



The City of Coral Gables

Historical Resources Department

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, December 11, 2014, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

Table with columns for MEMBERS, months (J, F, M, A, M, J, J, A, S, O, N, D), and APPOINTED BY. Rows list members like Dorothy Thomson, Margaret Rolando, etc., with their attendance status (P, A, E, -) for each month.

LEGEND: A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; \* = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member; - = No Meeting

STAFF:

- Dona Spain, Historic Preservation Officer
Kara N. Kautz, Assistant Preservation Officer
Emily Ahouse, Historic Preservationist
Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant
Bridgette Thornton, Deputy City Attorney
Ramon Trias, Planning & Zoning Director
Megan McLaughlin, City Planner, Development Services

GUESTS: Mario Garcia-Serra, Josh Bailey, Dan Freed, Gay Bondurant, Richard Thurer, Juan C. Menendez, Juliana Tooma, Jane Tompkins, Pedro Bravo, Frank Lopez, Jose Faria, Arturo Griego, Gregory E. Lopez, Josh Geldmon, James Hutson, Pedro Fernandez.

RECORDING AND PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:06 p.m. A quorum was present.

MINUTES: MEETING OF NOVEMBER 20, 2014:

A motion to approve the minutes of the November 20, 2014 meeting was made by Ms. MacIntyre, seconded by Mr. Newell and unanimously approved by voice vote.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Mr. Parsley made a motion, seconded by Ms. Pruitt, to excuse the absence of Ms. Guerrero from the meeting. The motion was approved by voice vote. Mr. Torre asked staff to again remind Ms. Guerrero about the importance of her regular attendance. Ms. Rolando had not yet arrived, but her attendance was anticipated.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact.

DEFERRALS: Case File COA (SP) 2014-009

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Ms. Morgan administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

PLANNING DEPARTMENT PRESENTATION:

An informational presentation regarding 2801, 2901, and 3001 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, "Mediterranean Village at Ponce Circle," lengthy legal description on file in the Historical Resources Department. The proposed development is located surrounding 2901 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, a local historic landmark, legally described as Tract A, Ponce Place Villas East, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 168, Page 42 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County.

After Ms. Spain introduced Ramon Trias, Director of Planning & Zoning Department, Mr. Trias advised that the purpose of the presentation was informational only, would be useful to the Board and needed no action. Stating that the applicant would make a brief presentation, Mr. Trias displayed the site location, reviewed City and public processes completed to date and focused on the center of the project, the Arts Center Building and surrounding space to be featured as a plaza. He described the form-based Code principles that applied and preservation of the historic building.

Attorney Garcia-Serra, representing the owner, briefly described the owner's background, stated that the Arts Center Building would be the focal point of the development, and described remaining approvals needed.

Mr. Bailey, project architect (396 Alhambra Circle), stated that the group proposed a mixed-use development project with a hotel, commercial spaces, an office building, a series of different residential buildings and underground parking.

Ms. Rolando arrived at 4:20 p.m.

Mr. Bailey continued his detailed description of the project, after which Mr. Trias advised the Board that their recommendations were welcome, even though no issues would be subject to voting. Mr. Garcia-Serra added that tenants would eventually be occupying space in the building, at which time proposed renovations would be brought to the Board for approval. He again requested Board input regarding the historic building and the surrounding landscaping.

Board members clarified details as they related to the historic building, the plaza, materials, landscaping, trees, zoning, project height and potential flooding issues. Specific recommendations were offered regarding the surrounding buildings and features of the overall project to further highlight the importance to the project of the historic building. Specific recommendations regarding plaza landscaping and care of the historic building:

- Mr. Parsley: Recommended adding landscaping shade to the outdoor plaza surrounding the building;
- Mr. Silva: Recommended including a maintenance plan and attendant allocation of funds for the historic building;
- Mr. Torre: It would be helpful to have an elevation that features the plaza's relationship to the buildings to the north and south, including landscaping/trees emphasizing the plaza's importance.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, December 11, 2014

Continued

After discussion, Mr. Trias advised that the developer was maximizing public input, and expressed appreciation to the Board for its thoughtful review and discussion. Mr. Torre asked, if the project came back to the Board, for elevations that feature all sides of the historic building and plaza, and Mr. Silva asked to eventually see the site and landscaping plan, even if not required for this Board.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATIONS:

CASE FILE LHD 2014-006: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 1615 Country Club Prado, legally described as the N 4.46 FT of Lot 18 and Lots 19 & 20, Block 20, Coral Gables Section "E" REV, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 86 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Kautz displayed and reviewed the site plan, historic and current photographs, and described the architecture, structure features, property history and alterations made over the years. She also provided additional information about the Mediterranean Transitional style, and displayed the body of work created by the original architects and pointed out similarities to the subject property. Ms. Kautz concluded her presentation by stating that staff recommended approval of local historic designation based on its historic, cultural and architectural significance.

Mr. Torre inquired about the 1948 addition, asking if it enhanced or detracted from the original design. Ms. Kautz observed that the addition was sufficient early and didn't detract from the original design. Thereafter, Mr. Torre invited comment from the audience.

Mr. Griego, the project architect hired by the owner, Aizrat Real Estate Opportunities, LLC, to design a home for the site. Prior to beginning the project, Mr. Griego asked if the house was designated, and learned it was not designated; however, the applicant was informed that if the owner planned a demolition they needed to obtain a letter of significance. As it was not designated, the architect designed a new house. Prior to presenting the design to the Board of Architects, a letter of significance was requested, and they learned the property was deemed significant. Mr. Griego offered to review the proposed design of the residence. Subsequently, there followed a discussion between staff, the Board and Mr. Griego, who advised that the existing house needed to be updated and repaired if the owners were to live there with their family.

Mr. Fernandez, representing his partner (the person who planned to live on the property with his family), further explained his partner's plans regarding the property, stating that numerous upgrades and alterations were needed to accommodate a family.

After no further audience requests to speak, Mr. Torre closed the public hearing. After brief discussion, the Board voted on the application.

Mr. Parsley made a motion to approve local historic designation of the property located at 1615 Country Club Prado, which was seconded by Ms. Rolando.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Torre. Nays: Mr. Newell.

Mr. Parsley left the meeting at 5:45 p.m.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, December 11, 2014

Continued

SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2014-015: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1242 Coral Way, a vacant parcel within the "Coral Way Historic District," legally described as Lots 7 & 8, Block 1, Coral Gables Section "D" Revised Plat, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 25, at Page 74, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the construction of a new single-family residence.

Ms. Ahouse comprehensively reviewed the property's history as photographs were displayed and described. She concluded the presentation by stating that staff recommended approval of the application with two conditions: 1) that the roof, noted as a "shallow barrel clay roof tile," should be true, two-piece barrel tile; 2) the proposed windows and doors should be specified as having muntins with raised profiles.

Mr. Bravo, architect for the project, also displayed photographs as he reviewed the overall design as well as specific floor and feature plans as well as alterations, pointing out muntins with profiles in the windows. He added the Board of Architects approved the plan with no issues.

Mr. Torre clarified the size of the windows with Mr. Bravo. Ms. Ahouse addressed the raised muntins issue, which Mr. Bravo agreed to address. During the discussion, Ms. Rolando asked that Mr. Bravo review the windows with staff to reflect a suitable contemporary version of an Arts and Crafts design in the window style. Mr. Bravo agreed.

Additional audience comment was not requested, so Mr. Torre closed the public hearing. In response to Ms. MacIntyre's inquiry about using true barrel tile as requested by staff, Mr. Bravo agreed.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the design proposal for the construction of a new single-family residence at 1242 Coral Way, conditioned upon using true, two-piece barrel tile on the roof, and on staff's review and approval of the window selection, to conform with the Arts and Crafts style. Ms. MacIntyre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Newell, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Rolando, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Silva, Mr. Torre. Nays: None

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2014-016: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1013 Castile Avenue, a contributing resource within the "Castile Avenue Historic District," legally described as Lot 15 & E 15 FT Lot 16, Block 8, Coral Gables Section "C," according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 26, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for a two-story addition, and alterations to the existing one-story residence and two-story detached outbuilding.

Ms. Ahouse reviewed the property, including the two-story addition and two-story outbuilding, covering the background of the residence, and details of the proposed alterations, with photographs to show context and comparisons. She stated that staff deemed the alterations as both compatible and reversible, said the proposed addition did not detract from the overall historic integrity of the property, and stated staff's recommendation for approval of the design proposal for the two-story addition, and alterations to the existing one-story residence and the two-story detached outbuilding.

Ms. Tooma, the architect and applicant, reviewed proposal details, explaining their purposes and functions. She and Ms. Ahouse responded to Board questions requesting clarification of proposal details. It was stated that the roof would be tiled with true barrel tile. Board members praised the design and the differentiation between the historic structure and the alterations.

Mr. Torre invited additional audience comment. Hearing no further requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, December 11, 2014

Continued

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the design for a two-story addition, and alterations to the existing one-story residence and the two-story detached outbuilding, specifying that true barrel tile would be used on the addition roof at the property located at 1013 Castile Avenue. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Silva, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Newell, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

AD VALOREM TAX ABATEMENT:

CASE FILE AV 2013-004: An application requesting ad valorem tax relief for the property at 2622 Country Club Prado, a local historic landmark, legally described as Lots 11 thru 13, Block 14, Coral Gables Section "D," according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25 at Page 74 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The related Certificates of Appropriateness, COA (ST) 2013-137, COA (ST) 2013-145, COA (ST) 2013-151, COA (ST) 2014-007, COA (ST) 2014-010, COA (ST) 2014-015, and COA (ST) 2014-037 were granted design approval administratively by the Historical Resources Department.

Ms. Ahouse reviewed the property's history and previously-approved restoration projects, stating that the house was in poor condition when they began excellent restoration projects, now completed. She displayed before and after photographs as she oriented the Board to the locations of the features that were restored. Ms. Ahouse concluded by introducing the property owner.

Mr. Menendez expressed his satisfaction with restoring the home he loved. Board members were effusive in their praise of the restoration.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to recommend approval of ad valorem tax abatement for restoration work performed at the property located at 2622 Country Club Prado. Ms. MacIntyre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

STANDARD CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (ST) 2014-087: An application for the issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 5129 Riviera Drive, a contributing resource within the "Chinese Village Historic District," legally described as Lot 14 and North ½ of Lot 12, Block 100, Coral Gables Riviera Section Part 2, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 28, Page at 18 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the installation of a new roof using Ludowici 18 3/8 Spanish S (color: High Gloss Blue).

Ms. Kautz refreshed Board memory about the August application when the owner requested, and the Board approved, using Santa Fe tile on the roof. Because the homeowner preferred to exactly replace the roof tile with the original, rather than using the Santa Fe tile, the application was presented to replace the roof tile with Ludowici 18 3/8 Spanish S in a high gloss blue color.

Mr. Faria, representing the homeowner, explained the tile choice and reasons for revising the tile decision. He, Board members and Ms. Kautz briefly discussed details.

Mr. Torre invited additional audience comment. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, December 11, 2014

Continued

Mr. Newell made a motion to approve using the Ludowici 18 3/8 Spanish S tile in a high gloss blue color to replace the roof at the property located at 5129 Riviera Drive as requested. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

OLD BUSINESS:

Historic Home Plaques: Regarding plaques for the City's historic homes, Ms. Spain said she is researching the possibility of making a cast of a previously-purchased ceramic plaque.

City Hall Restoration Update: Ms. Spain reported that City Hall's restoration needs were being assessed, including the windows.

Merrick House Restoration: At the Board's request, Ms. Spain explained details of the planned restoration of Merrick House, the City's budgeted amount, the State of Florida's pending grant funding and how the City budget addresses historic preservation items.

NEW BUSINESS:

Board List: Staff will provide and distribute an updated list of Board members, their contact information and Board appointment dates.

ADJOURNMENT: There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting adjourned at 6:41 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Dona M. Spain  
Historic Preservation Officer