| 1  | CITY OF CORAL GABLES BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT MEETING  |
|----|---|
| 2  | VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT  CORAL GABLES CITY HALL   |
| 3  | 405 BILTMORE WAY, COMMISSION CHAMBERS   |
| 4  | CORAL GABLES, FLORIDA MONDAY, JUNE 2, 2014, COMMENCING AT 8:00 A.M.                             |
| 5  |   |
| 6  | Board Members Present:  |
| 7  | Jorge E. Otero, Chairperson Susan Fuhrman Alex Galvez   |
| 8  | Gustave Perez   |
| 9  | Michael Sotelo<br>John M. Thomson   |
| 10 | City Staff Present:   |
| 11 | Elizabeth Gonzalez, Zoning Tech Lead<br>Charles Wu, Assistant Development Services Director     |
| 12 | Ramon Trias, Planning & Zoning Director Yaneris Figueroa, Assistant City Attorney               |
| 13 | Irela Ferrer, Zoning Technician   |
| 14 | Case No. BA-14-04-2381<br>900 Hardee Road   |
| 15 | CORAL GABLES RIVIERA SEC 12, PB/PG 28-35,   |
| 16 | LOTS 7 & 8 & 9, BLK 254  Henry L. Pujol III & Doris M. Zulueta - Applicants                     |
| 17 | Henry L. Pujol III & Doris M. Zulueta - Owners<br>Teresita Vazquez/Arkitere Omslaer - Architect |
| 18 | Public Speakers: Henry L. Pujol, III, and Doris M. Zulueta                                      |
| 19 | 7   |
| 20 | Case No. BA-14-04-2600 8203 Los Pinos Circle  |
| 21 | COCOPLUM SECTION 1, PB/PG 99/39, LOT: 26, BLK: 9  Bunnell Foundation, Inc Applicant             |
| 22 | Jeff C. & Stephanie Settembrino - Owners<br>Denis K. Solano, P.E Engineer                       |
| 23 | Public Speaker: Richard Bunnell   |
| 24 |   |
| 25 |   |
|    |   |



1.5

1.7

## THEREUPON:

The following proceedings were had:

CHAIRMAN OTERO: Good morning. Welcome to the regularly scheduled meeting of the City of Coral Gables Board of Adjustment. We are appointed members of the Board and are charged to provide relief from hardships in the application of the Code regulations.

The Board is comprised of seven members.

Four members shall constitute a quorum and the affirmative vote of four members of the Board present shall be necessary to authorize a variance. As you can see, today we have six members. A tie vote shall result in the automatic continuance of the matter to the next meeting, which shall be continued until a majority vote is achieved.

Any person who acts as a lobbyist, pursuant to the City of Coral Gables Ordinance Number 2006-11, must register with the City Clerk prior to engaging in lobbying activities or presentations before City Staff, Boards, Committees and/or the City Commission. A copy of the ordinance is available in the Office of the City Clerk. Failure to register and

provide proof of registration shall prohibit your ability to present to the Historic Preservation Board on applications under consideration this morning.

1.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1,2

13

14

1.5

16

17

1.8

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Lobbyist is defined -- and that applies also to the Board of Adjustment. Lobbyist is defined as "an individual, corporation, partnership, or other legal entity employed or retained, whether paid or not, by a principal who seeks to encourage the approval, disapproval, adoption, repeal, passage, defeat or modifications of (a) any ordinance, resolution, action or decision of any City Commissioner; (b) any action, decision, recommendation of the City Manager, any City board or committee, including but not limited to Quasi-Judicial, Advisory Board, Trust, Authority, or Council; or any action, decision or recommendation of City personnel during the time period of the entire decision-making process on the action, decision or recommendation which foreseeably will be heard or reviewed by the City Commission, or a City board or committee, including but not limited to Quasi-Judicial, Advisory Board, Trust,

| 1   | Authority or Council."                      |
|-----|---|
| 2.  | I now officially call the City of Coral     |
| 3   | Gables Board of Adjustment Board meeting of |
| 4   | June 2nd to order. The time is 8:02 a.m.    |
| 5   | Liz, could you call the roll, please?       |
| 6   | MS. GONZALEZ: Yes. Good morning.            |
| 7   | Mr. Hidalgo has notified us that he will    |
| 8   | not be attending today. He's out of the     |
| 9   | country.                                    |
| 1.0 | Ms. Fuhrman?                                |
| 11  | MS. FUHRMAN: Here.                          |
| 12  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Galvez?                   |
| 13  | MR. GALVEZ: Here.                           |
| 14  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Perez?                    |
| 15  | MR. PEREZ: Here.                            |
| 16  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Thomson?                  |
| 17  | MR. THOMSON: Here.                          |
| 18  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Sotelo?                   |
| 19  | MR. SOTELO: Here.                           |
| 20  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr, Otero?                    |
| 21  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Here.                       |
| 22  | MS. GONZALEZ: You will need a motion to     |
| 23  | approve his absence.                        |
| 24  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: So moved.                   |
| 25  | MR. SOTELO: Second.                         |
|     |   |

All those in favor? CHAIRMAN OTERO: 1 (Thereupon, all members voted aye.) 2 3 CHAIRMAN OTERO: All opposed? (No response) 4 MS. GONZALEZ: I'm sorry, who seconded? 5 MR. SOTELO: I did. 7 CHAIRMAN OTERO: One more housekeeping item, Notice Regarding Ex-Parte Communications. 8 Please be advised that this Board is a quasi-9 10 judicial Board and the items on the agenda are quasi-judicial in nature, which requires Board 11 members to disclose all ex-parte communications 1.2 and site visits. An ex-parte communication is 1.3 defined as any contact, communication, 14 conversation, correspondence, memorandum or 15 other written or verbal communication that 16 takes place outside a public hearing between a 17 member of the public and a member of a 18 quasi-judicial board, regarding matters to be 19 20 heard by the board. If anyone made any contact with a Board 21. member regarding an issue before the Board, the 22 Board member must state on the record the 23 24 existence of the ex-parte communication and the

party who originated the communication.

25

if a Board member conducted a site visit specifically related to the case before the Board, the Board member must also disclose such visit. In either case, the Board member must state on the record whether the ex-parte communication and/or site visit will affect the Board member's ability to impartially consider the evidence to be presented regarding this matter. The Board member should also state that his or her decision will be based on substantial, competent evidence and testimony presented on the record today.

1.1

Does any member of the Board have such a communication and/or site visit to disclose at this time?

Let the record show no Board member spoke up.

Everyone who speaks this morning must complete the roster on the podium, which is right in front of me. We ask that you print clearly so the official records of your name and address will be correct.

Now, with the exception of attorneys, all persons who will speak on agenda items before us, please rise to be sworn in.

(Thereupon, all who were to speak were duly sworn by the court reporter.)

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

1.0

1.1

12

13

14

1.5

16

17

1.8

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRMAN OTERO: In deference to those present, we ask that all cell phones, pagers, if anyone has such a thing as a pager, and other electrical devices be turned off at this time.

Now we will proceed with the agenda.

Liz, could you read the first case, please?

MS. GONZALEZ: Good morning. The first case on the agenda is 900 Hardee Road. variance request to install a swimming pool located between the street and the main residential building. The Zoning Code stipulates that any accessory structure, such as a pool, may not be located in the area between the street and the main residential This is a very irregularly shaped building. It is unusual and uncommon. It's property. bordered by three streets. Specifically, a street at the rear of the property limits the available area to build a swimming pool and comply with the Zoning Code's requirements. The swimming pool conforms to all applicable setbacks and lot coverages. In addition, a

four-foot high aluminum rail -- wall with an aluminum rail is installed to screen the swimming pool from street view.

1.7

As you can see here on the screen, this is Hardee Road. This is the side street and this is the rear street. This is an aerial view.

Again, here is the rear of the property, which is Aduana. This is the side street, which is Castaneda, and this is Hardee Road in the front. The pool is being proposed at the rear of the home, which is typical to most residences. It meets the setbacks and all applicable lot coverages.

CHAIRMAN OTERO: Thank you -- oh, sorry.

MS. GONZALEZ: It has received Board of
Architects approval. It has approved -- All of
the trades have approved it, electrical,
structural, plumbing, Public Works and
Building. It meets all of the seven standards
required to approve a variance. And due to the
unusual lot boundaries and the existing
configuration of the residence, Staff
recommends approval of the applicant's request.

CHAIRMAN OTERO: Does anyone in the audience wish to speak in favor of this

1 application? Should we write in our names MR. PUJOL: 2 here? 3 CHAIRMAN OTERO: Please write your name and 4 address and state your name for the record. 5 MR. PUJOL: My name is Henry Pujol. 6 Currently my wife and I are the owners of the 7 property in question at this time. 8 Speak into the mike. MR. WU: 9 MR. PUJOL: Sure, thanks. 10 My name is Henry Pujol, the owner, along 11 with my wife, Doris. As just was mentioned, 12 what we're asking for is a variance, and I want 1.3 to thank the group for listening to the 14 request. Because of the irregular shape of the 15 lot, that's basically why we're asking for the 16 variance at this time. 17 As was mentioned, we meet all the other 18 requirements for the pool, and we will be 19 building a privacy wall along the property. 20 We're here to answer any other questions or 21 commentary. 22 CHAIRMAN OTERO: Does anyone on the Board 23 have any questions or comments from Staff or 24

25

the applicant?

Is there anyone in the audience that wishes 1 to speak in favor of this case or in opposition 2 to this case? 3 Let the record show that no one is speaking 4 in favor of or in opposition to. 5 MR. GALVEZ: I'd like to make a motion. 6 move that the Board of Adjustment Grant 7 Application BA-14-04-2381, a request by the 8 owners as applicants, for a variance to the 9 existing residence at 900 Hardee Road to allow 10 the proposed pool to be constructed between the 11 street and the main residential building. 1.2 motion is based upon the testimony presented 13 along with the application submitted and the 14 Staff report, which constitute competent, 15 substantial evidence. The Board hereby makes 16 findings of fact that the each of the standards 17 in Section 3-806 of the Zoning Code has been 18 met. 19 A motion is on the table. CHAIRMAN OTERO: 20 21 Is there a second? MR. PEREZ: I second that. 22 CHAIRMAN OTERO: Any discussion on the 23 24 motion? Roll call, please, on the motion. 25

| 1.  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Thomson?                  |
|-----|---|
| 2   | MR. THOMSON: Yes.                           |
| 3   | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Galvez?                   |
| 4   | MR. GALVEZ: Yes.                            |
| 5   | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Perez?                    |
| 6   | MR. PEREZ: Yes.                             |
| 7   | MS. GONZALEZ: Ms. Fuhrman?                  |
| 8   | MS. FUHRMAN: Yes.                           |
| 9   | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Sotelo?                   |
| 10  | MR. SOTELO: Yes.                            |
| 11  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Otero?                    |
| 12  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Yes.                        |
| 13  | MS. GONZALEZ: Thank you.                    |
| 14  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Thank you very much. A      |
| 1.5 | very thorough application. Thank you.       |
| 16  | MR. PUJOL: Thank you.                       |
| 17  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Next case?                  |
| 1.8 | MS. GONZALEZ: I'm sorry, for the record, I  |
| 19  | wanted to add that I did leave letters of   |
| 20  | support                                     |
| 21  | MR. SOTELO: Yes.                            |
| 22  | MS. GONZALEZ: from the affected             |
| 23  | neighbors that came in on Friday, late      |
| 24  | afternoon. I wasn't able to place it in the |
| 25  | packet. So I'd advise as to the letters of  |
|     |   |

| 1   | support from the affected neighbors.            |
|-----|---|
| 2   | MR. SOTELO: That was noted, thank you.          |
| 3   | MR. PUJOL: Thank you.                           |
| 4   | MS. ZULUETA: Thank you.                         |
| 5   | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Liz, since you're in            |
| 6   | charge of the gizmo, could you read the next    |
| 7   | case?   |
| 8   | MS. GONZALEZ: Yes, sir.                         |
| 9   | MR. PEREZ: She sure is.                         |
| 10  | MS. GONZALEZ: All right. The next case is       |
| 1.1 | a variance request for 8203 Los Pinos Circle.   |
| 12  | It is a variance request to install a wood      |
| 13  | dock, to extend outward from the bank 41 feet,  |
| 14  | versus five feet as allowed by the Zoning Code. |
| 15  | The applicant is proposing to construct an      |
| 16  | L-shaped dock consisting a four feet in width   |
| 17  | by 36 feet in length access walkway and a five  |
| 1.8 | feet in width by 56 feet 8 inch in length       |
| 19  | terminal platform.                              |
| 20  | This is an aerial view of the property.         |
| 21  | This is the Waterway. And if you see, this is   |
| 22  | the lot. It's not vacant. There is a home       |
| 23  | that was just constructed.                      |
| 24  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Which one is the lot in         |
| 25  | question?                                       |
|     |   |

MS. GONZALEZ: Right here.

1.

1.0

1.6

CHAIRMAN OTERO: That one?

MS. GONZALEZ: It's this lot right here.

You can see it's a very -- It happens to be on
a very wide inlet, it's just -- That's also
unusual. The proposed design was necessary due
to the presence of resources between the bank
and a waterward distance of 41 feet.

As included in your packet, DERM recommends this configuration due to the existence of red and white mangroves that need to be protected. There is -- The ample waterway here also accommodates the extension of the dock of 41 feet and allows for the 75 feet of remaining navigable waterway that is required by the Zoning Code.

This is the actual property site. Again, there is a new residence that was built on the home (sic) and here is the proposed dock with the terminal platform. Again, here we have the walkway of four feet, and the terminal platform at 56 feet 8 inches. As you can see here by the illustration, this area here is detailing the mangroves, also, here. There happens to be a separation and this was the best area that

| 1   | DERM recommended.                               |
|-----|---|
| 2   | It has received DERM approval. DERM             |
| 3   | requires this configuration in order to         |
| 4   | minimize the impact and meet the required Code  |
| 5   | depth. It has received Board of Architects      |
| 6   | approval. It has received Marine Patrol and     |
| 7   | Public Works have no objection to this design.  |
| 8   | It meets all of the seven standards required to |
| 9   | obtain a variance. Staff recommends approval    |
| 1.0 | in recommendation supporting DERM's             |
| 11  | recommendation and also in order to avoid any   |
| 12  | impact to the existing resources.               |
| 13  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Liz, could you put up the       |
| 14  | one of the where the property is located and    |
| 15  | where the canals are, where the canal is?       |
| 16  | MS. GONZALEZ: The aerial view? That one?        |
| 17  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Uh-huh.                         |
| 18  | So, as far as I understand it, there are        |
| 19  | two issues. One is the mangroves                |
| 20  | MS. GONZALEZ: Right here.                       |
| 21  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: or the 40-foot distance         |
| 22  | that must be exceeded, but the second is the    |
| 23  | width of the waterway.                          |
| 24  | MS. GONZALEZ: There is This happens to          |
| 25  | be a very large area.                           |
|     |   |

If the same issue was 1 CHAIRMAN OTERO: presented two houses to my left, to the left --MS. GONZALEZ: This way? 3 MR. SOTELO: Uh-huh. 4 CHAIRMAN OTERO: Yes. Then that would not 5 meet the waterway requirement, more than 6 likely, without knowing the numbers? 7 8 MS. GONZALEZ: It depends. It's not an exact science. All the waterways differ. 9 would take that into consideration. 10 1.1 this case --CHAIRMAN OTERO: One unique factor is the 12 fact that it is very wide at this point. 13 That is correct, and it just MS. GONZALEZ: 14 so happens -- You can't see it on this aerial 15 view, but the properties abutting do not have 16 the existing mangrove vegetation that this 17 So every lot is unusual and property has. 18 unique in itself. You can have one property 19 with resources and mangroves and you can have 20 the adjacent property without. 21 22 CHAIRMAN OTERO: Thank you. Any questions of Staff from the Board? 23 MS. FUHRMAN: There were no objections from 24 25 any of the other neighbors?

| 1   | MS. GONZALEZ: We did not receive any            |
|-----|---|
| 2   | objections. I did speak to a couple of          |
| 3   | neighbors and I didn't receive any written or   |
| 4   | verbal objections, no.                          |
| 5   | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Would this preclude any         |
| 6   | other neighbor from building a similar size     |
| 7   | a dock extending from their property?           |
| 8   | MS. GONZALEZ: Each case is based on its         |
| 9   | own merits, and again, there's a combination of |
| 10  | factors: DERM's requirement, water depth, and   |
| 11  | resources. Again, we have to abide by the       |
| 12  | Code; however, when there are unusual           |
| 1.3 | circumstances or factors like this, that cannot |
| 1.4 | be met, then this is an unusual circumstance    |
| 15  | and so therefore the variance is Staff          |
| 16  | recommends approval of the variance.            |
| 17  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Thank you.                      |
| 18  | Will the applicant step up, if you wish to      |
| 19  | present?  |
| 20  | MR. BUNNELL: Yes, thank you.                    |
| 21  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Good morning.                   |
| 22  | MR. BUNNELL: Good morning.                      |
| 23  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Would you state your name       |
| 24  | and address for the record?                     |
| 25  | MR. BUNNELL: My name is Richard Bunnell,        |
|     |   |

Bunnell Foundation, Marine Contractors. 1 Μy address is 1320 Northwest 18th Avenue in Miami. CHAIRMAN OTERO: And you represent the 3 owner? 4 5 MR. BUNNELL: Yes. I'm just going to go ahead and fill this out. 6 CHAIRMAN OTERO: Please. MR. BUNNELL: Yes, thank you, ladies and 8 9 gentlemen. As I said, my name is Richard Bunnell, Bunnell Foundation, the contractor of 1.0 the dock. As the City indicated, the 1.1 requirements for the variance was imposed upon 12 us by -- on the owner by Dade County DERM, for 13 avoiding mangroves and other resources and also 14 water depth conditions for the placement of the 15 vessels. 16 As indicated, on Page 2 of the Staff 1.7 report, your question about the distance across 18 19 the waterway, it indicates 300 feet in that area, in particular. All of the other 20 requirements of the variance have been met, and 21 again, if you have any questions, I'll be happy 22 to answer them. 23 CHAIRMAN OTERO: Thank you. One question I 24 have is, it could not have been any closer in, 25

41 feet was the minimum, because of the right? 1. 2 mangroves? MR. BUNNELL: DERM imposed that, yes. Yes. 3 They would not allow the mangroves to be 4 trimmed any further to avoid that, plus the 5 water depth was also an issue. 6 Thank you. 7 CHAIRMAN OTERO: Any Board members, questions, comments from 8 either applicant or Staff? 9 10 Thank you. Is there anyone present who wishes to speak 11 in favor of or in opposition to this case? 12 Let the record note, no one spoke up. 1.3 The public hearing is now closed. 14 have a motion to approve or a motion to defer? 15 MS. FUHRMAN: I'll read the motion. 16 make the motion. I move that the Board of 17 Adjustment grant Application BA-14-04-2600, a 1.8 request by Bunnell Foundation, Inc., on behalf 19 of owners Jeff C. and Stephanie Settembrino, 20 for a variance for the existing residence at 21 8203 Los Pinos Circle to allow the proposed 22 dock to be constructed and extend outward from 23 the bank, 41 feet. The motion is based upon 24 the testimony presented along with the 25

| 1   | application submitted and Staff report, which |
|-----|---|
| 2   | constitute competent, substantial evidence.   |
| 3   | The Board hereby makes findings of fact that  |
| 4   | each of the standards in Section 3-806 of the |
| 5   | Zoning Code has been met.                     |
| 6   | MR. THOMSON: Second.                          |
| 7   | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Any discussion on the         |
| 8   | motion made and seconded?                     |
| 9   | Roll call, please.                            |
| 1.0 | MS. GONZALEZ: Ms. Fuhrman?                    |
| 11  | MS. FUHRMAN: Yes.                             |
| 12  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Thomson?                    |
| 13  | MR. THOMSON: Yes.                             |
| 14  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Galvez?                     |
| 15  | MR. GALVEZ: Yes.                              |
| 16  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Sotelo?                     |
| 17  | MR. SOTELO: Yes.                              |
| 18  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Perez?                      |
| 19  | MR. PEREZ: Yes.                               |
| 20  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Otero?                      |
| 21  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Yes.                          |
| 22  | MS. GONZALEZ: Mr. Bunnell, did you sign       |
| 23  | in?   |
| 24  | MR. BUNNELL: Yes, I did.                      |
| 25  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Yes, he did.                  |
|     |   |

| 1   | MS. GONZALEZ: Thank you.                      |
|-----|---|
| 2   | CHAIRMAN OTERO: The motion passes             |
| 3   | unanimously.                                  |
| 4   | MR. BUNNELL: Thank you very much.             |
| 5   | CHAIRMAN OTERO: Thank you.                    |
| 6   | If there are no further items on the          |
| 7   | agenda, if there's no more business Oh,       |
| 8   | there is one more item on the agenda. Liz?    |
| 9   | MS. GONZALEZ: A friendly reminder, we have    |
| 10  | a recess in July, as you all voted upon last  |
| 11. | year for the schedule of Board of Adjustment  |
| 12  | meetings this year. So we will not be meeting |
| 13  | in July. Our next meeting is on August the    |
| 14  | 4th. Of course, if the applicants are ready   |
| 15  | and the packets are complete, then we will    |
| 16  | proceed with presentation.                    |
| 17  | Have a wonderful Fourth of July holiday.      |
| 18  | MR. PEREZ: Thank you.                         |
| 19  | MR. SOTELO: Thank you.                        |
| 20  | CHAIRMAN OTERO: The meeting is now            |
| 21  | adjourned. Thank you all very much.           |
| 22  | (Thereupon, the meeting was adjourned at      |
| 23  | 8:21 a.m.)                                    |
| 24  | *   |
| 25  |   |
|     |   |

| 1   | CERTIFICATE  |
|-----|--|
| 2   |  |
| 3   | STATE OF FLORIDA:  |
| 4   | SS.  |
| 5   | COUNTY OF MIAMI-DADE:  |
| 6   |  |
| 7   | I, JOAN L. BAILEY, Registered Diplomate  |
| 8   | Reporter, Florida Professional Reporter, and a Notary  |
| 9   | Public for the State of Florida at Large, do hereby  |
| 10  | certify that I was authorized to and did   |
| 1.1 | stenographically report the foregoing proceedings and  |
| 12  | that the transcript is a true and complete record of my  |
| 13  | stenographic notes.  |
| 14  | I further certify that all public speakers were  |
| 15  | duly sworn by me.  |
| 16  |  |
| 17  | JOAN L. BAILEY MY COMMISSION & EE BOBJ 192 EXPINES: June 14, 2015 Readed (Au Netan Pelik: Universidate)  Or or L. Bailey  Bailey |
| 18  | EXPINES: June 14, 2015 Roaded (hu Notary Public Underwiders )  Or A. Natural  Oracle (hu Notary Public Underwiders )             |
| 19  | U  |
| 20  | JOAN L. BAILEY, RDR, FPR   |
| 21  |  |
| 22  | Notary Commission Number EE 083192.  |
| 23  | My Notary Commission expires 6/14/15.  |
| 24  |  |
| 25  |  |
|     |  |