



CORALGABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

Thursday, January 19, 2017 Meeting, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida 33134

*Historical Resources &
Cultural Arts*

2327 SALZEDO STREET
CORAL GABLES
FLORIDA 33134

☎ 305.460.5093

✉ hist@coralgables.com

MEMBERS	F	M	A	M	J	J	A	S+	S	O	N	D	J	APPOINTED BY:
	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	17	
Janice Thomson	P	P	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	E	E	P	P	Mayor Jim Cason
Venny Torre	P	E	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	E	P	P	P	Vice-Mayor Frank Quesada
Elizabeth Ghia	E	P	P	P	P	E	-	E	E	P	P	P	P	Comm. Jeannett Slesnick
Alejandro Silva	P	P	P	P	E	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Patricia Keon
Alicia Bache-Wiig*							-			P	P	P	P	Comm. Vince Lago
John Fullerton	P	E	P	P	P	P	-	E	P	E	P	P	P	Board-as-a-Whole
Robert Parsley	E	P	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Manager
Margaret Rolando	E	E	P	P	P	P	-	P	E	P	P	P	P	City Commission
Albert Menendez	P	E	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission

LEGEND: A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; * = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member; - = No Meeting (lack of quorum); # = Late meeting arrival; S+ = Replacement August 2016 meeting

STAFF:

- Dona M. Spain, Historic Preservation Officer
- Kara N. Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
- ElizaBeth Guin, Historic Preservationist
- Miriam Ramos, Deputy City Attorney
- Jessica Keller, Assistant Director of Public Works specializing in Transportation and Sustainability

GUESTS: Wesley Castellanos, Alberto Alfaro, Antolin Cardenas, Monica Noguero, Rob Brown, Fabiana De Luea.

RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:11 p.m. A quorum was present.

MINUTES: MEETING OF DECEMBER 15, 2016:

Mr. Silva made a motion to approve the minutes of the December 15, 2016 Board meeting as written. Mr. Menendez seconded the motion, unanimously approved by voice vote.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex-parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

DEFERRALS: None

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

DISCUSSION ITEM: Coral Gables Bike Trail as it connects to Red Road along Coral Way

Ms. Spain advised that neither Ms. Rolando nor Ms. Thomson had notified their intent to be absent and would likely arrive shortly.

Ms. Keller relayed the research and background of the project, detailing the inclusive area of the proposal to create a bicycle boulevard on Castile Avenue as part of the City's bicycle master plan. The purpose, she said, was to connect with

existing bicycle lanes on Red Road and connect them to Coral Way, including speed cushions and related signage along Castile Avenue. Ms. Keller sought feedback from the Board as part of the City's overall project process.

Board questions generated discussion particularly related to how changes to the historic area would affect the appearance and historic integrity. At the conclusion of discussion, Ms. Spain asked the Board to provide guidance to Ms. Keller about moving forward with the proposal. Board members encouraged quality signage design, appropriate for the historic area.

During the discussion, Ms. Rolando and Ms. Thomson arrived at the meeting

Mr. Silva made a motion to support installation of speed cushions and required but appropriate signage as discussed to the Castile Avenue bicycle boulevard design as the project moves forward, and to apply the same historic sensitivity to similar future City projects. Mr. Fullerton seconded the motion.

Voice vote: Ayes from seven of nine Board members; Ms. Thomson: nay; Ms. Rolando: abstention due to late meeting arrival.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATIONS:

CASE FILE LHD 2016-011 AND COA (SP) 2016-024:

Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 1223 Lisbon Street, legally described as Lot 29, Block 59, Coral Gables Granada Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 113 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is also requesting the issuance of an Accelerated Special Certificate of Appropriateness and design approval for additions and alterations to the residence and sitework.

Ms. Spain advised that this property was referred to the Board by the Board of Architects.

Ms. Guin comprehensively reviewed the property's extensively-researched and written report, made a part of the record in entirety. Augmenting the presentation were displays of location map views, photographs and drawings. At the conclusion of the presentation, she stated that the property was significant to the City's history based on its architectural significance and voiced staff's recommendation of a motion to approve Local Historic Designation for the property at 1223 Lisbon Street.

Mr. Torre invited comments from the audience. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Mr. Silva made a motion to approve Local Historic Designation for the property at 1223 Lisbon Street. Ms. Ghia seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

Before proceeding with the application for a Special Certificate of Appropriateness, Ms. Spain distributed two pages missing from the Board's copy of the report and assured them the applicant received the entire report prior to the meeting. She advised the Board that staff recommended approval of the variance request regarding the width of the carport, and pointed out that staff's recommendation for approval of the design proposal and COA (SP) issuance was contingent upon numerous conditions to be reviewed after the presentation by project architect, Wesley Castellanos.

Mr. Castellanos introduced Ms. Nogueroles, the new property owner, stating it was her intention to restore the property to its original condition as well as to increase the size of the structure to accommodate family needs. He comprehensively reviewed photographs of the entire residence and described proposed restoration and design revisions. He described numerous meetings held with the Board of Architects and Historical Resources staff, and voiced agreement with all

conditions stipulated in the staff report. He reviewed the variance needed to reduce the width of the carport as part of the design proposal.

Ms. Spain advised that his overall application experience thus far had been lengthy and complex, but praised him and the owners for patience and cooperation. She reiterated staff's recommendation for approval of the variance, thereafter reviewing each of 15 staff conditions included in the report, with interspersed constructive comments from Board members relevant to the condition topic. Ms. Spain made a staff commitment to help the applicants resolve issues. During the continued review of the plans, Mr. Torre suggested design consideration of a balcony off the master bedroom in the rear of the property.

Regarding the staff condition to eliminate the proposed gate in the front wing wall, Mr. Castellanos said the owner wanted a gate in the front of the property to deter unwanted entry to the property. He and Board members discussed various options that could prevent the public from walking through to the rear of the property. Ms. Spain said a gate could be added to the porte cochere. Ms. Noguerol suggested a transparent gate. Mr. Torre indicated that a small, three-to-four foot high, thin wrought iron gate might be appropriate. Ms. Rolando pointed out that the opening was large, and said gates might be overpowering. She suggested putting a gate on the carport where it would be more recessed, less intrusive. Mr. Torre observed that gates on the carport would need to open outward to provide sufficient room for a car to fit inside. Ms. Spain favored a delicate, thin wrought iron gate. Mr. Castellanos confirmed his agreement with all other conditions.

Ms. Bache-Wiig questioned the awnings in the original photograph; however, Mr. Castellanos advised that this area was proposed to become a foyer. Ms. Spain said staff was agreeable to either include or not include awnings. Mr. Silva agreed with the general conditions as well as Mr. Torre's comments regarding the gate. Referencing item 12 on the list of staff conditions, he expressed preference for squaring off the arch to the terrace on the south elevation. Ms. Spain agreed. He suggested differentiating the historic structure from the new addition in the following locations: carport decorative elements don't need to be exactly replicated; the step configuration on the arches; the cornice rounded element could be more flat or squared off; and an element on new windows could be differentiated from the original. Mr. Torre added that that fence details in the gate elevations appeared different. He said the elements needed to be consistent, and advised the architect to work with staff to determine the best and consistent design solution. Mr. Castellanos agreed.

Mr. Fullerton made a motion to approve the design proposal for the alterations and additions to the building at 1223 Lisbon Street and issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness, including staff and Board recommendations made during discussion. Mr. Silva seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Menendez, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve granting a variance to allow the minimum width of the proposed carport to be approximately 9' vs. the minimum width of a carport shall be 12'-0" as required by Section 5-1402(A)(5) of the Coral Gables Zoning Code. Mr. Fullerton seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE LHD 2016-021:

Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 711 University Drive, legally described as Lot 11 & S ½ of Lot 10, Block 137, Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Six, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 20, at Page 1 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Kautz comprehensively reviewed the property and its history (detailed in a lengthy staff report, made a part of the meeting record) as she displayed a location map and numerous photographs and drawings. She said the structure designed by renowned architect Phineas Paist represented "the rarefied interpretation of the Mediterranean Revival style on a grand

scale". She added that this property qualified as a local historical landmark, meeting five criteria stipulated in the Coral Gables Zoning Code, Article 3, Section 3-1103. During the review, Ms. Kautz pointed out and described additions and alterations made to the original structure over the years. In conclusion, she said staff deemed the property significant to City of Coral Gables history based on its historical, cultural and architectural significance, and recommended approval of Local Historic Designation. She advised that the current owner was not at the meeting, but intended to restore and live in the home. Thereafter, she introduced Architect Robert Brown as the representative of the property owner.

During Mr. Brown's overall review, he advised the Board that areas of the house were currently boarded up as a safety and security protective measure, and indicated his willingness to conduct a daytime tour of the property for the Board and staff.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve Local Historic Designation of the property at 711 University Drive based on its historical, cultural and architectural significance. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2016-032:

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 9 Capina Court, a contributing resources within the "Campina Court Historic District", legally described as Lot 18 and the E 1.2 Lot 17, Block 3, Coral Gables Flagler Street Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 10, Page 12, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for additions and alterations to the residence.

After displaying the property location, Ms. Kautz advised that the application was for a one-story addition consisting of a master suite and installation of impact-resistant windows. She called attention to revision drawings in Board packets, stating that the report was published prior to receiving design revisions. She advised that staff comments about the windows not being appropriate were addressed by the architect in the revised documents. Ms. Kautz asked the Board to review the windows proposed for the addition, pointing out that the muntins read very horizontal. She asked for Board input regarding more vertical windows. Referencing proposed sliding glass doors, Ms. Kautz reiterated that they should be French doors. Thereafter, she introduced the project architect, Antolin Cardenas.

Mr. Cardenas said the addition was proposed for the rear of the property, that the homeowner wanted to improve the entrance to the house as steps were changed from the original and that the owner wanted to restore the original style. Discussing windows and reviewing photographs, he pointed out that the windows had been changed over the years, though he presumed they were originally casement. He indicated awareness that staff wanted muntins in the windows. As he continued the photographic display, he showed an existing one-story addition built without a permit that would be removed as part of this project, and reviewed the proposed one-story addition. He reported working with the City's landscaping division to mitigate removal of a sea grape tree and plant a flowering tree in the rear of the property and cluster palms in the front.

Mr. Torre observed that issues remained with the windows. Ms. Kautz said all windows were casements, but were shown with horizontal muntins. Mr. Torre noticed discrepancies in the windows on the east and west elevations, and commented that the windows were very wide. During continued discussion, it was agreed that staff would work with the applicant to develop an appropriate solution. Mr. Silva said windows on the west and east elevations should match, and called attention to a window size discrepancy in another area. He advised double checking all openings because of apparent discrepancies between original windows and proposed. Ms. Kautz said submitted photographs showed slight differences as well. Mr. Cardenas agreed to work with staff to review and correct all window openings.

Thursday, January 19, 2017

Continued

As stated in the written staff report, Ms. Kautz pointed out little differentiation between the existing residence and proposed addition, and recommended that the addition either be recessed slightly from the corner of the existing garage or that a score line or joint be applied at the connection. Regarding proposed windows and doors, she said they were not appropriate to the historic residence and should have muntins to match original permit drawings and that the windows should not be altered. The windows on the rear of the residence were replaced and resized without a permit and should be corrected, and the work already completed had to be included in the permit set for the addition. Stating that sliding glass doors were not appropriate for a historic residence, Ms. Kautz said they should be French doors, and added that the sliding glass door proposed on the east elevation should also be corrected. Other staff comments included the fascia venting or score line to differentiate the existing from the new facades; window openings should not be altered; the front door is not to be replaced; and the garage door replacement will require a separate Standard Certificate of Appropriateness.

Ms. Thomson asked if ventilation was a factor in Mr. Cardenas' choice of awning windows to facilitate capturing the breeze. A brief discussion was held about awning versus casement windows. After discussion, Mr. Cardenas agreed to all casement windows as discussed.

Ms. Bache-Wiig made a motion to approve the design proposal for the one-story addition on the residence at 9 Campina Court, including all staff recommendations and changing the windows from horizontal to vertical on the west elevation; and to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the one-story addition only. Mr. Menendez seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

City Entrances: Mr. Torre reported that the round elements at the historic entrances didn't appear original and looked like pencils. Ms. Kautz said she noticed that the trellis features at the plaza entrances were large and round with pointed ends. Ms. Spain and Ms. Kautz said they would look into the situation and review the drawings, thanking Mr. Torre for raising the issue.

ITEMS FROM THE SECRETARY:

On behalf of the Historic Preservation Board and Staff, Ms. Spain presented Nancy Morgan with a farewell gift and words of appreciation for her years of service to the City.

Certified Local Government Workshop: Ms. Spain reported that staff is hosting a Certified Local Government workshop for the South Florida Region on April 27th and 28th, venue to be determined. All Board members will be invited to participate.

Historic Plaques: Plaques are ordered and will be distributed when delivered.

NEXT BOARD MEETING:

February 16, 2017, 4:00 p.m.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting adjourned at 6:01 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Dona M. Spain
Historic Preservation Officer