



CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

**Wednesday, October 18, 2023, Meeting, 4:00 p.m.
Coral Gables City Hall, City Commission Chamber
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida 33134**

Historical Resources and Cultural Arts

2327 SALZEDO STREET
CORAL GABLES
FLORIDA 33134

☎ 305-460-5093
✉ hist@coralgables.com

MEMBERS	N 22	D 22	J 23	F 23	M 23	A 23	M 23	J 23	J 23	A 23	S 23	O 23	APPOINTED BY
Cesar Garcia-Pons (Vice-Chair)	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	City Manager Peter Iglesias
Margaret (Peggy) Rolando	#	P	P	P	E	P	A	P	P	E	E	P	Commissioner Melissa Castro
Dona Spain	P	P	P	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	P	P	Commissioner Rhonda Anderson
Michael J. Maxwell	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Commission Kirk R. Menendez
Bruce Ehrenhaft	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Commission-As-A-Whole
Brett Gillis	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	E	P	P	P	P	Commissioner Ariel Fernandez
Michelle Cuervo- Dunaj	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	P	P	P	P	Mayor Vince Lago
Alejandro Silva	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	P	P	Board-As-A-Whole
Xavier Durana	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	E	P	Commission-As-A-Whole

LEGEND: A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; * = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member; - = No Meeting; # = Late meeting arrival

STAFF: Anna Pernas, Historic Preservation Officer, Kara Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer, Stephanie Throckmorton, Deputy City Attorney, Elizabeth Guin, Historic Preservation Coordinator.

RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Yvelisse Bonilla, Administrative Assistant

The meeting was called to order at 4:04 pm by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and attendance was stated for the record.

In attendance were Ms. Dunaj, Mr. Gillis, Mr. Maxwell, Mr. Ehrenhaft, Mr. Silva, Mr. Durana, Ms. Spain, Ms. Rolando, and Mr. Garcia-Pons.

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

1. Historic Preservation Board Meeting Minutes September 20, 2023

Mr. Maxwell made a motion to approve the minutes of September 20, 2023. amendments discussed. Mr. Ehrenhaft seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

II. NOTICE REGARDING EX-PARTE COMMUNICATIONS:

Vice Chair Garcia-Pons read a statement regarding notice of ex-parte communications. Board members who had ex-parte communication of contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact.

III. ANNOUNCEMENT OR DEFERRAL OF AN AGENDA ITEM:

1. **CASE FILE LHD 2023-009**: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at **5005 Hammock Park Drive**, legally described as Lot 4, Block 1, Hammock Park, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 71, at Page 43, of the Public Records of Dade County, Florida.

The Historic Preservation Board and Staff have accepted the deferral of this item to the November 15, 2023, meeting.

2. **CASE FILE LHD 2022-007**: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at **1221 Milan Avenue**, legally described as Lot 9, Block 39, Coral Gables Granada Section Revised, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 113, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida on remand from the City Commission.

The Historic Preservation Board and Staff have accepted the deferral of this item to the December 20, 2023, meeting.

V. SWEARING IN OF THE PUBLIC:

The court reporter administered the oath to audience members who planned to testify during the meeting.

VII. SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2023-006: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **4300 Palmarito Street**, a Contributing Resource within the Italian Village Historic District, legally described as Lots 1 & 2, Block 12, Coral Gables Riviera Section Part One, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 28, at Page 31 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for additions and alterations to the property and sitework. Variances have also been requested from Article 2, Section 2-101 (D) #4a and Article 13, Section 13-303 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code for the minimum front setback and increasing the existing nonconformity of the residence.

Ms. Kautz made a presentation accompanying the on-screen presentation. She read excerpts from the staff report and described the property.

Mr. Rafael Portuondo of Portuondo Perotti Architects, Inc., presented the project on behalf of the owner. The Board had discussions on matching the stucco at the addition on the main structure. The staff recommend that the shutters should be removed from the addition to differentiate it from the original building. Mr. Portuondo requested that the Board reconsider the opening proposed at the garage but staff and the Board agreed that it was not appropriate.

A motion was made by Ms. Spain to approve a variance to allow for alteration of vertical expansion of an existing non-conforming structure pursuant to Article 13, Section 13-303 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code as stated in the Staff report. Mr. Durana seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

A motion was made by Ms. Spain to approve a variance to allow a proposed second story addition to have a front setback of zero where 25 feet is required pursuant to Article 2 Section 2-101 D 4A of the Coral Gables Zoning Code. Mr. Durana seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

A motion was made by Ms. Spain to approve the conditions noted above in the design proposal for demolition work, additions and alterations to the residence and site work on the property located at 4300 Palmarito Street and approve the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Durana seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

3. **CASE FILE COA (SP) 2022-033:** An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **1317 Alhambra Circle**, a Contributing Resource within the “Alhambra Circle Historic District,” legally described as Lots 25 and 26, Block 17, Coral Gables Section “E,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 13 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for additions and alterations to the residence and sitework.

Ms. Pernas made a presentation accompanying the on-screen presentation. She read excerpts from the staff report and described the property.

Mr. David Gee of J. Bonfill & Associates, presented the project on behalf of the owner. Mr. Bonfill reviewed the changes that were made to address the Historic Preservation Board’s comments from the December 21, 2022 meeting. Mr. Bonfill worked closely with Board of Architects staff and the Special Master to gain approval of the BOA. The Board appreciated the clarification and the changes made. Staff discussed all windows are to match the historic windows in style, configuration, and operation. Staff has included a condition for the applicant to work with Staff to make sure the windows are accurate to the original drawings. Mr. Silva discussed there should be a differentiation of the rafter tails for the new addition, can still be exposed. Mr. Gillis is not in favor of the way the garage is being executed, he is concerned there is . Would accept it if the roof was flat or if it were recessed more. Mr. Garcia-Pons commented on two things: the oak tree and the infeasibility of it and the separation between the garage and the main house, specifically the wall that covers the loggia.

Public Comment via Zoom: Karelia Carbonell, longtime resident; Ms. Carbonell was not sworn in therefore this comment is not sworn testimony. Ms. Carbonell states the home looks totally different from the original 1930's home. This home has the architectural pedigree of a very prominent architect. It does not have historical integrity. The point is to keep the historical integrity as much as possible. She feels it really changes the look of the residence. Ms. Carbonell believes in the historical integrity of the architect.

A motion was made by Ms. Spain to approve the application with the conditions as noted above and to include; the proposed windows need to be taken to staff in advance and need to match the original configuration, and the rafter tails design should be differentiated from the original, for the design proposal for additions and alterations to the residence the site work at the property located at 1317 Alhambra Circle a contributing resource within the Alhambra Circle District and the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Durana seconded the motion.

The motion passed (Ayes: 8; Nays: 1).

ITEMS FROM THE SECRETARY:

1. Resolution regarding the City Hall windows passed, unanimously approved by the City Commission.
 - a. Ms. Spain stated, at the City Commission meeting the City Manager made it clear that he was intending to remove the windows of City Hall. He also discussed steel windows for smaller profile areas.
 - b. The resolution includes giving the Historic Preservation Board the ability to give non-binding feedback and recommendations on any alterations.
 - c. Mr. Gillis discussed getting a quote for the environmental impact of tearing out all the windows and doors. Also discussed getting a quote for restoration of the windows and doors in addition to getting a quote for replacement of the windows.
2. iPads – HPB is going paperless. Board members will be receiving iPads instead of paper packets. The iPads have been received and will be programmed by IT. Distribution of iPads will overlap with the paper packets for the November and December meetings. The City Attorney will be working on a Use Policy for those that would like to take the iPad home.
3. Landmarks Advisory Meeting – Annual joint meeting scheduled for November 15, 2023, at 4:00pm. The HPB meeting will begin at 5:00pm.

DISCUSSION ITEM:

None.

OLD BUSINESS:

None.

NEW BUSINESS:

1. Mr. Ehrenhaft would like to vote for the Chair and Vice Chair.

A motion was made by Mr. Maxwell and seconded by Mr. Durana to approve Mr. Garcia-Pons as Chairperson. The motion was unanimously approved by voice vote.

A motion was made by Mr. Gillis and seconded by Ms. Dunaj to approve Mr. Maxwell as Vice Chairperson. The motion was unanimously approved by voice vote.

2. Mr. Silva discussed the two revisions to the Florida statute that have affected us: superseding of local voting ordinances, AND any property in a designated flood zone cannot be stopped from demolition if has not previously been declared historic. Last year the Florida Senate and the Florida House bought a bill that would do the same thing for anything that was declared historic. The bill was defeated narrowly, passed in the Senate, defeated in the House. The City Attorney discussed bringing the Commission an update in November. They have been following closely any legislation reemerging similar to the one last year. Part of their legislation priorities which we will present to the Commission in November next to repeal that provision of state law that applies to the Alfred Parker Browning house.
3. 9485 Old Cutler Lane – Mr. Gillis would like Staff to look into this property to see if it will be affected by the new law.

ADJOURNMENT:

A motion was made by Mr. Maxwell and seconded by Mr. Ehrenhaft to adjourn the meeting at 5:55 PM. The motion was unanimously approved by voice vote.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:55 PM.

Respectfully submitted,



Anna C. Pernas
Historic Resources and Cultural Arts Director