

77

1 that it was just not repairable. So what
2 do you do when it's -- when the cost to
3 repair is -- The City is not providing any
4 incentive for that, is it?

5 MS. KAUTZ: No.

6 MS. MORENO: Are you helping bear the
7 cost of remodeling an older home?

8 MS. KAUTZ: No, but I mean, if the home
9 were that badly damaged and it came to us
10 for full demolition, there's an undue
11 economic hardship section of the Zoning
12 Code that would go into effect, and the
13 homeowner could say undue economic hardship
14 for preservation.

15 MS. MORENO: What is undue hardship?

16 MS. KAUTZ: It's not accurately defined
17 in our Code. It's any -- it's whatever the
18 homeowner wants to present to my Board to
19 prove economic hardship.

20 MS. MORENO: So, if I go to you and I
21 say to you, "It's going to cost me three
22 times to maintain this as it would to tear
23 it down and build a new house," you'd say
24 that's undue hardship?

25 MS. KAUTZ: No. You need to prove it.

78

1 MS. MORENO: Okay, well, let's say that
2 I prove it.

3 MS. KAUTZ: Then my Board listens to
4 claims of economic hardship.

5 MS. MORENO: See, I always thought that
6 the historic designation in Coral Gables
7 was kind of voluntary. You're telling me,
8 really, that it's imposed on people and
9 that they can't do anything about their
10 homes if they have a historic home.

11 MS. KAUTZ: It's not imposed on people
12 without a reason. We do not require
13 homeowner consent for designation. We like
14 to. We like to work with homeowners, but
15 it is not required.

16 MS. MORENO: I think that needs to be
17 clearer to the public than what it is
18 today, because I think people would not buy
19 some of these historic homes if they knew
20 that they were so limited, and that
21 concerns me, because I own a historic home.
22 Somebody may not want to buy my house if
23 they knew that they were so limited.

24 MS. KAUTZ: I can argue this with you
25 forever.

79

1 MS. MORENO: Yeah.

2 MS. KAUTZ: There are --

3 MS. MORENO: But I certainly --

4 MS. KAUTZ: There are studies that show
5 that historically designated homes retain
6 their value more than those are not, so I
7 can --

8 MS. MORENO: Ultimately, my point is, I
9 can see when you're going for full
10 demolition, but I have a very hard time
11 with 25 percent.

12 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Any other comments
13 before we vote?

14 MR. COE: Call the question,
15 Mr. Chairman.

16 CHAIRMAN KORGE: A motion to defer,
17 will you call the question, please?

18 MS. MENENDEZ: Javier Salman?

19 MR. SALMAN: Yes.

20 MS. MENENDEZ: Eibi Aizenstat?

21 MR. AIZENSTAT: Yes.

22 MS. MENENDEZ: Robert Behar?

23 MR. BEHAR: Yes.

24 MS. MENENDEZ: Jack Coe?

25 MR. COE: Yes.

80

1 MS. MENENDEZ: Cristina Moreno?

2 MS. MORENO: Yes.

3 MS. MENENDEZ: Tom Korge?

4 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Yes.

5 MS. KAUTZ: Thank you.

6 MR. COE: Can we have a break,
7 Mr. Chairman?

8 MR. RIEL: Yeah, Mr. Chair, can we take
9 a break? Because we have a multimedia
10 presentation we need to CHAIRMAN KORGE:
11 Okay. Is five minutes enough?

12 MR. RIEL: Yeah, five, eight minutes,
13 fine. 7:15, come back?

14 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Okay, 7:15.

15 (Thereupon, a recess was taken.)

16 CHAIRMAN KORGE: We're reconvening, and
17 I've been reminded by Mr. Coe that when
18 it's time for people who wish to speak from
19 the public, they're allowed no more than
20 three minutes, and if they speak more than
21 three minutes, Jack promised to come and
22 hit me.

23 So, proceed, Mr. Riel.

24 MR. RIEL: This is a Planning and
25 Zoning Board discussion and recommendation

81

1 to allow metal roofs within a specific
2 geographic area or City-wide.
3 On July 17th, 2007, the City Commission
4 approved a Zoning Code text amendment on
5 second reading. It was a four-to-one vote,
6 to permit the submission of building permit
7 applications for standing seam metal roofs
8 as an allowable roofing material for a
9 period of 90 days or up until October 17th,
10 2007, in the areas east and south of U.S. 1
11 or South Dixie Highway.
12 Let me just -- let me back up a minute.
13 I just want to go through the exhibits.
14 The draft ordinance, Exhibit A. B is the
15 City Commission cover memo that provides
16 some background information. You have a
17 DVD of the January 8th City Commission
18 proceedings. You also have a verbatim
19 transcript. You have a notification list,
20 updated comments, which are on kind of the
21 coral or pink sheets, and then you also
22 have a metal roof progress report, and in
23 the back, there's a map, as well. I want
24 to make sure those get entered into the
25 record.

82

1 As I indicated, the Commission
2 recommendation was to allow east and south
3 of U.S. 1. We have a large map to the side
4 here. If you look on the map, we've
5 identified each of the properties where
6 those individuals had sought to install a
7 metal roof within the 90-day period.
8 As you know, it was part of this
9 Board's discussion, on July 17th, 2007, the
10 City Commission recommendation was a result
11 of extensive public input, public meetings.
12 There was a special Metal Roof Advisory
13 Committee, which your vice-chair chaired,
14 with representatives of the Board of
15 Architects and Historic Preservation. The
16 Planning and Zoning Board discussed the
17 issue. The Board of Architects discussed
18 the issue. The Historic Preservation Board
19 discussed the issue.
20 The research that we completed -- and
21 as a part of that process for that 90-day
22 what I'll call a trial or temporary period,
23 we looked at the type of metal roofs;
24 prohibition on replication, in terms of
25 materials; the installation, in terms of

83

1 what types of residences were allowed;
2 color limitations, and I have the palette.
3 These were the five colors that were
4 ultimately decided to be permitted, under
5 the proposed 90-day trial period, if you
6 want to look closer.
7 Roof pitch, there was restrictions on
8 that; insulation, in terms of a
9 manufacturer; and also a requirement that
10 the full Board of Architects review and
11 approve, looking at context and
12 compatibility, per the criteria that is in
13 the current Zoning Code.
14 As a part of that 90-day review, Staff
15 was required to come back to the Commission
16 to give a progress report. We did that on
17 January 8th of 2008. At that time, the
18 Commission asked us to provide to this
19 Board, as well as the Commission, a video
20 and an update of this metal roof progress
21 report. This is an updated version,
22 because at the time we went back in
23 January, there were approximately six or
24 seven roofs that had not been completed.
25 So this is an updated version of that, and

84

1 I'm going to go into a little bit more
2 detail in terms of what this -- what's
3 included in here.
4 At the time when Staff presented to the
5 City Commission, they asked for a
6 recommendation from the City regarding
7 continuance of the program City-wide/
8 specific area. City Staff debated the
9 issue, discussed the issue. We came to the
10 conclusion -- my office came to the
11 conclusion and the City Architect as well
12 as the Historic Preservation Officer -- we
13 made a recommendation that if the
14 Commission desires to proceed forward with
15 allowing metal roofs, if they decide to
16 proceed forward, we again recommend only
17 the southern portion of the City.
18 I'd like to call up Carlos Mindreau,
19 our City Architect. He's going to
20 articulate, in much better form, in terms
21 of our basis for our recommendation. He's
22 also going to give you an outline. We went
23 to the Board of Architects last -- two
24 weeks ago. We're going back tomorrow with
25 another presentation. The intent is to go

85

1 to the Commission on April 8th with your
2 recommendation, the Board of Architects,
3 and then the City Commission can provide
4 the direction.

5 After Carlos is finished, I have --
6 I'll go through the report, and we have a
7 video, as well.

8 MR. MINDREAU: Good evening. The basis
9 for the allowance or the recommendation to
10 allow metal roofs in the portions of the
11 City to the south and to the east of U.S. 1
12 was essentially one that we both voiced in
13 a meeting with each other, really, from
14 separate perspectives.

15 Primarily, I felt strongly that the
16 areas that were to the south of U.S. 1 were
17 stylistically and architecturally a bit
18 more diverse than the areas to the north,
19 which seemed to have a concentration of the
20 more historic 1920s to 1945 vintage
21 residences.

22 More significantly, the scale of the
23 homes to the south and the relationship of
24 one building site to the adjacent building
25 sites was considerably different to the

86

1 south than it is to the north, in that
2 their lots were bigger. The area -- the
3 green space between homes is bigger, as
4 well, including the fact that in the areas
5 to the south, there is already -- as a
6 result of the annexed areas, there is
7 already a preponderance of some areas that
8 have allowed standing seam metal roofs in a
9 variety of colors. Those areas continue to
10 have a permitted use for standing seam
11 metal roofs.

12 This ties in almost directly with the
13 issues to the north. The converse would be
14 applicable to the areas in the north. The
15 lot sizes are smaller. The relationship of
16 the homes, one to the other, is much more
17 immediate. The nature of the architecture
18 in the areas that are more historic is less
19 conducive to standing seam metal roofs
20 being appropriate.

21 I felt strongly that it was necessary
22 to preserve not just the individual homes
23 that were of a historic nature, but also
24 the ambience or the environment in which
25 these homes sit. And so, as a result, I

87

1 felt that introducing a new material or a
2 new element in these areas, even though the
3 specific building might to some degree be
4 appropriate, I felt that the introduction
5 of this element in the neighborhoods to the
6 north, particularly to the very north, but
7 in general to the north, would dilute the
8 experience of the architecture of the
9 history of Coral Gables, which we feel so
10 strongly about.

11 MR. RIEL: The Board of Architects? Do
12 you want to go to the Board of Architects.

13 MR. MINDREAU: The -- how so?

14 MR. RIEL: Well, we took this report to
15 the Board of Architects, about two weeks
16 ago. They're going to finalize that and
17 put their recommendation in letter form,
18 and that will be provided to the
19 Commission.

20 Generally, if I were to summarize, I
21 would say they were in support of allowing
22 metal roofs City-wide, with some provisions
23 in terms of more information that they get
24 in terms of the application. They wanted
25 to see photographs of the surrounding

88

1 residences, not necessarily right next
2 door, but the entire street. They wanted
3 additional time to look at it, two weeks
4 for the review. They wanted an opportunity
5 to basically go out and look at each of the
6 parcels and then make a recommendation
7 whether or not a metal roof should be
8 permitted on that residence, based upon the
9 architecture and context and compatibility.

10 And I will tell you, that may result
11 in -- if, you know, the City Commission
12 does it City-wide, that certain metal roofs
13 will not be permitted. They're going to
14 like I said, finalize the recommendation.
15 We're going to show them a video, which I'm
16 going to show you at the end --

17 MR. MINDREAU: The basic reason that it
18 was tabled at the Board of Architects,
19 essentially, was that they had not seen the
20 video. We knew the video was coming and
21 the Board felt that it was important to see
22 the video showing the result of the 90-day
23 period, before they really finalized their
24 decision.

25 MR. RIEL: Okay. Thanks, Carlos.

89

1 Let me just go through, briefly, the
2 metal roof progress report before I go to
3 the PowerPoint. Twenty-four roofs were --
4 applications were submitted. Five of
5 those -- if you look on the map here, you
6 see the areas in green. The areas in green
7 are annexed areas. They were allowed to
8 have metal roofs pursuant to the annexation
9 agreements when they were annexed in the
10 City, so that discounted five of them right
11 there. Sixteen were approved during the
12 90-day period, two were denied, and one was
13 deferred. So, in that 90-day period,
14 basically 24 -- or 23 went through the
15 process.

16 Let me go ahead and go to the
17 PowerPoint.

18 Javier, can you turn the lights down?

19 This is the same report, and we do
20 have -- I guess they're gone now. We do
21 have copies of the -- Basically, the
22 information we provided here is the
23 application number, the address, the
24 application submittal date, if it was
25 required to go to the Historic Preservation

90

1 Board, the architectural style, the year it
2 was built, the previous roof, and then the
3 color that was selected, and then the roof
4 pitch, and then those that were obviously
5 completed, we have photographs here, and
6 I'll just go kind of fast through this,
7 because these photographs are kind of
8 difficult to see. We have larger ones, at
9 the end.

10 And these numbers they reference, they
11 reference a location on the map. 6820
12 Portillo, this is in the Riviera section,
13 Part 12, and again, I have -- we have a
14 video of this that shows the entire
15 streetscape.

16 8000 Old Cutler Road. 1155 San Pedro,
17 this is in Coral Bay. 5781 Southwest 116th
18 Street, Pine Bay Estates. This one, I
19 believe, is in one of the annexation areas.
20 11085 Marin Street, Hammock Oaks. 5485
21 Hammock Drive. 483 -- this is in Hammock
22 Oaks Harbor. 5505 Arbor Lane, this is in
23 Snapper Creek. 201 Solano Prado. 5860
24 Southwest 118th Street, Pine Bay Estates.
25 6830 -- which is in the Riviera Section,

91

1 Part 13. 10945 Lakeside Drive, Snapper
2 Creek Lakes. This is shown in red, because
3 this was one that was denied.

4 500 Old Cutler Bay, this again is
5 another one that was denied a metal roof.
6 6950 Sunrise Drive. 520 -- in Biscayne
7 Bay. 521, again in Biscayne Bay. And
8 that's it.

9 Let me just go ahead and read the Staff
10 recommendation. Again, if the Board
11 direction to the Commission is to proceed
12 forward with allowing metal roofs, the
13 Staff is recommending that it only be
14 allowed in the southern portions of the
15 City.

16 So, at this time, if we'd just have the
17 video. We have the same video of all these
18 properties. It's about a six to
19 seven-minute video. The video is actually
20 on the web as of this evening.

21 Unfortunately, the only way you can get
22 it is if you have QuickTime on your
23 computer, but it is on the web, and we do
24 have copies of the video, if you'd like to
25 take a copy with you. Hopefully we'll win

92

1 an Emmy with it or something like that.

2 So if you could roll the video.

3 We thought we would wake you up a
4 little bit.

5 (Thereupon, the video was played.)

6 MR. RIEL: They did a very good job, in
7 terms of editing and photographing. We
8 don't have the resources nor the talent to
9 do something like that.

10 And also, we did receive this evening a
11 petition that was in support, which is
12 signed by seven people, indicating, "The
13 undersigned residents of Coral Gables wish
14 to inform the Planning & Zoning Board,
15 Board of Architects, City Commission, a
16 support for an ordinance amending the
17 Zoning Code for metal roofs on
18 single-family homes, which was previously
19 an area south of U.S. 1. We would like it
20 in areas north of U.S. 1. Such a pilot
21 program would include appropriate review by
22 the Board of Architects."

23 So I want to enter that into the
24 record.

25 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you. I see

93

1 Commissioner Anderson has joined us.
 2 Did you want to get up and say a few
 3 words? No?
 4 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I'm scheduled
 5 to speak, so --
 6 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Oh, you are?
 7 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yes, so go
 8 ahead and do the persons that are ahead of
 9 me. I'll wait. Thank you.
 10 MR. RIEL: That concludes Staff's
 11 presentation. We do have nine people that
 12 have signed up to speak.
 13 MR. COE: Mr. Chairman, I have a
 14 question of Mr. Riel.
 15 Since we have City-wide copper roofs,
 16 why is there Staff resistance to having
 17 metal roofs City-wide?
 18 MR. RIEL: I think Mr. Mindreau
 19 articulated that much better than I did,
 20 and it's indicated in the Staff Report, the
 21 basis for Staff's findings. I think it's
 22 an issue more of context and compatibility,
 23 and we would feel the southern end of the
 24 City, given that it's, you know, more newer
 25 construction, our concern is, it perhaps

94

1 may -- you know, in terms of compatibility
 2 with the historic fabric of the City.
 3 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Copper would more
 4 compatible than the other metals?
 5 MR. RIEL: Well, copper has, as I
 6 understand it, been in the Code for about
 7 20 years, 23 years, so --
 8 MS. MORENO: But I'm seeing every one
 9 of these comments supports it on a
 10 City-wide basis, every single one.
 11 MR. RIEL: That's correct.
 12 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Okay, well, shall we
 13 open it for public discussion at this time?
 14 MR. RIEL: Whatever the Board would
 15 like.
 16 MR. BEHAR: Yeah.
 17 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Yeah, let's do that.
 18 Do you want to call the first name, please?
 19 MS. MENENDEZ: Mary Anderson?
 20 CHAIRMAN KORGE: We remind everybody
 21 that we have a three-minute time limit for
 22 each speaker, and we try to adhere to it,
 23 as best we can.
 24 Please state your name and address for
 25 the record.

95

1 MS. ANDERSON: Good evening. My name
 2 is Mary Anderson. I live at 1526 Trevino
 3 Avenue. I've been involved with this
 4 process, I think, since the beginning. I
 5 maybe missed one meeting. So I'm happy to
 6 meet you all this evening and see what you
 7 think about us homeowners having the same
 8 rights as the homeowners in the South
 9 Gables to have a metal roof for our home.
 10 I particularly became concerned after
 11 Wilma and Katrina with the number of new
 12 tile roofs that had been installed that did
 13 not perform well during the hurricane. I
 14 felt that very concerning, as a homeowner.
 15 It's such an important component and such
 16 an expensive component, and with insurance
 17 coverage these days, with deductibles on
 18 windstorm, if your roof is damaged, you
 19 really weren't covered, and for a long time
 20 we were with many people with tarps who
 21 could not afford to replace their roofs.
 22 I'm a native Miamian, and I really
 23 think that clay tile roofs have always been
 24 part of our architecture, but primarily
 25 they were reserved for these Mediterranean

96

1 historical buildings. The majority of
 2 homes in Miami were flat white tile roofs
 3 or barrel tile roofs that were white, and
 4 people began to use this clay tile roof
 5 because they didn't want the maintenance
 6 that a white tile roof needed, and I think
 7 Miami is just such a mass of clay tile
 8 roofs. My block, everyone has primarily,
 9 with the exception of myself and maybe two
 10 other people, the same color roof, the same
 11 color paint on their home, the same
 12 windows, the same front door.
 13 I think -- I've also had the privilege
 14 of working at Douglas Entrance, from 1978
 15 to 1985, and during that time, it was
 16 before any of the new office towers were
 17 constructed. So I really have a great
 18 fondness for Merrick and his architecture
 19 and what he tried to do, and I think if we
 20 would let these people -- us homeowners
 21 that have ranch homes just keep the
 22 integrity of the ranch and not try and
 23 convert it to a Mediterranean style, we
 24 would look more like a historical city and
 25 less like a planned community.

97

1 So I first found a metal roof about 10
2 years ago, on Key Biscayne, and if I may
3 show you a photograph, I photographed the
4 roof and my home, and they're not very
5 dissimilar. The green properties and the
6 windstorm properties that the metal roofs
7 have, I think, outweigh some of the
8 controversy as far as, will they fit into
9 the context of the neighborhood. I think
10 we should be allowed to protect our homes
11 with the best materials available.

12 I guess my three minutes are up.

13 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Yes.

14 MS. ANDERSON: Thank you.

15 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you very much.

16 MR. AIZENSTAT: Can I ask you a
17 question, please? How old is your roof
18 now?

19 MS. ANDERSON: I believe that my roof
20 is the original roof, 1947.

21 MR. AIZENSTAT: Are you looking to
22 change your roof?

23 MS. ANDERSON: I would like to change
24 my roof, yes, because my roof is -- My
25 insurance company doesn't like my roof from

98

1 1947, and it's starting to go on the
2 outside, and I'd like to renovate my whole
3 home, but I have an architect and I would
4 like to take into consideration windows,
5 roofs, doors, everything. I think Mike
6 Steffens was here at the last Commission
7 meeting, and he put it very eloquently: It
8 doesn't matter what material you use, as
9 long as you use it appropriately, because
10 if you use the inappropriate windows or the
11 inappropriate paint color or the
12 inappropriate door, you're not going to
13 have a successful project.

14 MR. AIZENSTAT: Thank you.

15 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you very much.

16 MS. MENENDEZ: Manuel J. Menendez.

17 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Please state your name
18 and address for the record.

19 MR. MENENDEZ: My name is Manuel J.

20 Menendez. I live at 3305 Alhambra Circle.

21 All I want to say is that these metal
22 roofs, to me they look so bad, and they
23 will look so bad in the City. I don't
24 believe that it was the intent of the
25 founder of the City to have these kind of

99

1 roofs. It will look like a Central
2 American country, to me. That's all I have
3 to say. Thank you.

4 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you.

5 MS. MENENDEZ: Sue Kawalerski?

6 MS. KAWALERSKI: Hi, I'm Sue
7 Kawalerski. I live at 6830 Gratian Street,
8 and mine is one of the houses that you saw
9 in the video. I have a metal roof. I live
10 east of U.S. 1, and I can tell you, I am
11 one happy customer, and I thank the City
12 for approving at least the pilot project,
13 to allow me a metal roof.

14 Last year at this time, I was in need
15 of a roof. I had a flat white cement tile
16 roof that had been damaged after hurricanes
17 and had leaks, and last year at this time I
18 faced having to replace it with what I
19 considered an inferior roof or fighting the
20 fight and coming to meetings and persuading
21 fellow neighbors to come to meetings to
22 allow metal roofs in the City of Coral
23 Gables, and I'm one of the lucky ones, and
24 here's my point of view on, you know, this
25 whole business of aesthetics and safety and

100

1 that sort of thing. You know, we can't
2 change time. We can't go back in time to
3 when they allowed nondescript housing like
4 mine in Coral Gables. Mine has no
5 historical value, no architectural
6 phenomenal sense to it whatsoever, and
7 actually, the metal roof on my house makes
8 absolute, perfect, aesthetic, logical
9 sense.

10 People in the north side, as well, have
11 some of these same nondescript ranches,
12 like mine on the south side, and my point
13 of view is, why try to bend architectural
14 styles to suit what was considered a
15 Mediterranean sense that George Merrick
16 brought about on houses that aren't at all
17 Mediterranean at all?

18 Very truthfully, if you looked at my
19 flat cement tile roof, compared to metal
20 roof, I mean, I have improved the value of
21 my house, both from an aesthetic point of
22 view and from a sales point of view. In
23 fact, Carlos -- you know, I saw him
24 videotaping my house, and Carlos and Eric
25 both said, you know, "Your house looks

101

1 phenomenal." They wouldn't have said that
2 a year ago, when I had my white flat cement
3 tile roof.

4 I've already gotten a rebate, by the
5 way, from FP & L, \$325. I'm getting lower
6 insurance rates from my insurance company
7 and I'm getting a tax incentive from the
8 Federal Government for going with a green
9 roof, essentially, an energy-efficient
10 roof. It just astounds me that this
11 shouldn't be a privilege of anyone in the
12 City of Coral Gables who wants one, put on
13 a home that aesthetically is more suitable
14 to a metal roof than a tile roof.

15 So I'm pleading for my northern
16 neighbors, as well as my southern neighbors
17 who also want the pilot project extended,
18 and I can tell you that, you know, the
19 sheer numbers of those involved in the
20 initial pilot project, 24 applications,
21 it's not like you're going to be flooded by
22 every single resident of Coral Gables
23 demanding metal roofs. I think people have
24 a sensibility in this community. Allow
25 them to exercise it.

102

1 Thanks.

2 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you.

3 MS. MENENDEZ: Ray Airan.

4 MR. AIRAN: I would appreciate it if
5 some other speakers could go first.

6 MS. MENENDEZ: Charles Girtman.

7 MR. GIRTMAN: I said my hellos to Jack
8 Coe. We both got off the Code Enforcement
9 Board before we went nuts.

10 Watching Judge Judy, one of the first
11 things she asks the people that come in
12 front of her is, "What's your axe to
13 grind?" When people come up here and talk
14 to you about these metal roofs, I wish you
15 would ask them, "What financial incentives
16 do you have to speak? Are you getting a
17 rebate to put them on from the builder?
18 Are you a builder? Are you an architect?
19 Do you have a financial interest in the
20 metal roofs?"

21 There's two reasons to put these metal
22 roofs on, that I can see. One is cost.
23 The lady who just spoke, she showed some of
24 the positive factors of the cost. They're
25 cheaper to put on, to start with, which is

103

1 what I've been told by the -- no, no, the
2 steel roofs are cheaper than copper, but
3 the steel roofs are cheaper, and these
4 roofs, every one you've seen is a steel
5 roof. It's not aluminum; it's steel. And
6 you get a rebate from the Government and
7 you get a rebate from FP & L to put them up
8 there. So money is the big factor.

9 There's two of them in my neighborhood,
10 very close, one two blocks away. The two
11 in my neighborhood -- and I'm pretty active
12 in City government. I try to keep up with
13 it. I've served on several boards, I come
14 to meetings, come take my time out and do
15 this when I'd rather be out on my boat, et
16 cetera. I didn't know anything about it,
17 and then I saw this roof there. The way
18 you see it, the house sits on a slight
19 rise. It's the yellow one on Tibidabo.
20 The sun shines off of it. It looks like a
21 beacon there. The house is bright yellow,
22 with a silver roof and blue shutters. All
23 the rest of us have either flat tile or
24 Mediterranean tile, and we're all on
25 100-foot lots. In truth, the houses, most

104

1 of whom that you saw here, are tear-downs.
2 The one on Tibidabo is a tear-down. My
3 house is a tear-down. It's 2,200 feet.
4 It's over 50 years old. Every house that's
5 been sold recently, it's been torn down and
6 they've put 3,400 square feet there.

7 So I would say, on the big, beautiful
8 homes with the copper roofs, some of the
9 homes you saw here that sit back, they've
10 got great landscaping, that's fine. I
11 would ask that not to restrict every single
12 one of them, but to have every one of them
13 be architecturally so they fit in, that the
14 Board of Architects say, "Yes, this fits in
15 with the neighborhood," not, "Great, put it
16 there because you'll save a little money on
17 the thing."

18 I had a metal roof. It was on a barn
19 that we had in Coral Gables. We used to
20 call them tin roofs. You've all seen them
21 if you've been in the south very long. The
22 house was not originally in Coral Gables.
23 It's now a historical house. It was my
24 house because I lived there; it was my
25 grandfather's home. So I speak from a

105

1 position of having had one, but I also know
2 and I agree with one of the previous
3 speakers here, they just don't look right.
4 And I was told by someone in the government
5 here that I'm an elitist because I want
6 things to stay the way they are. Coral
7 Gables has two things going for it, great
8 weather and great zoning. The property
9 values here -- and this will be my last
10 three sentences. The property values here
11 are so much higher than anywhere else in
12 Dade County, given whether water or non-
13 water, you know, compare. If you go into
14 places that do not have the zoning codes,
15 that let you do whatever you want to do,
16 you don't see the property values
17 preserved.

18 I disagree with the lady who spoke
19 before me, who said that her house is worth
20 more with a metal roof than it was with a
21 new -- not her old leaking cement tile
22 roof, but with a new cement tile roof. I
23 believe that would have the higher value.
24 But that's my opinion. Thank you very much
25 for your time.

106

1 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you.

2 MS. MENENDEZ: Robert Fine.

3 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Three minutes.

4 MR. FINE: I'd like to incorporate the
5 last two years into the record.

6 Very quickly, you know me. I've been
7 in front of you for the last couple of
8 years, regarding the metal roof issue.

9 I'm in the south part of the City, and
10 I think, in my opinion, the pilot project
11 has been very successful. A large portion
12 of the south already has metal roofs. They
13 can have them as a matter of right because
14 they're in the annexed area, if Ponce/Davis
15 comes in, even more so, and I really think
16 there's no good reason not to make it
17 permanent in the south.

18 In regard to the north, you know, the
19 reasons for people in the north who would
20 want metal roofs and why they should be
21 considered are really the same benefits
22 that I brought up with regards to the
23 south, the energy benefits, durability,
24 storm resistance, and while I agree with
25 the last speaker that economics does have

107

1 something to do with it, it's clearly not
2 the economics of putting the metal roof on,
3 because if you're in North Carolina, a
4 metal roof might be cheaper, but a metal
5 roof that meets the Florida Building Code's
6 wind resistance requirements for the
7 high-velocity hurricane zone, it's at least
8 equal and in many cases more expensive than
9 doing a tile roof. So, when people are
10 putting it on, it's they don't want the
11 cost of buying a new roof after the
12 hurricane, not because the first cost is
13 any less expensive.

14 I think that the benefits of metal
15 roofs and other materials that are coming
16 out can be so beneficial that it wouldn't
17 be right to deny people the benefits unless
18 you could really show that there's some
19 harm or harm could be shown, and so the
20 question is, is there a way to look at this
21 in the north part of the City without --
22 and find out, is it something that would
23 work there without creating harm?

24 And there will be speakers after me,
25 Tom Mooney and Luis Revucita, who will be

108

1 talking to you about their proposal for a
2 pilot project in the north, similar to that
3 in the south, but which includes a number
4 of additional protections so that if you
5 were to try it in the north, and let's say
6 fail, the homes would be isolated enough
7 and done in such a manner that it really
8 wouldn't adversely affect the fabric of the
9 north end, and with all those benefits
10 there, why not try and find out?

11 I mean, if you think about what's going
12 on, it's sort of a little weird. A few
13 minutes ago, you heard a speaker up here
14 saying we want to look at, you know,
15 historic consideration for ranch houses
16 with Spanish tile roofs on them, you know,
17 and now -- and you're saying we have a
18 product out here that's new. These ranch
19 houses, there's a lot more architectural
20 integrity in those houses with metal roofs.
21 They don't fit on every house, and when
22 they fit on a house, they don't fit on
23 every neighborhood, but that's why we have
24 the Board of Architects, that's why we have
25 a City Architect, to review those things,

109

1 and I do think it's worth considering a
2 pilot project for the north.
3 Thank you.
4 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you.
5 MS. MENENDEZ: Ted Rickel.
6 MR. RICKEL: My name is Ted Rickel. I
7 live at 1530 Baracoa Avenue, in the Gables.
8 Two points. I never signed the
9 petition to add metal roofs to the south
10 area -- I mean, to the north area, so I'd
11 like to be included, if I could, and the
12 second thing is, I was looking at the
13 design of the metal roofs that you have.
14 Can you please think about incorporating
15 different styles, as opposed to straight
16 lines? And if there is some technology
17 that's out there that shows where metal
18 roofs can be designed that look like tile,
19 either the straight tile or Mediterranean
20 tile, that would be something you might
21 want to consider.
22 Thank you, gentlemen and lady.
23 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you.
24 MS. MENENDEZ-DURAN: Luis Revuelta.
25 MR. REVUELTA: Good evening. My name

110

1 is Luis Revuelta. I'm an architect. I
2 have lived in the Gables for 26 years. I
3 live in 1417 Santa Cruz Avenue, plan to
4 move to 1045 Castile, and I certainly hope
5 I can have, some day, a metal roof on my
6 house.
7 I don't believe that roofs make the
8 City of Coral Gables. I think that what
9 makes the City of Coral Gables are the
10 1920s and the '30s styles that we find
11 around the Gables, the landscaping, which
12 most of the time covers a lot of the roofs,
13 the sidewalks, mainly in the North Gables,
14 the narrowness of the streets, the
15 services, and basically, the historical
16 sites that we have in Coral Gables. It's
17 not what type of a roof we have.
18 Merrick saw the value of having
19 different styles in Coral Gables. There
20 was nothing wrong with that. The City
21 itself allows a cement barrel tile roof,
22 that in my opinion as an architect, it
23 makes absolutely no architectural honest
24 sense. If we're going to allow barrel
25 barrel tile roofs, they should be clay tile

111

1 roofs. They should not be cement tile
2 roofs. A flat cement tile roof makes
3 sense. A barrel tile roof, if we're going
4 to be consistent in making the argument
5 that the metal roof is a foreign element to
6 the Gables or South Florida, which we have
7 a disagreement on, it's more honest than a
8 cement barrel tile roof.
9 I think standing metal roofs are not
10 only more reflective of the historical
11 character of South Florida, but they're
12 safer, they're more energy-efficient, and
13 they're architecturally pleasing. I think
14 if there's one style that really reflects
15 the area, it's that style of architecture
16 that comes with the metal roofs. The
17 architects under Merrick, what they were
18 doing at the time, in the 1920s, is
19 basically copying what they saw in Europe
20 and trying to re-interpret it here, which
21 you could have, at that point in time, made
22 an architectural argument that that was not
23 being honest.
24 Copper roofs are allowed, but copper
25 roofs turn darker, and I don't agree with

112

1 the fact that they're more compatible,
2 they're more energy-efficient. They turn
3 darker. They absorb the heat. Copper is a
4 great conductor of heat, and it's more
5 expensive. I think inherently in the fact
6 that for those reason, we don't find too
7 many copper roofs in the City.
8 As you know -- may or may not be aware,
9 we have a respectful difference of opinion
10 with Staff and some of the Commissioners
11 about this issue. We wholeheartedly agree
12 that this should be implemented on the
13 south. We believe that it's not fair not
14 to allow the north the same period of time
15 that the south was allowed to make an
16 intelligent architectural and political
17 decision, and fair. Give the north 30 or
18 60 days, and at that point, then let's deem
19 if it's accurate that this style of
20 architecture and this material is going to
21 affect the North Gables.
22 At the end of the day, if you're
23 correct, there's absolutely nothing wrong
24 with allowing 30 or 20 days. If we're
25 incorrect, there's nothing to lose. 30 or

113

1 60 days will prove that we're incorrect,
2 there's no harm done, and there's very few
3 of us that are in that.

4 I would like to just basically close
5 with this, that we believe it's not correct
6 not to allow the north the same test
7 period, or less, than the south was
8 allowed, and architecturally, I think it
9 would be the correct thing. We would not
10 be arguing for something or proposing
11 something that is going to affect our own
12 property values. I've lived in the Gables
13 for 26 years.

14 So I appreciate the ability to speak to
15 you all, and I would like to commend Thomas
16 Mooney and Robert Fine for the good job
17 that they've done in crafting what I think
18 is a very tight set of regulations that
19 would make Staff and the different boards
20 that are going to regulate this -- their
21 life a lot easier.

22 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you.

23 MR. REVUELTA: Thank you.

24 MS. MENENDEZ: Thomas Mooney.

25 MR. AIZENSTAT: Before Mr. Mooney

114

1 speaks, I would like to state that I did
2 receive an e-mail from Mr. Mooney on --

3 MR. COE: Oh, we all did.

4 MR. AIZENSTAT: Okay. I just wanted to
5 make that clear, on March 10th.

6 MR. MOONEY: Good evening,
7 Mr. Chairman, Members of the Planning
8 Board. For the record, Thomas Mooney. I
9 reside at 601 Navarre Avenue, and my
10 comments tonight are as a resident, as a
11 homeowner, and also as a professional urban
12 planner.

13 The ordinance that is before you, that
14 has been drafted by Staff, is something
15 that I support and I think everybody that
16 has been speaking up here is in full
17 support of, particularly with regard to
18 making the metal roof regulations permanent
19 south of U.S. 1.

20 The e-mail that I sent you a couple of
21 days ago is basically that same ordinance,
22 but I added an applicability section that
23 basically copied the pilot program that the
24 City Commission approved last July, but I
25 added a few more safeguards, and since you

115

1 have a copy of it, I won't, unless you want
2 me to, read all of them into the record,
3 but basically, what they do is, they make
4 that pilot program a little bit more
5 narrow, they include a few more safeguards,
6 and they also incorporate some of the
7 comments that were expressed by the City's
8 Board of Architects.

9 The whole concept of metal roofs has
10 been going on for almost two years now, and
11 it's something that I've been involved
12 with, and we've had some very good
13 discussions with Eric and his Staff, and
14 also I did a walking tour with Carlos, and
15 I do have the utmost respect for the City
16 Staff and the work that they've done and
17 the reports that they put together and the
18 videos they put together. However, as I
19 indicated to Carlos when we did our walking
20 tour, I do disagree with their assessment
21 of whether or not a pilot program or metal
22 roofs should be incorporated into the areas
23 in North Gables. And a couple of things
24 I'd like to point out with regard to the
25 north, specifically. I don't believe that

116

1 there exists a clear and unambiguous line
2 at U.S. 1. I think that once you go north
3 of 1, the context is very, very similar to
4 the area south of U.S. 1. If you're going
5 to start to gerrymander the City, that line
6 probably would be much further north, if at
7 all, and I don't think that you can
8 actually determine that line or the
9 gerrymander boundary lines until you've
10 actually had a much larger study area by
11 virtue of extending a pilot program to the
12 north, and I think once you've done that,
13 even if it's a shorter pilot program than
14 what we've suggested, I think at that point
15 you make a much more informed decision as
16 to whether or not there even should be a
17 boundary line.

18 I do think that the prevalent styles of
19 architecture north of U.S. 1 are clearly
20 not Mediterranean Revival. I think that
21 the City's studies -- City's own studies
22 show that only a small percentage of the
23 homes City-wide were constructed prior to
24 1940, but moreover, you really don't see a
25 prevalence of Med Rev -- true Med Rev

117

1 architecture until you really get north of
2 Coral Way.

3 So I think that in terms of the
4 diversity of architecture, that diversity
5 of architecture does go well north of U.S.
6 1.

7 With regard to the size of the lots in
8 the north area, I think that in the south
9 area, as you go further south and you have
10 the larger lots -- and you saw a lot of
11 these in the video that was put up on the
12 TV screen -- the bigger the lot, the larger
13 setbacks, particularly from the front, the
14 more of the roof that you actually see. In
15 a lot of the homes where the metal roofs
16 were approved, and I think they're very
17 attractive and they fit very well with the
18 context, ironically, they are more visible.

19 When you walk around the north, and I'm
20 telling you this as a resident of the north
21 who's walked almost all those blocks, when
22 you're on the same side of the street,
23 because the homes are much closer to the
24 sidewalk, you really don't even notice the
25 roofs, particularly when they have a lower

118

1 pitch, and if you have a standing seam
2 metal on the types of homes that would
3 allow it, subject to Board of Architects
4 approval, in this ordinance, it's not
5 something that's going to be jarring. It's
6 not something, I think, that's going to the
7 fabric or context of the area. I think
8 that you're going to look at it as nothing
9 different than a white flat tile.

10 With regard to the historic context and
11 the designation of historic districts, I
12 think that allowing metal roofs, certainly
13 as part of a pilot program, but perhaps as
14 a much broader city-wide ordinance, would
15 actually increase the chances for
16 designation of those areas and make
17 residents feel more comfortable about
18 designation.

19 My own home was built in 1960, and it's
20 something that I would like to consider for
21 designation. It's clearly a modern home,
22 but if the City is moving toward embracing
23 the more modern homes because of their
24 impact on the scale and context due to
25 their size, I think that a metal roof would

119

1 go a long way in distinguishing it from the
2 architectural styles that have been
3 designated now, the historic Med Revival
4 homes and the early post-war homes -- the
5 early pre-war homes.

6 In closing, as I said before, I don't
7 think that it's going to -- the
8 introduction of metal roofs in the north
9 area is going to be detrimental to the
10 scale, character or context of the built
11 environment. I think that a limited pilot
12 program would clearly show that. And as
13 this Board is well aware, this item or this
14 matter has been before both this Board, the
15 Historic Preservation Board in the past,
16 the Board of Architects, as well as the
17 Metal Roof Advisory Committee, and at each
18 step of the way, there's been overwhelming
19 support for a City-wide ordinance, which I
20 believe equates to good public policy.

21 So, in closing, I would ask that the
22 Board transmit a favorable recommendation
23 of the ordinance that has been drafted by
24 Staff, but with the applicability section
25 that I had drafted and had included to all

120

1 the Board members. I had talked to the
2 City Attorney about that, and she said that
3 adding that applicability section would not
4 cause it to have to come back to this Board
5 for a re-advertisement, that it is
6 something that you could add as a minor
7 text amendment, if you so choose to
8 transmit it to the Commission.

9 I thank you for your time and
10 consideration. If you have any questions,
11 I'd be glad to answer them.

12 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you very much.

13 MR. AIZENSTAT: Could I ask you a
14 question? I was going to ask you what part
15 of town you live in. You said you live in
16 the North Gables.

17 MR. MOONEY: Yes.

18 MR. AIZENSTAT: Are you looking to redo
19 your roof?

20 MR. MOONEY: Yes.

21 MR. AIZENSTAT: Thank you.

22 MS. MENENDEZ: Maria Anderson.

23 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Thank you.

24 For the record, Maria Anderson, 535
25 Almeria Avenue. It's a pleasure to be here

121

1 tonight, and I'd actually say I'm a little
2 nervous on the other side, sitting here.

3 I think I've been here a handful of
4 times throughout the seven years I've been
5 in office, but I felt very strongly to come
6 here tonight, and I actually got clearance
7 from the City Attorney, that I could speak,
8 because it is a legislative matter.

9 I disagree really strongly with Staff,
10 and I'd like to tell you why, and I think
11 it's reflected on the record on two issues,
12 fairness and facts. I think it's -- if you
13 give one pilot program to the south, I
14 think it's only fair that you offer it to
15 the north, with controls and with certain
16 limitations, like we did to the south.

17 I think the facts don't bear out that
18 we're a truly Mediterranean city. I think
19 we had a housing census that was provided
20 by the City. I asked for it. 87 percent
21 of the homes were built from 1940 and on,
22 87 percent. That's not Mediterranean.

23 I know Mr. Merrick had great dreams.
24 He had -- and he unfortunately didn't live
25 to see them and the economic times changed

122

1 after he left and it didn't follow what he
2 wanted, and in the 1940s, other styles took
3 over, and here we are. And so one thing he
4 did value -- and I never attempt to get
5 into Mr. Merrick's head, because many
6 people have, but in the writings that he
7 talks about it, he talks about
8 architectural harmony, and if a material,
9 whether it be a metal roof, whether it be a
10 barrel tile, whether it be a flat tile, is
11 harmonious with the street, say the street,
12 then why not? I think it's really
13 important not only to look at the house
14 straight on, but I think you need to look,
15 and if you drive by the houses -- sometimes
16 I asked -- when I went on the walking tour
17 with Carlos, I asked him to step into the
18 middle of the street in the North Gables,
19 and you see a lot of trees, you see a lot
20 of houses. There may be areas in the south
21 that don't have the tree canopy, but that's
22 a different thing. But a lot of it is
23 about the street and the context.

24 I firmly believe that without a pilot
25 program in the north -- it's just for those

123

1 two reasons, fairness and facts, and I'm
2 probably in the minority, and that's okay,
3 and I leave that to you all in your great
4 wisdom. I know you ruled in favor of it
5 before, as many other parties, or many
6 other boards.

7 Thank you for your consideration.
8 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you.

9 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: By the way, I
10 live in a nondescript 1950s home, and if
11 you drive in my area, Almeria, those two
12 blocks south, there's nothing historic
13 about it, nothing, and in fact, let me just
14 add, for years, a non-architect, a building
15 official, decided what barrel tile was put
16 on the houses, and if you go by my street,
17 ranch/burgher homes are -- you have homes
18 with orange barrel tile, that all you see
19 are the orange barrel tiles, and I'd rather
20 see something more discreet on these homes,
21 whether it be a flat cement tile or a metal
22 roof -- not a tin roof, a metal roof.

23 Thank you.

24 MR. AIZENSTAT: Commissioner?

25 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yes.

124

1 MR. AIZENSTAT: If I may ask you the
2 same question, what's the condition of your
3 roof that you have on your house?

4 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I have no
5 intention of removing my roof. I have a
6 relatively new roof, just recently cleaned,
7 so I'm up to Code, and I just feel very
8 strongly, as a trained architect, not a
9 practicing one, a trained architect with a
10 real keen eye for certain things, that
11 metal roofs are not an abomination, and I
12 think we begin -- I think change is hard
13 for many people and I think it's just by
14 trying pilot programs and by trying to
15 educate people that we may allay some
16 concerns and fears, but yesterday at the
17 Commission meeting we had a beautiful
18 modern building come before us. Thank God,
19 hallelujah, it didn't look like an orange
20 creamsicle, and I'm really proud of the
21 fact that we approved it, and it's
22 beautiful and it's going to add to the
23 beautiful area in the Ponce area near the
24 Village of Merrick Park.

25 We have to begin to explore diversity

125

1 and architectural harmony with whatever
2 materials they are, in the proper context.

3 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you.

4 MR. AIZENSTAT: Thank you.

5 MS. MENENDEZ: Ray Airan.

6 MR. AIRAN: Good evening, everybody.

7 My name is Ray Airan, and I live at 1252

8 Obispo Avenue. Originally, this house was

9 built in '27 and finished in -- '27,

10 because it was started in '22 and Mr.

11 Merrick went bankrupt in between, before he

12 finished the house.

13 At this time, if anybody were to ask me

14 what is the contributing factor in terms of

15 historic value on that house, it's the

16 leaky roof, and the year when it was

17 finished originally. I have gone through

18 the history of this house, after finding

19 out that I am in Code violations, that the

20 house had some kind of conditions and

21 remodeling and continuous work on an

22 average of every 15 years, including what I

23 have done.

24 Right now, anybody who stops by my

25 house and wants to know what style is that,

126

1 I say I don't know. But it looks good, it
2 looks unique, and any property around me,
3 none of them or myself has any designation
4 of a historic value.

5 I'm living with a leaky roof for about
6 30 years. I have replaced the roof for
7 about five times, and every time the
8 maximum warranty on the roof, from the
9 roofer, is 15 years that I could get,
10 anywhere between 10 to 15 years.

11 I refinanced my house about four times.

12 Now, you can imagine how much trouble or

13 what do you call it, a nightmare it is, for

14 me to replace the roof again. Three

15 fourths of the roof is flat, with parapet

16 walls. I have gone through three

17 architects, two structural engineers and

18 three contractors, and none of them have

19 been able to give me a roof which would

20 last for 15 years, not to even 10 years.

21 I need a metal roof. I have studied
22 the benefits of it. I attended a seminar
23 put out by Professor Jack Parker from FIU,
24 courtesy of Commissioner Anderson, you
25 know, arranged for it, and I understand the

127

1 benefits of it from an energy conservation
2 point of view, from a safety point of view,
3 and all of that. I wish that I would like
4 to add my name to the petition, also. I

5 need to replace the roof. I would like to

6 replace the roof with a metal roof, and

7 please consider offering us the same

8 benefits and consideration like you have

9 for the southern part of U.S. 1.

10 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you very much.

11 MR. AIRAN: Thank you.

12 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Anybody else to speak?

13 MS. MENENDEZ: No.

14 CHAIRMAN KORGE: No? Well, then, we'll

15 close the public hearing portion of the

16 meeting, and is there a motion for -- or

17 any discussion on the recommendation by the

18 Planning Department?

19 MR. AIZENSTAT: Eric, could I ask you,

20 when you go through the process for

21 somebody that wants to get a metal roof

22 today, in the pilot program, what are the

23 levels of check marks and so forth that

24 they have to go through?

25 MR. RIEL: Okay. If you refer to

128

1 Attachment A, which is the ordinance --

2 MR. AIZENSTAT: Correct.

3 MR. RIEL: If you go to Page 4, those
4 are basically the development standards
5 that is undergone, the extensive review and
6 input through this process.

7 Basically, the way this reads, this
8 provision mirrors what's in the south end
9 only. Article 5, Division 6, which is the
10 zoning -- in the Zoning Code, has very
11 specific design review standards that deal
12 with context and compatibility. It's
13 approximately three pages of regulations
14 that deal with that issue in general, that
15 all projects, single-family homes,
16 commercial developments, need to adhere to,
17 and then the regulations you see, one
18 through 10, deals specifically with metal
19 roofs, where it gets into allowable
20 architectural style. If it's historically
21 significant, it's prohibited from having a
22 metal roof. If it is in a district, it has
23 to go to the Historic Preservation Board.
24 You saw the color board. Metal roofs can't
25 be painted. It has to be a certain

129

1 standing seam metal gauge. It can't
2 replicate. It has to be installed per the
3 manufacturer guidelines. The pitch and
4 insulation is required, and then there
5 is -- which is standard on any provision,
6 an appeal process. And then there's a
7 definition of standing seam metal roof.

8 MR. AIZENSTAT: And presently, the
9 process has to go through the full Board of
10 Architects, meaning it doesn't convene with
11 two or three Board of Architects members,
12 but the entire Board.

13 MR. RIEL: The full Board. Full Board,
14 yes.

15 MR. AIZENSTAT: And if I remember
16 correctly, in the discussion that we had,
17 we stated that we relied upon the Board of
18 Architects to actually make that decision;
19 they were qualified individuals that we
20 felt were qualified to actually look at
21 that.

22 MR. RIEL: Yes.

23 MR. AIZENSTAT: And if you did a pilot
24 program for the north end, would you
25 consider doing it for the same amount of

130

1 time?

2 MR. RIEL: I think it's a decision we
3 look for, for a recommendation from this
4 Board and obviously the Commission, whether
5 or not it's a time frame or if it's
6 permanent. I mean, I think Staff has
7 presented our position in terms of where we
8 think it should be in terms of a geographic
9 area, but in terms of the time, you know,
10 limitation, I think that's a policy
11 direction issue.

12 MS. MORENO: I'm ready to move. I'd
13 like to move to adopt it in the south
14 permanently and to have a pilot program in
15 the north. I agree with Commissioner
16 Anderson. How can you not allow the north
17 to at least have a shot at it? It's a
18 question of fairness, especially when
19 you're talking about being environmentally
20 responsible and also addressing our severe
21 hurricane issues. The fact that we're
22 afraid that it may not be compatible should
23 not -- should not prevent us from trying it
24 and having a little faith in the Board of
25 Architects to make sure that it's approved

131

1 where it's appropriate.

2 MR. BEHAR: I'm going to second that
3 motion, Cristina, and furthermore, I --
4 since the beginning, I've been --

5 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Well, excuse me for
6 interrupting, but before we accept the
7 motion, the second part of your motion, not
8 that it's unacceptable, but it's kind of
9 vague. I mean, I don't think we have
10 before us the criteria for a temporary
11 program --

12 MS. MORENO: The same as it was in the
13 south.

14 CHAIRMAN KORGE: The same as it was in
15 the south?

16 MS. MORENO: The same --

17 MR. RIEL: Ninety days?

18 MS. MORENO: The same period, the same
19 requirements, exactly the same as what was
20 offered to the south, now offered to the
21 north.

22 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Just to be clear about
23 this, it would be the same time period
24 under -- I'm assuming under the same
25 criteria that would be approved for the

132

1 south.

2 MS. MORENO: Exactly the same.

3 CHAIRMAN KORGE: That would be approved
4 under this ordinance for the south.

5 MS. MORENO: Right.

6 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Okay. That's clear
7 enough for me.

8 MR. AIZENSTAT: Now, just --

9 CHAIRMAN KORGE: We have a second. I'm
10 sorry, I interrupted your second. I just
11 wanted to get that clear.

12 MR. BEHAR: But I just want to further
13 reinstate that since the very beginning,
14 I've always been a proponent to it, and I
15 believe, as an architect, that -- I find
16 out today that 87 percent of the homes in
17 the City were intended to have a flat,
18 low-profile roof on it. At some point in
19 the '60s, '70s, the trend started to start
20 incorporating barrel tiles, which is not
21 compatible, in my opinion, with those style
22 homes.

23 I do believe that -- and I see this
24 picture that you denied and I see the one
25 that Staff denied. To me, this house

133

1 should have never received a barrel tile
2 roof. It is more appropriate, a
3 low-profile metal roof that is more
4 consistent with the architecture.
5 The City-wide, since the beginning, I
6 always was in mind --
7 MS. MORENO: Yeah, I'm in favor of
8 City-wide.
9 MR. BEHAR: It has to be City-wide.
10 Therefore, I will second your motion.
11 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Any discussion on the
12 motion?
13 MR. AIZENSTAT: Your motion is, though,
14 to make it permanent.
15 MS. MORENO: Permanent in the south.
16 MR. AIZENSTAT: For the south?
17 MS. MORENO: Right.
18 MR. AIZENSTAT: That has not been
19 brought before us, to make it permanent.
20 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Yes.
21 MS. MORENO: Yes.
22 MR. SALMAN: That's what's before us.
23 MR. BEHAR: That's what's before us.
24 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Yes, that is before
25 us.

134

1 MS. MORENO: That is the request before
2 us.
3 MR. AIZENSTAT: I didn't understand it
4 that way.
5 MS. MORENO: Yeah. What's before us
6 was to make it permanent just in the south
7 and exclude the north, and what I have
8 amended it is to say, make it permanent in
9 the south and extend the pilot program on
10 the same terms as provided to the south, to
11 the north.
12 MR. AIZENSTAT: You would not rather
13 have a pilot program in the north and then
14 bring it all together?
15 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Well, that's what
16 she's saying. Oh, I'm sorry.
17 MR. COE: That's not what she's saying.
18 MS. MORENO: No.
19 MR. AIZENSTAT: No, and then bring it
20 all together --
21 MR. BEHAR: No.
22 MS. MORENO: No. I'd like to allow the
23 people in the south the opportunity. Their
24 period has ended. I'd like to give them
25 the opportunity to start putting on roofs

135

1 ahead of hurricane season. It's a -- We
2 had a period here after Hurricane Katrina
3 where we had a significant number of homes
4 with blue tarps for almost a year. We need
5 to address our hurricane issues, and we
6 cannot be distrustful of our architectural
7 review board in allowing people to do so.
8 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Any more discussion?
9 MR. COE: Yeah, I agree, and I voted --
10 three or four times, we voted in the past
11 on this -- that if we're going to do this,
12 it should be done City-wide. I could not
13 understand the arbitrary distinction at
14 U.S. 1.
15 Obviously, from a safety/hurricane
16 point of view, the so-called metal roof is
17 preferable to a barrel tile roof. They
18 don't blow away in a hurricane. You don't
19 have these roof particles coming at you.
20 On the other hand, while I was prepared
21 to do this, this evening, to vote again to
22 continue this project City-wide, I did,
23 earlier today, drive down and looked at
24 some of these properties in the South
25 Gables, and I'm now a little bit concerned.

136

1 I don't mind it as a pilot project in the
2 North Gables, but I would be, right now, a
3 little bit concerned about making that a
4 permanent part of a City ordinance. I'm
5 not so sure, where you have numerous
6 one-lot properties, how well the metal roof
7 will look, aesthetically. That's my only
8 concern about that, and I would like to see
9 that simply as a pilot project, and maybe
10 I'm wrong.
11 Someone had said that there should be
12 more diversity of the texture and the shape
13 and the form and the color of the roofs.
14 If you go down and look at what's been
15 built, they're not diverse, and frankly,
16 they're ugly, and I don't know what impact,
17 if any, it has on property values. I would
18 be a bit concerned if we precipitously
19 voted to extend this to the North Gables,
20 other than a pilot project, and I'm still a
21 little bit concerned about having it
22 permanently in the South Gables. I think
23 we need to take a further look at that and
24 have a pilot project on the north, maybe
25 extend the pilot project in the south, but

137

1 I think we should be very careful before we
2 start adopting permanent ordinances on
3 these things.

4 MR. AIZENSTAT: I would be in agreement
5 to extending the south and doing it in the
6 north and see how it goes, because for me,
7 I would like to do it -- take a look at the
8 program as a whole and not just divide it.
9 If we're here discussing and saying it's
10 not fair to the north, what's being done to
11 the south, why are we dividing it out and
12 making this permanent and this, you know,
13 for a trial period?

14 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Well, for the reason
15 that Jack just said, because he thinks that
16 it might -- architecturally -- excuse me.
17 He says architecturally, it may not go as
18 well in the north. That was --

19 MR. AIZENSTAT: Which I agree, but
20 that's why I'm saying, let's extend the
21 south, the pilot program, so if somebody
22 still wants to go and do their roof, they
23 can, and then at the time when it all comes
24 together, whether the Commission would look
25 at it or we'd look at it, let's --

138

1 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Well, do you think --
2 You're not satisfied that the south should
3 have a permanent program, because it may
4 not be architecturally sound?

5 MR. AIZENSTAT: I don't know if that's
6 the reason or I'd rather look at it as a
7 whole and not split it off and looking at
8 it as two sides.

9 MS. MORENO: Well, I think the reason
10 we initially split it or that -- I think
11 our Board recommended it City-wide, but I
12 think the reason for the initial split was
13 the understanding that in the south, there
14 are very few Old Spanish homes, which are
15 the ones that gave you problems with the
16 architectural aesthetics.

17 MR. SALMAN: Also, the insurance
18 companies make that definition of U.S. 1,
19 and this is an insurance issue with regards
20 to survivability of the roof in those
21 high-wind areas.

22 My concern is that a barrel tile roof
23 will last you about 15 years, maximum, that
24 I've seen. A metal roof typically lasts 30
25 or 40 years, all right? We talked about

139

1 people in the '70s and '80s and even now,
2 you know, arbitrarily putting Spanish tile
3 roofs on, you know, semi-ranch-style modern
4 buildings. It used to all be flat white
5 concrete tile, which was -- which is also,
6 by the way, very wind-resistant -- I mean,
7 very few of those failed during Katrina --
8 and what became a short-term sort of fad
9 issue, because in 15 years, most of those
10 roofs are going to be replaced, some of
11 them are going to go back to white tile,
12 some of them are going to be colored flat
13 tile, because those are allowed, and some
14 of them may end up being metal, which is
15 what we're talking about today.

16 My concern is that what is now a
17 fashion idea, because everyone sort of
18 wants a Key West style house with a metal
19 roof and whatnot, is something that we're
20 all going to end up living with in
21 inappropriate situations, but that's why we
22 have a Board of Architects --

23 MS. MORENO: Uh-huh.

24 MR. SALMAN: -- and that's why we trust
25 them, and that's why, given the extended

140

1 context of their review and the extended
2 level of review, I think it's totally
3 unfair not to give the north the
4 opportunity, in a pilot program, to go
5 ahead and start looking at it.

6 I'm thinking of the north end homes
7 that are small bungalow homes, especially
8 some of the historic ones, where they have
9 a preponderance of flat roofs. I have a
10 couple in my office right now, where it's
11 like, "Man, if I could do a metal roof, I'd
12 solve this problem from a pitch point of
13 view and get them out of the leak
14 business," because, I mean, a lot of these
15 have just parapet walls, flat roofs, with a
16 very low pitch, and the real technical
17 solution is a metal roof, and yet it's not
18 allowed, and so -- even though it's not
19 visible from the street.

20 MR. BENAR: Copper is.

21 MR. SALMAN: Copper is, yeah, but
22 copper is copper, and we'll leave it at
23 that. A metal roof, by the way, ladies and
24 gentlemen, is twice the price of a regular
25 roof, and you get twice the value out of

141

1 it. The cost benefit of it is that you
2 don't have to change it as often. But it
3 is a permanent situation.

4 I'm in complete favor of the proposal
5 before us and the motion. However, my only
6 concern is, one, that we're going to
7 misapply it, and that's why we have the
8 Board of Architects, and the extended
9 review should limit us from having that as
10 a problem, and I don't see why we should
11 limit anyone in the City from installing
12 and making that investment, because it is
13 an investment above and beyond a normal
14 roof, on their home. So that's my piece.

15 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Any more discussion on
16 the motion?

17 MR. BEHAR: Call the question.

18 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Let's call the vote,
19 please.

20 MS. MENENDEZ: Eibi Aizenstat?

21 MR. AIZENSTAT: So this is for making
22 it permanent?

23 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Permanent in the south
24 and a temporary program in the north, on
25 the same terms as the temporary program

142

1 that had been implemented in the south.

2 MR. AIZENSTAT: I agree that the north
3 should have a pilot program, but I don't
4 agree that the south should be permanent at
5 this time, so I'm going to vote no.

6 MS. MENENDEZ: Robert Behar?

7 MR. BEHAR: Yes.

8 MS. MENENDEZ: Jack Coe?

9 MR. COE: No.

10 MS. MENENDEZ: Cristina Moreno?

11 MS. MORENO: Yes.

12 MS. MENENDEZ: Javier Salman?

13 MR. SALMAN: Yes.

14 MS. MENENDEZ: Tom Korge?

15 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Yes.

16 MR. COE: Is that it?

17 CHAIRMAN KORGE: The next meeting?

18 MR. RIEL: Our next meeting is April
19 9th.

20 CHAIRMAN KORGE: Thank you.

21 (Thereupon, the meeting was adjourned
22 at 8:30 p.m.)

23

24

25

143

1 C E R T I F I C A T E

2

3 STATE OF FLORIDA:

4 SS.

5 COUNTY OF MIAMI-DADE:

6

7 I, JOAN L. BAILEY, Registered Diplomate
8 Reporter, Florida Professional Reporter, and a
9 Notary Public for the State of Florida at Large, do
10 hereby certify that I was authorized to and did
11 stenographically report the foregoing proceedings
12 and that the transcript is a true and complete
13 record of my stenographic notes.

14

15 I, JOAN L. BAILEY, a Notary Public in and
16 for the State of Florida at large, do hereby certify
17 that all witnesses were duly sworn by me.

18

19 DATED this 19th day of March, 2008.

20

21

22

23

24

25 Notary Commission Number DD 64037
Expiration June 14, 2011.

JOAN L. BAILEY, RDR, FPR

2008

PETITION/ NOTICE OF SUPPORT

FOR AN ORDINANCE EXTENDING A PILOT PROGRAM FOR METAL ROOFS IN CORAL GABLES, FLORIDA

We, the undersigned, are residents of the City of Coral Gables and wish to inform the city's Planning & Zoning Board, Board of Architects and City Commission of our support for an ordinance amending the Zoning Code to extend the pilot program for metal roofs on single family homes, which was previously approved for those areas to the south of US1/South Dixie Highway, to those areas of the City north of US1/South Dixie Highway. Such pilot program would include the appropriate review by the City of Coral Gables Board of Architects in order to protect the character of historic homes and neighborhoods.

Name	Address	Date
Karina Borge	1131 Sunset Rd, 33143	03/08/08
Hamlet Rodriguez	6900 Mentore St, 33146	03/09/08 -
Ann Barnett	1140 S Alhambra Cir 33146	03/10/08
Stephen Dupont	6911 Gratian St	03/09/08
Carlos R. Murciano	1177 Sunset Road 33143	3/09/08
Silvianne Scorsello	1170 S. Alhambra Cir	3/10/08
Robert & Karina Smith	1141 Sunset Rd. 33143	3/12/08

Planning & Zoning Board Meeting Attendance/Speaker Sign In Sheet – March 12, 2008

Name	Mailing Address	Phone	(If you wish to be a speaker, please check the appropriate box)
MARY ANDERSON	1526 TREVINO AVE 66, FL 33134	305-661-4320	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
MARIO PORTUONDO	1524 MANTUA	305-778-9384	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
ROBERT Ruiz	7429 SW. 105 PLACE, MIAMI, FL. 33173	(305) 273-1252	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
Sacha Smith	700 Biltmore Way #408 Corral Gables, FL	(305) 321-3662	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
Maria Swill	1141 Sunset Rd C. G. 33143	305 6627340	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
MANUEL MENDOZA	3305 AUSTIN BLVD CORAL GABLES	305 609-6388	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
Sue KAWALERSKI	6830 GRATIAN ST	305 978-2233	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)

Planning & Zoning Board Meeting Attendance/Speaker Sign In Sheet – March 12, 2008

	Name	Mailing Address	Phone	(If you wish to be a speaker, please check the appropriate box)
1.	RAY AILAN	1252 OBISPO AVE	305-3425206	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) (14) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
2.	PATRICK VALENTI, PA	4533 PONCE DE LEON BLVD. E.G.	(705) 740-5442	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
3.	CHARLES GIRTMAN	744 TIBBAGO A	305 661-5614	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) (5) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
4.	Robert Fine	360 S. Lewis Road	305 665-8055	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) (6) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
5.	TED RICKEL	1530 BARACUA AVE CO. FL. 331461910	7862/82000	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) (7) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
6.	Luis PEVELIA	1417 SANTA CROZALE CO.	305-778-9344	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) (8) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
7.	ZEKE GUILVERD	8222 PONCE DE LEON BLVD	305-446-8411	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)

(2)

Planning & Zoning Board Meeting Attendance/Speaker Sign In Sheet – March 12, 2008

Name	Mailing Address	Phone	(If you wish to be a speaker, please check the appropriate box)
1. THOMAS MOONEY	PO BOX 141537 Coral Gables, FL 33114	305-448-9180	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
2. MARIA ANDERSON		305 443 7026	<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
3. Laura Russo			<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
4.			<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
5.			<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
6.			<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)
7.			<input type="checkbox"/> Item # 5 (Gables Gateway) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – David William) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 7 (ZC Text Amendment - Demolition) <input type="checkbox"/> Item # 6 (ZC Text Amendment – Metal Roof)

3