City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting Agenda Item H-4 August 26, 2025 **City Commission Chambers** 405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

City Commission

Mayor Vince Lago Vice Mayor Rhonda Anderson **Commissioner Melissa Castro Commissioner Ariel Fernandez (Absent)** Commissioner Richard D. Lara

City Staff

City Attorney, Cristina Suárez City Manager, Peter Iglesias City Clerk, Billy Urquia

Public Mr. Ahmadzadegan(s)

Shamim Ahmadzadegan, AIA | Principal, Gensler Maria Cruz **Jackson Rip Holmes** Patrick Ilabaca Lisa DeTournay

Agenda Item H-4 [1:40 p.m.]

A Resolution of the City Commission providing direction to the City Manager regarding design options for the Mobility Hub

Mayor Lago: We have our final time starting before lunch, which is item H4. And I appreciate our friends from Gensler for their patience. Thank you so much. Item H-4.

City Attorney Suarez: H-4 is a resolution of the City Commission providing direction to the City Manager regarding design options for the Mobility Hub.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Good afternoon.

Vice Mayor Anderson: Thank you for being here.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: I was going to say Mr. Mayor, but he's speaking right now. Good afternoon, Vice Mayor. Thank you. Commissioners, of course, the City Manager. Happy to be back and presenting some options to you.

Vice Mayor Anderson: I appreciate that.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: So, I don't know who has the presentation that they could put up on the screen.

Vice Mayor Anderson: Clerk, do you have the power?

City Clerk Urquia: They should have it available.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Thank you. Then I can just click it. Okay, thank you.

Commissioner Castro: When you're showing the presentation, can you let me know where Andalucía is? Yeah, when you're showing the rendering.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Sure. Yes, of course.

Commissioner Castro: I was looking at it last night and I'm like, oh, I was like turning around.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: You were wondering which one was Andalucía.

Commissioner Castro: Yes.

Vice Mayor Anderson: Andalucia where Publix is.

Commissioner Castro: No, the mobility hub. So, I wanted to know what section of the building was actually facing Andalucía...

Vice Mayor Anderson: The ramp side faces Miracle Mile and the entrance and exit side faces Andalucía. That's the simple explanation. So, you pull in the building, and you make a left to go up the ramp. Okay. So that you have enough queuing before you get to the ramp, so you don't have a backlog onto Andalucía. Be able to keep people moving as opposed to causing a traffic jam like we now have on Andalucía.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Exactly.

Vice Mayor Anderson: So, very well thought out there.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Yes.

Commissioner Castro: Is there any way to put like a rendering of like the Actors Playhouse in front of those just to see how it matches?

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: A rendering of Actors Playhouse?

Commissioner Castro: Yes.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: We don't have it in this particular presentation, but absolutely, you can, we can have renderings.

Commissioner Castro: I want to see like the harmony that it causes like as a backdrop.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Okay, we can do that.

Mayor Lago: Okay, can we do something very quickly?

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Yes.

Mayor Lago: While we wait for this to upload.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Yes.

Mayor Lago: We can take another item, that'll be quick.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Okay.

Note for the Record: The Mayor took up another item in order for the Gensler presentation to download]

[Item was resumed]

Mayor Lago: Mr. Clerk, how are we doing with the upload?

City Clerk Urquia: I have it available whenever you're ready.

Mayor Lago: Alright. Let's go. Perfect. H-4. Back at it. And then we're going to hear one more item after this, and we'll go to lunch. Okay.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Okay, let's try this again. Again, good afternoon, Mr. Mayor, Vice Mayor, Commissioners, City Manager. I wanted to start the presentation by just a very quick evaluation of the Mediterranean style of architecture for a parking structure. So, again, you're all very familiar with the Mediterranean Revival style. The arched openings, the low-pitched clay tile roofs, stucco wall finishes, ironwork carved details, and really the necessity to have depth so that you can read

all of the three-dimensional design components. As you know, this site is actually very limited. So, the entire facade is pushed flat to the extent of the site to have an efficient parking structure. Mediterranean Revival really depends on the depth to create like a layered massing that is typical, the arcades and the terraces. Unfortunately, because of this site, we're not able to do that. Everything is flush and flat, which begins to create a lack of authenticity when you're trying to create a Mediterranean Revival style. There's also efficiency and sustainability that's going to be a big part of this. As you know, the style adaptation of a Mediterranean Revival for a parking structure could lead to reduced air flow and daylight for obvious reasons. There are higher operating costs because of that, greater energy use that is associated with that, and it's really inconsistent with the city's sustainability goals. So, we're really thinking about the function of the structure over just a style and a facade. So again, the Mediterranean Revival relies on enclosure and heaviness and depth, and garage really requires openness and airflow for performance. So, applying these historical styles creates a form and function mismatch. The other thing is really safety and visibility. So, the deep recesses limit light going deep into the parking structure itself. And what we're trying to do is really create a structure that supports daylight and transparency, visibility, which also creates a sense of safety for the public. Merrick's vision really was about a cohesive city that was still diverse. So, it embraced variation through themed villages. So, you have the Chinese, the Dutch, the South African, the French. I just heard talk about an Italian. So, it really talks to this idea of diversity within Merrick's vision as well. So, he really promoted placemaking and adapted to the setting and the climate. Just as an example, obviously, the newest garage is a more minimalist, modern design. It complements the architectural language of Coral Gables while still maintaining a clean and contemporary aesthetic. It also allows for the natural light to come through, which obviously improves safety and also allowing for efficient and effective ventilation for the mechanical systems themselves. So, we brought this up as just a recent example of one of the latest garages that have been built in Minorca. So, in conclusion, the idea is that it should be authenticity over imitation. Again, parking structures, because of their function, demand openness and light and safety. Again, Merrick's true legacy is really about variety. And our approach is honoring Coral Gables through a contextual, functional, and timeless design that goes beyond the historical style. So let us get into that. And I don't know if I need to go through this. If everyone is aware of the difference between the parking structure and what a mobility hub is, I don't need to dwell on it. So, we'll go through that and get straight to the facade. So, our approach here was really looking at the options that go beyond the style to capture the soul of Coral Gables. And our thought was, okay, what is the soul of Coral Gables? And it's really about the context of the lush tree canopies that you see, the texture of the native coral stones that you see around. And that really reflects the city's deep bond from our perspective with nature and place. And if we can combine that with an architectural expression, then I think we've really hit something that goes beyond just an imitation of style. So, let's start with our first option. The first concept is called Vertical Canopy. It draws this idea from the beautiful vertical palms that you see on Miracle

Mile itself. It's kind of echoing the local tree forms themselves. We still wanted to incorporate biophilia by having the cascading greens on the facade of the project as well. And then all the way on the right, it's really about the dappled light and the evening glow as the light goes through these vertical fins. So, we started with an exploration of just looking at what that could look like conceptually. So, these images are not specific to this project. They're just looking at what happens when you take this idea of the vertical fins and apply it to the parking structure and mix a little bit of biophilia in there. This is actually how it could be when we're looking at the building itself. So, you had asked about where is Andalucía. So, the longer facade that you're seeing there is kind of that corner. So, the Cheesecake Factory is right in front of us, just to put it in context. So, what this is showing is really a vertical striation with different depths that as you come closer to the building, allow the light to trickle through. But still hide the cars so that obviously we don't want to see the cars through that. There's a boxed-out area where, if you remember in the original design, we had a placeholder for a piece of art and sculpture that could still be there. You're seeing that the staircase, which is an exit stair, is also open and bright again for safety reasons, but also for architectural reasons. If we now move to the view from Miracle Mile, you're beginning to see the openings that were designed originally for the project, incorporated into this design. So, you have the biophilia directly on the facade in two locations. So, one location you see directly on the corner, we have that opening area that expresses the ramp for just a little bit. The green that you see behind it is an existing wall. That's another location we felt would be really unique and interesting for mural art to happen. So again, all of these facades, especially facing Miracle Mile, are all about the art, which is facing that ramp, the biophilia, and also this beautiful rhythm that we've created on the facade with just these simple vertical slats. And this is just a closeup of what that could be as an art piece. This is also another view, again on Andalucía, kind of right where the cars are going to be coming in and out of the project itself. This again shows it in a little bit more context because now we're closer to the building itself. You're able to see that what we did with the facade is actually raise up that facade as it comes to the corner so that as you're walking towards the building, the first thing that you actually notice is the biophilia on those slabs. So, it really brings nature and grounds it back to the street. You're also seeing the colonnade that we've created that's going to have retail at that ground floor. So, it's going to activate that street instead of just being dead parking spaces. And of course, this is that cut through that we have that allows the building to really funnel people all the way through into the Miracle Mile itself. And of course, the activation of art, this beautiful express staircase that takes you up onto the second floor, the plaza space, and also the retail that's going to be there at that ground floor. So that was option one. Option two, we're calling Carved by Nature. This one is really taking the idea of the voids that you see when you're looking through the very, very dense tree structures and conceptualizing it into an abstract shape. So, for us, this was reminiscent of either kind of the tree canopies as the light goes through it, what type of pattern you get, or the abstraction of coral rock patterns. So, it's really connecting to very specific points of nature within Coral Gables itself. These are just kind of very

quick studies of what it could be as an abstract shape and form. And then this is what it would actually look like on the building. So, one thing to note, to help break down the scale, what we did is, we chose two tones of metal panel so that instead of being a kind of very long, relentless facade, we were able to break it down into smaller pieces to help with the scale of the building itself. So, you see that the top square portion is a lighter color. So, this would be an off-white. The bottom portion would be a little bit more of a champagne color. So, it's not too harsh of a contrast, but it's just kind of a very simple way of helping break down the scale. So again, you're able to see this beautiful filigree pattern that you could imagine, especially at night, would really become an artwork itself on the facade. This becomes the entire facade facing the Miracle Mile. Again, incorporation of biophilia on the facade and this beautiful veil that we've created hiding the cars behind it. This one shows kind of an approach of, I know that Vice Mayor Anderson was concerned about the ramp. And so, the idea of having an extended guardrail with biophilia fronting the facade itself would allow for that safety as people are driving up because I remember this was an issue in the beginning. This is another closeup of the entry as well.

So again, you're able to see this beautiful filigree pattern that's reminiscent of the tree canopies, that's reminiscent of coral rock, and an abundant amount of biophilia so that as you're walking towards this parking structure, it really connects you back to nature. Thirdly, we have one that we're calling Deco-Tropical. So, the idea here was, could we take some of the geometric abstract forms of the deco building next to us and bring that into the parking structure itself? Again, not in a literal way, in an abstract way, and still include the biophilia within that. And these are some kinds of investigations that we had done. And then ultimately kind of looking at these very rounded shapes that really refer back to art deco in terms of the way the lines move, that streamline action that you see there. But again, it also looks like almost over-scaled tree fronds or leaf patterns that you see on the facade. Still, the idea is that we would have areas where we would have sculptures on the project itself, biophilia would still be very abundant within the openings here. Again, this is that main entrance right off of Andalucía. And you can see that the perforations are there. It's harder to see in the images that are farther away, but you can see that all of these are perforated panels to allow light to still come through the project. So, this is a design comparison for you so that you can see all three options at the same time. So, the first one, the Vertical Canopy, the second one Carved by Nature, the third one Deco-Tropical. And this is from all the views. This is Miracle Mile. Again, all three concepts. And this is at that main entry off of Andalucía itself with the three concepts. So, this is what we have for you. I tried to make it brief, by the way.

Mayor Lago: So first and foremost, thank you for that. You did an amazing job. I think these designs are beautiful. A little bit of an echo, Mr. Clerk. An echo?

Vice Mayor Anderson: There is an echo. Good to hear yourself twice.

Mayor Lago: All right. I think the time has come to make a decision. We've got to start moving forward. It's all good? So. Is that better? Are we good?

City Clerk Urquia: Yes.

Mayor Lago: I think it's time that we start moving forward. We have to make a decision. You look at the current state of the parking garages on Andalucía. You know, we've hit a crossroad here. And I think what we're facing here right now, and we have to be honest with ourselves, is that how do you make a parking garage Mediterranean? The example is, look at the Aragon parking garage. I've had conversations with Willy Bermello, who was the architect of that project, and he told me, Vince, this is what they told me I had to do. I had no other choice. But this is not Mediterranean. Putting some tiles, small windows, and a precast, that's not Mediterranean. What you have there right now, if you're in that facility, and I'll leave it up to my Parking Director, who has a lot more experience than I do, you have, in my opinion, and I parked there once in a while to charge my electric car on the second floor, it's dark, it's not welcoming, and you're not going to get that Mediterranean feel. It's just virtually impossible. Because the Mediterranean feel has small windows. So, I think we have to be honest with ourselves and have a real conversation and say, we've been talking about this for years. We have got to move forward. Portions of the facade of the building have fallen. Okay. Nobody wants to park there as a result of an antiquated structure that's not built for today's cars. So, what I'd like to see is for my colleagues either make a decision today and then have a real conversation about G4 and recommend the Manager start addressing G4 in one form or another. I know that's outside of your scope, but something that I think we need to have a conversation here and start giving the Manager the runway to have that conversation. Yes, Madam Vice Mayor.

Vice Mayor Anderson: So, before I start talking more about Mediterranean, I want to point out a couple of things. We think all of us, maybe just a couple of us, got an email this morning about noise and that particular one happened to be a generator. I've also gotten complaints about noise in the fans from Mediterranean style garages. It's horrible when you go in the garage. It's an annoyance when you're outside the garage. Then you have a bearing go and it's really got over the top. So, if you haven't experienced it, go take a trip down to Trader Joe's. There is no adequate ventilation even with the additional fans running. So, making a Mediterranean garage is not necessarily the best thing to do, especially on a site that's so small depth-wise that you can't effectively do it. They're dark, you can't see through them, and you end up with what, because I worked a long time on the Mediterranean ordinance trying to improve the architecture. You end up with that wallpaper Mediterranean that is not Mediterranean at all. I have made a suggestion for Art Deco in that block because you have several other existing pieces of architecture that are Art Deco. You have the Miracle Theater. You have what is now Supercuts, used to be Supercuts and now Starbucks that have that language of Art Deco and then on the opposite corner where the

Cheesecake Factory is, you have also a rounded type of architecture there. A couple of comments. I mean, there's always room for massaging something once we have an overall choice on which one we want. I lean toward the one in the middle.

Mayor Lago: Yes. I like Carved. Carved is beautiful, option two.

Vice Mayor Anderson: So yes, I lean there. Other than plastic plants, I don't know what's going to grow on those ramps. So, I think from a practicality point, we got to look at not only is it going to grow there, plus the reality is it's not going to get light half the year because the sun is on the south. It's not going to get sun on the north and it's going to get burned. The plants have to adjust. So might need to look to tweak a few things here. So, the other thing that I had-

Mayor Lago: Can I add something to that, Vice Mayor? Just to her point, which I wrote down here when I gave my comments is, let's look at PAM. Let's look at where PAM, beautiful design, but where maybe they didn't think about certain things or maintenance is an issue. The trees have been an issue. The maintenance-

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Talking about the hanging.

Mayor Lago: Yes, because she mentioned that right now. It's a very good point that she mentioned. And you drive by it; it's such a masterpiece and then the trees are dead. It doesn't look so good.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Yes.

Vice Mayor Anderson: So, one of the things I had talked about with our very qualified Landscape Director is the ability to put some vine in a confined area on the building. One little spot on the east and one spot on the west. Why did I suggest that? Because you get the morning sun, you get the evening sun. And I think there's a way that we can kind of tame it. I call it wisteria. She knows what the heck it's called in South Florida language. There's a vine and it's been put on some of the buildings in one of the parking garages in South Miami. And it's got a woody stem, and it could utilize what you've already designed and grow up it. You know, how high it's going to grow? Your expert is over there. So, she can give you some guidance there. The other thing that I spoke to the Manager about was the fact that, you know, some of these dead corners we can make into a productive area. And a time to think about it is now because you may need to adjust the floor plate a little bit. Make a hole in it to allow some more height. Climbing gym. There's a market for it. Top Rope requires a certain amount of height. I Googled it as to whether or not there's a market for it. The closest thing we have is a bouldering gym which provides no top rope capability. It's only about a 20-foot height. You need about 50, I think, feet, 50 to 60 feet. You guys are the architects. You can think about this. And then it would also create revenue. Because I really just don't think people are going to sit out there in chairs at level whatever it is to, you know, unless there's something. I mean, is there going to be a juice bar or something where they can sit out there

and enjoy a cool beverage on that level? So those are some of the things I want you to think about. And instead of biophilia on the ramps, let's look at another way that we can give that feeling to folks that they have security. And perhaps the art needs to go more on the exterior so that it's not blocked by whatever that security feature is, that feeling that you're not going to be falling off the ramp. So, I think you've made a tremendous improvement. And I'm looking forward to the next step of this.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Thank you.

Commissioner Castro: Through the Mayor.

Mayor Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Castro: So, number one, I see that you put a lot of thought and work into this, and I'm very appreciative of that. And I want to thank you for that. Honestly, when it comes to the Mobility Hub, I was very closed. And coming into this meeting, I want to be more open-minded and see the options. I see you worked hard on this. There were two designs that I think we can work with. But I would like to see what the Actors' Playhouse looks like in front of it. The other thing is, I feel like some of those designs, it's like I'm going to Lincoln Road, and it's like something I'll see in Lincoln Road. Not just beautiful, but just not here, especially in front of some places that look historical. One of my questions is, why so tall? I just, if I can imagine something in back of the Actors' Playhouse that's like what you're showing me, I would imagine it at a lower scale. Why did we choose to go so tall in that area?

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: So, I can explain that. In order to hit the parking requirements for the city, which was in the end 626 cars, I believe, because of how thin the actual site is, we had to go vertical so that we could actually be able to fit 626 cars on that site. So, it's only driven by the parking requirement number. It's driven by nothing else. So, it's a very functional reason, and it's a very, very efficient site.

Commissioner Castro: So, it's the number that the city gave you that we needed as far as available parking, basically.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Correct, yes.

Commissioner Castro: And Monica, is there any flexibility on that?

City Manager Iglesias: Through the Mayor.

Mayor Lago: Yes.

City Manager Iglesias: If I may say, Mayor. What we're doing is we are using parking garage one as a mobility hub for future micro and mobility needs. Besides having a park on the roof, it also takes care of garage number four. So, we have a combined garage number one and garage number four. So that's one of the issues that we had. So that's why we came up with 626.

Mayor Lago: And if I may. Again, this is nothing new. It's been discussed for 10 years. You have two parking garages that are antiquated that need to be replaced. So, either you build two parking garages, or you build one, you sell the other land, you put that money into this building, and you pay down the debt. And you have a parking garage that is producing positive income. This is something that's been talked about, that's been written about. The Herald's written about it. Community Newspaper's written about it. Miami Today's written about it. This is nothing new.

Vice Mayor Anderson: So, Mayor, I'll just add that I did, and it's up on the website, publish a memo.

Mayor Lago: Yes.

Vice Mayor Anderson: Portion of which was also published in the Miami Herald that did the parking calculations supported by the city's documentation and the city's parking studies. Historically, you know, we needed this parking, and we've been kicking this can down the road for how long? I don't know. I've lost track.

City Manager Iglesias: Through the Mayor?

Mayor Lago: Yes.

City Manager Iglesias: Yes. We have, both parking garages are operational obsolete. Parking garage four doesn't even have, doesn't have an elevator to the second or third floor. We can see what's happening, parking garage one, the facade's coming off. So, the idea was to merge Parking Garage One and Four, and then do something different on, certainly maybe a P3 or something different on garage, on the site of Garage Four, which is the one right across from Publix. The vice mayor actually brought up a very good point concerning noise. The fact that a Mediterranean garage has small windows, it makes it very dark and uninviting. It also provides forced ventilation, so you have to have that noise, because you have to get rid of the carbon monoxide, and you have to either have it sufficiently open, or you have to force it out. And so, one of the things about the Mediterranean concept is, I believe one of the reasons why the Biltmore is so beautiful, it doesn't have a parking garage pedestal. It's got a garage on the west. So, the idea was to combine Garage One, and also actually in the future, as our mobility needs change. We have the Minorca garage, which is a very important garage, because it's part of our EOC, of our Emergency Operations Center. It's been hardened, and it's been designed to store vehicles in case of a storm. And then the mobility hub would be the central hub for all mobility, all future mobility needs, making in the

future as mobility changes, maybe the other garages become obsolete, and we create a Coral Gables Parking Authority. And at that point, we keep these two garages, and everything else turns into mixed-use buildings, which in effect bring more people into the downtown.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Yes, sir.

Okay. Through the Mayor.

Mayor Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Castro: I don't feel that a building that scale, and I understand the explanation the City Manager is giving, is really compatible with the neighborhood, honestly speaking. I think it's beautiful, but at the same time, I feel that if we would have scaled it down a little bit, it would form some harmony, especially in a street that's very important to us, with the backdrop of the Actors Playhouse. I don't know what the estimated price of that project is today. I know three years ago; it was like \$64 million. I'm very curious about that now. And I think that this is a very large investment, so this needs to go to the public. This needs some public input. After we have maybe choose one or two designs, this needs public input. And if I were to choose one of those designs closer, it would probably be Carved by Nature or the Vertical Canopy, but I cannot imagine what it looks like as a backdrop, and I think that's one of the most important things to me.

Mayor Lago: So, the code, correct me if I'm wrong, Mr. Manager, the code currently allows 190...

City Manager Iglesias: 190.5, Mayor.

Mayor Lago: 190.5. So, this is within the code. And at the end of the day, nothing that this Commission did, we need parking in the downtown. There is no other way to make this building smaller, unless you remove floors of parking, which at the end of the day, in my opinion, is not in the best interest of the city, because you're investing in your downtown. Your downtown represents 27% of your tax base. You need to provide parking for your downtown. So, we can get caught up in the story that we've been caught up and politicize this, but at the end of the day, our downtown is 27% of our tax base. You have to provide the necessary parking for our downtown. Whether you like the design or you don't like the design, it's a different story, but the infrastructure, the structure itself is a necessity. What I would like to see is I'd like to see us provide the Manager with guidance to move forward on G4, P3 partnership, 99-year lease, first sale, use the funds from that sale and have it directly injected into G1. Just going to give a number. It was a \$25 million sale. You have to go out to market. By the way, as you know, and I know, because we're in the industry, I'm going to give an example. Phillips Park came in at over \$1.2 million cheaper than the budget that we had estimated. Why? Because as I told several people, when they mocked me and laughed at me here, winter's coming, winter's here. Prices have gone down significantly. Our tax

base has gone from 12%, increased to 11%, to 8%, to this year 5%. So, when you look at the construction, and you can talk about it, how competitive is the market right now?

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: It's very competitive.

Mayor Lago: Very competitive. So, winter's here. So, what ends up happening is that when there's competition, you have to lower your prices, lower your prices. Phillips Park today is a prime example of that. It is 25% cheaper than we thought it was going to be. Correct?

City Manager Iglesias: Mayor, we assumed \$5.1 million came in at \$3.9 million.

Mayor Lago: \$3.9. The numbers don't lie. They're there. So, if it's \$64 million, or it's \$60 million, or it's \$67 million, we'll find out when we move forward. But if you're going to protect your business community, which is subsidizing the residential neighborhoods to the tune of 27%, you have to provide parking. We don't live in a community where people have flying cars or the infrastructure necessary like New York does, like Chicago does, where they have actual subway that can take you from point A to point B. So, in this community, due to the weather, due to the lack of infrastructure, people drive their cars. So, we can continue to go back and forth in politics and theater and the whole thing about the building is too big and this and that, but at the end of the day, this is a reality. We have to make decisions. Just like the windows of the city, of this City Hall, are a reality. No more political theater. Let's move on. Things that need to be addressed.

Vice Mayor Anderson: Mr. Mayor, I have a couple of questions for the Manager. The building's not 190.5 feet but put it on the record.

City Manager Iglesias: No, it's under 150.

Mayor Lago: 150.

Vice Mayor Anderson: It's under 150. And the other question is, would it not cost more to build two separate parking garages than just build one?

City Manager Iglesias: Yes, much more.

Mayor Lago: Much more, much more. So, let's leave this up to the professionals and let's leave the politics out of it because you end up costing the city tons of money. Okay. We've got to make a decision. We got to make a decision. This has to come to it. So, this is my advice. My advice is we give the Manager we like two, for example, I think Carved looks very nice. It's a beautiful design. And I also like option three. We tell the Manager, let's move forward with whatever it is the consensus is here. We move forward with that. And we tell the Manager, start negotiating G4. Because I do not want to take out a 50, \$60 million bond. I wanted to cut that in half by hopefully selling G4 or doing a P3 partnership in that project. Which is, by the way, nothing new. It's been

discussed for over a decade. Okay. Do my colleagues have any other, anything else they'd like to say?

Commissioner Castro: Yes. Through the Mayor.

Mayor Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Castro: So, I know that making two garages would be a little more expensive. But from the sentiment of residents, that height in the garage is not something I can budge for. I am budgeting for a mobility hub, something I was very closed on. Okay. But right now, I will not support any of these if the scale is that high. If we want to go ahead and provide enough parking between the two garages and phase it out or put a plan to make this happen, I'm all for that, but not in the back of Miracle Mile. I cannot for any point accept that or approve it or vote on it.

Mayor Lago: Can we do, how about this? Can we design the parking garage underground, 10 stories?

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Absolutely not, no.

Mayor Lago: No, we can't?

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: No.

Mayor Lago: Can we do it like some sort of portal where you drive your car into and you go into like a nebulous state that no one sees the parking garage? Just give me ideas. How do we resolve this? You got to be better. I mean, Gensler is world-class, but you got to do better than this. This is all you brought to the table today. That's it? You can't do anything else? Help me fix this problem. How do we fix this?

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: So, given the requirements that we have and the laws of physics, this is what we can do in order to fit 626 cars on that particular site.

Mayor Lago: Okay.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: There's nowhere else we can deal with the specific requirements of what we're being asked to design.

Mayor Lago: So, I'm going to move forward on a few items that I want to put on the record, Mr. Manager, and I hope that my colleagues will agree, tweak, change. Let's put this out there. Number one, I want to make sure there's a shade study done. I think it's important, so we get a better understanding.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Just a question, is it self-shading or are you interested in getting the shade study of what facades get?

Mayor Lago: Yeah.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Sunlight specifically for landscaping.

Mayor Lago: Yes, both.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Or what shade is being given by the structure to the surrounding area?

Mayor Lago: Yes, both.

Mr. Ahmadzadegan: Okay.

Mayor Lago: That's what I would like, and the Manager, this is through the Manager. Okay. Because I know that's going to be one of the conversations that they mentioned. Even though we're not going 190, we're going under 150, which is, again, by law, allowed by the code. I want to make sure, like the Vice Mayor said, address the issue of the foliage is important. Using PAM as an example, Paris Art Museum. I want to see an action plan for G4, which should include paying down the construction of G1. Whoever buys or partners up with the city at G4 has to build G1, which will do it extremely more economical than the public sector will. Curate G4 in a fashion that is residential. I want to make sure that G4 is residential so that we have life in the downtown, so that people come after work, live, work, and play. They stay -- they go to the restaurants at Miracle Mile and Andalusia. I want to continue to build on our downtown. And the final portion is I'd like to see maybe instead of an art sculpture, I know I'm way ahead of myself, just putting it out there now. I'd like to see maybe a beautiful bronze wall mural on the first floor. I think it's something that will be on the wall. It will be out of the way. And I think you could entertain an artist, which I think would be amazing by the name of Hernan Bas, who does these beautiful landscape scenes out of bronze. He's a Miami artist. And I think he'll be a beautiful artist to be considered. I'm going to leave that up to staff but just throwing it out there. So those are a few things, and I'm a fan of option number two. Madam Vice Mayor.

Vice Mayor Anderson: And I would, you know, taking into account the comments I've already made, you know, I'm a fan of option number two. I concur with the other points that you made on G4, you know, because we do need to address both issues. It is, I think, the most balanced approach to dealing with a number of issues, and I'd rather build one garage, as I had written in my memo, rather than filling up all the activated areas of our city with parking garages. And I think that's the best approach that we can do. I think it's the best budgetary decision that we can do, because we're not in the business of construction. And having a private entity do this P3 type of partnership will deliver to our residents at the best price an efficient garage that is beautiful. I mean, I'm the one

that brought you the pictures of the Miracle Theater and the Supercuts to influence your decision on the architecture and inform it. I can visualize it, just because it's something that I can do, because probably because I did art extensively when I was young. So, I think it will complement, and it won't overpower, like a facade that is Mediterranean, faux-Mediterranean, I would call, and clash with the Miracle Theater itself. So, thank you for the effort, and I look forward to seeing additional tweaks on the building.

Mayor Lago: And I think that a point that the Vice Mayor made needs to be really memorialized, and that is the exterior will be softened significantly instead of having a slab of concrete that runs the length of the project. And also, the colors on number two especially were a lot softer. And I thought it was a very beautiful, beautiful approach.

Commissioner Castro: Through the Mayor.

Mayor Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Castro: I just want to put on the record what I understood, and I'm wowed right now, because I didn't even know this was the thoughts behind what was happening. So, we want to sell the other garage, right, to then sell it to someone who will make a development there, most likely residential. And to be able to cover for that parking that we're going to lose, we're going to put those two garages into one garage that will fit 626 cars. That's the reason that we're making it so tall. Instead of dividing both garages within the two parking's, which would be easier for people to park closer to different businesses. I didn't know that was the plan. I didn't know the plan was to go ahead and sell the other garage, to go ahead and more development, to go ahead and put another building, probably as tall as the mobility hub. I will not vote for this. Absolutely not.

Mayor Lago: Let me provide you with a little clarity, because I understand that you're seeing this for the first time. I'm dumbfounded that you're seeing this for the first time, because I know you just moved into the City of Coral Gables four years ago,

Commissioner Castro: I've lived here over a decade. Okay.

Mayor Lago: But let's be honest with ourselves. Let's be honest with ourselves. Let's be honest with ourselves. Commissioner let's be honest with ourselves. There have been multiple iterations of projects where G4 was redeveloped into a multifamily site. The last one was Allen Morris and Related project that came to this Commission, which I voted against. This is nothing new. That site was always going to be residential.

My issue was the 6.0 FAR that was being proposed. The Vice Mayor, Bill Kerdyk, that can provide a lesson here, because he was well aware of what happened. This is nothing new. This is what it

was. I voted no because of the magnitude and the size of that project. That site allows you 190 feet. This parking garage is 150. I've always wanted residential. If you talk to anybody that owns property in downtown, they say that they need more activation. They need more people living in the downtown. So, when five o'clock comes and the business closed, people don't leave town, and it becomes a ghost town. Ask anybody that knows about real estate, they'll tell you, you want to live, work, and play. So, it's not about development. Project is going to be built no matter what. It's about putting pieces together in the right areas that will make our city sustainable. Now, if you're going to get rid of one parking garage, that's how you got to the number of 600 plus. It's always been like that. I can't do the research for you. The research is all over the internet. It's in many articles. The Herald's written articles about it. Community newspapers have written articles about it. This is the second or third time today where you haven't heard or seen something and it's incumbent on you on doing your homework and seeing what's going on in this city. And I'm sorry to put it to you that way because those are the facts. We have to stop kicking the can down the curb. We have to do something with these parking garages, just like we have to do something with these windows. So, we have to move forward. You can be in opposition, it's perfectly fine. And I welcome that again. But at the end of the day, something has to be done. I've given a little bit of my input. The Vice Mayor has. Commissioner Castro is opposed. She says she's seen this for the first time ever. Commissioner Lara, would you like to provide a little bit of guidance and see what you think of the project, so the Manager knows how to move forward?

Commissioner Lara: Yes. So, I agree that we need to be moving forward. It's been too long in a stalled-out mode. I think that your presentation was spectacular. Everybody has an opinion as to which one they like. So, let's just focus on that for one second. I really like number one. I don't think necessarily that number one would be as complimentary. You know, if number one was all by itself somewhere or in the renderings, but it probably isn't as complimentary as number two is. I really didn't, wasn't my cup of tea number three. But it's a shame when you drive into the city and you have these two garages that are so dilapidated that it's worse than that. They instill sometimes fear. Like, I'm a father of three daughters, my wife, nobody wants to go into that garage and they're afraid of its safety, right? So clearly the need is there, it's overdue. And I understand the plan. And the plan makes sense to me. And I feel that the city needs it now, but I also believe that the city will grow into it in time, right? I've been thinking about and meeting with different residents as well as business owners about how we can start jumpstarting economic activity in our downtown, because I'm also appalled by the number of vacancies that I'm seeing spring up. Miracle Mile and around the area, Giralda even, I have had members of the Chamber send me photos at 6.55 p.m. of an empty Giralda, right. So, I think the Mayor's point is well taken. If it's only going to be driven by businesses being built or office spaces being built, they vacate at the end of the closing day. And that doesn't help businesses like restaurants, for example, that need to be open, not just on Friday nights and Saturday nights, but they need to be all week long. So having more residential, if it's smart, if it's appropriate, if it's driven by the market and it's in conformity with

the vision of what's best for the residents and the vision of Merrick, it makes sense to me. But we can suffer continued paralysis through over-analysis, or we can make a decision to go forward today. I'm ready to go forward today.

Mayor Lago: Okay. All right, Mr. Manager, what do we need to give you the guidance necessary to move forward?

City Manager Iglesias: Mayor, it would be good if we pick one of the solutions and allow us to move forward with design. And then I would like to be able to work on something on garage four, some type of P3 on garage four, so I can bring that alternative. We always have the alternative of building it ourselves, but we also have a very good opportunity now to look at a potential P3 using garage four and potentially having construction savings.

Commissioner Castro: Through the Mayor.

Mayor Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Castro: Are we planning on doing this without any public input or reaching out to the community? We're going to hear and choose a design and not let the community even have a conversation?

Mayor Lago: Commissioner. There was just an election. The election was very clear in the outcome. They chose three people by a significant margin and the decision was made. We have to stop kicking the can down the curb. We have to stop doing things based on group think. The Commission has to take bold steps. We have to do things that are productive. I know that this will now make it tomorrow in Political Cortadito and the magazine and Felix Pardo's magazine or whatever it's called, the Gazette. It'll be all on tomorrow. I know. Who knows what they'll say. They'll say that I'm building and then I'm the owner. They're going to sell it to me. It's fine. My point is this. My point is, we have to move forward. This idea where, you know, we have to have every single piece of input. We've been talking about a garage, and I would love to have the Vice Mayor up here because he has so much more experience and Chip. We've been talking about a garage for 20 years, possibly. It's got to get done. Just like the windows here in City Hall. So, at the end of the day, I know we want to do massive outreach and get everybody's input. I understand. But we have to move forward. We have to.

Commissioner Castro: Yes. Through the Mayor. Really quick, through the Mayor. This is a project that's over \$60 million. It is a significant investment to the city. So, for us to just bypass voters, not voters, but residents and input, it's a very big deal. It's a very big deal. Here, let's just choose a design. We're going to pay over \$60 million. But yeah, let's make, because there was an election. I'm sorry. We cannot, we cannot let voters.

Vice Mayor Anderson: So...

Mayor Lago: Let me, I'd like to respond, Madam Vice Mayor.

Mayor Lago: Before you came to Coral Gables, I had the privilege of working on a project that is called our Public Safety Building. That was a, how much was that building?

City Manager Iglesias: \$63 million.

Mayor Lago: \$63 million. That building was a massive investment, probably the largest investment in the city's last 25 years, would you say?

City Manager Iglesias: At least, Mayor.

Mayor Lago: We did not go out for public input. We did not discuss the design. At the end of the day, we did what was right and everybody was happy. When you add the parking garage adjacent to it, how much is the parking garage?

City Manager Iglesias: Parking garage, it was \$18 million.

Mayor Lago: \$18 million. So, you're talking about \$81 million dollars. Okay. So that is a massive investment that we did. This Commission is in place in this position to lead. Every person that you speak to that owns property in the downtown will tell you that these parking garages have to be revamped. It is time. It is time. We have to make the necessary investment. I've already been through one failed P3 that was a debacle. And now we're here in a position where we can finally address this issue and bring real parking solutions to the downtown that will last for the next 15 to 20 years. We have to stop kicking the can on the curb. Yes, Madam Vice Mayor.

Vice Mayor Anderson: So, I'm going to add to that. We had public input.

Mayor Lago: We did.

Vice Mayor Anderson: We had public meetings. And unanimously and overwhelmingly, the request was for an Art Deco building with some plants on it. We've delivered. And you delivered beautifully. As far as public comment, comments coming in to me as well while we're real time here is applause for option two. My secondary choice was going to be option one. But my primary choice was going to be option two because taking in context the block that it's in. Okay. There's always going to be differences of opinion, whether it's a Picasso or a different piece of art. It's because we are different. Every single one of us is different. But that doesn't mean that we're going to continue to allow the disgrace that is our parking garage, number one, to just sit there. I had the opportunity to knock a lot of doors as well as Commissioner Lara and the Mayor recently. We

need to move forward on this. People do not want to park in these old garages. We have shoring poles in them. We cannot continue to kick this can down the road.

Mayor Lago: All right. So, we've been pretty clear. I think we stand with option two. Is that correct, Commissioner Lara?

Commissioner Lara: I'm for number two.

Mayor Lago: Okay. And we've discussed that we have to find a revenue stream to address this issue. I would like to take out as little debt as possible. But I'm okay taking debt on this issue because there's a revenue stream attached to it, which is parking. I think that we need to find an answer for the debt. And it'll be a combination of going out for a bond issuance and also G4. And I leave that up to your discretion to come back to the Commission. But I think it's time to move forward. This building, again, for the record, before the blogs come out and say it's a massive building, you could build 190 feet here. You're talking about a building that's under 150 feet. Okay. I want to commend you, you and your team, along with the Parking Director, the City Manager, Matt, everyone for being here. Thank you for doing a wonderful job. This has been a long haul. Okay. I appreciate Gensler being a partner and really working on this. Madam Director, would you like to say a few words?

Parking Director Beltran: Yes. Thank you very much. Good afternoon. Monica Beltran, Parking, Sustainability, and Mobility Director, which is great, right? That symbiotic relationship between mobility and parking. I thank you very much for the opportunity. I understand the concerns. I am the liaison for the Parking Advisory Board. I understand the concern, but all I could do is I could tell you that parking is a quality of life, business, and work need, okay? So, we need to meld all of this together. The proximity of these garages, not very practical to have two garages in such close proximity, one walk after the other.

Mayor Lago: Can you do me a favor? Just for the record, just for the blog, so they can hear you. Can you repeat that as a parking expert?

Parking Director Beltran: The proximity of the garages is the quality of life, work, and business?

Mayor Lago: No, no, building two parking garages next to each other.

Parking Director Beltran: The proximity is not practical. However, okay, to be fair, I understand because I hear it every day. I heard it yesterday. Somebody, a resident came and yell at me about not more lots here. I get it, but it's not practical. And so, what I would urge as a parking, I'm not a parking professional for some reason. I'm a parking aficionado that-

Vice Mayor Anderson: It's a good thing.

Parking Director Beltran: Go figure, right? I mean, why? Parking can be beautiful. Leave it. And the parking industry can be beautiful, but it can also be practical. So, I would urge that in this process, that at the very least, we keep in mind circulation. So that once inside the building, you feel comfortable moving. That's very important. So, parking has to be functional, but parking can be beautiful. You can drive many places and see these beautiful parking garages. In fact, I think in Miami Beach at one point, the problem we had was that people didn't know that it was a parking garage, because it had all those plants outside, right? So, we can make it. And the other thing is I urge the city and that we take into consideration the transition. So that we have a multi-pronged approach to where we accommodate parkers during this whole process. And that would have to be in that process of going from G4 to G1 only. Or sorry, the garages as you know. Mobility is very important. Charging is very important. Alternatives are very important. The garage is beautifully located close to our very, very successful trolley route. And so, all I can say is that sometimes we give up some things in the desire to solve others. It's a compromise and that we should keep beauty and functionality and practicality when we transition very much in place. I do know that, and I hear it that there's a lot of concern about the buildings. But you can make circulation within very functional so that you can feel a little more comfortable.

Mayor Lago: Mr. Manager.

City Manager Iglesias: Yes, Mayor. Just to add to that and clarify. One of the great issues about the mobility hub is its usability. High ceilings, very open, high security. All these issues have been addressed. In addition to that, we understand that we can't really tear down Garage 4 until we build Garage 1. So, all those issues have been taken care of from a user perspective. So, we've addressed all these issues before. What we need to do now is just move forward and decide what we're going to do. And so, if we like Garage 2, we will come back at next Commission meeting with there will be some additional costs to finalize this design. And then of course, the ability to work on a P3 for Garage 4.

Mayor Lago: Okay. Do you need a motion?

City Manager Iglesias: Yes, Mayor.

Mayor Lago: Can I have a motion?

Vice Mayor Anderson: I'll move it.

Commissioner Lara: Second.

Mayor Lago: We're going to have public comment. Can I have public comment?

Commissioner Lara: Second.

City Attorney Suarez: Mr. Mayor. Sorry, Mayor. The motion, is it with respect to Design 2?

Mayor Lago: Yes.

Mayor Lago: Mr. Clerk, public comment?

City Clerk Urquia: Yes, Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Lago: Yes.

City Clerk Urquia: First speaker is Mrs. Maria Cruz.

Mrs. Cruz: Mrs. Maria Cruz, 1447 Miller Road. There's an old saying about a penny that keeps coming up or turning up or whatever the case it is. Some people like to change history. We can say anything we want today and quote history. But let me tell you, it won't take long for me to do the research and prove some people wrong. The previous election, we keep saying this election was we have the power. They voted for us to do whatever we want. No, that's not the case. Actually, the previous election, the big issue was the mobility hub. Hello? We keep saying that people want the mobility hub. No, the people did not want the mobility hub. This is the reason it's been taking this long because we keep coming back with something that the people do not want, period, the end. That's the bottom line. We are doing, I hear you, and this is like listening to a developer. We get a small lot because we cannot fit everything we want in the small lot. We have to be -- no, we do not want that type, that height in downtown. And I'm glad that Commissioner Lara at least had some common sense and said, look at the vacancies. We're worried about this. Downtown is providing 27% of the income. Hello, go and count empty stores all over the place. But some of you cannot count. Why are we talking about a parking garage? I remember the first time we talked about this; people soon would not be driving. Pretty soon, parking garages will not be needed according to Peter Iglesias. I'm going to go look for the minutes. That's why we had to have a building that we could transform into something else. Oh, now we're talking about we need parking cars. Wow, we forgot already. I, once again, we are living under a condition that this is not Coral Gables. The issue here is, and I'm sorry, when are we going to talk to the people? When are we going to ask our residents if they're good with this? If they're good with this, wonderful. But you can't say, well, you know, we have to move on. So, we're going to make the decision. And by the way, not everybody's happy with the Police and Fire Building. Not everybody's happy with all the repairs that have to be done already. Not everybody's happy with a building that could not be fixed. And now we have a beautiful building there, even though we couldn't fix it, even though it was sold for nothing. And now the other people got it, and they were able to do it. Listen, history cannot be rewritten unless you live in a communist country. And the way it's going, maybe...

Mayor Lago: Mr. Cruz, please finish your sentence. Your time has elapsed.

City Clerk Urquia: Jackson Holmes.

Mr. Holmes: So, thank you for your comments, Mayor.

City Clerk Urquia: Mr. Holmes, please state your name and address for the record, sir.

Mr. Holmes: Thank you. Jackson Rip Holmes. I live at 35 Sedonia here in Coral Gables. I own property abutting this garage. And that's why I've championed it, along with Mayor Lago, along with City Manager Iglesias for how many years? As long as we've been talking about it. But I do have a caution. And I think that Commissioner Castro is pretty smart, because what she said... I don't like the idea of pairing this with selling off Garage 4. If that's the deal, I don't think we should do it. Now, I do think we need to do this garage. I want to acknowledge, I don't know the finances here. I had the idea maybe you were going to do the parking lots over on the other side, with Gables LLC, whatever it is, and use that money. The idea that we're going to sell off the bigger garage in order to shrink to the small. I mean, I just don't...Here's the thing. In this conversation today, City Manager Iglesias, you made mention of Miracle Mile going mid-rise. And the problem I see, Mayor, and you struggled with this, you heroically resisted the Allen Morris stuff because you said, we can do it better. We don't need to cave in to developers. But the thing is, here's the future I see. And I'm glad that Mr. Lara's new to this because he's pretty open. The future I see is the developers... We go to a mid-rise Miracle Mile, and then the developers poach what little I have behind my little store, and they take it away. They say we are the 800-pound gorillas, and we're taking the Publix parking because we're the developers. That's what they tried to do down the street at Galliano and Miracle Mile. They tried to poach and not even live up to the parking code. So, I've kind of said a lot of different things here. If I were you all, I would say, let's go forward with this beautiful mobility hub. And I commend Shamim for having redesigned it to make it much more palatable to some of the people who were worried about a garish-looking garage. It's a safe garage. And let's work on the finances. I would not, not, not...If I was voting today and they said, you got to sell off Garage 4. No, no. Even though I love this garage, we need the garage.

Mayor Lago: Thank you.

City Clerk Urquia: Patrick Ilabaca.

City Clerk Urquia: Yes, sir.

Mr. Ilabaca: Yes. We definitely need a garage. I like number two, even though it doesn't really look like Coral Gables to me, but number two is the best of the three. If you guys do decide to change all the other garages, it'd be great to have all the same, since most of Coral Gables does look the same. That'd be kind of cool, plus maybe saving costs in future design. And three, in order

to obtain more revenue for the city, may you consider putting an ecological car wash and have a revenue share so the city can make some money off some car washes. There's not a lot of car washes in Coral Gables. There's a new one over at the Crown, I believe, and then there's one at Merrick Park. Aside from that, I really don't know. And people like to get the car washed if they're going downtown. They're going to spend some money, spend a little bit more, and the city can make some more. That's it. Thank you.

Mayor Lago: Thank you, sir.

City Clerk Urquia: I'm sorry, Mr. Mayor. We're going to go to Zoom next. Lisa DeTournay. Asking her to unmute.

Ms. DeTournay: Can you hear me?

Mayor Lago: Yes.

Ms. DeTournay: I'm sorry I can't be there in person, but I was earlier this morning. Regarding the mobility hub, I have an idea how you could reduce the height by getting rid of the retail floor on the bottom and the park on the top that probably no one will ever use since it's not easily accessible. I can also say that I would never be parking on floors six, seven, or eight of a parking garage, no matter how safe you say it might be. Thirdly, I support all the comments that Commissioner Castro has brought up. I think that she's brought up some very important points that might be sidestepped by people on your Commission that have already decided what they want to do. And please, Mayor Lago, I am disappointed in your frequent condescension of her ideas and comments. I also, and I keep up pretty well with the going-ons here in the city, but I also was unaware of your plans to sell off the other garage to finance this one. And I only recently saw anything about the newest designs for the mobility hub based on the agenda that you have for today's meeting. So I think it's very important that you ask the opinion of a lot of people that live here and not just rely on the fact that you all were elected recently by a large margin of votes, but mobility hub was not the biggest issue that I recall in the last election, nor were there any designs or height plans that was discussed during your election campaigns. Thank you for listening.

Mayor Lago: Thank you. Mr. Clerk, do we get a last name for Lisa, the attorney?

Commissioner Castro: DeTournay.

Mayor Lago: Okay, I want to respond.

City Clerk Urquia: That's it, Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Lago: Oh, I'm sorry?

City Clerk Urquia: That's it.

Mayor Lago: Yeah, thank you. I'll close that. Number one, the issues of P3 partnership opportunity. We've got to find some sort of revenue. It's the same thing that was proposed the previous go around, but the FAR was way more than I was willing to accept. That's why I voted no on that project. At the end of the day, we have to find revenue. We just can't continue to give away money every single day. So, moving forward, it's either going to have to be a P3 partnership or the lot's going to have to be sold. That's what's going to have to happen to be able to pay down the debt and be able to assume as little debt as possible for garage one. It's simple economics. It's the truth and it's what has to be done. Moving on, anything else? All right, so you have a motion and a second.

City Clerk Urquia: I do, sir.

Mayor Lago: Okay.

Vice Mayor Anderson: Yes

Commissioner Castro: No

Commissioner Lara: Yes

Mayor Lago: Yes

(Commissioner Fernandez: Absent)

(Vote: 3-1)