

EXCERPT

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

April 16, 2009, 4:00 p.m.
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	M	J	J	J#	A	S	O	N	D	J	F#	F	M	A	APPOINTED BY:
Dorothy Thomson	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
Margaret Rolando*									P	P	+	P	P	P	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Ernesto Santos	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	A	E	P	P	Comm. Maria Anderson
Venny Torre*													P	P	Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
Michael Beeman	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	^	^	^	Historic Preservation Board
Joyce Meyers	P	P	E	E	P	P	E	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	City Manager
Lisa Bennett	P	P	E	E	P	P	E	E	P	P	A	P	P	P	City Commission
Shirley Maroon	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	City Commission

+ Ms. Rolando recused herself from discussion.

- Ms. Maroon left the meeting at 7:00 p.m.

STAFF:

Kara Kautz, Historic Preservation Officer
Betty Perez, Administrative Assistant
Rodney Carbonell, Historical Resources Department

A = Absent
P = Present
E = Excused
*** = New Member**
^ = Resigned Member
= Special Meeting

GUESTS: City Manager Patrick Salerno, Laura Russo, Kendell Turner, Barbara Stein, David Arisco, City Architect Carlos Mindreau, Mohamed Fahmy, Burton Hirsch, Kelly and June Marcum, Margaret Davis, Leona Ferguson Cooper, Karla and Ana Quintana, Ari Miller, Jim Crum, Judith Weisel, Andrea Lopez, Joe Perillo, Rolando Hidalgo, Mary E. Burke, Ronald Mitas, Danny Improgno, Elizabeth Andrews, Bruce Fitzgerald, Leona Collins, Leona C. Baker, Louis Duncan, Sr., Isabella Smith

RECORDING SECRETARY: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Dolly MacIntyre at 4:05 p.m. A quorum was present.

STANDARD CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (ST) 2009-14 (continued):

An application for the issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 2703 Alhambra Circle, a contributing property within the "Alhambra Circle Historic District," legally described as lots 17 and 18, Block 10, Coral Gables Section D, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 74, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the installation of a new roof using clay "S" tiles.

Noting that minutes of the February 2009 meeting were in Board materials, Ms. Kautz relayed that the two motions made regarding this application in February did not receive a majority vote. Therefore, the inability of the Board to reach a decision was reviewed by the City Commission and remanded back for a full Board review.

Ms. Kautz reviewed the initial presentation, stating that the owner wished to replace the roof using S tile (versus barrel), and that staff recommended barrel tile. She pointed out that the applicant submitted materials for review, which would be explained by the applicant after staff's presentation. City Architect Carlos Mindreau was available for information. Ms. Kautz added that if the Board decided to approve S tile, she would request that such approval be case-specific with the condition that the next time this applicant or a subsequent owner replaced the roof, barrel tile would be required.

Mr. Mindreau stated that only U.S. Tile manufactured a Spanish S tile suitable for a "barrel tile starter course," adding that the Santa Fe tile proposed by the applicant could not do that or do it well. He thoroughly explained the issue and applications, and concluded that if Spanish S tile were approved by the Board, then the tile should be manufactured by U.S. Tile, which has the initial appearance of barrel tile at the edge of a roof. He added that the perfect choice for the application was barrel tile, with a second choice being U.S. Tile Spanish S. A Florida Rooftec representative added that U.S. Tile Spanish S was proposed.

Homeowner Kelly Marcum informed the Board that the current proposal was to use a combination of U.S. Tile Spanish S and barrel tile, and mentioned the price differential of the applications. Lengthy discussion continued, after which Ms. MacIntyre invited additional public comment. Hearing no requests to speak, she closed the public hearing portion of the application. Discussion of all aspects of the issue continued, with Board members indicating their opinion leanings and debating issues related to tile types and uses.

Ms. Kautz stated that, in the past, when historic homes were brought before the Board in this condition, the Board requested that barrel tile replace the roof. If a designated house already had S tile, owners were not forced to use barrel tile. In this case, she advised, there was a good chance that if S tile was used on this roof, barrel tile would not likely be forced in the future since those conclusions had been reached by previous boards.

Ms. Maroon made a motion to approve the application of the U.S. Tile Spanish S tile with a barrel tile starter course. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: Ms. Bennett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando. The motion did not pass.

Ms. Kautz suggested Board consideration of conditioning the installation of U.S. Tile Spanish S tile on using true barrel tile as a starter course and on a requirement that the homeowner use barrel tile in the next roof replacement. Mr. Mindreau added doubts that the Board of Architects would approve mixing roof applications on the same building because a roof is integral to architecture, especially in a historic structure. Board debate continued.

Ms. Maroon made a motion to approve the application of the U.S. Tile Spanish S tile with the barrel tile starter on the roof with the condition that this be a one-time approval, case specific to this owner and Certificate of Appropriateness, and in the future the application for the re-roofing of this property must be true barrel tile. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: Ms. Bennett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando. The motion did not pass.

Ms. Kautz said she would forward the issue to the City Commission for a decision. Mr. Torre requested that if the City Commission decided to approve the application, that the applicant be required to use red cement on the ridge or edges to make the roof appearance more authentic.