



The City of Coral Gables

Historical Resources Department

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, February 20, 2014, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:

	M	A	M	J	J	A	S	O	N	D	J	F	APPOINTED BY:
Dorothy Thomson	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Mayor Jim Cason
Margaret Rolando	P	-	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Alejandro Silva	P	-	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	E	P	P	Comm. Patricia Keon
Venny Torre	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Frank C. Quesada
Tony Newell*		-				P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Vince Lago
Carmen Guerrero	P	-	E	E	P	P	P	P	E	E	E	P	Historic Preservation Board
Deborah Tackett^	P	-	P	E	P	P	P	^	^	^	^	^	City Manager
Dolly MacIntyre	P	-	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission
Judy Pruitt	P	-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission

A = Absent

P = Present

E = Excused

* = New Member

^ = Resigned Member

- = No Meeting

STAFF:

Dona Spain, Historic Preservation Officer
Kara N. Kautz Assistant Preservation Officer
Emily Ahouse, Historic Preservationist
Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant
Bridgette Thornton, Deputy City Attorney
William Miner, Building Director

GUESTS: Robert Novo, Kristopher D. Decasserd, Jorge Linares, Lourdes Neugart, Mario Garcia-Serra, Gerald Cherubin, Andrea Askowitz, Antonio Rodriguez, Albert Poza, Mariela Martinez, Robert Leen, Jose L. Sanchez

RECORDING AND PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:05 p.m. A quorum was present.

MINUTES: MEETING OF JANUARY 16, 2014:

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve the minutes of the meeting of January 16, 2014 as presented. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion, unanimously passed by voice vote.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact.

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Ms. Morgan administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATIONS:

CASE FILE LHD 2013-002 CONTINUED: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 235 Majorca Avenue, legally described as Lots 42 to 45 Inclusive, Block 7, Coral Gables Section "K," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 33 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

After distributing a letter from Daniel Perez-Zarraga, AIA of Perez & Perez Architects to Board members, Ms. Spain said the Development Services Director had additional questions for the applicant regarding the TDR amendment issue, so only the local historic designation would be considered by the Board at this meeting.

Mr. Garcia-Serra reviewed previous discussions and efforts related to the application (including the TDR amendment matter), with City staff and Board members contributing thoughts in an effort to reach agreement and move forward. Ms. Rolando observed that it would be mutually beneficial if the base of TDR donor sites were expanded; however, she said the onus should not be on one property owner to bear the expense to secure data necessary to determine if such expansion is feasible. Favor was generally expressed for limiting the geographic area of additional donor sites to multi-family properties in the North Ponce de Leon Boulevard area. Ms. Rolando then suggested adopting a resolution to recommend to the Planning and Zoning Board that the text of the Zoning Code's TDR ordinance be modified to expand the geographic area to include historic sites in the North Ponce area. Ms. Thomson expressed concern that sufficient information was not available to make such a recommendation and suggested the City conduct a study that would produce sufficient facts for the Board to consider the issue. Ms. Rolando suggested establishing a vehicle for incentivizing owners to own and maintain their historic properties, and favored a strong recommendation that the City develop a database to position itself to adopt an amendment to the Code to allow for an expansion of the donor sites for TDRs. Discussion continued. Ms. Spain suggested moving forward with the property's historic designation, separate from the TDR ordinance, and advised that it was possible for the applicant to appeal the designation, if desired, and also to put the appeal on hold while the TDR amendment issue moves forward.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to ask the Director of the Historical Resources Department to recommend to the Planning and Zoning Division that the Planning and Zoning Division develop a database, with the assistance of the Historical Resources Department, to determine the scope of properties that could be deemed historic and the amount of TDRs that could be transferred from those properties in the North Ponce de Leon Boulevard area* if the donor base for TDRs were expanded to include the North Ponce de Leon Boulevard area; and to ask the Planning and Zoning Division to develop proposed text for amending the Zoning Code to allow the transfer of TDRs from these donor sites in the expanded area to include multi-family properties in the North Ponce de Leon Boulevard area, and to bring the proposed amendment back to the Board within three months for its consideration of a recommendation to adopt the proposed amendment to the City Commission. (*The North Ponce de Leon Boulevard area referenced above is north of the Central Business District [Navarre Avenue] and east of LeJeune Road. The sending properties would be the multifamily properties in that location that are designated as historic.) Ms. MacIntyre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Newell, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre. Nays: Ms. Thomson.

Regarding the property's proposed historic designation, Mr. Garcia-Serra again objected, cited Architect Daniel Perez-Zarraga's letter and analysis of the property as not sufficiently significant to warrant designation.

Ms. Ahouse presented the property's history, displayed photographs and recapped its significance, concluding that staff recommended in favor of historic designation. Board discussion ensued, after which Mr. Torre invited audience input. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. Pruitt made a motion to approve local historic designation of the property located at 235 Majorca Avenue. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Rolando, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Silva, Mr. Torre. Nays: Mr. Newell.

Referencing the TDR issue, Ms. Thomson cited page 27 of a previous meeting transcript that referenced the City's hiring of outside counsel to analyze the issue. Ms. Spain said the attorney is still analyzing the issue, and said she would follow up.

CASE FILE LHD 2013-005: Consideration of the local historic designation of a local historic district entitled the "Coral Way Historic District." The district includes properties, plazas, the roadway, and the associated landscaping and lighting within the right-of-way on the north and south sides of Coral Way between Anderson Road and Alhambra Circle. A list of addresses and legal descriptions are on file in the Historic Preservation Office.

Ms. Ahouse reviewed the area of the proposed district and the numerous significant elements along Coral Way. She displayed photographs and maps and described the included properties. After stating that a letter protesting the designation was received by Peter and Greta Swart (2418 Country Club Prado), she said two meetings were held with property owners, and concluded that staff recommended in favor of historic designation.

Ms. Spain distributed and read for the record the letter from Peter and Greta Swart who, although not residing in the proposed district, strongly protested the proposed designation for properties abutting Coral Way, located between Anderson Avenue and Alhambra Circle.

Ms. Ahouse was complimented by Board members for the comprehensive and outstanding report she prepared. Ms. Torre invited audience comment. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve local historic designation of a local historic district entitled the "Coral Way Historic District." Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Newell, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2012-20 REVISED: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 6312 Riviera Drive, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lots 8 through 11 & Part of Undug W/W LYG ADJ. Thereto, Block 257, Coral Gables Section Riviera Section Part 11, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 28, Page 23, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for a revision to the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition of a garage structure.

Ms. Ahouse explained that the initial designation and COA application was heard by the Board in January 2013, adding that the homeowner, at this time, wished to revise the previously-approved COA. She displayed photographs and cited the three proposed revisions, describing how they differentiated from the original design. At the conclusion of her presentation, she stated staff's recommendation in favor of approval.

Mr. Rodriguez, project architect, answered Board questions and responded favorably to Mr. Torre's suggestion to more authentically recess the garage doors, perhaps to 12 inches, to cause the structure to appear more like a carriage house. Ms. Guerrero requested, for future cases with elements such as this garage design, to view a model or three-dimensional drawing of the proposed structure.

To Mr. Torre's invitation for audience comment, there was no response. He closed the public hearing.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to approve the design revisions to the previously-approved Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition of a garage structure. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Guerrero, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2013-022: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 135 Grand Avenue, a vacant parcel within the "MacFarlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District," legally

described as Lot 10, less portion lying in R/W, Block 1A, MacFarlane Homestead Subdivision, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 81 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the construction of a new commercial building.

Ms. Ahouse reviewed the vacant lot, site of the proposed new commercial building, as well as the adjacent properties. She stated staff's recommendation in favor of the proposal, stating it was compatible with the scale and character of the district.

Architect Jose Sanchez discussed the limitations of the project and elements of the design specified for safety purposes, after which he reviewed parking and materials. He responded to Board questions, after which Mr. Torre invited additional audience comment. Hearing no requests to provide further input, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. Guerrero made a motion to approve the design for the construction of a new commercial building at 135 Grand Avenue. Mr. Silva seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Silva, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

Mr. Torre introduced and welcomed William Miner, the new City Building Director.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2013-023: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 4220 Santa Maria Street, a contributing property within the "Santa Maria Street Historic District," legally described as Lot 17 & S 38 feet of Lot 16, Block 93, Coral Gables Country Club Section 5, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 23, Page 55 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for an addition and alterations to the residence.

Ms. Ahouse's presentation included location, property background, historic and current photographs, and the proposed addition and alteration. She concluded by stating staff's recommendation in favor of approving the design proposal for the construction of a one-story addition, pool, pool deck, barbecue counter, and a wall, replacement of the roof tile, windows, and shutters, and interior alterations to the building at 4220 Santa Maria Street, and to approve the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness.

Architect Jorge Linares reviewed the proposal in detail and responded to Board questions. Mr. Torre suggested and discussed with Mr. Linares adding brick facing to the barbecue wall to make it more compatible with the house, making it U-shaped and centering the barbecue on the central axis of the pool. Discussion continued.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the design subject to the application of brick veneer to the barbecue wall, aligning the barbecue structure with the central axis of the pool and to making the barbecue wall U-shaped. The motion was seconded by Mr. Silva.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Rolando, Mr. Silva, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2014-001: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 716 Alhambra Circle, a contributing property within the "Alhambra Circle Historic District," legally described as the East 20 feet of Lot 13 and all of Lots 14 & 15, Block 23, Coral Gables Section B, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 111 of the Public Record of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requested design approval for an addition and alterations to the residence.

Ms. Ahouse conducted a comprehensive presentation of the property, describing as she displayed photographs and drawings the elements and the application. She concluded by stating that staff recommended in favor of approval of the application.

Mr. Poza, project architect, reviewed the proposed addition and alterations, responding during the presentation to Board questions and suggestions. At the conclusion of his presentation, Mr. Torre invited additional audience input. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the design proposal for the two-story addition at 716 Alhambra Circle and to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Newell, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Guerrero, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

Window replacement for 508 Caligula Avenue, a contributing property within the "French Country Village Historic District," legally described as Lots 9 & 10, Block 124, Coral Gables Riviera Section 10, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 31, Page 1 of the Public Record of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Kautz relayed that the matter was brought to the Board for input regarding window issues she discovered during an inspection. She reviewed the property's 2010 Certificate of Appropriateness, displaying the architect's original proposal and submittal drawings with windows depicted as single-hung window types. The 2010 Board specified that the windows be casement. The drawings appeared to specify double casement windows. However, single casements were installed. All other windows on the house are existing aluminum awning windows. She asked the Board to determine whether or not the owner needs to change new windows to double casements, and introduced property owner Andrea Askowitz. After discussion, Board members consented to allow the owner to keep the new windows as installed.

Douglas Entrance Windows: Mr. Torre raised the issue of the windows on the Douglas Entrance building and asked if there was a protective covenant that specified the replacement of the windows. He suggested that staff, through Code Enforcement, pressure the owners to protect the windows.

Art in Public Places: Ms. Spain advised that staff will report the amount of the fund for historic preservation within the Art in Public Places fund.

City Hall: In response to Ms. Thomson's question about a survey of the condition of City Hall, Ms. Spain said the Public Works Department could advise.

MacFarlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District: Ms. Spain pointed out the district report submitted to Miami-Dade County. She said there is money available for these residences, mentioned how helpful Commissioners had been, and advised that the properties should eventually come before the Board for historic restoration. The importance of ongoing maintenance was discussed.

House on Lisbon: In response to Ms. Thomson's question about a Lisbon residence being demolished today, Ms. Spain relayed that it was not historically designated. An application to demolish the structure was submitted. Staff visited the property with Peter Iglesias. The property had been altered, was not historically significant or structurally sound, and it was allowed to be demolished.

Board Vacancy: Ms. Spain said the City Manager was seeking a candidate, who needs to be either a certified planner or a registered landscape architect.

Segovia Circle: Since this is a Public Works Department project, Ms. Spain said she was unaware of the current status.

NEW BUSINESS:

Miami Center for Architecture: Mr. Silva announced that the Center's opening exhibition will be held March 7th and encouraged attendance.

ADJOURNMENT: There being no further business to be considered, the meeting adjourned at 7:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Dona M. Spain
Historic Preservation Officer