

**City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting**  
**Agenda Item J-1**  
**May 22, 2018**  
**City Commission Chamber**  
**405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL**

**City Commission**

**Mayor Raul Valdes-Fauli**  
**Vice Mayor Frank Quesada**  
**Commissioner Pat Keon**  
**Commissioner Vince Lago**  
**Commissioner Michael Mena**

**City Staff**

**City Manager, Cathy Swanson-Rivenbark**  
**Assistant City Manager, Frank Fernandez**  
**City Attorney, Miriam Ramos**  
**City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman**  
**Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia**  
**Information Technology Director, Raimundo Rodulfo**  
**Assistant Information Technology Director, Nelson Gonzalez**

**Public Speaker(s)**

**Raul Mas**

---

Agenda Item J-1 [0:00:00 p.m.]  
Presentation of Coral Gables Smart City Initiatives.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Presentation of Coral Gables Smart City Initiatives, Madam City Manager.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Good afternoon, Mr. Mayor, Vice Mayor and members of the Commission. It is truly my honor today to introduce to you the members of the Information

Technology team and their Smart City Initiatives. I'll start by saying the City of Coral Gables IT Department works very well with all City departments in further enhancing the efficiencies and effectiveness of our tools in the way of technology. We have done this with great success across all city departments to enhance efficiencies and also operational effectiveness. We have worked with police, fire and emergency management on enhancing our public safety initiatives, both internal and external, and they've done that with great resolve. Additionally, I want to bring to your attention, as I bring up the members of the team, that they have been recognized by numerous associations for their success stories, and some of the awards have come by way of Smart City World Standards Award from the IEEE, which are standard organizations, ICMA Smart City Case Study Award, IEEE Smart City studies, senior membership awards from the Institute of Electrical and Engineers and the Institute of Industrial and Systems Engineers, additionally, Best Conceptual Design Award at the University of Miami Smart City Conference, and finally, panel membership -- and this panel has presented membership at conferences such as CIO Summits, the University of Miami and Florida International University Smart City and (INAUDIBLE) Conferences. Without any further ado, I introduce to you our director of Information Technology, Raimundo Rodulfo, and Assistant Director Nelson Gonzalez, who have done a fantastic job, who will lead you through a presentation on our Smart City Initiative. Director, the floor is yours.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Good afternoon, Mayor, members of the Commission, Madam City Manager, Madam City Attorney. So, a few years ago we created this poster where we showed what is our strategy, our master plan for Smart Cities. At the center of it all, we have a Lean Six Sigma process improvement program where we have a training component and we have produced 28 certified Six Sigma green belts across the organization in multiple departments, and we're working improving the processes, making them streamlined and lean before we introduce technology to the process, so making sure that when we introduce technology, it is most effective and is most successful in the implementation. So, at the center of our strategy is strategic planning, customer service and improving the quality of life through continuous improvement. So, we have an area of initiatives that are related to data and business

intelligence. Those are all those projects that we have multiple projects where we have private and public clouds where we create data analytics. We provide value and actionable information to employees and to the citizens through data platforms. We have transparency portals, dashboards and multiple solutions for data and analytics. We have multiple projects on public safety, introducing all the technology that we have on the crime intelligence center, which is located at the emergency operations center. We have technology like CCTV cameras and license plate readers. We have data analytics from Crime View and multiple other tools through our problem-solving initiative program. We analyze that data and we produce actionable information for first responders and for public safety. We also have initiatives for the fire department, like electronic patient care and multiple other solutions to improve public safety. And we also have Internet of Things as part of this site of our projects. We have multiple smart applications and enterprise systems bringing mobility and accessibility to City services. We have the City's mobile app and multiple other apps that have been introduced over the years. And at the end, we align with the City's sustainability master plan, because we work together with Public Works and Sustainability because all these technologies, they reduce carbon footprint. They help reduce the need to commute, multiple things that can be done electronically. We save time and also we help the environment. We reduce the use of paper and also we have energy efficiency programs in our infrastructure and also working with Public Works on energy efficiency programs as well. Besides, in our Internet of Things, we are introducing now environmental sensors that are going to help us to have a visibility over the environment as well. I'm going to move now to our next poster, where we have a more in detail engineering roadmap for smart cities. So, in this engineering roadmap, we have the foundation of high-speed communications and resilience. So, we have a network that is smart that is designed based on best practices from the IEEE. And in that level, we have multiple layers of redundancy. So, in case of emergencies, like during Hurricane Irma when we lose power in multiple locations, when we lose communication because the service providers, they go down in multiple places, we have the ability to sustain critical services, critical communications. They remain active even though we may lose different components of this network. That's the one that we got an award from the IEEE last year, from the Smart City Standard Contest. We have a

network of fiber optics. We have a combination of (INAUDIBLE) fiber optics and fiber optics that we have been building over the years. So, in downtown, for example, we coordinated through the streetscape project, we built fiber in Giralda and also Miracle Mile and some (INAUDIBLE) to the garages and other buildings. Our idea is to continue building more fiber optics that will allow us to continue providing the last mile for more and more services and coordination. We have a wireless backbone, like point to point wireless communications. That is also a layer of redundancy during emergencies. We also have metropolitan Ethernet provided by the central office. That's the first redundancy when we lose one of the fiber connections during hurricanes, for example. It's on major buildings, like fire stations, public safety, on this building, facilities. We also have public and private Wi-Fi networks. But recently, we opened public Wi-Fi in Giralda and Miracle Mile in the streetscape area. It has been very successful. It's being used. And that smart Wi-Fi network provides also sensors. We have an array of frequency sensors that allows us to get counts of pedestrians as well. We also have satellite and cellular communications, which is another redundancy. For example, during Irma, we helped our friends in the Florida Keys. They didn't have any communication at all and we were able to help them to communicate using hand -- satellite handhelds. We also have what we call a rapid deployment kit, which provides satellite communications, internet and phones, whatever we need that we need to rapid deploy during an emergency. And also, you need elements of energy resilience to be able to support this network. So, besides backup generators and batteries, working as part of the (INAUDIBLE) team for the Bloomberg Challenge, we're also working with the University of Miami in the development of a micro-grid, a smart micro-grid that will give us more energy resilience for this layer. The next layer is the Internet of Things. It's pretty much any device that connects to the internet can be (INAUDIBLE), for example, it's the smart phones and the tablets and the laptops that are used by our first responders or our mobile fleet. It can be the mobile devices that our citizens use to communicate to our services through our mobile apps. It can be smart devices like Internet of Things sensors. For example, in Giralda Plaza we have pedestrian counters, so they are giving us actual information about traffic of pedestrians hour by hour. That information is available through our platform. It can be used by employees. It can be used for urban planning. It can be used for traffic engineering and for

other purposes. We are also installing in Miracle Mile sensors for traffic that will count vehicles and will also count pedestrians. And we have environmental sensors that will give us, for example, the air quality, CO<sub>2</sub> pollutants, noise, (INAUDIBLE) and multiple measurements to give us a visibility over the environment. So, this is the layer that gives us real-time urban and environmental visibility and physical interfacing. And as we know with new technology, we will have also smart kiosks and digital signage. We have in some buildings and the idea is to have more and more. Imagine a device like this one, for example, on this building where we can have interactive applications for the visitors. And now, with robotics, with drones that are used, for example, for rescue recon during emergencies or by CGTV, for example, and smart vehicles. So, we have fleet management systems where the vehicles become part of the Internet of Things as well. And new commercial vehicles are coming already with connectivity to the internet, so it's going to be common in the near future that those smart vehicles are going to be able to interconnect to the City's systems and find parking or access other resources automatically. So, that's something that is coming and that's why we are building this infrastructure to allow us to get to the next step. We have the next layer is the data platforms that integrate. So, that data platform gives us data aggregation, integration and correlation between multiple variables. We have business intelligence and analytics. On that layer, we have public and private clouds that we have, big data and analytics, so the way to analyze the data and make actionable information out of the data. Artificial intelligence and machine learning is something that has been used with algorithms, for example, for video analytics for public safety. Open data and APIs are those integrations between different systems that they are separate, but they talk to each other. And, we also have horizontal and vertical integration that is built on this layer. And this is the best layer of all, because this is the layer that interacts directly with the constituents, with the stakeholders. We call this layer the Smart City Hub. The Smart City Hub has value -- it delivers value through applications, transparency, open data and analytics, actionable information and efficiencies. So, multiple applications that are part of our digital transformation and allow us to replace manual and inefficient processes with electronic processes and improve efficiency. Also, it helps us to deliver citizen engagement. We can communicate better with the citizens, mobility and accessibility, and it also has values like inclusion and crowdsourcing and collaboration. In

this layer, we are able to collaborate between other stakeholders. So, here we have a data marketplace where you can pretty much access public records, download documents and access information. For example, this Commission meeting that is being broadcasted through a system called Granicus, things like that. We also have an Internet of Things dashboard where you can see in real time all these readings on these sensors, so you can see in real time the pedestrian counter, how many pedestrians, how many vehicles in certain areas of the city. You can see the air quality or the water quality in real time. And, we also have geographic information system portals. Those are the interactive maps that you can go there and you can access data through geographic information. So, they are location aware services and systems. We have multiple applications that are open in this platform. We have an application store where we have the City's mobile app, which is being redesigned to make it more ergonomic. And, we also have other apps like the Traffix app that was developed in-house to allow citizens to record traffic issues; the intelligence mobile app, to report -- for -- receive alerts; the ParkMe (INAUDIBLE) mobile app, to find parking; the PayByPhone app to pay for parking; the trolley app that allows you to see where the trolley is, get ETA and location of the trolley routes; and the Freebee app, for example. We have multiple enterprise systems in this layer too. So, for example, the new Parks and Recreation system that was deployed last year. We also have the new facility management system, the new procurement vendor registration system. And now, we are working with Development Services and Public Works and other departments implementing a new electronic permitting system. That is the next step on this. And we have transparency portals. You recently saw the one that Finance deployed with IT, which is their financial transparency portal. We also have Customer Connect. We have Legistar. We have Granicus. We have multiple systems that deal with transparency and citizen engagement tools, like Customer Connect, like mobile apps, like social media. And this is the physical facility, the emergency operations center that we call the Crime Intelligence Center. It's part of this layer, because it's an ultimate result of the implementation of all these other layers that we see here. The last layer is the stakeholder layer that we call the Smart City Ecosystem. Here we have people, businesses, organizations, things and IT systems all working together in collaboration, partnership, bringing intelligence to our ecosystem. And it's formed by customers, stakeholders

and by technology. So, at the center of all of this continuous improvement with layers of strategic planning and innovation to improve customer service and quality of life. So, I'm going to mention now how we implemented this as a platform. So, we recently launched what we call the Smart City Hub public platform. It's this one that you see here. Our GIS manager and his team, they took this concept and they built these three components as a live platform. So, most of these applications, they already existed, but they were like silos in different places. They didn't talk to each other. They were not aggregated in one place. Now, the citizens can go to CoralGables.com. They click on the Smart City Hub and they will be able to find all this technology and all this value in one place. And, when you go to the Smart City Hub -- the address, by the way, is CoralGables.com/SmartCity. You see the transparency portals. For example, transparency -- financial transparency tools. You see the City Clerk's dashboards, like for passports, City lobbyists and demographics and elections. You see the public records request system. You see another layer where you can search for public records. You have Legistar. You have police records portal. And you have the permits and inspections, where you can see what are the current permits and inspections. Citizen engagement tools are here, like social media, Customer Connect, the City's website. You have, for example, eNews. You have Sustainable Living, the sustainability page. A virtual kiosk that looks like this, but is the one that we have at the museum. We can connect with technology and we have this layer that was built by the City Clerk's Office in collaboration with FIU. They have a virtual tool of the City, Digital Collections and the Talking Book. The app store that I mentioned is imagined like a common app store, where you find all the applications in one place and you can download them to your mobile phones. eGov City Services, where we have, for example, the ability to pay for things online. All these are tools to pay online for multiple City services. The ability to enroll in classes or our career portal. City vendor registration, parking permit renewal. This is a new system that was implemented with the Parking Department. The Employee Portal -- and you have open data, where you can have financial transparency. This is a system that was developed in-house to search for business data. And, all this data that is here is GIS integrated. It's open and this data has what we call APIs. If you are a university, you are a developer, you want to develop more value, bring more value to this app, you can connect to this data, which is public

records, and you can build more application and more value. We are actually doing that with UM and FIU. GIS application -- this is real-time Internet of Things, so, Giralda, where you can see, for example, the pedestrian counters live on Giralda. We are building more sensors here, so soon you're going to see also more live sensors coming from Miracle Mile and the environment and other measurements. In collaboration with FIU, we have water sensors in different waterways. Public Works and Sustainability, they are working together with FIU to build more value into these systems. We have open data from IoT and we have GIS applications that I mentioned. This is an information about the Crime Intelligence Center and open APIs. So, what the director mentioned that we have been meeting with organizations, with the IEEE, that would like (INAUDIBLE) in projects. They are helping us to improve all these projects to make them better. In some cases, we have been awarded. We have received very good feedback. We went to the University of Miami Smart City Conference. We showed it to them, the dean and the faculty and the students. They like it so much that they are going to do an event around this. An event is going to be like a Hack-a-thon and they're going to invite the students and the faculty to build more value and to collaborate more with the City.

Commissioner Keon: Wow.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: So -- and -- well, that's part of the study about this application and we continue building more and more value and more systems here.

Commissioner Keon: How safe.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, the International City Managers Association, 10,000 cities, they picked 13 that represent the best practice of smart cities incorporating technology in the communities. And, we're really proud that San Diego got picked and Chattanooga got picked. But most importantly, we're proud that the City of Coral Gables got picked and it's a real tribute to the hardworking IT staff and all the good work that they're doing.



Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Very good.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So, this is -- a few weeks ago, you showed us a little bit of it. Obviously, it was more information today. But, as you were scrolling through -- this is the website. This is the access that everyone's going to have, the full transparency that I know that we've been working on. I remember we looked at the City of Doral a few months ago, maybe...

Commissioner Mena: Yeah, more than that.

Vice Mayor Quesada: More than a year ago. This seems more comprehensive than what they had, what we were trying to achieve. So, yeah, congrats.

Commissioner Mena: Well, that's just -- so what you're describing is just the transparency portal.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Just the transparency portal.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah, but I sent you...

Vice Mayor Quesada: There's a lot more.

Commissioner Lago: I sent you...

Vice Mayor Quesada: That's what I'm saying. It's gone above and beyond that is what I'm saying.

Commissioner Mena: Does this interface, Raimundo? Is this -- is this the app? Is this the website? Is it both?

Information Technology Director Rodolfo: It is a platform...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Information Technology Director Rodolfo: That aggregates all the systems and integrates them using GIS.

Commissioner Mena: But, the actual functionality as I see you scrolling down through these pages is this...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Is this what the website functionality will look like?

Information Technology Director Rodolfo: Yes. If you go to CoralGables.com -- of course, this is a special monitor, but...

Commissioner Mena: Right, right.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Of course, yeah.

Information Technology Director Rodolfo: You will see it and, yes, it's the same. It's the same.

Commissioner Mena: Commissioner Quesada has that monitor at home.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah.

Information Technology Director Rodolfo: It also works for mobile devices. From your cell phone -- it is mobile friendly. Of course, it doesn't look that big, but...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah, course.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: It works for mobile devices.

Commissioner Mena: Very nice.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Very good.

Commissioner Keon: Congratulations.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Thank you.

Commissioner Keon: Great work.

Commissioner Lago: It's great.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It is great, and I thank you very, very much for the presentation and the great job you're doing.

Commissioner Lago: Raimundo, how long have you been with...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Mr. Mayor, I believe we have speaker cards on this.

Commissioner Lago: How long have you been with the City?

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Huh?

Commissioner Lago: How long have been with the City?

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Started in 2004.

Commissioner Mena: 2004?

Commissioner Keon: But how long have you been director?

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Two years.

Commissioner Keon: That's what's amazing.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah. You've achieved a lot in two years.

Commissioner Keon: In two years, you've been...

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: We have a great team actually. This is built by the IT team...

Commissioner Keon: Right.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: And working together with all departments, because there's a lot of collaboration work with other departments and with the universities too.

Commissioner Lago: I speak for myself. I don't speak for anybody else, but you should have been made the director a long time ago.

Commissioner Keon: We're certainly glad you're there now.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright. We have...

Commissioner Keon: You've done a great job.

Commissioner Lago: He's good. I'm telling you. And when I wrote that memo about transparency and what Doral was doing, you not only have met what I thought would be a great idea, but you...

Vice Mayor Quesada: I know.

Commissioner Lago: Superseded that, I mean, beyond belief. So...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: He's done a great job.

Commissioner Lago: This is really, really good.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We have...

Commissioner Keon: It is a -- yeah.

Commissioner Lago: Good job.

Commissioner Keon: It is amazing the work that can be done when you have a director that is open and promotes their people to explore and to achieve. You truly are a leader.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Thank you.

Commissioner Keon: Wonderful.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: What I'd like to see for the future, if possible -- I know that Kevin Kinney is over here also. We've talked about smart parking technology and I know...

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: That's coming.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: I want to -- I want to have that discussion -- not today -- I want to have the discussion in the future, maybe in a few months, because the implementation of having someone be able to look at their phone while they're driving or while they're stopped and make a decision...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: (INAUDIBLE) stopped.

Commissioner Lago: Which I think what I've heard is about a 30 percent savings in regards to congestion where that person can just go right into a parking lot or can know exactly what street has less -- has more available parking and not have to do circle after circle after circle in the city is a real big benefit. There's a lot of technology -- there's a lot of articles about that.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: These cameras at Miracle Mile will allow that technology. We're working with Director Kinney on identifying the right software.

Commissioner Lago: I'd like to see -- and I'm not asking for it now, but I'd like to see, in the future, a presentation on that, because if resources need to be provided to get to that goal -- and I'd also like to see a timeline to potentially even be able to offer that in a year, two years, whatever it may be.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Sure.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Commissioner Keon: You know what, Naples has...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We have a member of the public that wishes to speak. Raul Mas. Good afternoon.

Commissioner Keon: On the streetlights. It tells you what they are.

Raul Mas: Good afternoon, Mr. Mayor, Mr. Vice Mayor, Commissioners. It's been a long day, but boy, am I glad I waited because, quite frankly, what I just heard here -- all of you up here basically just nodded in agreement...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes, sir. We did.

Mr. Mas: And thought it was absolutely wonderful.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We did.

Mr. Mas: Yeah. Well, I disagree. I disagree strongly, because I don't think it's a hundred percent great, okay. I'm all in agreement with all that stuff that provides transparency and consumer access to the City and what's going on in my municipality. What I am not in agreement with is all those other parts that basically gather information on us and what we're doing and where we are. And quite frankly, this scares the hell out of me. I don't like it. None of you asked any questions about privacy.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Calm down, will you?

Mr. Mas: None of you asked...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Don't shout.

Mr. Mas: It's a passionate subject. I'm sorry, Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Mr. Mas: None of you asked any questions about privacy. None of you asked any questions about anonymity for individuals to go about their normal lives with a certain degree of privacy. I mean, does that not even matter to any of you on this Commission anymore? I mean, a couple of weeks ago we received, you know, a press release in an email talking about how in the City of Coral Gables we are now on track to capture 30 million license plate images in a city of 51,000 people. We've captured 50 million images since the system was started, and that information is being stored for three years. Now, don't get me wrong. I have no objection to technology. I have no objection to these automated license plate readers being used for legitimate law enforcement purposes, for finding a victim of an amber alert, for finding a criminal. But, I don't see why my government has to be capturing images of where I'm going during the course of the day and then saving that information for three years by a company called Vigilant Solutions, which is national in scope that shares that information with other people that keeps it in a cloud. And I want answers as to, you know, who came up with this idea? It seems crazy to me. Not once, Raimundo, did you talk -- did you address the issue of privacy, did you address the issue of, you know, maintaining the privacy of individuals' information, securities. You're having all of this information now talking to each other; before they were in silos. Technology is a double-edged sword, ladies and gentlemen. You get great benefits from it, no question about it. But, I beg one of you to start asking those difficult questions about privacy, about whether it's really necessary to keep this information for six months. And what about the cost? What about the



cost of this system? Do I really need an environmental sensor --- to pay for an environmental sensor to tell me when it's raining outside? No. I can open the window and I can see. Is this a good use of taxpayer monies? How much money are we spending on this, direct and indirect? I'd like some answers to those questions, quite frankly. You know, I sent a letter last Thursday, May 17, 3:51 pm to this Commission. I had about ten questions in there, primarily related to the automated license plate reader technology. I hope to meet with Mr. Fernandez in the near future to discuss it.

Commissioner Mena: I believe you scheduled that...

Mr. Mas: But I...

Commissioner Mena: Right?

Mr. Mas: Correct.

Commissioner Mena: He reached out and scheduled that with you?

Mr. Mas: He did and we're...

Commissioner Mena: Okay.

Mr. Mas: Hoping to meet in early June.

Commissioner Mena: Good.

Mr. Mas: Correct? So, I look forward to doing that. But I also think, as I stated in my letter, no matter how good that meeting may go, alright, that I think it's important that when you are collecting this much information on the residents of Coral Gables, that you need to have clear

and independent oversight of all of the stuff that's going on. I don't think having the sheepdogs looking after the sheepdogs is a good idea. And, what I mean by sheepdogs is the common acronym for police departments or police officers whatever, the sheepdog looking after the sheep. When the sheepdogs are looking after the sheepdogs and one day one of those sheepdogs turn into a wolf, the sheep are not going to know what the heck hit them, okay. So, I think it's very important that you have individuals, you know, not associated with law enforcement looking after this information. I think there need to be restrictions on this kind of data. There was a recent Supreme Court decision in Virginia that basically said these automated license plate readers are, in fact, not just gathering information on license tags. They are, in fact, gathering information on people's movements. And I remind all of you, especially the three of you that are attorneys here, the Constitution of the State of Florida has a privacy -- a right to privacy, which some people would argue is stronger than our own Fourth Amendment right under the US Constitution.

Commissioner Mena: But we...

Mr. Mas: And I think it's important to respect that.

Commissioner Mena: You're citing Virginia's Supreme Court authority, which is not legal precedent here, so you're...

Mr. Mas: Correct.

Commissioner Mena: Talking on the...

Mr. Mas: Correct. My point is...

Commissioner Mena: One -- may I address what you said?

Mr. Mas: Virginia's Supreme Court basically said that...

Commissioner Mena: The Florida Supreme Court did not.

Mr. Mas: It possibly violates their statute.

Vice Mayor Quesada: But...

Mr. Mas: My point is that in the state of Florida, we don't have a statutory, you know, right to privacy. It is embedded in our constitution...

Commissioner Mena: Sure.

Mr. Mas: And was embedded in 1980 in the general election.

Commissioner Mena: But we have...

Mr. Mas: And...

Commissioner Mena: Legal authority here that says we're in...

Mr. Mas: I'm sorry?

Commissioner Mena: We have legal authority here, which our City Attorney has advised us that we are in compliance with.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Right.

City Attorney Ramos: There has been no challenge...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Wait, but hold on a second.

City Attorney Ramos: To the ALPR in the state of...

Vice Mayor Quesada: But he's...

City Attorney Ramos: Florida that we've...

Vice Mayor Quesada: I don't...

City Attorney Ramos: Been able to find in state or federal court at this time.

Unidentified Speaker: I'm sorry. Say that again.

City Attorney Ramos: There have been no challenges put forth in state or federal court of -- in Florida of the ALPR systems, not in the City of Coral Gables, in many other cities in the state of Florida.

Mr. Mas: I'm not disagreeing with that. I'm not disagreeing with that. There may come that challenge in due course, okay.

City Attorney Ramos: There may.

Mr. Mas: But my point is, do we have to wait for a legal challenge to take place? I mean, do you not see that this information can be abused? Do you not...

Commissioner Lago: So...

Mr. Mas: See that this information can...

Commissioner Lago: So, Mr. Mas...

Mr. Mas: Concern somebody...

Commissioner Lago: I want to ask a quick question.

Mr. Mas: Who wants a certain amount of privacy and anonymity as I go about my life in Coral Gables?

Commissioner Lago: Let me ask you a question, Mr. Mas.

Mr. Mas: Yes, sir.

Commissioner Lago: With all due respect.

Mr. Mas: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: And I agree with a lot of the things you've said in the past in regards...

Mr. Mas: Yes, sir.

Commissioner Lago: To other issues, but I'd like to have you provide me with an alternate solution in regards to what we currently have in place. So, what would you -- just give me one second.

Mr. Mas: Sure.

Commissioner Lago: What would you rather...

Vice Mayor Quesada: But he suggested it already.

Mr. Mas: Sure.

Vice Mayor Quesada: He suggested it already.

Mr. Mas: No, I do have a suggestion. Number one...

Commissioner Lago: No, but I want you to put it on the record.

Mr. Mas: Number one, there are apparently FDLE guidelines regarding the capture of this information, including the need for oversight, evaluation, auditing and enforcement of misuse.

Commissioner Lago: Okay.

Mr. Mas: I'd like to see whether that's being done by the City of Coral Gables. Are, in fact, audits being done of the information being collected by ALPR? If so, make them public. Let's take a look at them. I'd like to see...

Commissioner Lago: Okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We can't make them public.

Mr. Mas: If you're spending billions of dollars on this information gathering, I'd like to see is it working. Have we actually captured criminals as a result of this?

Commissioner Lago: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes, we have.

Commissioner Lago: Yes, we have.

Mr. Mas: What are those numbers?

Commissioner Lago: And, there has been a double-digit reduction in crime over the last...

Mr. Mas: I...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And we have captured criminals, Mr. Mas.

Mr. Mas: As the direct...

Commissioner Lago: And then it's a multi-prong approach.

Mr. Mas: Correct.

Commissioner Lago: Multi-prong approach.

Mr. Mas: There is no direct link -- and you said it yourself in the video, okay, that it is a contributing factor, but that there's no direct link. Again...

Commissioner Lago: Is it a...

Mr. Mas: I will reiterate my point.

Commissioner Lago: But let me ask you a question. Mr. Mas, hold on. Let's not speak over each other.

Mr. Mas: Sure.

Commissioner Lago: Let's have a dialogue, back and forth. Don't forget, I'm not one of the attorneys here. The attorneys are over here. Let's have a dialogue back and forth. If a person is considering stepping into the City of Coral Gables and committing a crime...

Mr. Mas: Correct.

Commissioner Lago: You know, we're a very affluent city. Again, in certain instances, we're looked upon as a potential target for someone who's coming to rob -- again, we're very low in regards to what they call serious crime. But when you have instances like petty theft, it happens. You don't think honestly -- and I want you to answer me -- you don't think that having a presence like a camera on a main thoroughfare is going to deter -- hold on -- is going to deter someone who is having a thought about potentially coming into our city and committing a criminal act. Or if a individual who is coming in into our city and is driving down 8<sup>th</sup> Street, for example, and has multiple warrants for their arrest, do you think he or she would have second thoughts driving by an LPR?

Mr. Mas: Let me reiterate, because I think we're saying the same thing, but perhaps, you didn't hear what I initially prefaced my comments with. I have no problem with these ALPRs being used for law enforcement purposes to identify criminals, to deter criminals, as you say, okay, to have these cameras. What I am concerned about and where I think this Commission needs to focus on is what sort of protections are there for the individuals, for the residents of Coral Gables, the people that work here, the people that transit through the city who are innocent individuals, are up to no -- you know, they're not convicted of any crimes. They're not looking to commit any crime in Coral Gables, that their information is not being kept for three years...



Commissioner Lago: But a lot of the...

Mr. Mas: Which is the maximum that's allowed?

City Attorney Ramos: Commissioner Lago, if I might.

Mr. Mas: It seems to me to be extreme.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: But what purpose do you...

Commissioner Lago: A lot of those questions are going to be answered, like you said, when you meet with...

Mr. Mas: Well...

Commissioner Lago: Assistant City Manager...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Well, hold on a second.

City Attorney Ramos: But, I think there's an important...

Vice Mayor Quesada: If I could jump in. I've been wanting to jump in here for a second. A few things. Number one, your comments are, with me, very well taken. You're looking at it from a perspective I hadn't really looked at it before, so thank you for that. As far as asking the question -- let me just -- just a few points and then I'll get into the substance of it. The reason I didn't -- I don't think this Commission was asking any questions as to privacy with Raimundo is we don't -- we see him as the technology guy sort of putting it all together on the transparency side. We're not seeing him...

Commissioner Lago: Wi-Fi, the website.

Vice Mayor Quesada: I see this...

Mr. Mas: Sure.

Vice Mayor Quesada: I see this more on the policing side.

Mr. Mas: And I don't...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Let me finish.

Mr. Mas: Have a problem with that stuff.

Vice Mayor Quesada: No, no, let me finish though because you mentioned -- you said, well, why didn't we ask that question, so I want to address that direct point is I see that more as a question for the police department and Frank Fernandez and Chief Hudak. So, that's on that point. But what you're saying, the oversight, like I deal with the data company all day long. I understand where you're coming from. It makes that -- I think it's very well taken for me, and I definitely want to do something about it.

City Attorney Ramos: Vice Mayor, can I address that one minute?

Vice Mayor Quesada: What data is being kept, how long it's being kept. We may have policies in place. I haven't seen them. I want to see them. I think we should be very clear and transparent as to what does -- is kept and what isn't kept. For example, the three-year period, I didn't know that until a few weeks ago.

Mr. Mas: Frank, can I address something...

City Attorney Ramos: But Vice Mayor, if I...

Mr. Mas: Very important?

City Attorney Ramos: Might, please. The...

Mr. Mas: You'll appreciate this because you're in the data mining business, okay.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah.

Mr. Mas: So, my understanding is that this information is being captured by a company called Vigilant Solutions, correct?

Unidentified Speaker: Yes.

Mr. Mas: Vigilant Solutions is a national company. They tend to have practically a monopoly on this business throughout the United States, okay. The federal government, at one point, wanted to do these ALPRs at a national level and they were stopped. But instead, what's happening is municipalities are doing the work for them. And, I think one of the things that needs to be investigated is that contract with Vigilant Solutions. Read the fine print. Where is this information going? And do you, in fact, as the City of Coral Gables have control over that data and where it goes and who it is shared with, okay? Because I don't think you do.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Probably not.

Mr. Mas: Okay. They -- from what I've read, they're able to keep this information so long as it has a commercial value to them.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So, you bring up the point...

Mr. Mas: And so, these people are in the data mining business, and they're going around and they're going to sell the information on Commissioner Keon's daily movements to her insurance company.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah.

Mr. Mas: To, you know, if Commissioner Lago's electric vehicle needs to be repossessed, the repo man's going to be able to find out where he is, okay.

Commissioner Lago: Maybe.

Mr. Mas: That's the kind of information...

Commissioner Lago: I don't have a place to park it.

Mr. Mas: Right now, okay.

Vice Mayor Quesada: But so, for the other members of the Commission, you know, he's bringing up a point that I deal with every day on the private side of what I do. Because there are people that see data differently. So, even though we may be looking at it for Item A, there are people who are looking at it for Items 2 through 2000, and it's about restricting the use -- using it properly and preventing the improper use of it.

City Attorney Ramos: Can...

Vice Mayor Quesada: So, I'm not saying we're doing anything improper. I'm not suggesting that at all. However, we need to be very clear and set clear guidelines as to what data is kept, how it's kept and how it's used and how others are aggregating that data and using it. I mean, very good point.

Mr. Mas: And I'm not suggesting...

City Attorney Ramos: If I...

Mr. Mas: Just for the record, that this information is being misused...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Right.

Mr. Mas: Has been misused.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah. Let's get out in front of it.

City Attorney Ramos: If I can please address the point.

Mr. Mas: Yes.

City Attorney Ramos: I need -- two points I need to address. The three-year period of time was not made up by the City of Coral Gables. It's what the public records retention schedule sets forth for your ALPR...

Unidentified Speaker: Correct.

City Attorney Ramos: Data; one.

Unidentified Speaker: Correct.

City Attorney Ramos: Two, ACM Fernandez, can you please tell us how and whom can access the Vigilant records?

Vice Mayor Quesada: Well, let me stop for a second.

City Attorney Ramos: And for what purpose.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let her finish.

Vice Mayor Quesada: It's just I want to be clear. We're not going to be able to resolve all of the potential issues in this conversation.

City Attorney Ramos: No, but this is really important.

Vice Mayor Quesada: What I'm going to ask coming out of this...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let her finish, please.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yeah, okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Go ahead.

City Attorney Ramos: This is really important for everybody to hear.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Okay.

City Attorney Ramos: Whom can access the Vigilant system?

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: First and foremost, let me say that we're arch advocates of the Constitution. We pass out the constitutional book to every police officer that gets hired, pass it out to the IT personnel. So, I want you to know you're in good hands when it comes to ensuring that your constitutional rights are protected and I am an arch advocate of it. And, I want you to feel comfortable and I hope to meet with you, so I could show you all of the oversights that we have. Secondly, under Chapter 316.0778, those guidelines cover what we're supposed to do with LPR information. We're strictly adhering to state law. We have oversight for that by way of Director Raimundo Rodulfo. He'll explain to you we do seven audits throughout the year, and also the security officer for the police department for the IT for the oversight is Assistant Director Nelson Gonzalez. And, they could come up and give you a 30-second overview of the oversight that we have for both police and also the other technology that we have. A great oversight that we do seven audits every year and we document all this information. The Crime Intelligence Center, sir, that we have all this information is closely supervised. Access is restricted, number one. Number two, there are cameras that watch the person watching the camera in the event that there's a suspicion of inappropriate use of that camera system that we have information to look at what they were looking at. Number two, as relates to your question under the LPR, visually, what it looks like when you open up the LPR system, it'll ask you if you're looking for a tag. It'll ask you to first put in your name and your authorized ID number that gives you access. So, it's a signature access only into that system. Then you must put in a case number that relates to why you're going into that system and you have to put in comments as to what that information is going to be used for. It is strictly, strictly governed. Access into the system is closely governed as well. But, with your permission, Mr. Mayor, I'd like to ask Director Rodulfo and Assistant Director Gonzalez...

Mr. Mas: Can I just respond to that? I mean, you...

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: May I have them come? They may provide further clarity for you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, no. Let him finish. Please let him finish. We let you talk, Mr. Mas.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Let me provide further clarify -- Director Raimundo, please come up. Thank you, sir.

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Thank you, sir. We take data privacy and data security very seriously. We undergo seven audits every year. For public safety data, we have compliance requirements from FDLE, Florida Department of Law Enforcement, from CJIS and also from FBI and from CALEA. So, we undergo all those audits every year and they look at all those different type of data and how we protect that data and how we're using it and how we're (INAUDIBLE) them. So, we have to comply. It's very rigorous. So, Nelson Gonzalez, he's our cybersecurity expert. He can go more in detail how those audits are performed. Also, we have best practices for information security that protects all the data in the organization for different types of data.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Can you please outline your certifications, please?

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Huh?

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Your engineering certifications and (INAUDIBLE).

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: Professional engineer. I have a master's in engineering management...

Mr. Mas: I've seen your résumé.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good afternoon.



Commissioner Keon: I wanted to hear that.

Assistant Information Technology Director Gonzalez: Good afternoon.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Commissioner Keon: Could you tell -- let him tell us what it is. I'd like to hear what your certifications are.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Can you tell them your certifications?

Information Technology Director Rodulfo: I'm an electrical engineer in electronics, professional engineer, licensed in Florida and also nationally. I have a project manager professional license. I'm a senior member of the IEEE, and also, I have six Lean Six Sigma Belts and also certifications. But our security expert is Nelson Gonzalez. He has a CISSP certification, which is the highest in the cybersecurity world.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: (COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Commissioner Keon: Thank you.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: (COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Assistant Information Technology Director Gonzalez: Yes, sir. Good afternoon. My name is Nelson Gonzalez. I am Assistant IT Director and local agency security officer, registered with FDLE. I've been so for the last 13 years. On the professional field, I have a master's in information assurance, which is cybersecurity management, and a CISSP, as my director said.

It's certified information systems security professional. I'm also a registered ethical hacker and I have certifications in the payment card industry, anything that has to do with cyber security. I have been doing so for the City for 13 years. Like to piggyback on what Director Rodolfo said, we recently undergo a seven-month-long audit process with the Florida Department of Law Enforcement and we received a letter of compliance, which we can show you and this is one of the topics. Everything is in there. We -- every member of the IT Department and the Police Department has a mandatory two -- every two years, they have to take a CJIS certification on how to handle information. And, we do have an enterprise service agreement with Vigilant that strictly specifies what they can do with this data, which is nothing. We own the data, and the agency has total control of who they can share the data with -- to your comment -- by contractual agreement. And, I can answer any other questions that you may have regarding privacy and security.

Mr. Mas: Why is it necessary? The critical question that I have in here is why is it necessary to capture all of this information and store it for the maximum period of time allowed under the statute, which is three years? What is the necessity of it? I mean, if I transit through the city commuting every day to Miami, okay, and other than that, I don't go to Coral Gables, why do you need to keep my records for more than a month? I mean, I understand -- you know, if a crime is committed on a Friday night and you don't realize that your shop has been burglarized until Monday morning, I understand the need to have this historical imagery, okay, for a certain period of time. Or you have a terrorist incident and you want to go back and you want to see, okay, where was this person two, three months ago. But, I think in the interest of privacy that for information that no longer has a legitimate value, you should not be keeping it for three years. And, the reason I mentioned this Internet of Things is because -- and I think you have to agree with this -- the more you connect, interconnectivity of your different silos, okay, that's wonderful for certain reasons, right? But, it also brings up other potentials for data breaching, et cetera, okay. And I'm delighted that you have a cybersecurity expert, okay, but I don't know, you know, to what extent Vigilant is actually being very vigilant with that information that

you're giving them. I mean, I've seen anecdotal information, okay, and hopefully, in our meeting, we'll learn more...

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Sure.

Mr. Mas: Okay, that, you know, this information is, in fact, being shared, you know, with other departments and other entities, okay. So, but my question, at the end of the day, is why the need to keep this information on private citizens for three years.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: So, first, let me reiterate that the information is not sold to the private sector. We verified that through Vigilant. It's kept -- and that's for all cities, so it's part of their contract as well. We do not sell that information and they don't sell it, and we don't allow them to utilize it for private.

Mr. Mas: Do other government...

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: It's only utilized for law enforcement...

Mr. Mas: Agencies have access to it?

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: I'm sorry?

Mr. Mas: Do other government agencies have access to it?

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Absolutely. Other government agencies do have access to it under the same restrictions under Chapter 316.0778, and they have to comply with it. That is absolutely correct. And by the way, we're very transparent. Anyone who's ever asked me for a tour or asked IT or any other member in the police department, we've opened up that Crime Intelligence Center. We want people to see it. All the Commissioners have been through that

center, so nothing is being secret. There's nothing secret. It's very transparent. The poles are not covert, they're overt. We actually put up red and blue on them, so people know that there's a camera there. There's nothing covert about this system at all. We also believe that the system, because they are overt, they bring great deterrent value to the City. As Commissioner Lago said, we've seen double-digit reductions. I didn't say it wasn't because of the cameras. I said that we have a multitude of strategies...

Mr. Mas: Of course.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: That we've put in play, all of which surround and support our men and women, the boots on the ground, provide situation awareness and technical support for them to be at the best place at the best time to have the most highest effectiveness. As it relates to your question, why keep it for three years, it is a standard to keep it for three years, that why. We just followed the prescribed standard under state law. The purpose of keeping it beyond 30 days or less time is because there could be a case that comes to light or a witness comes up a year or two years later. That is the reason why in some departments you'll find a cold case squad and this data can be utilized for that information. But, there is no covert reason why that data is being kept for three years other than following state statute. Nothing other than that.

Mr. Mas: I'm not suggesting there's a covert reason, Frank. I'm not suggesting that you -- that there's...

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: No, no.

Mr. Mas: That there's any nefarious reason for your keeping this information.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: No, no. I just wanted you to know that...

Mr. Mas: But, you're telling that...

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: It's all transparent, that's all.

Mr. Mas: You're keeping it because we can. And my point is, just because you can doesn't mean you should. And if that requires you, after six months, to go out and have your detectives, you know, use good old shoe leather to solve a cold case, then, quite frankly, I would be much better -- I'd feel better with that than knowing that my information is being kept for three years in a cloud controlled by a private corporation, alright, that tells me that, don't worry, you know. You've got nothing to worry about, okay.

Commissioner Lago: So, Mr. Mas, what do you prefer the City do in regards to timeframe? If it's not three years...

Mr. Mas: I...

Commissioner Lago: If it's not three years -- just give me one second.

Mr. Mas: Sure.

Commissioner Lago: Let me just finish. If it's not three years, as per the state statute, what do you view as appropriate?

Mr. Mas: I think that's a conversation worth having.

Commissioner Lago: I think you're going to have the conversation with...

Mr. Mas: I think...

Commissioner Lago: ACM Fernandez.

Mr. Mas: We will have that conversation. I mean, I am not an expert on, obviously, investigative tools, okay. I'm willing to listen as to what information is necessary, alright. But I do know, as a private citizen, that three years seems extraordinarily wrong.

Commissioner Lago: I just -- and just for my own edification, ACM Fernandez...

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: When this private company is approached by, let's say another government agency, whatever that agency may be, do they have to fill some sort of documentation and notify the City that those records are being delivered or provided to another agency -- federal agency?

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: No. They have to comply with the Florida State Statute that I mentioned. They don't...

Commissioner Lago: I'm not...

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Have to notify us...

Commissioner Lago: I'm not familiar with the state statutes verbatim.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Yeah. They don't have to notify...

Commissioner Lago: Okay.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Us that they're going into that database to retrieve information off of a tag.

Commissioner Lago: Okay.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: But, they have to comply with the Florida State Statute.

City Attorney Ramos: And if you might...

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Yes.

City Attorney Ramos: Explain. The reason to go into that database -- am I correct in saying that it's for law enforcement purposes only?

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Absolutely. Only for law enforcement purposes and it is not accessible to the private sector, not accessible.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So, when you have that -- so just a few quick things. And, what I wanted to say earlier is we're not going to solve this up here now. I'm happy to see that we have so many protections in place to begin with.

Unidentified Speaker: Yes.

Vice Mayor Quesada: But even though -- I'm just speaking out of my own personal experience. Just because you have the right protocols in place doesn't mean something you haven't thought of has been looked at. When you have that meeting, I want to be at that meeting. And I'm going to -- when we finish the meeting today, I want to talk to you about getting me some documents before that meeting, because I want to have a few different ideas. I want to see the audits. I want to see what they're looking at. Again, the only reason I'm saying this is because I have a

particularized knowledge in this area that I'd like to look at it from my perspective. Look, I'm sure we're doing everything right, but there's some more questions that I'm going to have that I can be here for hours discussing it, so I'd rather set aside two hours so that we can go through it in detail.

Assistant City Manager Fernandez: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you. Thank you very much. The fact remains...

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That our crime is down, that we have caught crooks, thieves, whatever it is, with the system and that it's working.