



EXCERPT-AV2019-002

CORALGABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
Thursday, January 19, 2017 Meeting, 4:00 p.m.
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida 33134

Historical Resources & Cultural Arts

2327 SALZEDO STREET
CORAL GABLES
FLORIDA 33134

305.460.5093
hist@coralgables.com

Table with columns for MEMBERS and dates (F 16, M 16, A 16, M 16, J 16, J 16, A 16, S+ 16, S 16, O 16, N 16, D 16, J 17) and rows for members: Janice Thomson, Venny Torre, Elizabeth Ghia, Alejandro Silva, Alicia Bache-Wiig*, John Fullerton, Robert Parsley, Margaret Rolando, Albert Menendez.

APPOINTED BY: Mayor Jim Cason, Vice-Mayor Frank Quesada, Comm. Jeannett Slesnick, Comm. Patricia Keon, Comm. Vince Lago, Board-as-a-Whole, City Manager, City Commission, City Commission

LEGEND: A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; * = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member; - = No Meeting (lack of quorum); # = Late meeting arrival; S+ = Replacement August 2016 meeting

STAFF:

- Dona M. Spain, Historic Preservation Officer
Kara N. Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
ElizaBeth Guin, Historic Preservationist
Miriam Ramos, Deputy City Attorney
Jessica Keller, Assistant Director of Public Works specializing in Transportation and Sustainability

GUESTS: Wesley Castellanos, Alberto Alfaro, Antolin Cardenas, Monica Noguerol, Rob Brown, Fabiana De Luea.

RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:11 p.m. A quorum was present.

MINUTES: MEETING OF DECEMBER 15, 2016:

Mr. Silva made a motion to approve the minutes of the December 15, 2016 Board meeting as written. Mr. Menendez seconded the motion, unanimously approved by voice vote.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex-parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

DEFERRALS: None

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

DISCUSSION ITEM: Coral Gables Bike Trail as it connects to Red Road along Coral Way

Ms. Spain advised that neither Ms. Rolando nor Ms. Thomson had notified their intent to be absent and would likely arrive shortly.

Ms. Keller relayed the research and background of the project, detailing the inclusive area of the proposal to create a bicycle boulevard on Castile Avenue as part of the City's bicycle master plan. The purpose, she said, was to connect with

existing bicycle lanes on Red Road and connect them to Coral Way, including speed cushions and related signage along Castile Avenue. Ms. Keller sought feedback from the Board as part of the City's overall project process.

Board questions generated discussion particularly related to how changes to the historic area would affect the appearance and historic integrity. At the conclusion of discussion, Ms. Spain asked the Board to provide guidance to Ms. Keller about moving forward with the proposal. Board members encouraged quality signage design, appropriate for the historic area.

During the discussion, Ms. Rolando and Ms. Thomson arrived at the meeting

Mr. Silva made a motion to support installation of speed cushions and required but appropriate signage as discussed to the Castile Avenue bicycle boulevard design as the project moves forward, and to apply the same historic sensitivity to similar future City projects. Mr. Fullerton seconded the motion.

Voice vote: Ayes from seven of nine Board members; Ms. Thomson: nay; Ms. Rolando: abstention due to late meeting arrival.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATIONS:

CASE FILE LHD 2016-011 AND COA (SP) 2016-024:

Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 1223 Lisbon Street, legally described as Lot 29, Block 59, Coral Gables Granada Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 113 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is also requesting the issuance of an Accelerated Special Certificate of Appropriateness and design approval for additions and alterations to the residence and sitework.

Ms. Spain advised that this property was referred to the Board by the Board of Architects.

Ms. Guin comprehensively reviewed the property's extensively-researched and written report, made a part of the record in entirety. Augmenting the presentation were displays of location map views, photographs and drawings. At the conclusion of the presentation, she stated that the property was significant to the City's history based on its architectural significance and voiced staff's recommendation of a motion to approve Local Historic Designation for the property at 1223 Lisbon Street.

Mr. Torre invited comments from the audience. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Mr. Silva made a motion to approve Local Historic Designation for the property at 1223 Lisbon Street. Ms. Ghia seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

Before proceeding with the application for a Special Certificate of Appropriateness, Ms. Spain distributed two pages missing from the Board's copy of the report and assured them the applicant received the entire report prior to the meeting. She advised the Board that staff recommended approval of the variance request regarding the width of the carport, and pointed out that staff's recommendation for approval of the design proposal and COA (SP) issuance was contingent upon numerous conditions to be reviewed after the presentation by project architect, Wesley Castellanos.

Mr. Castellanos introduced Ms. Noguero, the new property owner, stating it was her intention to restore the property to its original condition as well as to increase the size of the structure to accommodate family needs. He comprehensively reviewed photographs of the entire residence and described proposed restoration and design revisions. He described numerous meetings held with the Board of Architects and Historical Resources staff, and voiced agreement with all

conditions stipulated in the staff report. He reviewed the variance needed to reduce the width of the carport as part of the design proposal.

Ms. Spain advised that his overall application experience thus far had been lengthy and complex, but praised him and the owners for patience and cooperation. She reiterated staff's recommendation for approval of the variance, thereafter reviewing each of 15 staff conditions included in the report, with interspersed constructive comments from Board members relevant to the condition topic. Ms. Spain made a staff commitment to help the applicants resolve issues. During the continued review of the plans, Mr. Torre suggested design consideration of a balcony off the master bedroom in the rear of the property.

Regarding the staff condition to eliminate the proposed gate in the front wing wall, Mr. Castellanos said the owner wanted a gate in the front of the property to deter unwanted entry to the property. He and Board members discussed various options that could prevent the public from walking through to the rear of the property. Ms. Spain said a gate could be added to the porte cochere. Ms. Noguerol suggested a transparent gate. Mr. Torre indicated that a small, three-to-four foot high, thin wrought iron gate might be appropriate. Ms. Rolando pointed out that the opening was large, and said gates might be overpowering. She suggested putting a gate on the carport where it would be more recessed, less intrusive. Mr. Torre observed that gates on the carport would need to open outward to provide sufficient room for a car to fit inside. Ms. Spain favored a delicate, thin wrought iron gate. Mr. Castellanos confirmed his agreement with all other conditions.

Ms. Bache-Wiig questioned the awnings in the original photograph; however, Mr. Castellanos advised that this area was proposed to become a foyer. Ms. Spain said staff was agreeable to either include or not include awnings. Mr. Silva agreed with the general conditions as well as Mr. Torre's comments regarding the gate. Referencing item 12 on the list of staff conditions, he expressed preference for squaring off the arch to the terrace on the south elevation. Ms. Spain agreed. He suggested differentiating the historic structure from the new addition in the following locations: carport decorative elements don't need to be exactly replicated; the step configuration on the arches; the cornice rounded element could be more flat or squared off; and an element on new windows could be differentiated from the original. Mr. Torre added that that fence details in the gate elevations appeared different. He said the elements needed to be consistent, and advised the architect to work with staff to determine the best and consistent design solution. Mr. Castellanos agreed.

Mr. Fullerton made a motion to approve the design proposal for the alterations and additions to the building at 1223 Lisbon Street and issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness, including staff and Board recommendations made during discussion. Mr. Silva seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Menendez, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve granting a variance to allow the minimum width of the proposed carport to be approximately 9' vs. the minimum width of a carport shall be 12'-0" as required by Section 5-1402(A)(5) of the Coral Gables Zoning Code. Mr. Fullerton seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE LHD 2016-021: 

Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 711 University Drive, legally described as Lot 11 & S ½ of Lot 10, Block 137, Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Six, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 20, at Page 1 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Kautz comprehensively reviewed the property and its history (detailed in a lengthy staff report, made a part of the meeting record) as she displayed a location map and numerous photographs and drawings. She said the structure designed by renowned architect Phineas Paist presented "the rarefied interpretation of the Mediterranean Revival style on a grand