



The City of Coral Gables

Historical Resources Department

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, June 18, 2015, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

Table with columns for MEMBERS, J A S O N D J F M A M J, and APPOINTED BY. Lists names like Dorothy Thomson, Venny Torre, Margaret Rolando, etc., and their attendance status (P, E, A) for each month.

LEGEND: A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; * = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member; - = No Meeting

STAFF:

- Dona Spain, Historic Preservation Officer
Kara N. Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant, Historical Resources Department
Craig Leen, City Attorney
Miriam S. Ramos, Deputy City Attorney

GUESTS: Zeke Guilford, Mario R. Tur, Rina and Pedro Alfonso, Joe Greenberg, Stephen R. Chepenik, Jim Siegel, Rafael Portuondo, Olga Ramundo, Chris Lee Reyes, Steven Steckler, Elizabeth Guin

RECORDING AND PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:06 p.m. A quorum was present.

MINUTES: MEETING OF MAY 21, 2015:

A motion to approve the minutes of the May 21, 2015 meeting was made by Ms. Thomson, seconded by Ms. Rolando and unanimously approved by voice vote.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex-parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

A motion was made by Ms. MacIntyre to excuse the absence of Mr. Silva. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion, which was unanimously approved.

DEFERRALS: None

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan, Notary Public, administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

REQUEST BY TEMPLE JUDEA TO WAIVE ART IN PUBLIC PLACES FEE:

Ms. Spain explained that the Board needed to determine if it would recommend the waiver to the City Commission.

Mr. Parsley recused himself as he is the landscape architect for the project.

Continuing, Ms. Spain stated staff's recommendation of Board approval of its recommendation to the City Commission to approve the waiver of the Art in Public Places fee according to Section 3-2103 (B)(3) - Waiver of the Art in Public Places Fee. Ms. Spain read the pertinent section of code.

Attorney Zeke Guilford, representing Temple Judea, addressed the Board, introduced Temple Judea's representatives, Mr. Siegel and Mr. Greenberg, and requested fee waiver pursuant to Article 3, Section 3-2103 (B)(3). After initial remarks, Mr. Guilford stated Temple Judea's reasons for requesting the fee waiver:

- Temple Judea is a non-profit organization;
- The congregation raised the money for the addition, and to add to its burden to raise the fee would be a hardship;
- Public art already in place is throughout the property;
- The building designed by Morris Lapidus is a piece of public art in itself;
- The three arches on the property are symbolic, representing a house of education/study, a house of meaningful prayer and a house of study;
- The provision of the Zoning Code allows the City to waive the fee.

Mr. Guilford concluded by asking the Board to recommend to the City Commission that the Art in Public Places fee be waived for this Temple Judea project.

At the request of Ms. Thomson, Mr. Guilford further interpreted the language in the fee waiver provision.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to recommend approval by the City Commission of the Art in Public Places fee waiver pursuant to Article 3, Section 3-2103 (B)(3). Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Fullerton, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.
Recusal: Mr. Parsley.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATIONS:

CASE FILE LHD 2015-01: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 102 Menores Avenue, legally described as Lot 11, Block 36, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, at Page 69 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Kautz explained that all applications would be considered separately. However, the commonalities of the three properties would be described one time and considered part of the record for all three applications.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, June 18, 2015

Continued

Continuing, Ms. Kautz said she would separately review each building regarding its architecture, ownership and tenancy records and so forth. However, the contextual history, architect's biography and other information common to all three properties would be reviewed in this first application.

All three Menores properties being considered for designation were brought to the Board because of historical significance requests. All three met the criteria for historic designation.

Referring contextually to all three Menores properties, Ms. Kautz displayed a site map of the neighborhood and asked that the record reflect the application of contextual reference to all three applications as they were all situated in the same block and same side of the street. She comprehensively reviewed the historic record of the area, Mediterranean Revival architectural style and features as published on pages two and three of staff reports for all three Menores properties.

Specifically addressing 102 Menores, Ms. Kautz discussed architectural characteristics of the property as historic and current photographs were displayed. She detailed features and alterations made over the years, stated they did not detract from the architectural integrity of the property, referred to the professions of residents by decades, and stated staff's recommendation of approval of local historic designation.

Prior to requesting public comment, Mr. Torre clarified some property features. There being no requests to comment from members of the audience, he closed the public hearing and opened Board discussion.

Board members discussed affordable housing and bed and breakfast considerations as they may apply to buildings of this type. Ms. Spain advised that if the property were designated historic, the owner of the property would be able to sell the development rights to a developer and include a maintenance plan for the building which would cover interior work and maintenance that could create a source of income. She emphasized this would only be possible if the building were designated. During this discussion, Mr. Fullerton asked if the buildings would qualify for TDRs. Ms. Spain answered in the affirmative, and discussion continued with a focus on the positive impact aspects of the TDRs.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve local historic designation of the property at 102 Menores Avenue. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Torres.
Nays: None.

CASE FILE LHD 2015-02: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 114 Menores Avenue, legally described as Lot 8 & W ½ Lot 9, Block 36, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, at Page 69 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

As Ms. Kautz relayed the history of this apartment building, also designed by Architect H. George Fink, she displayed historic and current photographs, said the published and previously referenced designation report applied to this building as well, and comprehensively described the features and alterations. She referenced a sampling of represented professions from the roster of residents by decade from the beginning of the building's history. Ms. Kautz concluded her presentation by stating staff's recommendation of approval of historic designation, and said all three Menores buildings were initially submitted to the Historical Resources Department for a historical significance determination in anticipation of demolition by one architect.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, June 18, 2015

Continued

Mr. Torres invited audience comment. Hearing no requests, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve local historic designation for the property at 114 Menores Avenue. Ms. Pruitt seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Parsley, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Torre.
Nays: None.

CASE FILE LHD 2015-03: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 118 Menores Avenue, legally described as Lot 7, Block 36, Coral Gables Douglas Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, at Page 69 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Kautz displayed original drawings as well as current and historic photographs as she relayed the history, ownership and project architect for the property. She reiterated that the previously referenced designation report applied to this building as well, and comprehensively described its features and alterations. She referenced a sampling of represented professions from the roster of residents by decade from the beginning of the building's history. Ms. Kautz concluded her presentation by stating that staff deems the property as significant to Coral Gables' history and recommends approval of local historic designation.

Hearing no requests for public comment, Mr. Torre closed the public hearing. In response to Ms. Rolando's question about the 1940s photograph that showed the name "The Peabody" on the property signage. Ms. Kautz said it is thought that Mr. Peabody was one of the owners, but it isn't known when he purchased or sold it.

Ms. Ramudo, owner of 118 Menores, said it is her intention to bring the building back to its original appearance as much as possible, and she would like to rename the building, "The Peabody." She spoke in support of local historic designation. There followed a discussion that included Ms. Ramudo about the letter of intent from Architect Marshall Bellin regarding her property.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve local historic designation for the property at 118 Menores Avenue. Mr. Parsley seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Torre.
Nays: None.

122 MENORES AVENUE:

Ms. Kautz asked if the Board would consider asking staff to review this vacant property to determine its eligibility for historic designation, currently red tagged by the City.

Mr. Fullerton made a motion for staff to research the property at 122 Menores Avenue to determine if it is eligible for local historic designation and, if so, to prepare a historic significance report. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion, which was unanimously passed by voice vote.

CORAL GABLES ELEMENTARY SCHOOL PROJECT UPDATE: City Attorney Craig Leen

At the request of Ms. Spain, Mr. Leen updated the Board regarding Coral Gables Elementary School's project to replace the historic building's windows, an issue of great concern to the City and the Historic Preservation Board. He reviewed

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, June 18, 2015

Continued

immediate action taken by the City Manager and him when they learned about the circumstances from Historical Resources staff. He comprehensively described each step already taken by the City, which had authority to red tag and halt the project as local government takes precedence in matters of zoning. Mr. Leen said the City will continue to respectfully and firmly encourage the School Board to cooperate with the City to resolve all issues; however, the City is prepared to use all means necessary to ensure the School Board complies with the law. To that end, the City has hired outside counsel to represent its interests along with Mr. Leen. He assured the Board that he and the City Manager were committed to this effort.

During discussion with Board members, Chair Torre voiced the Board's full support. A resolution was suggested to support the principle that the School Board should agree to and abide by the City's process.

Ms. Pruitt made a motion to adopt a resolution stating the Board strongly supports that the School Board should comply with the zoning procedures of the City of Coral Gables as related to historic preservation. Mr. Parsley seconded the motion.

Ms. MacIntyre left the meeting prior to the vote on the resolution. Mr. Leen advised that the vote could be reopened at the next meeting to register Ms. MacIntyre's vote on the resolution.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2015-005: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 4209 Santa Maria Street, a Local Historic Landmark and a contributing structure within the "Santa Maria Street Historic District," legally described as Lots 11 and 12, Block 96, Coral Gables Country Club Section Part Five, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 23, at Page 55, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for addition and alterations to the residence.

Ms. Spain advised that this residence was her previous home, purchased in 1994 and brought to this Board for review of proposed alterations in 1995.

Mr. Torre advised that he had communication with the project architect on the construction pricing for this property. He stated that this connection did not affect in any way his ability to objectively deliberate about the application.

Ms. Kautz reviewed the history of the property, additions and alterations made over the years as she displayed historic and current photographs. She said the architect would review the plans for design approval for additions and alterations. No variances were requested, and the Board of Architects reviewed the plans in February 2015 without comment. Ms. Kautz said staff had a few conditions to discuss after the architect's presentation.

Ms. Thomson questioned verbiage on page five in the second paragraph that should read "do not negatively . . ." rather than "do negatively . . .".

Architect Portuondo addressed the Board and detailed plans for restoration, alterations and additions to the property. When helpful to the Board's understanding, Ms. Spain occasionally commented on features that were or were not original to the house. At the conclusion of Mr. Portuondo's presentation, he engaged in discussion with Board members.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, June 18, 2015

Continued

Discussion between Mr. Portuondo, Board members and staff:

- Gardener's storage and potting room area: Mr. Portuondo agreed to using turned wood with screening in a specified opening of the outdoor potting room and retaining the other opening as square.
- Shutters: In the original historic drawings, the window above the front door had a shutter, but remaining windows and doors did not have shutters. Staff felt that shutters should not be added where they did not originally exist.
- Reflecting pond: Mr. Portuondo agreed to separate the water feature approximately 30 inches from the wall and still retain the design axis with the back wall of the guest room.
- Garage doors: Some of the garage doors are rotting. Ms. Spain advised that they are not original garage doors and are vulnerable to hurricanes. Since they are not historic, Mr. Portuondo suggested creating a more historical design compatible with the original architect's design, to make them hurricane code compliant and review the design with staff.
- S tile roof: The original tile was true barrel tile, S tile was allowed when the roof was replaced and true barrel tile should be used for replacement. Mr. Portuondo agreed to advise the owners, but requested that true barrel tile not be a contingency item as the cost of true barrel tile was not in the owners' budget. It was agreed that true barrel tile would be used on the addition, and that a contingency covenant could be approved stating that true barrel tile be applied to the existing portions of the house must be applied when the roof needs replacement.
- Front Wall: Mr. Portuondo has not yet designed a front wall, and will bring the item back to the Board for later review.
- Window sills: Window sills should not be added to the existing historic house. Mr. Portuondo said the sills in the original drawings and opined that they add charm to the house. He also pointed out that the original architect didn't necessarily build what they designed.
- Stucco should be differentiated slightly between the existing house and the new addition.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the design proposal for the one-story addition to the building on the property at 4209 Santa Maria Street, and to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: 1) separate the water feature from the main structure; 2) all tile on the new portions of the roof will be true barrel tile, and if the tile on the existing roof is not replaced during construction of the addition with true barrel tile, there needs to be a restrictive covenant recorded against the property requiring that when the roof on the existing portions of the house needs to be replaced, they will be replaced with true barrel tile; 3) window sills will not be added to the historic portions of the structure; 4) stucco on the new portions of the structure will be differentiated from the existing historic structure by either a difference in the texture or a vertical line in the stucco; 5) the window in the gardener's storage/potting room shall have a decorative feature of turned wood. Mr. Parsley seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2015-009: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 97 Campina Court, a contributing resource within the "Campina Court Historic District," legally described as Lot 1 & W ½ Lot 2, Block 3, Coral Gables Flagler Street Section, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 10, at Page 12, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida and Lots 25 & 26 Less W 95 FT, Stadler Grove Addition #1, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 12, at Page 42, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for addition and alterations to the residence.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, June 18, 2015

Continued

Ms. Spain advised that a portion of the house is in the City of Miami and a portion in the City of Coral Gables. She described the background of the property as current and historic photographs were displayed. She then called forward the project architect as she stated that staff recommended design approval for the addition and alterations to the residence.

Mr. Tur thanked the Board and staff for their help. He detailed all plans as photographs were displayed of all areas of the property. When he concluded his presentation, he indicated his willingness to respond to Board questions and comments.

Regarding the flat roofs over the dining and laundry rooms, Mr. Torre suggested slightly reducing the flat roof to avoid a notch in the elevation and retain the connecting flat space, which would make the proposed west elevation match the east elevation. Mr. Fullerton and Ms. Rolando joined the discussion. Mr. Tur agreed with the design recommendation. Thereafter, Mr. Torre invited comment from the audience. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

There followed a brief conversation about how one property in two cities is taxed. Regarding the west elevation, Mr. Fullerton clarified that true barrel tile would be used on the roof. Mr. Torre suggested a simpler railing design than proposed to be more appropriate to the language of the house.

Mr. Parsley made a motion to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 97 and to approve the design with modification to the roof, removing the notch and matching the east elevation with the west elevation, and the parapet on the west side against the true barrel tile. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.

There followed a discussion about difficulties experienced by owners of one property situated within two municipalities.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Fullerton, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

ITEMS FROM THE SECRETARY:

Dedication to Honor Sarah Anderson:

July 13, 2015, 10:30 a.m. at Fewell Park. Invitations were given to each Board member.

Historic Preservationist Applications:

Thus far, 63 applications have been received for the Historical Resources Department position vacated by Emily Ahouse.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

Douglas Entrance Update:

Mr. Torre referenced the Douglas Entrance window replacement project brought before the Board five years ago, and commented that nothing has been done and the windows are deteriorating. Ms. Spain and Ms. Kautz advised that Douglas Entrance is under new ownership, relayed information learned by staff during a recent meeting with the owner, who agreed to develop and furnish staff with a master plan that includes all the windows.

OLD BUSINESS:

Restoration of City Hall: Ms. Spain reported that the windows in City Hall will be restored along with other aspects of the restoration project. There is money set aside in the upcoming budget for restoration of the building.

Historic Plaques: Ms. Spain reported that a letter was sent to the artist's husband, stating the City's intention to proceed with the project. They are seeking an artist who can create a mold using the sole plaque on hand to replicate the design.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, June 18, 2015

Continued

NEW BUSINESS:

Board Position: Ms. Thomson said this would be her last meeting with the Board after eight years. On behalf of the Board, Mr. Torre praised her contributions and historical observations over the years. Ms. Spain asked her to attend the next Board meeting for a formal farewell.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting adjourned at 7:20 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Dona M. Spain
Historic Preservation Officer