#### **EXCERPT-AV2016-001**



### The City of Coral Gables

Historical Resources Department

# CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES Thursday, June 18, 2015, 4:00 p.m. City Commission Chambers

## 405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	J 14	<b>A</b> 14	S 14	<b>O</b> 14	N 14	D 14	J 15	F 15	M 15	A 15	M 15	J 15	APPOINTED BY:
<b>Dorothy Thomson</b>	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P P	13 P	Mayor Jim Cason
Venny Torre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Vice Mayor Frank C. Quesada
Margaret Rolando	P	P	E	E	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Commissioner Jeannett Slesnick
Alejandro Silva	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	Commissioner Patricia Keon
Vacancy								^	^	^	٨		Commissioner Vince Lago
John Fullerton*									E	P	Α	P	Historic Preservation Board
Robert Parsley	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	City Manager
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	City Commission
Judy Pruitt	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission

<u>LEGEND</u>: A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; \* = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member; - = No Meeting

#### STAFF:

Dona Spain, Historic Preservation Officer

Kara N. Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer

Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant, Historical Resources Department

Craig Leen, City Attorney

Miriam S. Ramos, Deputy City Attorney

<u>GUESTS</u>: Zeke Guilford, Mario R. Tur, Rina and Pedro Alfonso, Joe Greenberg, Stephen R. Chepenik, Jim Siegel, Rafael Portuondo, Olga Ramundo, Chris Lee Reyes, Steven Steckler, Elizabeth Guin

RECORDING AND PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:06 p.m. A quorum was present.

#### **MINUTES: MEETING OF MAY 21, 2015:**

A motion to approve the minutes of the May 21, 2015 meeting was made by Ms. Thomson, seconded by Ms. Rolando and unanimously approved by voice vote.

#### **DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:**

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had exparte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

#### **MEETING ATTENDANCE:**

A motion was made by Ms. MacIntyre to excuse the absence of Mr. Silva. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion, which was unanimously approved.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES Thursday, June 18, 2015 Continued

immediate action taken by the City Manager and him when they learned about the circumstances from Historical Resources staff. He comprehensively described each step already taken by the City, which had authority to red tag and halt the project as local government takes precedence in matters of zoning. Mr. Leen said the city will continue to respectfully and firmly encourage the School Board to cooperate with the City to resolve of issues; however, the City is prepared to use all means necessary to ensure the School Board complies with the law. To that end, the City has hired outside counsel to represent its interests along with Mr. Leen. He assured the Board that he and the City Manager were committed to this effort.

During discussion with Board members, Chair Torre voiced the Board's full support. A resolution was suggested to support the principle that the School Board should agree to and abide by the City's process.

Ms. Pruitt made a motion to adopt a resolution stating the Board strongly supports that the School Board should comply with the zoning procedures of the City of Coral Gables as related to historic preservation. Mr. Parsley seconded the motion.

Ms. MacIntyre left the meeting prior to the vote on the resolution. Mr. Leen advised that the vote could be reopened at the next meeting to register Ms. MacIntyre's vote on the resolution.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

#### SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:



<u>CASE FILE COA (SP) 2015-005</u>: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 4209 Santa Maria Street, a Local Historic Landmark and a contributing structure within the "Santa Maria Street Historic District," legally described as Lots 11 and 12, Block 96, Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Five, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 23, at Page 55, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for addition and alterations to the residence.

Ms. Spain advised that this residence was her previous home, purchased in 1994 and brought to this Board for review of proposed alterations in 1995.

Mr. Torre advised that he had communication with the project architect on the construction pricing for this property. He stated that this connection did not affect in any way his ability to objectively deliberate about the application.

Ms. Kautz reviewed the history of the property, additions and alterations made over the years as she displayed historic and current photographs. She said the architect would review the plans for design approval for additions and alterations. No variances were requested, and the Board of Architects reviewed the plans in February 2015 without comment. Ms. Kautz said staff had a few conditions to discuss after the architect's presentation.

Ms. Thomson questioned verbiage on page five in the second paragraph that should read "do not negatively . . . " rather than "do negatively . . . ".

Architect Portuondo addressed the Board and detailed plans for restoration, alterations and additions to the property. When helpful to the Board's understanding, Ms. Spain occasionally commented on features that were or were not original to the house. At the conclusion of Mr. Portuondo's presentation, he engaged in discussion with Board members.

## CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES Thursday, June 18, 2015 Continued

Discussion between Mr. Portuondo, Board members and staff:

- Gardener's storage and potting room area: Mr. Portuondo agreed to using turned wood with screening in a specified opening of the outdoor potting room and retaining the other opening as square.
- Shutters: In the original historic drawings, the window above the front door had a shutter, but remaining windows and doors did not have shutters. Staff felt that shutters should not be added where they did not originally exist.
- Reflecting pond: Mr. Portuondo agreed to separate the water feature approximately 30 inches from the wall and still retain the design axis with the back wall of the guest room.
- Garage doors: Some of the garage doors are rotting. Ms. Spain advised that they are not original garage doors and are vulnerable to hurricanes. Since they are not historic, Mr. Portuondo suggested creating a more historical design compatible with the original architect's design, to make them hurricane code compliant and review the design with staff.
- S tile roof: The original tile was true barrel tile, S tile was allowed when the roof was replaced and true barrel tile should be used for replacement. Mr. Portuondo agreed to advise the owners, but requested that true barrel tile not be a contingency item as the cost of true barrel tile was not in the owners' budget. It was agreed that true barrel tile would be used on the addition, and that a contingency covenant could be approved stating that true barrel tile be applied to the existing portions of the house must be applied when the roof needs replacement.
- Front Wall: Mr. Portuondo has not yet designed a front wall, and will bring the item back to the Board for later review.
- Window sills: Window sills should not be added to the existing historic house. Mr. Portuondo said the sills in the original drawings and opined that they add charm to the house. He also pointed out that the original architect didn't necessarily build what they designed.
- Stucco should be differentiated slightly between the existing house and the new addition.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the design proposal for the one-story addition to the building on the property at 4209 Santa Maria Street, and to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: 1) separate the water feature from the main structure; 2) all tile on the new portions of the roof will be true barrel tile, and if the tile on the existing roof is not replaced during construction of the addition with true barrel tile, there needs to be a restrictive covenant recorded against the property requiring that when the roof on the existing portions of the house needs to be replaced, they will be replaced with true barrel tile; 3) window sills will not be added to the historic portions of the structure; 4) stucco on the new portions of the structure will be differentiated from the existing historic structure by either a difference in the texture or a vertical line in the stucco; 5) the window in the gardener's storage/potting room shall have a decorative feature of turned wood. Mr. Parsley seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2015-009: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 97 Campina Court a contributing resource within the "Campina Court Historic District," legally described as Lot 1 & W ½ Lot 2, Block 3, Coral Gaoles Flegler Street Section, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 10, at Page 12, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Piorida and Lots 25 & 26 Less W 95 FT, Stadler Grove Addition #1, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 12, at Page 42, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for addition and alterations to the residence.