## Proposal Evaluation Form RFQ 2024-007 - Transportation Planning and Engineering Consulting Services Totals Composite Form Active

| Selection Criteria \ Proposers   | Maximum<br>Criteria Points<br>per Evaluator | Total Maximum<br>Sub-Criteria<br>Points | Ardurra<br>Group, Inc. | BCC<br>Engineering,<br>LLC | Caltran<br>Engineering<br>Group, Inc. | CHA<br>Consulting,<br>Inc. | EXP U.S.<br>Services<br>Inc. | Kimley-Horn<br>and Associates,<br>Inc | Roadway<br>Design<br>Solutions, Inc. | Volkert,<br>Inc | WSP<br>USA Inc. |
|--|---|---|------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
|  |   |   | TOTAL:                 | TOTAL:                     | TOTAL:                                | TOTAL:                     | TOTAL:                       | TOTAL:                                | TOTAL:                               | TOTAL:          | TOTAL:          |
| Experience & Qualifications  | 30  | 120                                     |                        |                            |                                       |                            |                              |                                       |                                      |                 |                 |
| Proposer's qualifications, including, but not limited to company history and description, the number of years in business, size, number of employees, office location where work is to be performed, licenses/certifications, credentials, capabilities and capacity to effectively meet the City's needs, relevant experience, and proven track record of providing the scope of services as identified in this solicitation to public sector agencies.   |   | 40                                      | 33.0                   | 30.0                       | 34.0                                  | 31.0                       | 31.0                         | 38.0                                  | 32.0                                 | 34.0            | 31.0            |
| Proposer's expertise and experience in working with other disciplines, including coordination with other planning and engineering professionals and sub-consultants.   |   | 28                                      | 26.0                   | 24.0                       | 27.0                                  | 27.0                       | 24.0                         | 27.0                                  | 27.0                                 | 27.0            | 25.0            |
| Proposer's financial stability.  |   | 24                                      | 20.0                   | 23.0                       | 20.0                                  | 19.0                       | 19.0                         | 23.0                                  | 20.0                                 | 20.0            | 18.0            |
| Qualifications and experience of all proposed key personnel (including sub-consultants)  |   | 28                                      | 23.0                   | 23.0                       | 25.0                                  | 24.0                       | 23.0                         | 26.0                                  | 27.0                                 | 25.0            | 23.0            |
| Experience & Qualifications Total  |   |   | 102.0                  | 100.0                      | 106.0                                 | 101.0                      | 97.0                         | 114.0                                 | 106.0                                | 106.0           | 97.0            |
| Project Understanding, Proposed Approach, Methodology  | 20  | 80                                      |                        |                            |                                       |                            |                              |                                       |                                      |                 |                 |
| Proposer's overall detailed approach and methodology to perform the services solicited herein. Understanding of the RFQ scope and requirements, strategies for assuring assigned work is completed on time, strategies for assuring assigned work is completed on time, innovation interaction and communication with the community, City staff, and multiple stakeholders.  |   | 16                                      | 14.0                   | 11.0                       | 15.0                                  | 13.0                       | 15.0                         | 15.0                                  | 13.0                                 | 14.0            | 12.0            |
| Recent, current, and projected workload for the Proposer and key personnel and how the potential contract will fit into the Proposer's workload.   |   | 12                                      | 10.0                   | 11.0                       | 11.0                                  | 11.0                       | 11.0                         | 12.0                                  | 11.0                                 | 11.0            | 11.0            |
| Proposer's demonstrated ability to positively and innovatively move a project from the conceptual stage into a clearly defined project that may be designed and constructed, while minimizing the impact on the community.   |   | 16                                      | 12.0                   | 13.0                       | 14.0                                  | 14.0                       | 12.0                         | 16.0                                  | 14.0                                 | 14.0            | 12.0            |
| Proposer's demonstrated ability to provide schedule control, cost control and quality control for the services specified herein. Proposer's experience with similar projects completed on-time and within budget.  |   | 16                                      | 13.0                   | 11.0                       | 14.0                                  | 13.0                       | 13.0                         | 15.0                                  | 13.0                                 | 15.0            | 13.0            |
| Proposer's ability to deliver similar projects having significant community and business involvement.  |   | 12                                      | 11.0                   | 11.0                       | 12.0                                  | 12.0                       | 10.0                         | 12.0                                  | 12.0                                 | 11.0            | 11.0            |
| Proposer's ability to work with other consultants designated by the City.  |   | 8                                       | 8.0                    | 8.0                        | 8.0                                   | 8.0                        | 8.0                          | 8.0                                   | 8.0                                  | 8.0             | 8.0             |
| Project Understanding, Proposed Approach, Methodology Total  |   |   | 68.0                   | 65.0                       | 74.0                                  | 71.0                       | 69.0                         | 78.0                                  | 71.0                                 | 73.0            | 67.0            |
| Past Performance and References  | 15  | 60                                      |                        |                            |                                       |                            |                              |                                       |                                      |                 |                 |
| Provide detailed information on five (5) of the Proposer's most recent and relevant projects similar in scope and nature to the services described in the solicitation   |   | 28                                      | 23.0                   | 23.0                       | 26.0                                  | 22.0                       | 21.0                         | 25.0                                  | 21.0                                 | 22.0            | 21.0            |
| All contracts which the Proposer has performed (past and present) for the City of Coral Gables. The City will review all contracts the Proposer has performed for the City in accordance with Section 4.10 Evaluation of Responses (c) (4) which states the City may consider "Proposer's unsatisfactory performance record, judged from the standpoint of conduct of work, workmanship, progress or standards of performance agreed upon in the Contract as substantiated by past or current work with the City". |   | 12                                      | 11.0                   | 6.0                        | 11.0                                  | 11.0                       | 5.0                          | 12.0                                  | 8.0                                  | 6.0             | 9.0             |
| List with contact information of public sector clients, if any, that have discontinued use of Proposer's services within the past two (2) years and indicate the reasons for the same.   |   | 12                                      | 11.0                   | 11.0                       | 12.0                                  | 12.0                       | 12.0                         | 12.0                                  | 12.0                                 | 12.0            | 12.0            |
| Please identify each incident within the last five (5) years where (a) a civil, criminal, administrative, other similar proceeding was filed or is pending, if such proceeding arises from or is a dispute concerning the Proposer's rights, remedies or duties under a contract for the same or similar type services to be provided under this RFQ (See Affidavit D).  |   | 8                                       | 7.0                    | 8.0                        | 8.0                                   | 8.0                        | 8.0                          | 7.0                                   | 8.0                                  | 7.0             | 8.0             |
| Past Performance and References Total  |   |   | 52.0                   | 48.0                       | 57.0                                  | 53.0                       | 46.0                         | 56.0                                  | 49.0                                 | 47.0            | 50.0            |
| Additional Criteria: Experience & Qualifications of Key Personnel  | 20  | 80                                      |                        |                            |                                       |                            |                              |                                       |                                      |                 |                 |
| Project manager assigned to the work must have experience in Traffic and Transportation Engineering and Planning and have served as project manager on similar projects.   |   | 40                                      | 33.0                   | 31.0                       | 37.0                                  | 33.0                       | 28.0                         | 37.0                                  | 34.0                                 | 36.0            | 33.0            |
| Identify the team members who will be assigned to this contract (including working titles, degrees, certificates, licenses and technical expertise). Describe the roles and responsibilities of each team member and why each team member is critical to the success of the overall contract.  |   | 20                                      | 18.0                   | 17.0                       | 17.0                                  | 18.0                       | 16.0                         | 19.0                                  | 18.0                                 | 18.0            | 17.0            |
| Include resumes of key team members. Resumes will not be included in the page count for this section and are limited to one single sided page per individual.  |   | 20                                      | 18.0                   | 18.0                       | 19.0                                  | 18.0                       | 16.0                         | 18.0                                  | 18.0                                 | 17.0            | 17.0            |
| Additional Criteria: Experience & Qualifications of Key Personnel Total  |   |   | 69.0                   | 66.0                       | 73.0                                  | 69.0                       | 60.0                         | 74.0                                  | 70.0                                 | 71.0            | 67.0            |
| Agreement Exceptions   | 5   | 20                                      |                        |                            |                                       |                            |                              |                                       |                                      |                 |                 |
| Review exceptions made by the proposer to the conditions listed in the agreement for the services.   |   | 20                                      | 16.0                   | 11.0                       | 20.0                                  | 16.0                       | 16.0                         | 18.0                                  | 15.0                                 | 17.0            | 17.0            |
| Agreement Exceptions Total   |   |   | 16.0                   | 11.0                       | 20.0                                  | 16.0                       | 16.0                         | 18.0                                  | 15.0                                 | 17.0            | 17.0            |
| Points shall be awarded to the Proposer for volume of work awarded by the City in the last three (3) years from the due date of this RFQ.  | 5   | 20                                      | 20.0                   | 20.0                       | 20.0                                  | 20.0                       | 20.0                         | 12.0                                  | 20.0                                 | 20.0            | 20.0            |
| Total Points   | 100   | 400                                     | 345.0                  | 326.0                      | 368.0                                 | 345.0                      | 326.0                        | 370.0                                 | 347.0                                | 353.0           | 335.0           |
| Ranking  |   |   | 5                      | 8                          | 2                                     | 5                          | 8                            | 1                                     | 4                                    | 3               | 7               |