

**City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting
Agenda Item – Miracle Mile & Giralda Streetscape Project
August 27, 2015
Special City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL**

City Commission

**Mayor Jim Cason
Commissioner Pat Keon
Commissioner Vince Lago
Vice Mayor Frank Quesada
Commissioner Jeannett Slesnick**

City Staff

**City Manager, Cathy Swanson-Rivenbark
City Attorney, Craig E. Leen
City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman
Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia
Assistant City Manager, Carmen Olazabal
Public Works Director, Glenn Kephart
Historic Preservation Officer, Dona Spain**

Public Speaker(s)

**Earl Jackson, AIA, Partner Cooper Robertson
Robert A. Parsley A.S.L.A., Principal, Landscape Architect, Geomantic Designs, Inc.
Unidentified Speaker 2
Jaime Correa, Professor, School of Architecture University of Miami and B.I.D. Consultant
Marina Foglia, Executive Director of the Business Improvement District (B.I.D.)
Burton Hersh, Chairman, Business Improvement District**

Agenda Item [9:40:22 a.m.]

Mayor Cason: Good morning everyone, the August 27th Workshop on Miracle Mile and Giralda Avenue Streetscape. Mr. City Attorney, you want to lead us off.

City Attorney Leen: Yes, thank you Mr. Mayor. Before we begin there were a few things I wanted to say and then also there were a couple small items we wanted to address before we got into the larger question of design. This first issue is, today is a workshop; it's focused on Miracle Mile design. In addition, two other items related to the streetscape; one the special assessment, there is a small resolution related to that, and also one related to the contractor at-risk, pardon me, the construction manager at-risk. When we get into the issue of design, the Mayor has issued certain procedural rules for today's hearing. First, there will be a time for public comment at the end. It will be about ten minutes; the Mayor has discretion to extend it, if he wishes. Now one issue though is that will only be on the issue of design of Miracle Mile, what's discussed today. The Mayor has already issued a procedural ruling that any issue related to the bike path on Miracle Mile, the request for that or the debate over that, in his view has already been decided. So he has ruled that out of order, any discussion related to that. That would require a vote of three Commissioners for that to be discussed. So at this point that is out of order. I just want to make sure everyone knows that. Otherwise though if the comments are on design, please feel free to speak and it's the Mayor's discretion as to how long each person can speak. So with that I'd like to bring up the first resolution, if it's OK Mr. Mayor. That is a resolution of the City Commission of the City of Coral Gables, Florida relating to the provision of the Miracle Mile Improvement Project and Giralda Avenue Improvement Project, amending Resolution Nos. 2014-169 and 2014-171, relating to the collection of the assessments imposed in the Miracle Mile assessment area and Giralda Avenue assessment area, and providing for an effective date. What this item does is it delays by one year the beginning of the assessment area for Miracle Mile, there is a special assessment on Miracle Mile delayed by one year, starting to collect that assessment, because the construction has been delayed. So the thinking was we wanted to wait one year before we had people starting to pay, and it would be 20 years from then. So, I think that, that's something people would probably like, but we had to bring it to you because we had to change the date in the resolution. The Finance Director is here if you have any questions.

Mayor Cason: Any discussion? I think we made it clear in the beginning when we approved it, would be two years after we started construction, so it seems logical to me.

Commissioner Lago: Yes, we want to do everything in our power, I imagine the rest of the Commission agrees, that we want to do everything in our power during this tough transition to make sure that we alleviate the end-user as much as possible, so I'm in favor 110 percent on this issue.

Mayor Cason: Do I have a motion then?

Commissioner Lago: I'll make the motion.

Commissioner Keon: I'll second it.

Mayor Cason: Commissioner Lago makes the motion, Commissioner Keon seconds. City Clerk.

Commissioner Keon: Yes

Commissioner Lago: Yes

Commissioner Slesnick: Yes

Mayor Cason: Yes

(Vote: 4-0)

City Attorney Leen: Now Mr. Mayor on Item A-3, I would ask the Public Works Director and the Assistant City Manager, is the thinking to do this after?

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: After.

City Attorney Leen: OK. So with that Mr. Mayor, I'll turn it over to you for the workshop.

Mayor Cason: Carmen do you want to lead the discussion?

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: Yes.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: And before she begins, I just really want to personally thank her for all the leadership and coordination that she's provided. This is a very important project. The community has talked about Miracle Mile and the sidewalks for more than 30 years, and it's coming together, not only because of the support of staff and its talents, the outside consultant, the leadership of the Commission and the involvement of the community. But I just wanted to personally thank her.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: Thank you, appreciate it. So good morning, for the record I'm Carmen Olazabal, your Assistant City Manager for operations, and we are here today to discuss a project that is very dear to all of our hearts, the Miracle Mile and Giralda Avenue Streetscape Project. With me today is Public Works Director, Glenn Kephart and our design team of Cooper Robertson, which include Earl Jackson, Bill Kensworthy, who just came from vacation you can tell by the tan on his face, Alex Cooper and the staff consultants which include Robert Parsley, the landscape architect and Ivan from Rodriguez and Quiroga and the rest is Coastal Systems International, Inc. their civil engineer, and he is on his way. In addition, we also have Ramon Castillo, he is from Stantec and he's been advising the City on drainage and permitting on matters regarding this project. Oh, and we also have our contractor, our construction manager at-risk from Ric-Man International Inc., and with that we'll start the presentation. The agenda for today includes a project overview; the project overview will have design review, we'll open up for discussions and then we'll talk about what are the next steps needed to move the project forwarded. Project Overview: Miracle Mile and Giralda Avenue Project is the result of decades of community visioning. When completed it will transform the public realm to create civic prominence that will become focal points in the region. Miracle Mile will include a 50 percent wider pedestrian environment with extensive landscaping, trees, sidewalk, public art, lighting and inviting street furnishings. Giralda will become a spectacular shared pedestrian environment, whereas Commissioner Keon referred to in a recent e-mail, a delightful....that you will encounter as you are strolling through the streets of Coral Gables. The transformed environment will include creative and artful pavers, lighting and landscaping. It is anticipated that Miracle Mile and Giralda Avenue will become world renowned streets, and a must place to visit in the region. So where are we currently? After decades of community planning, discussion, and

dialogue, Miracle Mile has successfully moved along from conceptual phase to design/development phase. Through this process we have worked very closely with the community and with the steering committee. Our steering committee consists of members that represent the business district, Miracle Mile and Giralda, as well as the community as-a-whole. I wanted to take some time to acknowledge our steering committee members, they had dedicated countless hours to move this design forward, and we have some of them in the audience, I just wanted to recognize them. We have Dr. Chuck Bohls...

Commissioner Slesnick: Could we have them stand up so we can identify people.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: Absolutely. If you could stand up. We also have Judge Gelfman, we have Dr. Chuck Bohls, the University of Miami, we have Victor Richards, we have Judge Gelfman, who is representing...who is in our steering committee. In addition, we have Wayne Eldridge, we have Marina Foglia, we have George Cooperman, Carlos Rossi, and Mike Sotelo, and Glenn and myself, who are part of that.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Excuse me Carmen, just for the Commission's knowledge. The whole steering committee met last night in great detail, so if you see a few of their representatives, last night we kept them for several hours.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: We had a very good discussion yesterday. We have also worked very closely with the Commission to move this project along and I really wanted to thank you all, because you have been very dedicated and committed to this project throughout the whole process. So thank you very much for your time. And as you can see from the next slide, we have had a total of 11 Commission meetings, 9 steering committee meetings, and 5 public meetings, and that's included the one we had yesterday and the one we are having today, and we will continue to have public meetings to make sure that we get this project right. This project is now at a critical stage. What we need to define is the specific details to be able to move the project forward and go into finalizing construction documents. In this workshop we will discuss key defined elements to ensure we gather details right in a way that accurately represents

the special environment that our community has envisioned through decades of community visioning. So during this meeting the team of Cooper Robertson and our consultants will represent the design elements of the project. We will then discuss the elements that should be included in the construction documents and then we'll discuss what the next steps we need to take to move this project into the construction phase. And with that I'm going to pass it to the Cooper Robertson team, so that they can walk us through the different design elements.

Earl Jackson: Thank you Carmen and thank you Commission for your time today and your attention to the project that we've been working on for the past eight months or so. Design Review: Its worth saying up front that we are focusing on Miracle Mile and Giralda Avenue, but that this is a major artery, it's in the downtown and that all the streets in between are going to be affected by this work and foot traffic. We recognize the role that both of these streets play in the larger context of the City. The project comes from an agreement that was made to transfer diagonal parking to parallel parking to increase the width of the sidewalk by up to eight feet, and potentially use some of that space for parking as you do. And the transfer of that and the design to date, we are looking at a number of parking spaces that are being lost, obviously; I think you have a number of plus or minus 94-96 spaces that are going to change. It's looking at increased capacity for valet and a total net gain in parking in the parking garages around the Mile of up to 500 more than you have today. So those are some of the things that will change in the face of the project and we think that they are all good changes. Today we are talking about design details, design character, we'll be talking about stone, elements in the streetscape, and we'll start with Miracle Mile itself. With that expansion of the sidewalk and the area that's been created when you add planting, when you add trees, when you add furniture, you are probably picking up close to three-quarters of an acre of usable, programmable public space that cafes, restaurants, and shops can start to activate and use in ways that you haven't had the opportunity to do before. In April we presented a schematic design and had a public meeting at 204 Miracle Mile, had a great turnout. There is a mockup which still stand today, which shows the extension of curb and it gives you a sense of what parallel parking would be like with that expanded seating area. And this rendering was the water color that we put together to start to show some of the characteristics that we were developing at that time. The things we've been working with mostly

come from a place, they come from the people we've talked to, they've come from the genetics of the street. Miracle Mile has rhythm, a poetic rhythm that begins and ends at Douglas Plaza and LeJeune Plaza. There is a series of big punctuation marks at the north/south crossing streets at Salzedo, at Ponce, and Galiano; and then the mid-block crossings play a very key role in the rhythm of Miracle Mile in that they shorten the length between intersections, so that people can cross more frequently, which is essential for a retail environment to succeed, the mid-block cross-walks. We are going to talk about a number of typical conditions; the plazas at the ends, we are showing an image on the left of paving pattern. So LeJeune Plaza is shown on the left, as a typical condition for plaza area, the mid-block crossing is shown in the middle, and street intersections are shown on the right. Things of note in these three diagrams are paving pattern and color, use of planting in the ground plane, and permanent street furniture aspects, which are some of the round pieces and squiggly pieces that you see moving through. I'll describe those in greater detail as we get into the show. We'll start with paving, because the general character of the place is going to come from that paved surface as much as anything else. We've talked at length through a number of different conversations about creating a timeless design; and timeless is both in concept and in materiality. So we gravitated toward capturing the magic of the southern Florida skies, the deep blues, the pearl white clouds, and the way that they play a role in the character, place and climate of the place in Coral Gables. We found places where that sky was brought into the pavement through puddling and said, well couldn't we bring it into the pavement in a more permanent way and make it the character of this new street. Our task at the beginning of this project was to create a street that was unlike any other in the world, which is a great ambitious statement, and we are trying to work at that in many ways that are creative and flexible, so that we can meet your schedule and budget and create a place that's of Coral Gables as opposed to some foreign implant design. The five big things we are trying to do: strengthen the identity of Miracle Mile as Coral Gables premiere public place; create a social and retail environment that's more competitive in the region. We did a study that looked at all of the other places in the area, outreaching as Aventura Mall and questioned why people are going there. How can we capture more of that foot traffic and more of those bodies that activate and enliven Coral Gables and the downtown? To design a streetscape whose character is among the world's best is what I just mentioned, use authentic materials that are resilient. There are a number of

places around town where you can see materials that feel like they have a sense of permanence that weather terribly under UV conditions and under the daily use of heavy foot traffic that you would see in the Central Business District. So resilient materials are really key, a key factor in the way that we've looked at this. And then timing with a concept. Can we create an experience that rivals a walk in the clouds? We did a sky study from a rooftop in March and set up a series of cameras and watched the sky change from sunrise to sunset; and we looked at and learned from cloud patterns and sky colors and things like that. And the pure concept was strengthened by that event. What we've done is we've created a flexible approach, we don't have a whole blue sidewalk, but you have blues and whites and grays that emulate that changing sky that you live with day-to-day, so that you are not committed to a full blue street, which may have been more of a one-liner; this is a much more dynamic approach. The paving pattern: This was a slide we put together to show the different kinds of stones we are exploring. We feel like we're fairly close to having exactly the right stones picked for the project and there are a couple of reasons that we are studying the darker gray at the moment, we can talk about that. And I have samples here, if you haven't seen them then you can get up and look at and pieces that we can pick up and move around, so you can get a sense of what that stone. We are finding an amazing blue stone from Brazil called Macaruba, and we are working with innovative ways of using that stone to bring the price down as low as you possibly can get, because to use great stone like this in a public project is a challenging thing to do and I think we are at a point where this is a successful venture.

Mayor Cason: They are going to be smaller blocks or larger blocks?

Earl Jackson: They are smaller blocks. The block size is a great question; the block size is six by six, and what six by six does, a six by six by two, so it's about two inches thick and stone they measure in centimeters, so it's a five centimeter-plus stone thickness. At that size its virtually indestructible piece of material as it becomes more expansive it becomes more susceptible to heavy point loads creating fractures or deformations in the stone. So one is the resilience of the material it's based on that size; two) in order to source it, if you were to look up the same stone and try to buy it as a slab for your kitchen countertop, you'd get a price that was exponentially

higher than the price we are getting. So we are able to use parts of the quarry that are much more cost effective by keeping the unit size down as well. So the whole design is flexible in order to achieve a lot with the means that we have.

Mayor Cason: Are you planning to keep a larger reserve of stones as they could break or tree roots could lift them up or whatever?

Earl Jackson: There is discussion about a reserve of stone. Typically the order on a stone project is anywhere from maybe 8 to 10 percent over what the measured area of the project is, because it's possible that things get damaged in shipping or any of those kinds of things. So, I expect we'll have a reserve, the amount of reserve we have is not yet been determined, but the idea is to have enough so that if we need additional stone for maintenance, reasons we have it, and a couple sizes, I'm going to tell you a little bit more about other areas of the stone and why we'd have reserve for that. We've been in this meeting and in others talking about the maintenance of stone, you get a high quality stone, how do you keep it clean?- how do you keep it looking great? We know that gum and oil are major concerns in terms of the character and quality of the place. So we've done a little homework and talked to a number of people, there is probably a day-to-day maintenance program at some collaboration between the City and the bidder going to develop in order to maintain a place more routinely. If not, there are techniques using dry ice blasters that work really well in terms of getting gum off the sidewalk. You are asking for the silver bullet before – I'll send you a YouTube link to the video that shows the sky. At the top right hand corner you see all the gum, at the bottom it's all gone; the middle, the guy is actually blasting and then it comes right off. I thought that you might like to see that.

Mayor Cason: Can I ask you one question on reserves. We had talked with the Mediterranean Village about connecting their project to this. Have you had any discussions with them about using any of these materials or is that something that's going to come later?

Earl Jackson: Today we have not talked to the Mediterranean Village about the project, but if that's something you'd like us to do we can certainly undertake that. The design pattern for this

is coming from again, the concept of bringing the sky into the ground plane, and the ability to have more or less blue is actually the flexible part of this. So that we are sure we are on budget for the project. So we have the highest amount of blue we can get, we have great amount of cloud, white and grays, and we've developed a strategy where that sky and blue fits into the primary walking area of Miracle Mile, and if you think about being out there today, there is a little slot of sky that exist between the trees and the storefronts. In architecture we draw reflected ceiling plans to design ceilings. We think of public spaces having a ceiling, in your condition it's defined by that tree and that corner sign. So we are actually creating a mirrored version of the sky and the place where you walk, hence trying to get to that effect of a walk in the clouds and a sense of weightlessness which we think is going to be very cool and expressive for the project.

Commissioner Lago: Could I ask you just a quick question? I know we may have discussed it when we met about a month ago. In reference to the blue – one of my biggest concerns is the potential for five to ten years that the blue match may fade. What is your opinion in regards to that material? I've never seen that material installed, so I'm not aware of if there would be potentially be a fading issue.

Earl Jackson: We've been working on the blue stone, I would say the first conversations I had about blue stone were late in January, just to figure out. OK, is this within the realm of possibility, and we've been working hard on trying to determine which is the right blue stone, and which is an affordable blue stone, which is the most durable blue stone. We've gone through a number of studies where there are African blue stones which will turn brown as they oxidize, there are Scandinavian blue stones which are a heavy gray and speckled and probably not the right character. For this Macauba, it's a granite quartzite and it's very hard and it's expected to change very little over time, and we've talked to a number of stone experts on that matter. I have a good friend in Los Angeles who is kind of like the world renowned stone guru; he's been helping with this. I have a local guy in Naples whose been helping us source it, and on Tuesday and Wednesday next week I'm actually going to the quarry to check on the quality of the stone, to look at how they are pulling it out of the ground, to make sure that they have the

quantity we need, and to make sure that they are able to deliver it within the project schedule that we've been talking about.

Commissioner Lago: The proposed finished look, Mayor, would be in your opinion, would not obviously be a polish, it would be honed.

Earl Jackson: It's a honed finish.

Mayor Cason: And is this being used in sidewalks anywhere in the world?

Commissioner Lago: And in reference to – we had discussed this before and I'm not sure if this is the same sample that we looked at. How about scratch resistant?- because the last thing we want to see is a beautiful stone like this all marked up and chipped. What are we talking about in regards to the make-up of the actual stone?

Earl Jackson: So on two fronts, you asked about the finish and its durability. The finish as you see it, if you were to order it for your countertop it would be a very bright blue. The color comes down on this because in order to take the slip resistance down and make sure that its entirely safe you blast it, and then this is blasted and then brushed, and the brushing helps bring back some of the color, so we are still getting a good blue. If you wet your thumb and put a mark on it you'll see how that color will actually change when it rains. So when it rains it's going to get more vibrant, so there is some kind of really nice reverberation about the color change in response to that, your question is about scratching and durability, because it's a quartzite and granite its exceptionally hard. You are always going to get the opportunity in the public realm for things to get nicked and marked. We think that most of those are going to be able to clean off, but it's really, really, it's like one of the hardest stones we can get.

Commissioner Lago: It's really resilient, very resilient.

Commissioner Keon: Its granite. You know what, where is it in Vermont where they have all the quarries, the granite quarries?

Earl Jackson: In Danby, Vermont it was the country's first quarry.

Commissioner Keon: In a lot of those small towns they have granite sidewalks. It's not that color, because that's not their granite, but their granite sidewalk all over those, but those towns have, a lot of them have granite sidewalks.

Mayor Cason: And all over Brazil of course has Cococobana, they have those kinds of stone designs everywhere. The nice things about these small sizes are that should there be scratches, pull them out and put another one in.

Earl Jackson: Exactly – or even just take – you can pull a piece out. Let's say something crazy happens and it actually gets gashed, the force and the weight that would gash a piece of stone like that would have to be tremendous, but let's say it happened. You can pull it out and you can reblast it and rebrush it and put it back in. So the stone is five centimeters thick or more. You are going to have a tremendous amount of opportunity to repair the actual stone. You wouldn't have to replace it, so the quantity is not as big a thing. So in relationship to stone, one of the things that have been discussed is how it meets private property? If you are out on the Mile today, the sense of sidewalk is actually bigger than the right-of-way, because there are so many setbacks and alcoves and areas where that public realm feels, the private area feels like the public realm. We measure, if we don't count the paseos, it's about 23,000 square feet of area between the right-of-way line and the building line in our surveys. We've been working with City staff and a team to identify those areas on the Mile that are most visually connected to the public realm, and we can take that number from 23,000 square feet to just under 9,000 square feet, 8,000-plus, and we've got a strategy for putting paving in those areas to maintain the character throughout, so it doesn't feel like a strip of new stuff and then everybody else's old. I think there are a number of negotiations in the discussions happening right now at the City and the B.I.D. and property owners to sort of clarify how that works. I can show you visually, if we were to put paving in just

to the property line. In this slide you can see the yellow dashed out line is the property line, the paving pattern on the left – the area that you see to the right of the property line is private, but feels like its public. So that 8,000 square feet would cover the majority of those major setbacks, so the sidewalk would feel continuous to the physical line of the building in the majority of cases.

Mayor Cason: What's the idea on that example, say the owner did not want this our paving there, we wouldn't put it?- or are we going to negotiate, we will pay for it and put it in?

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: We've been working with the City Attorney's office with the idea is to treat that area as a construction easement area where we will be doing the work as part of one project, and with discussions with the City Attorney, but basically we are able to do that as part of the project and just build it.

Commissioner Keon: It's included in the cost estimates that we will already have?

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: We have preliminary cost estimates that were done by Atkins, who is the staff consultant for Cooper Robertson, and it includes that easement area.

Commissioner Keon: So there is not an extra charge to the property owner, is that right?

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: Not for the area...

Commissioner Lago: The setback.

Commissioner Keon: The setback to the storefront.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: Beyond the property line.

Commissioner Keon: To the storefront.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: The line of sight.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: There are indentations that this does not include.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: It doesn't include...[inaudible]

Commissioner Keon: That's the entrance into the store, that's not what we are talking about; we are talking about to the storefront.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: That's the current....

Commissioner Lago: If you look at the previous slide that you showed, I think it would be a travesty if we didn't do this the right way. In my opinion, the right way is to include the setback, because it's so many years waiting for this project and put yourself in a position that way right now. I know there may be additional costs, but I think we really need to make sure that we make the right decision on that.

Earl Jackson: The discussion we've been having to date on that has been focused on the fact that we do recognize its private property and of course some tenants they have made investments in the character of their front door, so certain places have made investments, others are historic. The theater for instance, has amazing terrazzo pizzo, there is a sensitive way of dealing with it on a case-by-case basis to understand what the needs and desire are of each property owner, and I think that we are just beginning to get to point where those discussions are being had.

Commissioner Lago: Are those discussions are they being had with Dona right now?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Dona has been instrumental in this whole process and historic and what to do.

Mrs. Spain: We've identified the historic properties; particularly Miracle Mile from day one, there was a concern because they had just done that realm around the terrazzo a few years ago, and so we are keeping that and also the other historic properties.

Commissioner Keon: For the theater.

Mrs. Spain: For the theater.

Mayor Cason: But for example, if the owner – we went up to the right hand yellow line and if the owners said, I would really like to have it extended, we will work with them...

Commissioner Lago: In reference to the setback or the alcoves?

Mayor Cason: The alcove.

Commissioner Keon: The entrance into the store.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: We haven't started the alcoves process, we are working with...[inaudible – off mic]...we are planning on having a conversation with the property owners, but the idea is that they don't have the ability to extend it if they want it...they have to permit it and then have to pay for the cost...

Commissioner Lago: Just want to be clear on this, so I don't want there to be any ambiguous understanding in reference to where we stand as a Commission. The setback is included in the pricing that the City will pick up, correct?- as per our general agreement, our construction CM agreement? The only question in pricing would be the alcoves.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal:...We only have estimates.

Commissioner Lago: No, no. I understand.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: We only have estimates so we don't...but the estimate right now includes what we are calling the setback...does not include the alcoves.

Commissioner Lago: And I bring that up because that was a lively discussion item yesterday. I want to be very, very clear on that. Like the Mayor was saying, if we can discuss with the owners and we can explain to them the benefit of potentially incorporating the alcoves in the project, it just makes the project so much more beautiful, in my opinion again.

Mayor Cason: I agree.

Commissioner Keon: Are we going to have a discussion with regard to the storefronts and what is historic at the end of this we'll talk about that?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: We have some information, we don't have the information that identifies each of the properties that may have a setback, additional setback issue, but I believe the best way for us to resolve that is hear the intention of the Commission and then on a case-by-case basis go in and see how we can resolve that.

Commissioner Keon: OK. Thank you. We'll talk about that at the end.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: I just want to provide Commissioner Lago assurances that this project is the City realm. In addition to that setback area, which we are identifying as a construction easement, because that's what gives you that bold wide sidewalk. We have not resolved the issue on the alcove, the intent of ordering more stone so that if individual property owners want to join, we'll make it as easy as possible. We haven't solved all of that yet. But yes sir, you asked specifically, does it include up to through the setback, and this plan does.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you for clarifying. But I just want to make sure like the Assistant City Manager stated that the alcoves and what Commissioner Keon mentioned, the storefronts

that we start discussing that now, because this project is going to move quickly now after this meeting, because you are talking about a resolution to enter into a CM agreement with a contractor. So we need to make sure that we speak to a lot of the owners that are in the room here.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: I believe I got an e-mail from Victor yesterday trying to set up a meeting...to discuss how we go about...so we are looking at that.

Commissioner Lago: I know you guys are moving quickly, this is my construction background, it gets the better of me.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: You are absolutely right. This is kind of the critical step.

Commissioner Lago: We are at a juncture right now.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: Right – we need to do this right now so we can...

Commissioner Lago: If we do it now it will cost less than doing it later.

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: Absolutely – and it is time critical to do it now.

Mrs. Spain: And the stones would match which is a concern. At the end of this meeting I can get up with a map and tell you exactly which properties are designated as historic.

Commissioner Keon: OK. At the end we can talk about that. OK.

Mrs. Spain: I'm happy to do that. I will just tell you that the north side of Miracle Mile, there is no designated properties other than the Colonnade.

Commissioner Keon: OK.

Mrs. Spain: That doesn't mean that they are not historically significant, because they have those 1940's storefronts, but they are not designated.

Commissioner Keon: OK. Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you Dona.

Earl Jackson: We brought a mix of the Helmsley Building, which is just on Broadway and New York City, as an example of the extension of paving from public into private or from private into public. If you look at this image from the building face to the curb is the same granite paver. These two images are the same plaza, the little yellow dashed line that you see in the slide is the difference between public and private, and if you look right there, there is small brass line and a little brass plate that calls out the fact that one side is public and one side is private. If you look a little deeper you see the drainage system for that plaza right here and the dark incline, a trench drain.

Commissioner Keon: That's a trench drain?

Earl Jackson: That's a trench drain. But it's a continuous material that moves from the building fact all the way to the curb. The landscape, I'm going to ask...

Commissioner Lago: Could you just go back to that slide in reference to trench drain. How long has that trench drain been replaced?

Earl Jackson: The building has been standing since I think the 60's.

Commissioner Lago: Did you look into the maintenance of the trench drain?- the effectiveness of the trench drain?- is it still in operable use?

Earl Jackson: For this I've never seen any problem here. Our office is just a few steps away. I used to live about four blocks from this location. I've never seen a problem. We have a drainage discussion that we can talk about it.

Commissioner Lago: Under a deluge if it actually worked efficiently.

Earl Jackson: I've never seen a problem with it. It is a big graphic mark across the thing and it's interesting to note that the public/private isn't the place where they put the line, because it just feels a bit more open that way. I think what would be important is this line in that little marker because it is private property. If people want to put tables and chairs, when you have a continuous paving you do need some register so that somebody can go out there and say, listen you are four feet over or two feet over.

Commissioner Slesnick: So we are having that delineation?

Earl Jackson: So you don't have the conflict at some point later down the road.

Commissioner Slesnick: We are going to have that on Miracle Mile?

Earl Jackson: Yes. We'll have a detail worked in, whether it's one line or a segment in a little plate. We have some ideas with some cool little coins that we could use. For landscape, Robert is going to help carry some of this discussion. I can start it – Robert if you want to come up, we can kind of talk through it together. I can tell you that the team has been out on site through, I don't know, at least three possibly four different tree assessment expeditions to look at what's out there, try and maintain as many of the trees as we possibly can. To date, this is our proposed plan for typical tree conditions between crosswalks and intersections. There are 95 trees out there that aren't at the crosswalks; 37 of which are existing trees that will remain exactly where they are, and Robert will walk you through exactly why and how those were selected and the reasons why it's good to keep them where they are and not try to move them. Twenty-three (23) exist at the new limit of the sidewalk creating two rows, and then another 35 we are putting in at the front

and back end of every two or three parking spaces to create a much more park-like experience than a single line of trees might get you. There are currently 107 oak trees on the Mile; many are not in great shape. The proposed design preserves 37. Overall, we are proposing 127 live oak and flowering trees on the Mile, so an increase in canopy trees is what is in the plan to date. The ones that remain in place, Robert maybe you can talk a little bit to this, are going to stay exactly where they are in sections. You can see the extent of the sidewalk moving outward from that creating more space; we'll walk around those trees on all sides.

Robert Parsley: I think the biggest question has been how we selected the oaks to stay and how we selected the ones that we are recommending to cut down and be removed. And we knew from the get-go this was going to be a public concern, hopefully not controversial, but a public concern. Let me start with a general statement, none of the trees are in great shape. All are one-sided, all of them have root problems, many of them have horticultural health problems, since they don't have enough nutrition they are a little bit off color, you'll see a lot of dead twigs in them. Those are all symptoms of growing in an urban environment, and all trees in an urban environment at some point hit a barrier, a size limitation where they are either dangerous to the public because they have lifted the pavement and we have that all over, but it's been mitigated over the years, but you can see where there are problems, or they just can't find new soil, new sources of water to actively grow. Roots have to find new material all the time; roots aren't static, they absorb their water nutrients from live tissue, that tissue hardens off and they continually growing, which is a problem with Bonzite trees or old pods that get root bound, they get circular and they eventually decline. So are these trees kind of at their limits?- you know these are 20-some odd year old trees, probably 25 year old trees, they've been in the ground over 20 and they were six inch trees when they first went in. So the criteria for which ones should stay and which ones should go, in the end was subjective. If we had an arborist out there to look at all the technical stuff, they'll likely all be eliminated. So we did it more which ones look structurally sound enough and healthy enough that we'll try to work with them. And then go back to the slide of the ones that...with Earl's team we looked at the soil pattern of which ones could stay in order to get some on each block on both sides of the block, and in a pattern where we could go in and

out and get rid of these soldiers lined up look of a typical boulevard street and get this more staggered park-like setting in the proposed plans here.

Mayor Cason: Let me ask you. The ones that you decided to stay, is there any risk that they'll die and you'll have to dig up the streets and put them in? You picked the ones that you are pretty sure will make it?

Robert Parsley: Well, we are going to make the assumption that if they are reasonably healthy looking now and vigorous, but they will continue to be, if they have found seeds in the sub-soil, deep water sources. There is no reason that I could predict that they are going to decline if they are seed vigorous in the last 15-20 years.

Mayor Cason: The ones that are not going to make it, are you planning to move them somewhere else or just cut them down?

Robert Parsley: Just cut them down is my recommendation.

Commissioner Slesnick: Is there any possibility of moving them? It's like a stray dog, you bring it in and you feed it and give it a bath and it looks a lot better. If we move them to Country Club Prado or something, I mean 70 trees is a lot to move.

Robert Parsley: If you took any one of these trees out of this linear setting against the building and stood it out on its own, you'd look at it yourself and go, cut that down. So when you take them out...

Commissioner Slesnick: I understand that, but I mean, it's like when you have a hurricane and the hurricane takes half a tree off, the tree grows back into that direction. So I hate cutting out 70 trees, and 20 years old is not old for an oak tree.

Robert Parsley: The trees that aren't doing well, aren't doing well for a reason, and primarily they've run out of soil...

Commissioner Slesnick: I understand that – and nutrients and so forth that I said it's just like feeding a dog again. You can revive things and I hate to see 70 trees cut down. They are not worth saving?

Robert Parsley: I don't think – I'm not saying that it can't be done. I'm saying that I'm recommending not doing it. These aren't strays, these are trees, we manage our trees, we are always replacing trees, there is a cycle of succession of trees that's normal for a City, so I don't think the analogy of the dog is quite similar, but I get it. I almost want to say these are one-legged, one ear, one eyed dogs, but that doesn't quite address the aspects of saving animals versus saving plants. We are not out running around trying to save agoras or the crotons...

Commissioner Slesnick: No.

Robert Parsley: And oaks and trees we have more of a sentimental feeling about. I have to morphsize them a little bit, but in truth these are not good candidates to move. Many have structural problems and I don't think they'll ever turn around to be good trees in that park place.

Commissioner Lago: Can I just ask a quick question on what the Commissioner is saying. Again, I would love if there was a possibility or an answer to moving the trees; we hate to see those beautiful trees go. What do you think will be the cost associated with potentially relocating those trees?- because from my understanding there is about a six-month to one year window, you have to water the trees and you have to monitor those trees, so what do you think the cost per tree just on average. I'm not going to hold you to it, to kind of get to a number what the additional cost would be to entertain what Commissioner Slesnick is saying?

Robert Parsley: I think you could be looking at \$6,000 to \$12,000 to move any one of these. I think there is a long term structural problem where you set them in a new location, all of them are kind of leaning, so now you've taken them somewhere, you have to brace them forever.

Commissioner Lago: \$6,000 to \$12,000 and also the trees...

Robert Parsley: And they are not warranted.

Commissioner Lago: The trees would have to be in their current location probably about four months for the root pruning to occur, and then you have to cut the tree down to basically just a stump, you have to cut all the limbs.

Earl Jackson: You've got to cut everything down to move it.

Robert Parsley: It's just not good candidates to move.

Mayor Cason: And think about the amount of money you would spend doing that, you could buy new ones. But it would be nice if some of them could be saved.

Commissioner Lago: How many trees, how many oaks are we talking about exactly?

Earl Jackson: Vince, we've gone from the initial assessment, I think we saved 16 trees.

Commissioner Slesnick: How many?

Earl Jackson: 16.

Commissioner Slesnick: 16.

Earl Jackson: 16 existing in place. We heard concern, we took another look, took another assessment, reconfigured like where we are creating opportunities for program on the sidewalk, reshuffled how trees land between parking spaces and got up to 23 or 26. Heard again that it still felt like it wasn't enough, went back again, added a few more that looked like, OK, these weren't the best candidates the first time, they weren't great candidates the second time, but we felt like they had a decent shot at staying where they were, and pushed that number up to 37. So we've gone through multiple iterations of how can we continually try and save more and more.

Commissioner Slesnick: And I appreciate that from when we first talked that you are saving a lot more trees than originally designated. I appreciate it. Thank you very much.

Earl Jackson: We are trying.

Commissioner Lago: In reference to the oaks what are we looking at that would be removed?- how many oaks would you say?

Commissioner Slesnick: 70?

Earl Jackson: I think its hovering around 70.

Mayor Cason: OK. Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you sir.

Earl Jackson: I have a couple graphics to just walk through the experience of it. Once you add two lines of trees you get the condition. Another thing is the design standpoint. If you kept them all where they were, you'd create a split sidewalk because that line would be maintained as rigorous, so you want to be able to get some of them out of those locations and move them to others. That's one of the things that putting the second line is at the new limit of the sidewalk achieves for you. When you add the third row and you get trees at the front and back ends of

cars, you now create a much more park-like experience, you narrow the roads, so you calm traffic, you slow vehicles down and you start the preference the pedestrian over the automobile a little bit more in the environment.

Commissioner Lago: And you also avoid what we currently have right now, which are those lob-sided trees...

Earl Jackson: Right – the ones that...

Commissioner Lago: That's been continuously pruned over so many years just to basically one-sided to avoid encroaching on the properties.

Earl Jackson: The further it is away from that building the more chance it has to be an evenly growing tree. We have a very preliminary rendering that shows those three rows of trees, the dark green, the bright green in the distance, and the yellow-green in the foreground, give you a sense of what that environment would feel like.

Vice Mayor Quesada: I said it before; I just want to say it again. I'm so excited for the tree setup here. It's almost like a park in a downtown being merged into one, which I think is perfect for Coral Gables. So that's it. Just saying thank you.

Earl Jackson: At the cross-sections we are adding a pink flowering tree to strengthen that north/south connection. In a retail environment the more you can get people moving north and south, back and forth, the more vibrant the stores are, also to create a more full canopy. One of the things we are doing is we are taking the trees in the median are palms today; we are taking the palm out and putting a flowering tree in, so that you have a connective canopy across.

Commissioner Lago: I would just like to say one thing about that Mayor. That to me, like what Vice Mayor said, I think this is one of the most important parts of the project for me, personally. Right now we have the palms, the palms are beautiful, but they don't provide really any shade

and you look down the Mile and you can see completely the entire Mile. This will make it look more like a forest, more like a park, more inviting. Whoever thought of that should be commended, because those simple six trees that we replace are going to really change and liven up the area.

Earl Jackson: I should have to give the credit to probably Robert for this.

Vice Mayor Quesada: As you are driving through, which is a nice part also those trees stand out.

Commissioner Lago: It's a great idea.

Mayor Cason: A question on the flowering trees, how many months are they going to flower? Do you have any kind of staggering that you'll have flowers all the time or just three months?

Commissioner Keon: Do they flower during different seasons or do they all flower the same time? Do we have trees like that in Florida that flower at different seasons?

Robert Parsley: We have all kinds of flowering trees.

Commissioner Keon: OK.

Robert Parsley: Pink was the color that was chosen, so among the pink there is really only three good ones. The pink tabebuia which is kind of a common tree and a few good bloomers, a lot of them are just sporadic, they are actually getting their fall bloom now. The silk floss which is like...Douglas by Denny's, that one is spectacular when it blooms....bloom twice a year, heavy spring bloom and a fall bloom.

Commissioner Keon: But in between is that tree naked?

Robert Parsley: That can be naked, yes. And then the third tree...

Commissioner Keon: You know what?- that's really not a pretty tree.

Robert Parsley:.... or the....the image of it...it actually has a field like that, unfortunately that's primarily a spring bloomer and it's probably the closest thing we have to a cherry blossom-like tree where you get a whole mass at once. Now the advantage of this one is not deciduous and it has really a lovely dapple, leaflet, shimmering kind of shade.

Commissioner Keon: Is there one over by the University of Miami?

Robert Parsley: Yes ma'am.

Commissioner Keon: That's that one, that's that tree? Boy, that tree is beautiful.

Mayor Cason: So the bottom line is it will be a mix of trees so there will always be some flowers there, it won't be green.

Robert Parsley: Like most flowering trees that have a prime time...So once a year this will be spectacular and then in the fall you'll have another little show, but there is almost no tree that stays like this...

Commissioner Keon: Right.

Robert Parsley: And the only little tree that I know is actually a shrub is...the little red thing, that blooms every day, but that's truly the exception.

Commissioner Keon: What is the name of that tree that is so pretty, that pink tree?

Robert Parsley: Cassia bakeriana.

Commissioner Keon: Cassia?

Robert Parsley: Bakeriana – *bakeriana*.

Commissioner Slesnick: Question. This is my favorite part too, because I've been in Coral Gables a lot this summer on Miracle Mile in 91 degree weather waiting for traffic lights to cross in the middle, I mean it is hot out there with no shade at the intersection. Do we have the drains provided near this to take care of all the flowers when they fall off so they don't block up? Are we having more drains?

Earl Jackson: We have a whole drainage section that we are going to walk you through in a couple of minutes and we can talk about other things.

Commissioner Slesnick: This is beautiful.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Commissioners think about the peak season and how we can wrap around really glorious events where people want to come because it's Miracle Mile in high bloom. The tree that you saw at the groundbreaking for the crossover at University of Miami that's that tree.

Commissioner Keon: That tree is just beautiful – beautiful tree. The silk floss trees are pretty when they are in bloom, but they don't bloom for very long and they don't bloom that much and it's really not a pretty tree when it's not in bloom.

Robert Parsley: Some people are concerned about the thorns.

Commissioner Keon: It's just not a pretty tree. It looks like it's kind of dying. It's not bad if it's in a park-like setting where there are a lot of other trees around it, so you don't notice it so much, but something that really is creating a vista, they really are not pretty. You'd think about that one?

Robert Parsley: Well right now the plans show the cassia bakeriana on the plans. The earlier plans showed the silk floss.

Commissioner Keon: OK, but not now. Oh great. OK.

Commissioner Lago: Could you do me a favor just for construction specifications. Can you ensure that there is a detailed breakout in reference to bio-barriers for when trees are planted, either the new ones or the proposed ones, because I want to make sure that we avoid the cost over-runs that are associated with having the individuals who go out there right now and they maintain the sidewalks or maintain the roots, you see them constantly cutting the roots because of the tripping hazard. The bio-barriers, I have installed them, they work, they are very effective, they push the roots down, so they basically avoid what you see currently on the Mile, which are the sidewalks being lifted or the roots going in a direction where they become an eventual tripping hazard.

Robert Parsley: Right now we have the root barriers, which is the mechanical device to push the root down. The bio-barriers has the little chemicals on them, which I have mixed feelings about that, and it only has to shove it, once the chemical is gone it doesn't work anymore it's still a physical barrier. But we do have that in the plans; the main things we have in the plans for the long term viability of these trees is extensive subsoil work with....structural soils, which have been elsewhere and other parts of the Gables.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Commissioner Keon: That's so pretty.

Robert Parsley: Giralda, if we talk about trees. I know there were some concerns about the tree selection there. The palms down the middle are going to be the date palms that were taken out of the median at the crosswalks, and they'll be transplanted to Giralda, then the two yellow, the

little section of Giralda, mid-right – those yellow trees we've looked at the yellow tabebuia, the golden trumpet, which is also a tabebuia. I have some concerns horticulturally on how well they'll do in a rock; a Bulnesia, I believe the City Manager had some concerns about those. I still think that's a tree we should consider.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: I love that tree. I have one in my backyard, it is just naked if it goes to 45 degrees, it drops every leaf and it is a very sensitive tree to storms.

Robert Parsley: It's a sub-tropical tree, so are the Geiger.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: I love it. I love it. We just need to look at how good it is over 15 and 20 years that was my concern.

Robert Parsley: The other tree and I like it for the shade pattern, it does have a little yellow flowers, the bridal barrel, which we've used on multiple streets, and the City actually has some primo ones on some of the multi-family by Douglas Entrance, Zamaro Street, Dan Keys planted some, 10-15 years ago, a good size to transplant, so maybe you can use some of your own trees and replace them in kind with good starter trees and have a very mature look there with the height that we need and the spread to give shade.

Mayor Cason: On that issue – how big are these trees going to be when you plant them?

Earl Jackson: This is a little under-story, I can come back to that, but you asked a question on size. I'm just going to move and then we are going to come back to this. So when you ask trees being planted on day one, we've been working with these guys -- I should let you talk to this Robert, you know better than I, but there are two – 670 boxes a gallon, 670 gallon tree against a 1400 gallon tree, and there is a guy you can see right there in the shade and right there in the shade and he's got a yellow pole that goes up to 25 feet. So we did a little study, granted it's a photo-shop study, but we think we have the scale about right. So there is the same guy with the same pole to 25 feet, it gets lost a little in this projection on the screen, but it goes almost to the

rooftop. So the 25-foot tree from the 670 gallon box looks like this on day one; the 1400 gallon tree looks like this.

Commissioner Lago: So it's actually better than some of the trees that's been out there for 20 years.

Earl Jackson: Well it's been growing in a nursery.

Commissioner Keon: So which are we using? Are we using the 1400?

Robert Parsley: What we are proposing are the 670's.

Commissioner Keon: You are looking at using the 670 gallon. OK.

Commissioner Lago: What is the difference in cost?

Robert Parsley: The factor is 4.

Commissioner Keon: Are they harder to plant too...?

Robert Parsley: They are just big.

Commissioner Keon: They are just big. OK.

Commissioner Slesnick: How many 1400 gallon trees are we getting?

Robert Parsley: We don't have any in the plans right now.

Commissioner Slesnick: We are going with the smaller ones. So we are going across the board with the...

Earl Jackson: With the 670 gallon tree.

Commissioner Keon: You shouldn't have shown us the 1400 – (laughter). I like the big ones.

Robert Parsley: There are so many utilities now. You have this 8-foot by 4 ½ foot square root ball, you don't have a lot of flexibility, and you know the three staggers of trees, we can't use those on the roadside with bump-outs, you can only use those on the curbside and they demand a new soil. There may be some places where we feel that we need a bigger one and I think it helps that variability which we are going for instead of these soldiers lined up in the design. So, I'll see if we can find a way to get one or two of these in.

Mayor Cason: Is this solid coral rock like elsewhere in the Gables?- or is there better soil right now?

Earl Jackson: As I understand it, it's not far before you go down before you hit that coral rock.

Robert Parsley: We are going to have to excavate very large holes, 12 by 15, backfill them with structural soil, good soil, silver cells, which are sort of stacked, look like egg crates and that's what holds the paving and then the soil can't settle below, but you've got the structural egg crates to hold the paving up, and then it goes into structural soil after that.

Earl Jackson: I'll rifle back through a couple of the design issues. This was talking about the under-story. There is a very abstract graphic on the bottom which just to put in a very simple way, our landscape team has been developing an under-story pattern for planting that focuses on the scale and texture of leaf size. So again, picking up that rhythm of the crosswalk, the mid-block, the intersection, the mid-block, the crosswalk, and what you see the bottom is an impression of finer grain, bigger grain, broader leaver, finer leaves, as you move through. I think it's a very cool idea. We have a couple of images where we are starting to look at some of the species that could be used for those, and then we get into the design for Douglas Plaza. Now

Douglas Plaza is very different than LeJeune Plaza in that LeJeune Plaza you have more of an opportunity to create a real place, to create a plaza-like place around those fountains. Douglas Plaza – people use that space, they gather around the fountain, but it's more of a pasture pass-by place, it's the threshold between cities, between Coral Gables and the City of Miami. So we are looking to increase the identity that comes with Douglas Plaza and the experience of arriving in Coral Gables, but it's less of an attempt to make it a real place where people want to go and gather and do a lot of things. So, we've been working with a number of different people. We talked with some representatives of the Garden Club; we understand that they have a heavy amount of interest and investment in that area. The image you see on the screen is how it looks today. What could make this a more announced and more glorious threshold into the City of Coral Gables from the City of Miami? The first move we thought was, can we just make more of the arches by pulling away the planting? So you see the inner leg of the arch is covered by planting today, so we pulled that back you can allow the arch to be a little bit more architectural, a little bit more ceremonial and it's a very light move to just pull that planting. Coupled with that, can we do something more with the sign? – The image, can you make the letters pop a little bit more?- can we repaint; refinish where those letters have been engraved to recognize that's it's the threshold to Coral Gables. Second, when you add the three rows of trees and the pink flowering trees down the Mile, you see a backdrop of green start to thicken up behind those arches. So just playing with subtle moves to create great contrast between landscape and the arches helps them stand out a bit more prominently. We've added behind them in the immediate background an array of palm trees. Again, we can make the background more lush to make the foreground stand out more. And then lastly, leveraging off of the existing pink flowering tree that's there, we've added pink to the entry so that there is a sense of consistency between where you recognize you are entering and the things that are happening, as you go further down the Mile.

Commissioner Lago: It's a beautiful concept, but I think that you are forgetting one of most important things which would potentially change the way that all Miracle Mile is looked at. We have to and I'll continue to say it, I think my colleague would support this, we need to do

everything in our power to get in contact with FPL and the County and make sure those mast arms are removed and downplayed to a certain extent.

Vice Mayor Quesada: I'm sorry, I missed...

Commissioner Lago: The mast arms...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Oh yes.

Commissioner Lago: There is a future traffic plan which the County has funded; I think they look out 5 to 10 years. I can imagine we can speak to our contractor who is here on site, he can give us a little bit more input in regards to that, because that's what he does every day, but I think we need to make sure that we sit down with our local officials at the County and at FPL and really discuss what are the options in reference to those mast arms and any other type of components that you see laying around that are really blocking the total view and the feel of Miracle Mile. What's your opinion? Would you like to see those mast arms gone?

Earl Jackson: I know you need the traffic control, right?

Commissioner Lago: But there are other ways to do it.

Earl Jackson: And in this image it actually shows it pretty prominently, that it sits right in front of the view point that this is taken from. Now this is the Google car driving down the street with the elevated camera, so that perspective is constantly dynamic. You're at a greater distance you see over it, at this moment it happens to cut right in front of the letters. As you get closer you see under it. I think we have it on the radar, we've talked to FDOT (Florida Department of Transportation), we are talking with FPL, we are trying to reduce the number and see if there is any room for flexibility and where the poles are placed for the mast arms and it's definitely a concern, we are definitely working on it. At some point they are the larger governing body and

that traffic thing has carried more weight than some of our aesthetic concerns to date, but we are continuing to lead in that direction and try and push it that way.

Commissioner Lago: But there are mast arms, I mean you see them, instead of being so large and overbearing; there are single pole mast arms that can give you the exact direction of traffic that you are requesting without being so intrusive.

Earl Jackson: Right.

Commissioner Lago: I think we should exhaust all our options, that's all I'm saying, make sure that staff is meeting we're at the County at FDOT. I want to do it now and since we are going to open up the grounds to upgrade the drainage, why not do a multitude of other projects which are potentially being planned by the County and Water and Sewer?- why don't we do them now, instead of having to do it in the future to reopen up streets.

Earl Jackson: One of the things that sounds promising and the question on this, since I think it's really about the logistics and coordination between agencies, right? It's promising to me to hear that you are beginning to undertake an area-wide sort of traffic assessment and because that is primarily a traffic issue it might become one of the things that are more appropriate for that project and that realm to negotiate. I think we'll continue to lean on it, so that it's an issue at the table when those discussions are had with those parties, but I would look at both projects as an opportunity to have some influence on that issue.

Commissioner Keon: You know the sign that bothers me more than that is, you can't see it so much in this picture, but you can see it a lot when you are driving by, is we have a parking directional sign that's lower there, you see that?- yes. That sign bothers me more than any sign, anything up there, that is horrible when you go by, and we can – that's our sign that we put it in such a place that blocks the entrance. We should find a way that it doesn't block the entrance, but still is visible so people know where there is public parking, but maybe we can do a better job with that particular sign.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Excuse me Commissioner Keon, Kevin Kinney is in the audience and he's taking notes on that comment.

Commissioner Keon: Thank you. I'm glad that came up because that sign is...

Mayor Cason: Did the steering committee come to some kind of conclusion on the options that you just discussed on this?

Earl Jackson: I feel like at the moment we have full support for this direction.

Mayor Cason: For this one right here?

Earl Jackson: Yes.

Commissioner Keon: Can I also ask you, will you plant beds of flowers and things there again?

Earl Jackson: I think the idea is to continue to work with the Garden Club. I think their role and their sense of ownership over the place is great.

Commissioner Keon: They had the entrances and the fountains. I don't know about the planting of those flowers. The issue I have with those flowers is, because of one, just the heat, compounded by the asphalt, compounded by the exhaust of cars, because it's right at the level that cars are going by. No matter what they plant there it never looks, it doesn't look great, it never looks great. And I know maybe it's a maintenance thing, but papers and things get caught up in them and whatever. I went up to Palm Beach to Worth Avenue to look at those and interestingly on a lot of those areas like that, they just have grass planted and it's really pretty. It's just a thick bed of green grass. It's great for drainage, because it absorbs the water can run into it, and it was really pretty, or else use pots or plants in a pot that sits up higher, so it's not so

close the asphalt, or the exhaust from cars, and it's much more easily changed out, the flowers, in a pot than in the ground there, but those bunch of flowers never ever look great.

Robert Parsley: One of those discussions we've had among ourselves is the level of maintenance for the new planting, because all planting have a common level of maintenance. Right now most of the flowers are for the vehicle experience. We think, I think that the high detailed planting, the ornamental planting, the...planting should be more along the street side, the crosswalks, where people are experiencing at a pedestrian pace, because these big beds of colors you pass them in a nano-second, and I was at Worth Avenue about two weeks ago, and I was looking for the same thing. Other than bougainvillea, they don't have a lot of color there.

Commissioner Keon: No, it looks very pretty. It's a very, very pretty street. So would you consider that, would you consider grass as opposed to plant flowers?

Robert Parsley: I think its over-emphasis on the vehicle experience for these big beds of solid annual flowers. We do that at the tips of those islands and there is that one plant, that purple ground cover the tips...I'm not crazy about that color, but that's tough as nails other than grass.

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Robert Parsley: So I think we can use that...the grass is the first level of color...

Commissioner Keon: I went down there; it's very, very, very pretty. It is kind of park-like as you walk through and you see these beds of really...yes, so maybe you'll give that some thought.

Robert Parsley: Yes ma'am.

Commissioner Keon: Thank you.

Commissioner Slesnick: My wish is with his laptop here. Back to the screen – that screen. This isn't about the intersection. Is there anyway of having the palms come up further toward Douglas, in the median?

Commissioner Keon: No, you can't, it's a turn lane.

Commissioner Slesnick: I guess we can't do anything.

Vice Mayor Quesada: There is a sign directly in the median right next to the turn lane, do we need that?- yes, probably.

Commissioner Slesnick: Yes – probably.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So we are not certain is what you are saying.

Commissioner Keon: They could evaluate it. You know the good thing about the way that those palms are in the median is you can look across to both sides of the street; you can see both sides of the street as you drive down one side.

Earl Jackson: Yes, we agree. I think that's why we like them.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Are you putting bushes or some low-lying grass there?

Earl Jackson: In the median?

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes.

Earl Jackson: We have a strategy for the median and moved over quickly to jump ahead to that other issue, where at the location of the pedestrian crossings we've...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Well we are staying on that same screen near Douglas, at the intersection of Miracle Mile and Douglas.

Earl Jackson: Well the other thing is there is not a lot of pedestrian connection there.

Commissioner Slesnick: It's a big turn lane and a long extensive turn lane.

Commissioner Keon: Yes, they need a lot of stacking there.

Earl Jackson: Trees on day one, we've just gone over. I have a bit on lighting. Lighting will cost between the two locations Miracle Mile and Giralda, can you guys hear me OK?- my voice getting a little scratchy. So, again the idea of using the rhythm of the Mile to establish an order for all things is at the heart of the lighting strategy. You can see that there are seven different or six different locations or types that we are developing lighting for the Mile. The plazas, the crosswalks, the typical street sections, the intersections, and the lighting I'll show you in the coming slides really focus on those areas. At the crosswalks, we've introduced a series of pylon lights to help change the lighting character as you are walking down the Mile to something more significant, so cars and people can more readily recognize those areas as opportunities to cross. To the third of the Mile and all the typical conditions, people really love the lights that are wrapped around the trees. We are working with Fisher Moran Stone, they are one of the world's best lighting designers, and the first they said was it's really great that you have that. It's a lateral light, it helps with facial recognition, and it's a soft ambient light. It complements the light that should come from storefronts really well. So we are looking to just upgrade the quality of those lights, connect them better to the infrastructure. Right now it's a bit makeshift and to have those on year-round. We are looking at a nice white light that's on the warm side of the color spectrum, so that you can again, warm side makes peoples' faces a little bit more rosy and it's a little bit more inviting, cool side tends to drop things away a little bit bluer.

Commissioner Keon: Will they wrap every tree?

Earl Jackson: All the trees are up and down the Mile. We haven't decided on the palms in the median. I think the palms in the median have; I think it's all the trees.

Commissioner Keon: OK.

Earl Jackson: Through the median we are also up-lighting. So the way that you guys have lit Alhambra is actually a good recognition of how that works, and at night it's quite beautiful. So up-light those canopies is saying catch the length of the trunk, along the near length. One of the key things is driving the identity for LeJeune Plaza is the lighting strategy. So we've got a strategy in place right now to basically, color the base of the pool, and we've been working with Dona on this, because we know those are historic elements, get the base of the pool be colored the same as the Venetian Pool, so it ties better to the history of the place, and we are going to put lights in the water. We had originally talked about a linear light, but that's gone away because it would be too visible and too obstructive, and put a couple of spots in that water to activate that surface. This is the Chevy Fountain, a little bit like that, but then to light the face of the fountain, so that on the LeJeune Plaza side you also get that sense of threshold and entry between the City of Coral Gables and Miracle Mile. Now that light, matching the color of the pool, is a greenish-blue, kind of a teal, you know the bottom of the Venetian Pool quite well. That side is going to be cool lighting, so cool whites -- whites on the blue side of the color spectrum. On the backside, getting rid of the grass and we are creating a plaza-like environment, so that tenants in those buildings can spill out into that space and that area is going to be lit with a warm white light. So your eyes are going to see the distinction between the two. It's going to make the fountain more prominent and it's going to announce the entry and create a place for people in a way that you don't currently have today. Douglas Plaza -- the lighting things are going to make more the lights in the fountains. We looked at the pumping and facilities that manage those fountains right now and talked about that a few weeks ago, so we are going to bring that back to life, they are going to operate, and we are going to light them better; and then we are going to up-light the underside of the arch and we are going to bring better lighting to the letters that announce those structures as Coral Gables. We've talked about holiday lights as an additional thing that should be thought about, it comes on the back of this project, not as a part that's included in the project, but at the

north/south movements between the ends, at Galiano, at Ponce, and at Salzedo, the idea of hanging lights during the holiday season, so that it can again pick up on this metered sequence times of year, seasons, and sort of the way you program opportunities and events for the Mile. This would be another one of those ornaments you could add in. From a sustainable standpoint, all of the lights that we are suggesting to be used in the Mile are LED lights. We've got an idea that's out there that needs to be further developed about coordinating with private property owners to use their rooftops. When we did the sky study from the roof, we looked down on the Mile and noticed that it's all one and two-story buildings predominantly, and that those rooftops are fairly blank. They look like a great opportunity for us. We did a calculation – there is almost a half-a-million square feet of rooftop available, and then there is another almost quarter of a million square feet on the garages that could be used for solar opportunities. We did a little research on the technology and one panel does about 280 kilowatts a year. If you multiply that by the area that we have, you can produce about 140 million kilowatts per year, and we're with our lighting guys to see exactly how that translates and how that might partition, so that you could register you are powering half the lights for Miracle Mile by solar or such. For streetscape elements, we've got furniture and a couple of other things to discuss. The furniture is really broken down into three parts. There is integral, fixed, and permanent furniture. There is heavy, but movable furniture, and then there is the very light weight and flexible furniture that you have in public space that people can adapt and change and group and gather at a moment's notice the way they might need to. For the integral and permanent furniture, we've been looking at bringing, and this is an issue, I think is probably very important, in bringing some of the material character of the greater context of Coral Gables into Miracle Mile. It's going to be a great new street, but I think making a connection to historic material is very important. I think this furniture is an opportunity to do that. So we've been looking at coral stone and shell stone to try and maintain a little bit of that materiality through the length of the Mile. We've been looking at some from Mexico, from southern Florida, from the Dominican Republic, and from Spain. Now you know from living with this stone that's its very porous, in certain conditions orientations it has more or less of a tendency to gather and hold moisture and become black with mildew, this building is a prime example. We think that those things are things we should address, especially if it's furniture and people are touching it all the time. Certain aspects of them, it's great that the

stone will age to a degree, but we want to minimize those negative aspects. So at the moment, we have some samples on the floor here and an idea, and we are working with arborcators to use the shell stone from Spain. It's called shell stone, it has some fossil in it, it has figure and texture enough to hold the character that we see in some of the rough cut pieces, and where we want to use it for furniture, the top is filled and honed and sloped in many conditions. So the water runs off so it can be easily wiped and cleaned so that it's not something you worry about when you are sitting on it in a suit or in a dress.

Mayor Cason: Is that graphity-proof?

Earl Jackson: I don't know if anything is really graphity-proof, so I would say no. You are going to be able to clean the honed surface easier than you'll be able to clean the rough surface on the side, to be honest.

Mayor Cason: Can we coat it at all with anything to fill in?

Earl Jackson: I think you could apply coating, but my sense is the fact that it has so many "nooks and crannies," and the shell stone has far fewer.

Commissioner Lago: It's significantly further dense than the other stones.

Commissioner Keon: They have samples of the shell stone here. Take a look at it.

Commissioner Lago: Again, in reference to cost...

Earl Jackson: This is the shell stone from Spain. There are two samples there; one is a honed finish, which is hard for people to sit on, the other is the more...[inaudible – off mic].

Commissioner Keon: And those are from where?

Commissioner Lago: When you basically compare it to south Florida stone, what are you looking at in reference to cost?

Earl Jackson: We are still working on the cost...[inaudible – off mic]...

Commissioner Keon: Are these all the samples you have from Spain?

Earl Jackson: These two samples are the ones I have.

Commissioner Keon: These are from Spain?

Earl Jackson: Exactly. It's much denser; it's a very clean stone. It's a slightly different one. This one that you have in front of you is the shell, and you'll see a bit more fossil in it, and then the other one is called reef, and it's a little less, there is less fossil. So from a material standpoint, we think it's important to bring that in, since you are undergoing a cost comparison so that we weigh them more evenly. This seemed from a physical standpoint superior, so this is the one that's at the frontrunner right now. This material would be applied to permanent furniture that wrapped existing trees to remain. Many of those trees have roots that are growing out and above the surface of the paving, so in order to keep that safe, we've put furniture around it, also it's a great place to sit in the shade. We've got a modular system in place that's the sum of three components; a bar, an arch, and a connector, so that the fabrication cost go down, it's a unit.

Vice Mayor Quesada: You said modular that means any pedestrian can move them around in the space?

Earl Jackson: No. Modular means in terms of geometry and fabrication, there are three types. Instead of every piece being a custom piece, there are three types; they can be joined in different ways to create different effect, so it's just about fabrication. This is the integrated and fixed furniture. There are some heavy movable ones, which pedestrians, a group of pedestrians might

be able to move, but probably need some machinery, and then there is the light weight stuff, which anybody can move.

Vice Mayor Quesada: You know that rendering you have up there reminds me of the area on Lincoln Road in front of the movie theater, how they have that type of – the seating areas in the shade around the trees in the greenery area, and they have like a little stream or something like that, there is a little pond, yes, and you see a lot of people congregate there, so its effective.

Earl Jackson: That image is actually the backside of LeJeune Plaza, so one thing I failed to mention, is there is plumbing on the backside of that fountain. We are going to reactivate it and create an audible and visual small fountain in the basin that exists there. So it's going to help the traffic noise and it's also going to add to the ambiance of that place, so when you tie landscape shade, paving program and a fountain together it's starting to be the right composition of elements that add up to a great spot.

Vice Mayor Quesada: You know you mentioned something about the fountain that I hadn't really thought about. Near the civil courthouse, 73 West Flagler, they created a small pocket park. I don't know who in this room goes there too often, but I'm there all the time, and they have a small pocket park next to – so you have the courthouse, you have Flagler Street, with all the hustle and bustle of Flagler Street, and then you have a small little pocket park, I mean tiny, and it's got a fountain in the back, it's got a large waterfall in the back; and it's funny, with all the noise that you have on the street, the cars, the people, the movement. Everything that's happening in a very busy area of downtown Miami, you in that area and all you hear is water. It's amazing because you sit in there, they have some tables and chairs, and again – you have a concrete wall on one side and a concrete wall on the other side and a gate in front of you and a fountain behind you, and even though you are surrounded by concrete you feel it's a very pleasant experience because of the sound of the water flowing. I think it's a good idea to add that kind of sound of the water element as much as possible. So, I'm just saying I like the idea.

Earl Jackson: We agree. We agree. This is that arch that's been joined five times, six times, to wrap a tree, so again, having flexibility in the module. This is the bollard seat, so where we meet bollards on Giralda and Miracle Mile, we were challenged with, how can you make a bollard that actually performs for the social qualities of the space? So we have a mock-up here on the floor in front of us. This is the travel version. It's made out of like foam, we built this up near our office fabrication, prototyping, testing facility in New Jersey, but it's got the same principles. The sides of it have a rough hew edge to it, that's akin to the rough part of the stone and then the top would be smooth, so that people could easily sit on. For light weight furniture, we've got a couple of samples in the room. There are a couple more coming that is even lighter. We like the idea of light weight furniture, we live with it everywhere in Manhattan now, and what it has done it has allowed the people of New York City to transform public space at will. So you want to have lunch by yourself with a good book, you take a small table and you drag it six feet away and a small chair and you sit there and have your lunch. You come with a class on a field trip and you want to gather them and give them a talk, you can assemble 15 of these chairs very easily and give a talk to 15 people. So what you see here is a bistro chair from Bryant Park, we are looking at a company called....does this chair. You see them all out along the edge, you see them scattered all the way through here. They are exceptionally light, they fold up, you can move them and take them anywhere.

Mayor Cason: Where do you suggest placing those?

Earl Jackson: I think that these should primarily occur at the crosswalks and potentially like LeJeune Plaza. In my experience on the Mile, we've spent a lot of time on the Mile, put a lot of paces in and I've tried to talk to people who don't get too freaked out by being approached by a stranger at those locations, and some people have told me that they like sitting there. People have said I've got twenty minutes; I'm meeting my bridal party before we go get our wedding dresses. I've seen girls open laptops and start to do a little bit of work, and I've asked them, you know how often do you come here?- do you live here?- do you work here? Many of them said, if they had tables they would use those spaces more. So we like the idea of introducing tables, I like the

idea of flexible furniture complementing the more permanent and heavy things to create a lot of flexibility for...

Mayor Cason: What's your experience in New York?- do they disappear?- or do they tend to stay?

Earl Jackson: You know, I have to be honest, in that field I don't have a great answer for that because there is so much of it, I'm sure that a few of them walk away. They are not highly desirable, they are cool for public space, but if you thought about bringing it home you wouldn't really want it at home. Would you want it on your deck?- people might want them on their decks. There is a way to run a rope through them or a wire through them at night and chain them up, but you will have to deal with some degree of, its light weight so...

Mayor Cason: They hold up physically?

Earl Jackson: They hold up really well. They started with them in Bryant Park, they are now everywhere throughout the City.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So does that mean pedestrians take them other places?

Earl Jackson: You could take it from one end of the park to the other.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Bad joke. I've seen other types of seating, public seating like this same type of material in other locations, I don't know if you have other pictures or other design types. And I don't speak French, but outside Leuve, I think I've talked to you about it, around those circular pond, fountains that they have, I'm going to butcher this, Tierrez Park, I don't know how to say it, but they have the same type of chairs similar to the white one that you brought today, but its angled back so it's more of a relaxed angle. Similar to what you have on the screen there on the bottom, but that looks more like a beach chair to me. If you think of the white chair and I guess angle it back 45 degrees, and I've sat in those chairs in Paris for hours at a time and you

see a lot of people. I guess it's really what you are trying to promote, if someone is going to be there 20 minutes, obviously this type of chair and table set up is more convenient, if you want someone to be there a long time and lounge, then I think we would want the other types of chairs. What are your thoughts on that?

Earl Jackson: I think you are spot on when you say, it depends on how you want to use the space, and at the crosswalks, I would imagine probably it's more of the twenty minutes than the two hours, because there is a lot of congestion, right, a lot of vibrant activity of people moving, cars moving, a lot of things happening. I would think that maybe the more and this is like an off the cuff response to your question. I would think that maybe the more comfortable longer duration seating might be more appropriate like Lot 25 or Merrick Park or Pittman Park, where there is a more slightly off...

Mayor Cason: You know the problem that I see with the one at the bottom that encourages people to stay eight hours.

Earl Jackson: Yes. I agree.

Commissioner Keon: We need the twenty minute chairs (laughter).

Mayor Cason: I think the twenty minute one is the best.

Earl Jackson: At the moment this is the only one we've got in our plans, and we are comparing this one as a very light weight piece to the ones that you see in the room in front of you. So the one on the screen here is the silver one, this is the table that goes with it. I don't have a cut-sheet for the white one. The white one was brought up from the University of Miami yesterday, they've had it outside at the student center for four years, people stand on it. It's much heavier...

Commissioner Slesnick: That's a four year old chair?

Earl Jackson: That's a four year old chair.

Commissioner Slesnick: It looks good.

Earl Jackson: I'd say it's probably two to three times the weight of the bistro chair, but it's still pretty movable.

Commissioner Lago: Who manufacturers that chair?

Earl Jackson: This one is Landscape Forms.

Commissioner Slesnick: Just an observation though. The chair on the left over here, the silver one really does not stand out as much or a silver table, so that if you're thinking, seeing more of the trees instead of white objects all along, it's like seeing parkways without the little white bumps in the yards. What do you call those?

Commissioner Keon: The buttons.

Commissioner Slesnick: Yes, the buttons. It really seems to me to be more visually appealing not to see all the chairs as you are looking down Miracle Mile where the trees, because I can see through it more too.

Earl Jackson: We've had the discussion, about finish. In the next phase of the design process we'll get finish refined. There was initially an idea of keeping all the elements on the streetscape light in color and white, and I think the light metal color does that as well as the white, but that's why we began with the white. The bistro chair has a slide here, this is just a few steps away from One World Trade Center near Seven World Trade in Manhattan, they use a series of light colors. So we like the idea of elements being feeling light, and we haven't settled on a color yet.

Mayor Cason: In terms of maintenance with the pollution and the dust, which is going to be easier to keep?

Earl Jackson: You know it's interesting, on maintenance the biggest question for us is not necessarily pollution and dust because that I think you can wipe and clean pretty easily. We are in depth looking at like what does it mean in this humidity and is there any opportunity because of the way the chairs are fastened or put together that rust has a factor in it. So we are more concerned about rust and aging, for the most part I think wiping them down is fairly...

Commissioner Slesnick: And this chair from UM was sitting outside not under...

Earl Jackson: That's what I'm told.

Commissioner Slesnick: That is a very good looking four year old chair.

Earl Jackson: Yes. Yes.

Commissioner Slesnick: But it does have a lot of little holes, which if you were sitting and getting leaves and so forth gathering on it, it would just tend to get dirtier faster.

Earl Jackson: And if you never use it, right, so in a way every time you sit on this chair you couldn't. So the more it's used the more...

(Laughter)

Commissioner Lago: Only in the summer.

Earl Jackson: The maintenance program is a public contribution. For bicycle facilities, we have a map that we put together that identifies all of the locations where we are adding bicycle racks. We are placing bikes around the corner from the Mile at every vehicle intersection and at the

plazas. We've got 80 racks in total, 22 of which are within City parking garages, so that if you are worried about keeping your bike out of the elements, worried about rain on your bike, you can put it potentially inside a place in the garage and protect it that way.

Mayor Cason: Have you looked at any of the non-standard designs for the bike racks? I think I mentioned at one of the earlier meetings Brodislavaslovakia, they have some really beautiful, incredibly, whimsical some of the big wheel bikes on the end, other than just the standard aluminum boring – if you looked at making some fun?

Earl Jackson: We have. You know when we started the project; we undertook the project with the idea that a one percent for our project should be actually 100 percent for our work if we do artful things. We looked at countless opportunities for bike racks and all the ones you mentioned were in previous slides and design. At the moment we are specifying a very simple, clean standard bike rack, more for cost and efficiency than any other reason. We think that the design is elegant and that its great and that its minimally impacting the area of the sidewalk, and that's the reason we like it, but that's not to say that there couldn't be a program that initiates competition for other artists to engage and potentially doing significant bike racks. I know you had one outside of City Hall for a while a few months back, kind of orange.

Mayor Cason: I think it would be interesting to get some competition, not all of them, but maybe a couple to add some whimsical features, because there are so many that I've seen around the world that are really just spectacular that why not have some of those here as well.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Mr. Mayor about two years ago, three years ago, I tried to start that initiative where we would do competition and have people from the community all over to be able to submit to create bike racks that made sense with our community. Maybe a bike rack that looked like the Biltmore, different kind of things like that, and where we got hung up, we had a few meetings on it and we created sort of an ad hoc group with a few of the bike enthusiasts in town. We had a few good meetings, we had a few good plans, we wrote up sort of a proposal to

take it forward, but funding fell short on it to make that a reality. So that's where everything sort of died at that point, but it doesn't mean we can't revisit in the future.

Mayor Cason: Yes, that's what I was saying, maybe not for all of them, but maybe two let's say, somewhere at the appropriate place, something that would be really different.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Well one of the thoughts that we had is, we could have some of the stores on Miracle Mile actually sponsor the bike racks, so if they want one in front of their business, let's say Hilstone, want one in front of their business they can have a bike rack that look like a hamburger, to give you a bad example and then they would pay for that bike rack.

Commissioner Keon: I like the simplicity and the cleanness of – and a little bit of elegance, I mean I think that's the look you want on the Mile, and its functional, but I don't think you really see it, I mean people will see it to use it, but it's not going to distract you from the elements that are really expensive elements that are being built into the Mile. So, I kind of like that very simply plain elegance of that type of a bike rack.

Commissioner Slesnick: I like them too. Things that don't really show up and concentrate on the sidewalk...

Commissioner Keon: I like a very...

Commissioner Slesnick: Do we have any plans – I know we talked about bike routes on Miracle Mile which is off the table, but for Salzedo which is also a wide street with very few trees and so forth, that's making Salzedo have a bike lane on it. While we are incorporating Miracle Mile, I was just wondering if maybe we should look into that.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: We are keeping their focus on Miracle Mile, Giralda, Lot 22 Park, but there are other discussions within staff about how do we get people to the Mile, but not through the Mile, including Salzedo.

Commissioner Slesnick: Because I noticed there aren't a lot of trees either in your slide back there where we have big oak trees down Miracle Mile and Salzedo, it's just very blah and there is no parking on Salzedo either.

Earl Jackson: I think your question about Salzedo also on the coattails of how Cathy responded is indicative that the project is going do, hopefully everything you hope it does for the B.I.D., the downtown and the City. It's actually a catalytic project, right, so the streetscape is the first move that initiates a lot of other moves where you recognize, Oh wow, we can actually fix this a little better, we can do a little more here, we add to Merrick Way, so I think it's the right question to ask, I think to Cathy's point, we've been focused primarily on Giralda and Miracle Mile, but we are thrilled to be with you here as long as you want to keep doing cool projects in the City of Coral Gables. Manhole covers another opportunity – we have a design which everybody is excited about which also tries to leverage a little bit of the local character and a little bit of the landscape history of the region. We found a great piece of coral stone nearby and took it home with us, put it on a saw, cut a bunch of sections through it to see what the patterns and the organization of the shell structure was, and the cross-section that we found most interesting was the one that cut most perpendicular to the veins, so we've got a great pattern that's generated from shell stone in the casting of the manhole covers.

Vice Mayor Quesada: First of all, I think that looks awesome. It's a different take on what I'd always anticipated. Every time you see manholes in municipalities like the City of Miami, they have the palm tree, the seal of the City. This is a different take and I love it, but can we just go back for a second with the bikes one more. We had, you and I had a conversation, I don't know if it was on the dais, I don't know if it was in a private setting or not, but I just want to remind you of the conversation that we had had when it came to promoting – obviously this Commission has spent, has set aside a significant amount of resources on bike lanes throughout the City, and one of the conversations that we had obviously had this discussion and I was on the losing side of the discussion about putting the bike lanes on Miracle Mile, one of the discussions, I think you said at that meeting, correct me if I'm wrong, is that it was very important still that we need to

bring, make it easy for cyclists and pedestrians to get to Miracle Mile, and maybe not necessarily ride on Miracle Mile, but on the surrounding streets and you guys were going to come up with a plan for the neighboring streets to really make it as the best connectivity possible. Something along those lines, if I'm speaking out of turn, I'm sure you will correct me when I finish now. So one of the things that we've also discussed is creating or promoting a plan or discussing a plan of the surrounding buildings and the surrounding streets making the paseos friendly, if you are parking your bike off the Mile it's very easy, very quick, and your bike is, you can park it in a location where it's in the shade and its protected and it's out of the way. We had talked about the parking garage, we had talked about the RFP's for the buildings on Andalusia, that there be bike parking facilities in those garages. I know it's not within the scope of what you are doing, but I see it as ancillary, as part of it and considering the money that this Commission, this City has dedicated to improving bike lanes. We've set aside \$400,000, we've already spent \$60,000 on a bike master plan, we are negotiating with the City to get additional \$1.5 million for bike facilities throughout the City, I just think it's important for you to just keep in the back of your mind, because personally, I love the way you think, I love the way you are looking at this, you understand, you really understand the City, your group does, that's how you speak on behalf of your whole group, is to keep that in mind on that connectivity on making it that pleasant experience for the cyclists to be able to get into downtown and the easiest way possible and how can we really promote that. Because right now when you look at the bike racks that we currently have outside of Miracle Mile, first of all, they are few and far between and the ones that do exist are not in an ideal location. I think of 355 Alhambra, you know the bike rack is tucked away in a back corner that you rarely see a bike there, because I'm doubtful a cyclist can ever find it. So we had sort of had that conversation, maybe I have gone a little further than what we discussed, but I just want you to continue to be cognizant of that, your group, that we want to make an easy transition for the cyclists to be able to come in and out. If we are not going to get those lanes on Miracle Mile for the cyclists that it's very easy to come in and out and we are being forward thinking or being proactive to make it as connected as possible.

Commissioner Slesnick: And I'd like to piggyback on that. I just wrote a question to the City Manager about when we have Parking Garages 1 and 4, which are on Andalusia backing up to

Miracle Mile, to have bike racks and we have included this in the RFP request and so forth, but also maybe having the bicycles that you can rent and having bicycle rental stations in the parking garages and again, protected near the paseos, and again, I don't want to harp on Salzedo, but it's not a very attractive street, but it is a wide street without parking that, that might be a great one that goes up to Giralda and down to the Police Station that we could have more bike routes on Salzedo and narrow the street there, but also it comes into those parking garages. So, I'd like to see covered parking for bicyclists in some of these places, not just on Miracle Mile where it's open, but also in our parking garage.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Just easy transitions. It's got to be easy; it's got to be connected. I know you are focusing on Miracle Mile; obviously that's your scope...

Commissioner Slesnick: Clever and you can come up with something.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes. We like the way you think.

Earl Jackson: I think there is a short response to that is that there hasn't been anything we've done on either Galiano, on either Giralda or on Miracle Mile that in any way to our knowledge precludes anything like improvements on Salzedo or any of the other areas of the project. I think the issue of where bike lanes go begins with the master plan that you've already commissioned, it picks up on the traffic study, which is not beginning to go through the ropes, so it's a vehicle issue and once you talk about Salzedo it is outside of the scope, but we do have a more expansive view of the downtown, the image I showed you early on in the presentation. We are mindful not to do anything that precludes opportunities for other parts of the City in the course of this project.

Vice Mayor Quesada: OK. Actually, I want to piggyback on something Commissioner said about you bringing in the park the bike rental facilities, and this is outside of the scope to today's conversation, but it's something that I had thought about for the North Ponce area as well. We talk about – it's tough because the parking and the depth of the lots that we have in the North Ponce area to do what we want to do. One of the things we could be thinking of, because you

have trolley stops there, if we added also bike rental facilities there, you make it even more connected and you can relieve some of that vehicle traffic and vehicle parking issues that we may come across. So it has nothing to do with you at this point, but it just came to mind I want to let you know my thoughts. Thank you.

Mayor Cason: On the manhole covers, are they going to resist heavy trucks?

Earl Jackson: These are created in a foundry, these are like the best manhole covers you can possibly get. We had a guy in our office a week ago, who talked about fastening. So for instance, not to scare anybody, but in the world there are conditions where a gas line leaks into a sewer system where the sewer gases build up and manhole covers blow, and flooding conditions manhole covers can blow. So we've looked at a foundry and are talking to guys who have backups for that. So when it blows, it moves but then doesn't fly off and it relieves and dissipates an explosion, so these are very strong, very resilient, very technically advanced manhole covers we are talking about. On other utilities, there are boxes out there that you need by necessity; they run your traffic lights, your signals, your equipment. Some of them are flush in the paving and where they are we are putting stone in a custom trace so they are almost invisible, you can find them if you need to obviously, but for just those walking by they would tend to disappear. For boxes that are more pronounced, we are taking them off the paving wherever possible, so that it doesn't feel like clutter, and we are putting them in planting areas and then the planting helps camouflage, and then we are thinking that there should be an artist who can come in and actually do kind of like an art piece that's like art camouflage for utility boxes.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Will the utilities allow us to do that?

Earl Jackson: There hasn't been any opposition to date.

Vice Mayor Quesada: I think I just answered my own question. When you go through the design district some of them are all painted up and they have different designs.

Mayor Cason: I just got back from San Diego, and all over San Diego you see those with art on them.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Should we set aside some funds for artists to do some sort of competition to...

Commissioner Lago: Dona can talk a little bit about it, I've spoken to her, but there is already monies allocated in the project for art in public places.

Vice Mayor Quesada: For these utility boxes?

Commissioner Lago: I don't think these utility boxes. You may need more money, depending on what the final outcome is going to be, but I know there are monies to be allocated, but that's for something completely different. My question to you was, after meeting with the contractor they were mentioning about the possibility that maybe these boxes, when were they installed? As technology has changed and you can see your cell phone 15 years ago was the size of an encyclopedia, now today it fits in your palm. So there has to be, I think, some new technology in place where these can be minimized to a certain extent.

Earl Jackson: We have seen the dimensions drop from; I think what you have today...

Commissioner Lago: But significant?

Earl Jackson: It's not significant. The reason why I don't think it's significant, if you want to examine this, this might be a good thing to do. I think it's mostly about the ability to access and maintain the things in the box that create this condition like not making it too tired, to compact or too hard to get to.

Commissioner Keon: Making it modern-proof.

Earl Jackson: Yes.

Mayor Cason: I think it's a great idea not to have those green ones and make it into a piece of art. I'm sure if we need money we can address this.

Commissioner Lago: Yes – and also to incorporate it into our landscaping.

Earl Jackson: In my mind its art, but its subtle, so you might not notice it. For many of us you walk outside unless you are looking you don't notice those pieces, they are just a part of everyday life, so I think that, that would be, but then once you notice one and you might find another, I think that there could be a narrative that art could play a role in.

Mayor Cason: How many of them are there?

Earl Jackson: I'm sorry?

Mayor Cason: How many of these are there?

Earl Jackson: I'll get back to you.

Commissioner Slesnick: Can we landscape the light poles too and put ivy up?

Earl Jackson: You know we've been working with Brook and checking all of our landscaping moves. One of the great things about the region is vertical landscape, so being able to hang landscape on lights, being able to hang landscape in trees. There are places around town where you see that already, that's one of the things we are developing as an additional layer.

Commissioner Slesnick: Maybe we can use it at Miracle Mile so it's disguised as a lamp – light post.

Earl Jackson: Sure. For sure.

Mayor Cason: In Istanbul they have lights and they have flowers hanging off of all of them. It was spectacular.

Earl Jackson: OK. So a number of elements under refinement – Art in Public Places is one, and we’ve been working with Dona to move this forward. We created a framework that was based pretty much on the art master plan that you had done, maybe five years ago, 2010 or so, and identified opportunities that were different in plazas than you might find in parks. When I say plazas, I really mean LeJeune Plaza, Douglas Plaza, and the potential for Lot 25. When I say parks, I mean Merrick Park, potentially Pittman Park, both aren’t in the scope the same way Miracle Mile and Giralda are, but they’ve been things we’ve been looking at. Streetscape art – There is along the length of the street with noted moments of significant opportunities at intersections and pedestrian crosswalks; and then we even thought the roof tops were an opportunity. There is a solar opportunity and art opportunity there. Our process to date has been in January, I think on our first trip down, the first group of presentations we met the people who are running the public art program, the public art director. We then met art consultants that were hired by the City of Coral Gables to help us make selections. We looked at the 2010 Master Plan. We framed up an approach that was about engaging artists, not necessarily buying art off the shelf and putting it in place, but actually engaging artists, so that there was a meaningful dialogue between the design of the Mile and Giralda and the things that they might think would be appropriate for the new environment, in addition to recognizing the history of the place. We came up with a long list of artists, was far greater than 23 as we began the effort, but we sort of narrowed it down to 23 as our first cut. We had an Arts Advisory Board review with the people on the commission, and looked at those 23 and brought it down to about a dozen. I think that dozen was brought to you at some point and then it was narrowed down to four. We then added a fifth artist and that puts us today at a group of five artists we’ve been discussing the project with. Blessing Hancock, Teresita Fernandez, Count Perrot, Andy Cowl, Cybil Posh, and Jorge Pardo. To date we have been on foot, on site with three of the five artists. We’ve walked and shown them the Mile and talked about opportunities and paseos and alleys and garages, as well as

around the Mile. We've had digital presentations where I have walked these artists through the design to date via *gotomeeting*, because some of them are in California, Cybil Posh is in Switzerland. She actually made the trip here to Miami and walked the Mile with us, Cybil Posh, she is a sculptor. So we've had walks and we've now just as of this week and the week before we started to receive some initial concepts and ideas, sketches and drawings from these artists to look at and discuss the project with. Now the artists on this list are significant artists. Have been on the Washington, D.C. National Arts Council, have done significant things around the world, so their schedules are tough, they are all very busy. They are not all on an equal playing field in terms of the amount of attention we've been able to give them or they've been able to give us, so that's the reason why we've been only been able to get three of the five to the site to date purely because of schedule coordination. We would like to get them all to the same level of engagement before we start to decide which direction we want to take with this. To date, it's been about developing a dialog and an understanding of the place and the project and sees who feels best, and I can say that everybody I've talked to and things we've seen have been surprisingly exciting. Paseos – we have a number of concepts for paseos and we've looked at the number of paseos throughout the project. There is no way to talk about paseos without talking alleys; there is no way to talk about paseos and alleys without talking about garages. We had a high level concept task as a part of the scope of work to think about what paseos might be. We identified the fact that there are two basic types of paseos. There are those that are open to the sky and those that slip through a building as a volume with a roof. And we've made some sketches and some loose things and I think we are at a point now where if the project takes another step forward outside of this scope, we'll be able to pick up on that work and develop those slots for you in stride. There are ten paseos if you count the four that engage Giralda, ten alleys and ten garages, perfect triple-double serendipitous. So it was mentioned before in the introduction that yesterday we had a discussion with members of the steering committee, members of the Commission and members of the design team. The discussion was held to come to some agreement about what should be the limit of the sidewalk?- how do we define the limit of the sidewalk? Another way to put it is, does it have a curb or doesn't it have a curb?- and this has been it's really a schismatic design issue, right, it's a physical issue. It has gone through a number of iterations, we've decided, we've questioned, we've come back, we've asked experts

outside of the project team to look at it, and the next series of slides sort of gets into what that discussion was yesterday and where we are. This is one of the things we're asking for your direction on today. The combination of our team and City staff has pulled together a number of slides that we think are relevant just to show to warm up the conversation. The image you see here is Third Avenue in Naples. It's a curbed street, has a very nice car in it, but it's a public environment that sits behind a wall and there is a sidewalk and there is some curbside planting, which looks like an afterthought, but it's a curbed environment with dining outside. This is I believe Worth Avenue. The big things that stand out to me here, you've got a really narrow street; it's one-way, you've got two lanes of moving traffic with parking on both sides. One of the big challenges on Miracle Mile is that it's 120 feet wide, it's double, essentially than an ideal retail street wants to be at 60 feet or so. So how can we continue to look for ways to narrow the sense of the street? We are doing it with the trees, we are doing it with potentially some paving, some other things. I think it's one thing to keep in mind, but it's a great example of a great environment, great looking street. This one, I believe, is Saratoga Springs. It has an evening environment, lighting detail, and a curb that looks very much like Miracle Mile today, actually. This could, with the exception of the slightly wider sidewalk be Miracle Mile today. One thing, photography always gives you the opportunity to play with light a little bit, but you can see even in this image how much contribution the light from the storefronts plays on the sidewalk. It's very important, I think, to keep a sensitive and ambient level of light on that street. You don't want to make it too bright, so it's one of the things that have factored in going back to the lighting conversation into why we think wrapping the trees like this is such a good thing to do. Curbless environment – this is in Illinois. You can start to see in this image when they've gone curbless the degrees to which they feel like they need to protect that environment with bollard planters, curbs around trees – there is the same bike rack actually that we are showing you.

Vice Mayor Quesada: You know the first thing that jumps out to me when I look at this? First of all it's a little dreary, the location, but it seems very cluttered the way they've tried to create a line of demarcation between the vehicles and the pedestrians. Just seems very cluttered, a hodge-podge of different things.

Earl Jackson: We agree. Clutter has been one of the things that we've talked about. Clutter is a great word because there is a way of seeing use of space, whether it's event space, assembly space, or public space, as being inviting. So you know if you go to, if you are the first one out to meet your friends at a place for dinner and there is nobody in the bar or the restaurant, you are sort of alone and you feel the scale of it, and it's better to be in a room that's smaller because four people in a room that's smaller create an environment that feels right, as opposed to a room that's vacuous when there is four people in it. So clutter is definitely an issue when it's empty, clutter when it's full adds to the mix, and I think, we've been back and forth on this idea of what do elements do and how do they play a role in the space. We don't like clutter, we want to keep the streets clean, open, and as flexible as we possibly can, and I think that's the way that we've been talking about it to date. It's a good point. It feels cluttered and if you go to, Glenn what's the name of this street that we were at in Miami that has all the clutter?- Yes in Mid-Town is a great example of where they tried to get rid of curbs in certain places and it just cluttered the whole thing up, because they tried to protect everything, they put a curb around it.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes, because they have those aluminum or metallic colored bollards that they sort of put in place there. I guess you do get clutter now that I think about it, but really the bigger feeling that you get out of it is more of an industrial type of design feel, which obviously you and I have discussed this, it's not our aesthetic.

Earl Jackson: Right. There has been questions about you know, whether or not a curb is actually tied to the scale of the street. So we talked the last time, you and I met, about the fact that in Manhattan where we are taking back our streets and giving them to pedestrians, there are a ton of curbless environments. The one you see here is just outside of Madison Square Park, this is Broadway, so Broadway is a curbless environment and some locations that's the same furniture, that same bistro chair and tables that are being used. You can see that they set bollards and planters up to delineate the difference between those areas. In some ways, the bollard with the planter softens the environment, because it adds a little green, a little flower to the space. In the upper left you can see the triangle here is the wedge that used to be the curbed traffic island, and

then the additional what looks like 15 to 20 feet or more stretching from that curb to the edge is the curbless environment on both sides; and the ability to set up flexible, movable furniture.

Commissioner Slesnick: You mean that's where parking used to be?

Earl Jackson: There was never parking.

Commissioner Slesnick: There was never parking.

Commissioner Keon: There was never parking.

Earl Jackson: Yes. Yes.

Commissioner Slesnick: Just a lane of traffic.

Commissioner Keon: Lanes of traffic.

Earl Jackson: It was lanes of traffic and it may have been, if there were parking it was probably no New York City signs, it was probably the "no parking between 7 and 7", "deliveries only," kind of thing.

Commissioner Slesnick: It could use more trees.

Earl Jackson: Oh, for sure. What's happened was, you know New York City was a pioneer in this idea, taking streets away in the early 2000's, and it's hard for people to think of taking away what they already have and doing something different. So what New York City did was, they said well, let's not spend a lot of money on it, let's just paint it, and try to use it a different way and see what happens. So what you see in many of these cases is literally just paint, that's the reason why it's curbless.

Commissioner Slesnick: So they never had curbs there to begin with?- they just painted that lane?

Earl Jackson: They painted it out to give the use over to the pedestrian. Now that they've been widely accepted and the people love them, you know most historic and significant is that section of Broadway at 42nd Street that is completely closed, and now those things are being designed and built with more permanent finishes and surfaces.

Commissioner Keon: Are they remaining curbless?

Earl Jackson: Alex would you know the answer to the Time Square one? With the Time Square paving, do you know if that section – I think it is, because it has to be revocable.

Commissioner Keon: Right, I thought it was too.

Commissioner Lago: They just used the planters as a demarcation...the line.

Commissioner Keon: But they are going into a more permanent.

Earl Jackson: And they are putting new pavers down. There is another image, that's a close-up of that same edge with the planters and the curbless environment. It brings us to the Mile, and we've talked about this as an aesthetic issue, as a performance issue, as a safety issue, as a number of different issues. We created two renderings for Miracle Mile, so that you could get an understanding of visual impact of the two, and I'll click back and forth between these. So this is Miracle Mile with a curb, its looks great. Without a curb, you can see what changes are the bollards have been introduced so that cars can understand the limit of where they park better.

Vice Mayor Quesada: There is an interplay and safety between the trees and the bollards.

Earl Jackson: Yes. So the bollards are actually in line with trees that sit at the limit of the sidewalk. The tree that's in the foreground at the left maybe creeping a little toward the sidewalk, but that's one at the back end of parking, so you'll have trees, lights, utility poles, and bollards in that line of the limit of the sidewalk, and I have a couple of slides to show you how that layers out. So that's with the curb and that's with curbless.

Mayor Cason: So you lose a little space with the bollards.

Earl Jackson: You lose a little space for the bollard. We were challenged on this notion of clutter to say, you know, our steering committee said well, if we have them can you design them so that they are not intrusive?- and that's where the design of the bollard that we have today comes from where it's also a seat.

Commissioner Keon: It becomes a seat.

Mayor Cason: People on sitting on those...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Absolutely – yes. Maybe you are waiting outside a store, maybe it's not in front of a restaurant that's got tables and chairs or maybe it's full and you've got to wait five minutes because someone's in the store, who knows?

Commissioner Lago: Maybe a child in a stroller you have a moment to sit down.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Absolutely. I think the idea of designing it the way they've designed it is so that it serves that little purpose, the one of safety.

Mayor Cason: I was just wondering – right up near the edge of the cars.

Vice Mayor Quesada: And actually the design is encouraging that people sit on it.

Earl Jackson: Yes. So we have after these two images, and I'll just click back and forth, so you can see the difference again. I have a list, now you are going to have to bear with me, because every few slides there is a word only slide, which is I know is a little rough to have on the screen for too long, but we've broken these, sort of issues of whether we have a curb or don't have a curb into four primary categories, so that we could evaluate them, and have an informed discussion about which direction we should take on this.

Commissioner Keon: Could you go back to your image though on the curb or curbless?- because what you can't see, it's hard to visualize here is what you see in the curbed environment is that white line that demarcates the curb. What you don't see in the curbless is that the pavement or some sort of stone extends out into where the cars are parked.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So it's not asphalt.

Commissioner Keon: It's not asphalt. So what you also do essentially with that is you narrow, visually you narrow the street. So instead of having that wide expansion of asphalt, what you have is stone that comes out to the outer edge of the parking line and then just two lanes of road or carriageway that are asphalt.

Commissioner Slesnick: So you are saying the pavers that we are using would go out to include...

Commissioner Keon: Well not necessarily the pavers – it doesn't necessarily have to be the pavers that are on the sidewalk, but it is a paver that is consistent with those, but it could be less expensive or whatever. It takes itself out to the...

Earl Jackson: Yes. I'm going to show you the before...

Commissioner Keon: OK – but it’s hard to see – that image is hard to visualize on that, in that picture and to see the effect of that as far a narrowing the street is difficult to see from that vantage point.

Earl Jackson: Ideally we would make 14 of these renderings that show what’s like when the car is not there and all those things. We tried to get as many of those aspects in and point to the corner that shows where there is a texture to help those who are visually impaired and all kinds of other things. I’ll walk you through all these issues in the slides to come. So we’ve grouped them into four categories, so that we don’t skip around too much between topical points on the issue. The first water and drainage – nobody wants water on the Mile, when it rains getting it off the Mile as soon as possible is kind of, I won’t say job one; job one is always safety, but water is definitely job two, because its property owners value, its shops, its quality of life, its all of those things. So we’ve got a category for water and drainage. We’ve got a category which is very short for the automobile; we’ve got a long list of things to discuss as comparatives in terms of the role for people. And finally, we are going to tell you that there is a cost difference between the two and talk a little bit about what that means. So on water and drainage, there are four points that, at least four points that we can compare. Cut and dry – the curb system uses catch basin for surface intake. Without a curb we have a catch basin plus a trench drain, so a linear drain that runs the length of the Mile to help pull water off of it. The catch basin for curb is exactly like the work that you guys have on Ponce now for that recent upgrade. Number two, the curb provides a vertical backstop for surface water and drainage, if the system fails, for standing water that curb helps it collect in a place that can be organized and ordered and the slope of the street is a little deeper to help hold some capacity there. Without a curb – there is concern about the smooth grade as meaning, if there is any failure water would be shallower, but would cover a greater area.

Mayor Cason: If the drainage would fail with the curb it still doesn’t mean that it would stop it from going over the curb, so...

Earl Jackson: Right. The ability to predict storms is an increasingly difficult...

Commissioner Lago: Which is currently the case today.

Mayor Cason: It's not a failsafe; it helps light rain, if it fails.

Earl Jackson: Right. Number three, the drain location in the curb is at the inside edge of parking, so it's about 23 feet with a width of the drain 24 feet away from the storefront. Without a curb, it's 31 feet, because it's on the outside of parking edge away from the property lines. Number four, surface maintenance – if you put a curb in and did the drainage exactly the way you did it on Ponce, maintenance would occur exactly the way it occurs today. If you did without a curb and you had a trench drain, you are introducing a new drainage system that you have to rethink maintenance a little bit in order to fully handle.

Mayor Cason: You wouldn't be able to use the street sweeper that we have with the curbless?

Earl Jackson: Glenn can talk to the machinery a little bit better than I can.

Mr. Kephart: I'll speak to that in a minute. We have a slide that shows the differences between the two and some of the things that we've considered, so perhaps you do this slide and then we can talk about the differences and the maintenance and those things.

Earl Jackson: So the first graphic compares the two – is a catch basin here at the back corner of parking. That's the tree, the backend of parking; this is the curb edge limit of the sidewalk. Another tree at the front end of parking and you have a catch basin and a catch basin at the corners. So there is longitudinal slope that allows water to eventually get from the middle of the space to those locations. Without a curb, you get an overflow catch basin at the front end of those planters and you get a trench drain that connects the two, so you have a continuous line of drainage for the full length of the Mile, hence you can see the additional cost. In this image, we are showing the paving extending out to that limit. In this image, we are showing the asphalt coming in. I'll talk a little bit more about that when we get to the other area. We decided as a

group yesterday, it's not mutually exclusive. If you put a curb in, you can still extend the paving into that parking area and reduce the presence of asphalt. In the sense of asphalt for the street, we think that's a good thing to do, if we can find the money to do it, in any event. The second slide looks at catching that water and before the meeting started today, I spent some time out there also. Creating a change in the surface to hold water is basically what the curb does, and Glenn you have some numbers and things to talk about on this slide.

Mr. Kephart: Thank you Earl. I would just add the issue of the curb or curbless has been an issue that the steering committee and the design team and staff have spent a lot of time on issue evaluating. The steering committee expressed a pretty strong opinion that they really like the curbless design, as long as they had assurances that from a drainage standpoint it could work. Staff expressed some concerns about how well the drainage worked initially, and I will say the design team and their engineers worked really hard to consider those concerns and do what they could to address them. One of the things from a standpoint, I'll explain in this slide, some of them they have addressed and some of them they still have some concerns about. I'll cover that and talk about what that means. In this slide, and what we are really trying to depict is the difference between curb and curbless. This is your traditional curb and this blue area represents water storage, and in the bottom that's your curbless design and your low point is out at the outside of it, edge of parked cars adjacent to where the travel cars will go. In considering these two options, some of the things we considered were, does the overall drainage system work? We know that the curbed system works, as Earl had talked about very similar to what we have on Ponce de Leon and the new projects, and they work very well. We don't have drainage problems with those projects. So we know how to design that so it will work, and we challenged our engineers on that. They have looked at the curbless design and we made it clear that it needs to work as well as the curbed design and they have assured us and they have put in some extra security measures, some extra drainage, so that – and are confident that will work, and as an engineer I can help myself and say, OK, what if it doesn't work?- what happens then?- what if the water does for some reason the system gets overloaded and whether its clogging or a storm that is just beyond the capacity of what the system can hold, what happens?- and that's what these picture depict. In a typical curb environment, the curb provides a backstop and storage for

water that is in the place where cars are parked, so it doesn't get out into the travel lane and it provides some protection to not get in the pedestrian environment. In the curbless environment, that low point is out at the edge of parked cars and adjacent to where the cars move through and the water builds up into a point where the travel cars would actually go through a little bit of water if this system clogged. Our engineers are designing this system so that it will work well on day one, and what is the likelihood that it will clog?- we've got to maintain it really well. One of my concerns was that similar to this chair over here, the trench drain grate that is out there has to have very small openings because they have to be smaller than a half inch heel, so that if you step out of your car your heel doesn't go into it; and given that we have a lot of trees on the Mile we do have the issue of a lot of debris and a lot of leaves falling and they could tend to clog up those trench drains. Is that likely to happen often?- hopefully not. If it does happen, we get this condition where the cars going through could splash onto parked cars and create a little bit of flow-back toward the sidewalk. The engineers have – and so we need to maintain the system, if we go its curbless very, very well so that we keep it free-flowing.

Mayor Cason: Have you looked at other cities that have curbless, what is the actual experience on heavy rain storms? The worst thing would be to have cars going through and spray everybody on the sidewalk.

Mr. Kephart: The other cities we looked at that have a similar environment with vegetation we have tended to be more narrow streets. And similar to what we are doing on Giralda, we are draining the water to the middle of the street, so you don't have the similar issues and the slower traffic, and it's just not as wide of an environment. This one you've got a fair amount of water coming toward that trench drain. And like I said, the engineers took our concerns at heart and they designed it, secondary backup systems, so you are not going to get overall flooding of the Mile. What you can get is nuisance flooding if water backs up in that trench drain. And you asked the question about maintenance. Currently we sweep the streets at night when there aren't any cars there, and we also have periodic maintenance of our underground system and our catch basins. We would still sweep the streets the same as we do today and on a nightly basis, which would work fairly well with the trench drain. I suspect and it's something that we don't currently

do today, we'll probably also have to integrate a power washing into that trench drain, because over time as the little leaves go and they start to collect in there, the street sweepers won't get all of that, it will just push some of it down into the grate and that will build up over time. So we'll have to watch that and see the frequency that we need to then power wash that to keep that clean, because it's going to be very, very important not to have this condition exist. So we looked at those, like I said, from an overall standpoint, they've addressed the entire...flood, the nuisance flooding is going to be on us from a maintenance standpoint, along with the B.I.D. to make sure that we don't let paper bags and plastic bags and things clog this up; and then there is the issue of the cost that the – in order to put in the extra systems and we'll talk about the cost here at the end of this to discuss that.

Mayor Cason: Are the drainage basins going to be bigger than the ones we have now regardless of which way we go?

Mr. Kephart: Yes. There are a lot of 12-inch drains out there now. The designers have recommended 15-inch, and our contractor is even saying maybe you should go with 18-inch because it cost us about the same to put in an 18-inch pipe as it does a 15-inch pipe, so you are only paying the difference of the pipes. We are very confident, I'm very confident that the underground system either way is going to handle the capacity and so it becomes a matter of what happens at the surface, if it fails, and what amount of maintenance that we have to do on it to assure that it doesn't.

Commissioner Lago: I just want to kind of talk to you about a few things that we discussed yesterday in the meeting. I was unsure in reference to what direction I was going to head curb or curbless, but I've made my decision in reference to this kind of design. I'm leaning now toward really going curbless, because I think that when you take into account the current system that we have in place, the fact that you are going to see significant percolation, and correct me if I'm wrong, as a result of the new paver system, you are not going to have all that asphalt, you are not going to have all that basically concrete that just pushes the water. You are going to have some percolation through the pavers, you are going to have the existing catch basins, new trench

drains, new landscaping drains. You are going to have an upgraded system, you are going to have the trees, and you are also going to have, which I think is the most important issue that we talked about yesterday and that is, a maintenance system in place that has never existed before to this degree. So, I think that we all these new failsafe measures. I think that in my opinion, aesthetically curbless is obviously the more beautiful option, and I think that it's in the best interest of the City.

Commissioner Keon: I think programmatically there is an advantage to curbless too, as long as the other issues have been dealt with and the drainage issues are properly addressed, I think the programmatic opportunities that the curbless design provides for us is better than a curbed design. You could talk about that later.

Mayor Cason: The cost side so then we can then look at the whole...

Commissioner Lago: I jumped the gun there because I have seen the presentation yesterday, so I understood the cost analysis already.

Earl Jackson: What I have is a series of points in each of those four categories and graphics to go with each, so you have visualization. Maybe what I suggest we do is take a pass through them, so we all have visual recognition of what's there and then we can continue a more unilateral discussion across all four issues, because it's hard to separate them, and then we can refer back and forth to the slides that we have in the show. So to the point of distance, this is 23 feet from the property line versus 33 feet on top of the overlay, that shows the surface coverage issue. For the automobile, there are a couple of points. With the curb you have point of contact between an auto and the curb at the tire. You know people drive up and hit the curb all the time when they are parking because they depend on that curb as being the backstop. Without a curb you have a bollard and we've actually designed a bollard so it looks lightweight, you know it's a heavy piece of stone, possibly even anchored, it looks lightweight so there is a sense of trying not to hit it. Nobody wants to hit it with their car because the point of contact is not your bumper. Resilient to contact automobiles that curb takes a beating; the bollard will if people smash into it,

potentially chip and it will have to be repaired or replaced, if there are significant damages done to it. For people there is a longer list and I'll go quickly, because this is the slide that looks like white noise to me when I see it on the screen. Curb is very common and prevalent in the region, no curb not as prominent. Curb – fewer street elements within the limit of the sidewalk creating greater flexibility for outdoor furnishing between the limit of the sidewalk and the storefront. Bollards are introduced – we were challenged with the idea that bollards might be clutter, so we've tried to make bollards also seats. Number nine – legal limits of how the City defines where restaurants can put tables and chairs, maybe slightly bigger with a curb, because you can get them closer to it without having a bollard in place. So there is a slight area difference there. Number ten – with a curb, you have the curb to negotiate if you decide to do events beyond the limit of the sidewalk. Without a curb you have a smoother transition, so you are able to extend tables and chairs and events and other things without having to negotiate the grade. Now people negotiate the grade in other cities, parking day in San Francisco, in New York, and in other places, sometimes build a platform, a temporary platform that matches the level of the curb. They put it out there during the event and it tapers off into the road. Others just put a new surface down and they just negotiate the curb, but you do have that step that you have to negotiate when you extend program beyond the limit of the sidewalk. Number eleven – there is little pressure to have additional stone in the parking when there is a curb. It's easier to bring the asphalt in because that space really feels like its auto-dominant. When there is no curb, it's more desirable to bring that paving out. Again, they are not mutually exclusive, you can do paving in either one, but I think there is a tendency toward each. The difference in paving, regardless of whether it's curb or no curb, when you pave the parking areas we do a measurement about 50 percent of the Mile is asphalt. When you do paving out to the limit of parking it's about 40 percent. So you get a 10 percent reduction in asphalt.

Commissioner Lago: Let me ask you just a quick, well more a statement and I'll propose this to the Manager as we discussed yesterday. We were discussing the opportunity of potentially getting away from asphalt and extending the pavers or the cobble stones all the way into the street for a multitude of reasons. Obviously, it slows traffic down, its more aesthetically pleasing,

is there a possibility that you could with the help of the contractor, maybe give us analysis and what the delta would be in reference to the cost of going that route?

Mr. Kephart: If you would like, I mean we did at six o'clock this morning a back of a napkin magnitude of what...

Commissioner Lago: You know I've never asked you to do that.

Mr. Kephart: No, but it's looking like about a \$2 million delta, if we go with something like our traditional, not the pavers we are talking about on the sidewalk, but for a Chicago Brick type of paver that we use on our streets and other areas.

Commissioner Slesnick: Can you wait a second? I can't hear.

Mr. Kephart: Sure.

[Note: The sound of an ambulance going by].

Mr. Kephart: What I had said, we did a quick analysis of what it would take, because Commissioner Lago asked yesterday, if what would be the cost delta to pave the street with pavers?- and we considered for a practicality standpoint, we wouldn't use the expensive granite, it would be reasonably something like our Chicago Brick or the types of paves that we do in our traffic calming or some of our neighborhoods and some of our entrance features. So for Chicago Brick, based on the square footage of paving we have, we believe it would be somewhere around a \$2 million increase to pave Miracle Mile with pavers, as opposed to asphalt, and that number would need to be vetted for sure with the contractor.

Commissioner Lago: Of course. I would ask you, obviously through the Manager, to please look into that and maybe Chicago Brick is not the answer, maybe we want to use a different material which matches the proposed pavers that are being installed on the sidewalks, but I think it's

something that we should really explore right now, because now is the time to do that, and I think it would be just another option that would heighten the beauty of this project.

Commissioner Slesnick: Just to clarify. If you went beyond the sidewalk out to cover up the parking spot, it wouldn't be Chicago Brick; it would be something similar to what's already there on pavers.

Mr. Kephart: That's correct.

Commissioner Slesnick: So the pavers are that much more expensive to keep going out over the asphalt, \$2 million roughly?

Mr. Kephart: It's the entire street...

Commissioner Keon: He was talking about the whole street, all the asphalt.

Earl Jackson: He's talking about the entire street.

Commissioner Slesnick: The \$2 million going all the way across the street.

Commissioner Keon: All the way to the median.

Mr. Kephart: That's what the \$2 million was.

Commissioner Slesnick: Is that what you were talking about?

Commissioner Lago: Yes. Yes. I just want to explore it because I think it would be a beautiful option.

Commissioner Slesnick: But are we exploring, if we go curbless going out to where the end of the parking spot would be?

Commissioner Keon: Yes.

Mayor Cason: Yes. That's your cost analysis.

Earl Jackson: And I have images and the cost slide.

Commissioner Lago: Like I told you that before. I jumped the gun when I started talking about why I'm in favor of curb or curbless, because I was the Sunshine Meeting yesterday.

Earl Jackson: Lastly, the point of how you get out of your car when you are a parallel parker, there is a difference of experience there. Pedestrian or a passenger gets out with the curb, even if there is water on the street; they step on the curb over the puddle. When there is no curb depending on the extent there could, if there is drainage failure, be water there, otherwise you step out unto the same surface on the sidewalk. For the driver in curbless, the drain is between parking and driving. So the driver has a drain somewhere between where he's parked and where a moving car is to negotiate. You can test this, if you go to the site where we built the mockup, there is a white line in the road. If you park your car against that parallel and you look at the white line as being the drain, you can just ask yourself, is that distance, to what extent is that distance an issue?- and then there are design details with the size of the openings and the way that the trench drain is covered that we could try to negotiate to make sure that, that's not a bad thing. It's a serious concern, I think Glenn's point is taken, I don't think I want anybody stepping out on what feels like a big open drain, so it's one of the things on our list. Before any comparative, for people, one of the things that we've gone through and I think through the course of this discussion, we've all gone back and forth in terms of whether or not we thought curb or curbless was better for different reasons. One of the things we've discussed was safety and in many cases whether you have a curb or not, you have multiple layers between where people move and where moving traffic is, I think to help keep this pedestrian environment safe. Seven

layers, as a matter of fact, and I'll just walk you through them really quickly. Where people walk is up against the storefront primarily, that area ranges from 5 feet at a minimum, a little more than 5 feet at a minimum to about 23 feet, if you get the full width of the sidewalk. The first layer of things that keep you from walking out into the street is the new program. So restaurants are going to put tables and chairs out on the street, so there is a first layer there that keeps people from wondering. The second layer is the line of permanent seats, bollards and planting, so trees and planting areas are another layer of defense from walking out. The bollards themselves, if you take a bollard as being the beginning of two feet from a curb, and set that in the same environment in curbside, it looks like this. Obviously, we don't have a bollard where there is a curb, so what we are looking at here, instead of someone who's not able-bodied or is visually impaired; they would find the curb because of the change in drop. For us we've got stone that has a series of grooves cut in it, so they would feel the texture change and they...

Mayor Cason: There would be no impediment ADA, wheelchairs or anything between the trees and the bollards to get out the cars?

Earl Jackson: From an ADA standpoint, you can come onto the sidewalk anywhere without a curb. With a curb, you obviously depend on the vehicle that sets you on the upper level of the sidewalk or you use the crosswalks.

Mayor Cason: I mean the bollards and the trees won't be more of an ADA impact.

Earl Jackson: No. No. There is space wide enough that it's not.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Also keep in mind when you have meters there, the metered parking that we have; we don't have metered handicap parking spaces. You just need to have that distance to be able to get and out of the vehicle with a wheelchair, with a walker, or whatever requirement, so there are no issues.

Commissioner Lago: Just to make sure, we've probably touched on it before. We are not going to have designated meters per car, correct? Maybe that's a question for Kinney. Just the machine, correct?

Mr. Kinney: Yes. That's the instruction we gave that to the design...[inaudible – off mic].

Commissioner Lago: Great work. Just want to make sure. Again, the Vice Mayor said, as little clutter as possible.

Earl Jackson: The next slide is that edge that we just referred to. In that image that's where that curb would be versus the textured stone. The biggest barrier is parked cars. We are hearing that you turn over a parked car on the Mile at least 15 times a day. So the majority of the time people are on the Mile there are cars parked there. So that coupled with the planters at the ends really creates a very hard line that keeps people generally safe on Miracle Mile. Lastly, the trench drain is another physical thing that people will recognize. The trench drain will probably sit in a bit of a swale, so it's another physical recognition of layering. Lastly, there is moving cars, so I feel pretty confident that this is a really safe pedestrian environment where we are putting together. The area of clutter and new program has come up. Without a bollard we can pull the distance from the storefront or the property line, let's say property line, to two feet from within the curb to about 21 feet. It's noted at 26, but I think it's better to call it 21 feet. If the City is permitting this, there has been direction that they don't want to permit beyond the edge of the bollard, so that pulls that back to 19 feet. It would be 19.4; the bollards are about 18 inches to 2 feet wide depending on the final scale of it. We zoomed in on this just to make it clear. In that three-quarters of an acre that you are picking up for a program on Miracle Mile.

Vice Mayor Quesada: [Inaudible – off mic].

Earl Jackson: This is the storefront here, the property line. This is an alcove – we had a discussion about the paving. So there is an in-code, there is a five-foot minimum walk. We talked yesterday with Commissioner Keon about the fact that you probably want to be nine or ten

feet, if you want four people to be able to move up and down the sidewalk with ease. In almost all cases we have that. There are a couple of places where existing trees remain in place, we put a bench around it to protect the roots and planting area, and there is no setback in the building, where you get down to about six feet. That's actually not a bad thing; it creates more of a meander on, on the path anyway. So the big differences here are again, those 21 feet and the 19 feet, if you permit to the edge of that line. In either case, Wayne Eldridge will show you pictures of his establishment on a Thursday night, where people are leaning on parked cars and spilling out onto the sidewalk. The issue of coverage in terms of asphalt is demonstrated in this diagram, without paving in the parking area, whether its curb or curbless, it looks and feels like this, 50 percent of the right-of-way is asphalt. When you pave that parking area, you go to 40 percent asphalt, if there is a nod to paving the entire width of the Mile then obviously all the asphalt goes away. One of the biggest issues for me is the experience, so we did a zoom in on what it would mean to get out of the car, step out of the car in a traditional condition right onto a curb. Without a curb you step right out onto the same level. For the driver, there is a drain to negotiate. I feel like there is about two feet of space between the limit of the car and where that is. You can't get science on that, because you are either a good parker or not a good parker. You are either driving a narrow car or a really wide car, so that's a hard thing to pin down scientifically, but we are cognizant that there is an issue there and we are trying to make the best of what it would be. So, the bigger thing at the end of the day, I think, is the bottom line is having no curb is more expensive than having a curb. The number you see on the screen one and-a-half to \$2 million more is generated by putting a number of new paving in there. So the number of paving the parking area right now we calculated about \$800,000 more, so that's a big chunk of it, almost half. The bollards themselves, if you don't have bollards the number between bollards, you have 68 in the project, including those on Giralda, you go up to 233. So the delta on bollards is about \$280,000, so you see a bollard and furniture expense. And then the number on drainage that we have to date is plus or minus half-a-million dollars. So, if you add that up, you start looking at about \$1.6 (million), and then you put in cost differentials for labor and some other things and you are in that range of between \$1.5 and \$2 million more.

Mayor Cason: Based on where you come up with all the various elements. If we went with without a curb would that still fit within the budget that we were talking about?- or would it go over?

Earl Jackson: Right now the way we have the numbers penciled out, I think we are over the budget.

Commissioner Keon: By how much?

Mr. Kephart: I would address that. The design development estimate right now and we worked real hard to get it within budget, and within budget with a curb, but there is not a lot of flexibility in that budget, so one-and-a-half to \$2 million, I believe is would need to be an addition to the existing budget.

Commissioner Keon: Can we use Traffic Impact Fees to pave that parking area to reduce the appearance of asphalt as a traffic calming measure?

Commissioner Lago: From the County.

Commissioner Keon: There are traffic impact fees that we pay, that builders pay into the area and we can – traffic calming is one of the uses of traffic impact fees on major roadways. I think part of the value of using the pavers out to the parking line that it does reduce the amount of asphalt and it visually reduces the size of the road which will cause people to go slower. So is it, potentially is that a source of – that's \$800,000 of that, is that right?- it's about \$800,000, so it's almost two-thirds of the million dollars, of the million and-a-half dollars.

Mr. Kephart: That's a very interesting question and one that we will follow up to evaluate, if that would be OK. We'll discuss it with the County.

Commissioner Keon: OK.

Vice Mayor Quesada: I think it's a very sound argument. Commissioner Keon continues to be taking out of the box. I love it. I think it's a great idea.

Commissioner Keon: Well, you know, when I worked for Jimmy Morales as an Aide, and the City was looking for ways to cover the cost of the median on Ponce, I worked with Bill Kerdyk to formulate the application, so that it qualified, and so I think a lot of it is working with the staff to put an application that actually expresses what the intent is and why you want to do it. So, I think there is potential for it.

Mr. Kephart: I think also, and we have a very good relationship with the staff that manages that program, so we'll have the discussions with them. I think another possibility is on the parallel parking, because they really look for capacity improvements more than traffic calming.

Commissioner Keon: Yes. We'll put both.

Mr. Kephart: So capacity – yes, we'll have that discussion.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Before we get into that conversation, Mr. Mayor, I think we need to determine whether on this dais whether we want to go curb or curbless. I think we need to make that decision before we engage any other kind of effort...

Commissioner Keon: Right. Yes.

Vice Mayor Quesada:...and put any other energy into it.

Mayor Cason: Can you summarize the advantages of the two? I think part of it is reduces the asphalt, so it probably with some traffic calming, slower traffic.

Commissioner Keon: I think it's more programmatically. I think we talked about that kind of at length yesterday, and I think the steering committee was, in general, it's my understanding that the steering committee is supportive of curbless over curb, is that right? Can someone speak for them? Do you have a spokesman for the steering committee?- or no?

Vice Mayor Quesada: Is there a recommendation from the steering committee?

Mayor Cason: Was there consensus?

Vice Mayor Quesada: Can you speak into the microphone for those watching at home?

Commissioner Keon: Is Wayne Eldridge here, still?

Vice Mayor Quesada: He was here earlier, I think he stepped away.

Earl Jackson 2: The consensus of the steering committee was that there was more favor of curbless. It was not a unanimous consensus. Concerns regarding now were flooding into the storefronts, reducing the sidewalk by two feet, and the other issue that came up was, if you are not going to pave the parking spaces with pavers, the curbless idea was probably not worthwhile.

Commissioner Keon: Right. OK. That was my understanding, but I think the overwhelming support was for a curbless design, and I thought it was – there thought was and the B.I.D. was that it allowed for a lot of flexibility in programming on the street, that if – to keep in mind that this is an economic development project. It is to encourage retail on that street that is what the whole intent of this is. So it's not a matter of bringing outside events to the Mile for a party, it's being able to at Christmas time to set up like the Christmas Shops that you see all over Europe on the Mile. It's to have; you know if you are going to have a dining experience you can do that on the Mile. You can also – the curbless also really lends itself, there are a lot of cities around the world that on Sundays will close their street to traffic. They'll close it to traffic, they take the parking out and they make it a – and it can be from 8 till noon or something, that's it's a real

walking environment and a pedestrian environment. Curbless adds to your ability to do all of these things a little better than curbs, because you don't have that restriction of the changing grade. It's particularly good as people grow older, they fall off of curbs, or trip on curbs. So it was for those reasons. Now I understand that the cost is an issue, so I think we can have a preference and then look at cost, but that's up to you.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So, I think, why don't you make a motion?

Commissioner Keon: I'd like to make a motion that we go with the curbless design, with consideration of cost.

Commissioner Lago: I'll second the motion.

Mayor Cason: Commissioner Keon makes the motion, Commissioner Lago...

Commissioner Keon: Do you want that clarified?

Commissioner Slesnick: Discussion – discussion. Do we have an opinion by the B.I.D. of what the business owners prefer curb or curbless?

Commissioner Keon: They were part of the steering committee.

Mayor Cason: Marina are you going to speak?

Mr. Jaime Correa: I'm Jaime Correa, an urban design professor at the School of Architecture of the University of Miami, Very familiar with curbless streets, and I applaud the efforts of the City Manager, you and the City Manager, because this project is overdue and both citizens and property owners have been waiting with great eagerness and optimism for this project. In principal the ideas by the New York designers sounds very good, it sounds great, but we have learned is that not only in Coral Gables, but in every urban environment around the world

everything is interconnected. Once we take a decision somewhere, regarding let's say, land use or location or landscape, general welfare, whatever you want, that decision will affect something or somewhere else with macro and micro behaviors. This is particularly true in relationship to land use, to parking, and to traffic speeding. Therefore, a curbless street is great, not bad – it's not a bad design proposition, but it requires a very serious discussion about territoriality, appropriateness, and scale. In terms of territoriality, they've already explained that everyone on a curbless street needs to know exactly what area of the public space they own. Perceptually, demarcation of areas for humans and cars must be clearly noticed by the space users. In terms of appropriateness, a curbless street on an arterial road, remember that this is an arterial road, offers less protection to pedestrians and on people seating in open air restaurants, due to traffic and parking, and issues of – by introducing these bollards that would seem it would diminish the sidewalk space by approximately four feet. I know we are talking about two feet, but it's approximately four feet. The net shortage of sidewalk space will be one foot six inches according to the drawings, which means that this will reduce the net potential revenue for retailers and restaurant owners on the Mile by 25 percent. I'm sure that now you see one of the problems. A curbless street requires no vertical changes, no steps, meaning that either the entire road will have to go up or the sidewalks will have to come down, creating a negative consequence in both cases. Section slopes will need to be very carefully studied in order to be perceived as flat, and in order to keep the same entrances and in the same height of entrances to the existing retail establishments. Plus, you already saw the drainage when it fails causes problems, not only on the sidewalk side, but also on the roadside. So it will cause problems for traffic and for people using the sidewalks. A curbless street will increase also the opportunity of jay walking. Now fourth, insurance policies for the City of Coral Gables and property owners will also increase, obviously after the first accident. This is a pure pragmatic issue. I've done similar streets, I mean in Lauderdale by the Sea very close, you don't have to go to anywhere foreign, and moreover their professional liability as a consultant, I mean I know this, will increase exponentially. If the drainage fails it will be a problem for the property owners and a hazard for the pedestrians. In order to solve this problem there are two well documented alternatives in design in....as it refers to conflict and resolution and as explained by Nobel Prize Lauriat Thomas Schilling at the University of Maryland. The first one is what they call creating Schilling points or focal points,

which is what they've been talking about, which is to increase the awareness and to modify human behavior and in this case they will do that by requiring asphalt pavements that change or pavements that change from asphalt to other materials that create awareness on the part of the driver, not just on parallel parking areas, and save rough pavers along the entire Mile, which will reduce the speed. I mean when you have to use Schilling points for pedestrian streets, you have to reduce the speed to 15 miles per hour that will be a regional issue that will require further traffic engineering studies and that will increase the overall budget by a substantial amount, approximately – we were calculating also in a napkin in the back by \$3.2 million, not just \$2 million. Another idea for a focal Schilling point will be to provide temporary barriers, say bollards like they have, nor should we forget that things might take – will be a little bit more challenging during nighttime. The other thing – the second idea will be to develop what in urban design is now called a “street diet,” which is back basically leaving the same configuration, but less of this or less of the other. Chuck and I have done studies...LeJeune on what we call the 50/50 factor, and we know that very successful streets all over the world have 50 percent of the available street width vacated to pedestrian uses, and 50 percent maximum to automobile users. Therefore, it does not need to be curbless for it to work. The way that you have it right now it will work. We've seen that there are more costs than benefits. If a curbless street is what you desire in the City of Coral Gables, you should do further engineering studies to understand the regional effects and should the designers from New York to provide the necessary Schilling points to make it work, including its cost increase and new budget amounts. And one last thing to consider, if this is what you really want, what kind of shared street, a curbless street will you get when you always have parking cars, parked cars on the street? How many times a year will you be able to use this street the way it is proposed as a curbless street? Thank you very much.

Mayor Cason: A question. Are you speaking on behalf of the B.I.D. or yourself as a member of the B.I.D.?

Mr. Jaime Correa: Well, I'm speaking on behalf of myself, as a member of the University of Miami, but I'm a consultant to the B.I.D. regarding the new code for Miracle Mile and Giralda.

Mayor Cason: OK. Marina do you want to add any context to this and answer any of this?

Ms. Marina Foglia: And Jaime as well as Burton and Chuck, they were part of the original design firm for streetscape and they were the ones who worked on the proposal that was sent to Commission back in 2009.

Commissioner Keon: Have you had a consensus of your B.I.D., or are you speaking on your own behalf Marina?

Ms. Foglia: The B.I.D. Board, we have representation from the streetscape steering committee, but as a Board we have not had ample discussion as to the matter, so I cannot tell you right now the Board if they agree one way or the other.

Commissioner Keon: OK. So you can't speak on behalf of the B.I.D.

Ms. Foglia: Exactly. I think that we still need to have another conversation with the Board on that based on all these conversations.

Commissioner Lago: But you have a consultant on behalf of the B.I.D. who just spoke basically against curbless.

Ms. Foglia: Currently he is working with us on the overlay, which is part of the streetscape that is like the software for the streetscape and yes, so Jaimie Correa and Associates and I know that Chuck consults with him as well.

Commissioner Keon: Alright, but you have a member from the B.I.D. that is on that steering committee, it hasn't gone back to the B.I.D. for that purpose to have that discussion?

Ms. Foglia: You are talking about Victor. During the Board meetings we report on what is going on, but we haven't had ample discussion as to this issue, because until recently we were going

with a curbed option, so we really haven't gone back to the Board weighing all the options and seeing what the overall consensus is.

Mayor Cason: What was the consensus?- what was the vote in the steering committee on the question of curb and curbless?- was there a vote on it?

Mr. Jorge Cooperman: There was no formal vote.

Ms. Foglia: No formal vote.

City Attorney Leen: Microphone.

Commissioner Keon: Could you say who you are too and who you are speaking on behalf of.

Mr. Jorge Cooperman: Jorge Cooperman, I'm a member of the Business Improvement District Board of Directors appointed to be part of the steering committee, along with other colleagues in here. We've been meeting for a large number of hours at the steering committee level; I'm a property owner by the way, 137 Giralda Avenue. At no instance we voted at the level of Board of Directors whether the initiative was going to be curb or curbless. All of the discussions were taken place at the streetscape committee, where we never strictly voted. My sense is that we moved more and more toward curbless. Yesterday we had another meeting with two of you, Commissioner Lago and Commissioner Keon, and we continuously agreed that the best approach is curbless. You are asking, Mr. Mayor, for an actual vote, there wasn't an actual vote, but its consensus.

Mayor Cason: Alright.

City Attorney Leen: Please note that meeting with the two Commissioners was a noticed Sunshine Meeting.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: All of the Commissioners were included and we are happy to brief them on the results.

Mayor Cason: Would you like to add something else?

Unknown Speaker: One additional comment. Yes a consensus was for curbless, although there was no official vote, but this is the first time that I've heard this presentation done by this gentleman. So, I think that has never been incorporated into anybody's opinion, so we haven't been aware of that side...

Mayor Cason: You participated in the meetings and didn't bring this forward, is that what you are saying?

Commissioner Keon: They were never aware that he was their consultant.

Unknown Speaker: I've never heard that presentation until just now.

Commissioner Keon: As a B.I.D. member they were not aware of this.

Unknown Speaker: As the steering committee member.

Commissioner Keon: And a B.I.D. member.

Commissioner Lago: We spoke yesterday; you are a member of the B.I.D. Board, the Executive Board.

Unknown Speaker: I'm a B.I.D. member, not the Board and I'm on the steering committee.

Commissioner Keon: Mr. Cooperman are you on the Board of the B.I.D.?

Mr. Cooperman: Of course.

Commissioner Keon: Were you aware of this?

Mr. Cooperman: Victor sits on the steering committee.

Commissioner Keon: No, were you aware of the consultant?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Excuse me Mr. Mayor, it's going to be very difficult to record these minutes with so much active dialogue, so if we can go one at a time.

City Attorney Leen: Everything through the Mayor.

Mayor Cason: Let me ask. There were a number of, I won't say allegations, but a number of facts that were perhaps brought forward by Mr. Correa, would you like to address – one of them was four feet we would lose then I heard one point six, I'm kind of confused as to how much the allegation is that with curbless we would lose.

Earl Jackson: I'm not sure how, I can suspect how he's measuring four feet. If I take the face of the curb to the back of the bollard, I can get 3 foot – 8. We've gone through a number of discussions how you layer safety space between a parked car, not a moving car, but a parked car and where people would be. Now as we laid out in those layers, people would be in a wider zone for program reasons more than walking reasons, but in some instances at those 23 feet people will walk. If I hear 4 feet its 3 foot – 8 to the back of the bollard, the actual delta in loss, because nobody counts the first two feet up against the parked car is as I presented, one foot – 8 or two feet, depending on the final design of the bollard. So on that point, if there is a difference in the way you measured it, I'm not sure that gentleman did, you can come up and help me understand better.

Commissioner Keon: Don't you have to allow the space for a door to open?

Earl Jackson: Which we've calculated as two feet for engineering purposes.

Mr. Correa: Two feet for the door to be able to open-close; two feet for the bollard, that's four feet, but I said effectively the loss is one foot six inches.

Earl Jackson: That wasn't clear because I understood your statement as four feet loss.

Mayor Cason: So you're saying its one point six?

Mr. Correa: Multiplied by the length of the Mile twice.

Mayor Cason: OK. I didn't find the argument about jay walking persuasive; people jay walk wherever they walk, so that's irrelevant, and I think liability...is a separate issue, has nothing to do with the City.

Commissioner Lago: And the issue that was brought up in reference to programming and how many times we are going to use the streets to close off, we don't have that opportunity now. So once that opportunity is afforded to us, I expect that the street will be used in reference to that type of programming. I just want to move on from this...

Commissioner Keon: I think we are looking at 20 years out.

Commissioner Lago: We need to move forward from this because this is not the type of conversation I want to have now. The B.I.D. needs to have that conversation amongst themselves.

Commissioner Keon: They should have had it.

Commissioner Lago: It should have happened a long time ago. I don't know why we are bringing this up today. Sir?

Unknown Speaker: The B.I.D. was always under the impression that this was going to be a curbed streetscape. It only more recently evolved into the curbless that's why the B.I.D. hasn't been able to discuss it, because they are not knowledgeable that this thing has become a curbless environment. It was originally a curbed environment.

Mayor Cason: Let me at this stage, we have Burton Hersh wanted to speak, that's the only speaker card I have. Anybody else want to speak on any of these issues before we continue on?

Vice Mayor Quesada: Mr. Correa should fill out a form as well.

Mayor Cason: He already did.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Oh, he did. OK.

Mayor Cason: So this is the only card I have. Burton do you want to...?

Mr. Burton Hersh: Thank you. City Manager, Commissioners, thank you. My name is Burton Hersh, I was the original Committee Chairman for the B.I.D. and part of the design team was Professor Correa and also Dr. Bohl from University of Miami. I just found out like a week or so ago about the curbless option, and at first I just was thinking about it, but if you look at Giralda, it's very limited and the shared street from our initial design made a lot of sense, because it wasn't heavily trafficked, it goes within a normal shared street design which is really a street which does not have a lot of traffic. Miracle Mile on the other hand is an artery, and it has a lot of cars, and while it would be nice to calm in some way to slow it down, the fact is that, I think this is what Professor Correa was saying, with regional impact of making Miracle Mile a shared street. I think it's huge, because what happens with a shared street is you lower capacity and so what is the end result of that big through-put that Miracle Mile currently has? The other things

that I was starting to think about was mentioned somewhat was the role of people versus cars. The nice thing about a sidewalk is it kinds of defines the space of the people, and the space of the car is defined also by the difference in level and by the difference in material, and when you start to cloud that it doesn't seem appropriate because of the nature of an arterial road. Also, a sidewalk would be flatter, easier to maneuver, so after thinking about it for a week or ten days since I've heard about it, I just don't think it's a very good idea.

Mayor Cason: Curbless you are saying is not a good idea?

Mr. Hersh: I do believe it's not a good idea. I don't see what you have to gain, and it presents a lot of problems. What do you do – how does it affect the actual capacity of the Mile? There was a grant we got some years ago to install a median and a turning radius, and part of that grant was to increase capacity.

Commissioner Keon: No. I'm sorry.

Commissioner Lago: Earl can you come up here one second. Just want to clarify something.

Commissioner Keon: The Manager was here at the time in Economic Development and it was not necessarily to increase capacity, wasn't it to increase safety and allow for left turn lanes?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: And we could document in the application that by having that left turn dedicated....it enhanced flow.

Commissioner Keon: It enhanced flow, but not capacity. It was to enhance flow.

Commissioner Lago: Just for the record, I want to get an idea of how long have we been talking about curb versus curbless? I'm not going to hold you to the exact date, just give me an idea. You are always welcome to the podium.

Mr. Hersh: I've only heard about it recently.

Commissioner Keon: OK. But I think it's important that we document how long that the....

City Attorney Leen: One at a time just because we have to keep a record.

Earl Jackson: My perception has been that from day one, the first meeting we had, which was a kick-off, we held a meeting in the Museum and we opened up an idea about scope. That scope included such things that went to extent of closing the entire Mile. We backed away from that, understanding it wasn't the right time, it wasn't the right density to support that, we still needed people to go through the Mile as well as to the Mile. So on that day we worked through a range of options in which all of these things were present. The formal debate of curb and curbless was something that we looked at from April on. In the water color renderings that we show there is no curb in them and that's April 19th, so before then was the discussion. We have since in working primarily, from my standpoint we've been working primarily with the steering committee, which includes members of the B.I.D. We've had private meetings with Mr. Hersh, who I understand has a wealth of knowledge on the subject from his prior work, and we've talked with everybody we possibly can throughout the City to try and get a full understanding what's happening here. At one point, through the series of drawings that we have made, we reached consensus as a steering committee that the project would be curbless.

Commissioner Lago: Can you give me an idea in regards to the date of that meeting?

Earl Jackson: The date of that meeting was April 24th.

Commissioner Lago: So you have a meeting that states April 24th where you reach consensus that the project would be curbless.

Earl Jackson: We reached consensus.

Commissioner Lago: And you have several individuals who are on the steering committee that are on the same, that are part of the B.I.D.

Earl Jackson: That are part of the B.I.D.

Commissioner Lago: That are part of the B.I.D.

Earl Jackson: Right.

Mr. Hersh: I received a set of drawings a couple of weeks ago.

Commissioner Lago: I want to be clear, because the last thing – I want to say is that maybe we did something without being transparent, that's the worst you can do in public government. I just want to make sure that you were – and you are saying you just found out seven days ago. It concerns me...

Mr. Hersh: Because I have a set of drawings that I got several weeks ago, which...

Commissioner Lago: You are telling me that none of the members of the B.I.D. who are in the steering committee came to you and said, hey listen, we are actually have consensus going in a curbless fashion.

Mr. Hersh: Yes, that's what I'm saying.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Excuse me Mr. Mayor and Commission. I know you are in active discussion; I just wanted to remind you, one of your slides showed about the composition of the steering committee. You all wanted to have a steering committee to be representative on guiding that design process forward, and you asked for the majority of them to be members of the Business Improvement District, property owners, or tenants, but of the Business Improvement District, of those six of the ten members of the steering committee are B.I.D. One

of those six is Giralda, but five of them are Miracle Mile. I just need to establish this, and then of the remainder two of them are us, Carmen and Glenn, and the other is a resident member because you felt that that was important as we were building the Mile for your residents to have that kind of input, and then the last was Dr. Chuck Bohl, because he was not only University of Miami, because you wanted a representative. He's also been very involved in the visioning and work of the B.I.D., and he's also worked with us. So your ten members, six of them are of the B.I.D., of that six one of them is Giralda, and I just feel like it's important for us as your staff given what your direction was about a steering committee to help guide this, that I remind you of that composition.

Commissioner Keon: Thank you. I think it's also important to remember that at the time that the City undertook the changes to the Mile with a median and those sorts of things. The County turned over the maintenance and the control of that section of Coral Way to the City. So it does remain sort of an arterial, but it also – the City now has much more control over it than it would ever have had in the past. So we have much more to say about it than we would. And also, it goes into a one-way street with only two lanes, so it's not that you're, you are not like taking four blocks out of an expressway and changing them. You are gradually reducing the arterial impact of Coral Way as it comes into the City of Coral Gables and goes through the City of Coral Gables. So it seems like a pretty natural transition and I think it's probably a very good thing for us as we deal with the traffic as it's close to our City, and if we can have it flow more smoothly and a little more slowly, it's a good thing for everybody that's on it. It's also an exceedingly good thing for the merchants on the Mile because people can actually see the stores and they can see the storefronts. I think that you really are to be applauded for your work for so long in this vision and how long you have stayed with it, how long you have really championed it, and now you are at the point where you can see the fruits of your labor. So thank you very much for all you have done for so long.

Mr. Hersh: Thank you very much.

Mayor Cason: Does anyone else want to speak? We have a motion and I want to make sure that anybody else wants to speak here's your chance right now on the line elements.

Mr. Hersh: If I could just wrap up just before I leave.

Commissioner Lago: Of course.

Mr. Hersh: My conversation with Marina yesterday was, of course the B.I.D. had a lot of participation on the steering committee. So it's really not something that needed to go back to the Board, and I received a couple of weeks ago a set of drawings and it had a curb. So, I wasn't really thinking that there wouldn't be a curb. And unfortunately, I didn't get on the steering committee.

Commissioner Keon: OK.

Mr. Hersh: So, I just wanted to...

Commissioner Keon: But thank you. You have been such a wonderful participant in this whole vision for so many years and you know what?- it started with a dream and you were the dreamer. So we are very grateful to you for that.

Mr. Hersh: Look forward to it.

City Attorney Leen: Mr. Mayor the motion should be modified though. I just wanted to say a few words about the --- what you are doing today is you are making a decision as to design, and there was a question about liability, and I just want to talk a little bit about sovereign immunity. You have the right, the sovereign right to determine the design of Miracle Mile. In doing that though it's helpful that the motion says that you consider the advantages and disadvantages, that you waive the risks and that you are determining it's in the best interest of the City to go curbless. That should be in the resolution that you pass, if that's your view.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Excuse me, Mr. City Attorney, I would want to remind the Commission with a great deal of respect that we have for our consultants and their engineers, that we are relying on their commitment that this will work.

City Attorney Leen: Yes.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So in terms of waiving the liability, I think we are directing it to the consultants with the best of respect, because it is their design that they are recommending that they have presented to your City Commission that this will work.

City Attorney Leen: Certainly. But I didn't say waiving, that you are weighing, that you are weighing the advantages and disadvantages.

Commissioner Keon: I would be most comfortable in saying that I would move to have a curbless design based on the representations of the design committee and their professionals and expertise in this field, that a curbless environment provides us with greater opportunity and flexibility and programmatically and serves the needs of the City going forward.

City Attorney Leen: It should include though, with respect, it should include that it's in the best interest of the City.

Commissioner Keon: I just said it was in the best interest of the City.

City Attorney Leen: I'm sorry. I'm sorry.

Commissioner Keon: I think that it is in the best interest of the City twice.

Mayor Cason: It's incorporated in there the revised motion.

City Attorney Leen: Thank you.

Mayor Cason: Which has been seconded by Commissioner Lago – City Clerk.

Commissioner Lago: Yes

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes

Commissioner Slesnick: Yes

Commissioner Keon: Yes

Mayor Cason: Yes

(Vote: 5-0)

Mayor Cason: Thank you.

Earl Jackson: Who wants to talk about Giralda?

Mayor Cason: Yes. Let's go to Giralda.

Commissioner Keon: OK. Let's go to Giralda.

Earl Jackson: Giralda Avenue. The concept of capturing the sky and using it in the ground plain of Miracle Mile. We looked for a way to bend the rules on what the sky meant to the project. On Giralda we captured the afternoon rains and the tropical rains that you have. What it's done is its generated pattern for paving that is concentric and vibrant and on Giralda from the beginning there has always been an agreement...

Vice Mayor Quesada: I'm sorry, can we turn off these lights that are on now so that we can see the screen a little bit easier. I know it makes it a little bit tougher for the TV to see us at home, but a little easier for us to see the screen when those lights are off.

Earl Jackson: This is the rendering that we showed for Giralda Avenue, Giralda Plaza in April at the public meeting. What we are showing is a condition where cars can pass. They are not encouraged, it's primarily a pedestrian place. You get the opportunity of programming this a lot more like you do on the evenings when you have "Giralda Under the Stars". You get expanded areas of opportunity outside of businesses, because you've reduced the planters and curbs that are there to a clean surface. Clearly the difference Giralda and Miracle Mile is having the dimension. So this is the 60 foot width that's really optimal for plaza-like space as opposed to the 120 that you have and you struggle with on Miracle Mile. We are looking at pavers; we have samples here on the ground. There are two things we are looking at....which comes from Gentino and Italy will last forever, comes very thick, comes in four colors, and we are arranging the pattern to pick up on the colors of sunset and sunrise and catching those colors in the raindrops that we've created. Complementing that, we are testing to see if there is a granite palate that may work and that, that granite palate would complement the same sort of conceptual intent would have equal durability, but would create a wider range of color palates and would have cost implications, so we are waiting for those cost numbers to make a final decision on that. At the end of the day, the appearance of it would be very similar, the concept doesn't change. The idea is that where we have trees, where we have bollards, where we have lights, you get a moment of impact that creates a raindrop, and we've worked with our designers and with stone layers to come up with an efficient way to create this concentric pattern, so that's constructible. The black and white drawing of Giralda shows three parts: a part against Ponce, a section in the middle, and a section against Galiano. The pattern looks like this and you can see colors changing in terms of their weight. We've got cooler colors in the middle spreading to warmer colors at the end. The street is oriented east-west, so the colors of sunlight, sunrise and sunset come from the east and the west. So, we are picking that up in a way that we are designing the project. Those three rooms which we are calling them a curve from a dense canopy of trees at the end by Ponce, a dense canopy of trees at the end by Galiano, and a series of palms in the middle to help shape a humanly scale of experience for the entire 600 foot length of Giralda Avenue. At the top of the screen, we are noting the trees that we are studying for those end canopy trees and the trees that we are looking at for the middle piece, and Robert if there is any need, I'll ask you to come up and explain where we are with this a little bit further, but its great in terms of creating

that sense of space for the length of the street. The removable bollard at the end, what we are hearing is a real desire to potentially close Giralda from Friday afternoon until Sunday evening, so that it can be a real weekend plaza space. In order to do that, you need some manageable temporary bollards at each end of the street to keep cars from being able to get in and out. What we've come up with under this idea that 100 percent of the project is an art piece. It's an attitude toward a very simple steel bollard that gets posted in, has a grommet when it's not there, and gets moved to a location where they can collect like a family when the street is open. It's got an artistic approach which is what would happen if you took the impression of raindrops on the street and stack them as though they were three dimensional objects. So it's a striped kind of piece, and then on the top you've got a mirror for the blue sky and clouds above. It's an art recommendation; it could be a number of different things. This is where we are with the design to date. The lighting is a series of pylons underneath the canopy trees at the ends and the overhead cabin area, which I think you've discussed for eternity for Giralda in the middle. The difference is that overhead...area in this design is a series of dashes of light to simulate the idea of raindrops coming down and trying to tie that concept for lighting in with the concept for paving. Sections look like this. We've been working with the County to talk about distances between objects and cars and Noman Cletcher for naming the street. There has been a lot of discussion about declaring this section of Giralda, Giralda Plaza, treating the area like you would a parking lot – cars can pass through it, but they are not encouraged like it's a road, that would alleviate some of the constraints that we are seeing in terms of capacity on the road. Right now you are talking about 20 feet between trees in the middle of the street where the drain would be, and trees on the sidewalk. You need 8 feet for a car, if its parked, 10 if it's moving, so the idea of having ample room between car and objects on the side is something we physically feel comfortable with. The Green Book for Highway Engineers is going to tell you differently that you need even wider space between those trees and those cars. We've looked at what it would mean to push that tree further out and you really get the same pinch that you have on that sidewalk if you do that, that you have today, that narrow stretch within which you can walk. Canopy trees on the ends – the idea is that when as soon as they can in their mature life, they can kind of connect, again creating a special condition of arrival, a threshold, and event in the center of the street. To close the show, we have an image of Giralda as we know it today. There is your

narrow sidewalk; you do have planting to soften the effect, but no shade really at all. To a condition where the palms and the trees at the back end and the frontend actually create great shapeful opportunities and that center space underneath the raindrop lights and palms becomes a real eventful place for “Giralda Under the Stars.”

Assistant City Manager Olazabal: You should mention the before and after...

Earl Jackson: So this is – what’s not clear about that? So this is obviously before, Giralda today and then this is after. Different time of day, but you can see this building back here, local right there, there is local, there is the building in the background. I think it’s clear, but it’s dramatically different in terms of environment, so maybe it wasn’t, but Giralda is a major transformation, to do this on Giralda is a major transformation.

Commissioner Slesnick: Are we only using palms on Giralda?

Earl Jackson: We are only using palms in the middle, so if I click back to that previous slide that shows the difference in planting. The palms sit here in the center section; Giralda is about 600 feet wide. You have a great shade canopy tree at the Galiano end, you have a great shade canopy tree on Ponce and then in the center the shade comes from the fact that there are three rows of palms, we put palms in the middle of the street. They essentially act as a double yellow line acts in a row, just as a column, but their expanse is going to help with the shade condition there.

Commissioner Lago: Are you done?

Earl Jackson: I think I have a slide that says discussion at the end. There it is.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Can you go back to the last slide on Giralda.

Commissioner Lago: That’s what I want to kind of talk about a little bit.

Earl Jackson: The image?

Commissioner Lago: Yes, that one right there.

Mayor Cason: Who are those people dancing there?

Commissioner Slesnick: That's Vice Mayor Quesada.

[Laughter]

Commissioner Lago: I love everything about the project. I only have just one minor concern, I think I brought that up to you last time we met, and that is there is just so much movement on the floor and I'm afraid that right now that may look spectacular, but maybe in four-five years it just may look kind of outdated or worn or outdated. I think the design is perfect. I just want to make sure that those colors on the floor aren't popping too much and they are not too vibrant.

Earl Jackson: Yes. I think that's why it's great to have the stone in the room because even on day one, in a rendering we do the best we can to get it exactly right, but the stone on the floor has a much subtler difference. There is variation in color, but you know as well as anybody, once you blast it the color comes down, we are going to brush it to bring the color back, because if it was just blasted it wouldn't look like there was any color variation. So that's the granite family and then the porphyry family.

Mayor Cason: It looked a lot brighter...

Earl Jackson: [Inaudible – off mic]...so it's a much softer...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Will that stone fade or even with the vehicle traffic, like you won't be able to see in the pedestrian areas or the vehicle areas, you won't see a color run-off between the two over time?

Earl Jackson: What you are going to have, if you have a lot of traffic and if it's fast moving, you are going to have some wear between vehicles and stone, you are going to get that anywhere you have those two things in conflict.

Vice Mayor Quesada: But the color fading won't end up something that is going to really stand out.

Earl Jackson: There won't be any fading to the degree natural thing occur in the sun. It won't be like your color concrete where you get fading. You are going to get discoloration because of other materials coming in contact with it.

Mayor Cason: And will these be like the other stones that can be refined, replaced?

Earl Jackson: You lift them out; you put them back in, very easy. I can show you...

Commissioner Slesnick: This looks like it's in a pattern, but when we are looking at this it's not a pattern?- it's just random? Right now it looks like you are doing it in a pattern.

Earl Jackson: In this image we've taken that palate of granite that you have there, which represents six colors and instead of laying this out just concentrically random. We've tried to organize colors and bands to help bring up to some subtle degree that idea of a raindrop environment. It's a notable gesture to bring recognition to the street. There are some places that have done concentric patterns, not to the extent that they felt random or like raindrops. We've worked with Italian stone masons in Trantino to look at what it means to do that, and if you look at any place that has porphyry, some of the older streets in the world are porphyry streets, and they often all have a scalloped pattern. So the question of the pattern feeling old or outdated. I'm not concerned with at all. The question of the color being too strident, I'm actually looking for a way to make the color more noticeable than I expect it will be, because if you look at the distance of that palate it's very even and very subtle.

Commissioner Lago: But most of those scalloped patterns that you mentioned right now are usually one color, like a fan is just one color.

Earl Jackson: They group by color for fans, but if notice, and I can send you pictures, a lot of times they just take that full palate of porphyry which really is like three or four colors and they just do it random. So it's still four colors, it's just random. Sometimes there are people who will organize colors to create so you can read the fan-like pattern a little bit more. For this we are trying to organize those colors to bring the rings out.

Commissioner Lago: I image it will grow on me. My biggest happiness right now has to do with the fact that Giralda is a street that has been dying for something new. Like the gentleman who spoke before who owns JSK Architecture, the street has been left alone for such a long time and the restaurants and businesses there have been crying out for something to revitalize the area and bring people there. Again, the color issue is just a personal preference, but overall the design and the street and the trees and the area is going to be a great place to congregate. I'm excited about it.

Mayor Cason: It's quite an improvement. This makes it look more striking, the colors, than I think it will.

Earl Jackson: We do have the ability in the process that we have ahead of us, we plan once there is a commitment to a material to have a real mockup made where we can test this. If it's too strident, we always have the opportunity to go back to a random lay.

Commissioner Lago: My concern is just that, my concern. If my colleagues disagree with me and they like it, I support it, but at the end of the day if we could have a mockup it would be great. I just think that the mockup, as you know, would have to be in a rather large scale.

Earl Jackson: It is.

Commissioner Lago:...to really understand. You should know better than anybody.

Unknown Speaker: I felt obligated to talk about it. In 2010 I bought my property, 137 Giralda Avenue that's where I have set up my architectural practice. I know Giralda very well. I meet periodically with a restaurant owner of "Giralda Under the Stars." I participated with my humble space doing some sort of art gallery. I think that this hasn't any precedent in the area other than Lincoln Road, but that's Miami Beach, that's on the other side of the lake. I believe this is going to be a magnet that is going to – the world is going to talk about this block. When you see that rendering and my hat off to the consultants, you can tell exactly what's going to happen in this area. This is going to be booming and I understand there is a second future idea to turn the parking lot in the corner for public use as well. You should see what's going on today, the desire of a space to gather at lunch time, to eat a sandwich, to meet with a co-worker, just picture this one and-a-half years down the road and this is going to be incredible.

Commissioner Lago: So of all the other owners and entities that are on Giralda right now and you've shared this design with them, they are excited?

Unknown Speaker: People are very excited; they are just concerned about everybody's concerns – Alton Road as an experience, what's going to happen during construction? I know that you are going to be working there every day and you know they want to make sure that customers are still coming and whatnot. I take it this is going to be their restaurant....

Commissioner Lago: As long as you are satisfied, that's all that matters.

Commissioner Keon: Where are we, Mayor Cason, where are we with the park, with the parking lot and the opportunity for a pocket park along there on Galiano?

Mayor Cason: I understand from the City Manager we are having a five year park plan looking at where would be the best places to put parks. We know from yesterday's discussion that maybe

four in the north, there are possibilities elsewhere. We have monies set aside for parks, so I guess the question is how would this one fit in with the other demands for parks. City Manager?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: I'm sorry, are you speaking about Lot 22....?

Commissioner Lago: Yes ma'am.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: I will have to say because of parking garage right across the street and because the only amount of space is like less than 20, using that as public space as opposed to 20 parking spaces, would really be a lovely benefit to the area. So Pittman Park is quite small, this could complement that. The loss of parking is not significant; we've got Garage 6 right across the way.

Commissioner Keon: So is there a plan then to incorporate that as a park?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: And so we haven't talked specifically about it for today, but when you recall we had our capital improvement plan workshop. We talked about rather than spending \$4 million right outside at the little Merrick Park. I say that because it's not the Village of Merrick Park, that we recommended to you all consistent with the Neighborhood Renaissance Plan, reallocating maybe a million and-a-half of that into the Lot 22 space to open it up to the public.

Commissioner Keon: OK. Will that be inclusive within their design or no?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Well they have played with it conceptually. We asked them to look at conceptual development, but not to the point of design drawings.

Commissioner Lago: Because I think that would be a good opportunity to potentially see some cost savings since we have the architect on board and the contractor on board. We wouldn't have to go out to the street and advertise again. I would be in favor of maybe reallocating some funds

from, like you mentioned, junior Merrick Park into Lot 21, which like you mentioned before, it's a nightmare to even park there in the spaces. I can only imagine what it generates in revenue on a yearly basis. Kinney you have an idea?

Mr. Kinney: \$90,000.

Commissioner Lago: About \$90,000. But there is adequate parking like the City Manager mentioned, there is a garage.

Commissioner Slesnick: Are we talking about the little parking lot that's right at the end of Giralda across from the coffee shop?

Commissioner Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Keon: Across from...

Commissioner Slesnick: A Mexican coffee shop or something?

Commissioner Lago: Yes. It's called....

Commissioner Keon: Can you go back to that; it's that Lot 25 – to make it into a green space that you could....

Commissioner Lago: You could congregate and have lunch.

Vice Mayor Quesada: I had always thought of maybe putting a small amphitheater kind of go there, so that you can have music going all throughout the street and making it green or maybe put a big tree in there and have like a little stage underneath that.

Commissioner Lago: That's a great option.

Vice Mayor Quesada: That's something that we had discussed a while back.

Commissioner Keon: Yes, we have.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: We have concept drawings that accomplish that amphitheater. The debate was do you do more paver or green and we were recommending more green, and so we are fine tuning those concepts and then we'll bring them forward.

Commissioner Keon: It's just that when they do the demolition to be able to do the design work on Giralda it would be easier to do it all at the same time, is that possible you think?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: And we talked about that too in terms of how do you make sure that you incorporate the benefits of that contractor on site without hurting it, so that when it is open its nice fresh and clean, and so we are working on those issues now.

Commissioner Keon: OK – great. Thank you.

Vice Mayor Quesada: But you know the nice thing about that making it green, you can create a place where people can congregate downtown. You know similar to One Columbus Circle, remember the project that came before us with that area that we wanted to turn the concrete plaza into more of a park to make it more attractive to the business residents because we don't really have downtown parks. This is a perfect other great little spot where we can really encourage people to come and congregate. You have some blank concrete walls there that you can put some greenery, you can do some art, you can do a lot of fun things, I think in that spot right there. Considering what we can anticipate with the additional foot traffic that's going to come into the area because we are going to have the street improved, it would be a great place to congregate, a great place to put that live music element that really brings a lot of people when we do "Giralda Under the Stars," when the B.I.D. does "Giralda Under the Stars."

Commissioner Slesnick: I like your idea of the amphitheater maybe up against that building.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes.

Commissioner Slesnick: So that you have a raised platform of some sort.

Vice Mayor Quesada: It works. It makes sense right there.

Commissioner Lago: That would be great.

Mayor Cason: Music when you close it down.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Perfect.

Mayor Cason: Go ahead.

Earl Jackson: That brings us to the tail end of the show. There is a Next Steps slide. Carmen do you want to speak to the next or Glenn?

Mr. Kephart: Thank you once again. So where do we go from here?- we keep this thing moving. We will be directing the design firm to crank out construction drawings based on the direction that we got today for a curbless design and all of the elements that you saw, to fine tune them. We are also working with the contractor who is on board now, the construction manager at-risk, and they will be going door-to-door with all the businesses talking about things like we mentioned earlier, the alcoves and what people want and talking about construction staging and how that will work. We've had discussions with the contractor and he's here if you have any questions, Victor is here, about the timing of this project. At this point, the major construction we are looking at starting right after the first of the year.

Commissioner Lago: Can I ask you a quick question?

Mr. Kephart: Yes.

Commissioner Lago: Could I have the contractor come up one second? I know everybody is hungry. I'll be brief maybe two minutes. You say you want the timeframe to commence, to start construction will be the beginning of the year, correct?

Mr. Kephart: Yes, at this point is. After the holiday season.

Commissioner Lago: Victor you and I have had several conversations and you brought a lot of great points to me lately, in reference to opportunities that this City has to piggyback off potential projects. I know you've been talking to Glenn about them. For example, one of the issues was that the City in its Master Plan, the County and its Master Plan has proposed upgrades to its water mains near the City of Coral Gables, is there any way that now that we are going to be trenching throughout Miracle Mile, that we can incorporate this and make sure that we go hand-in-hand with the County?- and ensure that we don't have to tear up the street not once but twice?

Victor ____: It will be a preference. When Glenn and I met with Public Works they are working on the design. As a matter of fact, I believe they proceeded on the design, they designed it themselves.

Mr. Kephart: Yes. There is an 18-inch water main, it goes down Miracle Mile and we've met with WSA (Water and Sewer Authority) and they've indicated a preference to replace that in conjunction with our project. They've agreed to accelerate that project...

Commissioner Lago: That's on their books, correct?

Mr. Kephart: That's on their books. What we do have that works well and we are trying to figure out the logistics of that, a couple things is, Ric-Man is a certified contractor for WSA, so that's

very convenient and it can be done. So that works out well and we also will be bringing to you as soon as we can get the language worked out with County, the City of Miami has an interlocal agreement with WSA that allows whenever these things happen that then the City can do the project as an agent for WSA, and we are in the process of moving forward with a similar interlocal agreement that we will be bringing to you, hopefully the next meeting or the one after that.

Commissioner Lago: But that proposed water main upgrade was not proposed for this year, it was proposed for the future, but due to your diligence you've basically pushed that project forward so that we don't have to dig up the street more than once.

Mr. Kephart: That's correct.

Commissioner Lago: Take advantage of the trenching now. So I also found out that there was, like we mentioned before, an RFP potentially in the near future for lining, is there any way we can move that up also to see?

Mr. Kephart: For the lining of our sanitary sewer?- or the...

Commissioner Lago: Yes.

Commissioner Keon: The street lighting?

Commissioner Lago: No. No. My understanding was that there was potentially going to be the lining product for the sanitary sewer on certain parts, is that still considered?

Mr. Kephart: Most of the sanitary sewer is in the alley and we are still evaluating the work that we need to do in the alley which will be in conjunction with the paseos and the alleys and the parking garage, and along with that the water service connections are predominantly in the alley, this is for Miracle Mile. There are some water upgrades that WSA is looking at for Giralda also.

Commissioner Lago: Victor what's your impression in regards to underground lighting, any conduits that need to be run. What would you recommend? I know that you are having a lot of conversations with the Public Works Director, but what would you recommend?- even if it's a little bit of additional cost, but it would give us the ability to not have to dig up the street, maybe CCTV upgrades, Wi-Fi, all that conduit that can be run or how many additional conduits would you leave in place for future use?

Victor ____: My personal opinion – anything that can be done today, do it today, so you don't have to do it in the future. So it will take a little bit of forecasting. For instance, a lot of cities are going toward CCTV. You could easily put it with a water main, right next to it for negligible cost. If you plan to underground one day, it doesn't cost much to go to a few intersections that maybe something you may want to do now, extra conduits, it usually takes three of them. If you are going to do anything with the lighting, anything like that, it should be done now. What you don't want to do is after the job is done is ten years later rip up those pavers, you are not going to match them, you will never match them exactly the same. So if you all have something that you do want to do in the future, it should be tried to be done concurrently as much as possible.

Commissioner Lago: Yes, because the most significant portion of the cost is obviously trenching that takes place. So we are already doing the trenching no matter what, for all the upgrades that we are performing. I mentioned already about the mast arms. I know you guys are working hand-in-hand try to see if we can potentially limit the visual pollution that we have out there currently. Any way I can help you in regards to the County, I know that Commissioner Keon has extensive contacts in the County. If you need to speak with Commissioner Sosa, who I think is the Commissioner for that area. I've spoken to her already; she said that she is more than willing and able to help us in any capacity.

Mr. Kephart: Thank you.

Mayor Cason: One question. We didn't discuss signage at all in any of this. Is that a later phase, the signage the way we are going to go?

Mr. Kephart: The signage – we put that in items under refinement and we have a pretty extensive signage package from the design team that we are vetting as staff and didn't feel that it was quite ready to bring forward to the Commission yet.

Mayor Cason: So we'll get it later.

Mr. Kephart: But it's pretty long and it's a later stage in the projects, so it's not critical to have the specifics of the sign Keller, the lettering, and those things at this point.

Commissioner Lago: What about existing light poles in reference to FPL? What are we doing with that? We own those poles right?

Mr. Kephart: The existing light poles in the project as it is would remain as they are; they are not being changed currently.

Commissioner Lago: How many poles are there exactly?

Mr. Kephart: I'll have to get back to you on how many there actually are.

Commissioner Lago: Just for an idea. I know that we are already asking for pricing in regards to a few other issues like what I mentioned before about potentially using cobble stone throughout the street. Just find out how many light poles there are and maybe our contractor can speak with their electrical sub-contractor to find out different options that currently exist in reference to upgrading those lights, because as you mentioned before, we are using everything LED, it would be great to finish off the project with everything LED.

Commissioner Slesnick: Glenn, I want to ask too. In the previous drawings I thought on Miracle Mile we had the light post that were going like wings on each side, so they'd be more lighting on Miracle Mile in the center of the sidewalk. In all these renderings I just saw one wing of a light.

Mr. Kephart: Predominantly – Earl may want to speak to this, but the lighting on the sidewalk of Miracle Mile is different components. There is the pylon lighting at the crosswalks and the predominant pedestrian lighting comes from the lighting around the trees.

Earl Jackson: And the shops.

Commissioner Slesnick: OK, but we are not doing the winged, the double lighting anymore, we are just doing one.

Earl Jackson: Yes. It's not a pedestrian specific light to light the sidewalk. This is a different; this is a retail environment, so it's very different than like an ocean front promenade where you need that.

Commissioner Slesnick: And if we don't have all the cracks in the sidewalks anymore we don't need to see so well.

[Laughter]

Mayor Cason: Anymore discussion?

Commissioner Keon: I just have a question before we close the meeting. I have one question that we talked about yesterday, as the Manager and it was Dona Spain. There was a discussion about the storefronts, because the number – some of the property owners have expressed an interest in bringing their storefront flush to the property line and putting in the...and doing all of that, and apparently I was told that because some of those storefronts are considered historic, they can't change them, they can't bring them out flush to the property line.

Mrs. Spain: That would have to go to the Historic Preservation Board because those properties on Miracle Mile that are designated as historic, they were done in the 1940's and they have that condition where you can stand at the front door and they are angled off.

Commissioner Keon: They are angled off – right.

Mrs. Spain: We have allowed BurgerFi is one of those and that's no longer like that, we allowed them to alter that. So it is a possibility they can do that. That only occurs on the south side of Miracle Mile because those are the only historic properties.

Commissioner Keon: Well, I remember the property owners when we met yesterday that was a concern that was raised with the property owners that were there at the steering committee, so I don't know how many other property owners may own them, but they talked about it, it being a pretty dated style and it's a very dated style.

Mrs. Spain: It is, sort of retro.

Commissioner Keon: And the conversation seem to be, I don't know for certain, seem to be that they would more like to be able to bring the properties flush with the street and do impact resistant glass and upgrade their storefronts. I think what we were talking about was, it would be a good thing if during this time before we actually start construction or not, when we finish the Mile to then have them come in and do that, but to have that conversation with the property owners early and if they want to do that move forward to begin to do that, so it can happen at the same time that the Mile is being done because it will affect also, you know with the property lines are and those areas that you were talking about needing to be paved. It's not the alcoves or the entries into the stores, its actually how the storefront meets the property line. How would we do that?

Mr. Kephart: That question is planned to be asked in the discussions for the contractors PIO, when they are meeting with each individual property owner or business tenant on the Mile to get their opinions as to what they would like to do with their storefronts, so we can gather that data and know what to do with it.

Commissioner Keon: OK. So then obviously historic needs to be involved in it because it would have to go through Historic Preservation in order to change those, if they chose to do it.

Mrs. Spain: Because there are only seven properties on Miracle Mile that's designated as historic, two of those are the Colonnade Hotel and the Miracle Theater.

Commissioner Keon: It's only five.

Mrs. Spain: It's only five.

Commissioner Keon: It's really a small number maybe you can have that conversation, so it can be taken of before they...

Mrs. Spain: It's a very small percentage....so we'll have that conversation.

City Attorney Leen: Just one issue here though. There is a – this has come up before where you have Historic Preservation, but you also have a larger interest of the Commission regarding Miracle Mile. I do think it's one of those things where it needs to go through the Board, but that sort of final decision should come to the Commission, in my opinion.

Mrs. Spain: To do what?- to change the...

City Attorney Leen: About whether they can change, if the Commission believes...

Mrs. Spain: To change the storefronts?

City Attorney Leen: Yes.

Mrs. Spain: Oh – because you know if they are not designated as historic, it wouldn't go to the Historic Preservation Board at all.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: You know Craig, I appreciate your point. Let's go through the process, we'll bring it back to you if we sense a conflict. The other thing Commissioner is, you had also mentioned about the inlets and the alcoves and how can we make sure that they are included. And my thought is, could you do a negotiation with the construction manager at-risk for Plan A, only up to the and including the construction easement that we talked about...

Commissioner Keon: Right.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark:...And then Plan B, to extend it deeper into those inlets and alcoves in the event that a property owner would be interested, because at least then we'd know what is the difference and if its nominal you all, who are basically underwriting a significant amount of this may just say, let's go ahead and fold it in, but without knowing that number you wouldn't be able to do that.

Commissioner Lago: I can't speak for the CM, but I mean I'm pretty sure that it would be much cheaper to be able to piggyback now on an existing contract and it would be to bring an individual contractor who has to mobilize, remobilize, deal with individual tenants, so I think the way to go is what the Manager just mentioned.

Mayor Cason: I agree.

Commissioner Keon: So often the alcove going into the store is what sort of goes with or works with the interior of the store. It's kind of the front, so I mean I think they certainly should be free

to choose how they want to treat their alcove, as long as it, in some ways is not in great conflict with the sidewalk, you don't kind of want it orange.

Mrs. Spain: There may be ways to put a little bit of the paving pattern in....

Commissioner Keon: Yes, but you know I think that should be a decision of a property owner...but you can deal with it.

Mayor Cason: Come back to us when you've done the survey and you have some cost...

Commissioner Keon: So that's the only thing, it's just so that the storefronts can all be addressed at the same time and then I'm fine. Thank you.

Commissioner Lago: But the alcove and the storefronts that needs to start moving now.

Commissioner Keon: Right.

Mayor Cason: Let's move to the last element because we have an Executive Session, it started a minute ago, on A-3, this is the resolution authorizing the City Manager to begin negotiations with Ric-Man International for a guaranteed maximum price for the construction of the Miracle Mile and Giralda Avenue Streetscape Project.

Commissioner Keon: I'll move it.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Second.

Mayor Cason: Commissioner Quesada makes the motion, who second? Commissioner Keon made the motion, Commissioner Quesada seconds, for the record. City Clerk.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes

Commissioner Slesnick: Yes

Commissioner Keon: Yes

Commissioner Lago: Yes

Mayor Cason: Yes

(Vote: 5-0)

Mayor Cason: Thank you very much. That closes this meeting and we'll go downstairs now for the Executive Session, which I think we have food there, right?

City Attorney Leen: Yes.

[End: 1:33:42 p.m.]