

MCHARRYASSOCIATES

March 28, 2016

City of Coral Gables
Public Works Department
2800 SW 72nd Avenue
Miami, Florida 33155
Phone 305-460-5017

Re: Citywide Roof Repairs – Invitation for Bid No. 2016.02LS
MCHA's Proposers' Bid Review and Award Recommendation

Dear Mr. Galeano

We have reviewed the three (3) bids received from your office via secure file transfer on 3/18 and offer the following:

We took into account each company's base bid for each of the projects and prepared a Bid Analysis worksheet (copy attached) which helped us compare their bids to our Statement of Probable Construction Cost and to confirm each bidder's understanding of the project scope and deviations from each other.

In general, the qualified bids came in 29% and 37% below MCHA's Statement of probable Construction Cost, last updated and issued on July 15, 2015 and below the published budget of approximately \$400,000. This can be attributed to higher unit prices used on our estimate as well current favorable economic and bidding conditions.

Another factor used in our ranking of the bids was each company's reported Experience Modification Rate (EMR) as an average over the last three years. On this account, Bidder # 3, Cunano Builders Corp. (who also happened to be the highest bidder) was immediately disqualified, as their reported EMR was found to be for a different company. We also note that while Bidder # 1 came in approximately \$41,000 below Bidder # 2, their Experience Modification Rate is slightly higher at 1.18.

Bidder	1	2	3
Name	A-1 Property Services Group	Precision Roofing Corp.	Cunano Builders
Bid Amount	\$ 384,406	\$ 342,966	\$ 485,628
EMR	1.0	1.18	N/A
Deductive Alternates ROR	100%	80%	N/A

Another criteria used was the 'rate of return' listed under the 'Deductive Alternates' Bid Category. In this respect, Bidder 1 offers 100% return, whereas Bidder 2 offers only 80%.

Based on the above if the City's intention is to award all projects to a single contractor, then we would recommend they go to Bidder # 2 (Precision Roofing Corp.), even though they hold a higher EMR.

However, if the City would like to award separate contracts, we would recommend the following award split:

Bidder Number	1	2
Bidder Name	A-1 Property Services Group	Precision Roofing Corp.
Biltmore Re-roofing – 427 Biltmore Way	X	
Granada Golf Course Maintenance Barn		X
Maintenance Facility Warehouses	X	
Salvadore Park Viewing Deck – 1120 Andalusia Ave		X
Girl Scouts – 3940 Granada Blvd.	X	

Respectfully submitted,



Javier Torres, AIA
Principal
M.C. Harry & Associates

Attachment: MCHA Bid Analysis Worksheet.