

City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting
Agenda Item H-1
January 8, 2008
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

City Commission

Mayor Slesnick Donald D. Slesnick, II
Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Commissioner Maria Anderson
Commissioner Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Commissioner Wayne "Chip" Withers

City Staff

City Manager, David Brown
City Attorney, Elizabeth Hernandez
City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman
City Clerk Staff, Billy Urquia
Eric Riel, Planning Director
Carlos Mindreau, City Architect

Public Speaker(s)

Robert De Leo, President of I Metal Roofing
Luis Revuelta, Coral Gables Resident
Andi Murai, Coral Gables Resident
Susan Kawalerski, Coral Gables Resident
Michael Steffens, Coral Gables Resident
Ray Airan, Coral Gables Resident
Richard Namon, Coral Gables Resident
Miguel Cano, Coral Gables Resident
Charles Girtman, Coral Gables Resident

H-1 [Start: 10:28:14 a.m.]

Progress Report on the installation of standing seam metal roofs pursuant to the City Commission approved 90-day time period (07-17-2007 – 10-17-2007).

Mayor Slesnick: We now go to H-1, Progress Report on the installation of standing seam metal roofs; Mr. Brown.

City Manager Brown: Mr. Riel and Mr. Mindreau.

Mr. Riel: Good morning, I have copies of the report, if anybody on the public would like a copy.

Mayor Slesnick: By the way, for those guests of ours in the audience that came to hear the status of the Village of Pinecrest, request for fire services, we will skip H-2 after this and go right to H-3 after this item, David, OK.

City Manager Brown: OK.

Mr. Riel: On July 17, 2007 the City Commission approved the Zoning Code Text Amendment to allow standing seam metal roofs for a period of ninety days. As a part of that approval, and that was basically to the south – southern part of the City, south of U.S.-1. As part of that we indicated we would come back with a progress report, and today I'm going to present that progress report to you with Carlos' assistance. As you know, to come up with this recommendation we did extensive study in terms of allowing it citywide, or in the southern end of the City; we looked at in terms of public input, which the committee set up, Board of Architects, Historic Preservation, and Planning and Zoning Board all provided recommendations to the Commission. We looked at various aspects in terms of criteria, color, roof pitch, installation, types of roofing material, replication, and also we required full Board of Architects review. What I prepared is a chart which you have in your packet, and what I'd like to do is briefly go through that chart. Basically in summary there's been, as a part of the ninety day period, there has been twenty four roofs that came through the process and got approval – twenty four (24) roofs that were submitted applications. Five (5) of those were within areas that already permitted metal roofs in terms of the annexation areas; and if you look on your map, and also on your right here, you'll see on your map everything that is shown in green are those areas that allowed metal roofs right now pursuant to the annexation agreements. As you can see it's fairly a large portion of the southern portion of the City, so the five (5) out of the twenty four (24) would have been allowed anyway, although they did go through the process. That resulted in sixteen (16) metal roofs being permitted pursuant to the ninety day period. I will tell you two of those were denied by the Board of Architects, and one was deferred, and the deferral since they didn't come back that approval – in other words they cannot come back because it was after October 17th. What I'd like to do is just go through the chart briefly; the way we have it organized is by the address, the submittal date, when it actually went to the Board, if you'll note that, usually when they were submitted they went within one or two days to the Board of Architects, and they were reviewed again by the full Board; we had the architectural style, year built, the previous type of roof, the color that was selected as you know we went through an extensive discussion in terms of what type of colors would be permitted, the roof pitch, and then the photographs that you see on the chart are only those roofs that have been completed, and the coloring of the chart, the yellow are those areas that were permitted pursuant to the ninety days; those that are shown in green are in the annexation areas; and the two that are shown in red are those that were actually denied. What I'd like to do is just go through each of the ones that were completed, and if I can have you bring those up on the screen, the photographs.

Commissioner Anderson: Let me ask – I had asked, as I was looking through the progress report, I remember recalling asking for contextual views through the streets, that's like a video or something that shows you as you drive through the streets, is that not available?

- these are flat-on, straight-on photographs that really don't show how it affects the neighborhood.

Mr. Riel: What we did is we stitched the photographs together; we went out and shot some of the videos and the quality of the video was not that good, and to be honest with you we shot like three or four of the residents, and the quality of the video was not – I don't think the department had the right equipment to go out and shoot it, that's why we put this mosaic of photographs in here.

Commissioner Anderson: I'll let you proceed, but I call into question the quality of the photographs.

Mr. Mindreau: I took those purposefully; I took one house to one side and the other house to the other side so you can see the context with the immediate neighbors. The Portillo, the second photograph on the chart actually shows that stitching which expands to the adjacent neighbor shows the right proportions.

Commissioner Anderson: But I was hoping for something more visual. Thank you, appreciate the explanation.

Mr. Riel: Back to the photographs again, this is Portillo, again these are just the ones that were completed as of, I believe, Christmas; let's go to the next one. 8000 Old Cutler; and the next one 1155 San Pedro Avenue, which is in Coral Bay; next one is 5781 S.W. 116 Street, this is actually one that's within an annexed area therefore it was allowed pursuant to the annexation; number 13, 5505 Arbor Lane, this is in Snapper Creek, again this is in also an annexed area, so you'll note if you did go out and visit the properties that there are other metal roofs, and in fact there is one right next door, you can kind of see on the left side of the picture.

Commissioner Cabrera: It had what, Mr. Riel; I didn't hear what you said.

Mr. Riel: The area has numerous metal roofs because they were allowed pursuant to the annexation.

Mayor Slesnick: Can I just go back to Mrs. Anderson's point, and that is as we go further into this, if we do go further into this, and if we ever ask for another report, which we may very well, it seems to me, Eric, that we could certainly have the camera crews from our Channel 77 go out and do the video, your department head doesn't have to do the video.

Mr. Riel: Yes, we could do that; number sixteen (16) is in the Riviera Section Part 13; number 17 is 10945 Lakeside Drive, this is shown in red, and this is in the annexed area although the Board of Architects, as you can see by looking at the photograph has tile on it; although its in the annexed area they denied based upon the architecture the installation of a metal roof, and we wanted to show you an example...

Commissioner Anderson: That has barrel tile? That has barrel tile?

Mr. Riel: Yes.

Commissioner Anderson: And that was denied a metal roof?

Mr. Mindreau: They did request a metal roof and denied it on the basis that the architecture was really more fitting for what it had.

Commissioner Anderson: But that's a barrel tile on a very non-descript home; its gray with like an orange tile, right?

Mr. Mindreau: Right, right because the house is rather lovely as it is without...

Commissioner Cabrera: But the point that Mrs. Anderson is trying to make is the same point that I...I agree with her point, this is a non-descript home with a barrel tile roof – Mediterranean barrel tile, Mr. Architect, I'm not trying to blame you for it, its just that I have the same problem with these lovely non-descript homes that we decide to make them Mediterranean, and there is nothing Mediterranean about this house, and this house would look best with a flat white tile roof.

Mr. Mindreau: I beg to differ, if I may, Commissioner...

Commissioner Cabrera: Sure, you know, I can't govern taste.

Mr. Mindreau: We can certainly research the origin of the roof, but I believe that this roof was the original to the design of this house; it certainly looked...

Commissioner Cabrera: Oh, I bet it was, I bet it was.

Mr. Mindreau: The house is always designed with a barrel tile roof.

Commissioner Cabrera: Like I said before, I can't govern bad taste or good taste, I wish I could, but then I would have to live in another country.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: But haven't we changed the way we are dealing with roofs now as opposed to the way it was a year ago?

Mr. Mindreau: The metal roof trend, I mean the barrel tile roof trend, the Mediterranean want-to-be trend took a hold of the City and it was really the tail wagging the dog, and I really made every effort to try to curtail that in the six months that I have been here.

Commissioner Cabrera: And you are doing an exceptional job, by the way.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: But the reason that was so that everybody understands watching this is very simple, it used to be a product approval issue where the people came with the tile,

they had a house, they went to Building Department, and the Building Department said yes, this meets our product approval, you can go ahead and place this tile on your roof...

Commissioner Anderson: Without any design criteria.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Without any design criteria, good point; so now the way we do it is if you have a roof replacement you have to go to the Board of Architects, and the Board of Architects has to approve it, so now that whole thought of having these little "S" tiles probably comes out of play for these 1950's style houses, and whether we agree upon this or we go back to flat tile that's the mechanism, which is far better than what we were doing the previous ten years.

Mr. Mindreau: That's my hope.

Commissioner Cabrera: It's gotten better, but unfortunately we've already botched it up...

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: No doubt, big time.

Commissioner Cabrera: ...And he's trying to fix it.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: I think he's doing a good job.

Commissioner Cabrera: I do too.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: We have it in place now to fix it.

Commissioner Cabrera: The reason I say – I'm not trying to patronize you; the reason I know first hand is because I've already heard about citizens who are upset with our decision not to allow them to have a barrel tile roof on a non-descript home, and to the best of my knowledge and all the years we've been around City Hall, I've never seen that happen before, and so it's a testament to your efforts.

Commissioner Withers: You know, the irony of it is, I think it was the low profile barrel tile that we kind of have a good feeling about.

Commissioner Anderson: No, actually it's all the barrel tiles that are on homes that don't really need to have it, and that's a good majority of homes in the Gables, I'd say in the north and south.

Commissioner Withers: You know, the irony of this, is that I drove and looked at a lot of these, probably all of them; and the metal roofs that are next to a flat tile roof actually look a little more at home than the metal roofs that are next to the barrel tile roofs, that's just my personal opinion.

Commissioner Anderson: Sure.

Commissioner Withers: So if there would not have been these barrel tile roofs, I think the acceptance of the metal roofs would probably be a little more widespread.

Commissioner Cabrera: That's a great point, that's a great point.

Commissioner Anderson: Contextually – it would have been contextually perfect.

Mr. Mindreau: And in determining whether standing metal seam was appropriate, we took into consideration the adjacent properties.

Commissioner Withers: Right, right, and most of them now are barrel tile or low profile, and they look out of place as a result of that.

Mr. Mindreau: There are a couple of issues, Commissioners, not only the adjacent house has a barrel tile roof, which might be pretty diametrically opposed, but also this is at the side-yard setbacks...

Commissioner Withers: Right.

Mr. Mindreau: ...And the amount of landscaping that separates or defines each one of the residences; all of those elements came into play, the decision from the Board of Architects to, pardon, to grant or deny an application.

Commissioner Withers: And architecturally, I don't know how the rest of the Commission feels, but I think a larger pitch on a metal roof like a Key West pitch, is a little more conducive to my liking than a flat metal roof, and most of the homes constructed that were in the '50's and '60's that look like are the ones that I had issues with the metal roof have a flatter pitch to it, and they just look bland.

Commissioner Cabrera: You see how pretty that Snapper Creek Lakes...

Commissioner Withers: I think a little bit of color, I mean, this is my opinion, and this is where we get into trouble is when we try to put opinions on aesthetics, but I think a little more pitch and a little more color in the metal roofs were a little more conducive to my eye than a flat, bland, white roof just opposed against a Spanish tile or a low profile – I know Maria, that's your architectural license to play over there.

Commissioner Anderson: No, it's OK, I'm listening, not a problem, you have a right to that opinion.

Commissioner Withers: Anyway, sorry to interrupt.

Mr. Riel: If we can go back to number 18 photograph; this is Old Cutler Bay; again this is another example, and it's shown in red because the Board of Architects denied the installation of a standing seam metal roof.

Commissioner Anderson: And that had barrel?- can't see it.

Mr. Mindreau: I believe it had a flat tile that was very weathered; for some reason people equate metal roofs with low maintenance, which may or may not be the case, everything mildews here in Florida regardless, so it's sort of a misconception that is very difficult.

Mr. Riel: And then the last one, 520 Tibidabo, that's actually reference number 20, this is just another example of standing seam metal roof. Last month when this issue came up before the Commission, the Commission asked if the Commission were to proceed forward today, what would staff's recommendation be? Carlos and I have spoken, we've also discussed this with Kara; we are of the opinion that if the Commission decides to move forward with metal roofs that it should continue only on the south end, and the basis for that we've articulated in the staff report in terms of not allowing it on the north end of the City versus the south end; so that's City staff's recommendation, and you've got three professionals that are recommending that to the Commission. I would note that we did mail out one hundred and ninety five notices, those that have participated in the process advising them of today's meeting.

Commissioner Cabrera: Mr. Riel, did you have a chance to read Mr. Mooney's letter to the City Commission?

Mr. Riel: I did not get a copy of that.

Commissioner Cabrera: Did you Mr. Architect?

Mr. Mindreau: No.

Mr. Riel: I got Mr. Fine's, but I did not get Mr. Mooney's.

Commissioner Cabrera: I have a copy here for you, OK, we have plenty of copies; I'd like the professional staff to read Mr. Mooney's comments, I think many of his points were very, very, well articulated.

Mr. Riel: I did have two conference calls with Mr. Mooney about a month ago, and we discussed a lot of the different issues, but I had not seen his final letter.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: I had the opportunity to go yesterday, Carlos, with you out to look at the houses itself, and I was sort of surprised by the strong sentiment that you had as far as not moving these metal roofs into the northern Gables area; can you articulate on that, and then I happen to see you too, Eric, and you sort of gave me the same sentiment that if we do anything is not to move into the North Gables, and I again was sort of caught back by that, but maybe you'd like to expand upon that or expound upon that a little bit more.

Mr. Riel: I think Carlos is probably much better at that because obviously he was the one that went through the process, worked with the full Board of Architects on that, I think he can articulate that better, but I'd be happy to support or add anything else.

Mr. Mindreau: Thank you Eric. I'll do my best, as you can tell I'm a little bit under the weather, so I apologize if I start coughing. After becoming familiar with the Coral Gables for the last six months since I started working with the City and becoming more intimately and familiar, I've always known the City, but never so intimately as I have during the last six months; and involved with the study that we are presenting to you, which started actually in early December, and I had started a week or so before that; becoming very familiar with the areas of Gables by the Sea, Coco Plum, and all those areas, and the houses that are in that area. I became really cognizant of the fact that the history of Coral Gables, the elements that are historic, the six designated districts all happened on this side of U.S.-1. I was of the opinion that not only should the district be a significant contributing historical element, but the areas that are not designated that surround the district become the support mechanism for the experience of the history of the City. I felt that it was important to preserve that at all cost, and not allow another construction material to become essentially a tool that we then have to figure out how to control because "the tail wags the dog" syndrome, and so in an effort to really bring together that charge, and I don't know if that was a charge directly from you, but I think in a way it was, to preserve that history, I felt that in conferences with Eric, that if we allowed it on the south side of U.S.-1, that we would not jeopardize or bring about essentially a kitchen door to diluting the history of the City – of the inner part of the City, the north part. Several elements come to play with that, not only the style of the architecture, but also the demographics of the City lots; the City lots on this side are small, narrower, the side-yard setbacks are smaller, in some cases in the cottages they are two-and-a-half feet, I believe, generally five feet in the Spanish cottages. When you get to the other side of U.S.-1 the side-yard setbacks begin to be more like ten or fifteen in some cases, the separation between buildings is greater, the landscaping is somewhat different as well. I felt that on the other side – the south side of U.S.-1, it was a more viable element that would in no way adversely impact its adjacent neighbors or the immediate community; whereas on the north side of U.S.-1 I felt that there was a large chance in many circumstances that it would be a detriment to the immediate neighbors; and that was really the single most significant basis for my being of the opinion that we should do it on the south of U.S.-1 and not on the north.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Is that a strong recommendation?

Mr. Mindreau: I don't know if I could be more emphatic.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: How about you Eric?

Mr. Riel: I agree; Carlos and I have debated the issue, we looked at both sides and obviously I went out and visited all of the properties; Carlos was involved in going through each; he has become familiar with the City in the past six to eight months; he brought a fresh outlook into the City; I whole-heartedly agree, and we discussed it with

Historic Preservation, and they agree. So, we feel if the Commission proceeds it should be on the south end only.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Are you for it being on the south end or not?

Mr. Riel: I have reservations about the south end as well, but you know, that's...

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: And you Carlos, just finishing up here; Carlos are you for continuing it in the south end?

Mr. Mindreau: I am in favor of.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: So you are for it; you're not, you have reservations about the south end; you are against the north end, Kara is against the north end; if we were taking a poll that would be...

Commissioner Anderson: If I may, I fundamentally disagree with everything you've all said, and it starts from first of all an issue of fairness. I have a lot of reasons, but I'm going to try to focus it on fairness and facts. Fairness I talked about in July; if you allow a pilot program for the south, why wouldn't you allow a pilot program for the north to see how it works? - that would be a logical next step; and then at the end of that process you could say, well, maybe it is what you say, an abuse of kind of the barrel tile scenario abuse all over again. But I'd also disagree with the fact that, and I'm going to go through on page two of the memo, it talks about the prevalent architectural styles in the areas north of U.S.-1 are based on the strong Mediterranean influence of homes. If you walk through all those neighborhoods like I've walked through two campaigns, the majority are not historic homes; there are historic homes sporadically in certain areas, and certainly in Greenways and Alhambra and stuff like that, and Grand Boulevard there are more historic homes, but the rest of the folks are just run of the mill, non-descript fifties homes that would much more benefit from an alternate material where at least the attempt to look at it. My point of view would be to look at it again; the scale of the homes vary; I disagree, I think sometimes – you don't see – why I asked for the video is sometimes you don't even see the roof; when you take a video down the street you see trees, you see cars, you see there is so much going on, you don't actually see the roof. So, whatever the lot size, in fact the larger the lot size, the larger the roof expanse especially for the more horizontal homes, and the south side which have a larger lot line. Would that dilute the historic fabric? - I don't know. What more dilution of the historic fabric than the abuse of barrel tile. That's for me, if you take that to the extreme, at least these materials, standing metal seam, and this is my opinion, is a much more discrete conservative view of a roof versus these glaring orange tiles when you see this long strip of house, and this glaring orange tile across it, that's one point. Historic districts, you know, I have some issues about historic districts because you impose wholesale conditions on hundreds of homes; and why I don't oppose historic designations of individual homes, I still have some dyspepsia, discomfort with historic districts because of what they impose on a large number of people; sometimes as opposed to hundreds of homes that were in the Country Club Prado section, hundreds of homes, which had a lot of impact; and if you look at the

element of reprocess, we've had the majority of our Boards have recommended it, not once, but twice. I'm not saying adopt it, but I'm saying let's try it for the same period of time and review it then; really it's just an element of fairness and everything else I've said; and I also have one thing that I have to really – and I've discussed this with the Manager, is well, I guess I'll leave this alone for awhile; its an area of policy and I have a problem when you bring – I'm going to say it – when you bring something to a governing body you give two solutions; you give one where you strongly recommend and one you give as an alternate in case the governing body wants to bite the apple, that way you've already done that. So, I would ask that we work more toward providing alternate solutions, when you have one – the Commission in many times has decided to go with Plan "B", and we didn't have it; and so I say, the policymakers on this side of the table with your professional assistants. I don't mean this – this is very hard for me to say because I respect both of you, but I feel really strongly that in the issue of fairness we should try a pilot program, and I encourage us to just really think about it as a Commission for the north end.

Commissioner Cabrera: Do you think that maybe the reason that the professional staff was so specific in their recommendation has a lot to do with their definite position, and that's why they could not come to an alternative?

Commissioner Anderson: I don't know; I can't speak for them; I certainly like I said, do respect them. We've had, let me see, the Metal Roof Advisory Committee made a recommendation expressed support for it; you had the Planning Board recommended it unanimously Zoning Code Text Amendments; you had Public Works, while no action was taken, the majority of people who were noticed and came supported the metal roofs; the Board of Architects supported the allowance of metal roofs citywide; so I beg to differ. I think we've had enough interest and a lot of people who are residents, thoughtful residents who have come, and I see them in the audience as well from the north and the south side.

Commissioner Cabrera: My question was not meant to be argumentative...

Commissioner Anderson: No, no, no, I was not taking it that way; I feel very strongly that despite what they might say, I think it's important to think about doing a pilot program in the north and see where it goes, and then take stock then, and then decide.

Mayor Slesnick: We are going to go to some public comment, and this is not a public hearing, this is a City Manager item, but we've known from the last few days that there are people who wish to express themselves again. I would urge that most of you who've signed up to speak have spoken before, and I am going to ask that we stick to the time limits that are given on the back of the cards that you signed.

Commissioner Cabrera: Now Mr. Mayor, I want to say this for the record for those in the audience that wish to speak; now it's very clear that this is not a public speaking item; this is a report to the City Commission, but as you pointed out there is so much interest

on both sides of the subject that this City Commission in its infinite wisdom is going to allow the public to speak. So I would urge you to be courteous and to the point.

Mayor Slesnick: I would again urge that we stay to the point, and we are going to stick to the three minute time limitation. So just understand that going into this, and we'll move forward more rapidly; and I would like you to understand that this is an interim report, the Commission may or may not make any more interim decisions at this time, and this is not the final twenty first century decision we are making. Mr. Roberto De Leo from Miami, 8230 S.W. 62nd Court, Miami.

Mr. De Leo: Good morning. Robert De Leo, President of I Metal Roofing; of the sixteen roofs that were approved, we did four; and I would like to express my gratitude to the Board of Architects and the Building Department, it was a very smooth process; we finished in time; our clients are very happy; they are already taking savings on their energy bills; they already applied to the discount on their insurance premiums, however, all the neighbors are upset because they came to me they wanted metal roofs, they missed the window.

Commissioner Withers: I can't understand.

Mayor Slesnick: He said all the neighbors are upset because they came to him and wanted metal roofs but they missed the window.

Mr. De Leo: They missed the window, so they are very upset about it.

Commissioner Withers: What does that have to do with... asking you to go ahead?

Mr. De Leo: No, I just want to express my gratitude and at the same time make you aware.

Commissioner Withers: [Inaudible – off mike].

Mayor Slesnick: All the neighbors what to replace their roofs right now, right.

Commissioner Withers: I have none.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: I haven't either.

Mayor Slesnick: I have none.

Mr. De Leo: I can give you a list.

Commissioner Cabrera: Encourage them; encourage them to reach out to us.

Commissioner Anderson: To write.

Mr. De Leo: Well, a couple of them came today to express their opinion as well.

Commissioner Cabrera: Since you are up here and you are a professional in this industry, I just need a point of education, does rust come to play with metal roofs.

Mr. De Leo: The manufacturer gives you twenty (20) years if you are a mile or more, a warranty on the material; if you next to the water it would be aluminum which is for life, so there is no consideration on the rest.

Commissioner Cabrera: So rust is not a consideration.

Mr. De Leo: It is not a problem.

Commissioner Cabrera: Because of the warranty period of twenty (20) years.

Mr. De Leo: And they give you a warranty because the material will last at least twenty years.

Commissioner Cabrera: I didn't know that; thank you sir.

Mr. De Leo: Thank you.

Mayor Slesnick: Well, if you are guaranteed twenty years you still can have rust and discoloration, correct?

Mr. De Leo: Yes.

Mayor Slesnick: OK, you can still have rust and discoloration...

Mr. De Leo: In twenty years...

Mayor Slesnick: So the company comes out and pays to help take care of the rust and discoloration during the twenty year period.

Mr. De Leo: Yes.

Mayor Slesnick: OK.

Commissioner Cabrera: Before you call the next speaker, can I just make a point to the Manager. Hey, Mr. Manager, regardless of what we do with this subject today, with this pilot program, I really have a strong feeling about copper roofs, and the fact is, and its written by Mr. Mooney and its been discussed by the Commissioners; I think Commissioner Withers was the first one to bring it up when we started this metal roof stuff, when you said you could put a copper roof and then paint it, and you're good to go; I think we are going to have to address that one, OK, and depending upon the direction we take, do you know where I'm coming from with this thing?

Commissioner Withers: I understand.

Commissioner Cabrera: I just don't want it to be the ongoing excuse, and I'm not trying to say that I'm for or against metal roofs, I'm just saying that we need to address this once and for all, because the cost issue is going to be always a consideration, it's just cost prohibitive to put a copper roof and then go and paint it, but it can be done. Thank you, Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Slesnick: Luis Revuelta, 1417 Santa Cruz; welcome back Luis.

Mr. Revuelta: Good morning and a Happy New Year to you all and to your families; congratulations to the Mayor for the AA Award, which I understand that you've got; and congratulations to the City Architect for the good job that he is doing in trying to walk on water, which I respect him a lot...

Mayor Slesnick: Luis, too I want you to know that I have a copy of your e-mail that I'll submit to the record.

Mr. Revuelta: OK.

Commissioner Cabrera: Thank you so much, thank you sir.

Mr. Revuelta: I think I sent everybody an e-mail except Maria.

Commissioner Anderson: Because I support... but it's OK.

Mr. Revuelta: I think that we do agree with part of the report that says that it should be maintained in South Gables, but I strongly disagree and was disheartened by the part that talks about North Gables; I actually was surprised because I did not think that the Commission asked staff to actually report or mention anything about North Gables; I thought this was strictly for South Gables; so I was taken a little bit aback when the North Gables issue came up and a strong recommendation not to approve it because I did not think that was part of the request. I think more important to maintain the historic character of North Gables and the City to incentivize owners and buyers of the real 1920 homes to keep them, and preserve them, and restore them, and not to incentivize people to replicate these homes which has been happening over the years, through no fault of anybody here probably, and might be good for Epcot, but I don't think it's good for the Gables, and that's why we ended up with so much of this quasi-Med revival homes that are nothing in particular, and very bothersome to me as an architect; what choices do I have as an architect, that's... to design my house; I find myself in a tight spot here. My wife likes the Gables, so I have to stay in the Gables, but I find myself with very little choices; I love the Gables too, but sometimes I find myself as an architect very frustrated. I did a survey this morning from Eighth Street to Milan, and spent probably an hour counting homes; forty percent (40%) of the homes are 1920s – 1930s Med-Revival homes; real 1920s-1930s. The other sixty percent (60%) are maybe twenty (20) or forty

(40) to fifty (50) homes that either are well designed or some sort of wannabe stage, and the other forty percent (40%) are homes that are newer, that have absolutely no style; they are covered with cement tile, flat barrel tile roof, painted, because they want to be clay, and they have stone or cement that wants to look like stone with sails and columns, and they are Spanish-wannabes. That's sixty percent (60%) of the homes from that forty percent that are Med-Revival. Of that sixty percent probably ten to twenty percent would qualify for roofs if a test pilot program was put in place, and all the layers are implemented which probably more restrictive layers need to be put in North Gables, and of that twenty percent maybe five, maybe ten percent of the people will deem that appropriate for their homes to be metal roofs. How does that mathematic equate with the fact that this is a threat to the character of North Gables; I frankly do not understand it at all. Please do not discriminate us to North Gables, give us a chance of thirty-sixty days to prove that we are saying, we live in the North Gables the last thing we want to do is basically damage ourselves. We care about the City and thank you. Please be fair to us. Thank you very much.

Mayor Slesnick: Andy Murai, 200 Solano Prado.

Mr. Murai: Good morning. Andy Murai, 200 Solano Prado. I'm not going to restate my position that I said before, but I do want to bring to the attention to all of you of what Mr. Withers said regarding architecturally different when you put a metal roof like the Key West style architecture would look much better than some of these homes. I also want to bring out what Commissioner Anderson mentioned about the pictures of the neighborhood; 520 Tibidabo – my daughter lives, and it took me a year to get a permit for that property; that house on 520 Tibidabo looks like a glorified McDonalds in the neighborhood that has all nice tile roofs on the entire block. If you people cannot agree to do the entire Gables, then this program should be stopped. I really resent to have tin city south of U.S.-1 and all Mediterranean Coral Gables north of U.S.-1, that is not why we moved into Coral Gables, that's not what we wanted there, that's not what is envisioned to be in Coral Gables. Not a single house has been modified in their pitch, or their roof structure in slapping the metal roofs on; every house has just put some metals on top of it; you know, if you go to High Pines and you look at what Mr. Withers was saying, some beautiful homes there, two stories, different pitch, different angle, different roof. When you go to 520 Tibidabo, when you go to 521 Santurce, when you go to Old Cutler Road and Davis Road, you know, these are homes that are barely eight feet high, with a couple of metal slabs on top of it. I ask you to stop this program, not to continue, and if you want to do it citywide then make a full analysis and see under what conditions you are going to have it. Perhaps, you know if you were talking about architectural diversity in our previous meetings, perhaps you know, you should consider new construction with certain specific guidelines like High Pines; there is nothing wrong with High Pines; there is something terribly wrong with what we have here today. There is only one home in your entire brochure, that's page number thirteen in Snapper Creek Lakes that makes any sense; but look at the picture of that roof; look at the levels of that roof, you know. I have pictures with me that I'm tempted to send to everyone who did not get; Homestead High Pines makes sense, these homes here do not make sense. You were talking about the neighborhood, 201 Solano Prado, I just learned that's across the street from me, to the

north, to the east, to the west, of that property is all tile roofs Mediterranean homes; now you are going to have a 1960 house – that house was built by the developer, _____, with a very flat roof and a white metal roof, it looks awful. I ask you, please, to stop this program. Thank you very much.

Mayor Slesnick: Susan Kawalerski, 6830 Gratian Street.

Ms. Kawalerski: Susan Kawalerski, 6830 Gratian Street. I am a customer of a metal roof as a result of your allowing me to get one during this ninety day period; and I'm here to report a couple of things, in addition to my support for the program to continue and to expand. I can tell you that your question regarding rust, Mr. Cabrera, I have a thirty-five year warranty from Inglert Metal regarding rust, paint discoloration, chipping, you name it, everything possible, a thirty-five year warranty; I live more than a mile away from the water, that's why I got the thirty-five years, and Inglert warranty affect that if there is any one of those above things I mentioned, they come out and replace it immediately.

Commissioner Cabrera: Is that something you had to purchase in addition to, that just came with the roofing material?

Ms. Kawalerski: That's a standard warranty from Inglert Metal and I believe from most of the other metal manufacturers that I researched, so if there is any concern...

Commissioner Cabrera: I just didn't know about it.

Ms. Kawalerski: If there is any concern I would say that's a better warranty than me having to pressure clean what used to be my white cement tile roof, my flat cement tile roof, getting it done as quickly and efficiently as the warranty I now have with the metal roof. One thing I have to say about the colors that you did select; one of the grays, one of the only two grays was never in production as of the time that you oked that, so our color choices were very, very limited during period of time, so I suggest if you do expand the program to expand the color choices to available colors.

Commissioner Cabrera: I think that was done on purpose.

Ms. Kawalerski: That's what I felt; that was pretty clear.

Commissioner Cabrera: Yes, absolutely.

Ms. Kawalerski: But coming down to the aesthetics of my roof in perspective to my neighborhood, my pictures did show the perspective to my neighbor's roofs; I can tell you – first of all, all of my neighbors that I solicited signatures for petitions said, we endorse this, but I can tell you after I put my metal roof on, my neighbors came to my house and said, oh my God, we didn't know it would look this good; now that's two streets worth of neighbors that have since come to my house to express their gratitude for me, taking off my white cement flat tile roof and replacing it with what they consider as well as I am aesthetically beautiful, absolutely beautiful standing metal seam roof. Now

in my neighborhood also, two blocks away there are old Spanish houses, so let's not – I'm not going to give the impression that I live in a neighborhood of exclusively, fifties, non-descript houses, that is not the case. I've got old Spanish in my neighborhood; I can tell you, and I think, Commissioner Anderson you sited the fact that in some of these neighborhoods there is foliage that you can't even see what your neighbors roof looks like, and that is the case in my neighborhood; I think you have to – when you are talking aesthetics, I think you have to take that into consideration; what's the landscaping as well as the setbacks, the set we were talking about earlier, and I can tell you that my roof blends in perfectly with my neighborhood, and that's not only my point of view, but my neighbors point of view as well. I can say that – if I was a Commissioner or the Mayor, I would want my legacy for this City to be the following that in regards to this subject; I was able to blend the new and aesthetically pleasant an energy efficient material of the future with the old character of the Mediterranean areas of the City; I think this is a matter of blending not a matter of exclusion, and while I respect Carlos' point of view of what about the areas surrounding the historically perfect, well you know what, to me it would be more disturbing having a non-descript fifties house with a barrel tile roof leading into an historic area where barrel tile is appropriate. So thank you very much, and I really do endorse you expanding the program to the north side as well as the south, at least on an experimental basis, and also to consider more colors during the expansion period. Thank you.

Mayor Slesnick: Ray Airan, 1252 Obispo Avenue.

Commissioner Anderson: He was here, he stepped out, I'm not sure if he's still here or not.

Mayor Slesnick: Michael Steffens, 4501 Santa Maria Street.

Mr. Steffens: Mayor and Commissioners, I'm here to support the citywide application of the metal roof. There are many situations in the City where metal roofs would be appropriate; certain specific re-roofing jobs, and you've discussed the appropriateness of context and other limiting factors in the appropriateness of re-roofing, and also on new construction; new construction specifically designed with metal roofs in mind, no matter where you are applying that. Metal roofs are the best roofs that you can buy today, they last forever, even though they have thirty-five year warranty their life span is significantly longer. If we limit ourselves to the approval of materials by their inappropriate use we would be very short of materials to use in this City. The City didn't ban Spanish tiles when they were plastered "willy nilly" all over fifties houses; they changed the process of approval so that they got a better handle on where the appropriate use of Spanish tile was, and I would like to respectfully disagree with the City Architect. I think that the proper use of any material will not dilute the character of any historic district, but once again it has to be the proper use. If you are going to ban materials because they are improperly used, you'd be banning not only Spanish tile but doors, windows and stucco in the City. So, I think the proper use of metal roofs is appropriate at any part of the City if it's applied correctly.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Mike, let me ask you a question, have you been by the one's that we've done now?

Mr. Steffens: I've been by a couple of them; but there is also one that wasn't on the list, there is a house on Granada north of Hardee on the waterway, that's a copper roof.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: A copper roof.

Mr. Steffens: But it's a metal roof and it looks very nice.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: But its patina though, it's not...

Mr. Steffens: It's a Houston patina.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: That and there's one on Blue Road too.

Mayor Slesnick: Alhambra Circle.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Is that proper application in your opinion?

Mr. Steffens: Some of them are, well more proper than Spanish tile, yes.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: We've already tried to deal with the Spanish tile issue as you pointed out. Is that proper application...?

Mr. Steffens: Is it proper to flat cement tile, probably. That's an aesthetic choice, that point, but I think both of the materials are proper for those kinds of houses.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Right. Thank you.

Mayor Slesnick: I see Ray Airan came back into the room.

Mr. Airan: Good day and Happy New Year to the Commission members and everybody, and thank you for the time. I have two properties in Coral Gables, one built in the fifties, another built in the twenties, and about three weeks ago I was talking to a friend of mine who also has a home in the north part of Coral Gables who also replaced his roof recently, and I'm in the process of replacing roofs on both of my properties. My problem is that the north and south part fundamentally people are not happy about it. Perception is how can the south people do it, and the north cannot do it. Unfortunately there is no perfect solution, so my question is, I'd like to see what's good – so whatever money I spend I don't continue to have to live with these leaks that I have to [inaudible]. Thank you.

Mayor Slesnick: Richard Namon.

Mr. Namon: Richard Namon, 5555 Oakwood Lane, and 750 Benevento Avenue also. First off, I have to say I agree one hundred percent (100%) with Commissioner Anderson; I'd like to be able to say I can agree with somebody very much.

Commissioner Cabrera: Me too.

Mr. Namon: The concept of "a home is a man's castle," I think, gets lost sometimes. The life of a tile roof in Southern Florida is approximately fifteen to twenty (15-20) years, most the roofs on the houses that you are talking about today were tiled according to availability and cost, not because people particularly wanted something. For instance, after the last hurricane there were no flat barrel tile, I mean, no flat tiles available for about six months, so there were a lot of barrel tile homes made. If you people can ever come up with a definition of what is beautiful, please have it written down, it will be engraved, it will be in gold plaque, it will be in a shrine somewhere. As long as we can't agree on what is beautiful, it is in the eye of the beholder, and while we like these well pitched roofs – remember the designs of many of the homes came about because of hurricanes, trying to make the homes more resistant, more, tolerable to weather conditions, and I think that we should think in terms of green, and we should think in terms of deficiency of design more than specificity, because what one man will see as beautiful another will see as ugly, and this is the way its been since time immemorial. So please think in terms of a home is "a man's castle," and that we should have some diversity of design.

Mayor Slesnick: Miguel Cano on behalf of Miguel and Mary E. Anderson – Cano, 1526 Trevino Avenue.

Mr. Cano: Good morning. My name is Miguel Cano; I live on 1526 Trevino, I also have an office on 150 Alhambra. I'm here to urge you to consider extending the pilot program north of U.S.-1 for two reasons. The first, is the fairness issue that you, Commissioner Cabrera, first brought up last Fall in the Commission meeting, and Commissioner Anderson has brought today; its simply not right that some people have the right to do it, and some people don't; secondly, I also respectfully disagree with the City Architect; I don't think a lot of the areas north of U.S.-1 are historic. I live on a street called Trevino Avenue, which is south of Coral Way and north of Bird; its one block long, running from Alhambra to Red Road, I'd say with the exception of one house every single house is a very boring, ranch, fifties and sixties house. Unfortunately during Hurricane Andrew our street was totally denuded of foliage, which hasn't really come back. I am not an architect, but I just don't see any historical architectural significance to our street, and how a metal roof would impact the surrounding area or our neighbors. Lastly, we have alluded to Tom Mooney today, who is a professional City Planner and works with the City of Miami Beach; he unfortunately was not able to come, but he sent me some comments, which if the Mayor will permit me I'd like to read into the record which is not lengthy.

Mayor Slesnick: We have his comments that will be entered into the record right here in front of me. Now, I'd more than happy if you have a short version, but both of the comments I have are quite long.

Mr. Cano: I have a shorter version, if I may. Mr. Mooney writes...

Mayor Slesnick: You may within another minute and-a-half.

Mr. Cano: OK. "The study of metal roofs in Coral Gables has been going on for almost two years and the concept of the citywide metal roof ordinance has received the full support of all of the Development Review Boards, Planning, Historic, Board of Architects, and Board of Adjustment including unanimous votes in most cases. The Metal Roof Advisory Committee and the vast Coral Gables residents and homeowners who have participated in the public process support this. This type of diverse and overwhelming support equates to good public policy. The residents of north Gables have participated in this long process fairly, and in good faith, and deserve the same opportunity of those residents who live south of U.S.-1 with regard to a limited pilot program. The City should not be divided. A pilot program for the area of the City north of U.S.-1 would be exceedingly limited in application and it's really the only tangible way of determining whether metal roofs would actually have any impact on the scale, context and character of North Gables. The safeguards suggested by the residents of the north Gables assured those applications would be limited. Once the roofs are up, assuming they are even approved, at that point they can be evaluated the same way the roofs in the south are evaluated. And lastly, the Commission should practice what it preaches; metal roofs are one of the best tools of energy, and green conscience design, as they reduce energy consumption by over forty percent (40%). At the December 2007 City Commission meeting, the Miami Chapter of the American Institute of Architects (AIA) presented the Mayor and the Commission with a 2007 Governmental Leadership Award. The AIA Miami Chapter is focused on protecting the environment through green living designs, and recognized that the Mayor and City share this commitment. Thank you".

Commissioner Cabrera: Thank you sir.

Commissioner Anderson: Thank you.

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you very much; at this time I'll enter the two e-mails that were sent, I believe, to the whole Commission from Thomas Mooney, both of January 4th, but different times of the day. I also will enter an e-mail from Robert Fine, who as we know supports the use of metal roofs, and also an e-mail from Sheryl de Carlo, who live on Santurce, who is offended by the metal roof in her neighborhood, and has sent us a...

Commissioner Cabrera: Is that the one that talks about thatched roofs?

Mayor Slesnick: Yes.

Commissioner Cabrera: That that will be the next thing we approve?

Mayor Slesnick: Yes.

Commissioner Cabrera: You know, she had a good letter, except she had to ruin it by being sarcastic. Really, I threw it away.

Mr. Girtman: Commissioner, isn't that not a fair point?

Commissioner Cabrera: I know, Mr. Girtman, but I just don't like sarcasm, there's no room for it; you know, we all work really hard here and we are respectful and courteous, and I just don't see – you can be sarcastic, I work for you Mr. Girtman, at the end of the day I work for all the residents of Coral Gables, but I speak my mind, and I think sarcasm has no room.

Mr. Girtman: [Inaudible – off mike].

Commissioner Cabrera: I'm sure she is, too bad that she is not going to have a second chance to make first impressions with me.

Mayor Slesnick: Mr. Girtman, you're next.

Mr. Girtman: I'd like to clear up one thing; the way you put the roof on at Santurce, the metal roof on Santurce, I stopped and talked to the people, they said seven year warranty. I gave you all a piece of the metal roof right there. I want to limit my remarks strictly to the steel, the painted steel; and Mr. Murai brought up the house on 520 and one of the neighbors said all it needs is a blue sign and it would be an I-HOP, that will work exactly right. I've got to give you a little [inaudible] forty seven (47) years ago when I was in engineering school at Vanderbilt University, I was on a Saturday morning, we had six day classes, when I much rather had been at the fraternity house drinking, and it came to my mind that being a good day dreamer is not the same as having a creative mind, and I got out of the School of Architecture. So that being said, all I know is I look at something and whether I like it or not. We've already talked about the 520, some of you were nice enough to come out and look at it. This is the opinion of the neighbors who have spoken to me about it, and they wanted to know, how did it happen?- a metal roof goes up very fast, and I said, I don't know how it happened; I called a couple of you all, we talked about it, it was approved, you are in the low rent area, we said do it in the low rent area, don't do it in the historic area – I'm paraphrasing your words and it didn't mean to be sarcastic, but that's how it felt to us. Now, when the test period is over, you are taking those roofs off if you vote against them?- no, they are going to be there for thirty-five years, I guess. I gave you a little brochure there of the Ginn Development Corporation. The reason I gave it to you is, they are building – they are one of the biggest builders of resorts in the country – they are building a mega resort on Freeport, west end, a billion dollar resort, super high end. Their biggest advertisement – not their biggest, one of their advertising points is, we do not use metal roofs, we use all cement tile roofs; this is one of the areas most hurricane prone, areas where you've got salt water, a lot of corrosion, and they specifically say, we do not use metal roofs. I had a metal roof; I came in front of you all about historic preservation; my grandfather's house, we had a metal roof in the

backyard, it was on the barn, it since been taken down. I cannot tell you I ever met George Merrick, because I didn't, but I do know that Mediterranean and tin roofs did not go together when he planned this City, and therefore they were not included in how you built here. Maybe everything they said is good. I hope the lady who's got a thirty-five year warranty gets a copy of today's tape and puts it in her safe because it may come in handy some time. Now, a very well known lawyer in town here, you all know him, I can't say his name, he'll call me up and raise hell; but he's contributed to all your campaigns, some of you very heavily, has a pad, a big horse farm down in south Dade, 247th and 249th, bought it for the kids; had a 52 or 54 stall barn out there, they fixed it up to a real show place. He put metal roofs just like on this, screws and interlocking clips, one hundred thousand dollars (\$100,000); Andrew went through there, and I know Andrew was an extreme, the metal roof didn't get torn up, it disappeared, there wasn't a trace of it left, who knows where it is now. The construction of metal roofs when they talk about how good they are for high wind protection is really true until they fail, because they are made in an interlocking fashion, one screws down and clips, watershed over the top of the clips, and then that's repeated all the way down, if wind that fails the whole roof will lift, and it is shown, and it has happened. Anyway, Sheryl is a good friend of mine; I don't know if it is fair to make the logical jump, that if you go from tile roofs to metal roofs, how about fiberglass roofs; I don't say that sarcastically Commissioner, I'm just asking is it fair to make that jump there or not.

Mayor Slesnick: Thank you Mr. Girtman.

Mr. Girman: Appreciate the time.

Mayor Slesnick: Appreciate it. We are going to close public input on this item, and move forward. I guess most everyone has had a chance to say something, I'll take my shot, it won't surprise – my comments won't surprise any of you all because most of you all have been here before, and Maria while you are right the input that we've got is heavily leaned toward experimenting with metal roofs, the input basically comes from the same source of people, and I like Mr. Namon's comment that a man's home is his castle, or a woman's home is her castle, and therefore I don't understand what our big offense is, is that people wanted barrel tile roofs, I mean, even if they weren't aesthetically designed to have barrel tile roofs, we all want to force in metal roofs if that's what people want, but it doesn't offend me that people put barrel tiles on homes that were built in the fifties, and so forth. No one required that, let's make sure we understand that; this City didn't require them to put barrel tiles on, it's because they wanted them, because that's their aesthetics; they liked them and wanted them. So now all of a sudden we've changed our mind and decided that's not aesthetically the right thing to do, and I guess we are urging people not to do what they want to do on one hand, so if you want a barrel tile roof you can't have it, but you can have a metal roof if you want it; I don't quite understand that. You know, to me, I don't think the experiment is complete yet; we asked for a progress report, the progress report inspired a lot of public comment, and I appreciate that, and I hope you know if you've ever written me an e-mail that I read them, I digest them, and I write back with my views, and I can truthfully say, it may surprise you Luis, I say this, I don't think that the moment has come to either redefine myself or to support one thing or another; I

just think we need to finish out this project; right now it's an incomplete project, we still have more than two thirds of this list to go before we can see it. I know that other Commissioners went out and looked at the houses, I did; I went out and looked, some did not offend me; nobody's house offended me, let me make that very clear, nothing offended me about the houses, but the context in the neighborhoods did radically change in different neighborhoods, and I felt that the impact of some of the houses that are in smaller lot settings and closer to the other homes was much more dramatic than other houses that were set apart. And Maria you bring up a great point, the more roof the bigger the house, the more metal, and we may need to look at that, but the fact is that in context when you have a street like Tibidabo, or Santurce the context is very important, and I know you asked and you didn't quite get what you want as far as context, but maybe in the end when we look at it we'll see the context, but I just don't know that we are ready yet to make that decision. So, I don't know that I'm prepared to do anything at this time except to wait to see how we finish this, and then maybe the time, because will come to do some new things or more expanded things.

Commissioner Anderson: I've already said my piece; I think if we don't do it on the sense of fairness and on the sense of actually a factual basis on both sides, it's just not fair; as to the issue of barrel tiles, there were years and years when our building official was putting on barrel tiles on re-roofs, so we didn't have people who had choices. I had architect friends who said, Maria they are making us use barrel tile, so debunk that thing. I just wish that we could complete the study on both sides, make a decision on all fairness. I don't think anybody who is for or against, it's what I mentioned in July, it's part of a good study is information, and I wish – and my disappointment is not because I'm going to get a metal roof – I'm not getting a metal roof; my disappointment is that if we are going to reach this decision we should have reached it in July and not wasted enough time, to me this was kind of to me just not acceptable.

Commissioner Withers: Don, not to be argumentative with you...

Commissioner Cabrera: Why not?

Mayor Slesnick: Ralph likes that.

Commissioner Withers: Go ahead Ralph.

Commissioner Cabrera: Beat up on him a little bit, you know, I kind of get tired of doing it.

Commissioner Withers: Look, it would be a very easy decision if we were comparing the efficiency or the effectiveness of the material versus – but I think it all boils down to personal opinion. That's what this all seems to be boiling down to. Now, saying that, I have no problem with the study going on, but I pretty much reached in my mind my feeling on how I feel the aesthetics of metal roofs, and I think everybody has too, and we've all said it; there is some that look absolutely fantastic; there is some that we have absolutely no issue with at all; there is some that we would approve without any

hesitancy. Then there are those few that we really don't think fit into the neighborhood. I've seen – I've driven to everyone of these, and I can tell you just like I said, there are a couple that cause me some issues, and my issues are pitch and color. But do we want to go into that area of dictating aesthetics where we have a group of experts, Board of Architects, City Architects, City Planning Director, do we want to cross that line and start designing as a Commission. I think that's the big issue that we are going to have to come to grips with when this study is eventually over is how do we personally feel about the aesthetics of what these look like. So, I don't know how each of you feel about that; I'm not real comfortable about getting into becoming an architect, I'm really not, but the problem we have is that we have the City Architect on one side, and we have a Board of Architects on the other side that are one hundred and eighty (180) degrees a part. I don't know how we cross that bridge.

Mayor Slesnick: How did you figure that?

Commissioner Withers: From what I understand; Carlos pretty much says "no mas," doesn't he? And the Board of Architects I don't think has a problem with extending the...

Mayor Slesnick: I don't think the Board has weighted in on that.

Commissioner Anderson: Actually 9-14-06 Board of Architects expressed support allowance of metal roofs citywide.

Mayor Slesnick: Yes, that was I think before.

Commissioner Withers: OK, OK, I mean from the inception of this whole project. I don't know – maybe we go back to the Board of Architects and say, give us your opinion on these at this point now that you've seen some and see if your opinions changed. I assume their opinions are the same; I don't know if Carlos...

Mayor Slesnick: Carlos and they work together on a daily basis; I don't know what their opinion is.

Commissioner Withers: Carlos, did the current Board of Architects have an opportunity to review this interim report and did they comment on it?

Mr. Mindreau: No Commissioner, they did not have time to review. I in casual meetings with one or two of the members of the Board discussed what my position would be on this, and I did not sense a sense of opposition from the two individuals; one of the members Luis Jauregui, I spoke with, and he had absolutely...he nodded a couple times; I wasn't trying to inquire as to his position or not.

Commissioner Withers: I'd like to know where they stand; where they weigh in after they've seen. I mean, the study has been good for me, I mean its given me...unfortunately its probably been at the expense of some neighbors as Charlie pointed out, and that's unfortunate, it really is unfortunate, but on the other hand its kind of put

the whole issue into bite size pieces for me. So I would suggest that we go back to the Board of Architects and I'd like to see how they feel about this.

Mr. Mindreau: I'd be happy to do that, and actually poll them one by one.

Mayor Slesnick: There is another group too, Mr. Cano was kind enough to read Mr. Mooney's remarks about the AIA recognition of our efforts in the City; I'd like to maybe hear from the AIA what their opinion for looking for architectural...

Commissioner Withers: But that's my opinion Don; I don't really want to...

Mayor Slesnick: I don't disagree with you.

Commissioner Withers: Do you feel comfortable designing the City?

Mayor Slesnick: No, I don't. That's why I feel very uncomfortable redesigning the City; that's my point, is what we are doing is redesigning our City and that's very uncomfortable for me. I looked back Maria, at all my historic preservation books and all the things. I actually read a few magazines last night, and it came to me that all of the thematic cities in this country stick to the theme. Now, Charleston doesn't introduce Mediterranean to be diverse; St. Augustine doesn't introduce colonial to be diverse, well actually they have colonial but not the same colonial I'm talking about, New England colonial. Thematic cities at least try to protect the core of their thematic design, and that's where they get their reputation; and I looked at some of the old Coral Gables things, I'm not saying this is right Maria, I'm just saying....I looked at some of our old things, I mean we always stress our Mediterranean, it doesn't really matter what we looked like in different one street blocks or so forth. The fact is that every piece of literature that you read for years and decades and so forth is stressing our Mediterranean design, and so for us to redesign our City and to take an active roll in trying to deteriorate that design, I'm not sure I'm comfortable with, so I have that. Maybe we talk about representative government; each one of us I think stood up to some people who have said, why don't you put everything out to a vote and I of course don't agree with that, and I think that would be very inefficient; maybe since I keep hearing about how all these people are for it, maybe this is one thing to ask the people of Coral Gables if they want it in their neighborhoods, put it to a straw poll and give us some guidance much more so than the people that have taken an active role in promoting this.

Commissioner Withers: Well, you know, one thing I did notice looking at these is when you really do focus on roofs, because if you just drive around you really don't focus on them; but when you really looked, and you focus...because what I tried to do especially on the Gracian, however you pronounce it, I look and I said, how would that house look with that low profile orange tile?- and I said, you know what, the metal roof actually looks better than what the houses look like; but again, that's my opinion.

Mayor Slesnick: It scares me though when we say diversity because – I'm going to bring this back up Chip, you decided to vote with the majority on allowing a black tile roof on a colonial...

Commissioner Withers: I knew somehow I was going to get...
LAUGHTER

Commissioner Cabrera: Charcoal...you won't let this go will you?

Mayor Slesnick: No.

Commissioner Withers: Along with seventeen other houses in the five mile radius.

Mayor Slesnick: Wait a minute – the reason I bring it up is because I think in retrospect when you saw it, it was a different context than you had imagined it to be when you voted; and it was the first time we had allowed that to happen in that area and it really did change the character, and so my vote was kind of unimaginative and conservative; I said no, let's stick to what we've got white tile...I'm just saying, so that's why I'm hesitant. I also can point out as each of you can where we now have diversity in some neighborhoods with the diversity has ruined the neighborhood, and I'm not going to point out the houses and talk about them, it has nothing to do with metal roofs; it has new diverse kind of architecture, which has nothing to do with the context of the neighborhood, and we've all talked about it; it was part of our discussion of "McMansions" and so forth; it was part of our discussions on other things. People who have chosen an architectural style which pleases them, but displeases a significant number of the neighbors around them, and by the way again going back to "a man's home is his castle," and I'll add again, a woman's home is her castle...

Commissioner Cabrera: "A person's home."

Mayor Slesnick:...a person's home, even the dogs that live there is their castle too. The fact of the matter is that is what zoning is all about, that is what zoning is all about; zoning is a way in which civilization can live in urban settings and get along with each other because we do regulate what you can do in an urban setting. Anyway, does anybody have anything in conclusion of this to move to suggest we just go forward, finish the roofs that are under construction, and come back and get another progress report, and then move on; or what do we want to do?

Commissioner Anderson: I'll go ahead and make a motion, I know that maybe in July it may fail, but that doesn't matter, it hasn't stopped me before. I'd like to make a motion that we do the pilot program in the North Gables, the same conditions, and then evaluate it all, and decide whether yea or nay for the whole thing. We could bring that back as an ordinance...

Commissioner Withers: You know Maria, I was prepared to support that before this progress report, but I don't know that I can... unless there is overwhelming support to support that, because honestly I've come to my opinion on where we should go with this at this point. Again, I'm trying to come to grips with, internally am I really supposed to make decisions based on how I feel things should look. Honestly there are some homes which I think look good with metal roofs, and honestly there are some homes which I

don't think look too good with metal roofs, and it has to do with color and pitch, and so I've got to come to grips, or we've got to come to grips on how we are going to work that out.

Commissioner Anderson: And I think something you really need to think about is not about whether you like it or not, it's about the big overall policy.

Commissioner Withers: I know, and that's my struggle, that's why I'm not...

Mayor Slesnick: We have a motion on the floor, do we have a second?

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Yes, but I'd like to talk about it.

Mayor Slesnick: OK.

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: I must say then, I also was very much thinking about this fairness issue that you brought up, and when I took my survey with Carlos yesterday, the City Architect, I had mixed feelings about what I saw in the neighborhoods, and we went by each one categorically, each one and again, and got back, and when I was talking to him about should we expand it for thirty days into the northern Gables area, staff has been so strong about not doing it, it gives me an uncomfortable feeling doing that with such a strong recommendation; now sure, the City Commission is up here, we can do whatever we please, but we do look at our professionals, and as I understand it, not segregating out Carlos, but its also Eric when I spoke to Eric, and Kara when I spoke to Kara; there is a problem. Now what is North Gables, that's another issue; is north Gables north of Coral Way, Mike Cano would argue effectively, well maybe that is North of Coral Way and not south. That's something up for discussion and maybe we can get through that in this period that we continue to experiment. I don't know where to go to be perfectly frank with you; I think there are some good houses and not some good houses, and Commissioner Withers might have the right thought process of revisiting it with the Board of Architects and getting their sentiment on the situation. That's why I can't support your initiative right now, but I do understand it.

Commissioner Cabrera: What about the idea that Don threw out about a straw vote?

Vice Mayor Kerdyk: Possible. Yes. Could be something to explore.

Commissioner Withers: We need a vote to.... Coral Gables?

Commissioner Cabrera: Straw vote – there is a process within our Charter for a straw vote. I don't know the last time that we...when was the last time we acted on it?

City Attorney Hernandez: We have not; never had.

Commissioner Withers: Let me play advocate, we ask about how they feel about other roof surfaces also.

Commissioner Anderson: It's a process of education because people think metal roofs are tin roofs and it's not, so...

Mayor Slesnick: Well, but see Maria, wait a minute...

Commissioner Anderson: And I'm not against taking a vote, but I think it comes with education.

Mayor Slesnick: No, no, no, well absolutely, but that's what disturbs me about the input we get because we have, and please don't take this wrong because I appreciate each one of you, some of you are good friends and we've now corresponded with each other several times, but we have the same ten informed people, now we did add Michael Steffens to the group today and maybe Ray and a couple others...it's your first time, well thank you Charlie; that's what I'm saying, we have people who now are self educated people about the whole process.

Commissioner Cabrera: We have the analogy, we have people in the metal roof parade, we have those that are watching the metal roof parade, and we have those that don't know a metal roof parade is going on.

Mayor Slesnick: That's true, but the fact of the matter is they know what they like and dislike, they are educated people and they know what they dislike and like, but they are not involved, how's that.

Commissioner Cabrera: And then unfortunately though, when we get done doing the parade, then they see the outcome, and then oh my goodness, how did those knuckleheads at City Hall approve a metal roof on Tibidabo that looks like a McDonalds?

Mayor Slesnick: We don't have a second to the motion, and unless there is further motion...

Commissioner Withers: When does this come back – when's the final...?

Mayor Slesnick: We can set another report and...

Commissioner Withers: When is the time...?

City Manager Brown: There is no future timetable to come back to you; this was the ninety day that was required.

Commissioner Anderson: I'd like for the Board of Architects to come back with a report from the Board of Architects, I'd like it to go back to the Planning and Zoning Board to look at it and let them know, and actually I would like for the Planning and Zoning Board to be given a copy before hand of this discussion; I want it to be interrupted by staff; I want them to look at it, I want the Board of Architects to look at it, and whatever, you

know at the end of the day whatever the process is, is fine with me. I think it's not been – the information has not been disseminated properly to get a proper feedback.

Mayor Slesnick: David you understand.

City Manager Brown: Yes.

Mayor Slesnick: We are going to re-circulate this; we are going to watch the rest of the metal roofs going up on this.

City Manager Brown: If there was a time that we would come back it would be at the time as I believe the Commission when all the roofs have been completed.

Mayor Slesnick: Wait, wait, knowing construction, I don't think we have to make a drop dead, all the metal roofs are completed, but I think the feeling of the Commission is that we'd like to move forward to look at what's happening with these roofs, many of them are not yet started or completed, and we'd like to take a further look; Maria has asked and I hear no dissent, that we'd like to send this report to the Planning and Zoning Board and send it to the Board of Architects; the only thing is – and certainly she's asked that the transcript of this meeting be provided, that's good; I don't think we want to muzzle staff; staff needs to express themselves.

Commissioner Anderson: But I find that the word sometimes there is a lost in translation, and I think if they have a DVD of the proceedings they...

Mayor Slesnick: They don't need to interpret what we said, but I think they need to have their opinion, we pay them, I hope good money for their opinion.

Commissioner Anderson: And they will, but I would like for them to see what we say.

City Manager Brown: We will provide them a transcript and a DVD.

Mayor Slesnick: And maybe, Madam City Attorney, you can let us know what it takes to do a straw ballot in the City, down the road you can tell us, send us a memo.

City Attorney Hernandez: Prepare you a memo and advise you; the first step would be to direct my office to prepare the question, and I'll go ahead and prepare a memo and give you the directions.

Mayor Slesnick: Just to tell us what it's all about and how we can do it. We are going to take a five minute stretch break just for the Commission to collect itself and we are going to then proceed as I had said before to the report from our Chief of Fire about the request from Pinecrest to provide fire services to that City.

[End: 11:50:46 a.m.]