

**City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting
Agenda Item I-2
October 24, 2017
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL**

City Commission

**Mayor Raul Valdes-Fauli
Vice Mayor Pat Keon
Commissioner Vince Lago
Commissioner Frank Quesada
Commissioner Michael Mena**

City Staff

**City Manager, Cathy Swanson-Rivenbark
Assistant City Manager, Peter Iglesias
City Attorney, Craig E. Leen
Deputy City Attorney, Miriam Ramos
City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman
Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia
Parking Director, Kevin Kinney**

Public Speaker(s)

Mike Martindill

Agenda Item I-2 [0:00:00 p.m.]

Presentation by Mike Martindill, Principal of Tim Haahs & Associates regarding Smart Parking.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And the item is presentation of Mr. Martindill, principal of Tim Haahs & Associates, regarding Smart Parking.

City Commission Meeting

October 24, 2017

Agenda Item I-2 - Presentation by Mike Martindill, Principal of Tim Haahs & Associates regarding Smart Parking.

Parking Director Kinney: I promise I'm not talking this time. I'm just doing the introduction. Mike Martindill is a consultant that's very familiar with us. Tim Haahs & Associates has done major parking studies. I will tell you that Mike has done at least 600 parking jobs across the country. Tim Haahs & Associates specializes in placemaking and integrating parking into the community. He was one of the two people I thought of the very first time I talked to Commissioner Lago about Smart Parking. And so, I'm happy that he was able to come and share his ideas of Smart Parking and where the parking industry is going with you.

Mike Martindill: Thank you, Kevin.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Welcome, sir.

Mr. Martindill: Hello, guys. How are you doing? Good to see you again. It's been a while, but it's good to be back in Coral Gables. Can we get the presentation up on the screen? There she is. We're going to talk about -- which way do I aim this? Anywhere? Thank you. We're going to talk about Smart Parking. Smart Parking is really a fallout of Smart Cities, the Smart City initiative that started in 2015 and is really taking the cities across the country by storm. And, really -- let's talk about Smart Parking first. But really, what that is, is taking technology and creativity and making parking work better, because parking's a very, very important part of every community, every downtown. So, out of the Smart City initiative, which I'm going to talk about next, the term Smart Parking came around. The Smart City initiative, which started, like I said, in 2015, the United States Department of Transportation put out an invitation to dozens and dozens of cities to challenge them with ideas on how to make their cities smarter. And really, what that means is making transportation and parking work better, helping mobility, which is really one of the big buzzwords now in our industry. So, they sent out all these invitations and challenged a bunch of cities to get involved. And, they shortlisted seven cities to come up with ideas on how to make mobility better, how to make transportation better. And, those cities were Portland, San Francisco, Kansas City, Columbus, Austin, and I can't think of the other two, but they were paid \$100,000 to come up with new ideas to basically move people around; move

goods and services and people around, and that includes parking. So, what do we know about parking here in the Gables? And, this is what a lot of these cities came back with. They came back with great ideas, but really, the on-street parking or the curb space parking is an extremely valuable asset. People love to park on-street. The merchants love to have people parking right outside where their business is or where their restaurant is, so it's a very, very critical asset. And, it's really a link to the community. It's a link to businesses, so that on-street parking has got to work really, really well. Ideally, in every community, you want turnover in parking. You want people to park once and you want some spaces to be available, because people love to find parking spaces, and that's on-street spaces, not the off-street spaces. Big difference between on-street and off-street, as we all know. But it's a way to activate. It's a way to get pedestrians activating the streets, what we call people places. And really, what that comes down to is parking management. How can I take these assets and make them better, make them a better part of the mobility options for our city? And that's kind of what we're talking about today, using technology and innovativeness and creativity to make parking smarter. And really, that, again, goes back to that word I used before. We don't talk about parking as much as we talk about mobility. Mobility is everything. Transits, parking, walking, all of that. And, you all have a lot of great things that you've done here in Coral Gables. For example, the shuttle bus system is fabulous. It's a great way to move people off-site into downtown and not have them park in key areas. As I said earlier, parking management -- and Kevin's doing a great job of this -- it's a hands-on activity, a daily activity to ensure that parking is being presented the way we want it to be presented, as a service, as an amenity to those that visit downtown. So, whatever we can do to make that service better -- and technology is what we're -- what you guys are doing right now. We're making it easier for people to park downtown, i.e., the pay by cell, the PayByPhone, which, by the way, is a national trend. Users love pay by cell mobile technology where, as we all know, we're going that way. In three years, we know that technology is going to change. We don't know what it is yet, but we know it's going to change. The nice thing about the parking industry -- and it took years, maybe decades for it to kind of get its act together on technology. Now technology is racing along real fast. And so, I get pretty excited when I go to these big conferences to see what's out there. And pretty soon, we're not going to have gates anymore.

Pretty soon, it's all going to be by your license plate. That's going to be your digital footprint, your digital permit. We're not there yet, but we're getting closer. And you guys already use pay by plate here. Pretty exciting stuff, but that's part of Smart City, Smart Parking. It all goes back to really technology and how you use it. Well, a good example. I just mentioned PayByPhone. You've got ParkMobile and PayByPhone. Those are the two giants in the parking payment space for paying for parking. It is so convenient and so attractive to pay for your parking that way versus trying to dig for pocket change and even using your credit card. This is a really great way -- and we're going to see this get better. Again, I don't know what it's going to be, but they're already talking about this getting better and getting more user-friendly. Something that Kevin and I -- actually, I've been talking about this to a lot of people, not only in South Florida, but around the country. It's about demand based pricing and that was a big initiative that came out of the Smart Cities analysis or challenge in cities like San Francisco and Portland, and for that matter, even Austin, are all thinking about demand based pricing where you've got a lot of activity, heavy demand. Maybe the price in that area is a little bit higher because of the demand, because of the number of cars and people that are in that zone. San Francisco has already initiated demand based pricing. And in some streets, it's pretty expensive, but people still pay, because it's very proximate parking and very convenient to wherever they're going. Typically, it's restaurants or a place of business, retail. So, I think that's an opportunity here to look at demand based pricing and how that curve may change throughout the day, throughout the day of the week as a way to control parking. Again, what we want to do, ideally, is to have turnover, but we also want to have some available spaces, and that's really important. That was a real big part of the Smart Cities and Smart Parking initiative. We want spaces to be available on-street. We want to get them off-street ideally. Parking regulations and policies need to complement whatever those strategies are, obviously, for any downtown or urban setting and that goes without saying. But, as Kevin mentioned earlier -- and we are big fans of this as a parking consultant -- we want people to park once. And, we ideally want them to walk or use something else -- maybe a golf cart, maybe a shuttle, but keep your car where it's parked, maybe it's off-street. And, that is the mobility option to move around versus parking here, then two hours later, going over here; maybe two hours later, going over and park somewhere else. Park that vehicle

once and walk or use other mobility options to get around, which is really, really important and a big item that came out of the Smart Cities. When we talk about technology, I think what it boils down to is data. We don't have a lot of data yet. The data is coming in. When you use PayByPhone, whether it's park mobile or PayByPhone application, there's a lot of good data that's coming in about demographics, usage, utilization, turnover. This data that's being analyzed right now is going to make us smarter about managing parking. So, as time goes on, and maybe we're two or three or four years down the road, we think all this data that's being collected in our urban cores about parking is going to make us smarter about managing parking, and that's going to make us smarter about our city and how transportation and mobility work. So, it's all about data and that goes back to technology and the ability to capture that data. So, in summary, this whole Smart Parking/Smart City initiative was about how do we manage this asset that we've got, on-street parking, better than we're managing it today. How can we improve loading zones? How can we improve employee parking? How can we improve and encourage more mobility uses, such as shuttles or mass transit or whatever type of mobility option is out there. It really is mission critical to the downtown. And you know, Coral Gables is probably one of the leading cities in the state of Florida with respect to Smart Parking and initiatives, which is good. So -- and again, the last thing I want to kind of end up here on two things. One, it's really all about the pedestrian. We're not really thinking about the car. We're thinking about the people that are driving the car and what we want them to do, what we would like their behavior to be. We think that that demand based pricing is a really smart initiative and something that the City should consider and study and put into effect. So...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Do you have any...

Mr. Martindill: Questions?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Experience -- thank you, sir. Do you have any experience with these systems where with an app, you're told which garage has which space where? And what has been your experience on that, if you have it?

Mr. Martindill: Yes. We do have experience with that. Some communities -- and Kevin mentioned ParkMe, which is one of those apps. There are actually more apps in development that are like ParkMe. People, when they leave their home, want to know where they can go when they arrive into a community.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: But we don't have that yet, right?

Mr. Martindill: Don't have it yet...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Mr. Martindill: But it's coming. But, people are even going to be in a position, based on the Smart Cities initiative, to actually reserve parking -- not a space, but an area.

Commissioner Lago: And that was...

Mr. Martindill: So, when they leave, that's kind of neat.

Commissioner Lago: Mayor, and this is why I brought this up to the Manager, and I'm happy that this gentleman is here to give us a little bit more insight in regards to Smart Parking. This has been up for discussion for almost a year now, and I think it's something that -- when you read a little bit more about Smart Parking -- and I'm no expert, but I've seen what other cities are doing. and for example, there are certain malls in South Florida right now where they're basically -- you know, they're notifying you right when you're driving into a parking garage, stop wasting time on the first floor. There isn't any parking. Go to the second, third or fourth floor. That reduces congestion. That reduces travel time. And, the same thing can be applied to a downtown footprint. For example, on surface parking lots, on parking lots up and down Aragon, you see people driving around looking for that primo parking spot in front of whatever

destination they're looking for or they're trying to get to. The idea is that if somebody could get on an app and say, okay, where am I going? What are the nearest surface parking lots or on-street parking that is available and they could make a quick decision to choose one of those destinations instead of driving around, which, again, correct me if I'm wrong -- I've read that by applying Smart Parking techniques, there's a reduction of around 30 percent. Is that correct or no?

Mr. Martindill: Well, I don't know what the percentage is, but you're reducing traffic and the carbon footprint that cars create, and that's kind of the driving force behind Smart Cities. What can we do to move people around better, more efficiently, and not have cars idling and circulating and circulating and looking for a place to park? So, -- but I don't know what the percentage is.

Commissioner Lago: I've read in different studies that it's around 30 percent, but I mean -- what I would like to see in the near future if my colleagues have an interest in doing it, I want to see us implement some of these strategies. And, I know that Kevin is trying to work on a few different strategies right now. I want to make the experience of going into downtown as simple as possible, especially with all the new infrastructure upgrades that we've done. I think we should try to see if there's an opportunity to, in the next one to two years, come up with a plan that will address our parking in the downtown. And we're going to address the valets now. We're potentially going to build new parking garages on Andalusia. We just finished Miracle Mile/Giralda. We're activating different modes of transportation. You have the trolley and now you have the...

Vice Mayor Keon: FreeBee.

Commissioner Lago: The FreeBee. Thank you, Vice Mayor. And there's other opportunities that are coming that we're talking about TPO. So, what -- can you give me an example of a city

in South Florida that has done an entire study of their downtown to see what options we have and how we can budget for the near future?

Mr. Martindill: Well, the Miami Parking Authority is looking into that because -- and again, they're another one of the leading parking management groups in the whole state of Florida. But, they're studying that and looking at that and what can be done. We're still waiting for the technology to catch up. You mentioned a great example earlier. We actually designed the two decks at Downtown Disney, where as you approach the parking deck, you know how many spaces are on each level.

Commissioner Lago: They have that in Sawgrass Mills right now.

Mr. Martindill: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: In the two -- in the brand-new parking garage that's there.

Mr. Martindill: Yeah. They have the sensors over the parking spaces. So, for example, your parking assets off-street, in time, could have that type of amenity or that service that tells people as they come up to a parking deck, this is how many we have. And by the way, here's where you need to go to get to that space once you get inside the parking deck. More and more cities are -- because the technology or that technology prices has come way down are implementing that kind of amenity, again, to speed up -- not drive fast, but speed up the -- reduce search time and speed up the flow of traffic, of cars. It's really neat. But again, we're not -- there are so many things being developed right now. I want to see where we're going to be in three years versus right now, because we know it's...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, but...

Mr. Martindill: Getting better and better.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: There are cities in the world that have this already and it works very, very well. Barcelona has it everywhere.

Mr. Martindill: Europe is -- actually, Europe led all this.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, but why not us do it?

Commissioner Lago: And it's -- Mayor, I brought to the Manager's attention -- I think it's been like three or four companies that have shown an interest in Smart Parking in Coral Gables. One of them I think is doing it in Paris or in Moscow. Again, just giving -- bringing different companies that could potentially give us a footprint on how to achieve this. But, what I wanted to see was not only what is Smart Parking. I wanted to see if we can get buy in to see if we can implement this strategy...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Commissioner Lago: Over the next two or three years. I know it's going to cost money because...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Over the next six months.

Commissioner Lago: From -- I would love to. That would be a dream to do it over six months. But, I remember having this conversation with Director Kinney about the fact that certain cities right now are going towards -- and I apologize. This is not my field of expertise, but they're going away from the hockey puck...

Parking Director Kinney: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: Mentality on the on-street parking, because they're seeing a lot of problems with that.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: What is -- I'm sorry.

Commissioner Lago: I'll let the gentleman...

Mr. Martindill: It's an element...

Commissioner Lago: Again, this is not my expertise. I've been trying to read up about it, but this is not...

Mr. Martindill: It's basically a sensor that's embedded in the street under a parking space that detects your car is there. They are having problems with it.

Commissioner Lago: They're having problems with it.

Mr. Martindill: So what they're doing, to your point -- and it's -- to me, this is one of the neatest technologies out there is the use of cameras to detect occupied spaces or unoccupied spaces. There are some other benefits to cameras as well, but that's a great technology.

Commissioner Lago: And, I think what you mentioned -- and I -- just to lead into what you're about to say, because I know where you're going because we've talked about this. I think Kevin is -- and I don't want to put words in your mouth, but I think Kevin's been a little hesitant in jumping into these waters, because technology is changing at such a rapid pace. Am I speaking for you?

Parking Director Kinney: That's -- yeah. There's some truth to that statement.

Commissioner Lago: Okay, alright.

Parking Director Kinney: What I would say, though, is -- and I wanted to speak on this because Mike and I haven't had a chance to talk about it. But, our IT Director and I -- Raimundo and I have been talking a lot about the cameras and that as a technology moving forward. And, for example, you mentioned -- right now, if you go on ParkMe, as we spoke earlier, you can see which garages we have, how many spaces are available and what the price is. But, the problem is I can't do that for my surface lots. The camera technology is going to help me do that for my surface lots, because there would be one camera looking at the surface lot. And when the surface lot is full, then when you pull up the ParkMe app, it's going to say don't bother going here; it's full. But, then the follow-up on the garages for when people are driving by or when they get to the garage, yes, absolutely, I -- there's been some issues like painting and cleaning and lighting and elevators that have kind of trumped this. But as you enter the garage, there absolutely should be a board that says if you want a space, you're going to drive to the seventh level, so don't bother looking. Just drive to the seventh level. And that -- I mean, our system will handle that. But, I think elevator comes first.

Vice Mayor Keon: So, are you -- your thoughts are before you would really invest in this, would you wait until the new garages are built?

Parking Director Kinney: Well...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No.

Vice Mayor Keon: Or would you start with the existing garages?

Parking Director Kinney: Well, the two older garages that are going to be redeveloped, I don't see a lot of investment...

Vice Mayor Keon: No.

Parking Director Kinney: There. But, the two garages on Aragon...

Vice Mayor Keon: On Aragon.

Parking Director Kinney: Yeah, we should start investing there.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: I will tell you in our strategic plan for the City part of the -- parking is the last truly in-depth parking study that was done in the City of Coral Gables was 2006. There is one in the planning for '18-'19. And, I do think we should hit hard there the idea of how do we become really efficient with what we have. I will tell you right now -- and no pride in saying this at all. Our parking spaces are used very efficiently. If you would have come to the -- on the 13th, to the event at Giralda...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: They all did.

Unidentified Speaker: Yeah.

Parking Director Kinney: Or I should have said...

Vice Mayor Keon: It was hard to find a parking space.

Parking Director Kinney: Every -- I mean, everybody -- I have one garage with some space left. We got people into all the empty spaces.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Was that on 72nd Avenue?

Parking Director Kinney: Not quite that far away, across from Publix. But you know, we were very efficient in getting our facilities full. And every Friday, we do that. Can we improve? Can we help people or train people maybe to, when they leave their house, say, I'm just going to drive straight to this location, because I know I can park there? Yeah, I think we can get there eventually.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Can we get going on that, though? I don't know if it's a study or whatever it is, but -- or a study...

Parking Director Kinney: Well, the parking app...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: To put out an RFP.

Parking Director Kinney: Exists.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: What?

Parking Director Kinney: You mean, (INAUDIBLE)...

Commissioner Lago: Couldn't we potentially just, you know, put a call out for...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: Unsolicited responses? And I'm going to tell you why, because the certain companies that I've met with that have an interest in coming to Coral Gables, I've swung them all to the Manager and I've introduced them to the Manager. A lot of them told me, look, Vince, this won't cost the City anything. You know, we'll make the investment. They will -- there won't -- let me correct myself. There won't be an upfront cost, okay. There won't be an upfront

cost. Again, they will take a portion of the proceeds, obviously, of the parking fees. But, we know that we have some of the lowest parking fees in Miami-Dade County at the present moment. So, I just want to -- I want to have a discussion, so my colleagues can get up to speed and understand what other cities, not only in the United States, but you know, across the world are doing to really simplify the idea of parking. A lot of people, like, for example, a person like my mother -- my mother likes to park, you know, right next to wherever she's going. I sometimes tell her -- I go, just park in the parking garage. It's much easier. You spend half the time looking for parking when it's much easier, it's safer. It's out of the sun and it's safe. But, there's that stigma sometimes with people parking in parking garages. It makes no sense, you know, and I've tried to explain it to her, but she insists on parking in front of the Mile, which, to me, you know...

Parking Director Kinney: But it is...

Commissioner Lago: After she's gone eight loops around the block and, you know, caused, I don't know how much congestion and averted near catastrophe, you know.

Parking Director Kinney: It is a learning curve. And, if you remember the one slide with the hourly parking in the garages, our community has been getting more educated and more comfortable with using (INAUDIBLE) facilities and that's something that's going to continue. And yes, we need to do everything we can help -- do to help them know where to go without driving around the block.

Commissioner Lago: Maybe we could do a study with one street, you know, like the other side of Aragon, or you could do maybe the other side of Giralda or Andalusia to kind of -- I would like to see not only the parking garages, but I'd like to see on-street parking, some sort of answer to...

Parking Director Kinney: That -- again, the cameras that are being...

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Parking Director Kinney: Installed, we're making sure that the software can be used on those to identify, you know, how -- occupancy. I will tell you, I'm fairly set against trying to direct people to an open space on-street, because I will tell you, if you try to get to an open space on the Mile that's on your app, it's not going to be there when you get there.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Correct.

Parking Director Kinney: So, we're trying to direct people to where we know we have capacity.

Commissioner Lago: But, maybe it's not about directing them to an open space. Maybe it's notifying them that there isn't an open space, for example.

Parking Director Kinney: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: You know, like, for example, there's no open space on the Mile, stop looking. You can look at the following different, you know, parallel side streets that, again, are an option. Or go to the following surface parking lot or go to, you know...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: But, this system has been installed in many cities already. Why don't we get going on that -- the system of -- you know, in parking garages at least?

Parking Director Kinney: Oh, the one on the...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, yeah.

Parking Director Kinney: Parking garage?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Parking Director Kinney: I will price that out.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Why don't we price that out?

Parking Director Kinney: It's available, and I will talk to the Manager about it...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'm talking about the parking garages, which I think is very, very effective, yeah.

Parking Director Kinney: Yeah, absolutely. And...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: When we purchase the new systems in the garages that was one of the options...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Perfect.

Parking Director Kinney: And it wasn't authorized, but I'll get the pricing.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Will you? Great.

Vice Mayor Keon: Can I ask a question about the differential parking? How big is that differential for it to be effective?

Mr. Martindill: For the demand-based pricing?

Vice Mayor Keon: Yes. Like what's the elasticity...

Parking Director Kinney: Well, I can give you our experience.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: So, when I came here, pricing on-street and in the garages was exactly the same. So, people always looked for the space on the street first. I won't claim that it's only because of the change in the rates, but right now, we have, in our core area prime spaces, \$2 an hour on street. Right now, in our parking garages, it's \$1 an hour, and that is one of the big things that has driven that...

Vice Mayor Keon: Is pushing people.

Parking Director Kinney: Two and a half percent...

Vice Mayor Keon: What about -- I mean, like what about on a street like the Mile now that it's -
- you know, once it's done and it's open and it's redeveloped? What do you...?

Parking Director Kinney: You have authorized \$2.50.

Vice Mayor Keon: Is that enough?

Parking Director Kinney: Whether that's enough...

Mr. Martindill: Well, it needs to be tested. I mean, it's...

Parking Director Kinney: It may have to go up.

Commissioner Lago: But, let me ask you -- just -- what the Vice Mayor is saying is a good point. We authorized that. Give me an example of other areas in Miami-Dade County -- for example, I know you can't park on Lincoln Road, but on the side streets, I park there, and it's pretty expensive.

Mr. Martindill: Oh, yeah.

Commissioner Lago: I don't remember, but you think -- you put a dollar, two dollars, and it's 15 minutes, 30 minutes. It's not...

Mr. Martindill: Yes.

Parking Director Kinney: They went to \$4 an hour on the Beach.

Commissioner Lago: I knew it.

Parking Director Kinney: But see, one of the issues...

Commissioner Lago: Four dollars.

Mr. Martindill: And people still pay it.

Commissioner Lago: And people still pay it, and they're not even on Lincoln Road. They're on a side street...

Mr. Martindill: Right.

Commissioner Lago: In a surface parking lot.

Mr. Martindill: Right.

Commissioner Lago: Which you still have to walk to the destination.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, thank you very much. Thank you, sir.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.