

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

July 17, 2008, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:

A S O N D J F M A M J J

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Dorothy Thomson* | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P |
| Catherine Stewart | E | P | P | P | P | E | E | P | E | P | P | P |
| Ernesto Santos | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P |
| Gonzalo Sanabria | | | | | | | | P | E | E | P | E |
| Dolly MacIntyre* | P | P | P | P | E | P | P | P | P | P | P | P |
| Michael Beeman | P | P | E | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | P |
| Joyce Meyers | P | P | P | E | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | E |
| Lisa Bennett | E | P | P | P | P | P | P | P | E | P | P | E |
| Shirley Maroon | P | P | P | P | E | P | P | P | P | P | P | P |

APPOINTED BY:

Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Comm. Maria Anderson
Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
Historic Preservation Board
City Manager David Brown
City Commission
City Commission

STAFF:

Kara N. Kautz, Historic Preservation Officer
Simone Chin, Historical Preservation Administrator
Betty Perez, Historical Resources Department
Rodney Carbonell, Historic Resources Department

A = Absent

P = Present

E = Excused

*** = New Member**

^ = Resigned Member

GUESTS: Assistant City Manager Dona Lubin, Herbert L. Brito, Sean Murphy

RECORDING SECRETARY: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Vice Chair Michael Beeman at 4:16 p.m. A quorum was present.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Beeman read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. He then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

MINUTES: MEETING OF JUNE 19, 2008:

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve the minutes of the meeting of June 19, 2008. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None. (Ms. Stewart arrived at 4:18 p.m., after voting occurred.)

DEFERRALS:

Ms. Kautz reported the following deferrals: LHD 2000-04 Revised (737 Alhambra Circle); COA (SP) 2008-06 (280 Miracle Mile). Ms. Kautz reported that 737 Alhambra Circle was deferred because the owner was unable to attend the meeting and wanted to be present when the application was considered. He is able to attend the August 21 meeting.

Mr. Beeman welcomed Assistant City Manager Dona Lubin.

SWEARING IN THE PUBLIC:

Nancy Morgan swore in members of the audience who planned to testify during the meeting.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Mr. Santos made a motion to excuse meeting attendance of Mr. Sanabria. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Mr. Santos made a motion to excuse meeting attendance of Ms. Bennett. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to excuse meeting attendance of Ms. Meyers. Ms. Maroon seconded the motion.

Roll Call (for all three motions): Ayes: Ms. Stewart, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Maroon, Mr. Santos, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

BOARD CHAIR/VICE CHAIR ELECTIONS:

Ms. Kautz reported that this meeting had been scheduled to conduct the election of Board Chair and Vice Chair. However, because all members were not present, the Board could defer elections to another meeting.

Ms. Maroon made a motion to defer the elections until the September meeting. Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

Discussion was held about Board members whose terms of service would expire this year. Ms. Kautz will confirm term expirations and report at the next meeting.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Stewart, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2008-10 An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 1256 Castile Avenue, a contributing structure within the "Castile Avenue Historic District," legally described as Lots 1 and 2, Block 7, Coral Gables Section "E," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 13, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the construction of an addition, renovation of the structure, and paint colors.

Stating that the applicant was present at the meeting, Ms. Kautz presented the project, describing property history and displaying photographs. She explained that the applicant was proposing a new addition to the west side of the property that would use part of a previous addition. Commenting that Board packets contained original drawings, Ms. Kautz said the second set of drawings was submitted subsequent to preparation of the staff report. These drawings showed minor changes to the roof line and a slight increase in square footage. The site plan, not included in the original submittal, was displayed as were elevations. Ms. Kautz concluded that staff recommended use of barrel tile on the roof and to allow a memory of a blocked window to remain, both of which the applicant agreed to incorporate.

Herbert Brito, project architect, described drawings, elevations and proposed alterations.

After the presentation, Mr. Santos complimented the architect for a well-managed site plan. He also made the following comments and suggestions, which were discussed with the Board by the architect as each issue was presented :

- On north façade, he pointed out one of the main features of the house as being the small courtyard entrance with two windows, suggesting that this renovation would be an ideal opportunity to add the details of the triple arched windows that appeared in the original drawings, but never built;
- The vertical proportions between the hip roofs and the adjacent flat roofs make it difficult to develop details on the flat area; the relationship between the flat and hip roofs is different as the new design is higher; recommendation that the flat roof or parapet be lowered;
- The roof drainage system needs to be modified in the roof plan;
- The drawings need to be further developed as their current status does not allow a proper judgment on the design; revise the drawings and return to the Board for review;
- The steps require railings in accordance with Code;
- Venting needs to be shown on the roof;
- Regarding the front façade, the two doors need to have a beam on top; there is space between the door head and the roof line; the vertical scale needs to be reviewed;
- The theme of the historic house should be carried throughout; research needs to be done to ensure that the end result will be worthy of the house;
- The drawings need to be further developed, with particular attention to the roofs, drainage, location of scuppers, venting locations, all four facades of the house, scale and dimensions of the drawings, proportions.

Mr. Santos said the Board of Architects should have noted these issues, commented that this was a most unusual property, and pointed out that the drawings were incorrect. Mr. Brito advised that he would correct the elevation, acknowledging that it was much lower. They discussed the porch and base of the house. Mr. Brito agreed to also study other details. Ms. Stewart clarified features of the original and proposed designs.

Ms. Kautz suggested the architect develop the plans further and bring them back to the Board for review. Mr. Beeman suggested the Board visit the house prior to the second review. Regarding the steps, Mr. Santos recommended that the applicant get an opinion from a building official about railings to learn if that Code requirement would be waived for a historic house.

Mr. Santos made a motion to have the architect further develop the drawings, incorporating Board comments, to work with staff prior to returning to the Board, and to also go through the complete procedure, including the Board of Architects before returning to the Board. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Mr. Beeman added that it would be helpful to have a visit to the property as well.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Maroon, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Stewart, Mr. Santos, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

AD VALOREM TAX RELIEF REQUEST:

CASE FILE AV 2006-03 An application requesting ad valorem tax relief for the property at 1101 North Greenway Drive, a contributing structure within the “Country Club of Coral Gables Historic District”, legally

described as Lots 13, 14, and 15, Block 15, Coral Gables Section "C", according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 26, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The related Special Certificate of Appropriateness – Case File COA (SP) 2005-13, was granted design approval on June 16, 2005 by the Historic Preservation Board.

A PowerPoint presentation was conducted by Ms. Kautz, who displayed photographs, described the history of the house and comprehensively reviewed the extensive renovation work performed. She commented that the owner received a landscaping award from the City, prior to introducing homeowner Sean Murphy.

Mr. Murphy dialogued with Board members about various features and the professionals involved in the restoration project.

Ms. Stewart made a motion to approve the application for ad valorem tax relief. Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Stewart, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

932 Escobar Avenue: Ms. Kautz reported that information pertaining to this property was brought to staff's attention by the contractor. The owners received approval to remodel the house, which included partial demolition. Demolition was estimated at 75% of the existing structure. At the onset of demolition, it was revealed that the house had no tie beams or footers holding it in place. As a result, they asked staff if demolition could continue. Ms. Kautz indicated to the owner and contractor that staff would not be supportive of demolition. If the property had initially been brought to staff for a significance request, the demolition would not have been permitted to take place.

At present, the house is not designated as a historic landmark, Ms. Kautz continued and, therefore, the renovation and remodeling was not presented to staff for review even though the demolition was extensive. The contractor also discovered that the second floor of the house was wood frame rather than concrete block.

The owner's options were: 1) to bring the house up to current Code, which would destroy the historic features of the house; 2) to rethink their plans and bring them to staff for designation and review; once designated as a historic landmark, the structural requirements would be less stringent; 3) to get a significance determination, which staff would not support, after which the owner would ask the Board for approval to demolish the house. The owner considered the options and decided to request designation and an Accelerated Certificate of Appropriateness. Given the condition of the house, Ms. Kautz told the owner that she would request a special meeting of the Board as the house is completely exposed and poised to fall down. Therefore, Ms. Kautz asked the Board to consider holding a special meeting in two weeks.

Ms. Kautz responded to Board questions about the house and clarified their understanding of the circumstances. She also said that she had advised the owners to seek counsel with Peter Iglesias. Mr. Santos opined that the house appeared to be beyond salvation.

The requirements and procedure for noticing the public was explained by Ms. Kautz. Ms. Maroon said she asked the City Clerk to post notices in newspapers that most people read, not the Miami Business Review, and Ms. Stewart suggested noticing proposed property changes on the City's web site.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to schedule a special meeting for this property on Thursday, July 31, 2008 to consider historic designation of 932 Escobar. Ms. Stewart seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Ms. Stewart, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Maroon, Mr. Santos, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

Ponce Circle Park Monuments: Ms. Stewart inquired about two monuments installed in Ponce Circle Park, which Ms. Kautz said were furnished by Old Spanish Village developers as a gift to the City. Ms. Stewart opined that the monuments inferred a false sense of history, stating that they appeared out of place, and were neither Spanish nor historic.

City Attorney Attendance at Board Meetings: Ms. Thomson asked for an update regarding Mr. Sanabria's suggestion that the City Attorney attend Board meetings. Ms. Kautz said that the City Attorney indicated she would contact Mr. Sanabria.

Board Membership Recommendation – Architects: Ms. Thomson asked if Ms. Kautz had received a response from the Planning and Zoning Board regarding this Board's request to have at least two architects comprise its membership. Ms. Kautz replied that the Planning and Zoning Board is not addressing text amendments at present, did not consider the request of an emergency nature and said they were waiting to address several amendments at one time. Ms. Thomson asked Ms. Kautz to confirm the proper procedure for requesting such changes.

BOARD ITEMS/CITY COMMISSION UPDATE:

Ms. Kautz reported that the Biltmore Villas project was allowed to move forward in the process by the City Commission. She stated that the City Attorney advised that Board members should not attend any of the presentations, or to speak with each other or anyone involved with the project until the property is presented to the Board for review and consideration of various approvals.

The Country Club Prado renovation was approved by the Commission and that project will be underway shortly.

ADJOURNMENT: 5:39 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz
Historic Preservation Officer