City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting Agenda Item G-1 October 24, 2017 City Commission Chambers 405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

<u>City Commission</u> Mayor Raul Valdes-Fauli Vice Mayor Pat Keon Commissioner Vince Lago Commissioner Frank Quesada Commissioner Michael Mena

City Staff

City Manager, Cathy Swanson-Rivenbark Assistant City Manager, Peter Iglesias City Attorney, Craig E. Leen Deputy City Attorney, Miriam Ramos City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia

Public Speaker(s) Joseph Selem Jerry Borbon Richard Aguilar Jose Yanez Orlando Hoyos

Agenda Item G-1 [0:00:00 p.m.]

A discussion regarding residential parking permit issues, in particular on Antiquera Avenue.

(Sponsored by Commissioner Mena)

City Commission Meeting October 24, 2017 Agenda Item G-1 - A discussion regarding residential parking permit issues, in particular on Antiquera Avenue. Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We're going to take G-1, which is time certain at 10 o'clock. Commissioner Mena, a discussion of residential parking permit issues on Antiquera Avenue. And, can you call Commissioner Quesada to join us, please?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Kevin.

Vice Mayor Keon: Did we pass the consent agenda?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: What?

Vice Mayor Keon: Did we do the consent agenda?

Commissioner Mena: No, we skipped that.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, we had these time certain items.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay.

Commissioner Mena: We went straight to the entrees (INAUDIBLE).

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay, okay.

Commissioner Lago: We got to go back and deal with...

Vice Mayor Keon: I wondered why my file was so big.

Commissioner Mena: Yeah. It's just that we had told these people (INAUDIBLE)

Commissioner Lago: Yeah, yeah.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And they're here. Okay, shall we start? Commissioner Mena.

Commissioner Mena: Sure. So, this was a discussion topic that I sponsored regarding residential parking permit issues, and particularly, in the area near Antiquera Avenue.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Excuse me. You can all sit down. I'm going to call you...

Commissioner Mena: He'll call you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: One by one, yeah.

Commissioner Lago: Good morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good morning. Nice of you to come.

Commissioner Mena: This is an area -- and I'll ask Mr. Kinney to clarify the details here, but I was approached by various business owners in the area. And essentially, there was street parking, which was provided for some time, which was neither metered nor permitted. It was just open free parking for some period of time.

Parking Director Kinney: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: At some point in time, it was changed to residential permit parking, because this is a commercial area that abuts a residential neighborhood. After it was converted to residential, there was some percentage of the parking spaces that you converted to residential that we then made not for residential permit...

Parking Director Kinney: Well, yeah.

Commissioner Mena: But, which didn't go back to being what it was to begin with, which was, you know...

Parking Director Kinney: Free and open.

Commissioner Mena: Free and open parking, but then you made it metered parking. And the result of it has been, in my opinion, that the metered parking doesn't benefit either the residential or the business owners, because now it's pay to park. Whereas, before, at least the business owners in the area, you know, their employees and customers or, you know, depending on the type of business, could park there. Now, they're at meters, you know, which makes it a little more challenging for their businesses. Which, one thing would be if it was for residential permitted parking, because you're telling me there's not enough parking for the residential. But, when you changed it from residential to metered, that's where I think, in my opinion, you know, there was a disconnect. And so, I've heard suggestion, and I obviously, want to hear from you, Mr. Kinney, about whether or not there's an option of maybe making it, you know, open parking during the day, during business hours, if you will, and then permitted after hours. That way, you know, the businesses owners have that parking during the day and it's not impacting the residential at night. And, I want to hear from you as to why that's not a good solution here and why you think it should stay as metered parking, if that is, in fact, your opinion, which I assume it is, but if you could address it.

Parking Director Kinney: No, absolutely. I mean, I do want to kind of take a little bit of a step back, because when we talked about the North Ponce area, it's kind of -- we have a uniform situation in many locations. And over the years, there have been a few residential areas that have gone into the residential permit request. They petitioned -- the residents petitioned. And, each one is looked at a little differently. There are some where the residential zone will be after 5 p.m. Usually, it's a portion of the residential zone, because in a lot of the streets in the North Ponce area, there is no off-street parking for the residential units. So, at least some portion of the spaces need to be available during the day. What you mentioned on Antiquera, what happened was initially there was a petition. I went up and I observed -- and in fact, I would like to just read the language in the Code, so the Commission understands exactly what I'm supposed to be looking for. But the Code provision says the City Manager, or designee, which is myself, shall designate only those residential areas where the incursion of vehicles assimilating parking accommodation and whose owners reside outside of the residential area create an unacceptable shortage of parking availability for area residents and guests. So, when I receive a petition, the first thing I do is I go check out the street. And at this location, there were employees, customers, not only at the businesses on Ponce, but also on the other end of the block, on Southwest 8<sup>th</sup>, there's a 7-Eleven. So, there was a lot of traffic coming over to Antiquera and Salzedo. So, it was clear that there was traffic from outside of the residential area that was creating -- essentially, there was no parking. In fact, today, if you go to the next street south, Calabria, you'll see the same situation. And in fact, I have a petition on my desk from the residents on Calabria. And, this is becoming more and more prevalent. In fact, right now in my folder on residential permits, I have six petitions. In the last year, we've done Salamanca. We've done Madeira. We've done Majorca, Boabadilla, (INAUDIBLE), Oviedo. So, it's becoming a very common thing to try and get commercial traffic out of the residential areas. So, initially, I established the residential zone on Antiquera, and this is an approximation. I'm not claiming it's exact. There were 20 spaces in the residential zone, and there was, I'm going to say, six or seven spaces that were metered on Antiquera. I went and met with the businesses at 814 Ponce, and we had a conversation. And from that, I agreed to look at the traffic and see if there were any reasonable adjustments I could make. And you are correct. What I did is then, within a block of 814 Ponce, I installed 12 parking meters to designate 12 additional spaces that could be used for commercial purposes. You're correct. They're no longer free, but when I'm managing the public spaces, I try and stay out of situations where I'm providing a specific business or a group of specific businesses free parking. I see my responsibility as making the price reasonable and that it be managed equitably. So, the meters are installed. They're longterm meters. When I go up and I looked at the traffic on Antiquera now, there are 13 or 14

spaces that are dedicated to the residential zone. On a typical day, when I've gone up there, it's between 8 and 13 cars that are parked in the residential zone. So, there's limited capacity...

Commissioner Mena: That's not including the meters, though. You're...

Parking Director Kinney: That's not including the meters. That's just in the area...

## Commissioner Mena: Right.

Parking Director Kinney: That is still purely residential. Now, there are other locations where I have installed PayByPhone along with the residential zone. You can see on Biltmore Way there's residential zones that are on top of metered spaces. So, during the day, someone could park at the meter and pay, or if they have a residential permit and they live there, they don't have to pay. My only caution here is if we want to kind of take a look at the rules and business rules of how we're managing residential parking, I would like to do that more holistically, maybe just see what it is. I know when we had the meetings on North Ponce on what's going to happen in North Ponce, the residential parking permit program was a very important piece of trying to resolve all the issues in North Ponce. And, I'm not saying there's only one way to do it, but I do think we need to look at it as a whole because I -- you know, if you talk to the residents on Boabadilla or Oviedo or any of these other streets where this has happened, they're very adamant that they need these spaces to make their neighborhoods not commercial.

Commissioner Mena: But, -- and let me just -- and I just want to say a couple of brief points in response to what you said, and then we should probably -- we should hear from some of the individuals who are here. But, you know, part of my concern is, you know, here it was already, you know, free -- for lack of a better word -- parking, and then taking it away. And so, that's a little bit different to me. You know, you have businesses in the area who rely on that parking or grow accustomed to having it available, and then you change it. And so, you're asking for a

holistic review, and my -- you know, I -- you already went in and changed sort of the status quo that was there...

Parking Director Kinney: Based on the business rules we have now, I mean, the Commission, absolutely, is capable of changing the ordinance or the business rules...

Commissioner Mena: Yeah, but the way I heard what you read -- and I don't have a perfect memory, but if I understood it correctly, it would work fine for purposes of changing it to residential permitted, which was what you originally did. If you're telling me there's not enough parking for these residential areas and they need it for residential is one thing -- and you did that for a component of this, fine. But then this second component, by virtue of the fact that you made it metered, clearly indicates to me that it's not necessary for the residential; otherwise, it'd just be residential permitted, wouldn't it?

Parking Director Kinney: Yes -- no. One -- you're absolutely correct. What I would say is once we start to manage spaces, free is really not what we do. Economics is one of the tools we use to manage. Now, when I say reasonably priced parking, those are long-term meters, so the rate is lower than the rate that you authorized last time we had a rate increase. I will -- there is one more sentence I should read. Just -- it does allow, after the petition, that the Parking Director will determine whether it qualifies for inclusion, but then it also goes on to say that there are some -- there is some leeway on how to manage -- the rules and regulations of a specific -- that's why I have the authority to say after 5 pm or if there needs to be some spaces during the day, you know, I can limit the number of spaces. For example, on Madeira, the north side of the street is only after 5. On the south side of the street, it's residential (INAUDIBLE).

Commissioner Mena: But, isn't it a win-win if that's residential during the night and free for the businesses during the day? Who loses out in that circumstance, other than...?

Parking Director Kinney: You mean just for the...

Commissioner Mena: Other than, frankly, the City's, you know...

Commissioner Quesada: Coffers.

Commissioner Mena: Yeah, asset, right is generating revenue, but other than that...

Parking Director Kinney: What I would say is once you allow the spaces in front of the residents to be free during the day, all those spaces are going to be filled.

Commissioner Quesada: So, let me -- if I can just jump in here a second.

Commissioner Mena: Yeah, sure.

Commissioner Quesada: I pulled it up on a map to see the location, because I didn't recall exactly where it was. A few years ago, maybe close to six years ago is when I first got elected. We had an issue with parking in residential areas on Carmona, Fonseca, Marabella...

Parking Director Kinney: Those have all petitioned.

Commissioner Quesada: But, what I recall at that time is the feeling from the residents at the time is people were driving into the neighborhoods, leaving their cars, taking the trolley, taking it down to the Metrorail, okay.

Parking Director Kinney: That was one of the issues.

Commissioner Quesada: That's what I recall from...

## Parking Director Kinney: Yeah.

Commissioner Quesada: Five or six years ago. And, I recall that the moment we applied residential permitting, those vehicles would shift to the next street down...

Parking Director Kinney: To the next block.

Commissioner Quesada: Or two streets down. So, I guess I didn't realize this when this happened. When did we apply this -- the meter parking on the subject street, Antiquera?

Parking Director Kinney: Well...

Commissioner Quesada: Recently or...

Parking Director Kinney: There's always been meters there. When I established...

Commissioner Quesada: So, what's changed or is it just...

Parking Director Kinney: There's more meters than there used to be.

Commissioner Quesada: Got it.

Parking Director Kinney: But there...

Commissioner Mena: There was free spaces that were taken away and are now metered, bottom line.

Commissioner Quesada: Is that what it is? It's three? Okay.

Commissioner Mena: Free. No, free.

Commissioner Quesada: Oh, I thought you said...

Commissioner Mena: I think you said there were like 12 of them.

Parking Director Kinney: Within a block of 814 Ponce, there's now 12 meters that used to be free spaces.

Commissioner Quesada: Got it.

Parking Director Kinney: Let me -- I do think it's a global thing, because I will also say that Economic Development and Parking, we are diligently working to increase the parking supply in this area, and we are in the middle of negotiations. But again, those will not necessarily be free spaces. When we begin to manage space, there is usually a cost associated, even though I believe it should be reasonable. I will tell you, on my shelf in my office, there's a big book, and it's called The High Cost of Free Parking. We're -- the City shouldn't get into the business of subsidizing commercial (INAUDIBLE).

Commissioner Quesada: Yeah, but you know what happens in that neighborhood? I've worked in that neighborhood for quite some time, so I walk around there quite a bit. And you have -- there are a lot of units, there are a lot of residents that live there and their units, they may have a smaller unit and only one parking space in their building, so they...

Parking Director Kinney: Or none.

Commissioner Quesada: (INAUDIBLE) second car -- or none. No, I don't think there's none.

Parking Director Kinney: There's quite a few units -- or buildings out there with no off-street parking.

Commissioner Quesada: Yeah. So, I mean, there's always a problem of parking in that -- at least from my personal experience, I'm seeing. I'm sure you've seen it as well that anytime there's an open spot; it's taken up rather quickly.

Parking Director Kinney: But the commercial traffic tends to exacerbate that problem.

Commissioner Quesada: Is there that much commercial traffic in that neighborhood, though? Because you have the Douglas Entrance, which has got more than ample parking. You have -- I know there's a restaurant there that does well. There's a real estate -- there's an office building. I've been to that building quite a few times. I know there's a law office across the street. I don't see it being as terribly that much.

Parking Director Kinney: We're getting a lot of petitions.

Commissioner Quesada: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: And, the first requirement for a petition is for me to confirm that there's people from outside of that neighborhood...

Commissioner Quesada: I believe it.

Parking Director Kinney: Parking in that neighborhood.

Commissioner Mena: But metering it doesn't solve that.

Vice Mayor Keon: Well...

Commissioner Mena: That's what I'm not understanding.

Commissioner Quesada: You're saying metering...

Commissioner Mena: If you made it residential permitted parking, then I understand that. Nobody could park there except residents. I get that. And, if you told me we needed this residential for these residences, this would be a different discussion.

Parking Director Kinney: Okay.

Commissioner Mena: But, what I'm hearing is that at least 12 of the spaces aren't absolutely necessary for the residential...

Parking Director Kinney: Right. Well...

Commissioner Mena: Which is why we metered them.

Parking Director Kinney: The alternative is -- and I don't know that I would support this, but I would be willing to talk about it. We have five spaces that have historically been metered on Antiquera. I added additional metered spaces. Well, if that's being unfair, then those -- let's say those six or seven spaces stay free, and then there's the residential zone. So, those six spaces, we basically dedicated to employees of the businesses right there, and those are the first six spaces that get filled up in the morning, and the seventh person is out of luck. They have to park at a meter. I'm not sure that's an equitable way to manage the space. That's...

Commissioner Mena: How is that less equitable than all of them having to park at a meter? I don't understand.

Vice Mayor Keon: Because...

Commissioner Mena: Isn't six people getting parking for these

Parking Director Kinney: For free.

Commissioner Mena: Businesses...

Parking Director Kinney: The City is paying for six people to park, six employees to park.

Commissioner Mena: Paying for is one way to phrase it. I understand. You know, we -- but we -- the City's been providing it for free for some time.

Parking Director Kinney: Because we do not get into the residential...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Parking Director Kinney: Right now, the City Manager or her designee has the ability to do a residential zone. And in fact, in one case, the Commission has directed us to do that. But, our practice right now is we only get into that if there's a petition. And once there's a petition, then I have to look at how we manage the parking on that street. And, there are differences of opinion on certain issues, and I'm fully open with that, and I see there's different ways to interpret it. But, in the case of Antiquera and most of the blocks in North Ponce, you have a liner of commercial. And right now, those commercial businesses are benefiting by parking in the residential zone, either their employees or their customers. And, as the residents ask us to address that so they have parking, that -- they're going to be pushed out into the meters on Ponce or the meters on the cross streets, so...

Commissioner Mena: Look, I recognize that all these situations are -- you know, you're looking for a holistic approach, which I understand, but I also don't think that it's one size fits all. I think different areas are different from others and you have to...

Parking Director Kinney: No. There is a variation, and there are different things we can do. Now, I can tell you because we're dealing with the issue at 760 and 757, I would not want to go to the residents on Boabadilla and say, oh, by the way, during the day, the doctors and the patients can park on your street.

Commissioner Mena: There's a lot more traffic there, though. Isn't there, I mean, medical use...

Parking Director Kinney: It's very similar to Antiquera.

Commissioner Mena: I mean, the building across the street from there is a huge building.

Parking Director Kinney: Yes, but there's a few towers right there on the 8 and 900 blocks of Ponce. And if, for example, if you go to Calabria today, I have not granted their petition. So, right now, if you go during the day, there is not one parking space in front of the residential properties. They are all full. Now, if you go to Antiquera, like I said, there's usually 8 to 13, so there's usually two or three open spaces in front of the residences on Antiquera.

Commissioner Mena: I think we should probably give them...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: So, we...

Commissioner Mena: An opportunity to...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah. Let's give the residents an opportunity...

Commissioner Mena: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: To speak. And I would like to call on Dr. Joseph Selem, please, to come before us. Good morning, sir.

Joseph Selem: Good morning, Mr. Mayor. Thank you for the opportunity. Commissioners, likewise. Like you all know, I'm one of the small business owners in 1814 Ponce. I'm a physician. I've been there now six years. I own the property there. I pay my property taxes, just like the residents around Antiquera. And as of six months ago, it was free parking for everybody on that street, as you've been told. And, six months ago is when this new ordinance came on for residential parking. After analyzing the situation, we felt that -- and meeting with Mr. Kinney, we felt that, you know, a fair meeting ground, I think, was as they do in other neighborhoods or cities around Miami was, you know, from 8 to 5, making it open so the small businesses around could continue using the parking spaces for clients and staff members. And then, from 5 to 8 am, making it only residential. This was discussed. Several conversations have taken place. We went ahead and we would take totals throughout the course of the day to have, you know -- to show that during the day the residents that live on Antiquera don't necessarily use the parking spaces, as there are maybe two or three cars there parked at different times throughout the day. Some of those photos were sent. However, Mr. Kinney felt that it was -- the right thing to do was to add meters along Antiquera and, I believe, Ponce. However, we felt that that was, you know, an inappropriate solution to a problem because now, yes, you are adding more parking spaces, but you've now added a burden on small business owners to provide parking for their staff or clients when they come to get service at the building. So, again, we feel that an even meeting ground would be, you know, 8 to 5 for commercial and 5 to 8 am for the residents there. And as discussed before, you know, most of those residents -- I don't know what percentage -but they do have parking included in their buildings. There haven't been any more residential buildings put up or apartments put up where we felt that there was an increased need for more residential parking. It's been pretty stable for a couple of years now. So, that was, you know, the essence of our situation. And you know, the -- and Mr. Kinney says that the residents petitioned for extra parking, but I think it's equal that small business owners that are in the area -- we pay property taxes, and we should also have an equal opportunity to maintain our businesses running and appropriately to continue to allow the City of Coral Gables to grow. So, that is all I have to say.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much, Doctor.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And, I would like to call all of the other speakers, and I will recognize everybody, but the other speakers are also from 814 Ponce, various other -- and I'm going to limit the -- your time to speak to two minutes, because Dr. Selem has expressed your point of view. But the next one, Jerry Borbon. Jerry. Mr. -- two minutes. Yes, sir. Welcome.

Jerry Borbon: Thank you for your time. Good morning, Mayor. Good morning, Commissioners. As Mr. -- Dr. Selem said, we do have a shortage of parking with our building. Our building is approximately, I believe, 43 units. We have 66 parking spaces on the ground, so you do the math. You have more than two people in an officer, you're short. By making these parking spaces residential, you've now taken away parking that we once had. By making it metered, you've made it worse by now having us pay for our employees to park there, whether it's a discounted rate, it's still an extra expense for us on a daily basis. If you walk down that street any time of day from 9 to 5, you're going to see two or three cars parked on the street now that it's residential only. Prior to that, yeah, it was full. It was being used. It was being used by our offices. Again, we are property tax payers. We are business tax payers. We pay for our business licenses in the area, and we do feel that we should have equal treatment and equal consideration with respect to this parking issue. As Dr. Selem said also, the apartment buildings that are in the area, I think all of them, if I'm not mistaken, have off-street parking within their building. So, I'm not sure what the petition was for, if it was for the guests. But again, the guests aren't there during the day. So, I think it would be more than fair to have the parking divided whereas 8:30 to 5:30 or so, it's open. And, then in the evenings and the early mornings,

it'll be, you know, strictly for the residents. We won't have any issue with that, I believe. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir. Alright, Richard Aguilar, 814 Ponce.

Richard Aguilar: Good morning.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good morning, sir.

Mr. Aguilar: Good morning. My name is Richard Aguilar. I'm the president of 814. I met with Kinney back in May and we called him various times and sent emails, and we met with him once. We couldn't get a follow-up email. But, going to -- he said that we pushed the residents out. It's unclear. The parking spaces that we're looking for are vacant from 9 to 5, so no one is utilizing them. So, again, parking that's not being utilized that can be utilized by us as small businesses to be able to use. So, no one's being pushed out. The residents use them after 5:30, and they should have the right. And again, there's the same ordinance with the City of Miami Beach, from 8:30 until 5:30, they're used by the commercial businesses. After 5:30, I agree, they should be used by the residents.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir. Jose Yanez, 814 Ponce.

Jose Yanez: Yes.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good morning, sir.

Mr. Yanez: Everyone, thank you for your time. I'll be very brief. I'm a business owner, as well, at 814. And, my law office has been there for 10 years. And, the changes that were recently done a few months ago has created a ruckus to all of our clients, as well as the employees. They're stating that the residents need the parking to petition, but we have sent

numerous pictures with emails clearly showing there is nobody there during the day. We also have a competing interest. As they said, there's 43 units in that building. I've had clients, I would say, on a weekly basis, from two to three, contact and say we can't find parking. What do we do? And I've said to my staff; just tell them to patiently drive around until you could figure something out. We have no alternative. The second thing we've had to do is I tell my staff, anything that could be done through email, by mail versus coming into the office, let's avoid people coming in.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And what...

Mr. Yanez: That's how bad it's gotten.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: What do you do? What's your profession?

Mr. Yanez: I'm an attorney.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And attorney, okay.

Mr. Yanez: And, that's how bad it's become in the last two months. So, I think the happy medium -- and we understand residents also have a right, but so do business owners. And, that's to find the medium during the day versus the evening, where everybody can have a little bit of peace and tranquility, run their affairs, and we're not blocking anybody's interests at nights. Thank you for your time.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you. Thank you, sir. Orlando Hoyos, 814 Ponce. Good morning, sir.

Orlando Hoyos: Good morning. I want to thank the Commission for hearing us today. My business is also at 814 Ponce. And, the problem in the parking is not just for the residential

residents. It's also for the businesses. I believe that when these buildings were built back in the '70s, these properties were all built; the ratios that were required were much lesser than they are today, so the problem applies for everyone. And, if the new restrictions would have helped the residents, I would understand. But, those spaces sit vacant for the most part of the day. I've sent over a dozen pictures in the past three months, I want to say, to Mr. Kinney. We haven't gotten a response for that. It's difficult to have an employee that earns \$10 or \$11 an hour, asking them to pay for parking all day long, so that doesn't make sense. And even though we're not residential residents, we are residents. Our building's directly adjacent to Antiquera, so we're affected by this. There are different solutions, I would think, that can be used to resolve the problem. If there is permitted parking, it should be for the residents, including the commercial residents, not just residential. Maybe that's another way to do it, where businesses that aren't directly in Antiquera do get to use -- do not use it, but the ones that are on Antiquera, do get to use it. And that's it. Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir. Thank you very much. Anybody else wants to speak on this issue? Any other -- Mr. Kinney, you're back.

Parking Director Kinney: I fully acknowledge that I got the photographs and the email. But, at the meetings -- and I will tell you I've toured this area over the summer and probably for the last five months at least 30 times. Yes, there may be a time when there's only two or three cars there. I'm not disputing that. I have not seen it myself, but I have seen the photographs. When I've been there and counted cars, there's been 8 to 13 cars in the residential zone, so that means...

Vice Mayor Keon: How many spaces are there?

Parking Director Kinney: Fourteen.

Vice Mayor Keon: Fourteen spaces, okay.

Commissioner Mena: We're not talking about the resident -- I'm not understanding. We're talking about the meters.

Parking Director Kinney: But what I would say is two blocks away, there's another small business that just opened up. She only had two spaces -- off-street spaces. She was forced to come and, you know, pay for a space so she could open up. So, I haven't -- I love small businesses. They're one of my biggest customers. But, I do think when we start talking about potentially subsidizing, you know, specific businesses, I think that's a slippery slope because there's no other place where I'm providing free parking to...

Commissioner Lago: That was going to be my next question, if you've embarked in a similar scenario anywhere in the city as what's potentially being proposed.

Parking Director Kinney: No. What I did appreciate out of the last gentleman that had the conversation is the potential for there to be permit parking for the commercial, not that I want there to be permit commercial parking in the residential zone, but that's exactly what Economic Development and I are working on to try and find a location. And we think we have one. I can't disclose it yet because we're in negotiations, but it would be close enough to these businesses to where if they needed permit parking for their employees -- and our permit parking is very reasonable. That's the solution I'm trying to work on.

Commissioner Mena: But, is the meter parking not still basically commercial? I don't understand. Like, if you lived there...

Parking Director Kinney: Yes.

Commissioner Mena: You're not going to pay for a meter the whole day.

Parking Director Kinney: Right. There's...

Commissioner Lago: But it's for guests. The issue is the guests. It's not really the person who lives there, right?

Parking Director Kinney: Well, no.

Commissioner Mena: The guests could still park there, if it was free, right?

Parking Director Kinney: Okay, in residential, there's two different worlds. Where we have multifamily, there is a specific provision in the Code that allows, you know, meters or PayByPhone along with the residential. If this was single-family, I couldn't offer that. But, that's how we got those extra 12 spaces is because this is generally a multifamily area. I was able to encroach a little bit in the residential to provide some extra spaces for the commercial.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Commissioner, what's your pleasure?

Commissioner Mena: I mean, listen, I'm supportive of the request that the business owners are making to have some version of this that allows them to utilize it during the day and doesn't impact the residents. You know, we're talking about encroaching on -- and all this stuff. But again, the status quo here has been that it was free for -- how long has this building been there?

Unidentified Speaker: '71 -- 1971.

Commissioner Mena: Since 1971, this parking...

Parking Director Kinney: I need to talk about 814 Ponce. There was actually a phase II that was supposed to include a garage.

Commissioner Mena: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: That never got built.

Commissioner Lago: That's what I wanted to talk about also...

Commissioner Mena: Why not?

Commissioner Lago: Because I'm looking at 814. This is where RESF is.

Commissioner Quesada: Yeah.

Commissioner Lago: So, I'm very intimately aware of the struggles that this building has. It's a pretty large building. The location is right obviously on Ponce and almost 8<sup>th</sup> Street. When you park in that parking lot -- it's kind of like a surface parking lot. It's tucked into the building.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Lago: There's a lot of, you know, double parking. There's a significant lack of parking. I think the design -- but when they talk about this building is from 1971...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It's very dangerous, yeah.

Commissioner Lago: It's not from 1971. This building is probably -- I would say it was redeveloped...

Parking Director Kinney: We just gave the CO, I believe, in 2008.

Vice Mayor Keon: Why did we give a CO without the garage?

Commissioner Lago: What I would like...

Parking Director Kinney: I...

Commissioner Lago: What I wanted to do was...

Parking Director Kinney: Wasn't involved.

Commissioner Lago: What I wanted to do was, if possible, I'd like to review the whole process of acceptance of this building. I know it has nothing to do with the parking, but I want to become a little bit more aware of how we got to this situation. And number two, I want to talk to some of the residents that live on the street adjacent to it, because I've been there. By the way, when I visit this building, it takes me 15 minutes to find parking. I end up having to park across the street, where MK Travel is, where the bank building is.

Parking Director Kinney: I'm hopeful that we will have a big solution soon. We are close to, I think, to cutting a deal.

Vice Mayor Keon: Is there any off-street parking for those businesses? Is there limited offstreet parking, like behind the businesses or whatever?

Parking Director Kinney: Yes. The businesses have their own parking.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: Their position is...

Vice Mayor Keon: They just don't have enough...

Parking Director Kinney: It's not adequate.

Vice Mayor Keon: Enough parking for their employees.

Parking Director Kinney: And the customers...

Vice Mayor Keon: Is that right?

Parking Director Kinney: Yeah.

Vice Mayor Keon: Well, their customers can park in -- on -- in the metered spaces.

Unidentified Speaker: On Ponce.

Vice Mayor Keon: I mean, that's what...

Parking Director Kinney: The last five times I've done the little tour...

Vice Mayor Keon: Yeah.

Parking Director Kinney: Up there within a block of 814, there was one time there were only two open metered spaces.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay, so you increased the number of metered spaces in the area to provide for their clientele.

Parking Director Kinney: Right. But we're...

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: Also negotiating with a property owner that may open up some parking that we could...

Vice Mayor Keon: You're could have permit parking.

Parking Director Kinney: Distribute to...

Vice Mayor Keon: Yeah. I...

Commissioner Lago: But is the issue more...

Vice Mayor Keon: I don't think...

Commissioner Lago: Is the issue more...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: But it would be charged.

Commissioner Lago: More...

Parking Director Kinney: Yes, it would not be free.

Commissioner Lago: Is the discussion more...

Vice Mayor Keon: No, you can't do free parking.

Commissioner Lago: Oriented towards clients -- is it towards clients or is it actually employees that don't have enough parking? Is that the issue?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Both.

Commissioner Lago: I mean, I think...

Parking Director Kinney: I think it's both, but I...

Commissioner Lago: Because, again, an employee would have to pay constantly over the nine hours, ten hours that they're...

Vice Mayor Keon: Right.

Commissioner Lago: At the building.

Parking Director Kinney: When I first received the petition and I sat in the morning on Antiquera, it looked like most of the people that were coming in were employees. Now, down on the end with the 7-Eleven, that was people running in to get a Slurpee, but that's typically...

Commissioner Mena: And here's the thing, Commissioner Lago, to your point about talking to the residents, which is fine. I don't -- but if you put yourself in the shoes of a resident there, let's say you live there...

Commissioner Lago: Of course.

Commissioner Mena: What do you -- like how does it benefit you to have those spaces be metered? You know, if -- again, one thing would be if it was only residential. I get that.

Commissioner Lago: And correct me, if I'm wrong. I mean, again, I want to do...

Parking Director Kinney: You would still be able to get a residential permit that would allow you to park there.

Commissioner Lago: I want to do more research on this. If they're metered, at least you have access to them. They turn over. Someone is forced to pay or they'll get a parking ticket.

Commissioner Mena: We're talking Monday through Friday, during business hours.

Commissioner Lago: But again...

Vice Mayor Keon: You know what...

Commissioner Lago: But, we have the same -- you know where we have the same problem, the same problem when I used to live on 100 Edgewater Drive -- 90 Edgewater Drive.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Lago: My -- and Frank knows very well. At least Frank had valet. His building -- Commissioner Quesada has valet and a little bit more guest parking. Our building had eight guest parking spaces, so I had to go up and down Edgewater looking for a parking space, and it was my wife and I living in a one-bedroom that we only had one dedicated parking. So, the reason why I bring that up is because the meter allows you at least to have some sort of turnover. When it's not and it's just basically an open space where we're not paying, you know, anybody could park there for "X" amount of hours until, obviously, you know...

Vice Mayor Keon: So, it's no turnover.

Commissioner Mena: Until after 5 o'clock on a weekday.

Vice Mayor Keon: No, but there's no turnover.

Commissioner Mena: No turnover.

Vice Mayor Keon: But you know, in front of Biltmore...

Commissioner Lago: But, I understand what you're saying. It's a problem because -- by the way, it's a problem that came as a result of the poor planning of whatever happened in 2008.

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Commissioner Lago: And, now we're -- I think now we're paying the consequences of that situation.

Commissioner Mena: Agreed.

Commissioner Lago: We've got to find an answer.

Vice Mayor Keon: On Biltmore Way, in front of David Williams and in front of the Biltmore, what is the name of the building there?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Biltmore II.

Vice Mayor Keon: Biltmore II.

Parking Director Kinney: Well, the 6 and 700 blocks.

Vice Mayor Keon: The 6 and 700 block of those streets have meters on them. They're all metered. There's also a provision that, with a residential permit tag of some sort, you don't have to feed the meter. So, there are meters...

Commissioner Mena: There's also -- I used to live in 711 Biltmore Way. The side streets are also free parking.

Parking Director Kinney: Yes. But, the reason the meters were put on Biltmore is because they were always full.

Commissioner Mena: Right, but the side street -- I used to live there. Those meters are empty all day and all night. I used to live in 711 Biltmore Way.

Parking Director Kinney: Well...

Commissioner Mena: And, there was never anybody there. And, the side streets to 711 Biltmore Way do not have meters nor are they residential. They're just free.

Parking Director Kinney: There are a couple unregulated streets, yes.

Commissioner Mena: Right, so there, it's okay.

Parking Director Kinney: Well...

Commissioner Mena: Why is that? That's what I'm not understanding.

Parking Director Kinney: Because, we have adequate space for the residents on Biltmore and...

Commissioner Mena: I mean, if you...

Parking Director Kinney: I would say there are a lot of permits that are purchased there, and there are times of the day where it's pretty sparse. But, the last two times I've driven down Biltmore Way, there are...

Vice Mayor Keon: It's...

Parking Director Kinney: Quite a few...

Vice Mayor Keon: Yeah, it's full.

Parking Director Kinney: Vehicles.

Vice Mayor Keon: But, I don't think that in general the City pays for or accommodates employee parking. We don't.

Commissioner Mena: But, that's not the right way to phrase it, because...

Vice Mayor Keon: But they haven't.

Commissioner Mena: But...

Vice Mayor Keon: I mean, we traditionally haven't.

Commissioner Mena: Except we have here, apparently, for...

Vice Mayor Keon: Well, because...

Commissioner Mena: At least nine years.

Vice Mayor Keon: Alright, but because of the one, there wasn't development...

Commissioner Mena: Because we approved a project...

Vice Mayor Keon: In the area.

Commissioner Mena: That didn't have enough parking.

Vice Mayor Keon: Well, someone gave them a CO...

Commissioner Mena: Right.

Vice Mayor Keon: Without the appropriate amount of parking.

Commissioner Mena: But who did that?

Vice Mayor Keon: I don't know who did that, but we can ask for -- can...

Commissioner Mena: At the end of the day, the City approved it.

Vice Mayor Keon: Mr. Iglesias, can -- well, that doesn't -- but maybe not properly, so you don't repeat it. If it wasn't done properly, you don't repeat the same mistake over and over again.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, why don't we...

Vice Mayor Keon: I understand that the businesses have on-site parking that accommodates some employees. It doesn't accommodate all their employees. But, you need to find a permit lot or something where people can purchase a permit, so they can park all day because the meters

along Ponce should be for their clientele that can come in, put money in the meter and go do whatever they need to do and leave. I mean, people in the residential area don't -- everybody doesn't work from 9 to 5. They don't -- you don't work from 9 to 5. You have a lot of people that work from home. You have a lot of people that go out and come back and there's no parking for them. There is...

Commissioner Mena: And, you think they're going to park at a meter when they get home?

Vice Mayor Keon: If...

Parking Director Kinney: If they have a permit.

Vice Mayor Keon: If they have a permit, they can park at the meter. They don't have to feed the meter.

Commissioner Mena: Okay.

Vice Mayor Keon: But, they can park at the meter.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. Let's -- what is the pleasure of the Commission?

Vice Mayor Keon: It's for the commercial use is why there's a meter.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let's move this to...

Commissioner Mena: My suggestion...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: A conclusion.

Commissioner Mena: As the person who sponsored this...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: Was some version of what was suggested by the tenants at 814.

Commissioner Quesada: Can you be -- can you just -- yes, be specific about it.

Commissioner Mena: To me, the best option I've heard -- but, you know, if somebody has a better one, I'm open ears -- was to have it be residential parking -- permitted parking during business hours, whatever we define that as...

Commissioner Quesada: During business hours?

Commissioner Mena: Excuse me, during non-business hours.

Commissioner Quesada: Yeah.

Commissioner Mena: And to be open to the...

Vice Mayor Keon: (INAUDIBLE)

Commissioner Mena: Businesses during business hours.

Commissioner Quesada: Alright, so I have a question.

Commissioner Lago: But, can I ask -- before the -- can we just -- what about this? Why don't we table this issue, and I'll tell you why. Not because I don't want to find a resolution today, but because Director Kinney brought something up that I want to -- I don't even know what he's

talking about. He said that they're potentially going to cut a deal that could resolve this issue. I'd like to sit down with Mr. Kinney, because he doesn't want to discuss this in the open right now...

Commissioner Mena: Fair enough.

Commissioner Lago: Because it's a sensitive issue, and kind of see what the resolution is and then bring it before...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Is that okay with you?

Commissioner Mena: Well, fair enough, except I would say, why don't we go back to the status quo we've had for nine years while he does that, instead of the new scenario that's only been the case for six months? Why don't we go back to what we've been doing for nine years, without such an urgent emergency problem while we resolve that?

Commissioner Lago: And, I'll tell you the other reason why maybe I'd like to wait on that also is because I want to sit down and I want to talk to the residents. I haven't talked to the residents on this issue.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, but they're here.

Commissioner Lago: No, well, the business owners are here. The business owners. I want to also hear the other side of the residents and see why we moved in this direction; what were their concerns. What was -- I know what's going on at 814 Ponce. I visit that building all the time. So, I need to speak to the residents to see what were their main concerns and maybe we can tweak it one way or another and find common ground. I think that's what I'd like to see. But I mean, again, it's your item so...

Commissioner Quesada: We can vote it up or we can vote it down.

Vice Mayor Keon: I mean, it's the same thing that happened with the Gables -- or the Riviera health facility -- rehab facility is along Sunset, they don't provide employee parking, so the employees park on the swales all up and down Sunset and then back into the neighborhoods, into High Pines. One, because it's Unincorporated Dade and nobody is monitoring parking on people's swales in residential areas, because the businesses weren't required to park their employees.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let's bring this to a conclusion. Make a motion and, you know, we'll...

Commissioner Mena: Listen, again, my suggestion -- I'm going to be respectful of Mr. Lago's request that we can hold off on a final decision, but my request would be...

Commissioner Lago: Let's put a timeline on it.

Commissioner Mena: No, no.

Commissioner Lago: Next meeting.

Commissioner Mena: No, no, no, but my request would still be...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Make a -- let's bring this to a close.

Commissioner Mena: My request would still be, if we're going to do that, let's go back to the status quo as that's been for at least the last nine years while you figure out or cut whatever deal it is you're discussing, which I'm not familiar with, so that at least in the interim, things are the same as they've been for nine years, probably during the time that most of those residents moved into those homes and that was free parking when they did so.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: That's your motion. Is there a second?

Commissioner Lago: Kevin, is -- can you tell me why this change happened -- very briefly, in a minute.

Parking Director Kinney: Because, there were residents who said they came home, couldn't park on their street. They had to go a block or two away. And, I would say...

Commissioner Lago: When you say came home -- let's address it. When you say came home, 12 o'clock for lunch, 5 o'clock?

Parking Director Kinney: No.

Commissioner Lago: I want to know.

Parking Director Kinney: Not only -- there's all the constituencies that the Vice Mayor talked about, but there's also a number of people in North Ponce who are retired, no longer have a job. So, they're looking for parking during the day.

Commissioner Quesada: So...

Parking Director Kinney: When I've counted, it's 8 to 10 vehicles in the residential zone.

Commissioner Quesada: I feel like we need to land this plane.

Commissioner Mena: Yeah, let me make it more clear. I'll be more clear.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, please.

Commissioner Mena: Here's my...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Let's finish this.

Commissioner Mena: Here's my proposal, and if somebody doesn't agree with it...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Go ahead.

Commissioner Mena: They can vote against it and it can come up another time. But, my proposal is...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Go ahead.

Commissioner Mena: To adopt what the -- most of the individuals from 814 suggested, which is, during business hours, for it to be open and available to their customers and employees and whoever needs to use it, and after business hours -- as defined by Mr. Kinney -- it will be residential permitted parking.

Commissioner Quesada: I will second that motion if we get a -- I want to either see this at the next Commission meeting, so we have some more clarity so we have a little bit -- moving forward...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, and the residents here.

Commissioner Quesada: So, if -- again, so that it's a temporary thing, that's the way I'll support it, if it's going to come back at the next meeting.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay, the motion has been made and seconded. Will you call the roll, please?

Vice Mayor Keon: But, okay, with the caveat that this is only until it...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Next Commission meeting.

Vice Mayor Keon: It comes back, the next Commission meeting. So, it's really a...

Commissioner Quesada: Correct.

Vice Mayor Keon: Delay. It's not a solution.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Commissioner Quesada: Correct.

Parking Director Kinney: There will be a large number of residents, I believe.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Very good.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay, at the next Commission meeting.

Parking Director Kinney: At the next meeting.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Vice Mayor Keon: I mean, I'll support you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Will you call the roll, please?

City Attorney Leen: Just -- Mr. Kinney...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, come on, come on, come on.

City Attorney Leen: I just...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Call the roll.

Vice Mayor Keon: What?

City Attorney Leen: Well, I want to know, can he do it? I mean, you're asking for a temporary measure. Are you able to do that?

Parking Director Kinney: I can remove the signs.

City Attorney Leen: Can you meet these goals?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes.

City Attorney Leen: Okay.

Vice Mayor Keon: Or just not enforce...

Parking Director Kinney: If I...

Vice Mayor Keon: For the moment.

Parking Director Kinney: Yeah.

Commissioner Quesada: Could we put a bag over the signs?

Commissioner Lago: Yeah, but I -- it's not just removing the signs. I don't want to have a (INAUDIBLE) and a thousand emails. Okay, we're getting enough emails with debris removal. Just can we at least notify the residents that in two weeks we're going to have this discussion again at the Commission?

Parking Director Kinney: I absolutely -- and I...

Commissioner Lago: Let's do that.

Parking Director Kinney: And, I know this is going to probably cause calls to me from the folks on Calabria who have their petition in, and they'll want to know what's going on. So, I will tell them that it's under consideration.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. Will you call the roll, please?

Vice Mayor Keon: Yes. Commissioner Lago: Yes. Commissioner Mena: Yes. Commissioner Quesada: Yes. Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes. (Vote: 5-0)

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you very much.