

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, November 18, 2010, 4:00 p.m.
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	D	J	F	M	A	M	J	J	A	S	O	N	APPOINTED BY:
Dorothy Thomson	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
Margaret Rolando	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Ernesto Santos	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Maria Anderson
Venny Torre	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
Richard Heisenbottle	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	Historic Preservation Board
Deborah Tackett*					P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Manager
Gay Bondurant	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	E	E	P	P	P	City Commission
Judy Pruitt*							P	E	P	P	P	P	City Commission

STAFF:

Kara Kautz, Historic Resources Officer
Simone Chin, Historic Preservation Administrator
Betty Perez, Administrative Assistant

A = Absent

P = Present

E = Excused

*** = New Member**

^ = Resigned Member

RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

GUESTS: Joseph (B.J.) Batchelder, George E. Peon, Lyle D. Lieberman, Fernando Font, Betty Fleming, Irma Abella, Jorge Hernandez, Rafael Gomez, Viviana Rangel, Mark Gralia, Jose More.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Dolly MacIntyre at 4:05 p.m. A quorum was present.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Ms. MacIntyre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. She then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

MINUTES: MEETING OF OCTOBER 21, 2010:

Ms. Tackett made a motion to approve the minutes of the October 21, 2010 meeting. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Ms. Thomson made a motion to excuse the meeting absence of Mr. Heisenbottle. Ms. Bondurant seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

DEFERRAL/WITHDRAWN: Case File COA (SP) 2010-16: 832 South Greenway Drive is deferred. Case File COA (SP) 2010-18, 348 Miracle Mile is withdrawn.

Thursday, November 18, 2010

Continued

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan swore in audience members who planned to testify during the meeting.

LOCAL HISTORIC DESIGNATION:

CASE FILE LHD 2010-05:

Consideration of the local historic designation of the buildings currently on the University of Miami Main Campus (5665 Ponce de Leon Boulevard) referred to as "**Pentland Building #34B**," located at **1238 Dickinson Drive**, legally described as all of the "Apartment Building 34B (Pentland)" as now existing, laid out and in use, the same being a portion of Tract 5 of Amended Plat Portion of Main Campus University of Miami, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 46 at Page 81 of the Public Records of Dade County (now Miami-Dade County), Florida and "**La Gorce Building #35**," located at **1228 Dickinson Drive**, legally described as all of the "La Gorce – Building 35" as now existing, laid out and in use, the same being a portion of Tract 1 of Amended Plat Portion of Main Campus University of Miami, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 46 at Page 81 of the Public Records of Dade County (now Miami-Dade County), Florida.

As this report was similar to others recently presented, Ms. Kautz focused her review on the application's two buildings, describing their background, designation criteria and alterations. She relayed staff's recommendation for approval of the application based on history, culture and architecture.

Mr. Hernandez expressed appreciation to the Board and staff for their work and care regarding these applications.

There being no further audience comments, Ms. MacIntyre closed the public hearing. Ms. Pruitt requested installation of a permanent plaque that describes the history and importance of the buildings.

Ms. Tackett made a motion to approve local historic designation for the Pentland Building #34B, 1238 Dickinson Drive, and the La Gorce Building #35, 1228 Dickinson Drive. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2010-13 CONTINUED:

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **700 Alhambra Circle**, a contributing property within the "Alhambra Circle Historic District," legally described as Lots 16, 17, and 18, Block 23, Coral Gables Section "B," as recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 111, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the construction of an addition and alterations to the existing structure.

For reference, Ms. Kautz drew Board attention to this property's previous two and current submittals. She stated that the current submittal included two alternate designs for Board consideration.

Mr. Peon, project architect, displayed and described both plans, modifications intended to address Board concerns. Mr. Batchelder followed at the podium, emphasizing their efforts to accommodate Board concerns and also create a design acceptable to him and his wife. He stated their concerns as: 1) the setback gives the house a flat-looking "face;" 2) the design eliminates the east-facing windows; 3) when the addition is pushed back, it eliminates the possibility of matching the arch in the living room; 4) they prefer to have a natural stepdown onto the patio rather than eliminating any patio space.

There followed lengthy debate of the issues by all parties, including an in-depth review of alternatives and design suggestions to create an appropriate result. Agreement was finally reached.

Mr. Torre made a motion to accept the design of the addition with the following conditions: 1) the addition be pushed further back from the front property line a minimum of two (2) feet; 2) the “jog” connection located to the right of the tower entrance be extended to a minimum of four (4) feet – eight (8) inches; 3) the addition may be pushed over to the right by two (2) feet if needed; 4) the windows on the second floor of the addition to match the sizes of those found on the second floor of the existing structure; and 5) that the final version of the design return to the Historic Preservation Board. Ms. Bondurant seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Torre, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: Ms. Tackett, Mr. Santos.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2010-20 An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **528 Alcazar Avenue**, a local historic landmark, legally described as Lot 5, Block 12, Coral Gables Section “B,” as recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 111, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the installation of windows. This application is a result of a violation.

Ms. Kautz displayed property photographs as she relayed its history as a contributing structure within the Alcazar Historic District, adding that the proposal was approved by the Board of Architects on September 23, 2010. She then reviewed discrepancies between application requests and proposed drawings, pointing out that the windows and doors were installed without a permit. A lack of supporting documents prevented verification of previous window types. Original drawings were then reviewed, focusing on type and style differences. Ms. Kautz concluded by stating that without knowledge of windows that previously existed, staff requested they be replaced with casement units with dimensional muntins. She recommended denial of the application as presented.

Mr. Font, the homeowner, reported no knowledge that the home was designated historic when he purchased two years prior, and said he wanted to resolve all problems. He cited no knowledge of needing a permit to replace windows on the house, and said those present at the time of purchase were awning windows in very poor condition. His intention was to replace them with hurricane-proof windows and to add security to his home.

Discussion between Mr. Font, Board members and Ms. Kautz ensued. Comments from staff and Board members included the following:

- It was reasonable to assume that original windows on the house were casement.
- The windows installed were inappropriate for the historic home.
- A possible solution to part of the problem would be to apply muntins to all windows.
- A recommendation was made to install casements with a historic pattern in the front of the house, and to replace the sliding windows on the side of the garage.
- Egress requirements must be considered, with attention to the rear windows, which are single hung.
- Another solution was offered to install single casements divided into two.
- Windows on the second story front façade could be single casement with heavier muntins in the center and horizontals to match the original windows; those windows on the sides and back of the house could have applied muntins on single hung windows.
- Muntins were recommended for the side doors.
- When Mr. Font was purchasing the house, he should have been told it was within a historic district so he could be informed about restrictions and opportunities.
- Mr. Santos suggested that residential property histories be programmed for notification when they reach 50 years of age as commercial properties are when they reach 40 years of age.
- Applied muntins should be three-dimensional rather than flat.

Ms. Tackett made a motion to approve the windows with the following conditions: the front two second floor windows shall be replaced with single-leaf casement windows with applied muntins to match the historic configuration; on the ground floor elevation, apply muntins to the casement windows on either side of the clear fixed panes of glass, according to historic documentation; on side and rear elevation single

Thursday, November 18, 2010

Continued

hung windows, with the exception of the enclosed screened porch and the small bathroom windows, apply vertical mullions; the door of the screened porch may remain; muntins shall be applied to the side door according to historical configuration; the installed ringos, including sliders on the garage, may remain, but must comply and return to the Board for approval of any future replacements. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Torre, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Santos, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2008-20 Revised An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **10XX Cotorro Avenue**, a vacant parcel within the “French City Village Historic District”, legally described as Lot 3, Block 145, Revised Plat of Coral Gables Riviera Section Part Nine as recorded in Plat Book 28, at Page 29, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant received design approval for in-fill construction within the historic district and for variances from the Coral Gables “Zoning Code” for the front door facing, maximum allowable building height, maximum allowable floor area, and maximum allowable ground area coverage from the Historic Preservation Board on December 18, 2008. The applicant is requesting a revision to the previously-approved variance from the Coral Gables “Zoning Code” to exceed the allowable maximum allowable ground area coverage.

Ms. Kautz explained that this application was similar to that of 51343 Riviera Drive, as plans were approved, including input of neighbors. While this application was undergoing the zoning process, zoning officials identified that the maximum ground area coverage was not sufficient and would require a variance, even though the design and footprint did not change. One response received from a neighbor was positive.

Architect Hernandez, representing the owner, briefly reviewed the facts, adding that he didn’t submit any new drawings as nothing changed.

After hearing no requests for additional audience input, Ms. MacIntyre closed the public hearing.

Mr. Santos made a motion to approve the variance as requested. Ms. Bondurant seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Mr. Santos, Ms. Pruitt, Ms. Tackett, Mr. Torre, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

Historic Residential Properties: Ms. MacIntyre asked Board members to address the overall problem that surfaced during the Alcazar application wherein the homeowner did not know the property he purchased was historic. Invited to participate in the discussion, Mr. Hernandez reinforced the suggestion to implement a “flag” for residential properties in Coral Gables, such as the one that exists countywide for commercial properties when they reach 40 years of age. He urged the City to lead the initiative to create a program, suggested that real estate professionals who practice in Coral Gables could be registered, and indicated a desire to help move the project forward through resources available at the University of Miami and collaboration with the City. He volunteered to begin researching ways to address the problem in cooperation with the Board.

Board suggestions/comments:

- Title searches should reveal historically-designated properties.
- Workshops for realtors should be conducted to address these issues.
- Historic homeowners should have a publication that specifies all requirements, including notification to potential buyers of their properties. The brochure could also be accessible as a link on the City’s website.
- The Florida Association of Realtors could add historic designation to its contracts.
- Real estate brokers and agents complete continuing education requirements on a scheduled basis, an opportunity to include pertinent information about historic designation.

Coral Gables Historic Preservation Board Meeting Minutes

Thursday, November 18, 2010

Continued

Ms. MacIntyre and Ms. Kautz will begin to devise a plan of action and involve Mr. Hernandez in the process.

ITEMS FROM THE SECRETARY:

1044 Coral Way: Issues related to 1044 Coral Way were remanded by the City Commission back to the Board. However, the owners deferred and filed an appeal of the Commission's decision to remand with the court system. Ms. Kautz will request a written summary from the City Attorney for the next Board meeting.

Merrick House Gala: The November 12th event was a great success. The second floor of Merrick House was refurnished. The annual holiday open house will be held Saturday, December 11th from 2 to 5 p.m.

Board Elections: Board elections of Chair and Vice Chair will be held at the next Board meeting.

Next Board Meeting: Thursday, December 16, 2010, 4:00 p.m.

ADJOURNMENT: 6:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz
Historic Preservation Officer