

CITY OF CORAL GABLES

- MEMORANDUM -

TO: Mr. David Brown
City Manager

Date: April 30, 2008

FROM: Danny Benedit
Procurement Supervisor

Subject: Towing Recommendation

HISTORY

The City issued RFP 2008.03.13 for Towing Services on March 14, 2008. A mandatory pre-bid meeting was held on March 20th and twenty-six potential bidders attended.

A total of four addendums were issued in responses to the (Q)uestions & (A)nswers between March 27th and April 8th. Eight proposals were received (two no bid responses) by the deadline of April 10, 2008 from Finest Towing, Freeway Transportation, Sunshine Towing, Southwest Transport d/b/a Westbrook Transport, Haul-O-Way Towing and Downtown Towing. Apache Wrecker and Midtown Towing were no bids.

The Procurement Division consolidated the information and included it in the distribution of the proposals to the Selection Committee on April 14th. All six proposers were scheduled for presentations to the Selection Committee on April 17, 2008. Shortly thereafter, the Selection Committee completed their evaluation based on Equipment, Experience, Presentation, Pricing, References and Background.

The Selection Committee Members consisted of Assistant City Manager, Dona Lubin, Chief Hammerschmidt and Chief Reed. The following summarizes their ranking and recommendation:

<u>Rank by Committee</u>	<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Points</u>
1	Downtown Towing	98
2	Haul-O-Way Towing	91
3	Westbrook Transport	89
4	Sunshine Towing	82
5	Freeway Transportation	80
6	Finest Towing	75

In averaging the results Downtown Towing and Westbrook Transport scored the same in all the categories except Pricing. We noticed that the Selection Committee scored Downtown Towing 50% higher than Westbrook in "Pricing" even though Downtown Towing was significantly higher in the Private Tows. We speculate it could have occurred because Downtown Towing is not charging the City on police tows in the Class "A" category (the majority of tows are Class "A"). However, their costs on the Private tows would be an estimated \$215,370. Whereas, Westbrook charged the same in City and Private tows \$210,584. This is according to data provided by the CGPD stating there were 2,393 unclassified tows this past year. In comparison, Haul-O-Way was the lowest in pricing overall and yet came in second place.

This issue was presented to Don Nelson, Finance Director and after careful consideration he instructed me to proceed to the City Manager for the next course of action. Please note that during our meeting with Mr. Nelson and Mr. Brown no vendor ranking or pricing was discussed. The Procurement Code was discussed and according to section 2-421 "Competitive Sealed Proposals", regulation R2-421.12.4 "Best and Final Offers"; the City Manager gave me the authorization to commence negotiations with the top three ranked vendors; Downtown Towing, Haul-O-Way, and Westbrook. A meeting was set for April 21st requesting a "Best and Final Offer" (BAFO) based on the imbalance of the pricing submitted by proposers. The opening of the BAFO was scheduled for April 23rd and all three vendors submitted their Best and Final Offer which included pricing for Tire Repairs not previously requested.

In conclusion, Procurement analyzed the Best and Final Offer received by the three (3) vendors and concurs with the recommendations of the Selection Committee. We were able to obtain all future Tire Repairs at no cost to the City, previously paid \$55.00 at an average of 60 repairs per year which is a total savings of \$3,300.00. Furthermore there was a significant decrease in pricing on all categories and classes for both Police and Private towing rates. Procurement found Downtown Towing to be the most responsive responsible vendor for this RFP.

It is my recommendation to the City Manager to present to the commission Downtown Towing as the selected vendor.

ATTACHED DOCUMENTS:

1. Original Pricing (all 6 vendors)
2. Selection Committee Evaluation
3. Best and Final Offer Pricing (all 3 vendors)