

CORAL GABLES HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday, January 21, 2010, 4:00 p.m.
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, Florida

MEMBERS:	F#	F	M	A	M	J	J	A	S	O	N	D	J	APPOINTED BY:
Dorothy Thomson	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Mayor Donald D. Slesnick, II
Margaret Rolando*	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	Vice Mayor William H. Kerdyk, Jr.
Ernesto Santos	A	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Maria Anderson
Venny Torre*			P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Rafael "Ralph" Cabrera, Jr.
Dolly MacIntyre	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P-	P	P	P	P	P	Comm. Wayne "Chip" Withers
Richard Heisenbottle*							P	P	P	P	P	P	P	Historic Preservation Board
Joyce Meyers	A	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	E	P	City Manager
Gay Bondurant*						P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	City Commission
Sharon Langer*								P	E	P	P	P	E	City Commission

Meeting Notes: February 2009: Ms. Rolando recused herself from discussion of one application at the special February meeting, and two applications at the December meeting. August 2009: Ms. MacIntyre arrived at 6:53 p.m. and Ms. Meyers departed at 6:54 p.m.; November 2009: Mr. Santos arrived at 4:50 p.m.; December 2009: Mr. Torre arrived at 5:40 p.m., Mr. Santos and Ms. Bondurant departed at approximately 6:00 p.m.; January 2010: Mr. Heisenbottle left the meeting at 5:15 p.m.

STAFF:

Kara Kautz, Historical Resources Officer
Ricardo Herran, Historical Resources Assistant

A = Absent
P = Present
E = Excused
*** = New Member**
^ = Resigned Member
= Special Meeting

GUESTS: Michael Ellingwood, Juan C. David, David Maseda, Todd M. Traskos, Zeke Guilford, Mort Guilford, Tom Grabowski, Ken Clark, Carlos Mindreau, Martha Salazar-Blanco.

RECORDING SECRETARY/PREPARATION OF MINUTES: Nancy C. Morgan, Coral Gables Services, Inc.

The meeting was called to order by Chair Dolly MacIntyre at 4:04 p.m. A quorum was present.

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT and DISCLOSURE OF CONTEXT:

Ms. MacIntyre read for the record the statement regarding lobbyist registration and disclosure. She then stated that if any members of the board had any ex parte communication or contact regarding any cases being heard, it was necessary to disclose such communication or contact. Board members did not indicate that any such communication occurred.

MEETING ATTENDANCE:

Mr. Heisenbottle made a motion to excuse the absence of Ms. Langer for the January 2010 meeting. Ms. Bondurant seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

Ms. Thomson made a motion to excuse the absence of Ms. Meyers for the December 2009 meeting. Mr. Santos seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

MINUTES: MEETING OF DECEMBER 16, 2009:

Ms. Thomson made a motion to approve the minutes of the meeting of December 16, 2009 as written. Mr. Heisenbottle seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote.

DEFERRALS: None.

PUBLIC SWEARING IN: Nancy Morgan swore in audience members who planned to testify during the meeting.

SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-28 (Continued):

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **547 Aragon Avenue**, a local historic landmark, legally described as Lots 23 and 24, Block 10, Coral Gables Section "B," according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 5, Page 111, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for interior alterations, and the installment of windows and doors. This application is a result of a violation. This application was heard at the November 19, 2009 meeting of the Historic Preservation Board.

As the presentation shown at the November 2009 meeting was again displayed, Ms. Kautz stated that November minutes and drawings were also available for reference. She pointed out that the proposed 11 casement units with fixed transom and casement bottom were not installed, but physically at the property. Drawings submitted by the applicant of the current proposed window treatment were displayed and reviewed.

Architect Juan David testified that he applied the Board recommendations from the November meeting regarding the rear doors, and reviewed their design. He read a portion of a letter received by homeowner from Marvin Windows, which stated that Marvin Windows could not manufacture casements as recommended by the Board. He noted that other companies could manufacture the specific recommended windows; however, he said they were too expensive. He then presented a modification of the window design, and ended his presentation by stating that the Board of Architects (BOA) approved it.

Ms. Kautz advised that the current submittal before the Board was rejected by the BOA with comments, and pointed out the presence of City Architect Carlos Mindreau.

Homeowner Todd Traskos described his efforts to have the remaining 11 windows installed, adding that 44 windows were already installed and saying the issue was the size of the transom. He reviewed research, design options and costs quoted by other window manufacturers, ending with a description of his hybrid-solution choice. He sought Board leniency regarding the issue.

Mr. Maseda, a friend of Mr. Traskos, displayed photographs of termite-damaged original windows, and reiterated his November comment that neighbors were concerned about broken glass on the property.

Ms. MacIntyre invited other audience comments. Hearing no requests to speak, she closed the public hearing portion of the application and called for Board input.

Upon request, Mr. Mindreau provided the following input:

- The design of the 11 windows at issue was rejected by the BOA, with a request to generate a new approach to the windows that more closely resembled the originals.
- The proposed design of the 11 windows contained a slight fine tuning of the transom, but the effort was not deemed sufficient by the BOA and they would not approve it.
- The applicant did not eliminate the transom bar of the window behind the doors.

During questions and discussion that included most Board members, Mr. Mindreau and Ms. Kautz, the following testimony summary resulted:

- A few companies were found through staff research that could fabricate casement windows with an integral arch.
- Those manufacturers who could fabricate that type of window could do so as impact-resistant units.
- The key issue is the transom and how it differs in appearance from the original windows.
- Windows that can be manufactured to match the originals would be approved by the BOA.

With permission of the Board to re-open the public hearing, Mr. Traskos said the windows in his possession were a historically-accurate style, but not like the originals. Mr. David debated issues and again urged the Board to approve the compromise presented in the proposed design. Again, the public hearing was closed.

- The Board restated that the request was to approve windows purchased by the applicant without approval and without a permit. The issue is a problem created by the owner/applicant.
- Mr. Mindreau: When the owner met with the BOA, he was already in violation of applicable ordinances, had been red-tagged and stopped for doing work without a permit or a review by the BOA. There were several meetings with the owner, none of which were agreeable. During the last BOA meeting, in an effort to create a vocabulary that would allow the applicant to meet with the Board, the BOA approved the current design to unify the vocabulary of the house, but did so only to move the issue to the Historic Preservation Board for its review and decision. The owner/applicant was counseled not to order, purchase or install windows until he received Historic Preservation Board approval.
- For additional clarification of events and timelines, Ms. Kautz detailed the progression, reiterating that the applicant was clearly counseled not to order, purchase or install windows until the Historic Preservation Board reviewed the case, made its decision and a permit was issued.

Mr. Heisenbottle made a motion to reject the application in compliance with recommendations of staff and the Board of Architects because the applicant did not make any substantive changes to the solution for the subject eleven windows from the application presented at the November meeting. Additionally, staff demonstrated that window types/styles are available that would closely match the original windows. Ms. Rolando seconded the motion.

After discussion and clarification about past Board deliberations and decisions regarding windows, Mr. Torre asked Mr. Mindreau to share with the BOA the Board's recognition of the importance of fenestration to a house. Mr. Mindreau agreed that fenestration was a significantly important architectural element.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-31:

An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at **400 University Drive**, a local historic landmark, legally described as Lots 1 through 10, Block 119, Coral Gables Country Club Section 6, as recorded in Plat Book 20, at Page 1, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant requested design approval for the installation of signage. A variance will be required from Article 5, Division 19, Section 5-1904 of the Coral Gables "Zoning Code" to allow a wall mounted sign be installed below the minimum allowable height.

Ms. Kautz reviewed property history, displayed photographs of the façade shown as the proposed signage site, and stated the background of the requested variance. She reported that the BOA did not approve the original sign proposal, but did approve the current one, which she displayed and described. Ms. Kautz said the location did not conform with the minimum height required by the Zoning Code, but staff agreed with the BOA that the alternate sign location would detract from the architectural expression of the building. The proposed signage is in a similar location as the previous JCI signage, but the height of the letters is smaller. Ms. Kautz advised that staff recommended approval of the installation of the signage in the proposed location and the granting of a variance. She called Board attention to one e-mailed objection

received from Alicia Vidal who stated that a commercial sign should not appear in a residential area and would be a feature that would not benefit Coral Gables residents.

Zeke Guilford, representing 400 University LLC, presented and described the proposed signage and City processes that had preceded the meeting. He requested Board approval of the application and variance.

Ms. MacIntyre invited interested audience members to speak. Hearing no requests, she closed the public hearing portion of the application.

Mr. Santos discussed the option of a free standing sign with Mr. Guilford, Mr. Heisenbottle encouraged support of the variance, and Ms. Meyers indicated support with placement and size of the sign, but suggested its appearance be downplayed with neutral colors. Mr. Guilford pointed out that the design was the tenant's logo.

Ms. MacIntyre suggested that trees removed from the front of the building be replaced.

Mr. Heisenbottle made a motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the design of the signage. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Mr. Torre. Nays: Ms. Meyers, Ms. MacIntyre.

Mr. Heisenbottle made a motion to approve the variance due to the existence of unusual circumstances with the design of the building. Mr. Torre seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Mr. Heisenbottle, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None

CASE FILE COA (SP) 2009-30: An application for the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness for the property at 3010 De Soto Boulevard, a local historic landmark, legally described as Lots 1 to 4, Block 14, Coral Gables Country Club Section 1, as recorded in Plat Book 8, at Page 108, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida. The applicant is requesting design approval for the installation of signage. A variance will be required from Article 5, Division 19, Section 5-1904 of the Coral Gables "Zoning Code" to allow the signage to not meet the required setbacks for a freestanding directory sign.

As Ms. Kautz displayed photographs of the property and described its history, she explained that the variance was required because of the sign location. Drawings of the proposed sign were displayed and described as similar in size and location as the original. She relayed research about signage at other churches in the City, and said that most would not meet current Code requirements, but added that the proposed sign met all Code requirements with the exception of location which, if current Code were enforced, would place the sign in the middle of an ADA ramp. Ms. Kautz stated that staff recommended approval of the design and variance.

Mr. Ellingwood spoke briefly about the design, and requested support for the application. Mr. Clark also asked for Board support of the application.

Mr. Santos made a motion to approve the issuance of a Special Certificate of Appropriateness. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Torre, Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Meyers, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

Mr. Santos made a motion to approve the requested variance. Ms. Thomson seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: Mr. Santos, Ms. Rolando, Ms. Thomson, Ms. Bondurant, Ms. Meyers, Mr. Torre, Ms. MacIntyre. Nays: None.

BOARD ITEMS / CITY COMMISSION / CITY PROJECTS UPDATE:

County Club Prado Entrance: A ribbon-cutting dedication for the restored entrance will be held January 26, 2010. Details will be forwarded to Board members.

Green Market: Ms. MacIntyre asked for Board support and representation at the February 6, 2010 green market to be held during the Farmer's Market.

MacFarlane District Update: Ms. Kautz reported that County (OCED) housing funds are available for restorative work on some of the historic properties. She, along with the County Preservation Officer, Mr. Heisenbottle, various contractors and Peter Iglesias, toured houses eligible for restoration. Discussion is ongoing, and focused on specific properties, how to optimize use of the funds and apply them. Mr. Santos asked to be kept informed and involved.

Signage for Historic Districts: At the request of Ms. MacIntyre, Ms. Kautz will research issues related to signage identifying historic districts throughout the City.

Douglas Entrance: Ms. Kautz updated the Board about progress on the window replacement project at Douglas Entrance.

NEW BUSINESS:

City Hall Windows: Mr. Torre inquired about restoration of deteriorating City Hall windows. Ms. Kautz will find out if action is planned or underway to repair or replace them.

At the request of Board members, Ms. Kautz updated the medical recovery status of two Historical Resources Department staff members.

ADJOURNMENT: 5:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kara N. Kautz
Historic Preservation Officer