

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, January 20, 2011, 4:00 p.m.
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:

F M A M J J A S O N D J

Dorothy Thomson	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P
Margaret Rolando	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P
Ernesto Santos	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
Venny Torre	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	E	P
Richard Heisenbottle	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	E
Deborah Tackett*		P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
Gay Bondurant	P	P	P	P	E	P	E	E	P	P	P	P
Judy Pruitt*						P	E	P	P	P	P	P

APPOINTED BY:

Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
 Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
 Comm. Maria Anderson
 Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
 Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
 Historic Preservation Board
 City Manager
 City Commission
 City Commission

STAFF:

Kara Kautz, Historic Resources Officer
 Simone Chin, Historic Preservation Administrator
 Betty Perez, Administrative Assistant

A = Absent
P = Present
E = Excused
*** = New Member**
^ = Resigned Member

RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

GUESTS: Camilla Cochrane, Jenifer Briley, Marc Compton, Thomas Daniels, Yvonne Daniels, Robert Strauss, Cori Gilbert, Stan Gilbert, Melanie Plumer

The meeting was called to order by Chair Dolly MacIntyre at 4:02 p.m. A quorum was present.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Ms. MacIntyre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. She then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Ms. Bondurant made a motion to excuse the meeting absence of Mr. Heisenbottle. Ms. Tackett seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

MINUTES: MEETING OF DECEMBER 16, 2010:

Two corrections to the December minutes were noted: 1) 501 Alhambra Circle (rather than 510 Alhambra Circle); 2) Writ of Certiorari (rather than Writ of Certiari).

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the minutes of the December 16, 2010 meeting as corrected. Mr. Santos seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

DEFERRALS: None

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan swore in audience members who planned to testify during the meeting.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2010-22:

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **814 Coral Way**, a contributing structure within the “Coral Rock Residences Thematic Group Local Historic District” legally described as Lots 7 and 8, Block 1, Coral Gables Section “A,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5 at Page 102, of the Public Records of Miami- Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for at-grade improvements, and the construction of an addition and alterations to the existing structure.

During a Powerpoint presentation, Ms. Kautz displayed photographs, relayed the property’s history and alterations, and described proposed at-grade improvements. She added that variances were not requested, and said Zoning identified potential issues that would be resolved by the applicant prior to permitting.

Ms. Kautz noted the following: the metal coping and scuppers on the parapet should be copper; the new addition should maintain “S” tile roofing material to match existing architecture (and replace all roofing material with true barrel tile in future roof replacement); new outriggers on the addition should be slightly different from existing to subtly distinguish new building sections; the reflecting pool in the existing garden fountain should be retained, though the lion’s head on the fountain’s spigot is not original and should not be retained; items not detailed in the drawings will require separate COA applications and design documents will need to be submitted for approval (gates and fencing, deck railings, custom metal screening, artisan panels). Ms. Kautz concluded that staff recommended approval of the application with consideration of notations as stated.

Architect Jenifer Briley introduced homeowner Camilla Cochrane, who pledged her commitment to maintaining the historic integrity and legacy of the residence.

Ms. Briley reviewed site and floor plans, stating that the landscape plan would be presented at a later meeting. She said all windows would be changed to replace aluminum windows and returned to the original color; the original fireplace would be restored; and the applicant would comply with the City’s request regarding use of copper for scuppers and downspouts.

Discussion ensued. Board concerns included the addition’s height and austerity; its contemporary, “alien” design as compared to the historic house; the temporary nature of foliage (cited as masking the addition from the street); fenestration and outside appearance of the addition; addition should be lower than the main house. Positive Board comments included a beautifully-executed design; correct scale and massing; and thoughtful detailing, among others. Ms. Rolando suggested deferring the application until the next meeting to consider alternatives. Ms. Briley advocated for the design as presented.

Ms. Bondurant left the meeting prior to 5:30. Ms. Kautz informed the applicant about the need for five votes of approval, offering deferral until a full board was present, adding that she received no neighbor comments.

Ms. Briley advised that her client wished to defer, and requested a clarification and summary of Board recommendations. During Board remarks, Mr. Santos said the proposal was well executed and acknowledged an understanding of the comments of his colleagues. He stated the issue as whether or not the City wanted to proceed in this direction regarding historic home additions, and positively declared the design as “daring.” Ms. Kautz confirmed the observation, but noted that very few architects would take this approach of examining an original product and creating high quality design details in an interesting modern product. Mr. Torre added his support of the progressive design and his desire to see it tied to the vernacular style of the original house, and Ms. Rolando cautioned the Board to be careful about changes that could initiate new trends.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to defer the application for a full-Board vote. Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1119 Lisbon: Ms. Kautz reported receiving as-built drawings for this property that included the addition of lanterns at the front of the property, adding that the approved set of plans showed concrete piers (not originally approved as electrified piers). She noted that the lanterns appeared large and moderately out of scale. Ms. Kautz requested Board review and determination. Though the appearance of the lanterns caused staff discomfort, Ms. Kautz said she would sign off on the as-builts if the Board so directed. Ms. Gilbert responded to Board inquiries about the lanterns. Mr. Torre advised that the procedure should be fixed, and the lanterns removed as they should have been presented before installation. Ms. Rolando agreed that due process was ignored, and also stated her objection to the lanterns. It was decided that the issue will be brought before the Board for determination at its next meeting.

Board March Meeting Date: The March meeting will be held March 24th.

Board Elections: Board Chair/Vice Chair elections will be conducted with the full Board present.

Coral Gables Water Tower: Ms. MacIntyre suggested a Board donation to the Tower preservation project. The current Board fund balance is \$39,686.36. It was suggested and agreed to wait to donate until the preservation project is better determined. Ms. MacIntyre requested a Board presentation about the project by Public Works.

Secretary of Interior Guidelines: After Board discussion about the importance of improving residents' knowledge about issues related to additions, remodeling or rebuilding, Ms. Kautz described the guidebook given to all applicants and inquirers. Copies will be provided to the Board.

Historic Districts Update: Staff is currently researching the Granada and Coral Way roadways. Ms. MacIntyre suggested establishing a procedure for reviewing existing historic districts at specific anniversary intervals, i.e., ten years. Ms. Kautz will provide a report on districts, their dates of designation and amendments.

Historic Markers: Ms. Kautz will update information about historic markers at the next meeting.

MacFarlane District: Ms. Kautz reported that Miami-Dade County is considering the funding of additional work within the District. She will request an updated County report. Ms. MacIntyre reported a likelihood that Dade Heritage Trust would acquire one of the District structures, using it as a model for restoration and establishing a community center with job training for neighborhood residents.

Merrick House Minutes: Ms. Thomson expressed appreciation for Merrick House Board meeting minutes.

BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE:

1044 Coral Way: Ms. Kautz reported that the City Attorney did not have an update on this property issue as yet.

ADJOURNMENT: 6:20 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz
Historic Preservation Officer