 25 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Continue the trim.

1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: So you don't have to turn.

- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Sorry.
- MS. KAUTZ: Do you want it back up? Can you
- 4 put the Power Point back up again? Thank you.
- 5 And then you could also do the same thing
- 6 here so it doesn't look like a mistake, do those two
- 7 corners so that dives it into something if they add that
- 8 same trim piece in the front --
- 9 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
- 10 MS. KAUTZ: -- so that it makes the corners.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Makes the corner.
- MS. KAUTZ: Yes, makes sense.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. So chair will
- 14 entertain a motion, and -- excuse me. Would you like to
- 15 speak?
- 16 MS. KAUTZ: Public hearing, you have to do
- 17 it.
- 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. All right. Nobody
- 19 else wishes to speak to it? Okay. Sorry. So chair will
- 20 entertain a motion, and then we can try to carefully
- 21 articulate the changes.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Okay. I propose to approve
- 23 the item including staff's comments and to include I guess
- 24 exploring a new color pallet, Kara. Did we talk about
- 25 that?

1 MS. KAUTZ: We didn't, but you can certainly

- 2 introduce it.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Okay, with staff, and also
- 4 to incorporate a concrete siding texture --
- 5 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Stucco.
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: Stucco.
- 7 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Stucco siding to the side on
- 8 Brooker Street and to end that siding with some kind of a
- 9 corner detail that's a continuation of the column above on
- 10 the terrace and simulate the same condition on the other
- 11 side.
- 12 MS. ROLANDO: And the vertical muntin on the
- 13 second floor windows.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: And the vertical muntin on
- 15 the second floor windows per the attached exhibit.
- MS. ROLAND: Second.
- 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. If there's no further
- 18 discussion, may we call the roll, please?
- MS. GUIN: Miss Bache-Wiig?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Mr. Durana?
- MR. DURANA: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Mr. Fullerton?
- MR. FULLERTON: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Mr. Rodriguez?

- 1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Miss Rolando?
- 3 MS. ROLAND: Yes.
- 4 MS. GUIN: Mr. Ehrenhaft?
- 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes. Motion passes
- 6 unanimously.
- 7 MR. DURANA: Do you mind if we take a
- 8 five-minute recess real quick?
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes, Certainly. We'll
- 10 recess. Please try to come back at five minutes to six,
- 11 please.
- 12 (Thereupon, a brief recess.)
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. We will reconvene the
- 14 meeting. It's starting at 5:56 p.m., we're reconvening.
- 15 The final item on the agenda is a standard
- 16 certificate of appropriateness. It is for Case File COA
- 17 (SP) 2020-015 for the property located at 43 Sidonia
- 18 Avenue.
- 19 This is an application for issuance of a
- 20 standard certificate of appropriateness for the property
- 21 at 43 Sidonia Avenue, a local historic landmark legally
- 22 described as Lot 23, Block 23, Coral Gables Douglas
- 23 section, according to the plat thereof as recorded in Plat
- 24 Book 25, Page Six, of the public records of Miami-Dade
- 25 County, Florida.

1 The applicant is requesting design approval

- 2 for the installation of impact windows and doors.
- I recall this is a property that we had in
- 4 December 2017 for historic designation.
- 5 MS. KAUTZ: Sounds right, sounds about right.
- 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 7 MS. KAUTZ: This one and the neighboring
- 8 property.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
- MS. KAUTZ: They're twins --
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
- MS. KAUTZ: -- that share a common courtyard.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Oh, yes, okay.
- MS. KAUTZ: Put the Power Point up, please.
- 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes, okay. That's fine.
- 16 MS. KAUTZ: So this is the location. It's in
- 17 north Ponce. You can see 43 on the left and 39, which is
- 18 its twin, to the right.
- 19 We don't actually have a 1940s photo of 43,
- 20 but it looked just like this, so this is the picture that
- 21 we have of this property.
- You can see it had casement windows. Each of
- 23 the corners that you see with the balconettes were deep
- 24 porches, all screened so there were no windows on any of
- 25 the corners.

1 These are the original drawings, Frank Wyatt

- 2 Woods. This is the two buildings at the time of
- 3 designation. You can see that it has awning windows now
- 4 on both properties. They are owned separately, not the
- 5 same owner for both properties, and this is the building.
- 6 So the application comes to you, it's a
- 7 standard certificate so we don't do a whole staff report
- 8 for it. It is brought to you all, they're replacing --
- 9 they want to replace these awning units with impact
- 10 resistant units, but they are a combination of horizontal
- 11 rollers and casement windows and fixed windows.
- 12 Because we require, we as staff at the
- 13 direction of the board require the windows to go back to
- 14 what they would have been originally, would have been all
- 15 casements, we were not comfortable signing off on this
- 16 project, which is why it's coming before you all rather
- 17 than just, you know, if I deny signing off on it, they
- 18 have the option to come to you all for your input too.
- 19 So the applicant is here. I'm going to let
- 20 him explain their project to you.
- 21 MR. AVILA: Hello, everyone. Javier Avila,
- 22 at 343 Majorca. I'm here for 43 Sidonia.
- 23 So we sat with Kara and Carlos, and what we
- 24 had discussed was to be --
- 25 MS. KAUTZ: The city architect.

- 1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
- MR. AVILA: What we had discussed was to do,
- 3 of course, the entire south and east facade of the
- 4 building, which is everything that you can see from the
- 5 actual street, to be casements. Those large openings that
- 6 you see there, those used to be in-swing doors which we
- 7 cannot do any, any from the original, the old picture.
- 8 So what we're doing is, is we're breaking it
- 9 down into casements and fixed casements in the bottom to
- 10 give it that, that separation that it had before.
- 11 All right. So if you look at, in the bottom,
- 12 so we're going to do a fixed casement, two fixed casements
- in the bottom, individual fixed casements, and then
- 14 casements on top to give it that same look and feel that
- 15 it had before, because there's no other way, you know, to
- 16 accomplish that.
- 17 Along the side of the building which is the
- 18 west side and the north side, on that side we had to put a
- 19 couple windows there that had to be horizontal rollers
- 20 because they have to meet egress, and we couldn't, we
- 21 couldn't make a casement 56 inch, 50 something inches
- 22 wide. There's no capability for that, so we are obligated
- 23 to put horizontal rollers on some windows on the west side
- 24 and some windows on the north side.
- 25 So what I suggested, you know, for to make

- 1 everything look the same was to just, any window that's
- 2 along that elevation on the side and on the back, was to
- 3 leave everything as horizontal rollers.
- 4 None of those elevations can actually be seen
- 5 from the street. If you go back to some of the pictures
- 6 that we have in the slides, you're going to see you can't
- 7 even see those from anywhere near the street, and in the
- 8 back of the building, there's another building covering,
- 9 covering the back side. Bless you.
- 10 MS. ROLANDO: May I ask why the window over
- 11 the entrance is not being addressed?
- MS. KAUTZ: Well, I mean, I can show you in
- 13 this picture. So it's got a very decorative sort of
- 14 scalloped top to it.
- MS. ROLANDO: Yes.
- 16 MS. KAUTZ: It was originally a pair of
- 17 casements which no one can do an operable arched top
- 18 casement, much less the scalloped top; similar situation
- 19 down below where it was just a screened opening.
- 20 So if you can see in these pictures, the top
- 21 wood frame is still there. They just don't have a
- 22 solution to do it without making that opening a different
- 23 shape. Correct?
- MR. AVILA: Correct.
- MR. FULLERTON: Well, they can leave the

1 opening exactly as it is and put a header across at the

- 2 bottom of the detail and make those casements.
- 3 MS. ROLANDO: Yeah.
- 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Just make them rectangular.
- 5 MR. AVILA: We talked about doing that,
- 6 Carlos and I, we discussed that in the detail. The
- 7 problem is that it's going to fall apart, yeah. It's, if
- 8 you were able to see the condition that that's in, it's
- 9 rotten.
- MS. ROLANDO: Yes, but if we're talking about
- 11 completely replacing all of the windows with -- except
- 12 that one with impact glass compliant windows, you know,
- 13 it's like that's not exactly a pinprick. It's a big
- 14 entrance and it's by the staircase.
- 15 MR. AVILA: There's -- we've contacted CGI,
- 16 PGT, Echo, SIW, ES Windows. We've contacted all the top
- 17 manufacturers. Nobody can make that window with that
- 18 small little cuts that it has in the design.
- 19 MS. ROLANDO: Yes, I totally get that, that
- 20 there's not the artisans available to do that, but
- 21 couldn't you make that fixed glass and then do compliant
- 22 window below that detail, preserve the detail? You know,
- 23 carpenters can make that.
- 24 MR. AVILA: That's what I was explaining,
- 25 that when Carlos and I were going over it, when -- if we

- 1 were to take out the bottom part, the bottom part of the
- 2 window, there is a very high probability that the, that
- 3 weird shape that you see there is going to get messed up
- 4 because it's old. It's rotten. It's made out of wood.
- I mean, I've got a picture here that I can
- 6 show you guys of some of the windows. You just put your
- 7 finger --
- MR. FULLERTON: Well, that's not that a
- 9 stucco detail -- or I mean a concrete detail or form?
- 10 MR. AVILA: So it's like a little concrete
- 11 design, so I mean, one of the options that we had
- 12 suggested was, was to just make it kind of look like the
- 13 bottom part. You see the door that it has like it's
- 14 called a fan, was just to round it off so it would match
- 15 that.
- But that would literally, to be honest with
- 17 you, it's like I agree with Kara, that would just kind of
- 18 kill the look of the, you know, of the building.
- 19 MR. FULLERTON: Couldn't it be just all fixed
- 20 glass and forget the opening and all, just put a vertical
- 21 mullion in the middle and do the frame?
- MS. KAUTZ: It's the "this" that's the
- 23 problem, though.
- MR. FULLERTON: Yeah, but --
- MS. KAUTZ: I don't know, I mean.

Page 81 MR. RODRIGUEZ: That can't be fixed? 1 2 MR. FULLERTON: Make a template. 3 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Can't we do that wood --4 MS. ROLANDO: It's not impossible. 5 MR. RODRIGUEZ: -- that wood siding? MR. AVILA: That, I don't even know where to 6 find that window, that's how old it is. 8 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, but a carpenter can do it. 9 10 MS. ROLANDO: Carpenters do --11 MR. RODRIGUEZ: You make a template of what's 12 there now. 13 MS. ROLANDO: Yeah. 14 MR. RODRIGUEZ: And a carpenter could do, you 15 know, could do it. 16 MR. DURANA: We, over at 711 University, she 17 has like a little breezeway, like the balcony, and there we did like an interior frame, like either -- I think we 18 were allowed to do it out of wood or steel, and then you 19 set the window back and you can still keep that. You 20 21 know, you eliminate the glass and you just keep the wood 22 decorative, and then you got --23 MS. KAUTZ: Oh, that's right, in the back 24 portion.

MR. DURANA: Yeah, we did it like on the back

25

- 1 of it.
- 2 MR. AVILA: Explain that, explain that to me
- 3 again.
- 4 MS. KAUTZ: You build a frame inside.
- 5 MR. DURANA: Like a frame on the inside,
- 6 assuming that's --
- 7 MR. AVILA: Something that's not impact, I'm
- 8 assuming, right?
- 9 MS. KAUTZ: No.
- MR. DURANA: No, no, no. The window will be
- 11 impact. What you do is you get like a four-by-four post,
- 12 wood post or whatever the construction engineer would
- 13 approve. You Tapcon, or you know, bolt into the wall.
- MR. AVILA: Right.
- 15 MR. DURANA: And then you set, you set just a
- 16 fixed glass panel there, and then you just eliminate what
- 17 the old, you know, the old glass or whatever and you just
- 18 leave the opening there, so you're kind of pressed up
- 19 against -- you create like another envelope on the back
- 20 side. Does that make sense, or?
- 21 MS. ROLANDO: Is it like a sandwich, so to
- 22 speak?
- MR. DURANA: Kind of, yeah, like the window,
- the new window would be sandwiched up against the
- 25 exterior, you know, the exterior wall but on the inside.

- 1 I don't know if I can --
- MS. KAUTZ: It makes sense. I get it.
- 3 MR. EHRENHAFT: But then the wood moulding
- 4 that gives the detail --
- 5 MR. DURANA: Stays there.
- 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- would have to be
- 7 replicated by --
- 8 MS. KAUTZ: No. It just --
- 9 MR. DURANA: You either replicate it or it
- 10 stays there.
- MS. KAUTZ: Or it just stays there.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: You have to replicate it with
- 13 a carpenter.
- MR. DURANA: On the back side.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: And then the carpenter has
- 16 to --
- 17 MR. AVILA: It has to be hung --
- 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- do it in manner that's --
- 19 MR. AVILA: -- and you get that impact on the
- 20 back side of that weird --
- 21 MR. DURANA: Because you got to go above it,
- 22 so on the inside it may look a little funky. You know,
- 23 you'll see the glass, a rectangular piece, and you have
- 24 that scallop shape.
- 25 MR. AVILA: So basically I'm going to have

- 1 the glass, what you're saying is I'll have the
- 2 glass over --
- 3 MR. DURANA: Arched over the opening.
- 4 MR. AVILA: -- the drywall.
- 5 MR. DURANA: Yes.
- 6 MR. AVILA: So try to create like an
- 7 interior, some kind of interior structure that connects to
- 8 the structure of the building, but then I would do like,
- 9 let's call it a superficial interior installation.
- MR. DURANA: Yes.
- MR. FULLERTON: Yes.
- MR. AVILA: Okay. I mean --
- MR. DURANA: It's something to --
- MR. AVILA: -- I can figure something like
- 15 that out.
- MS. ROLANDO: You know, though, there are
- 17 carpenters and very skilled carpenters in this town who
- 18 can replicate that.
- 19 MR. FULLERTON: Well, metal workers too, I
- 20 mean.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Exactly.
- 22 MR. AVILA: I don't have any doubts that
- 23 somebody can replicate the frame, zero doubt whatsoever.
- 24 It's cutting the glass. Do you understand?
- MS. ROLANDO: Yes.

- 1 MR. AVILA: That's the problem --
- 2 MR. DURANA: Yeah. You have to go either
- 3 larger or smaller.
- 4 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Exactly.
- 5 MR. AVILA: -- that we can't -- I've called
- 6 Cardinal. Cardinal is the largest glass manufacturer in
- 7 this industry, and they themselves said that they can't.
- 8 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Because it's high-impact
- 9 glass?
- 10 MR. AVILA: Because it's high-impact glass,
- 11 correct.
- MS. KAUTZ: I mean, if you're leaving it
- 13 alone -- which we can't make someone change their windows.
- 14 If they want to leave it like that, we designated it like
- 15 that, I can't make them change it.
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: But they could change --
- MS. KAUTZ: But if it's not protected now and
- 18 you wanted to build something to make it look like it did
- 19 before and put a shutter on it to protect it --
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
- 21 MS. KAUTZ: -- at least it looks pretty and
- 22 you're doing the same thing.
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
- MS. KAUTZ: Does that make sense?
- 25 MS. ROLANDO: Actually that makes sense.

1 MS. KAUTZ: But we can't require, we can't

- 2 require, we can't require them to do that.
- 3 MR. FULLERTON: So all the rest of the
- 4 windows in the building will be protected. That one will
- 5 just need a shutter.
- 6 MR. AVILA: Correct.
- 7 MR. DURANA: Problem solved.
- 8 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Is there a need, is there a
- 9 need for ventilation that that would be a functioning
- 10 window?
- 11 MR. AVILA: No, sir. That's just a common
- 12 area, so it could, it could be closed.
- MS. ROLANDO: So it could be easily fixed,
- 14 fixed glass.
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.
- MR. FULLERTON: Yeah.
- MS. KAUTZ: If you all are leaning toward the
- 18 horizontal roller windows which are going to be infinitely
- 19 less expensive than the casements, then they could
- 20 potentially do that, do that window out of wood and have
- 21 someone build it, in my view.
- MS. ROLANDO: Yes.
- MS. KAUTZ: You know, it's a thing.
- 24 MR. FULLERTON: I think if we can get all the
- 25 front windows that we can see from the street and the

1 courtyard and all that, if we can get those changed to

- 2 casement.
- 3 MS. KAUTZ: That's what they're proposing.
- 4 MR. FULLERTON: Right.
- 5 MR. AVILA: Yeah. That's exactly what
- б we're --
- 7 MR. FULLERTON: I think you've got a long
- 8 way --
- 9 MR. AVILA: I think we've got a long way --
- 10 MR. FULLERTON: -- to help that building
- 11 because this is what it should look like, right here.
- MS. ROLANDO: Yeah.
- 13 MR. AVILA: Try to get it as close to that as
- 14 possible.
- MR. FULLERTON: I know, I know.
- MS. ROLANDO: And John, he wants the car,
- 17 too, in the photo.
- 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: Can you tell me how much
- 19 recess there is in the window? Is there -- is it set
- 20 into --
- MR. AVILA: It's got the standard, I want to
- 22 say maybe about, let's say it's got like three inches.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Only three?
- 24 MR. AVILA: Yeah. It's very -- it's tiny.
- 25 MR. EHRENHAFT: Because I was thinking

1 because there are the fabric applications for hurricane

- 2 protection that are instead of -- you know, the waffle
- 3 part --
- 4 MR. AVILA: Right.
- 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- panels that you could
- 6 investigate whether one of the fabric covers, coverings on
- 7 that might --
- 8 MR. FULLERTON: I think they have to be
- 9 further from the wall, the glass, because they can --
- 10 MR. EHRENHAFT: I think -- yeah, that's what
- 11 I was going to say.
- MR. FULLERTON: -- because they can --
- MR. EHRENHAFT: They, I think they need like
- 14 maybe --
- 15 MR. FULLERTON: A foot or something.
- MS. KAUTZ: Yeah. They don't, they don't
- 17 anchor, they don't anchor in this way.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Yeah.
- 19 MS. KAUTZ: They're anchored to the facade.
- 20 They don't anchor in, they don't anchor in like --
- 21 MR. AVILA: I think The Collection --
- MR. EHRENHAFT: They're anchored to the
- 23 exterior.
- 24 MR. FULLERTON: Yeah, like The Collection.
- 25 MR. AVILA: The Collection uses that.

1 MR. FULLERTON: Yeah, but they're like three

- 2 feet from the glass.
- 3 MR. AVILA: Yeah, yeah, The Collection uses
- 4 that.
- 5 MR. EHRENHAFT: But this would be relatively
- 6 small so it would be less open. I don't know. It depends
- 7 on how deep it is, I guess.
- 8 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I have a question.
- 9 MS. KAUTZ: Go ahead.
- 10 MS. BACHE-WIIG: So the original has no --
- 11 just four lights at the porch?
- MS. KAUTZ: Right. So those, if you look at
- 13 the plan, they were, they were square porches. There were
- 14 no windows there. There were just screens. There were
- 15 in-swinging screen doors.
- 16 MS. BACHE-WIIG: And then on the proposed,
- 17 you have all these muntins.
- 18 MR. AVILA: If you look, if you zoom in kind
- 19 of --
- MR. FULLERTON: Yeah, yeah.
- 21 MR. AVILA: -- trust me, if you zoom in
- 22 carefully, that's actually a screen that's covering -- you
- 23 can't see the muntins that were on the door.
- MR. FULLERTON: Right, right.
- MR. AVILA: But they're there, like I

1 literally opened it up on a big computer and zoomed it in

- 2 to count the number of squares that it had.
- 3 MR. FULLERTON: Yeah, you can see it.
- 4 MR. AVILA: Yeah.
- 5 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Okay, the screen.
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: I don't actually think that's the
- 7 case.
- 8 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I think those are just the
- 9 windows in the back.
- 10 MS. KAUTZ: I think the thing there --
- 11 because you can't, but you can't swing those screen doors
- 12 out. Because of the way that the balcony is --
- MR. FULLERTON: No, I know.
- 14 MS. KAUTZ: -- those screen doors have to
- 15 swing in.
- 16 MR. FULLERTON: No, I know. It's just that's
- 17 the way it looks --
- 18 MS. KAUTZ: So I don't think there's a window
- 19 beyond. I mean -- right, but if you look at this, see
- 20 this, there's one in-swing, so that's the screen door,
- 21 because those can't swing out because they will hit this.
- MR. AVILA: Right, right.
- THE COURT REPORTER: I can't hear you.
- MS. KAUTZ: Sorry.
- 25 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I think what you're looking

- 1 at is the windows and the doors on the inside beyond.
- 2 MR. AVILA: Right. I'm looking past the
- 3 screen. I'm not looking at the screen.
- 4 MR. FULLERTON: Yes, right.
- 5 MR. AVILA: I'm looking at the door behind
- 6 the screen.
- 7 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Right, but that's not what
- 8 is happening on the facade, so.
- 9 MS. KAUTZ: Right.
- 10 MR. FULLERTON: No, but those doors may not
- 11 even open. The doors behind them open --
- Ms. BACHE-WIIG: Right.
- 13 MR. FULLERTON: -- because what if the
- 14 air-conditioning? So they just open and revealed --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: right --
- 16 MR. FULLERTON: -- a screen protection of
- 17 that opening, and I believe the muntins look like they're
- 18 there, that's what I'm seeing, but anyway, I don't know.
- 19 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Well, I don't see it.
- 20 MR. AVILA: It was, it was -- I looked at it
- 21 and I thought that I saw them and I had my, the engineer
- 22 look at it as well, and I think he said that he saw them
- 23 as well, and I think that's what we spoke about with Kara
- 24 and Carlos.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: I think what you're seeing

- 1 here is the door open.
- 2 MR. AVILA: Let me look.
- 3 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I think the doors actually
- 4 open.
- 5 MR. FULLERTON: I don't think the screen
- 6 doors were meant to open necessarily. I think they were
- 7 meant to --
- 8 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Not the screen doors but the
- 9 doors --
- 10 MR. RODRIGUEZ: The interior doors.
- MR. AVILA: Behind those.
- 12 Ms. BACHE-WIIG: The interior doors.
- MR. AVILA: They open out.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: I think what he's seeing --
- 15 MR. AVILA: They open in, these lines here.
- 16 You see these lines, see that, those lines that go across?
- 17 MR. FULLERTON: Yeah.
- 18 MR. AVILA: That's what I'm seeing, and then
- 19 you see, look at this one. Watch. You see at an angle,
- 20 you see now the shade of this one here. Look. See that?
- 21 It's at an angle.
- MS. KAUTZ: Okay, but so, Alicia, regardless,
- 23 are you saying that you don't want muntins on those
- 24 windows?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: I think it looks really

- 1 busy. I don't know. What do you think?
- 2 MS. KAUTZ: I think they were trying to be
- 3 consistent with what was there. I mean, we let people, if
- 4 it's a screen porch, have them clear view. Did I give you
- 5 that option? I think I gave you that option.
- 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: It does look like the inner
- 7 doors are open and that they had six lights above and less
- 8 below.
- 9 MR. AVILA: Bruce, if you look at the window
- 10 that's next to it, you can actually see the profile of the
- 11 raised muntins and you can actually see it better.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: No. I understand.
- MS. KAUTZ: I mean, we can take a loupe to
- 14 the original photograph. You'll see it much better.
- 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: I think what you're seeing on
- 16 the exterior is the screen doors.
- MS. KAUTZ: So if there's a preference either
- 18 way, we can --
- 19 MR. AVILA: Yeah. The screen doors are on
- 20 the exterior and then the doors in the interior.
- 21 MR. EHRENHAFT: And the screen doors have two
- 22 larger rectangular openings at the top --
- MR. AVILA: Right.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: -- and below two that are
- 25 close to square in dimension, and the doors that were

- 1 inside had many more lights than that.
- 2 MR. AVILA: Correct.
- 3 MR. DURANA: Right.
- 4 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I don't -- I mean, there was
- 5 no need to have so many muntins on that screen, you know,
- 6 enclosure anyway.
- 7 MR. AVILA: I will gladly remove them for
- 8 you, just ask.
- 9 MR. FULLERTON: I think we should ask them to
- 10 put the awnings back up too. Those are nice. I think
- 11 Carlos would appreciate that. Well, are we looking for a
- 12 motion?
- 13 MR. EHRENHAFT: Unless -- I thought this
- 14 discussion was still ongoing. Okay.
- 15 MR. FULLERTON: Are we talking one building
- 16 only, or both?
- MS. KAUTZ: They're separate owners, so it's
- 18 just for the one building.
- 19 MR. FULLERTON: And is it this one, or the
- 20 other one?
- 21 MR. AVILA: It's the one on the left.
- MS. KAUTZ: It's the one, it's the mirror
- 23 version of that.
- MR. FULLERTON: Okay.
- MS. KAUTZ: We don't have a '40s photo of the

- 1 other one.
- 2 Like I said, not to complicate things, but
- 3 these, the way they're drawn, they look like bi-fold
- 4 French doors --
- 5 MR. FULLERTON: Yes.
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: -- with a screen, not that that's
- 7 going to help anything, but, and that actually makes sense
- 8 because it looks like you can see part of the door on the
- 9 left upper, but if you look at the little, the notation
- 10 here, they're drawn like bi-folds, which is interesting.
- 11 MR. FULLERTON: Where is that?
- MS. KAUTZ: You see it?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: On the original.
- 15 MS. KAUTZ: And that way you'd be seeing the
- 16 fold of the door so you'd be seeing half of it in the
- 17 picture. Does that make sense?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
- 19 MS. KAUTZ: That's really unusual.
- 20 Ms. BACHE-WIIG: Then they would put a screen
- 21 in front of the mullion? That's strange.
- MR. FULLERTON: Yeah, it is.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: I don't know. I just --
- 24 MR. FULLERTON: That's so they didn't take
- 25 room -- too much space out of the room when they're opened

- 1 up. It's a nice detail.
- 2 MS. KAUTZ: It is.
- 3 MR. FULLERTON: Until a hurricane comes.
- 4 MR. AVILA: It's a nice building. The
- 5 current owner has -- those railing that you see there in
- 6 that image and the old, the original one, he actually
- 7 refurbished them, got them painted. He's painted the
- 8 building, so he's, you know, he's trying to take care of
- 9 it, so.
- 10 MR. FULLERTON: Nice, nice.
- MR. AVILA: Which is, it's nice. When he's
- done with it, it's going to be night and day from the one
- 13 on the right, so.
- MR. FULLERTON: Yeah.
- 15 MS. KAUTZ: Maybe he'll inspire them.
- MR. AVILA: I know, right?
- MS. KAUTZ: Oh, good, the Power Point is up.
- 18 So I just wanted to show this for reference for you all.
- 19 There's another apartment building in north
- 20 Ponce that we've been working with the owner. I don't
- 21 know if he's a new owner or not. I can't remember.
- 22 ElizaBeth, is he a new owner?
- 23 MS. GUIN: I think he is a new owner.
- 24 MS. KAUTZ: And he was proposing to do
- 25 horizontal rollers on the whole building. It's not

1 designated. It will be. He wants to bring it forward for

- 2 designation, but we talked him into putting the original
- 3 casements back.
- 4 MR. RODRIGUEZ: That's nice.
- 5 MS. BACHE-WIIG: That's nice.
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: It's fabulous.
- 7 MS. ROLANDO: Oh, my God.
- 8 MS. KAUTZ: Look at what a difference that
- 9 makes.
- 10 MR. RODRIGUEZ: What a difference.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: It's huge.
- MS. KAUTZ: So it can be done, and this is --
- 13 we're so happy, and he's volunteering to come for
- 14 designation, so we'll be seeing this one soon.
- 15 But I just wanted you to see what a
- 16 difference it makes to have the right windows on a project
- 17 like this.
- 18 MR. FULLERTON: Who was the architect for
- 19 that?
- MS. KAUTZ: The original architect?
- 21 MR. FULLERTON: No; for the renovation.
- MS. KAUTZ: I don't know if they had one. He
- 23 had come in -- and can you see them there?
- 24 Originally it started with those, with the AC
- 25 units, that they wanted to do them all in the wall, and we

- were like, "Please don't do that."
- 2 So we talked him out of that and we talked
- 3 him into this, and he's been lovely to work with thus far,
- 4 and it just -- and anyway, I wanted to show you for
- 5 reference what a difference it makes to have the right
- 6 windows.
- 7 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Well, Kara, if you're going
- 8 to leave the muntins on those balconies and they're going
- 9 to look like that, then that works, because they sort of
- 10 disappear.
- 11 MS. KAUTZ: I don't know -- I can't remember
- 12 what brand of windows these were.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: But the way they're drawn,
- 14 it's like they're very prominent.
- MS. KAUTZ: Yeah.
- 16 MS. BACHE-WIIG: The way they're drawn is
- 17 like they're very prominent. I think the way that they
- 18 look on this building, they're not. They recede.
- 19 MR. AVILA: Well, the thing is -- again, I
- 20 will put them on however you guys want.
- 21 This is a different -- so the size of each
- 22 window there is very different from the size of the -- you
- 23 know, so for example, this has to probably be, I don't
- 24 know, maybe 53 inches, give or take, in width, divided
- 25 into three different sections, and that one over there is

- 1 I think 74 inches, so it's a way bigger opening.
- 2 So it might look a little bit different than
- 3 what you're seeing there, so keep that in mind.
- 4 MS. KAUTZ: Yeah, no, of course
- 5 MS. BACHE-WIIG: No, understood.
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: And these all met egress too with
- 7 the casements and the triples and things, so. Anyway, it
- 8 was just for reference for you all, just a really nice
- 9 example how it turned out.
- 10 MR. AVILA: If you guys want to remove it
- 11 altogether, that's fine with me as well. We can take them
- 12 off or leave them on, whatever you guys --
- Ms. BACHE-WIIG: I think if they're quiet
- 14 like they look like in the other building, I'm fine with
- 15 it.
- 16 MR. AVILA: You see, I can't, I can't --
- 17 MR. DURANA: You'd have to do like four
- 18 window openings then at that point, wouldn't you? Like
- 19 you can't get those --
- 20 MR. AVILA: And then here is the other thing,
- 21 is that I've got to, I've got to try to match the top
- 22 window with the bottom window in the size of the lights,
- 23 so if I start changing the top, the bottom won't match.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: No, I'm not suggesting
- 25 that. Keep it how you have it.

- 1 MR. AVILA: Okay.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: But the interior lights,
- 3 they can just be really thin, just how it looks here. I
- 4 mean, you can hardly see the muntins, the frame of the
- 5 screen, so if you -- the way it looked in the other
- 6 building is really --
- 7 MS. KAUTZ: Yeah. I mean, I don't know what
- 8 windows those are, but it's a standard to ask for
- 9 high-profile muntins, so whatever their high-profile OB
- 10 muntin is, is what it is.
- 11 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Okay. Well, however it
- 12 turned out on the other building, it was quiet.
- MS. KAUTZ: Yeah.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: The way it's drawn, it looks
- 15 really heavy, so I'm not sure, you know.
- 16 MR. AVILA: I think, I think that the reason
- 17 why you see it like that, Alicia, is because you're only
- 18 seeing one horizontal one going across and you're not
- 19 seeing anything vertical.
- 20 MR. DURANA: Vertical, right.
- 21 MR. AVILA: So because of that, I think
- 22 that's why you're seeing it as quiet, and then you're
- 23 seeing a lot of the actual frame of the window which is a
- 24 lot thicker, so when you see that little, little muntin,
- 25 it's just like it's very soft.

1 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I don't even know if we're

- 2 talking about the same thing.
- 3 MR. AVILA: I'm talking about the picture
- 4 that Kara had put up for that property that -- so you see
- 5 -- okay.
- 6 MR. DURANA: The vertical.
- 7 MR. AVILA: So you look, you see how much
- 8 aluminum there is in between each window because you're
- 9 talking about the frame with three casements, right? So
- 10 it's a pretty thick, you know, vertical --
- 11 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah, I understand.
- MR. AVILA: -- right, profile? And then when
- 13 you put a little, thin little horizontal --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Right.
- 15 MR. AVILA: -- it kind of like disappears.
- MS. KAUTZ: So, while --
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: But you have a pretty thick
- 18 division between the two panels, both vertically and
- 19 horizontally.
- MR. AVILA: Right.
- 21 MS. BACHE-WIIG: So you can still achieve the
- 22 same, the same effect.
- MR. AVILA: I can, I can put it, you know,
- 24 horizontal. It's just not going to match the rest of the
- 25 building, because --

- 1 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Say again.
- 2 MS. KAUTZ: I know. I think you all are
- 3 talking about two different things.
- 4 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I know.
- 5 MS. KAUTZ: So are you talking about the
- 6 actual, the upper and lower part, the mull tubes, or the
- 7 actual thinner muntins?
- 8 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Inside each --
- 9 MS. KAUTZ: Uh-huh, the muntins.
- 10 MS. BACHE-WIIG: The muntins, that's what I'm
- 11 talking about. They look very prominent. They look very
- 12 heavy.
- MS. KAUTZ: I think that's just a matter of
- 14 the rendering because it's not a single line, it's, you
- 15 know, two lines, so I --
- 16 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yeah. I mean --
- MS. KAUTZ: But it's probably the real
- 18 thickness of what it is if they've drawn it properly.
- 19 I think it's a matter of whether you have
- them or you don't have them, you know, whether they're
- 21 there or whether they're not there.
- 22 My, one of -- as I'm looking at this now and
- 23 hearing you explain it, the windows on the right elevation
- 24 on Page Three, the ones labeled C are drawn as fixed
- 25 windows. They should be fixed casements so that the frame

1 size is consistent throughout the front facades. Do you

- 2 understand? I know you understand.
- But if you have a casement window, it's got
- 4 that thicker frame that you see here, and then if you have
- 5 a fixed window, it's got a very thin frame, and so if
- 6 they're side by side, they will always look different, but
- 7 if you have a fixed casement, it's basically taking a
- 8 casement window frame and making it not operable.
- 9 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Right.
- 10 MS. KAUTZ: It makes a huge difference.
- 11 MS. ROLANDO: Are you saying the center stays
- 12 fixed and the two sides open?
- MS. KAUTZ: No. They're doing them all
- 14 fixed, all the C windows on the right elevations --
- MS. ROLANDO: Okay.
- MS. KAUTZ: -- on Page Three.
- 17 MR. AVILA: Yeah. The letter Cs are all
- 18 fixed casements, which what that means is it's the same
- 19 exact profile as a casement. It just doesn't have any --
- 20 it's not operable.
- 21 MS. ROLANDO: You can't open the windows
- 22 then?
- MR. AVILA: No.
- 24 MR. FULLERTON: Are they in bedrooms, or in
- 25 living rooms?

1 MR. AVILA: It does have it. He just drew it

- 2 wrong, but it's the C is the fixed casement.
- 3 MS. KAUTZ: Right, but I want it to go like
- 4 this.
- 5 MR. AVILA: It is.
- 6 MS. KAUTZ: That same frame. Okay.
- 7 MR. AVILA: Yeah, yeah. It's just drawn
- 8 wrong.
- 9 MS. KAUTZ: Okay.
- 10 MR. AVILA: But if you look, C is, it says C
- 11 is the 550 --
- MS. KAUTZ: Okay, perfect.
- 13 MR. AVILA: -- fixed casement. It's just the
- 14 drawing is --
- MS. KAUTZ: Okay.
- MR. AVILA: But, yeah.
- 17 MR. FULLERTON: So I'm sorry to keep
- 18 repeating. The J windows, the G windows, the J windows --
- 19 the A windows, are those all horizontal slider?
- MS. KAUTZ: Yes.
- MR. AVILA: Yes.
- MR. FULLERTON: And the L, B --
- MS. KAUTZ: Page Four, just for you all, Page
- 24 Four.
- 25 MR. FULLERTON: -- L, B, M, C, C, B, M, Cs

- 1 are all potential --
- 2 MR. AVILA: Casements or fixed casements. If
- 3 I put a casement and a fixed casement next to each other
- 4 and I tell you to tell me which is which, you'll never
- 5 know.
- 6 MR. FULLERTON: Okay. That's fine with me.
- 7 The only thing I would caution you about -- and I see the
- 8 B window in the front bedroom and the same window in the
- 9 studio are openable, so that's fine. Okay, so we're good,
- and all the other ones in bedrooms are operable?
- MR. AVILA: Yes, yes, of course.
- MR. FULLERTON: Big improvement.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 14 MR. FULLERTON: Big improvement.
- 15 MR. AVILA: It's going to look beautiful, it
- 16 really is.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: So are the questions resolved
- 18 then?
- 19 MR. FULLERTON: I think it is.
- 20 MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes, I mean, I think if Kara
- 21 is fine with it.
- 22 MS. KAUTZ: Like I said, the only reason that
- 23 we brought this to you is because we'd like them to go
- 24 back to casement, so if you're okay with the horizontals
- on the other side, I will sign off on the drawings.

1 MS. ROLANDO: And what about the window over

- 2 the entry door?
- 3 MS. KAUTZ: That can be part of your
- 4 recommendation if you wish.
- 5 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Leave it there --
- 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: And you would be willing to,
- 7 after they look at the engineering possibilities, then --
- MS. KAUTZ: Yeah.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- address it
- 10 administratively?
- 11 MR. AVILA: I'll try to find you guys a
- 12 solution. I mean, I'll try to look at what you suggested,
- 13 Xavier.
- MR. DURANA: Yeah, if it's not too intrusive
- 15 to the inside. I don't know what's on the inside, so.
- 16 MR. AVILA: It's just, it's a common area,
- 17 and I don't think that the owner is going to have a
- 18 problem with that.
- MR. DURANA: Okay.
- 20 MR. AVILA: It doesn't intervene, intervene
- 21 with -- or interfere, rather, sorry, with any of the
- 22 tenants coming in and out of the units, so I'll try to
- 23 look at that.
- I'll get an engineer out there to see how I
- 25 can attach that so it becomes structural, and I'll figure

- 1 something out. I mean, worst case we'll try to get
- 2 somebody to re-make that window that's nonimpact, and then
- 3 at least so that, you know, we have a frame.
- I don't think I'll be able to get a fixed
- 5 casement frame to bend in those weird shapes.
- 6 MS. ROLANDO: Yes. I think it's going to
- 7 have to be fixed glass myself.
- 8 MR. AVILA: But I think I'll be able to find
- 9 somebody that can make a nonimpact fixed window to fit
- 10 there, and then what we'll do is we'll just put, you know,
- 11 so it's up to code, we'll put a hurricane shutter on
- 12 there.
- But at least when you're looking, when you're
- 14 standing outside looking at the building, you're not going
- 15 to see an eyesore with that.
- MS. ROLANDO: Right.
- 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: And then to the exterior of
- 18 that pane, you would have a carpenter also replicate the
- 19 wood.
- 20 MS. KAUTZ: Well, no. He said if he could
- 21 find someone --
- MR. AVILA: No.
- MS. KAUTZ: -- to build the fixed window --
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
- 25 MS. KAUTZ: -- and the shutter, then you

- 1 wouldn't need to do anything else.
- MR. AVILA: Yeah. I'm going to try to find
- 3 somebody that can make it nonimpact.
- 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
- 5 MR. AVILA: And then we'll just put --
- 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: But replicating the
- 7 moulding --
- MR. AVILA: Yes, yes, yes, yes, yes.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- and everything that is
- 10 there, all the same.
- MR. AVILA: We'll keep the integrity of the
- 12 look, yeah, 100 percent.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: That would be wonderful.
- MR. AVILA: Yeah. We can figure something
- 15 out.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay, okay.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Okay, but going back to
- 18 staff's recommendation to make the side -- the back part
- 19 casement, right? That's why we're moving on this.
- 20 MS. KAUTZ: That's for you all to decide. I
- 21 wasn't comfortable signing off on it administratively.
- 22 Carlos Mindreau, the city architect was, but I was not
- 23 because that's not what we've been directed to do.
- So if you all are comfortable with it, then
- 25 I'll sign off on it.

1 MS. BACHE-WIIG: What's the impact to change

- 2 it to casement?
- 3 MR. AVILA: Well, the impact is, number one,
- 4 is there's already windows that have to be along the west
- 5 and north elevation that have to be, no matter what, have
- 6 to be horizontal rollers because I have to meet fire code
- 7 which is egress to be able get in or out in case of a
- 8 fire.
- 9 The other thing is that the cost for putting
- 10 casements throughout the other windows would really spike
- 11 up the cost, and this gentleman right here is already way
- 12 over budget, and he's already suggested to me to, you
- 13 know, pull out.
- I've worked with him and I've done things for
- 15 him financially to try to keep him on board, but I know if
- 16 I come back to him now and say, "Hey, listen, casements
- 17 all around, "he's going to be like, "Withdraw, "and I
- 18 don't want him to do that.
- 19 MR. FULLERTON: I feel your pain.
- 20 MR. AVILA: And I kind of like, to be honest
- 21 with you, I like everything in a certain elevation to have
- 22 the same look all the way through.
- MR. FULLERTON: Makes sense.
- MR. AVILA: You know, that's why I like
- 25 everything nice and clean.

1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: You need a motion from us?

- MS. KAUTZ: Yes, I do.
- 3 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Or a resolution?
- 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. So chair will
- 5 entertain a motion.
- 6 MR. FULLERTON: Raul, you sounded like you
- 7 were --
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Well, we don't have a staff
- 9 recommendation, so I would approve the plans.
- MR. AVILA: Thank you.
- 11 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Subject to staff working on
- 12 that front window.
- 13 MR. AVILA: Yeah. We'll take care of that
- 14 for you guys.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- MR. DURANA: I'll second that.
- 17 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- MR. AVILA: Thank you.
- 19 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. If there's no further
- 20 discussion, call the roll, please.
- 21 MS. GUIN: Miss Bache-Wiig?
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Mr. Durana?
- MR. DURANA: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Mr. Fullerton?

- 1 MR. FULLERTON: Yes.
- MS. GUIN: Mr. Rodriguez?
- 3 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
- 4 MS. GUIN: Miss Rolando?
- 5 MS. ROLANDO: Yes.
- 6 MS. GUIN: Mr. Ehrenhaft?
- 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.
- 8 MR. FULLERTON: Hopefully this will make the
- 9 owner of the other one feel bad.
- 10 MR. AVILA: We'll take care of it.
- MR. DURANA: What you did today.
- 12 MR. AVILA: We'll take care of it. When
- 13 we're done, we'll send you a picture so you guys can see
- 14 what it looks like.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- MR. AVILA: Thank you, guys, all for your
- 17 time, and I wish you guys all the best.
- MR. DURANA: Thank you very much.
- MR. FULLERTON: Thank you.
- 20 MS. KAUTZ: I have a few items before you --
- MR. AVILA: Kara, thank you.
- 22 MS. KAUTZ: Thank you. So before you guys
- 23 bolt, I just wanted to remind you about the March 4th
- 24 meeting.
- 25 All nine board members have responded in the

- 1 affirmative that they're available. It's very important
- 2 that you're all there, so please make every effort to be
- 3 there. It's really important
- 4 Gus, if you want to direct it to the board
- 5 members who were not here.
- 6 MR. CEBALLOS: This doesn't need to be on the
- 7 record, but to the two --
- 8 .
- 9 THE COURT REPORTER: Off the record,
- 10 Mr. Ceballos?
- 11 MR. CEBALLOS: It doesn't matter. You can
- 12 leave it on the record.
- 13 For the two members that were not present at
- 14 the last meeting --
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes, yes.
- 16 MR. CEBALLOS: -- at least here, I believe
- 17 Alicia --
- MS. KAUTZ: Alicia.
- MR. CEBALLOS: -- and Peggy --
- 20 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I was not here at the last
- 21 meeting.
- MS. KAUTZ: And Peggy was not on the board
- 23 yet.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Peggy was not on the board
- 25 yet.

1 MR. CEBALLOS: Yes. I believe you have both

- 2 received the packet. If not, we'll make sure that that
- 3 happens.
- 4 MS. KAUTZ: Peggy, Peggy -- no. Did I give
- 5 you one?
- 6 MS. BACHE-WIIG: I have one but I think I
- 7 need a new one.
- MS. KAUTZ: We'll do them again.
- 9 MR. CEBALLOS: So I'm going to have to ask
- 10 you to do two things: To review the packet, and if you
- 11 can, because the presentation was lengthy and the
- 12 presentation will not be done again -- if they choose to,
- 13 they can, but I don't believe that's what the board wants,
- 14 nor the applicant -- or not applicant; the property owner.
- 15 If you can review the video from the last
- 16 meeting so that you can attest at the March 4th meeting
- 17 that you have reviewed the record and you feel competent
- 18 enough to partake in the conversation and the discussion
- 19 so that your vote can be based on what happens at the
- 20 March 4th meeting, but also with the knowledge of
- 21 everything that happened at the previous meeting.
- MS. ROLANDO: Did you e-mail a transcript of
- 23 the meeting?
- MR. CEBALLOS: Yes.
- 25 MS. ROLANDO: Is it sufficient to review the

- 1 transcript, or should the actual video be reviewed?
- 2 MR. CEBALLOS: That is up to you. If you
- 3 review the transcript, you've reviewed the record. I
- 4 would recommend the video because I feel like you get a
- 5 different feeling of how people say things. That's my
- 6 personal opinion, but legally the record is sufficient.
- 7 MS. ROLANDO: Thank you.
- 8 MS. KAUTZ: We can send all of you a link to
- 9 the video if you want to watch.
- MS. BACHE-WIIG: Okay.
- 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: Because sometimes I have
- 12 trouble --
- MS. KAUTZ: Yes.
- 14 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- making it happen.
- 15 MS. KAUTZ: Yes. We can send you the link
- 16 then.
- 17 MR. RODRIGUEZ: There was someone else who
- 18 was not present last time who is not present now.
- 19 MR. CEBALLOS: My recollection is that we
- 20 were a seven-member board because it was a four-three
- 21 vote.
- 22 MS. KAUTZ: Yeah. We were only missing two.
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Was it you?
- 24 MS. KAUTZ: Well, no. Janice --
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Cesar was there.

1 MS. KAUTZ: Yes. Peggy wasn't appointed yet,

- 2 so there was -- you were down to eight, and then Alicia
- 3 was not present so you were to seven.
- 4 MR. EHRENHAFT: So Albert and Cesar --
- 5 MR. RODRIGUEZ: They were present.
- 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- were present, right.
- 7 MS. KAUTZ: Yes, yes, so that's -- and Mike,
- 8 Mike was here too.
- 9 MR. EHRENHAFT: Mike as well.
- 10 MS. KAUTZ: So I will send you guys the link
- 11 to the video. Do we need to remake the entire package for
- 12 everybody, or just the two of them?
- MR. CEBALLOS: That's really up to the board.
- 14 If they have their original packet and they want to bring
- it, they're welcome to do so.
- MR. FULLERTON: I don't have mine.
- 17 MR. RODRIGUEZ: I think I left mine too.
- 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: I will check at home. I
- 19 think I have an entire --
- 20 MS. KAUTZ: We'll just, we'll recreate the
- 21 packets so that you all have them again, and we can also
- 22 print out the minutes. If you don't want to read them on
- 23 a device, just let us know and we'll make them part of the
- 24 package too, because they're pretty lengthy.
- MR. FULLERTON: Yeah.

1 MS. KAUTZ: But it gets difficult to read on

- 2 a screen, so just let us know.
- 3 MR. FULLERTON: And the video we can get?
- 4 MS. KAUTZ: I'll send you the link to it.
- 5 It's on line.
- 6 MR. FULLERTON: Okay. Well, can I ask a
- 7 question not related to that particular case? But we
- 8 don't have Comcast at home, but how do I watch these
- 9 meetings without --
- 10 MS. KAUTZ: You can watch them on line
- 11 actually. You can watch them on the city's website.
- MR. FULLERTON: Okay.
- MS. KAUTZ: I can send you that link too.
- MR. FULLERTON: Thank you.
- 15 MR. EHRENHAFT: I have just had trouble after
- 16 the fact getting it to go.
- 17 MS. KAUTZ: Yes.
- 18 MR. EHRENHAFT: You know what I mean?
- MS. KAUTZ: Yes, yes.
- 20 MR. EHRENHAFT: Finding it and --
- 21 MS. KAUTZ: Full disclosure, if you use
- 22 Google Chrome, it's super easy.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 24 MS. KAUTZ: For some reason other browsers
- 25 don't show up, so we have to switch to Chrome to use it.

- 1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- MS. KAUTZ: So that's one, and then there's a
- 3 link to our Historic Preservation Board agendas where you
- 4 just click on the item and it takes you right to that
- 5 point in the meeting.
- 6 MR. FULLERTON: Well, good.
- 7 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 8 MS. KAUTZ: So I'll send you, I'll send you
- 9 that link so you all can do that.
- 10 MR. FULLERTON: Super good. That's good.
- 11 MR. EHRENHAFT: All right.
- 12 MS. KAUTZ: In terms of things for the
- 13 commission, at the last commission meeting, the code
- 14 language that was being changed about the appeals to add
- 15 an additional 72 hours for staff to appeal if someone is
- 16 found not to have standing, that got approved so that will
- 17 be part of the code change.
- 18 The other item regarding standing by the
- 19 historic preservation group, Dade Heritage Trust, was
- 20 deferred off the agenda for more information, so we will
- 21 be providing that to the commission.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- MS. KAUTZ: And then the last thing I have is
- 24 that we are hosting our annual Pioneer Day at Pinewood
- 25 Cemetery on March 14th. It takes place at Pinewood from

1 ten to twelve if you all are interested, and you will get

- 2 invitations as well.
- 3 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 4 MS. KAUTZ: That's all.
- 5 MR. FULLERTON: Can I ask another question
- 6 about 1013 --
- 7 MS. KAUTZ: Behind you.
- 8 MR. FULLERTON: -- Castile --
- 9 MS. KAUTZ: Yes.
- 10 MR. FULLERTON: -- and the status?
- MS. KAUTZ: Do you know about that, about
- 12 1013 Castile?
- MR. CEBALLOS: What's the particular
- 14 question?
- 15 MR. FULLERTON: It's in receivership.
- MS. KAUTZ: It's in receivership, and from
- 17 what I understand, and I can ask Gus's office to provide
- 18 an update for you through staff's code enforcement, but
- 19 from what I was told is that the bank is actually moving
- 20 on foreclosure so that they can do the work.
- MR. FULLERTON: I see.
- 22 MS. KAUTZ: They're taking it out of
- 23 receivership is what I understand. All this is not my
- 24 forte, but I can find out for you and let you know.
- MR. FULLERTON: Thank you.

1 MS. ROLANDO: And what was the issue with the

- 2 property?
- 3 MR. FULLERTON: Well, it's almost demolition
- 4 by neglect.
- 5 MS. ROLANDO: Neglect.
- 6 MR. FULLERTON: However, the owner, the new
- 7 owner who is not so new, but he started construction and
- 8 then stopped for whatever reason, and it's been sitting
- 9 there for five years.
- 10 MS. KAUTZ: Wide open, so yeah. It's a
- 11 shell.
- 12 MR. FULLERTON: It's a construction site with
- 13 a fence and a gate and everything, and it's a mess, and
- 14 it's -- the city has had to come over and mow the yard,
- 15 mow the front swale.
- MS. KAUTZ: It went into, it did go into
- 17 receivership, and we're all very hopeful that it was going
- 18 to move forward, but I believe that the bank now has
- 19 decided that they want to take over and finish the work.
- 20 MR. FULLERTON: I'm not sure that -- I heard
- 21 rumors that when he was under construction, he built
- things that weren't part of the plans or he deviated from
- 23 the plans, so I'm not sure where that stands either, so.
- 24 MS. KAUTZ: Yeah. There were some, there
- 25 were some discrepancies that we addressed with them at the

- 1 time that we will address again, so.
- 2 MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. So in addition to the
- 3 special meeting on March 4th, then our next regular
- 4 meeting of the board --
- 5 MS. KAUTZ: Yes.
- 6 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- will convene on Wednesday,
- 7 March 18th, at four p.m.
- 8 MS. KAUTZ: Yes. I really appreciate you all
- 9 accommodating a special meeting, so thank you.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay.
- 11 MS. KAUTZ: And those packets will go out to
- 12 you next Friday. Okay.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: Okay. I'll entertain a
- 14 motion for adjournment.
- MR. FULLERTON: So moved.
- MR. RODRIGUEZ: Second it.
- MR. EHRENHAFT: All in favor, say "aye."
- THE BOARD MEMBERS: Aye (collectively).
- 19 (Thereupon, proceedings were concluded at 6:36 p.m.)

20

21

22

23

24

25