

## **CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES**

**Thursday, March 18, 2010, 4:00 p.m.**

**City Commission Chambers**

**405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida**

<b>MEMBERS:</b>	<b>A</b>	<b>M</b>	<b>J</b>	<b>J</b>	<b>A</b>	<b>S</b>	<b>O</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>D</b>	<b>J</b>	<b>F</b>	<b>M</b>	<b>APPOINTED BY:</b>
Dorothy Thomson	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
Margaret Rolando	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P+	P	E	P	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Ernesto Santos	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P-	P-	P	P	P	Comm. Maria Anderson
Venny Torre	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P-	P	P	E	Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P-	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
Richard Heisenbottle*				P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	Historic Preservation Board
Deborah Tackett*												P	City Manager
Gay Bondurant*			P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission
Sharon Langer*					P	E	P	P	P	E	P	P	City Commission

+ Ms. Rolando recused herself from discussion of one application at the special February meeting, and two applications at the December meeting.

- Ms. MacIntyre arrived at 6:53 p.m. (August); Mr. Santos arrived at 4:50 p.m. (November); Mr. Torre arrived at 5:40 p.m.; Mr. Santos and Ms. Bondurant departed at approximately 6:00 p.m. (December).

### **STAFF:**

Kara Kautz, Historic Resources Officer

Ricardo Herran, Historical Resources Assistant

**A = Absent**

**P = Present**

**E = Excused**

**\* = New Member**

**^ = Resigned Member**

---

**GUESTS:** Marta Hutson, Mary Lou Lewis, Steve M (Pierce Roofing), James J. Hutson, Nelson de Leon, Sergio R. Artigues, Rafael Portuondo, Burton Hersh

**RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES:** Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

---

The meeting was called to order by Chair Dolly MacIntyre at 4:05 p.m. A quorum was present.

### **DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:**

Ms. MacIntyre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. She then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

### **MEETING ATTENDANCE:**

**Ms. Langer made a motion to excuse the absence of Mr. Torre. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.**

### **MINUTES: MEETING OF FEBRUARY 18, 2010:**

**Ms. Langer made a motion to approve the minutes of the meeting of February 18, 2010 as written. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.**

**DEFERRALS:** None.

**PUBLIC SWEARING IN:** Nancy Morgan swore in audience members who planned to testify during the meeting.

**SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:**

**CASE FILE COA (SP) 2010-02:** An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **5133 Riviera Drive**, a contributing structure within the “Chinese Village Historic District,” legally described as Lots 13 and S ½ of Lot 12, Block 100, Coral Gables Riviera Section 2, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 28, Page 18, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the construction of an auxiliary structure. A variance was also requested to allow the property to exceed the maximum square foot floor area allowed by the Coral Gables Zoning Code.

As a photographic tour of the Chinese Village was conducted, Ms. Kautz said the subject property was a contributing structure within the district. She described the variance request for a garage addition and reviewed plans for the proposed structure. Rather than removing original historic features, Ms. Kautz advised that the owners wanted to provide a new structure for parking elsewhere on the property. She said staff did not find the location problematic, but found it difficult to justify the requested square footage for the structure.

Dr. Hutson conducted a presentation featuring his home renovations and a comparison between his existing garage doors and those of neighbors. He cited a major factor for the size of the proposed garage as the necessity to store aluminum hurricane shutters for 48 doors and windows on the property, currently stored offsite.

Architect de Leon described their research, the proposed garage, its multiple functions (vehicles plus storage for hurricane shutters) and the design developed to be harmonious with the house.

Ms. MacIntyre invited other audience members to speak. Hearing no requests, she closed the public hearing.

Ms. Kautz stated approval of the design aesthetics, but called attention to an issue with Code language regarding variance requirements, acknowledging that conditions exist that weren’t addressed by Code language.

**Ms. Langer made a motion to approve a variance as proposed. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.**

Board discussion focused on garage door width, garage door type, interior calculations, the wall that would be demolished for the new structure and hurricane shutter storage needs.

**Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Langer, Ms. Tackett, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.**

**Ms. Langer made a motion to approve the Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the design of the auxiliary structure. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.**

**Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Langer, Ms. Tackett, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.**

**CASE FILE COA (SP) 2010-03:** An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **1021 Alhambra Circle**, a contributing structure within the “Alhambra Circle Historic District”, legally described as Lots 15, 16 & E ½ of Lot 17, Block 3, Coral Gables Section “C”, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 26, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested approval for a variance from the Coral

Gables Zoning Code to allow a six-foot high hedge to serve as pool screening in lieu of a required four-foot high wall. Design approval for an addition and alterations were approved by the Historic Preservation Board on May 7, 2009.

Ms. Kautz said the applicants requested a variance that would allow a six-foot high hedge to screen a pool from street view as required by Code (a four-foot wall is required). She displayed original plans and photographs of the house, showing the wall on site, and explained that Code requires screening when a pool is visible from street frontage. Stating that the proposed hedge would be tied by covenant to the land, Ms. Kautz added that the variance was justifiable and that staff recommended approval.

Mr. Portuondo described the four-foot wall they built to progress the permitting process. Subsequently, it was decided to plant a six-foot hedge to screen the pool from visibility.

Ms. MacIntyre invited audience comments. No requests were made, so the public hearing was closed. A brief discussion was held about the existing wall. Mr. Portuondo agreed not to use ficus as hedge material.

**Ms. Bondurant made a motion to approve the variance with the covenant tying the hedge to the land. Mr. Heisenbottle seconded the motion.**

**Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Langer, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.**

**CASE FILE COA (SP) 2010-04:** An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **1321 North Greenway Drive**, a non-contributing structure within the “Country Club of Coral Gables Historic District,” legally described as Portion of Lot 14 desc. beg. SW corner of Lot 14, th NWLY AD 150 ft, NELY AD 35.38 FT, SELY AD 150 FT, SWLY AD 29 FT to POB & all of Lots 15 and 16, Block 15, Coral Gables Section “E,” as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 13 of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the construction of an addition and alterations to the property.

Ms. Kautz reviewed the background of the property, adding that it was a non-contributing structure within the district. Photographs, the site plan and the proposed addition were displayed as the architecture and details of the proposed addition were described. Ms. Kautz concluded that staff recommended approval of the application.

Architect Sergio Artigues, who designed and built the house in 1999, said the owners acquired a neighbor’s land where the addition would be built to link and complement the main house, and reviewed the design.

Ms. MacIntyre invited audience comments. Hearing no requests to speak, she closed the public hearing.

**Ms. Langer made a motion to approve the design as presented. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.**

**Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Tackett, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Langer, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.**

#### **AD VALOREM TAX RELIEF:**

**CASE FILE AV 2008-02:** An application requesting ad valorem tax relief for the property at **130 Miracle Mile**, a local historic landmark, legally described as Lots 14 and 15, Block 3, Coral Gables Crafts Section, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 10, at Page 40, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The related Certificate of Appropriateness – Case File COA (SP) 2006-23, was granted design approval on December 21, 2006 and July 19, 2007 by the Historic Preservation Board.

Ms. Kautz presented the property’s history, displayed drawings and photographs, reviewed renovation and restoration efforts. She concluded that staff recommended approval of the application for ad valorem tax relief.

Architect Burton Hersh first updated Board members on the status of the McFarlane district homes, which are complete and occupied. He lauded the Board for their design suggestions.

Mr. Hersh again thanked the Board for positive results achieved on this project. Ms. Thomson suggested adding a small sign containing the Baldwin name and history of the building, to which Mr. Hersh agreed.

**Ms. Thomson made a motion to approve the ad valorem tax relief application as presented. Ms. Langer seconded the motion.**

**Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Langer, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Santos, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.**

#### **STANDARD CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:**

**CASE FILE COA (ST) 2010-016:** An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **2003 Alhambra Circle**, a contributing structure within the “Alhambra Circle Historic District,” legally described as Lots 6 and 7, Block 14, Coral Gables Section E, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 13, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the installation of a new roof using clay “S” tiles.

While displaying original plans and photographs, Ms. Kautz explained that the original drawings, on both the addition and the original structure, showed two-piece, true barrel tile.

Ms. Lewis, the homeowner, said the previous roof tile was cement and no longer available. She selected Spanish S tile as it appeared to most closely resemble the previous tile. She also advised that the S tile was significantly more cost effective than true barrel tile.

Ms. Kautz stated staff’s recommendation that true barrel tile should be used.

Ms. MacIntyre invited audience comment. Hearing no further requests to speak, she closed the public hearing.

Mr. Heisenbottle supported staff’s recommendation, and suggested the owner explore the proper tile as recommended, and also advised that other tile manufacturers were more competitively priced.

Steve, Pierce Roofing, stated that the original roof tile was concrete panacap (sic), not clay tile. After discussion with the contractor, several Board members supported using tile shown on original drawings. Mr. Heisenbottle will provide a list of tile manufacturers to Ms. Kautz for the benefit of the applicant.

**Ms. Bondurant made a motion to defer a decision on this application to allow the applicant to conduct additional research on the availability of true barrel tile at a more reasonable price. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.**

**Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Tackett, Ms. Rolando, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: Ms. Langer, Mr. Santos.**

#### **BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE:**

##### **Election of Board Vice Chair:**

**Ms. Bondurant nominated Ms. Rolando to serve as Board Vice Chair. Ms. Rolando declined.**

**Ms. Thomson nominated Mr. Heisenbottle to serve as Board Vice Chair. Mr. Santos seconded the nomination, which passed unanimously by voice vote.**

**Joyce Meyers:** A letter will be sent to Ms. Meyers on behalf of the Board in recognition of her years of service.

**Pioneer Day:** Saturday, March 20, 2010, 10 a.m. Ms. Thomson pointed out that Harriet Liles, the featured speaker at the event, will receive a State of Florida award for her contributions to historic preservation.

**William Alexander Cooper Park:** Ms. Kautz reported that a park in the Golden Gate neighborhood was recently dedicated to William Alexander Cooper as a tribute to his years of community service.

**City Hall Windows and Coral Rock Walkway:** Ms. Kautz will provide an update at the next Board meeting.

**McFarlane District:** Ms. Kautz met with Habitat for Humanity, which is considering some housing projects in that area.

**Merrick House:** Ms. Kautz updated the Board on renovations and furniture reupholstery.

**1044 Coral Way:** This applicant requested deferral from the March agenda and will be on the April agenda.

**Coral Gables Historic Preservation Association:** A lecture by Arva Parks will be held March 28<sup>th</sup> from 5 to 7 p.m.

**Board Resignation:** Ms. Langer resigned from Board service and thanked members for the opportunity to serve.

**ADJOURNMENT:** 5:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz

Historic Preservation Officer