

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

June 18, 2009, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	J	J #	A	S	O	N	D	J	F #	F	M	A	M	J	APPOINTED BY:
Dorothy Thomson	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
Margaret Rolando*							P	P	P+	P	P	P	P	P	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Ernesto Santos	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	A	E	P	P	P	P	Comm. Maria Anderson
Venny Torre*											P	P	P	P	Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
										^	^	^	^	^	Historic Preservation Board
Joyce Meyers	E	E	P	P	E	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	P	P	City Manager
Gay Bondurant*														P	City Commission
Shirley Maroon	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	A	P	P	P-	P	P	City Commission

+ Ms. Rolando recused herself from discussion.

- Ms. Maroon left the meeting at 7:00 p.m.

STAFF:

Kara Kautz, Historic Resources Officer

Betty Perez, Administrative Assistant

Rodney Carbonell, Historical Resources Department

A = Absent

P = Present

E = Excused

*** = New Member**

^ = Resigned Member

= Special Meeting

GUESTS: Laura Russo, Burton Hersh, Tere Garcia, Cathy Owen, Ann T. Arvelo, Evelio Chavez, Marilyn Mercoe, Kelly and June Marcum, Rolando Hidalgo, Luis Perez-Codina, Magda Quiros, Douglas Zargham, Zeke Guilford, Andreas Birke, Fadi and Nadima Chamoun, Chris Tyson, Marilyn Haynes Smith, Leona Ferguson Cooper, Mike Sardinias, Kendell Turner, Jim Kay (Public Works Department)

RECORDING SECRETARY: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Dolly MacIntyre at 4:04 p.m. A quorum was present.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Ms. MacIntyre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. She then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

MINUTES: MEETING OF MAY 7, 2009:

Ms. Meyers made a motion to approve the minutes of the meeting of May 7, 2009. Mr. Santos seconded the motion, unanimously approved by voice vote.

The Chair noted Ms. Maroon's arrival at 4:10 p.m.

DEFERRALS: None.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENT:

Ms. Thomson said she reviewed the audio record and minutes of the May meeting, commenting that her absence in May occurred because the regular meeting date was changed and she was out of town on the revised meeting date.

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan swore in audience members who planned to testify during the meeting.

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION PRESENTATION:

After distributing an overview of the project to be discussed and showing photographs of the subject intersection, Ms. Kautz advised that representatives of FDOT would make a presentation.

Ms. Garcia, Public Information Officer, FDOT District Six, reviewed the background of FDOT's proposed improvements to the 57th Avenue corridor. She overviewed the history of 57th Avenue, efforts by elected officials and enabling legislation that now permit minor improvements for drainage, surfacing, sidewalks (to meet ADA requirements) and decorative lighting, adding that planned improvements met all historical preservation requirements. Ms. Garcia detailed due diligence, including meetings with elected and municipal officials, extensive meetings with property owners and residents on both sides of the corridor and funding for the project. She then introduced the project team, and explained that FDOT would need an easement from the City to proceed with improvements at the intersection of 8th Street and S.W. 57th Avenue. She assured there would be no impact on, or alteration to, any historic element. She sought Board input and a recommendation for project support.

Mr. Chavez, Consultech, displayed exhibits, described project limits and explained proposed improvements. He described the easement needed from the City close to the column at Country Club Prado to construct the ADA sidewalk. Mr. Chavez reported that a traffic study was conducted, which resulted in a recommendation to adjust vehicle lanes, provide a left turn lane, a correction to an existing off-course through lane and a modification for drainage. Summary discussion between Board members, Mr. Chavez, Ms. Garcia and FDOT representatives included the following:

- Current and planned configurations at the intersection;
- Residents support the project.
- The median will be striped (rather than concrete), and access for the southbound drivers will remain the same.
- Construction will be between 8th Street and Coral Way on Red Road.
- The duration of the construction period should be 12 months, with design completed in November 2009, construction to start in January 2012, and completion in January 2013 at a cost of \$4 million.
- The width of the lanes in the easement area is 12 feet; turn lanes 11 feet.
- Ms. Meyers advised that the January 2009 Plans Operation manual indicates lanes may be as narrow as 10 feet with turn lanes at nine feet. Traffic volume affects lane width.
- An option might be to design the sidewalk to go around the existing column.
- Mr. Santos suggested adding landscaping or trees in the swale on the south side in addition to sod.
- Mr. Torre expressed concern about the proximity of the sidewalk to the monument and the level of concrete on the Red Road corridor; suggested adding green space at the corner to improve appearance.
- Ms. Kautz suggested redirecting the sidewalk away from the monument to protect it from being hit.
- The FDOT District Design Manager would need to approve narrower lanes if recommended.

Ms. MacIntyre invited members of the audience to speak; however, there were no requests to do so.

Jim Kay reported that the Public Works Department reviewed the project with State officials, said the design would be an intersection safety improvement and would correct the offset intersection.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to recommend that the City Commission approve the design with the suggestion that FDOT examine new standards for traffic lane widths to see if the lanes could be narrower, thus adding more space between the City monument and traffic. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.

Ms. Garcia agreed to have the design engineer examine feasibility of lane width change, though she expressed doubt that a revision would be approved.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Maroon, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

STANDARD CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (ST) 2009-14 (Continued): An application for the issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 2703 Alhambra Circle, a contributing property with the "Alhambra Circle Historic District," legally described as lots 17 and 18, Block 10, Coral Gables Section D, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 74, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the installation of a new roof using clay "S" tiles.

Ms. Kautz advised that the Zoning Code stipulated that a tie vote was automatically returned to the Board for a decision. As a result of the tie vote on this application, the owners were unable to move forward with their appeal. Ms. Kautz reviewed application facts, and added that the owners successfully stemmed roof leakage. Staff's initial opinion that a true barrel tile roof needed to be reroofed with the same material; however, Ms. Kautz indicated a willingness to consider the proposal as a conditioned approval only, conditioned that the next roof replacement revert back to true barrel tile.

Ms. Maroon made a motion to approve the application with the condition that a subsequent re-roofing would revert to a true barrel tile. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Ms. Marcum restated her request to use Spanish "S" tile with a barrel tile border on the roof.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bondurant.

Mr. Santos recalled Ms. Meyers motion at the previous meeting for a hybrid solution with the first row of true barrel tile and the remainder of the roof tiled with Spanish "S" tile. Under those conditions, he indicated he would change his vote.

Mr. Hidalgo, a representative of the roofing company, confirmed that the application was for a first row of true barrel tile and the remainder of the roof tiled with Spanish "S" tile. Ms. Kautz advised that the application was for "S" tile.

Ms. Meyers made a motion to approve the "S" tile with a barrel tile starter course and with a reverter clause that stipulates that the next time the house is reroofed; it reverts back to true barrel tile. Ms. Maroon seconded the motion.

Mr. Torre conditioned the applicant with using gray mortar rather than red to make the roof appear more authentic.

Ms. Meyers accepted Mr. Torre's condition of a gray mortar application as an amendment to the motion, as did Ms. Maroon.

Roll Call for the motion and amendment: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-03 Continued An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 111 Florida Avenue, an empty parcel of land within the “Mac Farlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District,” legally described as Lot 3, Block 2-A, MacFarlane Homestead, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 81, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting variances from Article 5, Division 13, Section 5-1301, B; and Article 4, Division 1, 4-101, D; and Article 5, Division 16, Section 5-1602, A3 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code for construction materials at the gable end, lot coverage and for a visible flat roof. This item was granted conditional design approval for the construction of a new residence at the Historic Preservation Board meeting of May 7, 2009.

Ms. MacIntyre advised that this property and the three following applications would be considered as one for purposes of presentation, but voted on individually.

As variances were to be considered and approved for all four properties to move forward, Ms. Kautz first reviewed two similar structures, and then the remaining two, also similar, stating that each property staff report detailed individual structure differences and variance needs. She said the variances were acceptable to staff as the vernacular style of the buildings was not found anywhere else in the City.

Ms. Russo, as representative of the Lola B. Walker Homeowners Association, said two variances were needed for two of the houses and three for the remaining two.

Mr. Hersh reviewed relevant portions of the design and responded to Board questions regarding variances, property ownership and design decisions.

Ms. MacIntyre invited comments from the audience; however, none were forthcoming and the public hearing portion of the four applications was closed.

Mr. Torre made a motion to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 111 Florida Avenue, and to grant variances as detailed in staff’s report. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-04 Continued An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 114 Frow Avenue, an empty parcel of land within the “Mac Farlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District,” legally described as Lot 22, Block 2-A, MacFarlane Homestead, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 81, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting variances from Article 5, Division 13, Section 5-1301, B; and Article 5, Division 16, Section 5-1602, A3 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code for construction materials at the gable end and for a visible flat roof. This item was granted conditional design approval for the construction of a new residence at the Historic Preservation Board meeting of May 7, 2009.

Mr. Torre made a motion to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 114 Frow Avenue, and to grant variances as detailed in staff’s report. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-05 Continued An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 116 Frow Avenue, an empty parcel of land within the “Mac Farlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District,” legally described as Lot 21, Block 2-A, MacFarlane Homestead, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 81, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting variances from Article 5, Division 13,

Section 5-1301, B; and Article 5, Division 16, Section 5-1602, A3 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code for construction materials at the gable end and for a visible flat roof. This item was granted conditional design approval for the construction of a new residence at the Historic Preservation Board meeting of May 7, 2009.

Mr. Torre made a motion to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 116 Frow Avenue, and to grant variances as detailed in staff's report. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-06 Continued An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 114 Oak Avenue, an empty parcel of land within the "Mac Farlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District," legally described as Lot 21, Block 3-A, MacFarlane Homestead, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 81, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting variances from Article 5, Division 13, Section 5-1301, B; and Article 4, Division 1, 4-101, D; and Article 5, Division 16, Section 5-1602, A3 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code for construction materials at the gable end, lot coverage and for a visible flat roof. This item was granted conditional design approval for the construction of a new residence at the Historic Preservation Board meeting of May 7, 2009.

Mr. Torre made a motion to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 114 Oak Avenue, and to grant variances as detailed in staff's report. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Ms. Bondurant, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-08 Continued An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1235 North Greenway Drive, a non-contributing structure within the "Country Club of Coral Gables Historic District", legally described as Lots 25 and 26, Block 4, Coral Gables Section "E", as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 13, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for alterations to the existing structure. This item was deferred from the Historic Preservation Board meeting of May 7, 2009.

Ms. Kautz reported the applicant submitted a design proposal update. She displayed elevations, and pointed out that the revised design was reviewed by the Board of Architects with comments that would be explained after the presentation by the owners' representative.

Mr. Guilford, representing owners Elena Delgado and Bill Hilton, reviewed Board comments from the previous meeting, discussed historic districts, contributing and non-contributing structures within a district, differences in architecture, his opinion that it was impossible to make the subject house contributing, with a focus on Colonial Revival architectural style and its application in this instance. He displayed numerous photographs to illustrate his view, pointing out Colonial Revival features in each property. Thereafter, as shown on the June 8, 2009 letter from Architect Douglas Zargham, Mr. Guilford detailed design changes made in response to Board recommendations.

Mr. Zargham said the Board of Architects approved the revised design with the stipulation that muntins be used on the top sashes of the windows all around the house, with the exception of the porch enclosure, which the applicant agreed to do.

Regarding comments from the Board of Architects, Ms. Kautz reviewed changes to the drawings. She confirmed that the Board would rule on this house whether or not it was a contributing structure. As a non-contributing structure within a historic district, the house is over 50 years old, and Mr. Santos reiterated the point he made at the previous meeting that the house could become contributing if it were designated based on age. Mr. Guilford responded that the house would be a separate historic structure within a designated district, but would not maintain the qualities of the district. Ms. Kautz advised that the period of significance for which the district was designated could be extended, or an additional period of

significance could be added, but either option would entail a noticing process, review and other stipulated requirements. Mr. Santos expressed concern with changes proposed to the fenestrations, and restated that he viewed the house as historic, whether or not it was designated. Though he acknowledged that the design revisions were an improvement over the previous submission, he reiterated that the house had the characteristics of a historic house in a historic district and the proposed changes would make it appear like houses in other neighborhoods.

Ms. MacIntyre invited audience members to speak. Hearing no requests, she closed the public hearing.

Ms. Meyers commented that the revised design failed to recognize that the proportion of the muntins would not be as proposed in a Colonial Revival style structure. The architect accepted the suggestion.

Ms. MacIntyre said this application pointed out the importance of updating earlier designated districts, but also advised that all houses changed over time, which added to their history, and suggested the Board consider that concept as well, even though they were obligated to maintain the integrity of the house's position in the neighborhood. Ms. MacIntyre praised the applicant's efforts to incorporate Board's recommendations. Thereafter, the applicant addressed Board questions regarding roof color and the front door.

Ms. Maroon made a motion to approve the proposed revised design as amended. Ms. Bondurant seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-10 An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 3009 Alhambra Circle, a local historic landmark, legally described as Lots 13 and 14, Block 6, Coral Gables Country Club Section Part One, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 108, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the construction of additions and the renovation of the historic structure.

During initial presentation, Ms. Kautz advised that the property was designated at the Board's request, and refreshed memory regarding the connecting one-story garage and porch that were demolished prior to designation. Subsequent to the Board's instructions to designate the house in 2007 and due to the deteriorating state of the structure, the City intervened and made improvements to the property to prevent further deterioration. Ms. Kautz displayed photographs of the house, described proposed additions and renovations and invited the project architect to continue the presentation.

Mr. Sardinas stated that current homeowners Fadi and Nadima Chamoun had nothing to do with prior damage. He displayed and described restoration/addition plans and materials, explained that the garage would be rebuilt close to the original design and added that most of the work would occur in the area behind the garage. He mentioned an option under consideration for which he sought Board input. Mr. Sardinas distributed photographs to illustrate his point about raising the rear elevation with a larger-scale, repeated gable feature. Mr. Santos endorsed Mr. Sardinas' idea, and complimented him for the design. Mr. Sardinas indicated that detailed production drawings had not been completed as he wanted Board input regarding the rear elevation.

During discussion, Ms. Thomson remarked that the design dramatically changed the outside appearance of the house, but was assured by the architect that most of the work would occur in the rear of the property with the intent to restore it as closely as possible to the front of the house. Ms. Kautz advised that the design added square footage, that the proposed additions worked with current architecture, didn't overwhelm the design, and that the owners worked positively to create a sympathetic addition.

Mr. Torre discussed the front driveway and fence, and commented that the roof appeared busy and might impede roof maintenance. Regarding the front area, Mr. Sardinas said the wall would be low, in keeping with the character of the City, adding the plan to restore a decorative well to its original location in front.

Mr. Santos made a motion to approve the design for the additions to and renovation of the residence at 3009 Alhambra Circle, and to issue a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. Ms. Bondurant seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Maroon, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE:

Board Service Issues: Ms. Kautz reported that the appointment of Richard Heisenbottle would be confirmed by the City Commission at its July 7 meeting. She welcomed Gay Bondurant in her return to Board service, and said that one Board appointment remained outstanding and this meeting would likely be Ms. Maroon's last as her term of service had expired.

OLD BUSINESS:

Historic Preservation Workshop Series:

Ms. MacIntyre reported that a series of historic preservation workshops had been organized and scheduled by Chris Rupp, Coral Gables Museum; Kendell Turner, Dade Heritage Trust; and herself as a representative of the Coral Gables Historic Preservation Board. She distributed information about workshop topics and dates, and said the effort could help the community understand that preservation extends beyond aesthetics.

Ms. MacIntyre requested Board consideration of appropriating \$2,500 from the Board's fund to cover the expenses of bringing renowned preservation expert, Donovan Rypkema, to conduct the October 1, 2009 workshop. She pointed out that The Biltmore Hotel agreed to donate lodging for Mr. Rypkema and the use of the Biltmore Conference Center of the Americas for the workshop. Ms. Turner added that the workshops were intended to de-mystify preservation, and detailed the topics and speakers in the series. Board members were invited to recommend other workshop ideas. Ms. Rolando suggested that exhibitors be charged to generate funding to support speaker costs. Workshops will be video/audio taped for rebroadcast.

Ms. Meyers made a motion to appropriate \$2,500 from the Board's trust fund to cover expenses of speaker Donovan Rypkema for the October 1, 2009 workshop. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

Mac Farlane Homestead Update:

Ms. Kautz reported that a grant submitted to the National Trust Loan Fund was approved for the acquisition and rehabilitation of homes within the Mac Farlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District.

Segovia Traffic Circle Update:

In response to Ms. Thomson's request, Ms. Kautz will provide an update on the Circle landscaping project.

NEW BUSINESS:

Ms. Maroon expressed her appreciation for the opportunity to serve on the Board for the past eight years.

ADJOURNMENT: 6:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz
Historic Preservation Officer