

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD  
CITY COMMISSION CHAMBERS  
405 BILTMORE WAY  
CORAL GABLES, FLORIDA

OCTOBER 19, 2017  
THURSDAY  
4:00 P.M.

BEFORE:

VENNY TORRE, Chairperson  
ALEJANDRO SILVA, Vice-Chairperson  
BRUCE EHRENHAFT  
JOHN FULLERTON  
RAUL RODRIGUEZ  
JANICE THOMSON  
ALBERT MENENDEZ

ALSO PRESENT:

DONA SPAIN  
KARA KAUTZ  
ELIZABETH GUIN  
MIRIAM RAMOS, ESQ.  
YESENIA DIAZ

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

1           CHAIRMAN TORRE: Welcome to the Coral Gables  
2 Historic Preservation Board. We are residents of  
3 Coral Gables and are charged with the preservation  
4 and protection of historic architecturally worthy  
5 buildings, structures, sites, neighborhoods and  
6 artifacts which impart a distinct historical  
7 heritage of the city.

8           The board is comprised of nine members, seven  
9 of whom are appointed by the commission, and one by  
10 the city manager, and the ninth is selected by the  
11 board, confirmed by the commission. Five members  
12 of the board constitute a quorum and you need five  
13 affirmative votes for the adoption of any motion.

14           The lobbyist registration disclosures form  
15 says that any person who acts as a lobbyist  
16 pursuant to the City of Coral Gables Ordinance  
17 2016-11 must register with the city clerk prior to  
18 engaging in lobbying activities or presentations  
19 before city staff, boards, committees and of the  
20 city commission. A copy of the ordinance is  
21 available in the office of the city clerk. Failure  
22 to register and provide proof of registration shall  
23 prohibit your ability to present to the historic  
24 preservation board applications under consideration  
25 this afternoon.

1           A lobbyist is defined as an individual,  
2           corporation, partnership or other legal entity  
3           employed or retained, whether paid or not, by a  
4           principal who seeks to encourage the approval,  
5           disapproval, adoption, passage, repeal, defeat or  
6           modification of any ordinance, resolution, action  
7           or decision of any city commissioner, any action,  
8           decision, recommendation of the city manager, any  
9           city board or committee, including but not limited  
10          to quasi-judicial advisory board, trust, authority  
11          or council or any action, decision or  
12          recommendation of city personnel during the time  
13          period of the entire decision-making progress on  
14          the action, decision or recommendation which  
15          foreseeably will be heard or reviewed by the city  
16          commission or a city board or committee, including,  
17          but not limited to quasi-judicial advisory board,  
18          trust, authority or council.

19               Presentations made to this board are subject  
20               to the city's False Claim Ordinance Chapter 39 of  
21               the City of Coral Gables City Code.

22               I now officially call the City of Coral Gables  
23               Historic Preservation Board Meeting of October  
24               19th, 2017 to order. The time is 4:13.

25               Present today to my left, Jan Thomson, Raul

1           Rodriguez, Alejandro Silva, to my right, Albert  
2           Menendez, Mr. John Fullerton, Mr. Bruce Ehrenhaft.

3           The next item is the approval of the minutes,  
4           and this is for approving the minutes of September  
5           21st, 2017. Is there a motion for approval of  
6           those minutes?

7           MR. SILVA: I'll move approval.

8           MR. RODRIGUEZ: Second.

9           CHAIRMAN TORRE: We have a motion. We have a  
10          second. All those in favor, please say "aye".

11          (ALL): "Aye."

12          CHAIRMAN TORRE: Anybody against?

13          Thank you.

14          Notice regarding the ex parte communications  
15          says please be advised that this board is a  
16          quasi-judicial board and that the items on the  
17          agenda are quasi-judicial in nature, which requires  
18          board members to disclose all ex parte  
19          communications.

20          An ex parte communication is defined as any  
21          contact, communication, conversation,  
22          correspondence, memorandum or other written or  
23          verbal communication that takes place outside a  
24          public hearing between a member of the public and a  
25          member of the quasi-judicial board regarding

1 matters to be heard by the quasi-judicial board.

2 If anyone has made any contact with the board  
3 member when the issue comes before the board, the  
4 member must state on the record the existence of  
5 the ex parte communication, the party who  
6 originated the communication and whether the  
7 communication will affect the board member's  
8 ability to impartially consider the evidence to be  
9 presented regarding the matter.

10 Does any member of the board have such  
11 communication to disclose at this time?

12 Okay. Any deferrals today?

13 MS. SPAIN: No, sir.

14 CHAIRMAN TORRE: So we're going to swear  
15 anybody who would like to speak today. Would you  
16 please rise and be sworn in. Anybody who's going  
17 to speak, would you please rise. Thank you.

18 MS. DIAZ: Please raise your right hand. Do  
19 you swear to tell the whole truth and nothing but  
20 the truth?

21 (ALL): Yes.

22 MS. DIAZ: Okay.

23 CHAIRMAN TORRE: We have a request for an  
24 excused absence for Mr. Robert Parsley and I'd like  
25 to bring that up for a motion for excused absence.

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: So moved.

2 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Is there a second?

3 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

4 CHAIRMAN TORRE: So Mr. Rodriguez seconded it.

5 All those in favor, please say "aye."

6 (ALL): "Aye."

7 CHAIRMAN TORRE: All those against.

8 Thank you. So we'll do first the city item.

9 MS. RAMOS: Sure.

10 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Thank you.

11 MS. RAMOS: Good afternoon, everyone. My

12 apologies for September. This was supposed to

13 happen in September for both planning and zoning

14 and historic. I got called into an emergency

15 meeting right before this meeting so I was unable

16 to present, and then planning and zoning also got

17 postponed because of the hurricane. So forgive me

18 because this is a little bit redundant with what's

19 going to happen next Friday, but it's very limited.

20 Today we're only going to talk about voting

21 conflicts and it should take ten minutes.

22 Next Friday we have the boards and committees

23 training which many of you have attended. It's

24 from 9:00 to 12:00 at the youth center, and it's

25 going to talk about all the different things you

1 have to know with regard to serving as an appointed  
2 official. Okay. So today we're just going to talk  
3 about the voting conflicts as I mentioned.

4 The voting conflicts are set out both in state  
5 law and the county code and in the city code. And  
6 to that end, you need to know that the definition  
7 of immediate family is important in many of these  
8 statutes and ordinances.

9 As we go through you will see that it often  
10 refers to you and your immediate family. The  
11 problem is that there's three different definitions  
12 of immediate family. So the county defines it as  
13 spouse, domestic partner, parents, stepparents,  
14 children and stepchildren.

15 And then we here at the city say spouse,  
16 parents, children, brothers and sisters, so we add  
17 siblings.

18 And then the state calls them relatives and  
19 says parents, children, spouse, siblings and  
20 in-laws, so they add in-laws and they take out  
21 others.

22 So what our advice is is to take them all  
23 together, assume that all these people are either  
24 your relative or immediate family and that way  
25 we're always safe. Okay.

1           So now having defined immediate family, we'll  
2           talk about the first -- the provision in the county  
3           code. You should know that the city code is almost  
4           identical to the county code. When it's not I'll  
5           mention it, but for the most part it's identical.

6           Quasi-judicial board members or their  
7           immediate family members may not contract with an  
8           agency or department subject to the regulation,  
9           oversight, management, policy setting or  
10          quasi-judicial authority of that board in which the  
11          person is a member.

12          I have more than once received questions about  
13          board members asking, you know, I have a company  
14          that wants to put in for a bid. Is that permitted?  
15          As long as that bid is not regulated by this board,  
16          it is permitted for you to do so. Okay.

17          Now, I'll say this now and I'll probably  
18          mention it again. All of these provisions and all  
19          of the opinions that we issue are extremely fact  
20          based and fact specific. If you change one fact,  
21          the answer goes from no to yes or from yes to no.

22          So these are just for you to have these  
23          general concepts in your mind as triggers of when  
24          you have to ask the question. But our advice is to  
25          come to us before the meeting, as many of you have,



1 and say, look, I have this, you know, that I'm  
2 concerned about, can you give me an opinion?

3 If we give you a written opinion, you're  
4 essentially protected. While the most that will  
5 happen is if they file an ethics complaint, they'll  
6 come after our office and they'll say you guys were  
7 wrong, and that's fine, we'll take it. But you all  
8 will be protected because you received an opinion  
9 assuming you disclosed all the relevant facts. So  
10 please keep that in mind.

11 The second provision is appearances. So this  
12 is regarding the board on which you serve. Okay.  
13 So you may not appear before the board on behalf of  
14 third parties seeking a benefit from this board.  
15 This means that the board member cannot submit  
16 documents or correspondence, appear in meetings  
17 with staff or appear before the board on behalf of  
18 a client or nonprofit. You cannot receive  
19 compensation from third parties seeking a benefit  
20 from this board. And, again, it's limited to the  
21 board on which you serve.

22 The county has a provision that says that  
23 board members may not appear before their own  
24 board, but they may appear before other municipal  
25 boards.

1           Here at the city we say that you may not  
2           appear before your own board or before the city  
3           commission except as a representative of this  
4           board. The purpose of that -- or as a resident.  
5           Certainly, if you have an unrelated matter to  
6           historic preservation that you want to bring up  
7           before your commissioners, they're still your  
8           commissioners and you have the right to do that.

9           But what we don't want is essentially rogue  
10          board members disagreeing with the majority of what  
11          the board has voted on, and then kind of forum  
12          shopping to the city commission that they were in  
13          disagreement because they were in the minority.

14          Now, if you have an issue that the board  
15          decides you want to take together to the city  
16          commission by a resolution or you simply want to  
17          present, that is certainly permissible.

18          Now, the city code does have an exception for  
19          architects that serve on the board of architects  
20          and we allow them to do certain things. But, you  
21          know, that doesn't apply here. I just wanted to  
22          note it.

23                 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Can I clarify that just to  
24                 make sure?

25                 MS. RAMOS: Sure.

1           CHAIRMAN TORRE: So if we come before the  
2           commission as a -- not as a board member, but as a  
3           citizen and we feel strongly different from what  
4           the board ruled, are you allowed to speak as a  
5           citizen even though you're on the board?

6           MS. RAMOS: If it's about what the board  
7           ruled, it gets a little bit sticky. If it's about  
8           something else that has nothing to do with this  
9           board, certainly you have every right. But if it's  
10          about what your board ruled, I would come to us  
11          because it does get a little bit sticky with that  
12          provision.

13          CHAIRMAN TORRE: Okay. Thank you.

14          MS. RAMOS: Okay. Voting conflicts as related  
15          to financial interests. Quasi-judicial personnel  
16          may not participate in any action directly or  
17          indirectly affecting a business in which he or a  
18          member of his or her immediate family has a  
19          financial interest. Okay.

20          So essentially you can't vote on a matter  
21          where you have a financial interest or a family  
22          member does. This was one that people just know  
23          gut feeling you're not supposed to do that.

24          Miami-Dade has an actual provision called  
25          voting conflicts even though all of these address a

1 form of voting conflict. Board members may not  
2 vote on any matter if they will be directly  
3 affected by the action and if they have one of  
4 these enumerated relationships; officer, director,  
5 partner, of counsel, consultant, employee,  
6 fiduciary, beneficiary, stockholder, bondholder  
7 creditor or debtor. So if you would be directly  
8 affected and the person appearing before you has  
9 one of these relationships with you, you cannot  
10 vote. Okay. Now, that was all county code voting  
11 conflicts.

12 Now, there's a state law about voting  
13 conflicts, and the state law is similar, but a  
14 little bit different, and it says that no appointed  
15 public officer shall participate in any matter  
16 which would inure to the officer's special gain or  
17 loss, or which the officer knows should inure to  
18 their special gain or loss of any principal with  
19 whom he or she is retained or a relative or  
20 business associate without first disclosing the  
21 nature of his or her interest.

22 And they define special gain or loss as an  
23 economic benefit or harm that would inure to the  
24 benefit of themselves or their relative or their  
25 business associate. And they consider a number of

1 factors; the size of the class affected, the nature  
2 of the interest involved; the degree to which the  
3 interest of all members of the class are affected  
4 by the vote, and the degree to which the officer,  
5 relative, business associate or principal receives  
6 a greater benefit or harm than others.

7 The classic situation where this comes up is  
8 if you happen to own a home where -- and this would  
9 be for a legislative item. For quasi-judicial it's  
10 difficult to apply it. But if you own a home in an  
11 area where this legislative change, let's say,  
12 designated a whole neighborhood as historic and you  
13 happen to own a home in that area, the State's  
14 going to look at how big that class is. Is it one  
15 block? Then you might be uniquely affected. Is it  
16 80 blocks? Then you probably are not. Okay.

17 So that's when it says size of the class,  
18 nature of interest, those are the types of things  
19 it looks at. And it's not a black-and-white rule.  
20 It's just kind of a test that we apply to come to a  
21 conclusion.

22 So what happens if you have a voting conflict?  
23 Now, I will stop now to say you sit in two  
24 capacities. You sit in a legislative capacity and  
25 a quasi-judicial capacity. These rules apply to

1 both. But when you're sitting in a quasi-judicial  
2 capacity you have an extra added kind of little  
3 cricket on your shoulder that says, can I be fair?  
4 Even if you don't have one of these conflicts that  
5 are a legal conflict, when you sit as a judge,  
6 which is how you're sitting in a quasi-judicial  
7 proceeding, you have to yourself evaluate whether  
8 you are somehow biased toward this individual.

9 It could be because you had an ex parte  
10 communication, not purposely but the person  
11 approached you at a cocktail party that had nothing  
12 to do with anything, and you feel like you can't  
13 vote. You can, you just have to disclose it, but  
14 you might feel like you can't. A longstanding  
15 friendship, a number of different reasons that you  
16 feel may bury your political opponent, who knows,  
17 that you feel you can't be fair and impartial, then  
18 it's up to you to say, I can't be fair and  
19 impartial and to recuse. Okay. That's on  
20 quasi-judicial.

21 So if you have to recuse, whether because  
22 you're legally required to on a legislative item,  
23 whether you're legally required to on a  
24 quasi-judicial or because you feel you can't be  
25 fair and impartial, you have to follow three steps.

1           You have to announce the conflict in this room,  
2           then you have to leave the room and not participate  
3           in the discussions, and then you have to file a  
4           disclosure form essentially stating what your  
5           conflict is. Okay. And you have a number of days  
6           to do that.

7                     This is technically not required for  
8           quasi-judicial recusals. Okay. But it is what is  
9           recommended as a best practice.

10                    I'll briefly touch on Jennings, which  
11           basically says what I have just said, that when you  
12           sit in a quasi-judicial capacity you sit in the  
13           shoes of a judge, and that ex parte communications  
14           are not allowed in order to protect fundamental due  
15           process. Okay.

16                    You don't want to have -- if you can think  
17           about, you know, a judge, if you had a case before  
18           a judge and the other party got to talk to the  
19           judge and you didn't know what they said or have an  
20           ability to rebut it, you would feel that your due  
21           process rights were violated. This is exactly the  
22           same.

23                    And because of that under -- if this went to  
24           court, right, it would be presumed prejudicial.  
25           And the way that you get -- overcome that

1           presumption of prejudice is by disclosing the  
2           communication on the record, so that it's part of  
3           the record. And it has to be done before action is  
4           taken. Okay. And if the communication's in  
5           writing, that's fine, you can just make the piece  
6           of paper part of the record. Okay.

7           And, lastly, appearance of impropriety. As we  
8           all know, perception is often reality. So it's  
9           extremely important for you not only to avoid legal  
10          conflicts, but also to avoid appearances. And this  
11          goes to kind of that quasi-judicial path. So if  
12          you feel that a relationship with someone might be  
13          called -- might call your vote into question, keep  
14          that in mind. You're better off recusing. Okay.

15          Again, if you feel that the relationship may  
16          cause a conflict or you feel uncomfortable, please  
17          come to our office. We're always available. We  
18          appreciate a couple days notice if possible, but if  
19          it has to be right before the meeting or if it has  
20          to be right at the meeting, I've made the call,  
21          that's fine too. Okay.

22                    Any questions?

23                    All right. I will see most of you next  
24                    Friday, I hope.

25                    CHAIRMAN TORRE: Thank you very much.



1 MS. RAMOS: You're welcome.

2 CHAIRMAN TORRE: All right. So we're going to  
3 go to the historical significance determination of  
4 5732 Le Jeune Road, legally described as Lot 16 in  
5 the south 1/2 of Lot 15, Block 117, Coral Gables  
6 Riviera Section 10, according to the Plat thereof,  
7 as recorded in Plat Book 31 at Page 1 of the Public  
8 Records of Miami-Dade County.

9 MS. SPAIN: So, as you know, in 2003 the city  
10 commission passed an ordinance that requires the  
11 historic preservation officer's signature on every  
12 demolition permit. And so what we did was we have  
13 a process where you can apply for historic  
14 significance determination prior to obtaining that  
15 demolition permit.

16 And typically those were done  
17 administratively. They come into our office. We  
18 pull all the research on them. We make a  
19 determination, issue a letter, and either it's  
20 scheduled for designation and we do a designation  
21 report within a certain number of days, I think  
22 it's 60 days, or we allow it to be demolished but  
23 rarely.

24 But in this case, we're just not sure. We  
25 don't know whether it fits any of the criteria.

1           And so it's before you to have a discussion to see  
2           what you think. And Elizabeth is going to go over  
3           the slides that we have. This is all we knew about  
4           the property.

5                    And just I want to preface this, I went  
6           through the criteria myself, and if it's going to  
7           fit any criteria I believe it would be  
8           architectural significance. So as you're looking  
9           at it, think about that.

10                   There are four subcategories in architectural  
11           significance. I'm going to go over them. Contains  
12           an element of design detail, materials or  
13           craftsmanship of outstanding quality, which  
14           represent a significant innovation or adaptation to  
15           the South Florida environment. I do not believe it  
16           fits that criteria.

17                    Is an outstanding work of a prominent designer  
18           or builder. I do not think it fits that criteria  
19           either.

20                    So that leaves two, and that is portrays the  
21           environment in an era of history characterized by  
22           one or more distinctive architectural styles, or  
23           embodies those distinguishing characteristics of an  
24           architectural style or period or method of  
25           construction.

1           And so as Elizabeth goes through the slides,  
2           and also we have the owners here, and they need to  
3           correct me if I'm wrong, they purchased this house  
4           recently with the intent of demolishing it and  
5           building their dream house. So that's the  
6           circumstance.

7           MS. GUIN: All right. We just have a few  
8           slides to sort of give you a taste of what's there.

9           So the property is located at the corner of  
10          Le Jeune and Marmore. It's here. And here's a  
11          1940s photo of the house. The house was built in  
12          January 1939. The original permits, I believe you  
13          have a copy of those in your packet. The architect  
14          was Apuzzo and Tschumy. And then Tschumy again did  
15          the garage edition and enclosed the carport in '46.

16          The style that this would fit under is the  
17          minimal traditional style, which was a popular  
18          house style which appeared throughout the country  
19          during the Depression era, and this was a  
20          nationwide style. The architectural journals and  
21          magazines highly promoted this as the style of the  
22          time.

23          The style is simple, but was a subtle response  
24          to the economic hardships of the Depression and  
25          also the ornate styles of the '20s, so it was sort

1 of a backlash style that we see that happened in  
2 the '30s. In Coral Gables the many traditional  
3 houses often reflect the Spanish influences with  
4 barrel tile roofs, which we see with this house.

5 Now, just to put this in a little bit of  
6 context before we, you know, really dig into the  
7 research, but we know that in general we don't have  
8 a lot of houses from this time period, from the  
9 late '30s in Coral Gables that are still standing.  
10 So it here gives you, you know, a little bit of a  
11 graph so you can see in 1939 we had just a little  
12 over 100 houses that were built, single-family  
13 homes built during that time.

14 So looking at the house, it is primarily  
15 intact. There's been very few changes. The  
16 shutters are missing, and then there's the wood  
17 lattice work that was on the screen porch area  
18 that's missing. Otherwise, on the external facade  
19 the house is very much intact. It's not had  
20 additions.

21 You can see the '46 garage, detached garage to  
22 the back, and then in the lower photo here, this  
23 was the original area of the carport which Tschumy  
24 enclosed, he was the original architect, when he  
25 built the garage. We don't know at this point

1           when -- that was a screen porch area, when that was  
2           enclosed and the lattice work removed.

3           So just some other pictures comparing it to  
4           the original permit drawings. You see the house,  
5           simple in nature, but remains intact and doesn't  
6           have adverse alterations.

7           What is present that was one of the defining  
8           features of the style -- you can't really see it in  
9           the photo, perhaps in the photos that are before  
10          you, but it has the scoring like brick lines  
11          framing the window. You can see in the '40s photo  
12          that that was originally painted a different color.  
13          Those are actually painted score lines. That is  
14          still there. It's all just painted white.

15          So, really, the question before you is if this  
16          a simple example of the minimal traditional style  
17          in Coral Gables.

18          MS. SPAIN: So I believe the owners are here  
19          and they would like to address the board. They  
20          also put before you a letter from Omar Moreno, he's  
21          the operation manager of R-O-C -- okay -- Roc  
22          Group, and also a letter from Flores Lopez  
23          Architecture, and I'm sure they'll want to -- from  
24          Ricardo Lopez. I'm sure they'll want to discuss  
25          that with you.

1 MS. GUIN: We just wanted to also let the  
2 board know that this is a style that we have  
3 designated before. We don't have very many of  
4 them, but it is a legitimate style that we  
5 recognize in Coral Gables.

6 MS. LUGO: Hello. Good afternoon. My name is  
7 Valeria Lugo and I'm the owner of this house along  
8 with my husband Ferdinando Voto.

9 So we purchased this house after looking for a  
10 house for a long time in Coral Gables, Coconut  
11 Grove. When we found this location it was perfect  
12 for me, my husband and my two little girls since  
13 they go to St. Hugh. It's our school and our  
14 church. It's very close to St. Hugh and as well as  
15 Merrie Christmas Park. It was a couple blocks  
16 away. We thought it was perfect for us.

17 But the house is a two-bedroom, one-bath, so  
18 we always knew that we had to either extend the  
19 house, make it bigger, or build new. We hired a  
20 realtor, which is also the listing agent, and she  
21 assured us that you can, you know, build new, a  
22 brand-new house or you can expand. I actually have  
23 a copy of the MLS listing here where it says, Coral  
24 Gables, it's perfect for remodeling, expansion or  
25 new construction. So that was always our intention

1 to either expand or build new. Like we bought this  
2 house, you know, based on what she told us, so we  
3 feel a little, you know, off guard right now.

4 But we did look at different options of  
5 expanding the house or building new, and after  
6 analyzing both options, meeting with our  
7 architects, doing many inspections, meeting with  
8 the builder, analyzing costs, we realized that  
9 expanding was not a feasible option because the  
10 house is in such bad shape -- and we have a  
11 report -- that it was going to cost us a lot more  
12 money to fix everything that the house has than to  
13 start from, you know, from fresh. So we decided to  
14 go through the process of demolition and that's why  
15 we're here today.

16 We have a letter as you -- I have more copies  
17 from Ricardo Lopez basically -- it's on the second  
18 page stating that the house does not justify a  
19 historic designation. Okay. We also have a letter  
20 from our builder stating the challenges that the  
21 house has, which like I mentioned, the house there  
22 were -- the owners were from Virginia and they  
23 never came. They used it as a vacation house and  
24 they really didn't put a lot of money into any  
25 improvement or fix any of the problems with the

1 house. So after all these years, you know, the  
2 house, it's not in good shape.

3 The house itself has not been registered  
4 historic as of today, and we did our due diligence  
5 before buying this house, and we went on the  
6 records and it's not registered as historic, so we  
7 were pretty confident that we weren't going to have  
8 an issue with this.

9 And like I said, the house is a two-bedroom  
10 one-bath and we're a growing family of four. I  
11 have two little girls, hoping to have more, so it  
12 just doesn't work for us right now.

13 That's pretty much all I have. I do have my  
14 developer, which he did an inspection of the house  
15 and he can talk and, like I said, I have the letter  
16 from Ricardo Lopez, and I have, if you guys want to  
17 pass out, the MLS printout. I highlighted where it  
18 says, you know, it's perfect for remodeling,  
19 expansion or new construction.

20 That's it. I mean, it's just me and my  
21 husband and my girls. We want to live in Coral  
22 Gables. We want to, you know, raise our children  
23 there close to our school and our church, and you  
24 know, have them enjoy, you know, everything that  
25 Coral Gables has to offer.



1           And, you know, we're not developers. I'm not  
2           here to build and make a profit or flip houses.  
3           I'm here to stay for the long run and I hope you  
4           understand my needs. Thank you.

5           CHAIRMAN TORRE: Thank you very much.

6           Anybody else? Anybody else for this item?

7           Thank you.

8           MR. MORENO: My name is Omar Moreno. I'm the  
9           operating manager for Roc Build. I'm also the  
10          licensed architect for the project.

11          We did a quick inspection of the property. We  
12          went through the property to see its condition for  
13          us to consider building on top of it. And the  
14          porch addition is in -- it's in bad shape. And it  
15          seems like if there's going to be a lot of work to  
16          do to the house just to get it to a point where we  
17          could then consider expanding, and its location on  
18          the site, is a little difficult to figure how to  
19          make this sort of expand without touching the  
20          existing house.

21          So by moving -- by making the house larger so  
22          it can fit their family needs, we will have to  
23          significantly somehow violate the house in just  
24          getting it ready to be able to build on. So that's  
25          what we found with it.

1           It was -- it has been altered a bit inside,  
2           but it's not in very good shape. The mold and  
3           mildew is also a concern that we have and we don't  
4           know the extent. It seems like it would be  
5           probably more than just simply cleaning and moving  
6           on.

7           So those are some of the things that we were  
8           worried about and that's what showed up in the  
9           letter, and that's why I just wanted to stand up  
10          and give you a quick brief of what we saw and why  
11          we wrote the letter that we did.

12          CHAIRMAN TORRE: Thank you very much.

13          MR. MORENO: Thank you.

14          MR. BARRETO: Good afternoon. How are you?

15          Roberto Barreto. I'm his business partner.  
16          Just to point out a couple things that I noticed in  
17          the earlier presentation. The house has been  
18          altered. They had an open carport before and  
19          that's where the enclosure happened, which is the  
20          one that's actually falling apart and caving down.

21          One of the points that Omar made was the way  
22          the house was designed in the lot is also somewhat  
23          difficult. One of the things that we wanted to  
24          bring to the property was actually enjoying the  
25          large beautiful tree that it has. In the pictures

1           that they showed before, it did have -- that tree  
2           wasn't there before. Now one of the main features  
3           of the lot is one of the things we take into  
4           consideration when designing something is enjoying  
5           the landscape and enjoying the actual tree that it  
6           has. The way the location of the house is, it  
7           basically turns its back on the tree.

8                     One of the difficult things in the design is  
9           in the expansion we would have to take up most of  
10          the lot, which is something that is unfortunate.  
11          Just something to think about when talking about  
12          expansion. And that's it. Thanks.

13                    CHAIRMAN TORRE: Thanks. Anybody else?

14                    MS. SPAIN: Okay. So just as a reminder, what  
15          you need to focus on is the criteria. The city  
16          attorney's office has been very consistent that the  
17          condition of the home is something that we would  
18          look at after the designation if you think this is  
19          significant, and then they would need to apply for  
20          a certificate of appropriateness for demolition.  
21          So that should not enter into your determination on  
22          whether or not this is worthy of designation.

23                    And you're not going to designate it now even  
24          if you think it is. You would direct us to prepare  
25          a designation report and come back to this board.

1           So your options are to say, you know, lovely home,  
2           not significant enough to save, or, yes, it is  
3           historically significant and directing us to  
4           prepare a designation and come back to you. And  
5           even at that time, you could say thank you for the  
6           designation report, we still don't think it's  
7           significant. So those are your options.

8           MR. RODRIGUEZ: Could you read back to us the  
9           two elements that --

10          MS. SPAIN: This is just me.

11          Wait.

12          So I actually carry around the significance,  
13          the criteria on my phone, which is just wrong.

14          So the two that I believe that may qualify for  
15          if it's going to qualify for anything is portrays  
16          the environment in an era of history characterized  
17          by one or more distinctive architectural styles, or  
18          embodies those distinguishing characteristics of an  
19          architectural style or period or method of  
20          construction. I really think you're down to those  
21          two because it doesn't qualify for historical and  
22          cultural significance or aesthetic significance and  
23          it's not an outstanding work of a prominent  
24          designer.

25          MR. RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

1 MS. SPAIN: You're welcome.

2 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Thank you.

3 Close the public hearing.

4 Hold that thought because I want to go through  
5 a discussion that's a little different before we  
6 deliberate on the actual house, and it's about the  
7 way the function of arriving at the letter is  
8 working. We've talked about this before, and it  
9 just came to my mind when I saw your letter to the  
10 board of architects which led me to understand that  
11 your drawing's already done and then that's when  
12 you're going to get this response whether the house  
13 is significant or not.

14 MS. SPAIN: Well, typically, typically the  
15 real estate agents in Coral Gables know that --

16 CHAIRMAN TORRE: That's where I want to go  
17 back, to that point. But there's a tripping  
18 hazard --

19 MS. SPAIN: They're selling a home and they  
20 say we want to demolish it, they will say call  
21 Dona.

22 CHAIRMAN TORRE: There's a tripping hazard  
23 that I find is still there, and that tripping  
24 hazard is that some realtors are a little zealous  
25 and they kind of skew the words sometimes and it

1 gets a little tricky. And it's -- you know, I know  
2 better. When you're buying a house you should  
3 really, really do your homework, and I think maybe  
4 you did do your homework, but that's beside the  
5 point.

6 So my question is, and maybe for legal, for  
7 Miriam, is beyond the fact that we're trying to  
8 educate realtors that this could be a problem when  
9 you go to the board of architects. You spent all  
10 this time and you bought the house and now all of  
11 sudden, boom, here comes this meeting that you're  
12 having to go to.

13 Can we have a recorded document that -- and  
14 I'm thinking through this as I speak -- when you do  
15 a lien search, Miriam, is there a way to have it be  
16 known that Coral Gables has this particular  
17 ordinance that your house may be deemed to be  
18 historic at a future date and you should be aware  
19 of this notice?

20 MS. SPAIN: We would need to do that on every  
21 property in Coral Gables --

22 CHAIRMAN TORRE: But if you're buying a  
23 property --

24 MS. SPAIN: Is that what you're saying? I'm  
25 just asking.

1           CHAIRMAN TORRE: I don't know. Can it be a  
2 blanket recorded lien search item that you  
3 basically are getting it, because unless you're  
4 paying attention, nobody's going to ask for it.

5           MS. RAMOS: If they come here we can certainly  
6 administratively put something in that would be  
7 with every single lien search that just puts them  
8 on notice that because the house is in Coral Gables  
9 it could be historic.

10           If they do a county lien search, I don't think  
11 that they would allow us to put anything in there.

12           CHAIRMAN TORRE: There's no -- I mean, I'm  
13 just thinking through this. Is there any way to  
14 disclose more broadly to the person buying in Coral  
15 Gables this ordinance applies and may be coming  
16 back to you, you need to be aware? Is there any  
17 more of -- and, again, I'm trying to be helpful  
18 to --

19           MS. SPAIN: No. No. I --

20           CHAIRMAN TORRE: Is there any other way to get  
21 the public to be more aware that this is an issue?  
22 Again, some people will know better. Some people  
23 will never be aware.

24           MS. RAMOS: I think we can work together to  
25 find something that at least gets inserted. It

1           won't be in only the properties that might be.  
2           It's going to have to be a blanket statement. But  
3           at least it turns on a light bulb.

4           CHAIRMAN TORRE: I'm just thinking through  
5           this, and again, I've come across this many times.  
6           We've come across it. But these folks, you know,  
7           again, this is in the board of architects already,  
8           so if this falters --

9           MS. SPAIN: No. This has not been to the  
10          board of architects.

11          CHAIRMAN TORRE: It's not?

12          MS. SPAIN: No.

13          CHAIRMAN TORRE: Okay.

14          MS. SPAIN: If it's a new residence and --  
15          (MULTIPLE SPEAKERS SPEAKING AT ONE TIME.)

16          CHAIRMAN TORRE: -- it says here, on behalf of  
17          our clients we're submitting an application to the  
18          board of architects.

19          MS. SPAIN: Well, I can tell you that if  
20          everything's working the way it should, if they go  
21          to the board of architects counter for a new  
22          residence, unless they have a letter from me  
23          stating that it's not historic --

24          CHAIRMAN TORRE: But the --

25          (MULTIPLE SPEAKERS SPEAKING AT ONE TIME.)



1           CHAIRMAN TORRE:  -- Because it just happened  
2           to me this week.  My plans are done and then the  
3           architect said you need to submit and get the  
4           application; by the way, you need a letter.  Oh,  
5           yeah, I remember.

6           MS. SPAIN:  That happened to you?

7           CHAIRMAN TORRE:  Yes.  Now, we had done a  
8           letter before so it's not -- the letter had  
9           expired, we need to get a new letter from you, but  
10          that's another point.

11          MS. SPAIN:  Well, we do have on the website in  
12          big letters if they try to search to see whether  
13          it's on the -- already designated, we have in big  
14          letters, you know, even if your property is not  
15          designated it cannot be --

16          CHAIRMAN TORRE:  I hear what --

17          (MULTIPLE SPEAKERS SPEAKING AT ONE TIME.)

18          MS. SPAIN:  I feel horrible.

19          CHAIRMAN TORRE:  That's an issue, and I know  
20          some people are a little zealous, the realtors, and  
21          they, you know, sometimes are a little bit vague  
22          and sometimes they don't even say anything.

23          So I'm just trying to be protective of the  
24          people because I see this happen quite a bit.

25          MS. SPAIN:  And I will tell you that we are

1 very helpful to people. If a realtor calls me on a  
2 Saturday, I'll go out to the property with  
3 prospective buyers. I mean, we're really hands on  
4 when it comes to this because it's very difficult.  
5 You know, it's the most difficult thing that this  
6 department does is do those significance  
7 determinations. And for the most part, we allow  
8 things to be demolished because the realtors know  
9 that they're not going to show them something  
10 unless it has a letter so...

11 MR. FULLERTON: Can't you make a blanket  
12 statement that anything over 50 years of age  
13 automatically will go to you?

14 MS. SPAIN: The blanket statement is anything.

15 MR. FULLERTON: Everything.

16 MS. SPAIN: Even if it's less than 50 years of  
17 age we blocked demolition and designate them as  
18 historic. A case in point is Two Casuarina  
19 Concourse designed by Alfred Browning Parker.

20 CHAIRMAN TORRE: All right. So, I mean,  
21 that -- I know it comes and I try to help and I  
22 don't know what else we can do. To say if we can  
23 legally do something to advise people even more,  
24 that's great.

25 MS. RAMOS: We'll work on it.

1 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Thank you.

2 MS. SPAIN: So now back to this dilemma.

3 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Back to the deliberation.

4 MR. SILVA: Before I start, Dona, I mean, if  
5 this was black and white I don't think you would  
6 have brought it here, right?

7 MS. SPAIN: Exactly.

8 MR. SILVA: If it's clear you would have said  
9 no or yes one way or the other. So I think there  
10 is discussion to be had one way or the other.

11 I have a technical question. I know the  
12 carport was enclosed, but I don't see looking  
13 through the permit record, was that done by  
14 Tschumy? I see the garage addition, but --

15 MS. SPAIN: I don't know that we know that.

16 MS. GUIN: It doesn't show up on the permit.  
17 We are sort of making that assumption because the  
18 '40s photo, it's already done, and we know that the  
19 garage addition happened right before that photo.  
20 So when we dig a little more we may find, but we're  
21 thinking it was done at the same time. But it  
22 definitely was done before the late '40s.

23 MR. SILVA: Thank you.

24 CHAIRMAN TORRE: More discussion?

25 MR. FULLERTON: So the question for us right

1 now is either we want you to go through the process  
2 of doing a report or not?

3 MS. SPAIN: Or you allow it to be demolished.

4 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Does it need further  
5 information for you to make a determination.

6 MS. SPAIN: And, honestly, since I believe it  
7 will only fit the architectural significance, I  
8 really don't think it's necessary to do a  
9 designation report, going through that, unless you  
10 want us to and then we're happy to do the research.  
11 But, you know.

12 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Mr. Chairman, do you want  
13 comments?

14 CHAIRMAN TORRE: I'm letting you guys speak on  
15 this one.

16 MS. SPAIN: It's not easy for a historic  
17 preservation --

18 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Do you want comments or not?

19 CHAIRMAN TORRE: No. No. I'm asking for you  
20 guys to make comments. Yeah, I'm not --

21 MS. SPAIN: Go ahead.

22 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Well, just speaking from what  
23 I've seen in the record, it would be very difficult  
24 for me to justify placing this house in any one of  
25 these two categories, and if there's no sense -- if

1           that's the case, there's no sense sending you off  
2           to do work and let them waste another 60 days  
3           before they can start the demolition.

4           MS. SPAIN: Right.

5           MR. SILVA: I agree with that.

6           MR. EHRENHAFT: I agree too. I drove by the  
7           house and looked at it and it's a very simple  
8           house. I can see that if a lot of money was put  
9           into it and somebody wanted to fully restore it,  
10          I'm still not convinced that it's a superb example  
11          of that architecture. It has some details that are  
12          interesting.

13          I mean, there's a very lovely -- on the  
14          garage --

15          MS. SPAIN: Yes, that --

16          MR. EHRENHAFT: -- there's, you know --

17          (MULTIPLE SPEAKERS SPEAKING AT ONE TIME.)

18          MR. EHRENHAFT: -- on the side of the  
19          concrete, and you know -- and I noted, you know,  
20          the brick like details on the sides of the windows.  
21          But the rest of the entirety of the house is very  
22          simple.

23          MS. SPAIN: Right.

24          MR. EHRENHAFT: And in and of itself, I don't  
25          think that it's remarkable.

1 MS. SPAIN: I would agree with you.

2 MR. EHRENHAFT: I don't know whether it's  
3 appropriate to the conversations, but if the  
4 decision were made to allow it to be demolished,  
5 could it be appropriate to urge that architectural  
6 materials that are onsite that could be removed  
7 could be somehow recycled --

8 MS. SPAIN: We've never done that before.

9 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- or is that totally  
10 inappropriate to the discussion? I don't know.

11 MS. THOMSON: I don't know if that's worth it.

12 MR. EHRENHAFT: I don't know.

13 MS. THOMSON: I have a question going back to  
14 the realtor.

15 MS. SPAIN: Yes.

16 MS. THOMSON: Okay. Because you say this  
17 happens in Coral Gables. How can a realtor  
18 advertise to these people and tell them that they  
19 can demolish the house when they don't know?

20 MS. SPAIN: I don't know the answer to that  
21 question.

22 MS. THOMSON: Is there any accountability for  
23 the realtor? I think that's wrong.

24 MS. SPAIN: Oh, agree with you. I believe  
25 it's wrong. Every year I go to the realtors

1 conference and talk to them about it. I've given  
2 talks in individual real estate offices. If we  
3 know that something's being advertised as build  
4 your dream home and we haven't done the significant  
5 determination, we call the realtor and tell them  
6 this is what you need to do.

7 But I agree with you that it's not proper to  
8 have it like this. I'm not sure what we can do  
9 about it.

10 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Well, they can certainly bring  
11 an action before the board, board of realtors, not  
12 here.

13 MS. SPAIN: Right. Right. I understand.

14 MR. SILVA: To me speaking to the  
15 architectural merits of the building, when we've  
16 looked at buildings of this time period in the  
17 past, we've really looked closely at the detailing  
18 and what remains. It really has to be a pristine  
19 example, and to me that enclosure of the carport  
20 took away a lot of the kind of the playful massing  
21 that it had before, and it lost a lot of the  
22 detailing in terms of the railings and the columns.  
23 So I think it's altered enough, even though it's a  
24 simple alteration, that it does kind of begin to  
25 degrade the specialness of the house.

1 MS. SPAIN: That was my concern, but that's  
2 why it's before you because I couldn't figure it  
3 out. I couldn't decide, so...

4 MS. THOMSON: Well, it kind of looks like a  
5 house that's built anywhere, anywhere USA. I don't  
6 think it's significant --

7 MS. SPAIN: Well, then you need to make a  
8 motion.

9 MS. THOMSON: -- to Coral Gables.

10 CHAIRMAN TORRE: I'm waiting.

11 Anybody else? We're good? Jan?

12 MS. THOMSON: I can't make motions.

13 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Why not?

14 MS. THOMSON: I can't make them.

15 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Bruce?

16 MS. THOMSON: How about I move to approve,  
17 right, I move to approve that we accept the request  
18 of the owner to be able to demolish the house; is  
19 that the motion?

20 MR. FULLERTON: Or do what they would like to  
21 do to the house.

22 MS. THOMSON: Do what they would like to do to  
23 the house.

24 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Which in turn is saying you  
25 don't deem the house significant enough to --



1 MS. THOMSON: Did I say -- I don't know if I'm  
2 saying it right.

3 MS. SPAIN: I think that's fine. I'll issue a  
4 letter based on that saying that it's not  
5 historically significant and that it would not have  
6 to go to this board and allow it to be demolished.

7 MS. RAMOS: For the record, the motion would  
8 be a motion to not deem the home historically  
9 significant.

10 MS. THOMSON: Right. I move that -- to move  
11 that the home is not historically significant.

12 MS. SPAIN: Perfect.

13 CHAIRMAN TORRE: That will fly.

14 MS. THOMSON: I've never done that before.

15 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Good for you.

16 Is there a second?

17 MR. SILVA: I'll second.

18 CHAIRMAN TORRE: We have a second from  
19 Mr. Silva. Any more discussion on this? All  
20 right. Roll call, please.

21 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Fullerton?

22 MR. FULLERTON: Yes.

23 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Silva?

24 MR. SILVA: Yes.

25 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Ehrenhaft?

1 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.

2 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Menendez?

3 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.

4 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Rodriguez?

5 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

6 MS. DIAZ: Ms. Thomson?

7 MS. THOMSON: Yes.

8 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Torre?

9 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Yes.

10 Thank you.

11 All right. The next item is a local historic  
12 designation, and this is the case file LHD-2017-012  
13 and this is consideration of the amendment to the  
14 local historic designation report of the property  
15 at 2506 Ponce de Leon Boulevard. This is H. George  
16 Fink's office and studio, a local historic  
17 landmark, legally described as Lots 20 and 23,  
18 Block 7, Coral Gables Crafts Section, according to  
19 the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 10, at  
20 Page 40 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County.

21 This is an amendment by staff to expand the  
22 local historic designation of 2506 Ponce de Leon  
23 Boulevard, the George Fink office studios to  
24 include interior architectural features of the  
25 structure.

1 MS. GUIN: So since most of you were at the  
2 workshop last weekend you know the location of the  
3 building on Le Jeune.

4 The building was built in 1925 by H. George  
5 Fink as his office and studio. It was designated  
6 in 1984. It was designated under several criteria,  
7 both aesthetic, architectural in its siting. In  
8 particular of note, though, was the designation of  
9 the its contribution to the Mediterranean Revival  
10 Style in Coral Gables.

11 In 1924 Fink traveled to Europe to study  
12 Mediterranean architecture, and upon his return he  
13 designed this building as his office and studio to  
14 showcase his interpretation of what became known as  
15 the Mediterranean Revival style.

16 A 1926 article held the building as, it is now  
17 and destined to be one of the great showcases of  
18 Coral Gables. Blended in this building are  
19 Moorish, Gothic, Italian and the original thought  
20 of Mr. Fink with the most amazing harmony of color.

21 So also within the Coral Gables zoning code we  
22 had the ability to also designate interiors if  
23 they're public spaces. So that's the amendment  
24 that we're bringing forward to you now.

25 So in accordance with Article 3,

1 Section 3-110(b), the optional designation of  
2 interiors, says normally interior spaces shall not  
3 be subject to regulation under this section, this  
4 section meaning historic designation landmark.  
5 However, in cases of existing structures having  
6 exceptional architectural, artistic or historical  
7 or interior spaces which are customarily open to  
8 the public may be specifically designated. The  
9 designation report shall describe precisely these  
10 features subject to review and shall set forth  
11 standards and guidelines for such regulations.

12 So as staff, we've determined that the  
13 interior spaces of this building are significant  
14 and meet the above criteria.

15 This is from the original permit from Fink,  
16 which you have in the back of your packet in 1925.  
17 You can see the original footprint of the building  
18 was a slightly skewed T-structure.

19 One of the things that I want to point out  
20 here is the flow of the building. Right now  
21 normally you enter through the doorway here, as  
22 most of you did last week for the workshop. That  
23 was not an original doorway. That was a window.  
24 How they entered the building was actually through  
25 the patio space into -- the pointer's not working

1 here.

2 MS. SPAIN: They changed the screen.

3 MS. GUIN: Yeah.

4 MS. SPAIN: So it doesn't work.

5 MS. GUIN: Okay. Well, into the reception  
6 area through the secretary space, and then into the  
7 large private workshop where we had the workshop  
8 last week. And then to the back of the building  
9 was a large drafting room.

10 This is a HABS drawing that was done by the  
11 University of Miami this past year. They did the  
12 Level 1 Historic American Building Survey  
13 documentation of the building. In your packet I've  
14 included several of the drawings sort of to  
15 highlight and further detail some of the features.

16 You can get a sense here from this drawing,  
17 the colored areas were our additions. So  
18 originally they were garden spaces.

19 You can get a sense of the drafting room is  
20 broken up with those front spaces. That house, the  
21 reception, secretary and his office space, have  
22 remained primarily intact.

23 We have a few interior photos of the studio.  
24 Our best photos actually come from this 1926 Miami  
25 Daily News newspaper article where you can see a

1 picture looking into the office space, and since  
2 you all were there last week, you know that that  
3 space has remained primarily almost wholly intact.

4 And then looking from the other angle.

5 So some of the highlights of the architecture  
6 features of the interior include the painted  
7 ceilings that we see in many of the spaces. This  
8 is from the front office building where he used  
9 some pretty brilliant colors and with these  
10 brackets of these grimacing feature -- creatures  
11 holding up all the wooden beams.

12 This is the ceiling from the reception space.  
13 This would have been what you encountered as you  
14 first entered the building. One of the things that  
15 has been called out repeatedly in some of the  
16 newspaper articles of the time when it was opened  
17 talks about the amazing colors that were used in  
18 the building. And we still see some really decent  
19 remnants of those.

20 The interior coloring is blended in several  
21 hues. Each room is entirely different, but  
22 similarly impossible blending, the green with the  
23 red and orange with the purple, a brown with the  
24 vermillion. But the same ensemble is one of the  
25 colorful, pleasing and quiet harmony.

1           And you can see that here, the sort of  
2           brighter blue ones are actually infields, but what  
3           you see mostly up there on the screen belongs to  
4           his original color pallet in that room.

5           And then we have quite a number of the spaces  
6           where we have these painted beams still there. In  
7           the drafting room space, which has been divided up  
8           into offices, that has a drop ceiling, and we  
9           haven't been able to investigate that, so there's  
10          possible that that space still -- that those beams  
11          still exist or remnants of them or something.

12          One sort of neat feature we discovered as we  
13          were going through, this is in the ceiling and  
14          you're going up the second story, it's that first  
15          beam at the top of the stairs. You can see it has  
16          a C, G and a P inscribed in the beam. We're  
17          assuming that CG is for Coral Gables. We don't  
18          know what the P is. But if anybody knows what this  
19          stands for, we would love to know. There's not  
20          lots of nice little stories we're finding in the  
21          studio.

22          So throughout the spaces we have this use of  
23          tile and very colorful tile in some places on the  
24          floors and in the staircase.

25          In the studio, the secretary space and the

1 reception, we still have excellent -- this basket  
2 weave tile with these small colorful insets which  
3 Kara Matthews, who's an architectural historian at  
4 the University of Miami, when she first entered she  
5 immediately started identifying what some of these  
6 tiles, that they actually are crests, the crests of  
7 the various Spanish kingdoms. And so she was real  
8 excited and said that almost -- most of what's on  
9 there, that's where they're coming from.

10 We also see the beautiful tile work on the  
11 turned staircase, which the newspaper article in  
12 '26 called "faithful copy of the stairway of El  
13 Greco at Toledo."

14 And here has the stairs up to the second  
15 floor, and each riser very colorful and very  
16 different. The HABS team documented each of those  
17 risers in great detail.

18 And another sort of interesting piece to the  
19 story, the top riser of the stair has this Arabic  
20 motto from the Nsarid Rulers who built the Alhambra  
21 that says "There's no victory except for God," and  
22 you see this inscription several places as you walk  
23 around the Alhambra.

24 What's interesting, though, if you look you'll  
25 see that as it appears at Alhambra and how it



1 appears on the top riser, it's flipped. So  
2 something happened there. We don't know, but it's  
3 sort of interesting.

4 As you move up the steps there's this  
5 beautiful column ensemble that steps down giving  
6 light into the steps, and also they're very  
7 strategically placed. When you look through you  
8 can see different portions of that painted beam  
9 ceiling.

10 You have the large mantle, which this is quite  
11 oversized. I put the little inset photo in here so  
12 you can see just how tall and oversized that mantle  
13 is. I mean, it's above the door height there in  
14 the corner with some very nice detailing.

15 We have these Venetian columns with Encanthis  
16 leaves, and then these, again, grimacing creatures  
17 here holding up one portion of the mantle and then  
18 in another portion underneath the fireplace.

19 MS. THOMSON: That's creepy.

20 MS. GUIN: I know. It's really amazing when  
21 you start looking at the details that are here.  
22 But, you know, really nicely placed so that  
23 they're -- you sort of start to look for them.

24 Then there's this crest in the mantle, and  
25 we're not quite sure where that is from yet. It's

1 a phoenix, an eagle, a griffin, or what the story  
2 is at to why that was used very prominently in the  
3 mantle.

4 We have these Venetian style tracery windows  
5 with these very beautiful interior screens sort of  
6 giving privacy from the street on the bottom third  
7 of these windows. And here's the tracery which you  
8 see on the interior and the exterior.

9 Another feature that you find throughout the  
10 studio space are these different original doors,  
11 and most of them do not appear to be in their  
12 original locations, and I have to say, Kara and I  
13 had a really good time sort of hunting and looking  
14 at hinges and looking at the plans to figure out  
15 where some of these doors actually started.

16 This door is the door that you entered in  
17 right on that corner. That was originally a  
18 window, so obviously that's not the original  
19 location. The door, however, is inscribed as  
20 private, so you can read it up there.

21 So based on its size, we think that that was  
22 the door originally leading into Fink's studio. So  
23 you would have come through that reception space  
24 with that colorful ceiling and through the double  
25 arches, which were not enclosed at the time, and

1           then face this door, and you opened the door into  
2           this room.

3           There's another door which we sort of love.  
4           This is on the second floor. It's actually a  
5           closet door now, but it reads Spanish jail, and it  
6           is -- it does seem to be the door that led into the  
7           drafting room, sort of a -- you get a lot of sort  
8           of tongue in cheek we're finding the more we look  
9           in the studio.

10          This door, which currently is part of the  
11          infield in the arches, which we know is not its  
12          original location has the Spanish Galleon on it,  
13          and we think this was one of the exterior doors out  
14          into the garden in that veranda space.

15          So there's a number of doors. UM identified  
16          seven of them, I think, that they feel are original  
17          to the building, and they documented those as part  
18          of the HABS, and you see more pictures of those in  
19          designation report.

20          So and then the final sort of outstanding  
21          architectural feature that we wanted to point out  
22          for you today is the double arches that led from  
23          the secretary space into the reception which are  
24          now enclosed but are -- just have some really  
25          beautiful details.

1           This is, again, a photo that was included in  
2           that 1926 newspaper, so you can see that it was  
3           originally not enclosed as it is now.

4           So in conclusion, H. George Fink contributed  
5           heavily to the fabric of the city of Coral Gables,  
6           designing hundreds of buildings during his career  
7           in the city which spanned four decades.

8           In 1924 Fink traveled to Europe to study  
9           Mediterranean architecture. Upon his return he  
10          designed this building and his office and studio to  
11          showcase his interpretation of what became known as  
12          the Mediterranean Revival style.

13          In 1926 an article held the building as it is  
14          now and destined to be one of the great showpieces  
15          of Coral Gables.

16          And in 2016, in honor of the City of Coral  
17          Gables's 90th anniversary, the city purchased the  
18          building.

19          In 1984 the local historic landmark  
20          designation report states that the H. George Fink  
21          office and studio building is often referred to as  
22          the best example of Mediterranean Revival  
23          architecture in the city of Coral Gables.

24          Since the designation the building has  
25          retained a high degree of integrity and continues

1 to be proffered as a leading example of the style  
2 in the city zoning code. Both the exterior and  
3 interior of the H. George Fink office and studio  
4 remain key high notes of Mediterranean Revival  
5 architecture in the city.

6 Therefore, staff recommends to approve the  
7 amendment to the local historic designation of the  
8 property to include the interior architectural  
9 features and its spaces in the designation.

10 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Elizabeth, I have a question.

11 Did you guys discuss the issue of the  
12 additions and how that affects what you're doing  
13 today?

14 MS. SPAIN: Well, it was designated historic,  
15 I think, with those additions or at least it was  
16 allowed to have those additions.

17 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Those are designated --

18 MS. SPAIN: Those are designated just as part  
19 of the exterior of the building. We would  
20 certainly not be unhappy if someone wanted to take  
21 that down and -- the additions down and bring back  
22 the gardens, would be wonderful.

23 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Yes, but the finishes in  
24 those, especially the kitchen side, which is the  
25 left side, I guess the '77 addition, there's

1 nothing there except --

2 MS. SPAIN: No. I mean, we would not --

3 (MULTIPLE SPEAKERS SPEAKING AT ONE TIME.)

4 MS. SPAIN: It's really just those special  
5 features of the interiors that Elizabeth had talked  
6 to you about that we would want to designate.

7 MS. GUIN: We are asking the amendment to  
8 be --

9 CHAIRMAN TORRE: The entire building. I'm  
10 just wondering if you're restricting yourself to  
11 something you may not want to do that.

12 MS. SPAIN: But we would allow those to come  
13 down.

14 MS. GUIN: Yeah, outlined in report everything  
15 would just be handled --

16 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Would it be easier for us to  
17 deny the additions being designated on the inside  
18 to help any of that? I mean, if you keep adding  
19 designations, does it --

20 MS. SPAIN: No. But what we want to have  
21 happen is to have anything that goes on in the  
22 interiors come to this office. I mean, it's mainly  
23 just so that --

24 CHAIRMAN TORRE: So it's all looked at --

25 (MULTIPLE SPEAKERS SPEAKING AT ONE TIME.)

1 CHAIRMAN TORRE: -- your thought process.

2 That's why I asked.

3 MS. GUIN: Our other thought was if those  
4 additions were to come down, I mean, if we can --  
5 we still can sort of tell where those original  
6 openings are, so if those additions came down we  
7 might able to, you know --

8 MS. SPAIN: This is --

9 MS. GUIN: Or keep that in mind with whatever  
10 goes forward.

11 MS. SPAIN: And this is in anticipation of  
12 applying for it to be on the national registry,  
13 which we intend to do. And I also have to say  
14 every time we talk about those interiors, I need to  
15 thank the Dappy family, who owned this building for  
16 over 40 years and kept those interiors intact.

17 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Absolutely.

18 MS. SPAIN: Which is really amazing.

19 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Amazing.

20 MS. SPAIN: So...

21 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Yeah. Anybody in the  
22 audience like to speak toward this item or against  
23 this item?

24 Okay. Close the public hearing and sounds  
25 like an easy one to me.

1 MR. FULLERTON: Yeah, no-brainer.

2 MS. THOMSON: Yeah, it is.

3 CHAIRMAN TORRE: John?

4 MR. FULLERTON: I'll move staff  
5 recommendations to designate the interior features  
6 of this amazing house except the clock. I think we  
7 ought to exempt the clock from the designation --

8 MS. THOMSON: Why?

9 MR. FULLERTON: -- and remove it.

10 CHAIRMAN TORRE: It's not original.

11 MR. MENENDEZ: I second.

12 MS. THOMSON: It's so cool.

13 CHAIRMAN TORRE: We have a motion from

14 Mr. Fullerton and Mr. Menendez second it.

15 Any more discussion?

16 Go to roll call.

17 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Menendez?

18 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.

19 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Silva?

20 MR. SILVA: Yes.

21 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Ehrenhaft?

22 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.

23 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Rodriguez?

24 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

25 MS. DIAZ: Ms. Thomson?



1 MS. THOMSON: Yes.

2 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Fullerton?

3 MR. FULLERTON: Yes.

4 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Torre?

5 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Yes.

6 MS. GUIN: Thank you.

7 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Thank you. Thank you for  
8 brining this item, actually.

9 Last item today, this is for a special  
10 certificate of appropriateness, and this is case  
11 file COA (SP) 2017-019. This is an application for  
12 the issuance of a special certificate of  
13 appropriateness for the property at 1001 Hardee  
14 Road, a contributing resource within "The French  
15 City Village Historic District," and it's legally  
16 described at Lots 11, Block -- I'm sorry -- 11 and  
17 12 of Block 145, Coral Gables Riviera Section Part  
18 Nine as record in Plat 28, Page 29 of the public  
19 record of Miami-Dade County.

20 So this application request is on approval for  
21 the construction of an addition to the residence  
22 and also site work.

23 MS. KAUTZ: I was not here at the beginning of  
24 the meeting. I need to get sworn in.

25 MS. DIAZ: Please raise your right hand. Do

1           you swear to tell the whole truth and nothing but  
2           the truth?

3           MS. KAUTZ: I do.

4           MS. DIAZ: Thank you.

5           MS. KAUTZ: All right. This is a property, a  
6           contributing property in The French City Village.  
7           Location map, you can see it outlined on the  
8           screen. This is a 1940s photograph. It's the  
9           corner lot of Hardee and Cellini. It's -- French  
10          City Village obviously is one of 16 groups designed  
11          or planned by George Merrick. This was designed by  
12          Mott B. Schmidt. 22 residences make up the  
13          district, there are 16 contributing, and obviously  
14          this one is a contributing residence. It was  
15          designated in 2002 as a historic district.

16          The proposal requests approval of construction  
17          of a one-story addition to the residents. The  
18          addition consists of a new breakfast room in the  
19          location of an existing interior courtyard between  
20          the garage and the residence.

21          Interior renovations are also proposed for the  
22          residence. Site work includes the demolition of  
23          the existing driveway, walkway, patio and interior  
24          site walls, and installation of a new driveway, new  
25          interior site walls, new decks and a new swimming

1 pool.

2 No variances have been requested as part of  
3 this application. It was approved by the board of  
4 architects in June of this year. We as staff have  
5 no objection to the addition. It's not readily  
6 visible from any of the elevations from either  
7 Cellini or Hardee. The only item that will  
8 possibly be visual depending on what they choose is  
9 the skylight, the top finials of a skylight.

10 We have a few conditions of approval that are  
11 noted on the last page of your report that we'd  
12 like incorporated into the approval, please.

13 I'll turn it over to the applicant.

14 MR. IGLESIAS: Hi. My name is Tom Iglesias.  
15 I'm here representing the architectural firm, Cad  
16 Studio Architecture. As she stated, we are just  
17 proposing to put a breakfast addition in between  
18 the existing garage and existing house and its  
19 interior courtyard, not really visible from the  
20 street. We are going to maintain the  
21 characteristics of the house, obviously, and we're  
22 also wanting to add a pool, which technically would  
23 be in the front yard, but it's also consistent with  
24 some of the other houses on the same block.

25 That's basically it.

1           There's some slides here of the existing  
2 house, which you see on there on the screen.  
3 That's the existing courtyard now where we're  
4 proposing to put the addition.

5           There's a view there from the garage. A  
6 little further back there's an archway in front,  
7 which we will be maintaining the archway, which you  
8 can see there on the left-hand side, so technically  
9 the addition is behind that.

10           This would be the skylight that we're  
11 proposing to put on top of the breakfast room  
12 addition, was selected by the owner. It really  
13 won't be visible except from the Hardee side,  
14 possibly the two spires that you see there.

15           This is along -- this is the view from Hardee  
16 into the garage. The garage is going to remain as  
17 is and the existing garage doors will also be kept,  
18 which I believe is stated here in the conditions.

19           This is just an aerial map there. It's the  
20 corner lot, and that's the -- sort of a pool, the  
21 pool look we'll be going for there that you see in  
22 the left-hand slide.

23           And these are just the ideas that the owner  
24 had regarding replacing the driveway. The one on  
25 the right is the preference that she has.

1           And then this is sort of a conceptual view  
2           from above the interior walls, which we want to add  
3           to the driveway to disguise the pool equipment and  
4           the AC equipment, which would be on the yard side.

5           There's also the gateway there that would take  
6           you from the driveway to the yard area.

7           And that's just the pool deck material.

8           And that's it.

9           MS. MATOS-LACASA: Hi. My name is Mary  
10          Matos-Lacasa, and I own and my husband, Carlos  
11          Lacasa own this property.

12          I just wanted to say that we recognize how  
13          privileged we are to be the owners of this home  
14          right now, and our intent through what you've seen  
15          in the slides is essentially to preserve the  
16          original design intent of this historic home while  
17          bringing into it some of the amenities that we've  
18          grown accustomed to nowadays with a larger kitchen,  
19          an eat-in kitchen, a pool, and then certain  
20          elements like the gate that we showed on there  
21          is -- I believe that the home must have had a gate  
22          originally because most of the other -- all of the  
23          other homes actually do have a gate, and somewhere  
24          down the road I guess it was eliminated, so we want  
25          to add that again.

1           I don't know if you have any questions for me  
2           about our intent.

3           MR. EHRENHAFT: I have one question. The pool  
4           which you're proposing, which will be to the front  
5           of the house on the Hardee side, I understood from  
6           your written communications you're intending it to  
7           be a dipping pool, so are you suggesting it's not  
8           going to be full depth swimming pool?

9           MS. MATOS-LACASA: Correct. Correct.

10          MR. EHRENHAFT: So it will almost be like a  
11          formal garden reflecting pool, but deep enough to  
12          refresh yourself in?

13          MS. MATOS-LACASA: Exactly. Maybe two feet  
14          deep or so so that you can kind of sit in it and  
15          just cool off.

16          MR. MENENDEZ: We don't have to deal with the  
17          pool, do we?

18          MS. KAUTZ: No.

19          MR. MENENDEZ: Okay.

20          MS. KAUTZ: I mean, it's a design feature that  
21          they're including, but it's, you know...

22          MR. MENENDEZ: I think it's a pretty elegant,  
23          you know, solution. I like it a lot, to tell you  
24          the truth. I like the way that you've treated  
25          everything.

1           MR. SILVA: Yeah, I agree. The only comment  
2           that I would like to add is the way that the  
3           skylight is drawn now I think is very handsome,  
4           very in proportion with the design of the house,  
5           but it is a delegated design in terms of approval,  
6           right? We have -- you're going to be submitting  
7           shop drawings and structural calcs and all that for  
8           submittal.

9           I would like to add to the conditions that  
10          staff review the shop drawings for the skylight as  
11          well if that's possible, because I think that  
12          there's a lot of variation that could happen  
13          between -- this is great, and I think we'd like to  
14          keep this as or as close as possible to this.

15          MS. KAUTZ: We typically do review shop  
16          drawings for windows, doors, railings, things like  
17          that, they get sent to us, but I'll make sure.

18          CHAIRMAN TORRE: That's what happens when you  
19          put something so perfect. You got to stick to it.

20          MS. MATOS-LACASA: Pardon?

21          CHAIRMAN TORRE: When you put something so  
22          perfect you have to stick to it.

23          MS. MATOS-LACASA: Thank you.

24          CHAIRMAN TORRE: Nothing more to add? Anybody  
25          else? Anybody wants to speak for --

1 MS. SPAIN: I think it will be stunning. I'm  
2 really happy with this design.

3 CHAIRMAN TORRE: You brought us good stuff  
4 today.

5 MS. SPAIN: We did.

6 CHAIRMAN TORRE: You did.

7 MR. MENENDEZ: I move to approve.

8 MR. FULLERTON: Second.

9 MS. KAUTZ: With conditions including  
10 allowances?

11 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.

12 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Repeat the condition, would  
13 you.

14 MR. MENENDEZ: Alex can repeat his conditions.

15 MR. SILVA: Staff conditions, plus that staff  
16 also review the shop drawings for the skylight, a  
17 friendly amendment to your motion.

18 CHAIRMAN TORRE: So repeat the motion, would  
19 you.

20 MR. MENENDEZ: I approve with the addition by  
21 Alex, Mr. Silva, of staff reviewing the shop  
22 drawings.

23 CHAIRMAN TORRE: And staff recommendations.

24 MR. MENENDEZ: And staff recommendations.

25 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Thank you. Is there a



1 second? There was a second.

2 MR. EHRENHAFT: Second.

3 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Mr. Ehrenhaft.

4 MR. MENENDEZ: Before you changed everything  
5 there was, yes. We have a motion. We have a  
6 second. Any more discussion?

7 MS. KAUTZ: Wait. Who seconded it, John or  
8 Alex?

9 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Mr. Ehrenhaft.  
10 Jessie, we're all set.

11 MS. KAUTZ: Oh, neither. Okay.

12 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Silva?

13 MR. SILVA: Yes.

14 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Ehrenhaft?

15 MR. EHRENHAFT: Yes.

16 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Rodriguez?

17 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

18 MS. DIAZ: Ms. Thomson?

19 MS. THOMSON: Yes.

20 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Fullerton?

21 MR. FULLERTON: Yes.

22 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Menendez?

23 MR. MENENDEZ: Yes.

24 MS. DIAZ: Mr. Torre?

25 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Yes.

1 MS. SPAIN: So we received an e-mail from  
2 Alicia saying unfortunately I will be unable to  
3 attend today's board meeting due to an unexpected  
4 conflict and I ask that the board excuse my absence  
5 today.

6 So we received that at 3:30. If you could  
7 vote on that.

8 CHAIRMAN TORRE: We can definitely do that for  
9 Alicia.

10 So Ms. Bache-Wiig has requested an excused  
11 absence.

12 MS. SPAIN: I avoided her last name.

13 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Yes. Is there a motion for  
14 excuse of Bache-Wiig?

15 MS. THOMSON: I move that we approve her  
16 excuse, we excuse her.

17 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Beautiful.

18 MR. EHRENHAFT: Second it.

19 CHAIRMAN TORRE: There's a second.

20 And all those in favor please say "aye."

21 (ALL): "Aye."

22 CHAIRMAN TORRE: All against?

23 She's excused.

24 MS. SPAIN: That's it for us. I have nothing.

25 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Nice day today.

1 Thank you.

2 MR. FULLERTON: I've been noticing something  
3 around town just walking around downtown, how many  
4 newspaper boxes we still have that are completely  
5 empty except for The New Times. I was wondering,  
6 do we have to have those things anymore?

7 MS. SPAIN: Were you here when there was that  
8 whole controversy years ago?

9 MR. FULLERTON: I was here.

10 MS. SPAIN: And you're bringing it up again?

11 MR. FULLERTON: Yes.

12 MS. SPAIN: I'll check on it. I'll talk to  
13 the manager's office about it.

14 MR. FULLERTON: Yeah, it seems to me that  
15 that's a thing of the past. Maybe it's historic.  
16 Maybe they should remain.

17 MS. THOMSON: But like with this thing that  
18 came up today with the realtor, this is really  
19 bothering me, because I know -- I do real estate  
20 too, but -- and you have to represent things the  
21 way they are and the way that you're able to do  
22 them.

23 MS. SPAIN: You're right.

24 MS. THOMSON: So --

25 CHAIRMAN TORRE: And it happens a lot.

1           MR. EHRENHAFT: A realtor just wants to sell  
2           the property, so they're just going to say  
3           whatever.

4           MS. THOMSON: That's true.

5           MR. RODRIGUEZ: I think they have a good  
6           action to take it before the board of realtors if  
7           they wanted to do that. And if we had denied the  
8           request they definitely would have a problem with  
9           it.

10          MS. THOMSON: Especially if we denied the  
11          request.

12          MS. SPAIN: That's right. I agree.

13          CHAIRMAN TORRE: Something would happen that  
14          everybody would be paying attention and then it  
15          wouldn't happen anymore.

16          MR. RODRIGUEZ: Except you hate to make  
17          someone a scapegoat.

18          MS. THOMSON: I mean, it's wrong. This is  
19          Coral Gables.

20          MS. SPAIN: It is.

21          MR. RODRIGUEZ: It's also sort of naive on  
22          their part to have accepted that representation  
23          without going to counsel or doing their due  
24          diligence, but still they have that in writing from  
25          the realtor.

1 MS. SPAIN: That's true. I wonder whether  
2 there was just one realtor involved in that.  
3 Typically there's -- there was just one?

4 Oh, well, there you go.

5 MR. SILVA: Yeah, I mean, unfortunately, we've  
6 all seen it, is they do their due diligence in  
7 terms of is it designated now at this moment, and  
8 then --

9 MS. SPAIN: Yes. But if they call our  
10 department and ask us we tell them, are you  
11 planning on demolishing this, you know, we just  
12 need to tell you that it's not designated, but you  
13 cannot demolish it without going through the  
14 process.

15 So everybody in the department, you know, the  
16 archivist knows to say that. Katherine, that  
17 handles art in public places, she knows to say  
18 that.

19 CHAIRMAN TORRE: I think the only time to  
20 actually catch it is when the attorney looks at  
21 that lien letter and says, oh, by the way, look at  
22 what I just found.

23 MS. SPAIN: That's a very good idea. If we're  
24 able to do that, that's perfect.

25 CHAIRMAN TORRE: I mean, it may be too late to

1 get out of the contract, but there's a case to be  
2 made because all of a sudden, hey, did you know  
3 about this?

4 MR. EHRENHAFT: Could they not reach out to  
5 the board of realtors and then either hold a  
6 symposium or --

7 MS. SPAIN: They hold a symposium every year.

8 MR. EHRENHAFT: -- or have a communication  
9 from the city putting all of the realtors on notice  
10 through the board?

11 MS. SPAIN: I mean, we've notified the board  
12 of realtors. I speak at a symposium every year  
13 that they have an annual meeting. But I think that  
14 if we're able to somehow get it on for a title  
15 search, I don't know how to do that, I don't know  
16 whether we're able to do that, but Miriam and I  
17 will look into that. That would be perfect.

18 CHAIRMAN TORRE: I'm not sure it's possible.  
19 That's just my only suggestion.

20 MS. SPAIN: Yeah.

21 MS. RAMOS: The lien search is easier because  
22 Alba does it here at the city. So we can just have  
23 Alba do it with the lien results. Titled search is  
24 different.

25 CHAIRMAN TORRE: But lien search, they could

1 do a search with the city and all of a sudden --

2 MS. RAMOS: Yeah.

3 CHAIRMAN TORRE: -- fees and this and that,  
4 and oh, by the way, here's a notice for it.

5 MS. RAMOS: Yeah.

6 MR. RODRIGUEZ: We're not the municipality  
7 that has this issue, I imagine.

8 MS. SPAIN: Well, we're the only municipality  
9 in Miami-Dade County that has that provision.

10 CHAIRMAN TORRE: You can do it without them  
11 accepting it.

12 MS. SPAIN: I mean, I don't know of any other  
13 municipality that has that anywhere.

14 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Miami Beach doesn't do it?

15 MS. SPAIN: No.

16 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Is there a motion for  
17 adjournment?

18 MR. MENENDEZ: I move.

19 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Is there a second?

20 MR. EHRENHAFT: Second.

21 CHAIRMAN TORRE: All those in favor please say  
22 "aye."

23 (ALL): "Aye."

24 CHAIRMAN TORRE: Adjourn.

25 MS. SPAIN: Thank you very much.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COURT CERTIFICATE

STATE OF FLORIDA  
COUNTY OF DADE

I, JESSICA A. DONNELLY, FPR, certify that I was authorized to and did stenographically report the foregoing proceedings via CD and that the transcript is a true and complete record, to the best of my ability, of my stenographic notes.

Dated this 7th day of November, 2017.

\_\_\_\_\_  
JESSICA A. DONNELLY, FPR