



# The City of Coral Gables

## Historical Resources Department

### CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, July 16, 2015, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	A	S	O	N	D	J	F	M	A	M	J	J	APPOINTED BY:
	14	14	14	14	14	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	
Janice Thomson*													Mayor Jim Cason
Venny Torre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Vice Mayor Frank C. Quesada
Elizabeth Ghia*													Commissioner Jeannett Slesnick
Alejandro Silva	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Commissioner Patricia Keon
Alexander Adams*													Commissioner Vince Lago
John Fullerton*								E	P	A	P	P	Historic Preservation Board
Robert Parsley	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	City Manager
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	City Commission
Judy Pruitt	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission

**LEGEND:** A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; \* = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member; - = No Meeting

**STAFF:**

- Dona Spain, Historic Preservation Officer
- Kara N. Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
- Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant, Historical Resources Department
- Miriam S. Ramos, Deputy City Attorney

**GUESTS:** Dorothy Thomson, Jenifer Briley, Roy Gonas, Owen Morrel, Laurie Jewell, Stuart Debowsky, Angelica Guiteras, Greg Guiteras, Aida T. Baladi

**RECORDING AND PREPARATION OF MINUTES:** Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:06 p.m. A quorum was present.

**MINUTES: MEETING OF JUNE 18, 2015:**

A motion to approve the minutes of the June 18, 2015 meeting was made by Ms. Pruitt, seconded by Ms. MacIntyre and unanimously approved by voice vote.

**DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:**

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex-parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

**DEFERRALS:** Ms. Spain announced that a representative of 927 Valencia Avenue would request a continuance, which would be addressed in order on the agenda.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, July 16, 2015

Continued

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan, Notary Public, administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

SPECIAL PRESENTATION TO DOROTHY THOMSON:

On behalf of the Historic Preservation Board and the Historical Resources and Cultural Arts Department, Ms. Spain presented and read a plaque of appreciation to Mayor Dorothy Thomson for her years of service on the Board. Mayor Thomson expressed gratitude for the gift and also for the privilege of serving the City on the Historic Preservation Board.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATIONS:

CASE FILE LHD 2015-04: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 927 Valencia Avenue, legally described as Lots 17 to 20 Inclusive, Block 9, Coral Gables Section "A," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 102 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Mr. Gonas requested continuance of the case, explained the reason for the request, stating that additional time was needed to prepare. Ms. Spain added that the designation was the result of a historic significance determination and a request for a possible demolition, further explaining why it appeared on this agenda. She said the continuance was not a problem if the Board approved.

Mr. Fullerton made a motion to approve continuance of the case regarding the property at 927 Valencia Avenue, which was seconded by Mr. Parsley and unanimously passed by voice vote.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2015-010: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 800 Coral Way, a contributing resource within the "Coral Way Historic District," legally described as Lots 9 and 10, Block 1, Coral Gables Section "A," according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 102, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requested design approval for an addition and alterations to the residence.

During Ms. Kautz' presentation about the property, its background and alterations, she displayed and described photographs of the neighborhood and the proposed addition and alterations. She cited staff issues, stating that existing conditions were not accurately depicted in the drawings and many proposed windows didn't match existing (original) windows. Ms. Kautz said the architect needed to clarify actual plans for the proposed replacement windows. She said no variances were requested and the Board of Architects reviewed and approved the plans without comment on May 21, 2015.

Architect Debowsky, representing the homeowners (present in the audience), reviewed the site, residence, and plans for the addition and alterations. Regarding the windows, he said the existing windows were single-hung and was proposing to replace them with single-hung Colonial windows on both the existing house and proposed addition. He explained that the openings proposed to change in the original house were windows on the west side that faced the next-door property, stating the goal was to add more light and egress to a bedroom.

Mr. Torre opined that the design configuration appeared somewhat choppy, adding that the house might benefit from a simpler design solution. Ms. Silva asked Mr. Debowsky to comment on conditions stated in the staff report.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, July 16, 2015

Continued

Mr. Debowsky reviewed with Ms. Kautz the conditions in the staff report, which stated: the windows needed to be clarified and corrected drawings submitted for the COA file; window type "H" should be single-hung units and not a horizontal roller; all windows need to have dimensional, high-profile muntins; and the window that is being blocked up on the west elevation should have a recess or score line as a memory of the window opening. Ms. Kautz requested clarification from Mr. Debowsky, who described negotiations with the Board of Architects which resulted in the current proposal.

Mr. Adams asked if the architect intended to apply all single-hung windows. Mr. Debowsky replied in the affirmative. Mr. Adams said the survey appeared to include a terrace or post on the opposite side of the pool, to which Mr. Debowsky replied that a wall backed the pool and would remain. Mr. Adams advised that the wall should be shown in the drawings. He also agreed with Mr. Torre's comments about what he termed a complex, disorienting addition design. He advised that the design would cause roof costs to be expensive versus a more simple design in keeping with the house, Mr. Adams also commented that the design for the bathrooms and windows would face the back of the fountain wall rather than the pool.

Mr. Torre invited additional Board comments. Hearing no requests, he welcomed the homeowner to the podium.

Mr. Guiteras briefly described his history in the community, stated that his wife had managed the design project while he focused on management of the family business. He said his only interest was that his project investment would include a change to the exterior of the house. In the absence of any exterior changes, he pointed out that the east side of the façade was covered in brick, which was unsightly, and asked to paint the brick.

Mr. Torre suggested first continuing design discussions before addressing brick issues, and invited audience comment. Hearing no requests, he closed the public hearing and asked the Board to continue discussion.

Board comments:

- Ms. Thomson: concern about master bath window facing the pool; disliked red brick;
- Mr. Torre: citing the significance of historical context, the original brick does not detract from the house;
- Mr. Silva: opposed painting the brick;
- Mr. Adams: in favor of cleaning the brick rather than painting it; exterior of design seems overly complex and distracting from the historic house;
- Ms. MacIntyre: regarding the discolored brick, she suggested consultation with a historic technology organization that addresses such issues; suggested online research through [preservationnation.org](http://preservationnation.org), a part of the National Trust; and said painting the brick was not the solution. Ms. Spain said the National Park Service may have published a bulletin about brick and would research it.
- Mr. Torre: reviewed staff's reference to Secretary of Interior Standards regarding historic characteristics of the property, one of which is the red brick;
- Mr. Parsley: supported a preference for painted brick.
- Mr. Fullerton: has no problem with the shape of the addition; it presents a good opportunity for landscaping creativity; agreed with not painting the brick.

Mr. Fullerton made a motion to approve the application for issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 800 Coral Way, and for design approval for an addition and alterations to the residence with staff conditions. Mr. Silva seconded the motion.

Thursday, July 16, 2015

Continued

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Torre. Nays: Mr. Adams.

Mr. Parsley made a motion to approve painting the brick, leaving the color decision up to staff to work out with the homeowners. Ms. Ghia seconded the motion.

As discussion about painting continued, Mr. Guiteras showed Board members the photograph of the house on Granada Boulevard that inspired his idea to paint the brick on his house.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Fullerton, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Parsley, Ms. Thomson. Nays: Mr. Silva, Mr. Adams, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Torre. The motion failed.

#### AD VALOREM TAX ABATEMENT:

CASE FILE AV 2011-002: An application requesting ad valorem tax relief for the property at 814 Coral Way, a contributing resource within the “Coral Rock Residences Thematic Group Historic District” and the “Coral Way Historic District,” legally described as Lots 7 and 8, Block 1, Coral Gables Section “A,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5 at Page 102 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The related Certificates of Appropriateness, COA (SP) 2010-22, COA (SP) 2010-22 Continued, and COA (SP) 2012-001 were granted design approval by the Historic Preservation Board.

Ms. Kautz reviewed the definition of ad valorem tax relief, what is included in restorations that qualify the tax abatement, and the process and procedures of securing ad valorem tax relief. Thereafter, she reviewed 814 Coral Way, its history, architecture and relevant information while displaying historical and current photographs, stating that changes over the years were minimal. While describing alterations and restorations that were performed, she displayed before and after photographs, stated the estimated cost of the entire project, concluding that staff recommended approval of the ad valorem tax relief request and announcing that the homeowners and architect were present in the audience. Ms. Spain commented that the restoration was beautifully and thoughtfully done.

Mr. Torre inquired about the wood used thematically in the restoration. Ms. Briley responded that the wood paneling was reclaimed Cyprus from the St. John River.

Mr. Fullerton made a motion to recommend approval of ad valorem tax relief for the property at 814 Coral Way as requested. Ms. Ghia seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Mr. Adams, Mr. Fullerton, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

#### ITEMS FROM THE SECRETARY:

Temple Judea application update: Ms. Spain reported that the waiver of the Art in Public Places for Temple Judea went forward and was approved by the City Commission.

White Way lights update: The issue of the City obtaining the locations from Florida Power and Light for the white way lights was approved by the City Commission. The lights, designed by Denman Fink, will be restored.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, July 16, 2015

Continued

Miami-Dade Historic Preservation Resolution regarding Coral Gables Elementary School windows: Ms. Spain read verbatim the last portion of the June 17, 2015 resolution regarding restoration of the wood windows.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

Support for Resolution / Coral Gables Elementary Windows: For the record, Ms. MacIntyre voiced her support of the resolution regarding the wood windows at Coral Gables Elementary School and requested an opportunity to be part of that resolution. The motion was remade to include all Board members:

Ms. Pruitt made a motion to adopt a resolution stating the Board strongly supports that the School Board should comply with the zoning procedures of the City of Coral Gables as related to historic preservation. Ms. MacIntyre seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

Email Address Correction: Mr. Fullerton corrected his email address on the Board list.

National Historic Preservation Act 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary: To observe the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the National Historic Preservation Act, a major catalyst to preservation in the United States, Ms. MacIntyre suggested the Board plan an event to commemorate the anniversary and highlight preservation in Coral Gables. She suggested forming a planning committee. Ms. Spain advised that the committee meetings would need to be publically noticed and held in a public place. Minutes of the meeting must be kept. Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Silva, Mr. Adams and Ms. MacIntyre volunteered to serve on the committee.

Sarah Anderson Event: Ms. Spain reported that the July 13<sup>th</sup> event to honor Sarah Anderson was successful. At Ponce de Leon Plaza, there is a coral rock boulder and a large bronze plaque in honor of Mrs. Anderson, a member of the first Historic Preservation Board. Many of Mrs. Anderson's family members attended.

Developer Workshop: Ms. MacIntyre discussed workshops sponsored by the Board in the past, stating there is interest by Dade Heritage Trust and The Villagers to collaborate with the Board in planning and conducting a workshop aimed at developers. Ms. MacIntyre asked the Board to consider using remaining funds from the last workshop to partner with other organizations to plan and implement the developer workshop. Approximately \$400 remains in the workshop fund.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to use the balance of workshop funds to be dedicated to hosting a developer workshop in partnership with other organizations. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting adjourned at 5:13 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Dona M. Spain  
Historic Preservation Officer