

# The City of Coral Gables

# Historical Resources Department

# CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES Thursday, January 16, 2014, 4:00 p.m. **City Commission Chambers** 405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	F	M	A	M	J	J	A	S	O	N	D	J	APPOINTED BY:
Dorothy Thomson	Р	P	_	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Mayor Jim Cason
Margaret Rolando	P	P	_	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Alejandro Silva	P	P	_	P	P	P	Α	P	P	P	E	P	Comm. Patricia Keon
Venny Torre	P	P	_	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Frank C. Quesada
Tony Newell*			-				P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Vince Lago
Carmen Guerrero	Е	P	-	E	E	P	P	P	P	E	E	E	Historic Preservation Board
Deborah Tackett^	P	P	_	P	E	P	P	P	^	^	^	^	City Manager
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	-	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission
Judy Pruitt	P	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission

#### STAFF:

Dona Spain, Historic Preservation Officer Kara N. Kautz Assistant Preservation Officer Emily Ahouse, Historic Preservationist Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant Bridgette Thornton, Deputy City Attorney Ernesto Pino, Acting Public Works Director

A = Absent

P = Present

E = Excused

\* = New Member

^ = Resigned Member

- = No Meeting

GUESTS: Zeke Guilford, Leonel Pina, Nicole Cunningham, Andrew Frey, Guido Brito, Javier Baena, Shawn K. Mosravi, Ozzie Dominguez, Andy Burnham, Frank M. (2020 Salzedo Street), Ramon Trias

RECORDING AND PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:03 p.m. A quorum was present.

## MINUTES: MEETING OF DECEMBER 19, 2013:

Ms. Pruitt corrected the first sentence of the 6th paragraph on page 7 of the December minutes to read: Ms. Rolando recused herself from participation in this application (Case File COA (SP) 2012-001 Revised) as her law firm represents the owner.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to approve the minutes of the meeting of December 19, 2013 as amended. Ms. MacIntyre seconded the motion, unanimously passed by voice vote.

#### DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact.

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Ms. Morgan administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

PHONE (305) 460-5093 Fax (305) 460-5097

## MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion, seconded by Mr. Silva, to excuse the meeting absence of Ms. Guerrero. The motion was unanimously approved by voice vote.

#### PERSONAL APPEARANCE:

Ernesto Pino, Acting Public Works Director, on status of traffic review at Segovia Circle:

Mr. Pino updated the Board on the Alhambra Circle/Segovia Circle intersection and described two possible alternatives to intersection vehicle movement, which were proposed to Miami-Dade County (has jurisdiction). The County approved both alternatives, but requested a traffic study, currently being undertaken. Some Board members opposed changes to the intersection, stating that the changes did not well serve the community. Ms. Spain pointed out that alterations proposed for the historically-designated Alhambra Circle would be presented to the Board as an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for review and approval.

## TRANSFER OF DEVELOPMENT RIGHTS (TDR) (SENDING SITES):

At Mr. Torre's request, Ms. Spain reviewed information about TDRs, read applicable Zoning Code provisions and stated the purpose of TDRs. She reviewed the receiving and historically-designated sending sites as they related to the TDR, and displayed other properties whose unused development rights were successfully transferred. Ms. Spain advised the Board to focus on the maintenance preservation plans for the sending site properties, and said the City would conduct inspections to ensure maintenance according to the specific plans for each property.

Ms. Rolando arrived at 4:20 p.m.

#### CASE FILE TDR 2014-001:

Consideration of the Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 280 Alhambra Circle, legally described as Lots 1 to 4 inclusive, Block 28 of Coral Gables Section "K," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat book 8, Page 33 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests approval of a maintenance plan, authorization for the transfer of the unused development rights, and the issuance of Certificates of Transfer.

Ms. Spain displayed photographs as she reviewed the property and the request to transfer 25,804.5 square feet to the receiving site. She reviewed the stabilization and maintenance plan, for which the owner is responsible.

Ms. Rolando said successor mortgagees and owners should be put on notice about the transfer of development rights and the requirements of ongoing and maintenance, and recommended putting in place a system to protect properties being harvested. Ms. Spain reported receiving an email from Ramon Trias stating that staff should use square footage calculations supplied by the applicant.

Mr. Guilford said he represented Codina CG, LLC, owner of the receiving site and a principal of 280 Alhambra Circle.

Ms. Spain noted that staff recommended approval of issuance of a Certificate of Transfer for 25,804.5 square feet from 280 Alhambra Circle, and approval of the maintenance plan and authorization for the transfer of unused development rights.

Mr. Guilford restated his representation of the receiving site, and said each sending site was represented by the individual owners, all of whom were present, as was the architect for the receiving site. Regarding the receiving site, he said the Board would only review how the receiving site affects the historic property.

Ms. Thornton cited and read Article III, Section 3-1007 of the Zoning Code about the restrictive covenant issue, stating that a restrictive covenant is required on both the sending and receiving properties.

Mr. Torre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. Spain advised that Certificates of Transfer were valid for two years.

Ms. Thomson made a motion, seconded by Ms. Rolando, to approve issuance of a Certificate of Transfer for 25,804.5 square feet from 280 Alhambra Circle, and to approve the maintenance plan and authorization for the transfer of unused development rights, subject to all conditions, recommendations and repairs noted in the staff report and the recordation of restrictive covenants, including these conditions.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Newell, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

### **CASE FILE TDR 2014-002:**

Consideration of the Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 300 Alhambra Circle, legally described as Lots 23 and 24, Block 27 of Coral Gables Section "K," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 33 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests approval of a maintenance plan, authorization for the transfer of the unused development rights, and the issuance of Certificates of Transfer.

Ms. Spain displayed photographs as she reviewed the property, the request to transfer 10,757.0 square feet to the receiving site and staff's observations and recommendations for repairs as written in the staff report. She reviewed the stabilization and maintenance plan, and stated staff's recommendation of approval of the issuance of a Certificate of Transfer for 10,757.0 square feet from 300 Alhambra Circle, and approval of the maintenance plan and authorization for the transfer of unused development rights with repairs on deficient items.

Mr. Torre called for audience comment. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion, seconded by Ms. Rolando, to approve issuance of a Certificate of Transfer for 10,757.0 square feet from 300 Alhambra Circle, and to approve the maintenance plan and authorization for the transfer of unused development rights, subject to all conditions, recommendations and repairs noted in the staff report, and the recordation of restrictive covenants, including these conditions.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Newell, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

## CASE FILE TDR 2014-003:

Consideration of the Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 320 Miracle Mile, legally described as Lots 15 and 16, Block 1 of Coral Gables Crafts Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 10, Page 40 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests approval of a maintenance plan, authorization for the transfer of the unused development rights, and the issuance of Certificates of Transfer.

Ms. Spain displayed photographs as she reviewed the property, the request to transfer 10,708 square feet to the receiving site and staff's observations and recommendations for repair to minor damage on the pilaster column capital as written in the staff report. She reviewed the stabilization and maintenance plan, and stated staff's recommendation of approval of the issuance of a Certificate of Transfer for 10,708 square feet from 320 Miracle Mile, and approval of the maintenance plan and authorization for the transfer of unused development rights with repairs on deficient items as noted.

Mr. Torre called for audience comment. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. Rolando made a motion, seconded by Ms. Thomson, to approve issuance of a Certificate of Transfer for 10,708 square feet from 320 Miracle Mile, and to approve the maintenance plan and authorization for the transfer of unused development rights, subject to all conditions, recommendations and repairs noted in the staff report, repair of minor damage on the pilaster column capital and the recordation of restrictive covenants, including these conditions.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Silva, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Newell, Ms. Rolando, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

#### CASE FILE TDR 2014-004:

Consideration of the Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 2312 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, legally described as the North 25 feet of Lots 25, 26, 27, and 28, Block 34, Coral Gables Section "K," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 33 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests approval of a maintenance plan, authorization for the transfer of the unused development rights, and the issuance of Certificates of Transfer.

Ms. Spain reviewed the location and property as she displayed photographs and described the request to transfer 1,529.0 square feet to the receiving site. She reviewed staff's observations and recommendations for ongoing building care, cleaning of the precast window sills, and patch/repair of the exterior wall at the top right corner of the west façade as noted in the staff report. She reviewed the stabilization and maintenance plan, and stated staff's recommendation of approval of the issuance of a Certificate of Transfer for 1,529.0 square feet from 2312 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, and approval of the maintenance plan and authorization for the transfer of unused development rights with conditions as written.

Mr. Silva pointed out two additional elements (columns and decorative inserts on the corner) that should be added to the recommendations to annually inspect for their condition.

Mr. Torre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Mr. Silva made a motion, seconded by Mr. Newell, to approve issuance of a Certificate of Transfer for 1,529.0 square feet from 2312 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, and to approve the maintenance plan and authorization for the transfer of unused development rights, subject to all conditions, recommendations and repairs noted in the staff report, plus the patch/repair of the exterior wall at the top right corner of the west façade, annual inspections of conditions of the columns and decorative inserts on the corner and the recordation of restrictive covenants, including these conditions.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Silva, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

#### CASE FILE TDR 2014-005:

Consideration of the Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 2320 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, legally described as the North 25 feet of the South 75 feet of Lots 25 to 28 inclusive, Block 34 of Coral Gables Section "K," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 33 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests approval of a maintenance plan, authorization for the transfer of the unused development rights, and the issuance of Certificates of Transfer.

Ms. Spain reviewed the location and property as she displayed photographs and described the request to transfer 4,558.0 square feet to the receiving site. She reviewed staff's observations and recommendations for ongoing building care, and the need for minor repainting on the exterior wood doors. She reviewed the stabilization and maintenance plan, and stated staff's recommendation of approval of the issuance of a Certificate of Transfer for 4,558.0 square feet from 2320 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, and approval of the maintenance plan and authorization for the transfer of unused development rights with conditions as written.

Mr. Torre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. Rolando made a motion, seconded by Mr. Silva, to approve issuance of a Certificate of Transfer for 4,558.0 square feet from 2320 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, and to approve the maintenance plan and authorization for the transfer of unused development rights, subject to all conditions, recommendations and repairs noted in the staff

report, including the requirement for minor repainting on the exterior wood doors and the recordation of restrictive covenants, including these conditions.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Silva, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

### TRANSFER OF DEVELOPMENT RIGHTS (RECEIVING SITE):

The proposed development (receiving site) is located at 2020 Salzedo Street, legally described as Lots 13 through 37 inclusive, Block 18 of Coral Gables Section "K," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 33 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County. 2120 Salzedo Street, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lots 25 to 30 inclusive, Block 19 of Coral Gables Section "K," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 33 of the Public Record of Miami-Dade County, Florida, is within five hundred (500) feet of the proposed development located at 2020 Salzedo Street. Therefore, per Section 3-1006 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code, the Historic Preservation Board's review and approval of the proposed development is required to determine if the proposal adversely affects the historic, architectural, or aesthetic character of the historic property.

Ms. Spain reviewed the background, existing conditions and staff observations regarding 2120 Salzedo Street, a local historic landmark, and its location within 500 feet of the proposed development site located at 2020 Salzedo Street, during which she visually displayed photographs and site drawings. She concluded by stating that staff recommended a motion to find that the proposal does not adversely affect the historic, architectural and aesthetic character of the historic property located at 2120 Salzedo Street and a motion to approve the proposal with the understanding that it requires further review and approval by the Planning and Zoning Board and the City Commission.

Mr. Guilford commented on the importance of the approval of the Board of Architects and their examination of how the historic property fit in with the non-historic property. He called attention to representatives of Codina CG LLC and the architect.

Mr. Brito, architect for the proposed development, reviewed the development rending and oriented the Board, along with Mr. Guilford, to the historic property and its location within the overall property.

Ms. Spain read for the record conditions imposed by the Board of Architects within its preliminary approval of the proposed development:

- Study the scale and detail of the tower;
- Detail window placement within wall thickness;
- Study strengthening of cornice line;
- Provide detail of grill at parking levels;
- Study scale/proportion of arcade;
- Study alternate elevation of central portion of building elevation.

She added that none of the conditions would impact the overall massing of the proposed building.

Mr. Torre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests, he closed the hearing and called for Board discussion.

A discussion ensued about the importance of ongoing oversight of maintenance and repairs. Ms. Spain explained that the department maintains an excellent relationship with Code Enforcement Officers.

Ms. Rolando made a motion, seconded by Ms. Pruitt, stating that the Historical Preservation Board finds that receipt of the transferred development rights by the receiving site for the proposed development does not adversely affect the historic, architectural or aesthetic character of the historic property located at 2120 Salzedo Street.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

## BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATES:

During discussion of the restoration of City monuments and fountains, Mr. Torre inquired about the funding source for the projects and about provisions for historic project funding sourced from Art in Public Places funds. The current Historic Trust Fund balance will be reported at the February meeting. Mr. Torre asked if the Board could petition that monies from the Historic Trust Fund be used for restoration of City Hall's historic windows. Ms. Spain will research the ordinance.

Ms. Spain reported that Ms. MacIntyre and Ms. Pruitt were re-nominated to the Historic Preservation Board.

The City Commission approved ad valorem tax relief for 1125 North Greenway Drive.

## **DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

Ms. Spain reported that the Cotorro Street French Village property was vacant and in disrepair, adding that properties such as this one were discussed by the City Commission. Ms. Thornton reported action being taken regarding this property by the City Attorney's office.

Mr. Torre requested a list of endangered properties within the City for the purpose of proactively protecting them. Staff will furnish the list at the February meeting.

#### **NEW BUSINESS:**

Ms. MacIntyre announced that the National Trust was seeking nominations for preservation awards, suggesting examination of the categories to determine if Coral Gables would qualify.

The Coral Way Historic District will likely be included in the February meeting agenda.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 5:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Dona M. Spain

Historic Preservation Officer