

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES

May 7, 2009, 4:00 p.m.

City Commission Chambers

405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	J	J	J#	A	S	O	N	D	J	F#	F	M	A	M	APPOINTED BY:
Dorothy Thomson	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
Margaret Rolando*								P	P	P+	P	P	P	P	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Ernesto Santos	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	A	E	P	P	P	Comm. Maria Anderson
Venny Torre*												P	P	P	Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
Michael Beeman	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	^	^	^	^	Historic Preservation Board
Joyce Meyers	P	E	E	P	P	E	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	P	City Manager
Lisa Bennett	P	E	E	P	P	E	E	P	P	A	P	P	P	P	City Commission
Shirley Maroon	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	A	P	P	P-	P	City Commission

+ Ms. Rolando recused herself from discussion.

- Ms. Maroon left the meeting at 7:00 p.m.

STAFF:

Kara Kautz, Historic Resources Officer

Betty Perez, Administrative Assistant

Rodney Carbonell, Historical Resources Department

A = Absent

P = Present

E = Excused

*** = New Member**

^ = Resigned Member

= Special Meeting

GUESTS: Armando Davica, Hector Hernandez, Omar Morales, Elizabeth Andrews, Alina Fallat-Lopez, Karen Nickless, Quentin Nason, Rafael Diaz, Douglas Zargham, William Hilton, Carmen Barrenechea, Rafael Portuondo, Debra and Allan Kolsky, Robin V. Burr, Leona H. Cooper, Burton Hersh, Laura Russo, Sally Sauer, Hernando Davila.

RECORDING SECRETARY: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Dolly MacIntyre at 4:05 p.m. A quorum was present.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Ms. MacIntyre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. She then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

MINUTES: MEETING OF APRIL 16, 2009:

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the minutes of the meeting of April 16, 2009. Ms. Meyers seconded the motion, unanimously approved by voice vote.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Ms. Maroon made a motion to excuse the meeting absence of Ms. Thomson. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion, which was unanimously approved by voice vote.

DEFERRALS:

Ms. Kautz announced deferral of the personal appearance of Architect Jorge Hernandez.

PUBLIC SWEARING IN:

Nancy Morgan swore in audience members who planned to testify during the meeting.

LOCAL HISTORIC LANDMARK DESIGNATION:

CASE FILE LHD 2009-01 Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 444 Ponce De Leon Boulevard, legally described as Lot 6, Block 14, Coral Gables Flagler Street Section, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 10, Page 12, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Ms. Kautz displayed current/historic photographs and plans as she described the property's history and architecture. As features were described, she said the owner was encouraged to consider replacing original design elements. Ms. Kautz concluded that staff recommended approval of the local historic designation based on architecture, and also reported receiving a petition from six neighbors who objected to the designation. The six petition signers were: Jose Lopez-Santos, Ana Maria Lopez-Ochoa, Clara M. Paez, Ciro B. Sosa, Sr., Ciro B. Sosa, Caridad Castillo.

Homeowner Alina Fallat-Lopez stated her desire to refurbish the property to as close to the original state as possible.

There being no further requests to speak, Ms. MacIntyre closed the public hearing and called for Board comments.

Ms. Bennett made a motion to approve the application for local historic designation for 444 Ponce de Leon Boulevard. Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bennett, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILES LHD 2009-03 AND COA (SP) 2009-07 Consideration of the local historic designation of the property at 313 Sarto Avenue, legally described as the Lots 29 to 31 Inc. & E 10 FT of Lot 32, Block 8, Coconut Grove Section 1, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 14, at Page 25, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is also requesting the issuance of an Accelerated Special Certificate of Appropriateness and design approval for the construction of additions and alterations. Variances have also been requested from Article 4, Section 4-101 (D) 4b for the minimum allowable setbacks and Article 5, Section 5-1409 (B) 1 for covered parking construction.

Ms. Kautz first addressed the historic designation, stating that the house was brought to staff's attention prior to the current owner's purchase, when it was listed for sale as a "tear-down" property. During her presentation, Ms. Kautz displayed property photographs and relayed its history, concluding that staff recommended approval of the local historic designation based on architecture. Project Architect Omar Morales added that the house was an excellent example of Mediterranean Revival architecture.

Robin Burr, a neighbor who lives behind the subject property, said the house was extremely close to her house and urged the Board not to approve any variance that would cause the house or any additions to be situated closer to her property. She said the house was in very poor condition.

Sally Sauer, neighbor to the east of the subject property, said the house was only six feet from her house, and confirmed that additions would not be added to the original structure on her side of the property. She also mentioned that the house was in very poor condition.

There being no further requests to speak, Ms. MacIntyre closed the public hearing.

Mr. Torre clarified that historic designation would not create hardship because of the setbacks for future owners. Ms. Kautz replied that the house, built in 1925, would not get any closer to the setbacks.

Ms. Bennett made a motion to approve the local historic designation of 313 Sarto Avenue. Ms. Meyers seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bennet, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

Regarding the application for an Accelerated Special COA, design approval for construction of alterations and additions, Ms. Kautz reviewed the project, describing requested alterations, an addition and a request for variances.

Mr. Morales, project architect, said they would maintain configuration of the property with the new addition, and would be moving the addition five feet further from the property line to meet with current rear setbacks. He described restoration plans, the addition, and said the house would be accentuated with lush landscaping and a small reflecting pond in the courtyard. He described the proposed trellis carport, pointing out that it represented a variance request, and responded to Board questions.

There being no further audience requests to speak, Ms. MacIntyre closed the public hearing.

Board discussion and comments:

- The architect was commended for his design and for presenting clear plans.
- It was suggested that an interesting feature be added to the large blank wall on the north elevation. The architect said the owners wanted the blank wall for privacy.
- A suitable option for the blank wall would be mandatory landscaping to soften the effect.
- Concern was expressed about parking since the garage would be substituted by a transparent structure (trellised carport).
- A porte-cochere would be a more appropriate parking solution than the proposed trellised carport. Two members expressed support of the trellised carport.
- The architect said the proposed trellised carport was a heavy wood structure, structurally sound and meeting all requirements of uplift, anchoring and framing.

Ms. Kautz described three requested variances, adding that staff recommended approval of all three: 1) to allow the property to maintain an existing setback of 3 feet from the east property line; 2) to allow the property to have an overall side setback of approximately 12 feet, 6 inches; 3) to allow the property to use a trellised carport to satisfy the single family parking requirement.

Ms. Kautz asked the Board to address the following issues:

- Drawings indicate a Spanish “S” tile roof. Staff recommends a true barrel tile roof.
- Details for the fountain and paving materials need to be submitted for an additional COA when they are selected.
- The proposed glass block window in the new master bedroom should be a different window type, such as a fixed window with opaque glass.

With these conditions, Ms. Kautz said staff recommended approval of the design and variances.

Ms. Bennett made a motion to approve the variance regarding the trellised carport. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bennett, Ms. Maroon, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: Mr. Santos.

Ms. Bennett made a motion to approve the variance to maintain the existing setback of 3 feet from the east property line. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Meyers, Ms. Bennett, Ms. Maroon, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

Ms. Bennett made a motion to approve a variance to allow the property to have an overall side setback of approximately 12 feet, 6 inches. Ms. Maroon seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bennett, Ms. Maroon. Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

Ms. Bennett made a motion to approve the design with the three conditions outlined by staff. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bennett, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

STANDARD CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (ST) 2009-35 An application for the issuance of a Standard Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 516 Alcazar Avenue, a contributing property within the “Alcazar Avenue Historic District,” legally described as Lot 8, Block 12, Coral Gables Section B, according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 111, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the installation of a new roof using clay “S” tiles.

Ms. Kautz presented the property with historic and current photographs, describing its history and features.

Hernando Davila, project architect, explained that the house had an existing rooftop air conditioning (A/C) unit that leaked for a long time and caused considerable interior damage. In order to replace the roof, the A/C unit and all duct work would also need to be replaced. He proposed relocating the A/C unit to the interior of the house and to repair leakage damage. He said the owner’s cost for the project included these repairs as well as roof replacement, and added that barrel tile was more expensive. He reported surveying the street and finding 37 houses with Spanish “S” tile and 17 with barrel tile.

Ms. MacIntyre invited other audience members to speak. Hearing no requests, the public hearing was closed.

Ms. Bennett reiterated that barrel tile roofs should be replaced only with barrel tile to retain existing historic fabric, and urged the Board to protect the historic district by denying the Spanish “S” tile request.

Ms. Bennett made a motion to deny the application for Spanish “S” tile.

Ms. Kautz presented a letter from neighbor William Campbell, who wrote in favor of the applicant’s request.

During a discussion between Ms. Meyers and the architect, Mr. Davila confirmed that the difference in cost between the Spanish “S” tile and barrel tile on this roof was \$2,000. Ms. Rolando pointed out the significance of the original architects of the house, Phineas Paist and Harold Stewart.

Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.

Mr. Santos pointed out to Mr. Davila that the remodeling of the house and A/C system added to the cost of the project, with the differential between the cost of the two different roof applications not being comparatively significant.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bennett, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-03 Continued An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 111 Florida Avenue, an empty parcel of land within the “Mac Farlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District,” legally described as Lot 3, Block 2-A, MacFarlane Homestead, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 81, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the construction of a new residence. This item was deferred from the Historic Preservation Board meeting of April 16, 2009.

Citing the similarity of this property to 114 and 116 Frow Avenue, and 114 Oak Avenue, it was decided that the four applications would be reviewed together. Ms. Kautz’s presentation showed existing and proposed elevations for each property as she described them.

Attorney Laura Russo, representing the Lola B. Walker Homeowners Association, reported that the applicant accepted suggestions made regarding architectural design as a result of productive meetings between Mr. Santos and Architect Burton Hersh. The four homes were displayed, showing original and revised designs.

Mr. Hersh thanked Mr. Santos for his contributions to the design of the homes, stating he was satisfied with the revisions. Thereafter, he reviewed in detail each of the properties. He said Building and Zoning was in process of studying drawings to determine if variances would be needed. He will return to the Board in June with final drawings and variance requests.

Discussion comments:

- Metal shingles are not in the budget.
- The horizontal stucco band will be carried around the side of the house.
- The simplicity of the flat roof needs a trim piece.
- The texture around the base needs to be changed
- This process was a good example of cooperation between a property owner and the Board that yielded a better result.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the plans for 111 Florida Avenue with the discussed modifications, including adding the band at the base around the perimeter, and adding detail to the carport. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bennett, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-04 Continued An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 114 Frow Avenue, an empty parcel of land within the “Mac Farlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District,” legally described as Lot 22, Block 2-A, MacFarlane Homestead, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 81, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the construction of a new residence. This item was deferred from the Historic Preservation Board meeting of April 16, 2009.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the plans for 114 Frow Avenue with the discussed modifications as conditioned in the previous application. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Bennett, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-05 Continued An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 116 Frow Avenue, an empty parcel of land within the “Mac Farlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District,” legally described as Lot 21, Block 2-A, MacFarlane Homestead, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 81, of the

Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the construction of a new residence. This item was deferred from the Historic Preservation Board meeting of April 16, 2009.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the plans for 116 Frow Avenue with the discussed modifications as conditioned in the previous application. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bennett, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-06 Continued An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 114 Oak Avenue, an empty parcel of land within the “Mac Farlane Homestead Subdivision Historic District,” legally described as Lot 21, Block 3-A, MacFarlane Homestead, as recorded in Plat Book 5, at Page 81, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the construction of a new residence. This item was deferred from the Historic Preservation Board meeting of April 16, 2009.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to approve the plans for 114 Oak Avenue with the discussed modifications as conditioned in the previous application. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Bennett, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

Ms. Kautz thanked Mr. Hersh and Mr. Santos for their collaborative design efforts.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-08 An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1235 North Greenway Drive, a non-contributing structure within the “Country Club of Coral Gables Historic District”, legally described as Lots 25 and 26, Block 4, Coral Gables Section “E”, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 13, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for alterations to the existing structure.

Ms. Kautz reported that when the district was designated, non-contributing structures were excluded. In May 2004, the Board reviewed non-contributing structures. Stating that the house was deemed non-contributing prior to 2004 because it had not met the 50-year benchmark when the district was designated, Ms. Kautz displayed current and historic photographs, described the history and architecture.

Architect Douglas Zargham conducted a PowerPoint presentation as he described proposed interior and exterior renovations and at-grade property improvements. He said the alterations would give the owner an improved visual relationship with the golf course, and said the Board of Architects approved the plans without exception.

With no further requests for audience comment, Ms. MacIntyre closed the public hearing.

Board and staff comments:

- Original plans for the property do not exist.
- Concern expressed about changing fenestrations, and modernization of the house. The proposed design detracts from the house and destroys its architectural design and charm.
- The proposed design is a disservice to the historic district.

Homeowner Bill Hilton addressed the Board, stating his love for the house and his desire to update and modernize it. He requested specific objections to the alterations, to which the Board made the following responses:

- The design removes from the house the elements that created the house, including changes in fenestration, the elliptical doorway, wrought iron “Juliet” balcony, muntins and shutters, destroying the Colonial design.
- The house should be restored to its original appearance.

- Historic components need to remain, including the front door fan light, shutters, window placements and sizes, fencing.

Debate between the homeowner and Board ensued, during which time Board members reiterated their earlier statements, and also considered whether or not the house should be deemed contributing in the district. It was suggested that the applicant consider Board recommendations, review plans, defer the application and return in June. In response to the owner's request, Ms. MacIntyre offered creative suggestions to maintain the appearance of the original design. The advantages of ad valorem tax benefits were also explained, along with the Board's willingness to work constructively with the applicant to reach a compromise.

Ms. Rolando made a motion to defer the application to the June 18 meeting. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Bennett, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-09 An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 1021 Alhambra Circle, a contributing structure within the "Alhambra Circle Historic District", legally described as Lots 15, 16 & E ½ of Lot 17, Block 3, Coral Gables Section "C", as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 26, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the construction of an addition and alterations to the existing structure.

During presentation of the property, Ms. Kautz relayed its history, architecture (Phineas Paist and Harold Stewart) as she reviewed current and historic photographs.

Architect Rafael Portuondo comprehensively reviewed the original house design, proposed alterations and renovations.

Ms. MacIntyre invited members of the audience to speak to the application. Hearing no requests, she closed the public hearing.

Ms. Kautz made two observations: 1) The original design of the front elevation had a series of arched openings. Staff recommended that the two arches be reintroduced to the house; 2) If the applicant restored the arched openings and made the porch into a dining room, they might want to keep the arches, though restoring the front two arches is more important. Ms. Kautz suggested that security bars not be added, and that the replication of the detail not be exactly the same, but minor modifications to differentiate from the original.

Mr. Portuondo discussed his reasons for not restoring original arches. In response to Ms. MacIntyre's comment that the front elevation appeared busy, Mr. Portuondo agreed to simplify the shutters.

Mr. Torre made a motion to approve the application with the removal of the wrought iron.

Ms. Meyers clarified whether or not the stucco banding around the windows was original.

Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

Mr. Portuondo and Mr. Santos engaged in discussion about differentiation of architectural detailing and the square windows. Ms. Meyers joined the discussion regarding the double arches, and Mr. Portuondo pointed out that they broke the rhythm of the overall architecture, stating that what made the original porch special was that it stood on its own; however, it no longer exists.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bennett, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE

2901 Ponce de Leon Boulevard: Ms. MacIntyre advised that the Board needed to provide input about this property from this Board's perspective. To refresh memory, Ms. Kautz reviewed pertinent facts covered during the February 4 meeting. After discussion of multiple issues, most of which were not part of the Board's purview, Board consensus was that a recommendation on this issue would not be appropriate.

Ms. Meyers made a motion to make no recommendation regarding the City's consideration of a purchase of 2901 Ponce de Leon Boulevard. Mr. Santos seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Bennett, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None. Abstention: Ms. Rolando.

Board Appointment: Resumes were received from seven qualified individuals for Board service. Although the Board considered Ms. Thomson's request to postpone this decision until she was also present, consensus was that the appointment process should be completed at this time. Names of nominees presented by Ms. Kautz and considered by the Board: Luis Jauregui, Mark Lutz, Luis O. Revuelta, Richard Heisenbottle, Manuel Gallardo, Michael Steffens, Juan Contijoch. Attributes of all candidates were reviewed and discussed.

Ms. Maroon made a motion to nominate Richard Heisenbottle to serve on the Historic Preservation Board. Ms. Meyers seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Bennett, Ms. Maroon, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

Mac Farlane District: Ms. Meyers reported that the Mac Farlane task force met and identified two exciting opportunities:

- A grant program by the National Trust for Historic Preservation, for which the task force will apply, with a June deadline. If awarded, the grant would provide enough funding to acquire properties in the district, which would then be restored for either re-sale or rental and create a revolving fund in the district.
- A group called Rebuilding Together rehabilitates homes for people already living in the homes, predominantly elderly people. This group expressed a willingness to select a few houses in the district for its next project, to occur next year.

Ms. Meyers reported drafting a resolution for Board consideration, intended to make the City Commission aware of the critical nature of the deterioration problem in the Mac Farlane District, and ask their support of the Board's efforts to bring funding and economic incentives to the process. The resolution seeks the Commission's endorsement of this effort.

Ms. Meyers added that staff would prepare the federal grant application, but needed a non-profit organization to serve as applicant (hopefully the Lola B. Walker Homeowners Association).

Ms. Rolando made a motion to submit the resolution to the City Commission. Ms. Bennett seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously by voice vote.

Preservation Education Series: On behalf of the Coral Gables Preservation Education Planning Group, which also includes Chris Rupp and Kendell Turner, Ms. MacIntyre distributed a proposal for a series of five educational workshops and requested Board review, input and resources. The proposed workshops will be held between October 1, 2009 and February 4, 2010, possibly to be funded by the Board's Trust Fund. The preliminary budget for all workshops is approximately \$1,000. The events will be held at various historic sites in the City. Ms. MacIntyre will notify Board members about future planning meetings. Ms. Rolando suggested adding a workshop about how to improve or enlarge Coral Gables' cottages without decimating them. Ms. Kautz advised that the book that addresses this issue is in process of being updated. Mr. Santos suggested workshops that address non-contributing houses within historically-designated districts. Each district has different typology of details and materials that should be made clear to citizens.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business to be discussed, the meeting adjourned at 8:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz

Historic Preservation Officer