

**City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting
Agenda Item E-1
January 23, 2018
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL**

City Commission

**Mayor Raul Valdes-Fauli
Vice Mayor Pat Keon
Commissioner Vince Lago
Commissioner Frank Quesada
Commissioner Michael Mena**

City Staff

**City Manager, Cathy Swanson-Rivenbark
Assistant City Manager, Peter Iglesias
Assistant City Manager, Frank Fernandez
City Attorney, Miriam Ramos
City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman
Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia**

Public Speaker(s)

**Scott Sime
Dickie Davis
Maria Iparraguirre
Richard Davis
Lillian Smuglovsky-Gonzalez
Jack Zacks
Gustavo Pupo-Mayo
Marta Hutson
Edward Lazzarin
Debbie Swain
Caroline Parker
Marlin Ebbert
Maria Cosculluela
Susan Kawalerski**

City Commission Meeting
January 23, 2018
Agenda Item E-1 - Comments regarding Riviera bike paths by concerned residents.

Tina Herrera
Maria Cruz
Maria Valle
Ken Clark
Robert Ruano
Lord Toussaint
Ivette Arango O'Doski
Ignacio Granda
Michael Belaustegui
Rhett Cili
Dilian Sanchez

Agenda Item E-1 [11:14:04 a.m.]

Comments regarding Riviera bike paths by concerned residents.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'd like to call the meeting to order. And this is Item -- whatever it is. Time certain, 10 o'clock, and we're, obviously, an hour and 15 minutes late because of the length of the prior matter. Comments regarding Riviera bike paths by concerned residents. And Madam City Manager, you wanted to say something?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Absolutely. Before we begin, the process of developing a bike route, most recently, began in 2013, as far as I can see. And there were meetings with bike advocate groups to help understand what the expectations were. A master plan was developed. Private consultants were hired in order to develop it. It was presented to you in June 2014. It was updated in November 2014. And unfortunately, I didn't come until December 2014. And so, when I went back in and dug into what was the public engagement process, the civic engagement process, both globally, as well as locally when routes are identified, I could not find specific outreach to the Riviera Drive when a route was expected or directed for that route, which is inconsistent with the direction that you all want us to do in terms of community/neighborhood specific meetings. The majority of the people that were involved are

no longer here. Philosophically, we have a new approach on how we respect the input of individual residents that are affected. I have committed to be involved in every specific local -- as in local as in Riviera specific meeting to hear the concerns and to understand the challenges and fears before we move forward with the process. And I'm going to ask you all not to come. And I'm going to ask you not to come because if you -- one -- if more than one of you come, then it's a public meeting. It's a Sunshine meeting, and then other -- then people outside of Riviera Drive will not -- will be as a part of that meeting. And when you hear the passion and concerns of Riviera Drive, they deserve to have their own specific exclusive meeting with City staff. And I have committed to do as many as we need to do in order to have that happen for that route. And quite honestly, if there are any other routes -- sometimes, we talk about, well, one alternate could be Maggiore. We are not going to create the same failure to include if we just relocate it to another area. So, you're going to see a lot of specific neighborhood meetings. I commit to you I will update you on what happens. I know how interested you all are in wanting to attend. But unless we can agree that only one of you attends, then I would rather not have the Commission attend those meetings so that I have the City Attorney and the City Clerk satisfied that I've met the public meeting requirements. But there is going to be plenty of time for us to sit down and meet with each of the groups that want to meet with us. And I have committed to staff and I've committed to spokespeople of the Riviera Drive, specifically the 113 homes that go from South Dixie to feed onto -- by Ingraham Park. But obviously, it will be all of the areas that have been identified as a possible route as a part of a master plan, a master plan that has not -- that has funding in place, but is not -- you know, it is not driven by deadlines of when we have to accomplish what. If the residents -- the residents have to be heard, and we promise that we will establish that time. I want to say that before the people speak because this has been difficult on them, difficult on staff. And it's also -- I want to commit to a level of civility and respect that is signature to the City. Respect and civility from staff, and I'm confident it will be also respect and civility with the neighborhoods. And we're going to work on creating that dialogue, establishing a trust that -- why people come to Coral Gables, why they choose to live in Coral Gables is because they don't want to have to worry about what is going on in their neighborhood and with their -- you know, on their street specific. So, I just wanted to frame that as we begin

hearing conversations. It's not the end of conversations. There will be many more, and I look forward to participating in them.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Madam City Manager. I have 30, maybe, cards of people that wish to speak. And there are seven that do not wish to speak who are opposed and gave us some information on the cards having to do with safety and access to buildings, et cetera. Is anyone...

City Attorney Ramos: I'd also like to note that there were dozens of emails sent that have been made...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

City Attorney Ramos: Part of the record on this item, and the Commission was copied on all of them.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, the Commission was copied on them and they are part of the public record in the City Clerk's Office. They're available for your examination. But I think that we tried to respond to most of the emails that were sent. Is there a spokesperson for the group for or against or is there one person that wishes to speak?

Unidentified Speaker: Yeah, we have multiple speakers.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, but the multiple speakers are going to be limited to two minutes because, otherwise, we're going to be here through December.

Unidentified Speaker: I will respect the two minutes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, okay. Then I'll call on people one by one, and you're limited to two minutes. And we appreciate your comments and we'll take them into account. Yes. Did you fill out a card?

Scott Sime: I did.

Commissioner Quesada: Scott, how are you? It's a little bit better if we just follow his order, so...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, why don't we do that. Why don't we do that.

Mr. Sime: Yeah, yeah, sorry.

Commissioner Quesada: You'll definitely get a chance. I know you're eager, but...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, I'll call the first one here.

Commissioner Quesada: It'll be easier for us to keep order.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Scott Sime.

(LAUGHTER)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Gotcha.

Mr. Sime: Thank you, Mr. Mayor, and Commissioners, Vice Mayor. As many of you know -- first of all, I live at 6000 Riviera. And my wife, Belinda, and I have been residents of the City for the last 27 years. And our objective today is to basically deliver to you a petition upon finding out about the proposed bike path, in my case, and many of the residents, approximately

10 to 12 days ago. We mobilized and basically went door to door and talked to the residents, who we believe are the true stakeholders in this discussion. I don't know that we were mentioned as stakeholders in the survey, but we believe that we're constituents and the voters in the -- you know, the true stakeholders in this discussion. As mentioned earlier, the area that we're talking about is from US 1 on Riviera to LeJeune, which is basically Cocoplum Circle. In that -- on that roadway, there's 111 homes. We went to most, but not all because some of the homeowners were not in town. But of the 111 homes, we got signed petitions from 93 of the property owners, 84 percent, still more to come. The total number of petitions signed were 168 registered voters, and these voters are against a bike path on Riviera in any form or fashion, and that's reflected in, you know, these petitions, which I'd like to submit. These are the original 168 signed petitions from the...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Give them to the City Clerk, yes.

Mr. Sime: And I'll be brief, respecting the two-minute time limit, but the petition -- I'll read the first and last sentence of the petition. It says we, the undersigned registered Coral Gables voters and residents of Riviera, between US 1 and LeJeune Road, respectfully petition the City of Coral Gables to refrain from any consideration of Riviera Drive as a street onto which any bicycle infrastructure path or lane might be installed. And we close by, we respectfully request that if the City wants to preserve green space, residential harmony and beauty and wants to avoid injuries, damages and accidents, Riviera Drive, between US 1 and LeJeune Road, be withdrawn from consideration for a bike path or lanes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Sime: Thank you very much.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Scott.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you, sir.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Dickie Davis. Is Dickie Davis here? Hi. How are you?

Dickie Davis: Good morning.

Commissioner Lago: Hi.

Ms. Davis: Thank you so much for letting us be here today. I want to start by thanking City Manager Cathy Swanson-Rivenbark and Miriam. I can't do that?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It's your right to be here. You don't have to thank us, but...

Ms. Davis: Well...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you for appearing.

Ms. Davis: Well, I've -- they've been particularly helpful to me as we work through this, so I wanted to say that publicly. My name is Dickie Davis. My husband, Rick, and I live at 5531 Riviera. We've been there 35 years. I'm talking today about transparency and communications, and I've timed it -- I believe I'm right at two minutes, so I won't go on. The City's master plan that was approved in 2014, appears to have been created solely with input from special interest groups. These groups set the plan's vision and goals, surveyed our streets, made recommendations for routes and for priorities, and implementations suggested scheduled. This plan directly relates to our street, yet incredibly, we had no voice. On June 14, 2014, as the City Manager has said, this Commission adopted the master plan, which did not represent your residents, not those of us on Riviera. And this is simply wrong. Last fall, a handful of residents on our street attended two community meetings, where the City's consultant revealed four bike plan options for our street and for others. Attendees were asked to put a green dot on what route

they favored. For our residents, almost a hundred percent of our residents, it was the first time they had learned about a bike infrastructure. Why? Why is that? Why didn't we know? I'll tell you why we didn't know. The City -- and I've gotten the records -- says they did mailings. However, the mailings were sent 11 days after Hurricane Irma. Almost (INAUDIBLE) -- there were a few people that got them. Almost (INAUDIBLE), we didn't get them. We were preoccupied with things much more important than bike paths. Okay, so we go -- we go to the -- oh, and one more thing that's really critical about communication. I got to go fast. Anyway, it doesn't work. Last fall -- so, we go to these meetings and we have to put these dots, but guess what. There was no opportunity to talk, so there wasn't any fact finding. There wasn't really any expressing of things. I brought something -- one of our residents, in frustration, just scratched across the document "no bike paths." They were so frustrated. But what upset our residents the most or equally as much is that there were people putting the little dots that don't even live on Riviera, and that's just not fair. That's not fair. And they don't even live in our city and we have proof of that. So, bottom line, the consultant, after that meeting, created the document called Your Feedback. And they talk about what we want and we don't want. That is not our voice. We appreciate that this last month you have heard us, and we respectfully request that you remove Riviera from any consideration.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am.

Ms. Davis: Thank you very much.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you. Next is Maria Iparraguirre. Hello.

Maria Iparraguirre: Hello. My name is Maria Iparraguirre. My husband, Jose, and I have lived on Riviera for 25 years. My address is 5704. I actually grew up on Riviera, north of Bird Road, so I've been there since the '70s, so I know the street very well. And my mother-in-law, we just

bought her a house across the street -- we helped her -- on 5709, so we actually have relationship to two houses. I think in the master plan Riviera was described as a low-speed, low-traffic street. And if anybody's ever been there, it's anything but that. Traffic through LeJeune goes to Riviera, so we are kind of a cross-street between, you know, that area to people that don't want to be on LeJeune. Speeding is a problem. Traffic is a huge problem. There's backups. I mean, we can discuss speed on Riviera at a separate meeting, but it's really not a place where a bike path can exist safely. I can tell you to get out of my home, if you were going to take any of my green swale, I would not be able to leave my house safely. I have to pass a tree and then go all the way to the end of my property -- I'm on the non-sidewalk side -- and look three times before I make a left because of the traffic. If you've been down that street, when you're coming from Miller to Riviera to make that left, which I heard it was not possible to put a traffic circle there because of Miami-Dade restrictions, it's really dangerous. If you add bikers, you will have accidents. It will not be safe. I can talk about how we don't like it because of the way it looks. I can tell you how we would think our property would not be as nice. I could tell you how our street could not be any narrower because we have too much traffic, but honestly, bottom line, it's really not safe to put a bike path and none of the residents want it. We already share a big burden of the traffic in Coral Gables. I feel like for such high property value, we share too much of the traffic of Coral Gables right now. And to add to that the lack of safety and barriers, it would be unfair.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am. Thank you very much. Richard Davis. Good morning. You've been sitting there...

Richard Davis: Morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: For a long time.

Mr. Davis: I'm sorry?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You've been sitting there for a long time.

Mr. Davis: I have, since last Tuesday at the Transportation workshop.

(LAUGHTER)

Mr. Davis: Yeah.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We appreciate it.

Mr. Davis: But I met this beautiful young lady here. I -- Richard Davis, 5531 Riviera. My wife and I have been there since 1984.

Commissioner Quesada: And before you begin, you had the most comprehensive communication than anyone else, so I appreciate all the...

Mr. Davis: Oh, thank you. I'm happy to hear I got (INAUDIBLE).

Commissioner Quesada: Well...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Mr. Davis: Well, you're holding it up, but I don't know if you read it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

Mr. Davis: No, thank you, thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Very thorough.

Mr. Davis: It was important.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Go ahead, sir.

Mr. Davis: And I appreciate the City Manager's remarks about the -- how this all came about. In the 2013 master plan -- I think in the City's own documents are a highlight of what the problem has been, and also, a way to -- a path to solve the problem. In the 2014 master plan, the main stakeholder groups -- that's quoted from the plan -- were Bike Walk Coral Gables, Gables Bike Day, Mack Cycle, U Bike, at the University of Miami, and this one, I don't know about, the Dutch Consulate. That's not a joke. I don't know where that -- so -- and the recommendations of these groups were also included in assessments of routes. And I think, again, the City Manager spoke to this. There was no input from -- and speaking to our street -- from true Riviera Drive stakeholders, the residents, the property owners on that street. The -- and just, by the way, the plan itself states that -- and this is a quote -- the route is capped at both ends by very challenging crossings. This is US 1 and LeJeune. The vision statement from the Coral Gables Comprehensive Plan, presented at the January 16 transportation workshop, when I was sitting there also, states that the City's multimodal transportation system should sustain the City's natural aesthetic, historic, cultural, social and economic resources. Most of these, certainly, the natural aesthetic, historic and economic, apparently were disregarded by the authors of the 2014 plan. And I can't get into detail on all this. Yeah, read my letter. And everybody else -- I know you all...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We have.

Mr. Davis: Yeah, I understand.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It's a very good letter.

Mr. Davis: The consultant at the January 23 workshop noted, again, quoting “safety is paramount,” something we absolutely agree with and something that eliminates south Riviera from consideration. In the City’s own documents, there are alternatives to south Riviera, so we shouldn’t be limited to tunnel vision looking at Riviera. If I just...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please conclude.

Mr. Davis: Okay. At page 60 of the plan, there’s a statement. While the plan offers very specific recommendations for the location of bikeway facility types, each bikeway recommendation should be considered flexible. Thus, those routes in this plan are recommended, but in no way can predict the political support, public sentiment and roadway design practices and standards that often evolve over time. I think today, and for the last few weeks, you’ve seen what the public sentiment is. I hope that translates to the political support. We respectfully submit that Riviera should be withdrawn from consideration.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir. Thank you.

Mr. Davis: Thank you all.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much. Okay, Lillian Smuglovsky-Gonzalez. Good morning.

Lillian Smuglovsky-Gonzalez: Good morning. Good morning...

Commissioner Lago: Morning.

Ms. Smuglovsky-Gonzalez: Mr. Mayor, Ms. Vice Mayor, Commissioners, Madam (sic) City Clerk and Madam City Attorney. My name is Lillian Smuglovsky-Gonzalez, and I live at 5300 Riviera Drive. I was born and raised in this beautiful city and have lived here for over 50 years. I lived 24 years in North Gables and 26 years here, in South Gables. The intersection at Riviera Drive and South Dixie Highway is one of the most dangerous in our city, with a growing number of accidents and serious injuries each year. Fire station 2 reported they use Riviera Drive every time they have a call on our side of the highway, even down to Edgewater Drive. They have difficulty exiting the station. And the narrowing of the street will make it also more difficult for them to navigate, and perhaps, cause the same effect the demonstration project is causing station 1 on Salzedo, the need to reroute or use alternate streets due to narrowing. Their trucks simply cannot make those narrow turns. The merge lane at the corner of US 1 and the new apartment complex have added to the congestion of our intersection. Our home, in particular, has no sidewalk and cars use the swale to get around the cars making a left turn onto Bianca Avenue, destroy our grass, and they leave mud tracks on our front lawn. Cars have driven 20 feet onto our front property, nearly hitting the fence in our front yard. These drivers certainly would not respect a bike lane. For the safety of cyclists and residents, I urge you to remove any and all consideration of bike lanes on Riviera Drive. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Jack Zacks.

Jack Zacks: Good morning, everybody.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Morning.

Commissioner Lago: Morning.

Mr. Zacks: My name is Jack Zacks. I live at 6212 Riviera Drive, and I've been there for 28 years. I'm a biker, and I ride at least twice a week, so I'm talking through the eyes of someone who rides on Riviera Drive and other streets in our city. When I ride, I take alternate routes to avoid at all costs the dangerous intersections at Riviera and US 1 and at Riviera and LeJeune. Riding from Riviera to the Cocoplum Circle toward the Old Cutler bike path presents two additional issues: crossing LeJeune at Riviera and then a cross walking bridge puts you in direct opposition to oncoming traffic. I know the City's consultants also mentioned these intersections as problematic and suggested alternate routes to Riviera be investigated. I agree. To save money and protect riders, I suggest the City remove Riviera Drive from consideration of any bike path and investigate other safer and less costly options. Thank you for letting me address you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Now, I'd like to address the Chief of Police. If a robber looks at this meeting, all of the residents -- no, no, sit down -- all of the residents of Riviera Drive are here, so this would be a great opportunity to look at the homes in Riviera Drive. Gustavo Pupo-Mayo.

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

(LAUGHTER)

Gustavo Pupo-Mayo: Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Morning, sir.

Mr. Pupo-Mayo: Good morning. My name is Gustavo Pupo-Mayo. My wife and I have lived on Riviera since 2013, and I have lived in this city for 25 years. We're both avid cyclists and recreational walkers. I appreciate this opportunity to address our Mayor and our Commission about the 2014 Coral Gables Bicycle Pedestrian Master Plan, which, ironically, neglects a main focus of its title, pedestrians. This plan largely treats bike users and pedestrians as a single group, thereby overriding needs and solutions that will benefit pedestrians. In fact, when you read through the plan, there's not one instance in which an improvement is suggested that exclusively is dedicated to the improvement of the pedestrian experience and safety in our beautiful tree-lined city. Page 60 of the plan lists recommendations, and not a single one addresses pedestrians. Yet, in the January 16 staff presentation to the Commission workshop, there was a slide that read pedestrians shall come first citywide, as it should be because our city has a lot more pedestrian exercise walkers and runners than it does cyclists. The interest of all pedestrians are not well served by a plan that puts the interest of cyclists first and neglect pedestrians, despite the mention of them in its name. I respectfully request the City Commission to remove Riviera from consideration of any bike infrastructure.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Pupo-Mayo: Thank you very much.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Marta Hutson. Good morning.

Marta Hutson: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. My name is Marta Hutson. My husband, Jim, and I live at 5133 Riviera Drive, in the historic Chinese village. I support all of the statements of my neighbors and add two more objections to the addition of a bike path on

Riviera Drive. Number one, any proposed bike path would diminish the beauty of our street. Riviera Drive is among the loveliest in the City Beautiful. Near the south end, it's a splendid 1937 estate, Coral Cove, designed by Phineas Paist. At the other end of Riviera is the Chinese village, my home for the last 27 years, and one of eight international villages built in the 1920s by George Merrick. There are fewer than 100 of these international historic homes in Coral Gables, three of them on Riviera Drive. These unique landmarks are characterized by a zero-lot line with garden walls and garage entrances placed nearly at the sidewalk's edge. This was a purposeful aesthetic choice that dramatically differs from the standard residential setback. Any reduction to the swale at the Chinese village for the construction of a bike path would result in an unattractive change to the proportions between paving, green space and the zero-lot line setback. It would result in the appearance of a hulking massive wall overhanging an abbreviated green space in an ocean of paving. Particularly, as Riviera Drive widens in its approach to US 1, just 300 feet from the Chinese village, it's not a pretty picture in this historic section of our city. Any increase in the paved surface for a bike path at this end of Riviera would further diminish the residential nature of our neighborhood by compromising what should be a more rather than less demarcated change from the seven-lane thoroughfare of US 1 to a residential street. Riviera Drive, at the end of the Chinese village, is one of the few residential streets with an unmediated connection to US 1. We do not have a grand gate. We do not have Ponce de Leon Boulevard to the north of US 1 or the Miami homestead strip to the south of US 1 to buffer us from...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please finish.

Ms. Hutson: Seven lanes. Thank you for your consideration.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am. Thank you very much for a good presentation.
Edward Lazzarin.

Edward Lazzarin: Good morning, everybody...

Commissioner Lago: Good morning.

Mr. Lazzarin: Ladies and gentlemen. My name is Edward Lazzarin. I'm an orthopedic surgeon. I've lived on Riviera Drive with my lovely wife 40 years. I don't bicycle, but I do know a great deal about bicycling, largely from what I've learned from my patients who have been injured in bicycle accidents. It is an unquestioned fact that bicycling is the number-one most dangerous sport of all. Absolutely no debate on that. So, now the City wants to build a wonderful, desirable and safe bike path and offer a safe way to commute. The City is essentially inviting bicyclists to use the safe bicycle path, and that is an impossible promise to keep. This invitation will hurt the following: bicyclists and pedestrians, who, with potential severe injuries and possibly facing death. Number two, the homeowners and motorists, who will be subjected possibly to needless mental stress and anguish. But let's talk about the most important matter to us. There's been no real mention of the pedestrians. We all know that cars and bicycles do not coexist well. Do bicyclists and pedestrians coexist? No, not really. We have many pedestrians and constituents walking on the sidewalks for health and pleasure. My wife and I have walked up and down Riviera sidewalks for 40 years. As physicians, we recommend walking. Our federal government recommends all Americans walk. Amazingly, Democrats and Republicans both agree.

(LAUGHTER)

Mr. Lazzarin: So, now it has been safe to walk on Riviera. With this proposal, the City will make walking dangerous to its constituents. I sincerely doubt that that is the City's intention. And I, for one, am not just against bicyclists on Riviera. I think it's a bad idea, but you know, that's my point of view. I don't think we should subject any other street to this. Thank you very much.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you, Doctor.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Doctor. Debbie Swain.

Debbie Swain: Good morning, Commissioners and...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Morning.

Ms. Swain: Mr. Mayor. Debbie Swain. I am not a resident of Riviera. I live on University Drive, but I am a user of the roadway on Riviera. You know me in many facets, and one of which, of course, I'm sure is a bicycle rider. I'm also a cyclist, a road cyclist. I'm not looking at this plan as the interest of a person that goes fast on roadways. I'm looking at this as a -- as a granny and a kindergartener and the student and the UM student and the commuter and the tourist that wants to go around Coral Gables on bicycle. The number one concern that we have expressed to us -- and I mean us as those of us that do go out on our bicycles and ride -- is safety. And the gentleman just before me mentioned that. And the number one way to improve safety for bicycle riders to granny, the 8-year-old, is to provide infrastructure on the roadways. There's -- the master plan was really a high-level overall plan. It was never intended, as also we heard, to be an absolute. We knew that there was going to be (INAUDIBLE), field conditions were going to be considered, and we also saw that not -- there's not a one-size-fits-all solution. Riviera is probably best served by some sort of roadway device that is not -- does not interfere with the residents and also provides traffic calming. For example, striping. Not every street needs to have a lot of infrastructure to help somewhat with the safety aspect. The other benefits, as I mentioned, are traffic calming that reduces speed and it reduces -- when it reduces speed, it reduces volume. And again, who is this for? It's for all of the city, the people that want to get around by bicycle and use Riviera as the connector. But we urge you to look at -- I urge you to look at connections around the city and don't throw out the baby with the bathwater. Let's (INAUDIBLE)...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am.

Ms. Swain: The city. Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you. Caroline Parker.

Caroline Parker: Good morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Your address, please?

Ms. Parker: Good morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Address.

Ms. Parker: Excuse me?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: 4015 University Drive.

Ms. Parker: That's the address of our organization. I'm here to read...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Ms. Parker: A statement on behalf of Bike Walk Coral Gables...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Ms. Parker: Of which I'm a board member. Dear Mayors and Commissioners. We commend the City on your recent efforts in joining other world-class cities and making safe and comfortable streets for people walking and biking. In recent decades, our residential streets have

been overtaken by automobile traffic. And while we commend the City on its City trolley and Freebee initiatives, the City still lacks basic bicycle infrastructure. Creating attractive, safe and comfortable bicycle lanes for people to get around is one way we can help reduce automobile congestion. Connecting our city's major destinations, downtown, Youth Center, library, schools, the University of Miami, the future Underline and existing trails can make a positive impact and difference in the way people travel. We have diligently shared information about the Gables Greenways design process, Bike Walk Coral Gables, from the beginning of our mailings -- through mailings on our public tour series and on social media and have received hundreds of positive reactions and praise from residents in all parts of the city and from followers around the world. Through public workshops -- the public workshops the City has held in the fall were effective venues for residents to actually interact with the designers and give constructive feedback on the project. While we believe the first priority for implementation of the Gables Greenway should be in the denser areas of our city, connecting downtown to the University of Miami, Coral Gables High School and the future Underline, making other heavily-traveled residential streets safer by creating dedicated space for bikers and walkers is beneficial to all. We understand that specific concerns will arise from residents directly adjacent to this project. It is important for the City to continue meeting and working with concerned citizens. Regardless -- regarding the Gables Greenway. However, whenever infrastructure improvements are added to a roadway, whether it is for drivers, pedestrians or bicycle riders, it provides benefits not just to the residents on that particular street, but to everyone...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please finish up.

Ms. Parker: Who may use that street as a link to another destination in the city. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Commissioner Mena: Ms. Parker, can I ask you a quick question?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: Given that you're a board member of Bike Walk Coral Gables -- and I read your letter. When you say that this particular portion which we're talking about, which is the Riviera section south of US 1, is not the first priority, explain that to me.

Ms. Parker: Well, it may be that the other areas here in, let's say, the north section of the Gables, might have a higher impact. It might be a better place to start, perhaps. But that's not to say that it isn't important to connect to the south side of the Gables as well, south of US 1, but I do think that we'll probably see a higher impact in the north section of the Gables Greenway, especially with connectors to the University of Miami, the Youth Center and some of the other sites mentioned that connect to the downtown area.

Commissioner Mena: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Commissioner Mena: Can I also -- if this discussion -- will get going in a few after we hear from some more speakers, but I suspect that one of the things that will come up is the possibility of exploring other routes. I know there's been a mention that the report itself even contemplated that possibility once we have input from residents. What are your thoughts on that? I mean, I understand your point about connecting the south, but are you -- you know, does it have to be Riviera? Are there other options in this area? I throw out, for example -- and this is just sort of me off the cuff. I'm not a traffic engineer or a designer of a master bike plan, but I happen to live in this area and I know it relatively well. But, for example, I know on Maynada, right, there's already double-width sidewalks there, which are similar in some respects to the shared use concept that's been part of the Gables Greenway proposal that's been circulating. I mean, is that an option we could explore? What are your thoughts on that?

Ms. Parker: I think that certainly the organization is open to working with the City and their urban planners on other options. I know that that may not be the next phase, as the City might be interested in working directly with the residents, but I wouldn't discount that. I think that Bike Walk Coral Gables, as an organization, promotes educating people on safe cycling and also advocating for more bicycle infrastructure, as we know that that will ultimately keep people safe on the streets and improve our urban plan.

Commissioner Mena: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Ms. Parker: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I have two cards here from people who do not wish to speak that are opposed, Karen Schoen and Aida Lazzarin. They're opposed. And the next, Marlin Ebbert. Good morning, Ms. Ebbert.

Marlin Ebbert: Good morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It's a pleasure to see you.

Ms. Ebbert: Nice to see you, too. Happy New Year to everybody. I -- Marlin Ebbert. I live at 6510 San Vicente, and my backyard runs into Riviera backyard. And I'm beginning to sound like a broken record. The last time I was here, I spoke about not giving people proper notice. And I have spoken to many people on Riviera who were initially upset because this took them totally by surprise. And I think that people, at that point, are upset and they are defensive and -- so, the City starts off wrong, on the wrong foot with many people. I sent you all just a photograph. I went down Old Cutler about two weeks ago, and at the intersection of Old Cutler and 120th, there's a wonderful sign that Pincrest has put up about community conversations. It

gives a couple dates. It gives the location. It says, get engaged, you know -- let me see what it says. Participate, contribute, engage. Signs could be put -- signs could be tacked on to the telephone poles. I mean, people walk in our area and leave. Somehow, the waste bill gets to everybody's house. Why doesn't a notice about community meetings get to people's houses? I've looked at the Gables Greenway plan. One thing that you have also -- you have Maggiore as a possibility connecting. Something that the City has overlooked, Maggiore ends in the 6200 block. It becomes my street from then on down to LeJeune. Trust me, we did not -- no one on San Vicente -- in the five blocks that are left -- got a notice. I've talked to them all, so thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Ms. Ebbert.

Commissioner Mena: Thank you.

Ms. Ebbert: But you can put up signs. Please do it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Commissioner Mena: Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alicia Cervera Lamadrid.

Unidentified Speaker: She's outside.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. Maria Cosculluela, and then I'll call Alicia Cervera, if you can find her. Hello.

Maria Cosculluela: Good morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good morning.

Commissioner Lago: Good morning.

Vice Mayor Keon: Good morning.

Ms. Cosculluela: My name is Maria Cosculluela. First of all, Mr. Mayor, Vice Mayor, Commissioners, ladies and gentlemen, thank you for all your work because you work selflessly for all of us, the people who live in Coral Gables. I have heard now some people are talking about they are from an organization. They don't live in Coral Gables. I do live in Coral Gables.

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Ms. Cosculluela: Good. Good for you. Some of them.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Come on.

Ms. Cosculluela: I do live in Coral Gables. I have lived in Coral Gables for the last 43 years. My children have grown up here and they have married here. My husband had died here, and I still live in Coral Gables. I love Coral Gables. I live in 2825 Granada, on the side of Sevilla. Do you know what Sevilla is? Expressway that starts at 7 o'clock in the morning, and where all the traffic from the west that is going to the east, Brickell, downtown, wherever they're going. They go through that aisle. At 3 o'clock in the afternoon, the same thing happens on the other way from the east to the west. Then we get now that we have in LeJeune and Sevilla, a hotel that should never have been there, never ever, and still is not open. At 3 o'clock in the afternoon, the parking lot of cars in LeJeune, they are all the way to University. There are not enough policemen. And we have, from Sevilla to Miracle Mile, three traffic lights, one after each other

because they are after each streets. What are we going to do? The other day I was coming by north from LeJeune and I made a right turn, and that's when I got scared. A right turn on University, and I didn't know -- I saw a flowerpot, and many flowerpots in white with flowers and I didn't know was I in Coral Gables.

(LAUGHTER)

Ms. Cosculluela: Was I in another country? Was I in Central America? Was I in Amsterdam? As a gentleman wrote last week that he was in Amsterdam and he fell in love with the...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Ms. Cosculluela.

Ms. Cosculluela: Bicycles and were driving there. I do live here. I cannot walk here in Coral Gables, and sadly, I go three times a week at 10 o'clock in the morning to walk in Dadeland because I am very scared to drive because of the traffic.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Are you for or against the bicycles on Riviera?

Ms. Cosculluela: I am totally against Riviera -- no, against everywhere in Coral Gables.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

(APPLAUSE)

Ms. Cosculluela: Please. And thank you, all of you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you. Thank you very much.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, Mr...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, Mr. Mayor...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Sue Kawalerski. Sue...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Excuse me. As a matter of decorum, even when you support, even when you don't...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: What people say, it's really important that you not comment from the audience, that you not make, you know, applause and all. It's -- if you see it in the agenda, it says please refrain from doing so.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: That's hard for us to do, but it's important.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Sue.

Susan Kawalerski: Hi. Good morning...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good morning.

Ms. Kawalerski: Mayor and Commissioners. My name is Sue Kawalerski. I live at 6830 Gratian Street. I live in the Riviera neighborhood, and some of you know me as the president of the Riviera Neighborhood Association. Others know me as the president of Everglades Bicycle

Club. So, I'm kind of like straddling this issue a little bit because I'm a resident and I'm also a cyclist. And let me just say that I've heard a lot about safety this morning. To me, safety is the number one thing in Coral Gables. And we should be providing safety to our residents wherever possible. When I'm hearing my fellow residents on Riviera talk about there is a safety issue on Riviera, I am very concerned. And while I don't live on Riviera, I use Riviera. I met with many people from Riviera two weeks ago because they were concerned about the Greenways plan. And, first of all, I think they are very ill-informed about the Greenways plan to begin with because our communication has, I think, been inadequate. But when I explained that sometimes a bike facility in combination with speed tables, for example, can actually improve not only the look of the street, depending on how you design it, but also the safety of the street, as my Riviera residents are talking about. They're talking about high volume, high speed, and one of the ways to combat traffic is actually an aesthetic use and combination of bike facilities and speed tables. And the residents I spoke with didn't even know about the possibilities. My suggestion here moving forward is -- first of all, I'm advocating for safe places to ride a bicycle and to walk. We should not be car-centric. You know, we're all complaining about too many cars. Well, let's try to take some cars off the road. I am very disappointed, when I look around our community, and I don't see any children on bicycles. I grew up on a bicycle. It represented freedom. It represented independence. And as a result, those are character building skills. What I'm advocating for and I'm asking the Commission to do -- and I know the City Manager has said that she is going to have meetings. We really need a bottom up government. We need to talk to the residents and ask them what they want first before hiring consultants and spending money on something that may never be built because they weren't consulted first. So, I am absolutely with my fellow residents on Riviera Drive and their concerns. On the other hand, I am for getting some kind of compromise -- a workable compromise to make cycling safe in our community.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Sue.

Ms. Kawalerski: Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Tina Herrera. Tina Herrera. Oh, there you go. Good morning.

Tina Herrera: Good morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: How are you?

Ms. Herrera: My name is Tina Herrera, and I have lived in the Gables for many, many years, maybe 40, 42 years. And I live very close to Riviera, and I am totally against the dedicated bike path. I think it's a terrible mistake. I'm not going to -- but I am here just to speak up and say that I am totally against it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Ms. Herrera: Thank you for...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.

Ms. Herrera: Okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, I have another one here, a person that doesn't want to speak as an opponent, Robert Brown and Simone Vasquez. They don't want to speak. And I'd like to call -- I don't know if Alicia Cervera is here or has left. Left?

Commissioner Mena: She left.

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. Maria Cruz. We haven't seen you in a long time, Ms. Cruz.

(LAUGHTER)

Maria Cruz: Well, this is another example of daddy knows what's best. The City -- our city -- and by the way, I've lived here since 1976, and I've seen this time and time again. The staff decides what's good for the residents. They don't ask anybody. They decide, you know what, we should be into bicycling. Everybody should be bicycling. Well, I hate to tell you -- I hate to tell you, not everybody's going to bicycle. And maybe the City should back off a little bit and ask people what they want because it's very hard for me to believe that people that have considered the weather, the humidity, the showers, think that most of us are going to be bicycling to work or to -- I understand people doing it for recreation issues. I understand that. Let me tell you, I have a designated bike path across the street from me. I've counted two people every day since I've beginning to count. And you know what -- who they are? Students of the University that can't park there because it's too expensive to park. That's it. That's the extent. Now, to make it very short, we keep reading and we keep talking about, you know, we want to be a world-class city, like Amsterdam. That really made me think. Amsterdam's very well known for three specific things.

(LAUGHTER)

Ms. Cruz: In this city, we won't annex North Gables because, you know, we don't like those motels on 8th Street. We do not want to have marijuana dispensing stations in the Gables. But we do want bicycles. Now, you can't have it one way. If you want Coral Gables to be like Amsterdam, forget about annexing. Let's use those motels for a red-light district and let's have one of the parks for marijuana use and we can have all the bicycling and it will be wonderful.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And we can bicycle to the motels, yeah.

(LAUGHTER)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Ms. Cruz. Maria Valle. Good morning.

Maria Valle: Good morning, everybody, and thank you. My husband is the better speaker, but he couldn't be here today. Let me start by saying we live on 5607 Riviera Drive, and we are both completely opposed to Riviera having a bike path. I want to thank all my neighbors that are so active and keep us informed. And I agree with everything that has been said, but the major issue for my husband and I, as residents of Riviera -- and we're grandparents and avid walkers, both, with a little dog, Pico -- is accessibility to our homestead. It is already very difficult to get in and out of our house during times of traffic, which, by the way, is also when bikers like to bike, early in the morning and in the evening, not to mention the weekends. We have a hard time coming in and out of our house because of the traffic. A couple of other things we want to say, it concerns us how is our mail going to be delivered. Right now, the mailman parks the car in front of our house on our grass. And what about the trash swales? What are you going to do about that if we have a bike path on the street? Not to mention, we're avid walkers as well and the other option of sharing the sidewalk, making it bigger for bikers and walkers, I don't know how that's going to work. I don't think that's going to help. So, we please urge you to take into account the residents because we need to be able to get in and out of our homes. It's great to have a recreational activity, like biking and walking. I do both of them. But it's really important to be able to get in and out of our homes...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, ma'am.

Ms. Valle: Safely. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much. Roberta Neway. Roberta. Okay, she's not here. Roy Schoen. Roy Schoen?

Commissioner Lago: He's there.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Oh.

Commissioner Lago: He doesn't want to speak.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You don't want to speak. Okay.

Commissioner Quesada: For or against?

Roy Schoen: Against.

Commissioner Quesada: Okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. Alright, Roberta Neway. Ken Clark. Good morning.

Ken Clark: Good morning. Thank you for being interested in supporting the biking effort. I live at 912 Escobar Avenue, and I'm an avid cyclist. I cycle more than I drive a car in and around the city. This morning, I was at the U Health on Ponce and I rode my bike -- on bicycle. When I came back up, I came on Riviera, specifically to see what it was like on my bicycle. It's not necessarily where I usually pass. And interestingly, it seems to me that it's wide enough to do what's done on Alhambra Circle, where there's a dedicated bike lane, which is just a stripe on the road which indicates to vehicular traffic that a bicycle might be here and to make space for the bike.

Commissioner Mena: Sir, just to be clear -- I don't mean to interrupt you, but you're -- I assume you're referring to Riviera north of US 1.

Mr. Clark: I am, but...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: He's referring to Alhambra Circle.

Commissioner Mena: No, I know. But he -- the route he took from U Health...

Vice Mayor Keon: Right.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Oh.

Commissioner Mena: To come here...

Mr. Clark: Right, I came the...

Commissioner Mena: Was the route north of US 1.

Mr. Clark: That's correct.

Commissioner Mena: Okay.

Mr. Clark: But you know, I also bike -- my normal biking route, I go to Matheson Hammocks. I'm on Riviera, I'm on Granada, going north, south, different -- you know, different bicycles, different concerns. But all throughout the initial stages of planning, I think it's a great effort and I think it should be looked at on multiple levels to have sidewalks that are wide enough to have cycling and walking, I think is great. But to start with the cheapest and the most visible way to help cyclists, I think is to line streets to indicate there is a -- the possibility of a bike being there, signage that says bikes -- like on Anastasia, where it says cyclists may use whole lane, not that necessarily that happens, other than the groups, which is not really -- I don't think that's an issue in Coral Gables. But to start with signage and with street markings to indicate that bikes have a right to be here. I don't get honked at that much anymore. Even though people do know that

bikes are vehicles also, but that would be, to me, the best way to start and to work on other alternatives as well. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And Roberta Neway is not here, so I will -- there are two -- I have two types of cards here. One, bicycling in downtown, which eliminates parking, and the other one, Riviera and bicycling down Riviera for safety and other reasons. Any other Riviera people or people that want to speak on Riviera and bicycling? Yes, sir.

Robert Ruano: I filled out a card.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And what's your name?

Mr. Ruano: Robert Ruano.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Come on. Robert.

Commissioner Quesada: Mr. Mayor, what you're saying is the remainder of the cards are talking about the downtown area.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'm sorry?

Commissioner Quesada: No, no. I'm clear.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No. I don't have your card here, I'm sorry, but...

Mr. Ruano: No, I put it over there. I'm not sure what happened to it. I put it on the desk, okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Can I have that card?

Mr. Ruano: Good morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Morning. Your name -- your name again?

Mr. Ruano: Robert Ruano, 1544 Murcia Avenue.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: How do you spell your last name?

Mr. Ruano: R-U-A-N-O.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Oh, okay. I didn't have it. Great, thank you.

Mr. Ruano: Good morning, Mayor, Vice Mayor, members of the Commission. Actually, I appear before you today with concern. Speaking here is not something I really want to do. I'd rather go about my day and just hope that you all do the right thing. And I had a talk about it, but I'm probably not going to use it much because most of you weren't here when the bike plan was passed. I think you were here.

Commissioner Quesada: Well, three of us were.

Mr. Ruano: Oh, yeah? Three of you? Okay, well, okay, sorry. I meant everybody there. Anyway, Riviera was a contentious issue, if you recall. Our group -- or the group that I'm on, which I'm not speaking on its behalf today -- Bike Walk Coral Gables, which is actually City

residents and City business owners, did not really support it at the time, and that's the truth. But what we were told and what was discussed in the planning and when it was adopted was that we would put all these alternate plans and then we would come back to the community and let the community have input in whatever. But the concern here is really this item is really not about bike lanes on Riviera. It's really -- it's really about doing nothing against the increase of traffic, which is a real and urgent problem. You're going to hear a lot of reasons why we don't need this infrastructure and why other places are different that have embraced them. But the fact is that bike lanes, if they were installed on Riviera or other streets similar to it, would actually reduce the speed of traffic by causing cars to go slower in a narrower lane. That's the truth -- that's a fact. The fact is that exercising cyclists, the MAMILs, middle-aged men in Lycra, which I am not one of them -- some of you might be -- our group does not really -- was created for that. It was created for moms, dads, families, everybody. The fact is that those cyclists on Saturdays and Sundays avoid streets with cycling facilities. And in fact, if a bike lane was created on a road -- if you had a bike lane on Riviera today, a bike lane on the street, cyclists, by law, would have to ride single file on that road and not take over the lane. That's a fact. The other fact is that bike lanes do nothing to decrease property values, but actually make a property on a connecting artery like Riviera more attractive to the reduced automobile speed. The question is, what happens after today? Are you -- the next street you move down, when people come out, you need a north-south connection. When people come out, are you going to throw it away? Are you going to throw away the plan, or are you going to stand bold and say we need this kind of infrastructure because everybody here agrees traffic is bad. It's only going to get worse. We need to do something, and putting up walls around the city is not an option.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Ruano: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, I understand now that Riviera people have spoken, and I will call merchants and bike path concerned people on...

Commissioner Mena: There's another speaker. He says he gave a card.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Another...

Vice Mayor Keon: Oh.

William Moose: I also turned in a card, William Moose.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: What's your name?

Mr. Moose: (INAUDIBLE) William Moose.

Commissioner Quesada: Come on up.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Come up.

Commissioner Lago: William Moose.

Commissioner Mena: William Moose.

Mr. Moose: Yeah, I'll make it quick.

Vice Mayor Keon: (INAUDIBLE) other ones.

Mr. Moose: So, you've probably seen me before. I come out any time there's something related to walking, biking, safety-related...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: Name and address.

Mr. Moose: Yes, William Moose.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

Mr. Moose: I live at 444 Malaga Avenue, in Coral Gables, with my wife. We're a one-car household by choice. You know, for me, actually, someone mentioned that cycling is the most dangerous sport, but it's not really a sport. I actually very rarely...

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Mr. Moose: What's that?

Unidentified Speaker: Sir...

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, stop it.

Unidentified Speaker: Sir, excuse me.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No comments from the public, please.

Mr. Moose: No, no. I'm just saying that for me, sir...

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Commissioner Mena: Sir...

City Attorney Ramos: No, no. Sir, that is inappropriate.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Please address the Commission.

Mr. Moose: I'm saying, respectfully, sir, that for me...

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Mr. Moose: I'm saying, respectfully, that for me, it's actually my mode of transportation. Sorry I touched a nerve there. No, I'm saying that it's actually my primary form of transportation. And that although I live less than half a mile from downtown, it's often a very stressful experience just trying to move around. You know, people have just -- right in my neighborhood streets, have passed me, gotten out of the car, shouted at me, told me I had to use the sidewalk, when, legally, I know that I can use the lane and know I'm not doing anything wrong. So, I mean, I applaud the City for what it's trying to do here. I'm not trying to say that the Riviera residents are wrong, that I know their context better than they do or that, you know, that I know what's good for them and they don't, you know. I'm just saying that I strongly support an initiative to make cycling better and safer and connect neighborhoods to the downtown in a safe way. And I did just want to mention that I do this -- I do bicycle and pedestrian planning as a career. I've worked in the US, in Europe, in Latin America on these issues. And I will say that I know there's some concerns of the real estate values -- and I did just want to mention one thing. I don't know if anyone's familiar with the Indianapolis cultural trail, but it's about an eight-mile project through neighborhoods and downtown in Indianapolis, very similar to what we're trying to do. And six years after it opened in 2008, they had seen a 148 percent increase in property values within a block of the off-street bicycle trail. And for the 1,800 parcels along the eight-mile route, the total increase in value over a six-year period was \$1.01 billion, billion dollars

over a \$60 million investment. So, I mean, it catalyzed an incredible amount of economic growth and appreciation.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Moose: So, I'm just saying I know there's a lot of concern and that it can be a very visceral concern when it's in front of your house, but the evidence in a lot of places shows that it does in fact...

Commissioner Mena: Can I ask you...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Commissioner Mena: If you know about that study, just because you referenced it. I, obviously, haven't seen it, but that -- if I could ask my question. The median household value there in Indianapolis, I mean -- because I -- have you -- I could understand how a bike path can improve property values in an area where maybe, you know, it's not as affluent an area, but the specific portion we're talking about here, we're talking two to three...

Mr. Moose: Sure.

Commissioner Mena: Sometimes more million-dollar houses.

Mr. Moose: I've seen a number of studies on this issue, which are interesting. There was one that was done nationwide that looked at areas with above-average bike-ability and walkability compared to areas with average walkability and bike-ability, and they found about a \$34,000 increase in median home value if you were within 500 feet of a high-quality, off-street, you know, bike facility. So, I think that the evidence is pretty strong in these. These are academic studies, you know, they're like (INAUDIBLE) models with a control for a lot of other factors.

And it seems to be a fairly strong evidence across the country that these projects do, in fact, generally increase real estate value. I can't speak to this exact case, what that would be. But I'm just saying what's been studied thoroughly and rigorously elsewhere, that's what...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Moose: We find. So, thank you very much.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Commissioner Mena: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Now that everybody has spoken on Riviera -- yes, sir.

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Commissioner Mena: No, he's on the downtown issue.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, but are you on the downtown issue or Riviera?

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Commissioner Mena: We're just...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Commissioner Mena: We're trying to deal with Riviera and then...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: But we're trying to deal with Riviera...

Commissioner Mena: Which one are you? Because I know you were here last time.

Vice Mayor Keon: Yeah.

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Commissioner Mena: Okay, okay.

Commissioner Lago: Alright, come on.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'm sorry. What's your name again?

Lord Toussaint: Lord Toussaint.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, but you're going to speak on 245 University Drive or 255, isn't it?

Mr. Toussaint: No, not necessarily. I...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I was going to call you to speak on that.

Mr. Toussaint: I want to speak on the general process. And again, I'm a resident...

Commissioner Lago: Well, you could...

Mr. Toussaint: Of 6700 Granada Boulevard.

Commissioner Lago: Mayor, he can be the transition.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, okay.

Mr. Toussaint: A bridge, if you'd like.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I don't have you here, but go ahead.

Mr. Toussaint: So, good afternoon, I think, by now. You've probably noticed today that there's a storm of people that felt ambushed, that felt that they were never taken into consideration, that felt that they never had a voice in the process of the bike lane. When I was here for the very first time, I heard from Jessica Keller, who, if I'm not mistaken, is an employee of the city. So, I thought initially that she worked for Greenpeace. Then I thought she worked for Max Cycle, and then I realized that she works for us. And I have ten employees myself and I really don't take this lightly. If I hire someone to do a job for a city -- in fact, she's doing this job for all of you because you have busy lives and you have a specialist that does this job for you. I remember hearing the touting of Baltimore and its successful program. And I turn your attention very quickly to an article that says Baltimore battles its bike lanes. This article continues to name six other major US cities that are embroiled in lawsuits for the very same reason and the very same purpose. Residents were kept in the dark until the last minute. Residents were hoodwinked, and at the end of the day, lawsuits. Lawsuits in New York. Lawsuits in Boulder, Colorado, whose program lasted 11 weeks because it was ripped out under public fury and demand. What I can't understand is how we hire someone, we pay someone, we employ someone to do a job and the job is done more like a lobbyist, like an activist and not representing the citizens of the City of Coral Gables. And to me, that calls for the immediate resignation of anyone that has spearheaded this program.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Wait a second.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Mr. Mayor, so if there's not a -- if the employee is not an attorney -- the attorney and -- has the City Attorney's Office. The City Clerk has their

employees. I have 1,000 employees. I would welcome the opportunity to speak to you, but this is not a personal issue. We're talking about bike lanes. I appreciate the feedback that you're giving...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let's concentrate on that.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: But I'd like to get back to the...

Mr. Toussaint: Again, I'm not making it a personal issue. I'm making an issue of representation.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, I would welcome the opportunity to speak to you. the City Commission makes me responsible for how we proceed on the day-to-day measures. This is a day-to-day measure, and I would look forward to it. But I don't believe that this forum is the appropriate forum. So, Mr. Mayor, if we can...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: I would reach out to him and meet with him separately, but not...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Do you have any comments on bicycles?

Mr. Toussaint: Yes, I think my comments are relating directly to the issue, not indirectly.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Mr. Toussaint: Most people feel they weren't properly notified.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Mr. Toussaint: It was evidenced by the fact that you were told that somebody went door to door, and in many cases, no one was home, or in many cases, no business owners were around. And I think if you don't see this cloud...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Sir, you have...

Mr. Toussaint: You'll see the cloud when it's litigated because we were left in the dark. And I think we need to go back to the source, inclusion. The neighbors, the business owners were not included in the beginning of this process and that's a gross violation of all of our rights.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir. Thank you very much.

Mr. Toussaint: You're very welcome.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Appreciate it. Okay, Mayda Cisneros.

Vice Mayor Keon: I think Mayda left.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: She left? Okay, Ivette Arango.

Vice Mayor Keon: I think she speaks also...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

Vice Mayor Keon: I think Ivette also speaks for Mayda.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Hi. Go ahead.

Ivette Arango O'Doski: Good morning. Thank you for hearing the business owners and residents of City of Coral Gables. We were not informed of this process. We appreciate now you're opening this to listen to us. Our business -- our access to our downtown -- this is putting the cart before the horse. Number one, Miami-Dade County is bigger than some states. We don't have the infrastructure or the transportation connectivity to allow for some of this. Coral Gables does not have big parking lots in the downtown area to provide -- to allow for everybody to come -- that we need to come see us. So, by taking away -- you took away all my street parking on the side of my building. There is -- and University and Salzedo was, in some parts, reduced to one lane. This creates not only a dangerous situation, which I have a picture of an accident that happened last week with the planters. And it also creates a real hardship for my employees that come from Kendall, Doral, all over to come to me. It creates hardship for my clients to come to me, and it happened last week several times, where clients have circled around saying, listen, 30, 45 minutes looking for parking, more than that. We'll catch you next time. So, you're creating a dangerous situation. My delivery -- we get a lot of merchandise at the store. The delivery truck that used to be able to turn into my alley can no longer do that. I have pictures of that delivery truck, a UPS truck, you know -- they're taking up the one lane heading towards University on Salzedo and cars are going on the opposite side of the street, on opposing -- in opposing traffic to try to get to University, so that creates a dangerous situation. This is -- accessibility to our downtown is something that is very important for our continued success. We've made major investments in our downtown. The business owners -- you'll hear a lot of them -- are here, those that could make it. They're all in agreement that this -- you know, we're all having some struggle with this project. Thank you.

Commissioner Mena: Can I ask you real quick -- and I know several of you were here last meeting and we talked about some of these concerns. I think the takeaway, if I recall correctly, was...

Commissioner Lago: It was temporary.

Commissioner Mena: Once we have the results on this temporary -- and I'm only referring now to the downtown portion.

Ms. Arango O'Doski: Right.

Commissioner Mena: That we'll sit down. We'll make sure to get everybody's input and the type of data you're suggesting and figure out what works, what doesn't work, and see what we need to do. I'm just trying to understand if something's changed since that meeting or are we...

Ms. Arango O'Doski: For example...

Commissioner Mena: It's the same issue.

Ms. Arango O'Doski: Well, the accident happened, and then, we've had more situations...

Commissioner Mena: The one with the -- somebody hit the...

Ms. Arango O'Doski: The planter, right. And the UPS -- we saw, again, the UPS truck standing in the middle of that one lane. There's also study -- you guys -- it's my understanding that Ms. Keller was doing car counts, that there was a City employee at the corner of our street who was doing car counts. That person that was there was not taking into account -- they'll track when there's an empty space. They're not marking how long that space stays empty. So, a lot of these studies that are being conducted using our taxpayer dollars, again, are not -- we're not being included in any of this. It's -- I had to go out and talk to the person myself, find out why are you on my street corner every single day. What are you looking for? And we're not being included here. I mean, this is something that we're having to find out. This shouldn't be the case. I mean, not with our government. And like I said, this is something that essentially, you're taking away our choices. You're taking away our choices in how far we can travel. You're not

influencing the way I travel. You're taking my -- away my choice in how far I can travel because I have appointments all over the county and beyond. You're taking away my choices in when I could take my kids because I have infant carriers and car seats. You're taking away the choices of my clients to come see me, of my employees to have parking. I mean...

Commissioner Mena: And listen, I hear you loud and clear, and I don't dispute the notice shortcomings that we've talked about, I think, in a variety of instances here. I just -- again, this is temporary. I don't -- so, when you say we're taking away X, Y and Z, I just want to make it clear that there has no -- not been a final decision on this particular part of this route and that, as we instructed last meeting, we absolutely want your input and the input of the other businesses in the area to make sure we do this right. What's there now is not permanent by nature. I mean, I think it's expressly temporary. I'm not sure when that period ends. I think it was in...

Vice Mayor Keon: Cathy, when is it over? I think it's short.

Commissioner Mena: But I just want to make that clear that we're not, you know...

Unidentified Speaker: It's a 60-day demonstration period.

Commissioner Mena: Which started?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Unidentified Speaker: It started -- it should be over within the next two to three weeks.

Commissioner Mena: Okay.

Unidentified Speaker: I don't have...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Unidentified Speaker: The exact date.

Commissioner Mena: And as per...

Unidentified Speaker: But it's 60 days.

Commissioner Mena: Our instructions last meeting, once you've collected whatever data you're collecting, we'll be having...

Unidentified Speaker: Absolutely.

Commissioner Mena: Meetings with the business owners...

Unidentified Speaker: Demonstration project so folks could see what protected bike...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Why don't we finish the public meeting, and then...

Commissioner Mena: No, no.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We'll comment.

Commissioner Mena: I just wanted to make sure they understand that we absolutely want...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: But -- yes...

Commissioner Mena: Their input on this.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: We will absolutely, after the 60-day trial, we will stop. We will collect the -- and we will meet...

Vice Mayor Keon: Will remove.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: With everyone in the downtown area that is -- wants to provide input on that issue before we come back...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: With a recommendation to the City Commission.

Vice Mayor Keon: But can I just make clear, at the end of the 60 days, they will be removed?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Yes.

Unidentified Speaker: Yes.

Vice Mayor Keon: They will be removed.

Commissioner Lago: They will be removed.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, thank you very much, Ms. O'Doski.

Vice Mayor Keon: In two more weeks, they will be removed.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Ignacio Granda. Good morning.

Ignacio Granda: Good morning or good afternoon. My name is...

Commissioner Lago: Good morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good afternoon.

Mr. Granda: Ignacio Granda. I'm the owner of Alhambra Antiques. (INAUDIBLE) the building now that is in 2850 Salzedo Street, right across the police and fire department. I am here to let you know that I'm against the proposed protected bike path that steals 11 feet, 2 inches from Salzedo Street because, in my opinion, it is based on an erroneous underlying assumption that if the City provides this path, workers and shoppers are going to use them to come to the business district and alleviate our traffic problems. In the case of my two tenants, Mayda Cisneros, who was just here -- unfortunately, she left -- I want to share with you that she has nine employees, and none of the employees that she has live in Coral Gables; only Mayda lives in Coral Gables. My other tenant -- and by the way, her customers will not come on bikes to pick up nightgowns on a bicycle, so neither her employees nor her customers will be riding bikes.

Vice Mayor Keon: Ball gowns, not nightgowns.

Mr. Granda: House of Appliance...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Or antique furniture, yes.

Mr. Granda: House of Appliance is my other tenant now; has four employees. I asked them where they live. I was surprised to hear Hollywood Hills, Miami Lakes, Hialeah Gardens and Hialeah. So, four employees in my building do not live in the Gables, so they're not going to ride bikes to the Gables. Their customers -- I asked them -- they come from Ocean Reef, Miami

Beach, South Beach, Doral, Aventura, Key Biscayne, Fisher Island, so they're not going to ride bikes to come to Coral Gables. So, in conclusion, there is a demand for bike paths -- is there a demand, I'm asking, for the bike paths from the workers and shoppers in our cities? Please show us the data where current employees in the city live and their need for a bike path. Is the data from our constituency or our city residents (INAUDIBLE) for bike path? That's what I want to see before you move on.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much, Mr. Granda.

Mr. Granda: And I certainly hope that...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: This is a study, and after it's completed in two weeks -- is it? -- you will all be contacted and we will make sure that you're all included and your opinion is heard.

Mr. Granda: I am very happy to hear that they will be removed...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

Mr. Granda: In 60 days, those large planters because they really are taking away...

Commissioner Lago: And your parking will be restored.

Mr. Granda: Okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Mr. Granda: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Mike -- Michael Belaustegui. Good morning, sir.

Michael Belaustegui: Good afternoon.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Or good afternoon, unfortunately.

Mr. Belaustegui: Good afternoon, City Commission, Madam Vice Mayor. I own a little place called Vicky Bakery. I'm not sure you've heard of it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'm sorry, what?

Mr. Belaustegui: Vicky Bakery, and I'm sure you've heard of it.

Vice Mayor Keon: Vicky Bakery.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, of course.

Mr. Belaustegui: Okay. So, my parking situation is a little bit different. My employees don't use the metered parking, right. My customers do, right. And if you know anything about my customers -- because I've done some data -- some research. My customers are transient. My customers during the day, 9 to 5, for the most part, 85 percent do not live in the City of Coral Gables. Asking them to commute from Westchester, Kendall and the west on bicycle is obviously not possible.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You have some who do, yes.

Mr. Belaustegui: Yeah?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Customers.

Mr. Belaustegui: They take what, like 8th Street?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No.

Vice Mayor Keon: You ride your bike?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Mr. Belaustegui: You live in the Gables.

Commissioner Mena: Right. That's what he's saying.

Mr. Belaustegui: Live and work in the Gables.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'm part of the 15 percent.

Mr. Belaustegui: You're part of the 15 percent.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Mr. Belaustegui: I haven't seen you on a bike there, Mr. Mayor, with all due respect.

Vice Mayor Keon: I've never ridden my bike there.

Mr. Belaustegui: Right, correct. That's right.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I will use a tricycle.

(LAUGHTER)

Mr. Belaustegui: So, the sheer notion -- I heard the residents from Riviera speak. The sheer notion that reducing a street to reduce traffic flow, in my opinion, is ludicrous, alright. While it may reduce speed of traffic, I think it'll increase gridlock. If a bike -- protected bike lane is installed on Riviera, the overflow that you would see on University, where there is currently a restricted bike path, will create a gridlock as well. As Lord mentioned last week, the City approved, two years ago, the largest project in the history of the City. Coincidentally, the entrance to that project is on University and Malaga, and we're looking at installing and reducing lanes of traffic on University and Malaga, where we're going to introduce thousands of new residents. I certainly oppose the project and I look forward to the results of the 60-day project, and look forward to continuing the conversations. Thank you.

Commissioner Mena: Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you, sir.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir. Rhett Cili.

Rhett Cili: Good afternoon.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good afternoon. How do you pronounce your last name?

Mr. Cili: Cili.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Cili. I was right the second time.

Mr. Cili: Yeah. So, I was here last week. And as far as new information, I just wanted to update you because I think some pertinent things have happened, along with what Ivette said was the car count, they also sent an aerial photo of all of the spaces that are available -- it says within

one block of Palermo. But if you do a count of all the spaces, what I want you to understand is there are actually 18 spaces per city block available for parking. Now, I don't know how that relates to your math, but my math, for a city block to have 18 parking spaces is probably very limited in the opportunities. So, to take away more spaces is just unconscionable for our business. I'll give you a perfect example. Yesterday, at 4:10, a gentleman came in my showroom, Quito (phonetic). He is a lifelong resident of Coral Gables. He is a semi-retired builder, and he builds one to two houses a year. This is exactly what he said. This was my fourth attempt to come to your showroom because I couldn't park. And today, I was about to leave after circling a couple of times and somebody finally backed out, so I was able to come in. This is the story...

Commissioner Quesada: I'm sorry, what business is yours?

Mr. Cili: 300 Palermo, Designers Tile.

Commissioner Quesada: Got it.

Mr. Cili: So, again, as referenced before, nobody is coming to my store with a bicycle to carry samples back home to show their husband or wife, or the designer for her clients. Our business is dependent on traffic, and it's dependent on people having access to our store. And right now, that's really been prohibitive. And I just want you to know, in my opinion, you are all here to represent the people. And the voices that I've heard, as I've sat here, is overwhelmingly dominant that you really need to include all of us. Again, I made mention that Jessica came and brought the flyer to give me a heads-up that on Monday they were starting the project. Never once saying that it's open for discussion. So, I had two days to prepare to lose all of the parking spaces along the side of my store. It's very disappointing. So, I would just encourage you to listen to the people and act accordingly because it's really impacting all of our businesses.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Cili: Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And the last card I have is Dilian Sanchez.

Unidentified Speaker: She had to leave.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: She had to leave, okay.

Dilian Sanchez: No.

Commissioner Lago: She's here.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Oh. She had to leave, but didn't. Hi.

Ms. Sanchez: I stayed. Good afternoon. My name is Dilian Sanchez. I am the owner of El Encanto Medical Center. We are a brand-new medical center that opened in the Gables on 255 University Drive. We provide care to our seniors. We bring them to our center in buses, and they come and they spend a couple of hours with them. In the morning, after they see our doctor, they have lunch with us, and then we drive them home. I was born and raised in Miami and have been a resident of Coral Gables for over 20 years. Every time I make a right turn coming from my home -- I live on Edgewater Drive. Every time I make a right on University coming from LeJeune Road, I feel extremely -- it is extremely dangerous. I, myself, I'm afraid of hitting the planters. They're very pretty, but they make me nervous in the morning. Since the bike path was installed, we have seen only two bikers. One biker was inside the path and the other biker was outside on the street. Bikers are not using that biker lane on University Drive. University Drive is an extremely busy street. Since you have converted some of our streets in the Gables to

cobblestone cafés -- I forgot the name of the streets, but they're very beautiful. Since -- also, Coral Way, you've limited to one way each street also. That has made University Drive extremely busy. Not only is it extremely busier than when we started back in June, University Drive is right now, to me, a main street that brings -- connects you from LeJeune going south -- going east, I'm sorry. Going east, going to Little Havana, Brickell, downtown, southwest Miami area. I would like to thank you and appreciate your consideration to our...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much, ma'am.

Ms. Sanchez: To our...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thanks for appearing, and thanks for staying. I will close the public part of the hearing. We have had 40 people give us cards, and 33 of them appeared, talked, and -- having to do with Riviera and the downtown parking situation. I would like to hear -- I mean, this is a study. The study has not concluded. We have been told by the City Manager that neighborhoods, neighbors, merchants, et cetera, will be consulted without our participation so that we don't have to make it into a Sunshine meeting. I would like, however, based on what we've heard, along with the letters that we've heard, that whatever the study shows, we discard bicycle paths on Riviera Drive. No bicycle paths on Riviera Drive. And then the study will show whatever it does, but I would like to -- when somebody makes -- if they do -- to append that to the motion. Commissioner wants to say -- let's be brief because of the time.

Commissioner Mena: Are you talking about the entire Riviera or just the southern portion?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: The southern portion.

Commissioner Quesada: So, yeah, I have a few thoughts on this, and thank you for all the participation on this. It's great. We love it when people participate. It makes it easier for us to make a well-informed decision. Believe it or not, sometimes we don't get that much participation on some issues, so thank you for that. 2014, we talked about the bicycle plan. I was very involved with that, absolutely was. And I'm a big proponent of encouraging bike lanes and different types of transportation in the city, 100 percent. When we -- at that time when we were putting that study together, we were discussing different location that would make sense for north and south connectors. I believe at that time, the County was discussing improving the bike lanes that we have on Old Cutler going south, so it was about reaching a connection at that point. At that point, we had already discussed Alhambra, and I believe the striping had occurred already going east and west. So, the big conversation is how do you connect people that are riding, you know, east and west to go north and south. So, that was the conversation. Is it Granada? Is it Riviera? Is it another way to get there? In those conversations, we hired a consultant. I believe it was Street Works. Street...

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Commissioner Quesada: Street Plans. Yeah, I knew it had the street name in it. And that consultant was the one that, you know, they had different meetings with staff. I know we had public meetings on it, and I know there was quite a lot of participation, obviously, not as much participation as we're seeing now. But there were public meetings. There were public conversations. I remember getting briefed on those. I remember having people participate in those. So, I want to be clear with everyone that there was a public process. Now, whether we could have advertised it better, obviously, what I've heard today, yeah, we should have advertised it better somehow. And I know in the past we've always tried to be as inclusive as possible. So, I don't want anyone to think that we're trying to keep anyone out. I think it's important for the process, for everyone to understand. One of the reasons that Riviera was selected at that time, from my recollections in those meetings and being one of the people that

voted on yeah, we like the plan -- and it was always, well, we'll see how we implement it in the future. We didn't have the money at the time for implementation. And actually, the Miami Herald wrote an article a few months ago saying, hold on, City of Coral Gables implement -- paid for a plan and still hasn't implemented it. So, the idea always was, okay, this is what the consultant's given us. This is what we have the meetings about. We'll shelve it until we have the money, and then we can further analyze it moving forward. That's the way I recall everything playing out, and I see the other Commissioners nodding, so that's the way it played out. Now, one of the issues for Riviera was -- and Mr. Davis pointed out in his letter, the one I said was so comprehensive -- is one of the areas that we thought about for Riviera was, well, hold on a second. It's such a -- it's a wider street than Granada. So, I remember there were quite a few conversations related to that. And the conversation at that time was, well, hold on a second. There's a pretty deep swale, but most residents, although that's -- the swale is the City's property -- feel like it's their own property. So, the conversation became, well, do we want to cut into that or not. Will the residents like that? And most won't -- probably will not like it. So, at that time (INAUDIBLE) said, you know something, let's just table it for now. When the money is there to be able to do it, we should revisit the conversation because we don't want to do something that's going to anger all the residents. I think it's important for -- to give some of the history of how we've gotten to this point, at least from my recollection of it because I was very involved. It's very important -- and most people don't realize this -- and I didn't realize this until this number was given to us. We have several hundred thousand vehicles that cut through the city every day. From our perspective as elected officials, traffic is one of the top enemies that we have in the city. And now I'm talking about not only the Riviera corridor, but the downtown corridor. And I live walking distance to Vicky Bakery. I'm there too often. So, what ends up happening is we're always looking for alternatives, you know. We fought very hard to get a seat with the County on their traffic -- essentially, their Traffic Advisory Board, which Commissioner Lago's done a great job, and he's our representative on that. You know, the traffic issue in the city is that, you know, we're sort of dead center when it comes to cut-through, so we're always looking for different avenues. And I see our Chief of Police nodding yes because a lot of the stresses he deals with are the cut-through traffic issues. And the question is, a lot of people don't

see it, but when we see the data from other municipalities that are similar to us, be it San Diego or Portland or other cities that have a wonderful residential community next to a vibrant downtown, something that has helped with their traffic when it is presented to us is adding different alternatives. Now, most of us don't see ourselves riding bike to work. However, there is a percentage that grows every day, and that's why we've seen a lot of our property values increase near our downtown corridor because there are some people that want to be able to walk to work or ride the trolley or jump on a bike -- or uncoordinated and lanky people like me like riding skateboards to work every now and again. So, the more avenues you give people, the better likelihood there is that it will reduce the traffic. So, obviously, there's an overwhelming support not to have bike lanes on Riviera, you know.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Overwhelming.

Commissioner Quesada: Overwhelming, and I'm not going to go against the residents in that regard. But what I want everyone to keep in mind and something I'm going to continue fighting for is we can't throw out the idea of having bike lanes in the city. Some conversations got a little heated on safety. Here's our problem here with safety -- and I think Jessica Keller does a spectacular job. We can agree to disagree on that. I think she's excellent for our city. But when you see what a striping does -- what we have on Alhambra -- the last thing we want -- and I believe the surgeon -- I forget his name -- was correct. You see a lot of injuries when it's just striping. So, there's different...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No. We have had one accident on Alhambra, in all of the years, just one. That's not a lot of accidents.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That's fine. I'm talking about the greater data that we've looked at in 2014, which I recall. If you just have a stamp of a person riding a bicycle, you know, that little stick figure that you see riding a bicycle, obviously, there's more conflict between -- because when you're in a car, you hate cyclists. And when you're on a bicycle, you hate cars. That's just

the natural relationship that there is. So, we're trying to do something that is safe for the riders and the drivers, and something that works for everyone. So, if Riviera doesn't work -- and I believe that's what the sentiment is going to be up here -- I just want to make sure that we're still going to look for other avenues to get there. It's so important, and I'm going to continue to fight it to make sure that we do not lose that. Because, again, you see the numbers in other municipalities that it works, municipalities similar to ours. So, that's what my thoughts are on this.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Madam City Attorney, is a motion in order to, first, discuss this?

Commissioner Mena: Can I address?

City Attorney Ramos: I think there's still more comments to be made, but a motion to discuss it?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, no, no. I mean, under Robert's Rules of Order, does he need a motion in order to initiate a discussion on the motion?

City Attorney Ramos: Technically, you do, but we don't typically follow that process.

Commissioner Lago: So move.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, you move what?

Vice Mayor Keon: So, what is the...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And then we'll discuss it.

Commissioner Lago: I have a motion for discussion.

Commissioner Quesada: Second.

Commissioner Lago: Okay, so I just want to make one comment very briefly. I want to echo the sentiments of Commissioner Quesada. I made the same comments at the last Commission meeting, when we discussed the downtown. Again, I side with the residents of Riviera. I mean, the outcry has been incredible. And I also side with the businesses owners off University. But let's also be honest. We can't just keep pushing this back and back and back. We're eventually going to have to deal with this if we continue to, you know, have the proliferation of buildings and construction that we have in the downtown area. We're not the only city. By the way, the standards that we have in Coral Gables are so incredible -- look at other municipalities. They're facing construction booms that, you know, pale in comparison. So, what I'm telling you is that we can keep pushing this back, but eventually, we're going to have to deal with it. And I had an interesting conversation with Ivette Arango before our meeting today, and it was about maybe we put the cart before the horse. Maybe what we need to do is, before we address issues like the bike lanes, which I think would be embraced by all the business community -- Vicky Bakery, the gentleman with probably the best name I've ever heard in my life, Lord Toussaint. They would embrace it if we had parking already available. For example, I know we're in the process of the swap right now for the public safety building. If we could somehow, some way address it and we could potentially have 150, 200, 300 parking spaces in the downtown area that would be, you know, again, attributed to the business owners so that they have the necessary parking for their employees and for the people who are visiting the area -- that's a block away from where you guys are right now. A lot of your clients park a block away. I park a block away every time I go to Vicky Bakery because everybody's there. So, if we had an answer before we install these bike lanes, I think you would see a lot of people that say, hey, it makes sense. But right now, we're in a situation where, in my opinion, it just doesn't make sense because there is no answer for the parking. There is no answer, and all you're doing is basically inflicting unnecessary punishment on the businesses, and especially, the residents on Riviera.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright, Commissioner Mena.

Commissioner Mena: I typically am not a fan of the “not in my backyard” mentality. I spoke about that with Mr. Davis -- in this case, front yard -- because it’s not productive to progress in a city. I like to do things based on substance and data and facts. And what I want to make clear is that I think that is the case here in Riviera as far as there is substance and facts here that need to be considered. I know this area very well because I drive through here very often. And I won’t even -- I come down US 1 every night and I have to decide am I going to make a left on Maggiore, or this street or the other street. It’s never Riviera because that left turn there is probably the most dangerous turn on all of US 1, at least as far as I’m concerned because US 1 curves there and it’s very difficult to see. The traffic there -- I was out there on Friday afternoon/evening to look at the conditions. I mean, basically -- I have this little map here, which is all the houses. It backs up from Hardee -- not to US 1, but...

Commissioner Lago: Close.

Commissioner Mena: Pretty close. And there’s probably -- there probably are times that it does back up to US 1. It’s pretty bad. More importantly, though, you know, the conditions, if you sort of follow the swale, if you will, there’s trees, there’s sewers, there’s light posts. I mean, there’s all kinds of obstacles that make it very challenging. And when you consider the fact that there may be other options in the area, I think it’s important and I think -- these are some of the emails we’ve received from the residents. I did my best to read all of them and get back to everybody. There was a few that stood out. And I thought the letter from Dr. Bookman, in particular, when he said, look, let’s take a timeout. And I think that’s kind of the right mindset here. Let’s back up. Let’s look at this again. I think even the original plan contemplated reconsidering the actual routes once you had public input, which is, I think, where we are now. And I think that public input has been loud and clear. So, I support the Mayor’s comments about, at this point, not moving forward with the route on the southern portion of Riviera. I’d like to explore other options. I threw out there my, again, sort of own personal view of the possibility of (INAUDIBLE) being an option with double sidewalks already, where you already

have the core of that infrastructure there, but I don't know if that works. I know that's a County road, so that could be complicated. We'd have to work with the County on that.

Commissioner Lago: Should explore it, though.

Commissioner Mena: We should explore it. And I think that's really what everybody's asking here is that we really evaluate the facts here. I agree and I understand from all of you, both residents, business owners, that -- and I think the City Manager has acknowledged and is looking into and addressing some of the lack of notice and input we got from residents in the area here, and we need to do better there. There's no question about that. I respectfully -- I heard your comments loud and clear. What I would say to you is, you know, don't hold Ms. Keller accountable for that. We're accountable for that. We approved this bike plan. The buck really does stop here in the City Manager's Office and on this dais, as far as decisions that are made and the plans that get rolled out. At that point, her job is to go out and do what she's been advised to do. This was a plan -- she didn't come up with this plan, but it's her job to execute it. So, I understand there may be some issues there. I understand there's maybe -- you know, some conversations that have been had, but we need to move forward. We all want to move forward together to resolve this. We want to address your concerns, the businesses, absolutely. I agree with Commissioner Lago's comments. But the most important thing that, to me, has come out of this, this has really been a sort of -- and I talked to Dickie Davis about this, you know, the neighbors have come together. And this is democracy at work. This is how it should work. It would have been nice -- you know, I understand it would have been better if it started at this point instead of arriving at this point a couple years later, but we're striving to get better. We're going to do better. And I just think we need to, again, as Dr. Bookman said, take a timeout on some of these things, really reevaluate, talk to the neighbors and explore what the other alternatives are. Because I -- the last thing I'll say -- and I'm sorry I'm taking so long -- but the last thing I'll say is there were some comments today that kind of, you know, threw sort of the interest in having safe bike paths out the window, and I'm not for that. We do have to have this infrastructure. We just have to find the right way to do it and the right place to do it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: The right place to do it.

Commissioner Mena: And I don't want to -- while we represent all of you, no question, you know, there are people that use their bikes. I would love to be able -- when my daughters are a little older -- to ride around our neighborhood with them, and I'd like to have a safe infrastructure to do that. But we have to find the right place for it and the right way to execute it, and I think we will. So, let's keep working together. Let's keep the dialogue going, but let's also not rush to execute a plan that I think is still lacking in some respects.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright, Vice Mayor, you want to say something? Let's be brief.

Vice Mayor Keon: I think with regard to Riviera and most of the -- in an awful lot of the emails that we received, there was a comment about the shared bike lane between pedestrians and bicycles and people's objection to that, which when I started reading and I thought why -- there isn't any plan to do that. I mean, where did that come from? I don't know where that idea ever came from. And I think, in particular, I addressed it with you. And I think when I wrote back -- when I answered you in an email with regard to this shared use of bike plans or whatever -- I mean, bike paths, it surprised me because I thought that when -- I remember when we discussed the bicycle plan in 2014. It was, you know, a -- it was the beginning of a discussion as to alternative means of transportation. And bike plans were -- and bike plans are becoming -- bike lanes are becoming more prevalent around the country, not only in Europe, but around the country, and a way to alleviate traffic. So, you know, yes, we wanted to do bike lanes. We've also talked about complete streets, and we have a whole, you know, public policy with regard to complete streets and that does include bike lanes. So, I -- you know, but I don't -- this -- the objection from the residents on Riviera took me a little by surprise because I didn't think that there was a project going forward to install bike lanes on Riviera. I don't -- was there a project going forward to install bike lanes on Riviera? City Man...

Commissioner Mena: It's part of the Gables Greenway project.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay, but that's -- the Greenway project is still a project that's under...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That was the perception...

Vice Mayor Keon: Discussion.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: that the people -- yeah.

Vice Mayor Keon: And it is conceptual in plan, and there is no implementation of any of that discussion.

Unidentified Speaker: That's correct. And we're precisely -- where...

Vice Mayor Keon: Yeah.

Unidentified Speaker: (INAUDIBLE) Davis said we were, which we are now in the process of evaluating the community input. And once that community input is fully vetted and heard out...

Vice Mayor Keon: Right.

Unidentified Speaker: We will be in a position to see what's appropriate and where it's appropriate.

Vice Mayor Keon: Right. So, I was surprised by the firestorm of emails because there was no plan. There was no plan to install bike lanes. And there -- I know we went through a discussion as to what type of bike lanes, you know, would we use, and it was, you know, whether you could use striping, you can use protected bike lanes, where the bike lane is separated by a strip of grass

or something else. You could use the shared bike lanes. I think we had that discussion -- the issue of shared bike lanes between pedestrians and bikes was removed from the plan altogether as a concept. We decided it was dangerous; it was bad. You wouldn't mix the two, you know, but the potential for at least the striped bike lane or some sort of a protected bike lane, or a bike lane that's actually separated in some way from the lane of traffic was likely the -- was the safest, you know, for the bicyclist was the safest. But no plan had ever been devised, and no plan was at a point of implementation. It was a discussion among staff as to looking for direction as to how you move forward. And somehow, I think that that discussion became, to residents, was -- they believed it was an implementation plan, that we were ready to do this. And there was -- we weren't. There was no plan to do this. There was a plan to discuss this. I think we should consider -- I mean, this is now -- this is on Riviera. The downtown is another story.

Commissioner Mena: We created a website, though, with...

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Commissioner Mena: We created a website...

Vice Mayor Keon: It is...

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Vice Mayor Keon: It is...

(COMMENTS MADE OFF THE RECORD)

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay.

Unidentified Speaker: It says master (INAUDIBLE) plan.

Vice Mayor Keon: Right. And it was a master plan that was -- it was a conceptual plan that was put into place without any plan for implementation. So, it is a plan that is out there for discussion and for input, and it has never moved to the implementation...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, let's not...

Vice Mayor Keon: Phase.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Discuss it.

Vice Mayor Keon: So, I think that that is...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, go ahead.

Vice Mayor Keon: I mean, so I think that -- and it -- you know, obviously, we know how you feel, so you know, we're responding to you at this time. But the comments that -- I think I -- I do take exception to the comments that none of your -- you know, that there was no consideration given to residents. There was -- because it wasn't -- it -- the plan had not been -- it was conceptual in design. It wasn't -- no decision had been made that this is where you were going to go. It was under evaluation by staff and consideration. Once they would come to some decisions, then it would start the next phase of the process, which is that you go out to the neighbors and you go out and hold neighborhood meetings, and you do those sorts of things. You know, I don't -- I use -- I live on Edgewater also, so I have to tell you, I use Riviera every single day. That's how I come into the downtown. I come down Riviera at least once a day, usually, two or three times a day, I use Riviera. Now, I never access it from the highway, where I have to make right or left turns because I'm coming straight down. It's my route to come across the city to cut into the city. That area right at South Dixie Highway and Riviera is an exceedingly congested area. And the way that the lanes kind of converge and there are lots of

people making left-hand turns and right-hand turns to avoid that traffic light and so it is -- that is a very -- and I think I had spoken with public works that before there's any consideration of anything, that whole intersection and that area needs to be looked at very carefully before we go forward in any of that discussion. You know, also, at LeJeune, we did build the connections and the -- between the -- to be able to cross LeJeune safely to get to Ingraham Park or to continue on down either one of the Commodore or the other trail. So, you know, I wouldn't say that under no consideration should there ever be any consideration on Riviera. I want to tell you there are places along Riviera that absolutely there shouldn't be, you know -- you wouldn't want to put bike lanes because it's dangerous and because the intersections are bad. Is there a place where it may come out onto Riviera and then go on to another street? Possibly. If it's the striping on the side of the street, you know, I think it depends on what it is. And so, before I would react so strongly to it, I would like to see the actual -- the implement -- the plan that is ready to be implemented, or the plan that is being worked on. Now, when we look at and build a public safety building, we start with a conceptual drawing. We know this is what we kind of want to do. We need a public safety building. This is the conceptual building. And it takes a very long time to get from that concept to actually construction. This is all this is. This is conceptual.

Commissioner Mena: But I think -- you know, I don't know how clear that was, respectfully. If you look at the website, first of all...

Vice Mayor Keon: Well, then we erred there.

Commissioner Mena: No, no, I agree.

Vice Mayor Keon: Then we...

Commissioner Mena: There's a...

Vice Mayor Keon: Erred there.

Commissioner Mena: There's literally a section -- there's only like three or four tabs.

Vice Mayor Keon: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: One of them is called the options.

Vice Mayor Keon: Right.

Commissioner Mena: First option is shared use path for pedestrians and bicycles. And it actually says, however, conflicts with pedestrians and slower bicyclists often keep more experienced riders away from these facilities.

Vice Mayor Keon: Right.

Commissioner Mena: That's option one. I'm not saying it's the preferred option. But there's four options listed, and it's one of them.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay, right. And we had a meeting...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Vice Mayor Keon: Where we discussed that and we agreed, as a Commission, that that was not a viable option. So, although it may be on there...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I would like...

Vice Mayor Keon: We know -- and if we don't...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I would like to make a motion, please.

Vice Mayor Keon: And if we don't update the bike -- you know, if we don't update the website to be consistent, then that is a problem with us and our staff.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I would like to make a motion.

Vice Mayor Keon: And how we put it out there is a problem.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let's...

Vice Mayor Keon: So, I want to say with regard to that, you know, I think just like, you know, other issues is that, you know, we have heard you. We're glad -- I'm happy that you reacted. I don't know that you should, you know -- I wouldn't be supportive of saying absolutely on all -- under all circumstances forevermore Riviera will never be considered for anything. I think it's premature.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let me make a motion and let's discuss the motion.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay, I mean, I think that's a little premature...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I'd like to make a motion that...

City Attorney Ramos: Sir, are you passing down the gavel to be able to make the motion?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, I'll pass down the gavel.

Vice Mayor Keon: Now...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I would like to make a motion.

Vice Mayor Keon: Now with regard to...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That we continue with the study...

Vice Mayor Keon: With regard to the downtown -- when I'm through, I'll let you know. With regard to the downtown...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, but let's conclude.

Vice Mayor Keon: I do -- I don't support those bike lanes in the downtown. I think that most of those businesses that are affected are destinations. People are -- they're not going to the downtown to shop in the downtown. They're not going to have dinner and then going to walk the downtown. They are a destination. If you are buying a dress from Mayda Cisneros, you're going there to try on your dress and to go pick up your dress. If you're going to the tile store, you're going there because you're doing some decorating, you need a tile place, and you're going to walk into the tile shop and you're going to shop and buy whatever you do. And most of our downtown, including the Mile, is destination. It's not like Merrick Park, where you go, you park and you stroll around, you eat some lunch and you go to a multitude of shops. A lot of these small businesses on the side streets are destinations, and they do need parking in very close proximity to their stores in order for them to thrive. Now, in Amsterdam and in Denmark and in Copenhagen and in Helsinki, and all of these places that we have talked about where people ride bicycles a lot, those people ride bicycles in the streets. They share the street with the cars. They share them with the trolleys. They share them with the cars. They share them because they have a culture of courtesy that we don't have in this city between cars and bicycles. And you know, if we can work toward changing that, I think we should work toward changing that. But you know, I think right now, this, again, is a work in progress and we should allow staff to move forward

with this. And if those websites are not reflective of the decisions we've made, we need to get those websites updated.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, I would like to move the meeting forward, please. We have to be out of here by 3.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And we have other things to discuss. So, let me -- I passed the gavel. Let me make a motion that we continue the study, that whatever is done discards Riviera -- southern Riviera Drive, discards it totally because we've heard neighbors -- I mean, we've had a whole room full of people, we've had all sorts of emails, conversations, phone calls. We discard southern Riviera, we continue with the study, and we also take very much into account our downtown and the elimination of parking spaces that is vital to our downtown, and that the City Manager is commissioned, excluding Riviera again, to meet with affected parties with whatever plan we come up with.

Commissioner Mena: I'll second.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, we...

Vice Mayor Keon: Can you call the roll, please?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Please.

Commissioner Lago: Can I just...

Vice Mayor Keon: No, I'm sorry. I'll recognize Commissioner Lago.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you. Let me just add one point to the Mayor's comments -- an addendum to his motion. Let's also -- when we move forward and we meet with -- we're going to obviously take the information that we've gathered as a result of the study that's almost coming to an end now in downtown. Before we implement any future studies or we're looking at any areas in the downtown, let's also look at options that, as we take away, we find a way to give back in regards to parking.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Commissioner Lago: Because, again, like the Vice Mayor mentioned, this area, in particular, lacks public parking that I'm aware of, unless anybody could tell me.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Right.

Commissioner Lago: I don't see anybody parking garages -- City-owned parking garages in the area, so...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, will you call the roll, please?

Commissioner Quesada: But let me just understand something in your motion.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: The motion is that we continue...

Commissioner Quesada: Alright, just...

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay, yeah...

Commissioner Quesada: I heard what you said. I just...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Commissioner Quesada: Want to clarify one point...

Vice Mayor Keon: Quesada...

Commissioner Quesada: To understand.

Vice Mayor Keon: What is your concern?

Commissioner Quesada: So, you're saying if the bike lanes don't impact any parking at all in downtown?

Commissioner Lago: (INAUDIBLE).

Commissioner Quesada: No, not you. I'm saying what the Mayor said, what the actual motion is.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: My actual motion is that we continue with the study, we continue with what we're doing, with the planning, but that that planning exclude southern Riviera and that we take -- we pay particular attention to the downtown parking needs and the needs of our downtown and our merchants. That's my motion.

Commissioner Quesada: Okay. Okay, got it.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, and will you call the roll, please?

Commissioner Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: Yes.

Commissioner Quesada: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

Vice Mayor Keon: Yes.

(Vote: 5-0)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Commissioner Lago: Does that include my addendum?

Vice Mayor Keon: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes. We will...

Commissioner Lago: I have the pleasure of having my addendum included in the motion.

Vice Mayor Keon: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I accepted it. I didn't object to your...

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Addendum.

Vice Mayor Keon: He accepted your addendum.

Commissioner Lago: I just, again...

Vice Mayor Keon: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: I don't want to see ourselves here again.

Vice Mayor Keon: No.

[End: 1:07 p.m.]