

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, July 15, 2010, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:

A S O N D J F M A M J J

Dorothy Thomson	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P
Margaret Rolando	P	P	P	E	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P
Ernesto Santos	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
Venny Torre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
Richard Heisenbottle	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P
Deborah Tackett*								P	P	P	P	P
Gay Bondurant	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P
Judy Pruitt*												P

APPOINTED BY:

Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Comm. Maria Anderson
Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
Historic Preservation Board
City Manager Patrick Salerno
City Commission
City Commission

STAFF:

Kara Kautz, Historic Resources Officer
Simone Chin, Historic Preservation Administrator
Betty Perez, Administrative Assistant

A = Absent

P = Present

E = Excused

*** = New Member**

^ = Resigned Member

RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

GUESTS: Ileana Sotolongo, Cesar Sotolongo, Juan Valdes-Pages, Juan P. San Martin, Maria Elena Ramos, Alberto Vadia, Eduardo Llano.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Dolly MacIntyre at 4:04 p.m. A quorum was present.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Ms. MacIntyre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. She then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

MINUTES: MEETING OF JUNE 17, 2010:

Ms. Thomson made a motion to approve the minutes of the June 17, 2010 meeting as written. Ms. Tackett seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

DEFERRALS: None.

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan swore in audience members who planned to testify during the meeting.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2010-06:

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **813 Obispo Avenue**, a contributing structure within the “Obispo Avenue Historic District,” legally described as Lot 14 & W ½ of Lot 13, Block 28, Coral Gables Section “B”, as recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 111, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the construction of an addition and alterations.

After Ms. Kautz described the property’s history, architecture and alterations, she displayed photographs and proposed addition drawings, adding that variances were not requested.

Project architect Eduardo Llano reviewed the small addition and its details, and responded to Board questions.

Thereafter, hearing no audience requests to speak, Ms. MacIntyre closed the public hearing and opened Board discussion, during which Ms. Tackett discussed the design’s blank, 14-foot east elevation, barren of fenestration or other decorative feature.

Ms. Tackett made a motion to approve the design for the alterations to the property at 813 Obispo Avenue with the condition of an addition of fenestration or decorative element on the east elevation, subject to staff approval. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion, and suggested a decorative feature in lieu of a window, to which Ms. Tackett agreed, subject to staff approval.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2010-07:

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the St. Theresa Catholic School located at **2701 Indian Mound Trail**, a contributing structure within the “Church of the Little Flower Historic District,” legally described as All Blocks 6, 6-A, and 7, Coral Gables Section “D” Revised, as recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 74, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the installation of windows and an elevator.

Ms. Kautz displayed historic photographs of the property as she described its history and architecture, thereafter summarizing the application for design approval for the installation of impact-resistant windows and an elevator.

Ms. Chin oriented Board members to the campus and specific areas that would be affected by the proposal. Ms. Kautz added that the Board of Architects reviewed the application in March 2010 and recommended that the north wall and mechanical room be pushed slightly back so the roof could abut the existing wall of the stairwell. The recommendation was not implemented, and Ms. Kautz recommended implementation. She pointed out discrepancies between the drawings and the structure, and detailed staff concerns, stating that several issues needed to be addressed.

Mr. Llano, as project architect, relayed past alterations made to the school, after which he described proposed alterations. He added that the elevator project might have to be deferred due to finances if the windows had to be addressed differently than proposed. He pointed out that windows were leaking and there was no protection from hurricane-force winds. A sample of the proposed replacement windows was displayed. Discussion ensued.

Board discussion and comments:

- Mr. Torre: recommended a lighter color on window frames to lessen contrast with other windows.
- Mr. Heisenbottle: the proposed window style does not comply with the Secretary of Interior Standards as replacement windows; suggested matching original window frame color rather than introducing a new color; recommended exploring the egress opening requirement.

- Mr. Santos: discovered three window frame colors when working on the school in the 1980s (natural steel, off-white and green), with the green color selected for the 1980s restoration; recommended conducting a one-time wind test for the larger window configuration, and the possibility of installing swing windows.

Ms. Kautz explained that staff met many times with the applicant prior to the Board meeting, and said that given window egress concerns and being unsure how they would be solved, and knowing the windows were original and unique (odd configuration and tilt-out windows), the applicant focused on the opening and how to achieve egress. She clarified statements in the report regarding casement windows, and asked the Board to give direction to the applicant.

Mr. Santos pointed out that the applicant indicated the project could be split between the windows and the elevator, adding that the elevator approach, with the Board of Architects' comment, was acceptable to him. He recommended that the applicant determine the budget allocation for windows and address the issues raised during discussion, particularly the importance of meeting Secretary of Interior Standards. He also commented that there could be a conflict with Code in the corridors. Mr. Heisenbottle suggested deferring the application until September to give the applicant an opportunity to work on the windows. It was agreed to separate the application into the elevator project and the window project.

Mr. Heisenbottle made a motion to grant design approval for the construction of the elevator addition portion of the project on the property at 2701 Indian Mound Trail, subject to the recommendation of the Board of Architects for the wall recess. Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

Mr. Heisenbottle made a motion to defer the window project to the September meeting to provide sufficient time for the applicant to adjust the window configurations to more closely replicate the originals and meet the Secretary of Interior Standards. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

STANDARD CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (ST) 2010-66:

An application for the issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **656 Alhambra Circle**, a contributing structure within the "Alhambra Circle Coral Gables Historic District," legally described as Lot Lots 1 and 2, less the southeasterly 37 feet of Lot 2, Block 22, Coral Gables Section "B", according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 11, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida". The applicant requested design approval for the installation of flat roof tiles.

As photographs and drawings were displayed, Ms. Kautz reviewed the history of the property and the application, stating that original drawings showed white barrel tile on the roof. The current roof is true barrel, terracotta-colored tile. The Board of Architects requested the application be changed to flat white tile, rather than white S tile.

Mr. Valdes-Pages, representing the applicant, discussed the Board of Architects' review and his research to select tile.

During discussion about tile types, City Architect Carlos Mindreau described different types and styles and recommended that full barrel tile be installed on this house. A discussion ensued regarding cost differentiation between barrel tile types and flat roof tile.

Ms. Sotolongo, as homeowner for only two days, said the roof was leaking badly inside the house and a significant amount of other work had to be done, including window replacement. She indicated she would not object to a barrel tile but had to avoid the most expensive to enable her to do other necessary restorative work.

Ms. Bondurant made a motion to approve installation of white barrel tile on the roof of the residence at 656 Alhambra Circle. Ms. Tackett seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: Ms. Thomson.

OLD BUSINESS:

1044 Coral Way: Ms. Kautz reported that the appeal was deferred to the August 24, 2010 meeting of the City Commission. Ms. Bondurant was selected as Board spokesperson. If she is unable to attend, Ms. MacIntyre will so serve.

113 Grand Avenue: Ms. Kautz reported that, after discussion with the Zoning Department and the applicant, it was agreed that variances would not be necessary if two additional trees were added to the site, which will be done. The applicant will return to the Board when the wall design issue comes forward.

Douglas Entrance: Ms. Kautz reported that the applicant is undergoing permitting. Staff was satisfied with the upper window replacement, but not the ground level portion which will be done at a later date. She visited the site, and no installation progress has been made.

Historic Preservation Board Association Seminar: Ms. MacIntyre attended the day-long seminar and described it as very helpful in terms of board service issues and problem resolution. She will provide her comments and notes.

Districts: Ms. Kautz thanked the Board for directing staff to include more later-built homes and districts in support of staff's recommendations.

NEW BUSINESS:

Historical Resources Department: The department will relocate its offices to 2327 Salzedo Street during August.

Merrick House Gala: A Save the Date card for the November 12, 2010 gala to celebrate the House's 100th anniversary will be mailed to Board members.

Roof Tile Issues: Ms. Rolando recommended receiving additional guidelines regarding roof tiles to more knowledgeably respond to roof installation challenges. Ms. Tackett volunteered to furnish the Miami Beach ordinance, and Mr. Torre agreed to research and prepare materials to display various roof tile styles and costs. It was agreed that it would also be helpful to have photographs of different style homes with the various types of roof applications. Ms. Bondurant suggested using a computer program that displayed one house with different roof applications.

Historic District Updates: Ms. Thomson suggested a historic district update ordinance. It was agreed that a work plan for staff to follow might be more effective than an ordinance.

August Board Meeting: None scheduled at this time.

ADJOURNMENT: 5:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz
Historic Preservation Officer