City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting
Agenda Item H-1
February 5, 2013
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

City Commission
Mayor Jim Cason
Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Commissioner Maria Anderson
Commissioner Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Commissioner Frank Quesada

City Staff
City Manager, Patrick Salerno
City Attorney, Craig E. Leen
City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman
Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia
Historic Preservation Officer, Dona Spain

Public Speaker(s)
Mr. Kuvin, Representing Applicant

H-1 [Start: 11:46:00 a.m.]

Resolution of the City Commission granting final approval for the architectural plans of a new residence to be located at 1044 Coral Way, Coral Gables, Florida, legally described as Lot 1 and the West 32 feet of Lot 2, Block 11, Coral Gables Section "A", and granting final approval for a historic marker to be placed on the right-of-way along Coral Way adjacent to the residence.

Mayor Cason: City Manager Item H-1.

City Manager Salerno: Thank you Mayor. H-1 is a Resolution of the City Commission granting final approval for the architectural plans of a new residence to be located at 1044 Coral Way, Coral Gables, Florida, legally described as Lot 1 and the West 32 feet of Lot 2, Block 11, Coral Gables Section "A", and granting final approval for a historic marker to be placed on the right-of-way along Coral Way adjacent to the residence. Dona.

Mrs. Spain: I actually have a PowerPoint that shows the proposed residence, which I think we should at least look at the residence. That's the location of the property, this is the site plan of the proposed residence, first floor, second floor, roof plan, and this is the residence that's proposed for that lot, and that gets into the Board of Architects condition; and so this was reviewed by the Board of Architects and they recommend approval of the proposal with the following comments: coordinate the size and proportions of all the window openings; review the balcony brackets relative to size, proportion, spacing and scale; consider also adding columns at the balcony to reduce the scale of the spans; 3) study the entry porch columns to minimize the grout joints; consider stacking the masonry units using a butt joint otherwise known as butter joints; and show the roof pitch as graphically on the elevation pages; and so then it went to the Historic Preservation Board and they recommend approval of the plans as submitted and adopt those comments I just read from the Board of Architects and include the following recommendations for additional revisions: that the windows on the front elevation contain mutton grids consistent with the historical documentation of the time period; number two, that the sizes and proportions of the windows on the south, east and rare elevations more closely match the size and proportion of the windows on the front elevation and also contain mutton grids; and that textured stucco is used throughout of the exterior of the house and then they also added, to add the recommendation that the roofing material be true clay barrel tile. So that's what you have before you.

Mayor Cason: And what was the vote?

Mrs. Spain: The Board of Architects, there were two members that abstained and then the five remaining numbers recommended approval, and the Historic Preservation Board on the first three motions other than the roof tile it was 7-0; and then motion number two on the clay barrel tile was 5-2.

Mayor Cason: OK. Thank you.

City Attorney Leen: Mr. Mayor, if I may add a word before Mr. Kuvin speaks. The way that this came up to the City Commission if you recall, is that when the property was de-designated and that was heard on appeal, when you de-designate a property you place the condition that the final approval for this house come before you, but that first it go to the Board of Architects and

Historic Preservation Board for their recommendation. So this is not an appeal, you are hearing this in the first instance based on their recommendation and you have full authority to do whatever you think is warranted.

Mayor Cason: OK. Mr. Kuvin.

Mr. Kuvin: Good morning Mayor Cason, Board members. The recommended resolution that was given to the Commission by, I think it was Mrs. Spain, we agree with this, we agree with all the language except for three of the issues on here. If you have that in front of you I can explain each one.

Commissioner Anderson: Mr. Kuvin could you check to see if your mike is on.

Mr. Kuvin: It's not on?

Commissioner Anderson: I'm not sure.

Mr. Kuvin: Can you hear me now?

Commissioner Anderson: Try it again.

Mr. Kuvin: Let me move to the other side.

Commissioner Anderson: Maybe it's just my bad hearing, I'm getting older. Just want to make sure you are heard on the record.

Mr. Kuvin: Not a problem. Can you hear me now? It's usually me with the hearing problem. So, on the draft if we turn it over to the second page, item number C, which is to admin the grid consistent with historical documentation at the time period to the windows on the front elevation. My client would like to leave the design the way it is, because it was more in tune exactly with the way the building was before. The original building did not have these on it.

Commissioner Quesada: I'm sorry; I'm still having trouble hearing you. You are talking about "C", the studied entry porch columns to minimize the grout joints?

Mr. Kuvin: I'm sorry it was "D", I'm sorry.

Commissioner Quesada: "D" show the roof pitches graphically on the elevation pages.

Mrs. Spain: I apologize; I believe he is talking about the Historical Preservation Board's recommendation to have muttons on the windows.

Mr. Kuvin: I'm getting this from the draft resolution that was given to the Commission.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Yes, we've got it.

Commissioner Quesada: OK. So under section 2, is that what you are referring to?- section 2 is that what you are referring to?

Mr. Kuvin: Correct.

Commissioner Quesada: OK. Section 2, "D"…

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Show the roof pitches.

Mr. Kuvin: Well actually it was "E", I'm sorry, its "E", the mutton grid consistent with the historical documentation….

Commissioner Quesada:…to the time period…and you guys have a problem with that because?

Mr. Kuvin: The reason was because they weren't on the original building, it had been designed to look and that was one of the ideas was that this building should look like the building that was there before.

Commissioner Quesada: OK.

Mr. Kuvin: And then the next one was to make the size and proportions of the windows on the southeast and rear elevations, that's exactly the same as "A", coordinate the size and proportions of all windows opening, so we figured out it was redundant, so we would go with the "A" portion on there and make them all the size and proportion of all window openings; and then the other one that we had a problem with was "H", which was to use true clay barrel tile roof for the roofing material. The reason that we didn't want to do that was because of the added cost, it would add $50,000 to the cost of the dwelling as well as the fact that a majority of the houses that abut this property is within 500 feet of the property have the cement tile, half round….

Mayor Cason: Can you tell what it's made of?

Mr. Kuvin: The half round…

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: You call that the "S" tiles, I think – "S" tiles the little roll, right?

Mr. Kuvin: Correct.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Not the big roll.

Mr. Kuvin: Correct.

Mayor Cason: So they look different or is it just…

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: They do look a little different, but the Board of Architects approved it with the tile that you want to keep in, is that correct?- it's the Historic Board that want to change.

Mr. Kuvin: That is correct.

Commissioner Quesada: I want to make a motion.

Mayor Cason: Any more discussion?

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: No. I'm done.

Mr. Kuvin: I do have the architect here if you'd like to discuss it with him or if you need any more clarification.

Commissioner Anderson: No, I just want to make a comment that I actually agree with the fact – I don't agree with the Historic Board's recommendations, but we'll see what happens with the vote and I just wanted to put that on the record. I think it's a present day iteration of the house, it should have much more of the proportions of now, and I'm not a big fan of barrel tile unless it's appropriate, but that's not my call. That's all I wanted to say.

Commissioner Cabrera: My comment was more about the marker. I read the marker and I'm fine with it, but I mean there is no house there anymore. I just don't get it, but that's fine, if that's the will of everyone, I just think it's ridiculous to put up a marker when there is no existing property there anymore to commemorate what?

Mayor Cason: I guess at the last discussion it used to be there and here's what it looked like.

Commissioner Anderson: Actually, I brought it up, but I was trying to talk about the land, but whatever. I'm not totally married to it if you don't need to.

Mayor Cason: You all have a problem with the marker?

Mr. Kuvin: These were actually two separate votes at the Historical Preservation Board; we can do the first one, not to try to direct you, but just....

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Actually I don't know what Frank's motion is, but basically I don't have a problem with the recommendations as presented.

Commissioner Cabrera: I'm not going to make a big deal out of it, but I just think that...

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: We are going to look at...

Mayor Cason: Let's do the first one and then....

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Whatever you want.

Commissioner Quesada: So my motion is to give them everything they are looking for.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: And never see them back here again, is that it (laughter).

Mayor Cason: Do we have a second?

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: I'll second.

Mayor Cason: OK, the Vice Mayor.

Commissioner Quesada: So, I guess to be more specific is along the lines of the draft resolution which we are working off of, and deleting subsection, I guess section 2-E, 2-F, and 2-H, is that clear enough?

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: I'll accept that.

City Attorney Leen: And Commissioner as to section 4, is that being removed from this resolution or...?

Mayor Cason: No, that's separate.

City Attorney Leen: That will be separate.

Mayor Cason: Separate – right.

City Clerk

Commissioner Quesada: Yes
Commissioner Anderson: Yes
Commissioner Cabrera: Yes
Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Yes
Mayor Cason: Yes
(Vote: 5-0)

Mayor Cason: OK, on the plaque. What is your view?- do you want a plaque there?

Mr. Kuvin: I discussed this with Mrs. Spain this morning and she'd like to speak on it.

Mrs. Spain: I can put the wording that the Historic Preservation Board is recommending for the plaque. I'm fine without a plaque.

Commissioner Cabrera: Its Exhibit "B", right?- it's Exhibit "B"?

Mrs. Spain: Yes. Yes.

Commissioner Cabrera: But I don't want to go against – Commissioner I didn't know…

Commissioner Anderson: No, look, look, I told you I'm not married to it; I've got bigger fish to fry. My thoughts were just about the land. I know the building doesn't exist.

Commissioner Quesada: I'm going to make a motion to remove section 4 from that draft resolution and removing the requirement of having a plaque on the property. I think that's what…

City Attorney Leen: Commissioner it's already not included in the resolution.

Commissioner Quesada: It's already not included.

City Attorney Leen: Yes.

Commissioner Quesada: So we don't have to vote or anything then?

City Attorney Leen: Well – they did this…

Mayor Cason: Let's vote on it.

Commissioner Quesada: Done. So the motion is overturning the recommendation or denying the recommendation of the Historic Preservation Board requiring a plaque on the property.

Mrs. Spain: It was actually part of the settlement.

City Attorney Leen: Yes. What happened was when it came before you for the de-designation you had put a condition of a plaque, if everyone is OK with it, it's up to the Commission ultimately you could remove that requirement.

Commissioner Quesada: The motion is for modification of the settlement removing the requirement of a plaque on the property.

City Attorney Leen: Yes.

Commissioner Anderson: I'll second that.

Mayor Cason: Commissioner Anderson seconds it and Commissioner Quesada makes the motion.

City Clerk

Commissioner Anderson: Yes
Commissioner Cabrera: Yes
Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Yes
Commissioner Quesada: Yes
Mayor Cason: Yes
(Vote: 5-0)

Mrs. Spain: Thank you very much.

Mayor Cason: Congratulations. Do I hear the construction already? (Laughter).

[End: 11:57:58 a.m.]