



**CORALGABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD**

Thursday, October 20, 2016 Meeting, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida 33134

MEMBERS		N	D	J	F	M	A	M	J	J	A	S+	S	O	APPOINTED BY:
		15	15	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	16	
<i>Historical Resources &amp; Cultural Arts</i>	Janice Thomson	P	E	P#	P	P	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	E	Mayor Jim Cason
	Venny Torre	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	E	Vice-Mayor Frank Quesada
	Elizabeth Ghia	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	E	-	E	E	P	Comm. Jeannett Slesnick
	Alejandro Silva	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	-	P	P	P	Comm. Patricia Keon
2327 SALZEDO STREET	Alicia Bache-Wiig*										-			P	Comm. Vince Lago
CORAL GABLES	John Fullerton	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	-	E	P	E	Board-as-a-Whole
FLORIDA 33134	Robert Parsley	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	P	City Manager
	Margaret Rolando	P	P	P	E	E	P	P	P	P	-	P	E	P	City Commission
	Albert Menendez	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	-	P	P	P	City Commission

☎ 305.460.5093

✉ hist@coralgables.com

**LEGEND:** A = Absent; P = Present; E = Excused; \* = New Member; ^ = Resigned Member; - = No Meeting (lack of quorum); # = Late meeting arrival; S+ = Replacement August 2016 meeting

**STAFF:**

- Dona M. Spain, Historic Preservation Officer
- Kara N. Kautz, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
- ElizaBeth Guin, Historic Preservationist
- Yesenia Diaz, Administrative Assistant
- Miriam Ramos, Deputy City Attorney
- Cristina Suarez, Assistant City Attorney

**GUESTS:** Paula Schimpf, Paul Reinerman, Eric Reinerman, Eric and Neva Hiller, Megan Pimentel, Marshall Bellin, Elizabeth Camargo

**RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES:** Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Vice Chair Silva at 4:03 p.m. A quorum was present.

**MINUTES: MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 6, 2016:**

Mr. Parsley made a motion to approve the minutes of the September 6, 2016 Board meeting as written. Mr. Menendez seconded the motion, unanimously approved by voice vote.

**MINUTES: MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 15, 2016:**

Mr. Menendez made a motion to approve the minutes of the September 15, 2016 Board meeting as written. Mr. Parsley seconded the motion, unanimously approved by voice vote.

**DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:**

Mr. Silva read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. Board members who had ex-parte communication or contact regarding cases being heard were instructed to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

**DEFERRAL:** Ms. Spain announced the deferral of Case File LHD 2016-012, 2806 Granada Boulevard.

**PUBLIC SWEARING IN:** Nancy Morgan administered the public swearing in for those testifying during the meeting.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Mr. Menendez made a motion to excuse the meeting absence of Mr. Fullerton. Ms. Ghia seconded the motion, unanimously approved by voice vote. Mr. Menendez made a motion to excuse the meeting absence of Mr. Torre. Ms. Ghia seconded the motion, unanimously approved by voice vote. Ms. Ghia made a motion to excuse the meeting absence of Ms. Thomson. Mr. Menendez seconded the motion, unanimously approved by voice vote.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATION:

Stating that Ms. Rolando's presence at the meeting was anticipated, Ms. Spain advised that five Board member votes were necessary to carry any motion.

CASE FILE LHD 2016-014 AND COA (SP) 2016-028: Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 1224 Granada Boulevard, legally described as Lot 14, Block 4-F, Coral Gables Riviera Section Revised, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 113 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant also requested issuance of an Accelerated Special Certificate of Appropriateness and design approval for an addition to the residence. Variances were also requested from Article 4, Section 4-101 (D) (8) and Article 4, Section 4-101 (D) (9) of the Coral Gables Zoning Code for allowable lot coverage and maximum floor area ratio.

While conducting a visual presentation, Ms. Kautz comprehensively reviewed the property, its location, historic and current photographs, history, architects and architecture, criteria for designation and home ownership record (all as presented in staff's written report).

Ms. Rolando arrived during the presentation at 4:21 p.m. She advised that she had reviewed the staff report prior to the meeting.

Ms. Kautz' presentation continued, and concluded with her statement that staff recommended a motion to approve Local Historic Designation of the property at 1224 Granada Boulevard based on its historical significance. She advised that the owners, Paul Reinerman and Paula Schimpf were present.

Ms. Silva invited Board questions for staff and audience comments. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve Local Historic Designation of the property at 1224 Granada Boulevard. Ms. Ghia seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Parsley, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Mr. Silva, Ms. Rolando. Nays: None.

Regarding the application for a Special Certificate of Appropriateness, Ms. Kautz advised that the applicant was requesting the certificate for additions to the property, and said two variances were also requested. She said the owner/applicant would conduct a PowerPoint presentation, after which Ms. Kautz would discuss the requested variances.

Mr. Reinerman relayed that he and his wife had owned the property since 1987, adding that this project was undertaken to make their home more livable. As photographs and drawings were displayed, he described project details, including a walk-in closet/safe room. At the conclusion of his review, he invited Board questions, adding that the Board of Architects approved the design.

Ms. Kautz reviewed the variances requested in conjunction with the proposal, detailing them as they were written in the staff report. The first variance was for ground area coverage and the second for floor area ratio. Ms. Kautz concluded by explaining staff's review of the facts and their support of both variances. She added that the owners agreed to execute a covenant that the screened porch would remain a screened porch and would not be enclosed.

Mr. Silva invited additional audience input. Hearing no requests to comment, he closed the public hearing and called for Board discussion.

Ms. Rolando observed that the project's variance requests appeared driven by the unusual size and oddly-shaped Coral Gables lot. Mr. Silva agreed, adding also that the addition to the historic home as shown in the south elevation appeared to be seamless with the existing house. He recommended adding a simple score line, recess or other differentiation between the addition and the historic residence and suggested the applicant work out the details with staff.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve granting a variance to allow the residence at 1224 Granada Boulevard to have a maximum ground area coverage for a principal building of approximately 2,395 square feet (37.7% of the lot) vs. 2,222 square feet (35% of the lot) as required by Article 4, Section 4-101 (D) 8 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code. Mr. Menendez seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Ghia, Mr. Parsley, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Menendez, Mr. Silva. Nays: None.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve granting a variance to allow the residence at 1224 Granada Boulevard to have a maximum floor area ratio of approximately 2,880 square feet vs. 2,872 square feet as required by Article 4, Section 4-101 (D) 9 of the Coral Gables Zoning Code. Mr. Menendez seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Parsley, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Silva. Nays: None.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the design proposal for additions and alterations to the existing residence at 1224 Granada Boulevard with the modification recommended by Mr. Silva regarding a score line or other differentiation between the new construction and the historic residence as acceptable to staff; and to approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Menendez seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Parsley, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Silva. Nays: None.

CASE FILE LHD 2016-016 AND COA (SP) 2016-023: Consideration of a revision to the Local Historic Designation Report of the property at 900 El Rado Street, a Local Historic Landmark, legally described as Lots 55 through 57, Tamiami Place Plan 2, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 6, at Page 89, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The revision is to correct the legal / boundary description of the property. The applicant also requested issuance of an Accelerated Special Certificate of Appropriateness and design approval for an addition and alterations to the residence and sitework.

Ms. Kautz stated that the property was designated as a Local Historic Landmark in 1990. In the original designation report, the legal description of the site was listed as only Lots 55 and 56. Although the property owners at the time of designation owned Lot 57, it was excluded from the legal description found within the designation report. This application was for a revision to the original designation report to include Lot 57 in the legal/boundary description of the property. She said the current owners are planning an addition on Lot 57, and it needs to be brought into the designation report to help them move forward.

Mr. Silva invited comment from the audience. Hearing no requests, he closed the public hearing.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve a modification to the 1990 Local Historic Designation of 900 El Rado Street to modify the original local historic designation to include Lot 57 along with Lots 55 and 56. Mr. Menendez seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Parsley, Ms. Bache-Wiig, Ms. Rolando, Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Silva. Nays: None.

Regarding the application for a Special Certificate of Appropriateness, Ms. Kautz overviewed the proposed design. She said variances were not requested, and added that the Board of Architects gave preliminary approval of the proposal in May 2016 with the following notations:

- Study the connection between the existing residence and the new addition through the garage, which Ms. Kautz said was addressed by the applicant;
- The double doors leading from the exterior into the “great room” should be a single arched door;
- Reduce the window sizes at “laundry room” and “bath 3”; also addressed by applicant.

Architect Bellin comprehensively reviewed the proposal and displayed photographs, floor plans, existing house elevations and those for the addition, concluding by inviting Board questions and comments.

- Mr. Silva discussed staff and Board of Architects’ conditions regarding a two-foot reduction in the height of the new addition and indicated his agreement. Ms. Kautz explained how the height affected the roof line and proportionality between the new addition and existing house. Mr. Bellin said lowering the height would cause a head room problem. They considered options, finally agreeing that Mr. Bellin and staff would work out a compromise.
- Mr. Bellin agreed to change the design of the door to a single arched door; stating, however, his preference for a double door. Ms. Kautz said a double door could read as a front door, though Mr. Silva opined that the addition with the double door was significantly set back.
- Ms. Kautz expressed the possibility that the terrace size might be slightly reduced in consideration of the existing oak tree. She added that Public Service reviewed trees on the property and said the Gumbo Limbo could be removed due to its impact on the oak tree. Mr. Parsley advised about tree needs, especially during construction, and suggested an at-grade footing tie beam rather than excavating and cutting into the root system.
- Regarding the barbecue grill area, Mr. Parsley suggested adding a low seating wall that opens to the yard, reducing the front door appearance of the double door and also providing more privacy.
- Ms. Rolando expressed concern about the garage situated in the middle of the house as well as the connection between the addition and the existing house that is accessible through the garage. Mr. Bellin said the owner intended to use the garage as functionally intended, and added that the addition would be used as in-law quarters.

Mr. Silva invited additional comment from the audience. Hearing no requests to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Mr. Parsley made a motion to approve the design as presented for 900 El Rado Street with minor modifications as discussed to the barbecue area front façade, disguising the impact of the double doors on the addition as discussed, and leaving the height of the ceiling as proposed; and to also approve issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Menendez seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Bache-Wiig, Mr. Menendez, Ms. Ghia, Mr. Parsley, Mr. Silva. Nays: Ms. Rolando.

#### DISCUSSION ITEM:

Discussion regarding the auxiliary structure at 1264 Coral Way, legally described as Lots 1 and 2, Block 1, Revised Plat of Coral Gables Section “D,” according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 25, at Page 74, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Kautz stated staff’s decision to seek the Board’s opinion regarding the garage on the property. As she displayed the property location and pointed out the detached one-story garage, she explained that it had been added to over the years. The property owners’ architect consulted staff to discuss a proposed addition to the property that hinged on removing the garage. While displaying photographs, Ms. Kautz oriented the Board to the property, adding that the garage was original, but had been altered. She said that additions to it could be removed, leaving the original form. Ms. Spain interjected that, independent of the Board’s opinion about this issue, the applicants would need to return to the Board for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition to the house. After Ms. Kautz responded to Board questions, she asked the Board to consider if it was necessary to retain the garage.

Ms. Hiller explained their concern about the retaining the garage, stating they wanted to make the house more livable for their family of five. She said they wanted to construct an addition to the house to alleviate the family's crowded conditions, adding that the garage had few redeeming inside qualities and needed an "overhaul." She advised that they wanted to demolish the building to construct an addition to the house to accommodate their family's needs.

Architect Camargo addressed the Board, adding to previous testimony and stating that the only way to provide additional space for the family would be to add a second story over the garage; however, the current garage structure was in very poor condition, and reinforcing it to build a second story above would be impossible. She voiced their intention to retain the historic character of the residence, adding that the proposed new garage and second story would conform more with the original house.

Mr. Silva said it made sense to allow the garage to be removed, and indicated favor for allowing demolition of the garage. Ms. Rolando said she was most interested in ensuring that the massing of the addition wouldn't overwhelm or overshadow the original residence. She stated a preference for a sensitive addition was appropriate for the structure. Mr. Silva added that in exchange for allowing the structure to be demolished, he would ask that the architect and owners respect the original residence. Ms. Ghia said she saw the proposed project as an opportunity to clean up work done in the past and create a design more in keeping with the historic nature of the house. Mr. Menendez agreed with Mr. Silva's remarks and said he was in favor of allowing demolition of the small building. Ms. Bache-Wiig agreed with previous comments about being sensitive with the addition, and Mr. Parsley expressed agreement with all Board comments.

Ms. Spain voiced appreciation to the Board for their thoughtful consideration and for giving valuable input to staff.

NEW BUSINESS:

Ms. Spain welcomed Ms. Bache-Wiig to the Board and described her background. Board members had previously been received a copy of Ms. Bache-Wiig's CV.

Next Board Meeting: Thursday, November 10, 2016, 4:00 p.m.

ADJOURNMENT: There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting adjourned at 5:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Dona M. Spain  
Historic Preservation Officer