



**City of Coral Gables
CITY COMMISSION MEETING
January 24, 2023**

ITEM TITLE:

Historic Preservation Board Meeting of October 19, 2022

SUMMARY OF MEETING:

OPENING STATEMENT:

Chair Menendez read for the record the statement regarding the purpose of the board and lobbyist registration and disclosure.

CALL TO ORDER:

The meeting was called to order at 4:09 pm by Chair Menendez and attendance was stated for the record.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and seconded by Mr. Maxwell to approve the minutes of the September 21, meeting with corrections.

The motion passed (Ayes: 7; Nays: 0).

NOTICE REGARDING EX-PARTE COMMUNICATIONS.

Chair Menendez read a statement regarding Notice of Ex-Partee Communications. Board members who had ex-partee communication of contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact.

Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

ANNOUNCEMENT OF DEFERRAL OF AN AGENDA ITEM:

- 1) **CASE FILE LHD 2022-008:** Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 117 Aledo Avenue, legally described as Lots 27, 28, 29 and 30, Block 14, Coral Gables Coconut Grove Section Part One, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 14, at Page 25 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

A motion was made by Mr. Fullerton and seconded by Ms. Spain to defer CASE FILE LHD 2022-008, consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 117 Aledo Avenue to the November 16th, 2022, meeting.

The motion passed (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0).

APPROVAL OF ABSENCES:

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and seconded by Mr. Durana to excuse the absences of Mr. Bruce Ehrenhaft and Ms. Peggy Rolando from this meeting.

The motion passed (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0).

SWEARING IN OF THE PUBLIC:

Assistant City Attorney Ceballos administered the oath.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2022-025: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 817 Obispo Avenue, a Contributing Resource within the “Obispo Avenue Historic District,” legally described as the Lot 15, Block 28, Coral Gables Section “B,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 111 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for an addition and alterations to the residence. A variance has also been requested from Article 2, Section 2-101 D (4) b.i. of the Coral Gables Zoning Code for the minimum side setback.

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and seconded by Mr. Fullerton to approve with conditions as noted in the staff report the design proposal for an addition and alterations to the residence and sitework and approve the issuance of the Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 817 Obispo Avenue.

The motion passed (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0).

Conditions are as follows:

1. *Roof tile is to be two-piece true barrel tile.*
2. *Elevations of the entire residence with impact-resistant windows and doors matching the original type and configuration are to be provided so that the muntin pattern of the windows on the addition can be finalized with Staff.*
3. *Windows and doors are to receive high-profile muntins and glass is to be clear/no tint or reflectivity.*
4. *All existing windowsills are to remain.*
5. *Provide a recess at the infilled window openings on the east and west elevations.*

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and seconded by Mr. Fullerton to approve the request for a variance from Article 2, Section 2-101 D (4) b.i of the Coral Gables Zoning Code for the property to have a side setback of 3 feet 4 inches.

The motion passed (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0).

CASE FILE TDR 2022-005: Consideration of the Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 280 Miracle Mile, the Miracle Theater, a Local Historic Landmark. A lengthy legal description is on file with the Historical Resources Department. The application requests approval of the Maintenance/Preservation Plan, pursuant to Section 14-204.4 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code.

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and seconded by Ms. Spain to approve the Maintenance/Preservation Plan with conditions for the property (Sending Site) at 280 Miracle Mile, the Miracle Theater, a Local Historic Landmark and request that the annual report be provided to the Historic Preservation Board upon completion.

The motion passed (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0).

The conditions are as follows:

- 1) *The first sentence of item #6 of the Long-Term Maintenance Plan shall be amended to read: "The City's Historical Resources and Cultural Arts Department will perform yearly inspections of the building's historically significant features, make recommendations for their upkeep when warranted, and check for unpermitted alterations."*
- 2) *The completed Annual Reports shall be provided to the Historic Preservation Board for informational purposes.*

CASE FILE TDR 2022-006: Consideration of the Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 286 Miracle Mile, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as the North 70 Feet of Lots 1 and 2 and the West 10 Feet of the North 70 Feet of Lot 3, Block 2, Coral Gables Crafts Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 10, at Page 40, of the Public Records of Dade County, Florida. The application requests approval of the Maintenance/Preservation Plan pursuant to Section 14-204.4 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code.

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and seconded by Mr. Maxwell to approve the Maintenance/Preservation Plan with conditions for the property (Sending Site) at 286 Miracle Mile, a Local Historic Landmark.

The motion passed (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0).

The conditions were as follows:

1. *The first sentence of item #3 of the Long-Term Maintenance Plan shall be amended to read: "The City's Historical Resources and Cultural Arts Department will perform yearly inspections of the building's historically significant features, make recommendations for their upkeep when warranted, and check for unpermitted alterations."*
2. *The completed Annual Reports shall be provided to the Historic Preservation Board for informational purposes.*

CASE FILE TDR 2022-008: Consideration of the Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 2506 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, a Local Historic Landmark, legally Historic Preservation Board Meeting described as Lots 22 & 23, Block 7, Coral Gables Crafts Section, as recorded in Plat Book 10, at Page 40 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests approval of the Maintenance/Preservation Plan, pursuant to Section 14-204.4 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code.

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and seconded by Mr. Maxwell to approve the Preservation Plan with conditions for the property (Sending Site) at 2506 Ponce de Leon Boulevard a “Local Historic Landmark”.

The motion passed (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0).

Conditions are as follows:

1. *The first sentence of item #6 of the Long-Term Maintenance Plan shall be amended to read: “The City’s Historical Resources and Cultural Arts Department will perform yearly inspections of the building’s historically significant features, make recommendations for their upkeep when warranted, and check for unpermitted alterations.”*
2. *The completed Annual Reports shall be provided to the Historic Preservation Board for informational purposes.*

CASE FILE TDR 2022-009: Consideration of the Transfer of Development Rights for the property at 36 Phoenetia Avenue, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lot 4 & the West 23 Feet of Lot 5, Block 22, Coral Gables Douglas Section, as recorded in Plat Book 25, at Page 69 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests approval of the Maintenance/Preservation Plan, pursuant to Section 14-204.4 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code.

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Garcia-Pons and seconded by Mr. Maxwell to approve the Maintenance/Preservation Plan with conditions for the property (Sending Site) at 36 Phoenetia Avenue a “Local Historic Landmark”.

The motion passed (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0).

The conditions were as follows:

1. *The installation of appropriate and approved hurricane and disaster protection systems prior to the start of the next hurricane season.*

TRANSFER OF DEVELOPMENT RIGHTS (RECEIVING SITE): The proposed development (receiving site) is located at **1505 Ponce de Leon Boulevard**, legally described as Lots 1 through 5 and Lots 17 through 22, Block 36, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat book 25, Page 69 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The following historically designated properties are within five hundred (500) feet of the proposed development located at 1505 Ponce de Leon Boulevard:

- 1721 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, legally described as Lot 4 and the North 5 Feet of Lot 5, Block 3, Coral Gables Section “L,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 85 of the Public Record of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

- 131 Zamora Avenue, legally described as Lot 19, Block 39, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 69 of the Public Record of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
- 102 Menores Avenue, legally described as Lot 11, Block 36, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 69 of the Public Record of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
- 114 Menores Avenue, legally described as Lot 8 & the West ½ Lot 9, Block 36, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 69 of the Public Record of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
- 118 Menores Avenue, legally described as Lot 7, Block 36, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 69 of the Public Record of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
- 122 Menores Avenue, legally described as Lot 6, Block 36, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 69 of the Public Record of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
- 111 Salamanca Avenue, legally described as Lots 10 and 11, and the East 30 feet of Lot 12, Block 29, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 69 of the Public Record of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Therefore, per Section 14-204.6 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code, the Historic Preservation Board's review and approval of the proposed development is required to determine if the proposal adversely affects the historic, architectural, or aesthetic character of the historic property.

A motion was made by Ms. Spain and seconded by Mr. Maxwell to approve the Transfer of Development Rights to the proposed development at 1505 Ponce de Leon Boulevard as it will not adversely affect the Local Historic Landmarks located at 1721 Ponce de Leon Boulevard, 131 Zamora Avenue, 102 Menores Avenue, 114 Menores Avenue, 118 Menores Avenue, 122 Menores Avenue, and 111 Salamanca Avenue.

The motion passed (Ayes: 7, Nays: 0).

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2022-026: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 2003 Alhambra Circle, a Contributing Resource within the "Alhambra Circle Historic District," legally described as the Lots 6 and 7, Block 14, Coral Gables Section "E," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 13 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for additions and alterations to the residence and sitework.

A motion was made by Ms. Bache-Wiig and seconded by Mr. Durana to approve the request for design approval for additions and alterations to the residence and sitework with conditions and to approve the issuance of Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 2003 Alhambra Circle, a Contributing Resource within the "Alhambra Circle Historic District,"

The motion passed (Ayes: 5, Nays: 2).

The conditions are as follows:

1. *The shape of the parapets on the stair and elevator towers be amended to be more consistent with the architectural style of the house.*
2. *Details and specifications for all new doors and windows be submitted to Staff for review.*
3. *The proposed sills are removed from the windows on the additions to further differentiate the new construction from the original.*
4. *Details and specifications of all proposed new columns and railings be submitted to Staff for review.*
5. *Details and specifications of all proposed new pavers be submitted to Staff for review.*
6. *All Zoning issues are resolved.*
7. *On the new additions, all glass shall be clear and all muntins shall be high profile.*
8. *Provide pedestrian access (walkway) from the sidewalk at Alhambra Circle to the new front door location.*
9. *Delineate the change in the eave height at the garage by providing an architectural treatment - with material, not just a change in stucco - between the original eave height and the new eave height.*

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2022-028: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 410 Alcazar Avenue, a Contributing Resource within the “Alcazar Avenue Historic District,” legally described as Lot 10, Block 5, Coral Gables Section “B,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 111 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the enclosure of the open front porch with impact-resistant windows and doors.

A motion was made by Mr. Maxwell and seconded by Mr. Durana to approve the design for the enclosure of the open front porch with impact-resistant windows and doors, an approve the application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 410 Alcazar Avenue, a Contributing Resource within the “Alcazar Avenue Historic District”.

The motion failed (Ayes: 4, Nays: 3).

The Board discussed the options.

A motion was made by Mr. Maxwell and seconded by Mr. Fullerton to approve the design for the enclosure of the open front porch with impact-resistant windows and doors, an approve the application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 410 Alcazar Avenue, a Contributing Resource within the “Alcazar Avenue Historic District”.

The motion passed (Ayes: 5, Nays: 2).

BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE: None.

ITEMS FROM THE SECRETARY:

1. House with hybrid roofing system:

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. Restriction on communication between Boards:
2. TDR handouts:

OLD BUSINESS: None

NEW BUSINESS: None

ADJOURNMENT:

A motion was made by Mr. Maxwell and seconded by vice Chair Garcia Pons to adjourn the meeting. The motion passed with a collective aye.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:54 pm.