

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

April 17, 2008, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:

M J J A S O N D J F M A

Dorothy Thomson*			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
Catherine Stewart	E	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	E	E	P	E
Ernesto Santos	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
Gonzalo Sanabria											P	E
Dolly MacIntyre*		P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P
Michael Beeman	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P
Joyce Meyers	P	P	E	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P
Lisa Bennett	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E
Shirley Maroon	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P

APPOINTED BY:

Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Comm. Maria Anderson
Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
Historic Preservation Board
City Manager David Brown
City Commission
City Commission

STAFF:

Kara N. Kautz, Historic Preservation Officer
Betty Perez, Historical Resources Department
Simone Chin, Historical Preservation Administrator

A = Absent

P = Present

E = Excused

*** = New Member**

^ = Resigned Member

GUESTS: Christine Quencer, Elia Perez-Aryan,

RECORDING SECRETARY: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Vice Chair Michael Beeman at 4:09 p.m. A quorum was present.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Beeman read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. He then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

MINUTES: MEETING OF MARCH 20, 2008:

Mr. Santos requested that text regarding Case No. LHD 2007-14 better reflect his participation in the discussion and the advice given to the applicant regarding her father's property.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to approve the minutes of the meeting of March 20, 2008 with Mr. Santos' corrections. Mr. Santos seconded the motion, unanimously passed.

DEFERRALS:

Ms. Kautz reported deferral to the May meeting of Case File LHD 2007-09.

SWEARING IN THE PUBLIC:

Nancy Morgan swore in members of the audience who planned to testify during the meeting.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Ms. Meyers requested clarification of the City's policy pertaining to City board/committee meeting excused absences. Ms. Kautz said excused absences were appropriate for jury duty, illness and/or travel outside the local area. She said the Board could also excuse absences not included in these categories provided they were of similar importance. It was reported that Ms. Bennett had a medical appointment, Mr. Sanabria was out of town on business and Ms. Stewart had a parent/teacher conference.

Ms. Maroon made a motion to excuse the absence of Ms. Bennett. Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Meyers, Mr. Santos, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to excuse the absence of Mr. Sanabria. Ms. Maroon seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

Board comments regarding absences included the following: Board absence records should be periodically reviewed as less than a full board could create a hardship and impacts applicants; Ms. Stewart has missed 50% of the Board meetings over the past year; perhaps a parent/teacher conference could be scheduled to avoid meeting conflict; City policy states that three unexcused absences are permitted in a one-year period; the Board should adopt a policy that a member's absence will be unexcused if not for one of the City's permitted reasons.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to excuse the absence of Ms. Stewart, and to alert all Board members that only the above-stated approved reasons for excused absences will apply henceforth. Ms. MacIntyre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Santos, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

At the Board's request, Ms. Kautz will issue a memorandum stating that the Board is troubled by continued absences, and reminding everyone of the importance of full meeting participation.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATION:

CASE FILE LHD 2008-03 Consideration of the amendment of the local historic district designation of the "Santa Maria Street Historic District" to include the property at 4017 Santa Maria Street' legally described as Lot 3, less the North 25 feet and Lot 4, less the South 25 feet, Block 96, Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Five, according to the Plat thereof, as recoded in Plat Book 23, at Page 55, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida, as a contributing property.

Ms. Kautz advised that the purpose of the amendment to the Santa Maria Street Historic District designation was to include 4017 Santa Maria Street as a contributing property. The district was designated November 15, 2007, at which time the subject property was not included as a contributing structure. It was believed that substantial alterations were made to the house, including a second story addition. This information was in error and staff learned that very few alterations had been made to the property. As a result the house fits within the historic significance of the district and could contribute to the district. Ms. Kautz then reviewed the architecture, history of the house and original architect as a PowerPoint presentation was conducted.

Homeowner Christine Quencer briefly addressed the Board and confirmed that the second story addition was always on the house. Original plans confirm the statement.

Mr. Beeman invited other members of the audience to speak. However, with no requests to do so, the public hearing portion of the application was closed and Board comments were invited.

Ms. Meyers said she would classify the architectural style of the house as ranch rather than minimal traditional. She reviewed the design elements of each style, and recommended that information contained in the national register be referenced for criteria. She also pointed out that the changed windows on the house were a historically inappropriate style, and any future changes should more closely replicate the original window design. Discussion ensued about the original window style, and Mr. Santos recommended that national register information be included in Board packets whenever such evaluations were presented to the Board.

Ms. Meyers made a motion to approve the amendment to the Santa Maria Street Historic District to include 4017 Santa Maria Street as a contributing property within the District, with the change of style to ranch. Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Santos, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

CASE FILE LHD 2008-02 Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 1237 Ferdinand Street, legally described as Lot 19, Block 65, Coral Gables Granada Section, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 113, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Chin's PowerPoint presentation featured current and historic photographs and drawings as she described the history, architecture and additions. She concluded by stating that staff recommended approval of the application, and noted that homeowner Elia Perez-Aryan was present.

Ms. Perez-Aryan briefly addressed the Board, after which the public hearing was closed as no one else requested to speak. Mr. Santos confirmed the size of the house and lot.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to approve the application as presented. Ms. MacIntyre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Meyers, Ms. Maroon, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

BOARD ITEMS/CITY COMMISSION UPDATE:

Florida Trust Conference: Ms. Kautz reminded Board members about the mid-May conference in Pensacola. She suggested the Board designate Ms. MacIntyre as official conference delegate.

Ms. Maroon made a motion to designate Ms. MacIntyre as the Board's delegate to the Florida Trust Conference. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Meyers, Ms. Maroon, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None. Abstaining from vote: Ms. MacIntyre.

OLD BUSINESS:

Board Workshop: Ms. Kautz reported that staff is working to schedule a Board orientation and economic hardship workshop with the Miami-Dade County Attorney.

William Kerdyk, Sr.'s House: Ms. Kautz reported that Ms. Bolton withdrew her historic designation application for Mr. Kerdyk's home, and said the Kerdyk family was reviewing other alternatives.

Country Club Prado Lot: The City Attorney's opinion regarding the property will be brought to the Board at the next meeting.

1700 Cortez Street: The Board's designation of 1700 Cortez Street was appealed to the City Commission and is still pending.

Young Park: Ms. Thomson requested an update at the next meeting on the status of the park's plaque.

NEW BUSINESS:

737 Alhambra Circle: Ms. Kautz reported the work on the house is nearing completion. The house is currently historically designated and listed in the district report as non-contributing. Mr. Beeman inquired about removing the designation. Ms. Kautz reviewed the de-designation procedures.

Ms. Meyers made a motion for staff to begin the process of de-designation of the property at 737 Alhambra Circle. Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

During discussion, Ms. Chin reviewed the property's recent work history, after which Ms. MacIntyre recommended that the Building and Zoning Department report to the Historical Resources Department homes that have problems such as 737 Alhambra Circle. Ms. Kautz explained that the process for de-designation would include a complete report.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Mr. Santos, Ms. Meyers, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None. Ms. Maroon was out of the room during Roll Call.

Ms. Meyers raised the issue of de-designating a house within a designated district and asked if the motion passed regarding the Santa Maria property would be reflected as an amendment to the district report or just the designation of the individual house. As a result of the review of the original motion regarding 4017 Santa Maria Street, the motion was clarified as followed:

Ms. Meyers made a motion to clarify the original motion regarding 4017 Santa Maria Street to stipulate that the Board's vote was to amend the historic district designation report to include this designated property as contributing within the district, with the change of style to ranch. Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Santos, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Beeman. Nays: None.

University of Miami Buildings: Ms. Thomson raised the issue of three wooden buildings on the campus, about which she learned that the City opposed their demolition. Ms. Kautz advised that the buildings were the wooden art buildings and were listed on the UMCAD to be demolished. However, Ms. Kautz noted her objection to their removal to the University and the Planning and Zoning Board, and requested they follow procedures for any proposed removal of structures. She said it is possible that the buildings will be deemed historically significant and brought before the Board for review.

ADJOURNMENT:

Hearing no objections, the meeting adjourned at 5:17 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz
Historic Preservation Officer