

EXCERPT



HISTORICAL PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING
Meeting Minutes of April 20, 2022, at 4:00 p.m.
Coral Gables City Hall, City Commission Chamber
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida 33134

Historical Resources & Cultural Arts

2327 SALZEDO STREET
CORAL GABLES
FLORIDA 33134

305-460-5093
hist@coralgables.com

Table with 7 columns: MEMBERS, D 15, J 19, F 16, M 16, A 20, APPOINTED BY. Rows include Albert Menendez (Chair), Cesar Garcia Pons (Vice Chair), Alicia Bache-Wiig, Margaret (Peggy) Rolando, Dona Spain, Xavier Durana, Michael J. Maxwell, Bruce Ehrenhaft, and John P. Fullerton.

LEGEND: A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; * = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member.
- = No Meeting; # = Late meeting arrival

STAFF: Warren Adams, Historic Preservation Officer, Kara Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer, Gus Ceballos, Assistant City Attorney, Attorney of the Board.

RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy Kay Lyons, Administrative Assistant

OPENING STATEMENT

Acting Chair Mr. Garcia-Pons read for the record the statement regarding the purpose of the board and lobbyist registration and disclosure.

The meeting was called to order at 4:05 pm by Acting Chair Mr. Garcia-Pons and attendance was stated for the record.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

A motion was made by Mr. Spain and seconded by Mr. Garcia-Pons to approve the minutes of the meeting of March 16, 2022.
The motion passed (Ayes: 6; Nays: 0).

DEFERRALS: None

NOTICE REGARDING EX-PARTE COMMUNICATIONS.

Acting Chair Mr. Garcia-Pons read a statement regarding Notice of Ex-Partee Communications. Board members who had ex-partee communication of contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

SWEARING IN OF THE PUBLIC:

Attorney Ceballos administered the oath.

APPROVAL OF ABSENCES:

A motion was made by Mr. Rolando and seconded by Mr. Maxwell to approve the absences of Chair Menendez, Ms. Bache-Wiig and Mr. Durana.
The motion passed (Ayes: 6; Nays: 0).

Acting Chair Mr. Garcia-Pons read a description of the first item as follows:

AD VALOREM TAX RELIEF:

An application requesting ad valorem tax relief for the property at 711 University Drive, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lot 11 & S ½ of Lot 10, Block 137, Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Six, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 20, at Page 1 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The related Special Certificate of Appropriateness, COA (SP) 2017-006, was granted design approval by the Historic Preservation Board on June 15, 2017.

Ms. Kautz gave a presentation following the on-screen presentation. Highlights were as follows:

1. The property at 711 University drive is significant as an excellent example of the Mediterranean revival architectural style.
2. Designed by Phineas Paist for Edwin Gilbert and Ethel Merrick Bishop, the younger sister of Coral Gables founder George Merrick.
3. Designated in 2017.
4. Work on this ad valorem was approved as part of COA(SP)2017-006.
5. Project is substantially completed, and we are reviewing Part 2 now.
6. A photo from the 1940's and a rendering of the original permit by Phineas Paist was shown on the screen.
7. A series of before and after photos were shown and an explanation of the work performed was given.
 - a) New impact resistant casement windows indoors to match the original configuration.
 - b) New two-piece barrel tile.
 - c) Repair and replacement of damaged and rotten wood structural members.
 - d) New stucco finish and stucco repair.
 - e) Painting of the house.
 - f) New MEP systems.
 - g) Replacement of the south front façade balconette railings and iron window grill.
 - h) Reintroduction of the second-floor loggia, including the wood railings that match the existing found on the house.
 - i) Enclosure of an existing second floor loggia retaining the original wood railings.
 - j) Repair of the wood rafter ends.
 - k) Various structural improvements.
 - l) Demolition of later inappropriate additions.
 - m) The rear façade – paving, gates and pool.
 - n) Replacement of interior and exterior stone terracotta tile flooring.
 - o) Complete interior reconfiguration.
 - p) Interior restoration also included the replication of missing iron railing in the living room.
 - q) Repair of existing wood window grill.
 - r) Retention of the stained-glass windows.
 - s) Restoration of original iron work.
 - t) Restoration of the Pecky Cypress elements including the tower ceiling and the restoration of the interior doors.
 - u) One-story addition at the southwest corner of the residence.
 - v) Opening of an existing screen porch (shown with a red awning).
 - w) One story addition at the west side of the wing of the residence that flanks Palmarito Street, containing a half bathroom, covered terrace with built-in bar on the first floor and outdoor staircase.
 - x) Site improvements, new paver driveway and walkways, installation of new swimming pool and deck, restoration of the existing finial on the roof, installation of new landscaping, new walls fence and gates.
 - y) Before and after interior photos which did not count towards the ad-valorem, were shown to compare the new and the old. They included:
 - a) Kitchen.
 - b) Living room.
 - c) Railings and grills that were replicated.
 - d) Ceiling, staircase that was restored.
 - e) Grill that was replicated.
 - f) Staircase and doors that were restored.

Ms. Kautz said that this was one of the most comprehensive packages that she had ever received.

Ms. Spain said that the house was previously unnoticed, and they had done a beautiful job restoring it.

Acting Chair Mr. Garcia-Pons invited the owner to speak, but she declined saying she had nothing additional. Mr. Fullerton asked if the handrail on the stairwell had to meet a code. Ms. Kautz said because it was restoration it did not, and that staff recommended approval.

Acting Chair Mr. Garcia Pons asked if anyone in the audience would like to speak in favor of the application.

Mr. Eric Sartor of 3613 Alhambra Court stepped up to the microphone and stated that he had a house on Monserrate before and he agreed with Ms. Spain that the house was a previously a disaster and the owner had done a fabulous job restoring the house. He was not sure what she was asking for, but he thought that she deserved it.

Acting Chair Mr. Garcia Pons asked if anyone in the audience would like to speak against the application. When no one did he closed the public portion of the hearing.

Both Mr. Fullerton and Mr. Ehrenhaft thanked the owner for the beautiful job they had done.

A motion was made by Mr. Fullerton and seconded by Mr. Ehrenhaft to approve the ad valorem tax relief for the property at 711 University Drive.
The motion passed (Ayes: 6; Nays: 0).

Acting Chair Mr. Garcia-Pons read a description of the next item as follows:

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATION:

CASE FILE LHD 2022-001: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 3613 Alhambra Court, legally described as Lots 31 to 33 inclusive, Block 50, Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Four, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 10, at Page 57 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Kautz gave a presentation following the on-screen presentation. Highlights were as follows:

1. The application was as a result of the Board of Architects directive for a historic significance determination
2. 3613 Alhambra Court is eligible as a Local Historic Landmark based on three significance criteria:
 - Historical, Cultural significance**
 - 4. It Exemplifies the historical, cultural, political, economic, or social trends of the community
 - Architectural significance**
 1. Portrays the environment in an era of history characterized by one or more distinctive architectural style.
 2. Embodies those distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style, or period, or method of construction.
3. The single-family home is located on a 150' x 175' interior lot that backs onto the western portion of Biltmore Golf Course in Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Four. It was amongst first homes built along the course.
4. The home was permitted in 1940 by architect William Merriam.
5. It was designed in the Modernistic style of Art Moderne for Frank Slack.
6. This was one of a few high-style Art Moderne Modernistic homes built in the City during the City's second developmental period and represents both the somewhat rare domestic use of Art Moderne as well as the architectural turning point in Coral Gables as it embraces other styles.
7. The home exhibits extensive character-defining characteristics of Art Moderne architectures:
 - Asymmetrical, horizontal massing and orientation.
 - Cylindrical form positioned to give 'ship-like' streamline form.
 - Smooth, light-colored, exterior stucco surfaces with coral rock features.
 - Low-pitched roofs with wide eaves.
 - Sparse ornamentation using only elements that selectively enhance the geometry, sleekness, and horizontality of the structure.
 - Sculptural entry.
 - Architrave's receding symmetrical planes.
 - Ribbons of fenestration.
 - Stringcourses and inscribed horizontal lines.
 - Glass brick inserts.