



The City of Coral Gables

Historical Resources Department

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, October 13, 2011, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

| MEMBERS: | N | D | J | F | M | A | M | J | J | A | S | O | APPOINTED BY: |
|----------------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|-----------------------------------|
| Dorothy Thomson | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | - | P | P | P | P | Mayor Jim Cason |
| Margaret Rolando | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | - | P | P | E | P | Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr. |
| Alejandro Silva* | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | - | P | P | P | P | Comm. Maria Anderson |
| Venny Torre | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | - | P | P | P | P | Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr. |
| Kendell Turner* | P | E | P | P | P | P | P | - | P | P | P | P | Comm. Frank C. Quesada |
| Richard Heisenbottle | E | P | E | P | P | P | P | - | P | P | P | P | Historic Preservation Board |
| Deborah Tackett | P | P | P | E | P | P | P | - | P | E | P | P | City Manager |
| Dolly MacIntyre | P | E | P | P | P | P | P | - | P | P | P | P | City Commission |
| Judy Pruitt | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | - | P | E | A | P | City Commission |

- A = Absent**
- P = Present**
- E = Excused**
- * = New Member**
- ^ = Resigned Member**
- = No Meeting**

STAFF:
 Dona Spain, Historic Preservation Officer
 Simone Chin, Historic Preservation Administrator

RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

GUESTS: Grisel Alonso, Chapman Smits, George Richards, George Peon, Maggie Miranda, Huber R. Parsons, Jr., Jose Ferradaz, B.J. Batchelder, City Attorney Craig Leen, George Volsky, Rafael Gomez, Greg Kauffman, Janice Thomson Mills, Lisa Bennett, Connie and Tim Crowther.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Richard Heisenbottle at 4:04 p.m. A quorum was present.

MINUTES: MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 15, 2011:

Ms. Turner corrected the spelling of Tom Graboski's name.

Ms. Turner made a motion to approve the minutes of the September 15, 2011 meeting as amended. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Heisenbottle read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. He then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

DEFERRALS/WITHDRAWALS: None

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan swore in audience members who planned to testify during the meeting.
LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATION:

CASE FILE LHD 2011-02: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at **1248 Coral Way**, legally described as Lots 5 and 6 and Lots 7 and 8, Block 1, Coral Gables Section "D" Revised, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 74, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Spain explained that the owner of the residence is the U.S. government, represented at this meeting by Assistant U.S. Attorney Grisel Alonso, who relayed that the property was deeded to the U.S. government by James H. Davidson, Jr. to help reduce the national debt. She requested deferral of historic designation until January 2012 because the government wanted to sell the property.

City Attorney Craig Leen informed the Board that he was present to advise the Board if needed. Ms. Spain referred to and disagreed with a portion of Ms. Alonso's letter that stated the government did not receive sufficient notice. Ms. Spain expressed concern about continuing the application after a property sale, stating that the residence should be designated prior to a sale.

Mr. Heisenbottle invited additional audience comment. Ms. Alonso responded that the U.S. would provide full disclosure to prospective buyers, stated that there was considerable interest in the property and pointed out that the U.S. government paid no taxes to the City during its ownership. She added that the purchaser of the property should participate in the historic designation proceedings.

Mr. Huber Parsons expressed disappointment that the U.S. government would attempt to sell the property without the historic designation, and urged the Board to designate the property.

Ms. Alonso disputed Mr. Parsons' comment, restating that full disclosure would be made, and demolition would not occur without Board approval. Mr. Leen advised the Board that he had no doubt the U.S. would disclose if they made the commitment, and added that the Board could provide more time to the U.S. at its discretion. However, he continued, if the designation were to occur after the sale, new owners may not designate the property. There followed a lengthy discussion between Board members, Ms. Alonso and staff about the condition and maintenance of the residence as well as the possibilities attendant to deferral.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to continue the application to the next scheduled Board meeting. Ms. Tackett seconded the motion.

To a suggestion by Mr. Silva that the motion to defer be conditioned on no sale during the 30 days, Mr. Leen advised that the applicants could not be prevented from selling unless they agreed. Mr. Heisenbottle posed the question to Ms. Alonso, who responded that she saw no harm in the City's granting the 30-day deferral, having the property sold during that time and having the purchaser appear before the Board. When asked why it was to her advantage to have an additional 30 days, Ms. Alonso restated that she wanted designation to be the responsibility of the purchaser.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: Ms. Thomson, Ms. Turner, Mr. Heisenbottle.

Mr. Torre arrived at 4:35 p.m.

AD VALOREM TAX RELIEF:

CASE FILE AV 2005-03: An application requesting ad valorem tax relief for the property at **2723 Country Club Prado**, a local historic landmark, legally described as Lots 13 through 16 inclusive, Block 13 of Coral Gables Section "D" Revised, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 25, at Page 74, of the Public Records of Dade County,

Florida. The related Certificate of Appropriateness [Case File COA (SP) 2002-12] was granted approval by the Historical Preservation Board on June 20, 2002

Ms. Spain reviewed the improvements, additions and renovations to the property, advising that staff recommended approval of the application. The owner, Mr. Huber Parsons, briefly addressed the Board.

Ms. Tackett made a motion to recommend approval of ad valorem tax relief for the property at 2723 Country Club Prado. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Turner, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Heisenbottle. Nays: None.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2010-13 REVISION#2: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **700 Alhambra Circle**, a contributing property within the “Alhambra Circle Historic District,” legally described as Lots 16, 17, and 18, Block 23, Coral Gables Section “B,” as recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 111, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting a revision to the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness to include design modifications.

Ms. Spain reviewed the application proposing a revision to the previously-approved Special Certificate of Appropriateness (2010-13). The revision consisted of a proposed FAR reduction to the existing residence by converting existing storage on the rear of the existing detached garage to a proposed coverer terrace. Stating that the proposed work didn’t destroy or detract from the integrity of the historic building, was minimal in impact and consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, Ms. Spain advised that staff recommended approval of the application.

Architect George Peon explained his approach to the redesign, stating that the area would not be visible from the street and would not add square footage. Ms. Spain added that the affected portion of the building was erected in 1989; therefore, it was not historic.

Mr. Heisenbottle invited audience comment. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve the application. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Turner, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Silva, Mr. Heisenbottle. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2011-09: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1XX Florida Avenue, a vacant parcel located with the “MacFarlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District,” legally described as Lot 23, Block 1-A, MacFarlane Homestead Subdivision, as recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 81, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the construction of a new two-story residence.

During a PowerPoint presentation, Ms. Spain reviewed the property, its history, the two-story home previously situated on the adjacent lot ~~there~~ that was demolished, and the background of the only historic district in the City listed on the National Register. She described the proposal, stated that the Board of Architects unanimously approved the design and relayed staff’s recommendation of approval.

Architect Jose Ferradaz reviewed his design, and responded to Board questions regarding window type and architectural style. Mr. Heisenbottle pointed out that a railing was needed to define the porch edge to appear similar to other homes in

the neighborhood. Ms. Rolando also encouraged attention to this detail and suggested adding the porch railing as a condition of approval. Mr. Ferradaz agreed.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve the design, conditioning the motion with the addition of a porch railing to be approved by staff. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Turner, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Heisenbottle. Nays: None.

CASE FILE (SP) 2011-10: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **533 Alhambra Circle**, a contributing structure within the “Alhambra Circle Historic District,” legally described as Lots 21 and 22, Block 12, Section “B,” as recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 111, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County Florida. The applicant requested design approval for alterations and the construction of additions.

During her presentation, Ms. Spain reviewed the property’s history as she displayed photographs and described addition and alteration details. She displayed the existing condition of the property and the proposed addition design, thereafter stating staff’s recommendation of approval. Ms. Spain added that the Board of Architects approved the application with the comment to “study breaking up the upper roof ridge line.”

Architect Gregory Kauffman described the property and its challenges, stating the primary intent was to enhance enjoyment of the back yard and to abate Alhambra Circle traffic noise. He pointed out that the additions were less than permitted, and addressed the Board of Architects’ comment regarding the roof ridge line. Board members expressed concern about the roof line, and discussed various options to refine the appearance. Ms. Tackett expressed concern about the shutters, suggesting they be eliminated or simplified.

Ms. Tackett made a motion to approve the design for alterations and the construction of additions, leaving a decision about the shutters to staff and the architect. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Turner, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Silva, Mr. Heisenbottle. Nays: Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Torre.

BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE:

537 Majorca Avenue/Ad Valorem Tax Relief Application: Ms. Spain reported that the ad valorem tax relief application for 537 Majorca Avenue was unanimously approved by the City Commission on September 27, 2011.

Board Seminar: Ms. Spain will coordinate seminar dates and details with Mr. Heisenbottle and Board members.

NEW BUSINESS:

Riviera Drive Street Lights: Ms. MacIntyre reported that a historic preservation group met today with the City Manager regarding the historically-designated street lights on Riviera Drive. At particular issue were the cast iron bases. She suggested Board consideration of supporting efforts to restore and preserve them. Mr. Tim Crowther described and displayed the lights and bases, and explained that the group wants to identify a manufacturer who can replicate the bases in either cast iron or cast aluminum. He relayed Florida Power and Light Company’s (FPL) refusal to replicate them in metal, citing electrical conductivity risks.

1032 Cotoro: Ms. MacIntyre spoke about the deteriorated condition of this property. Ms. Spain reported that the garage roof caved in. She met yesterday with Building Official Manny Lopez and Assistant City Manager Maria Menendez to review the City’s recourse. Ms. Menendez will contact the bank as the property is in foreclosure. The Zoning Code allows the Building Official and Preservation Officer access to the property to stabilize and board it up.

Windows Workshop: The workshop needs to be planned and scheduled.

City Hall Coral Rock Walkways Update: Ms. Spain met with the Glenn Kephart and Ernesto Pino, and reviewed samples of walkway materials, which were not approved.

MacFarlane Task Force: Ms. MacIntyre encouraged rejuvenation of this task force, created to find funding and solutions to problems with properties in the historic district. Ms. Spain said the task force would be re-gathered.

1044 Coral Way: No decision regarding the litigation has been made.

Simone Chin: Ms. Turner noted that Ms. Chin's 14th anniversary with the City was observed today; however, Ms. Chin's position was eliminated and her last day in the Historical Resources Department will be October 28th. On behalf of the Save the Water Tower Committee, the Villagers and the Historic Preservation Association of Coral Gables, Ms. Turner presented a framed depiction of the Alhambra Water Tower to Ms. Chin in appreciation for her dedication to historic preservation. Ms. Bennett, a past Board member, also expressed her appreciation.

ADJOURNMENT: 5:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Dona M. Spain
Historic Preservation Officer