

Historical Resources Department 2327 Salzedo Street Coral Gables, Florida 33134

> COA (SP) 2007-12 JULY 19, 2007

#### STAFF REPORT

# SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR AN ADDITION//RENOVATION TO THE PROPERTY AT 1254 CORAL WAY A LOCAL HISTORIC LANDMARK

Proposal:

The application requests design approval for the construction of an

addition and renovations to the existing structure

Architect:

Fred R. Cardoso Architect

Owner:

George and Yeline Jaile

Legal Description:

Lots 3 and 4, Block 1, Coral Gables Section "D"

Site Characteristics:

The property is located on two interior lots. The primary elevation faces north onto Coral Way. Dimensions of the site are 100 feet wide by 175

forth onto Coral way. Dimensions of the site are 100 feet wide

feet deep.

Folio Number:

03-4118-002-0020

Designated:

June 15, 2006

# **BACKGROUND/EXISTING CONDITIONS**

Although permitted in 1924, the residence at 1254 Coral Way was actually constructed closer to 1922. It is an excellent example of masonry vernacular architecture where the style was adapted from another region while utilizing the local building materials. It is unknown at this time as to who the residence was built for or who designed the original structure; but in 1948, then owner George B. Caster hired renowned architect Upton C. Ewing to design an addition to the original structure. Mr. Caster would then hire another local architect, Edward T. Rempe, in 1954 to design a new half bathroom and an alteration to Mr. Ewing's addition. In 1960, Mr. Caster hired another local architect William E. Tschumy to design an addition to the west side of the residence.

An accelerated COA was issued in 2006 at the time of designation for a two-story addition. The addition proved structurally infeasible given the coral rock construction of the house.

# **PROPOSAL**

The application requests design approval for the construction of a one-story addition and renovations to the existing structure.

# SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION

The following Standards have application in this matter:

- 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

## **STAFF OBSERVATIONS**

The proposed addition is located to the rear (south) and west of the existing residence. This area was previously altered in 1948 and 1960. The new addition calls for the removal of the some of these non-original spaces. The application also proposes a new trellis feature located in front of the west carport.

The alterations include the removal of interior partitions, mainly in southwest portion of the home to accommodate the new addition. The interior spaces were reconfigured to include a new half bath and coat closet, an expanded open family room with bar, and one of the master bedroom closets.

The addition occurs to the rear and west side of the residence is comprised of a new master bedroom suite, and two additional bedroom suites.

The new addition is finished in smooth stucco so as to differentiate itself from the existing coral rock structure. The new addition has a combination of roof types – flat with a concrete parapet wall and a hip roof with blue tile to match the existing structure.

## **BOARD OF ARCHITECTS**

The Board of Architects reviewed this project on May 3, 2007 and approved it as noted with the following comments:

• To simplify the new railings and make them more wood railing like in appearance).

- With the readdress the new wood trellis on the west side on the home. The BOA note says "align mass."
- Provide finish for storage roof on the east side of the home.
- To resize the windows on the new addition under the covered terrace.

These comments were not addressed in the set of drawings provided to Staff.

### STAFF CONCLUSION

The application presented requests design approval for the construction of a one-story addition and renovations to the existing structure.

There are numerous drafting discrepancies that need to be corrected in the drawings. These discrepancies have been discussed with the architect and corrected plans will need to be resubmitted for the Department files.

The overall design of the addition does not detract from the historic nature of the structure. However, staff agrees with the Board of Architects' comments regarding the window sizes and with the simplification of the new metal railings. The railings, as proposed, appear too ornate and distract from the existing coral rock structure. Staff suggests that the railings be simplified to complement the existing architecture. Staff would also like clarification about attachments of the proposed new trellis to the existing structure.

In addition, although general review of local historic structures is usually limited to the exterior elevations, Staff feels that the exterior spaces that will become interior spaces continue to be reviewed for appropriateness and preservation.

## Staff recommends the following:

A motion to grant design approval for the construction of an addition and renovations to the existing structure, to the property at 1254 Coral Way, a local historic landmark and **APPROVE** with conditions the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz

Historic Preservation Officer

4,
7