



The City of Coral Gables

Historical Resources Department

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 20, 2015, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	S	O	N	D	J	F	M	A	M	J	J	A	APPOINTED BY:
	14	14	14	14	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	
Janice Thomson*												P	Mayor Jim Cason
Venny Torre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Vice Mayor Frank C. Quesada
Elizabeth Ghia*												P	Commissioner Jeannett Slesnick
Alejandro Silva	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Commissioner Patricia Keon
Alexander Adams*												P	Commissioner Vince Lago
John Fullerton*							E	P	A	P	P	P	Historic Preservation Board
Robert Parsley	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Manager
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission
Judy Pruitt	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission

LEGEND: A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; * = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member; - = No Meeting

STAFF:

- Dona Spain, Historic Preservation Officer
- Kara N. Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
- Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant, Historical Resources Department
- Craig Leen, City Attorney
- Ernesto Pino, Assistant Public Works Director

GUESTS: Osmundo Martinez, ElizaBeth Guin, Jose Diaz, Grettel Duran, Bert Leon, Nestor Vega, Javier Torres, Jennifer Goldstein, Kathrina Saladrigas, Carlos M. Perez, P.E.

RECORDING AND PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Torre at 4:04 p.m. A quorum was present.

MINUTES: MEETING OF JULY 16, 2015:

A motion to approve the minutes of the July 16, 2015 meeting was made by Mr. Silva, seconded by Ms. MacIntyre and unanimously approved by voice vote.

Mr. Parsley arrived at 4:06

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Mr. Torre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex-parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 20, 2015

Continued

AGENDA CHANGE: Ms. Spain reported that Case File LHD 2015-04 (927 Valencia Avenue) was, by mutual consent, again continued. Staff is coordinating efforts with the owners.

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan, Notary Public, administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATIONS:

CASE FILE LHD 2015-06:

Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 1511 Ferdinand Street, legally described as Lot 20, Block 68, Coral Gables Granada Section, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 113 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

As Ms. Kautz reviewed the property location, history, architecture, alterations, ownership and criteria for historic designation eligibility, she conducted a visual presentation, displaying current and historic photographs. Thereafter, she stated that the structure retained the majority of its historical integrity, and said staff recommended approval of local historic designation. Although the owner was not at the meeting, Ms. Kautz said the application was owner requested.

Mr. Torre observed that the original design appeared hindered by the addition. During discussion, Ms. Kautz advised that the owner had submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness application for restorative work, which was currently being reviewed by staff.

Confirming no audience requests for additional comment, Mr. Torre closed the public hearing.

Ms. MacIntyre called attention to an anonymous, handwritten note written August 13, 2015 on the City's Notice of Public Hearing and received in staff mail, which reads as follows: "I went by this property. It is not up to par, rather in poor condition. I would not give it a 'historical designation' unless there is a serious plan by the petitioner to restore this property to its deserved elegance. I have lived in my same house in Coral Gables for over 40 years."

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve local historic designation of the property at 1511 Ferdinand Street. The motion was seconded by Mr. Parsley.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Silva, Mr. Adams, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

STANDARD CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (ST) 2015-095:

An application for the issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness for the Coral Gables Merrick House located at 907 Coral Way, a Local Historic Landmark, listed in the National Register of Historic Places, and a contributing resource within the "Coral Way Historic District," legally described as Lot 10 LESS the West 80.00 feet of the North 125.00 feet, and LESS the South 175.00 feet of the West 84.45 feet, Peacock Re-Subdivision of Block 35, Coral Gables Section "B," according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 35, at Page 60, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for the restoration of the property.

As a visual of Merrick House's location was displayed, Ms. Kautz advised that the application was for design approval for restoration of the entire property (main house, auxiliary structure and grounds), and said the M.C. Harry & Associates' Letter of Intent summarized the proposed project.

Javier Torres, M.C. Harry & Associates, reviewed property photographs and reiterated that the firm's July 2, 2015 letter of intent would be used as a basis for the presentation. He comprehensively reviewed the condition of all areas of the

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 20, 2015

Continued

property and plans for restoring / replacing / repairing each area as appropriate. Mr. Torres said the main changes inside the house were mechanical issues, and pointed out areas of the property that would be made Code and ADA compliant.

Mr. Pino overviewed the planned construction schedule, stating that the project contractor should be on board by the end of this year. Construction should begin shortly thereafter, with completion anticipated six to seven months after starting.

Summary of comments / suggestions:

- The Historical Resources Department has received a special category grant for \$350,000 for the restoration project from the State of Florida, Division of Historical Resources. Included in the restoration budget is the removal and storage of all furnishings, artwork and artifacts in Merrick House until the project is completed.
- The grotto is not part of the proposed project work.
- The original windows will be restored and made operational by an expert in the field (Jody Rubin). The glass will not be hurricane impact glass.
- Staff will be involved in all materials selections and colors.
- Hand railings on the front steps of Merrick House would not be historically correct, but are ADA and elder appropriate.
- Regarding the gable on the front of the house, The Villagers' logo is a gable. Ms. MacIntyre advised that the organization will celebrate its 50th anniversary next year and is seeking projects to fund. One considered project is funding the cost of restoring the gable.
- Regarding parking lot lighting, minimum required lighting with full cutoff fixtures and an awareness of light temperature was recommended as existing residents primarily have incandescent outdoor lighting. Ensure that all site lighting matches as well as new bollards. LED bulbs are recommended, shielding light from existing residences.
- Regarding the ramp replacement and replication of the wrought iron rail, if a grip rail is required, use care in detailing to avoid a "clunky" appearance.
- Regarding air conditioning, a suggestion was made to consider additional de-humidification.
- All stair hand railings should be the same design, including a front porch hand railing, if approved.
- The small plaque to the right of the front porch steps on the ground should be completely visible.
- Although landscaping was excluded from the project, the Public Service Director, a horticulturist and landscape architect, will restore the grounds according to the original vegetation description.
- Additional research will be done to optimize hurricane protection for the windows.

Ms. MacIntyre made a motion to approve issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness for the Coral Gables Merrick House at 907 Coral Way, and to approve the design for the restoration of the property. Mr. Fullerton seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Mr. Adams, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2014-006:

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1100 Coral Way, a contributing resource within the "Coral Way Historic District," legally described as Lots 10 and 11, Block 18, Coral Gables Section "A," according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 102 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for an addition and alterations to the residence.

After relaying that Coral Way was designated as a district in February 2014, Ms. Kautz stated that this property was a contributing structure within the district because the primary facades had not been changed substantially over the years. She said the architects would thoroughly review project details, adding that they were requesting interior and exterior alterations and an addition of a master bathroom in the rear of the house. After describing exterior alterations, Ms. Kautz

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 20, 2015

Continued

called attention to written staff comments, most of which were related to the drawing and orientation of the windows. She added that the owner was working to correct all issues and was cooperating with staff to resolve them.

Architect Jose Diaz comprehensively reviewed interior and exterior alterations, the addition, the existing and proposed site plans, fencing, columns and driveway. He concluded that he was aware of all staff recommendations and was in agreement.

Regarding staff recommendations, Mr. Silva clarified that Mr. Diaz' agreed with all of them. Regarding the fence, Mr. Silva requested additional information. Ms. Kautz explained circumstances of the original drawings; however, the current drawings show five foot high columns with four foot six inch aluminum fencing. Mr. Silva suggested consideration of a curve to the driveway.

Regarding the proposed driveway, Mr. Adams questioned whether or not a driveway to Cordova Street was needed, and instead suggested a circular driveway. Mr. Martinez (homeowner) reviewed his reasons for preferring a driveway to Cordova Street. Mr. Adams emphasized leaving sufficient distance between the driveway and Coral Way. Ms. Kautz advised that plans would be reviewed by Public Works when the applicant went through the permitting process.

Mr. Torre brought up the angle visibility of the gates and suggested that portion of the project may need to come back to the Board for review. As discussion continued, Mr. Leen advised the Board to provide guidance about these issues, and to give staff the administrative authority to manage implementation.

Mr. Torre invited additional comment from the audience. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Mr. Adams made a motion to approve the design for an addition and alterations to the residence on the property at 1100 Coral Way, including all staff conditions as well as the condition that Public Works, Zoning and other applicable City departments ensure that the dimensions and site angles work well. Mr. Fullerton seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva, Mr. Adams, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

Ms. Kautz advised that, subsequent to the application, the owner requested changing the roof tile color to gray. Mr. Torre recommended addressing the issue at the next Board meeting.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2015-007:

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 936 Castile Avenue, a contributing resource within the "Castile Avenue / Plaza Historic District," legally described as Lot 8, Peacock Re-Subdivision, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 35, at Page 60 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The application requests design approval for an addition and alterations to the residence.

Ms. Kautz displayed a property location photograph, reviewed the property's history, architecture and alterations, and said the alterations did not interfere with historical integrity. She reviewed the proposal, said there were no variances requested and informed the Board that the Board of Architects reviewed and approved the proposal with the comment that the applicant study adding windows to the proposed east elevation of the garage structure, which she advised had been addressed.

Architect Bert Leon introduced homeowner Kathrina Saladrigas, as well as his architectural partner, Nester Vega. He described the project and its three components: 1) to restore the maintenance to its original condition; 2) to reconfigure some of the bedrooms and work previously done in these areas; 3) the addition and upgrading of the structure over the existing garage. He reviewed addition features previously constructed in the structure, many without permits, and said the current owners wanted to rectify those issues. Mr. Leon described plans for the restoration and alteration work throughout the property.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 20, 2015

Continued

Ms. Kautz and Ms. Spain spoke positively about the house, said there were a few windows that should be checked to ensure they were casement, but added that would be addressed when the project went to permitting. Regarding the wood picket grill detail, Ms. Kautz said the remaining existing wood picket grill should serve as a model in the design of replacement pieces and should be approved by staff prior to fabrication.

At the conclusion of the presentation, Mr. Torre invited members of the audience to comment. Hearing no requests, he closed the public hearing.

During Board discussion, Mr. Adams clarified information about the parapet roof and coping, and also referred to the four windows across the front elevation on the original plans, commenting that one in the current front elevation appeared lower. Ms. Saladrigas and Mr. Leon explained the feature and said their intention was to restore what currently appears as a small balcony design to a replication of originally designed window.

Mr. Torre expressed a desire for distinction in the addition, suggesting it might make a distinction if the barrel tile were removed from the garage top.

Mr. Parsley commented about a downspout through the shutter and asked how it would work. The architect said it had to be moved. Ms. Kautz observed that it was a scupper, not a downspout.

Ms. Ghia questioned the history about the decorative ironwork shown on the plans. Mr. Leon said it was not original to the house, and Ms. Saladrigas said the designs were created by a previous owner's wife.

Mr. Torre invited audience comment. Ms. Saladrigas asked, for purposes of permitting, if the decision about the roof alteration on the addition could be left to the discretion of staff since her husband was unable to attend this meeting and she wanted to give him an opportunity for input.

Mr. Parsley made a motion to approve the design proposal as presented for the property at 936 Castile Avenue without the barrel tile coping on the garage parapet to distinguish the addition from the existing structure; and for issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Silva, Mr. Adams, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

Mr. Silva left the meeting at 5:45 p.m.

AD VALOREM TAX ABATEMENT:

CASE FILE AV 2013-002:

An application requesting ad valorem tax relief for the property at 1203 Asturia Avenue, a local historic landmark, legally described as Lots 17 and 18, Block 5, Coral Gables Section "E," according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8 at Page 13 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The related Special Certificate of Appropriateness, COA (SP) 2012-10, was granted design approval on September 20, 2012 by the Historic Preservation Board. Standard Certificate of Appropriateness COA (ST) 2014-094 was granted design approval on August 20, 2014 by the Historical Resources Department.

As Ms. Kautz displayed historic and current photographs of the house, she reviewed its history and alterations made over the years. She explained that when the previous owner took over the property, it was in process of being gutted; however, the project stopped and did not move forward until Mr. Goldstein purchased the property. Displaying before and after photographs of the restoration project, she detailed work performed in the restoration. Ms. Kautz concluded her presentation by stating that staff recommended approval of the project and said Mr. Goldstein was present at the meeting.

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 20, 2015

Continued

Mr. Torre invited members of the audience to speak. Hearing no requests, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. Pruitt made a motion to recommend approval of ad valorem tax relief for the property at 1203 Asturia Avenue. Ms. MacIntyre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Adams, Ms. Thomson, Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Fullerton, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Torre. Nays: None.

BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE:

Coral Gables Elementary School Windows:

Mr. Leen reported that a meeting was scheduled August 21st with School Board and District staff, adding that the City continued to stand by its position. He commended Ms. Spain for her efforts to ensure that the removed window openings were boarded up to secure the property and limit deterioration. Regarding the Board resolution about the windows, Mr. Leen said staff prepared it and the resolution was currently in his office.

August 25, 2015 Commission Meeting:

Ms. Spain said the Commission would consider ad valorem tax relief for 814 Coral Way at its August 25th meeting. During the same meeting, she said it was possible the Commission would also vote on the Commission-as-a-Whole Board member since Ms. MacIntyre's term of Board service ended.

ITEMS FROM THE SECRETARY:

Note received from Mayor Thomson:

Ms. Spain read a note of gratitude written to the Board and staff by Mayor Thomson in appreciation for the plaque presented to her for her eight years of Board service.

Proposed Procedural Workshop:

When the Board is fully constituted, Ms. Spain suggested conducting a workshop to review procedures.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting adjourned at 5:57 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Dona M. Spain
Historic Preservation Officer