

**City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting**  
**Agenda Item I-1**  
**October 24, 2017**  
**City Commission Chambers**  
**405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL**

**City Commission**

**Mayor Raul Valdes-Fauli**  
**Vice Mayor Pat Keon**  
**Commissioner Vince Lago**  
**Commissioner Frank Quesada**  
**Commissioner Michael Mena**

**City Staff**

**City Manager, Cathy Swanson-Rivenbark**  
**Assistant City Manager, Peter Iglesias**  
**City Attorney, Craig E. Leen**  
**Deputy City Attorney, Miriam Ramos**  
**City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman**  
**Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia**  
**Parking Director, Kevin Kinney**

**Public Speaker(s)**

**Tim Haahs**  
**Henry Camejo**  
**Mark Trowbridge**

---

Agenda Item I-1 [0:00:00 p.m.]  
Presentation by the Parking Director regarding Public Parking and Centralized Valet.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright, City Manager items. Parking Director regarding public parking and centralized valet.

---

City Commission Meeting  
October 24, 2017  
Agenda Item I-1 - Presentation by the Parking Director regarding Public Parking and Centralized Valet.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: We have two beefy presentations for you. One is the -- how the downtown parking plan evolves and where centralized valet parking, where City would be the manager of all centralized valet parking, other than hotels in the downtown area. And then a second one is on Smart Parking. And the Parking director and consultants are ready to present those items.

Parking Director Kinney: If we could have the presentation come up. So, I brought with me two very bright people who are going to help us with a couple of parking issues, since today seems to be the parking day. But, before I brought them up to speak to you, I just wanted to give you kind of an overview. So, within the City's mission, this is the mission of the Parking Department. This is parking and transit. We want to manage our resources in a fair and efficient manner for businesses and residents, which is pretty simple, but we build on that with some very specific underlying principles. We start with the fact that parking and transit are service businesses. We are here to improve mobility and help people get where they want to go. That's a basic principle that we operate under. We prioritize parking -- the most important person for the City, for the downtown district, is the person that's coming to visit us for a couple of hours. So, everything we do, that individual is prioritized. We also, in our premium spaces, we encourage turnover, whether that's, you know, time limits, whether that's pricing, whatever we can do to encourage turnover, we will do. We also believe in a concept, park once. This is the reason why Parking is involved with the trolley. We're involved with supporting FreeBee. We're involved with making sure that downtown is walkable, because we want people to come and park, enjoy the district, and the only time they go back to their car is when they're leaving. We also believe in technology. We're going to have a presentation on Smart Parking later. But for the Parking Department, we've engaged in several technological improvements. We've got a ParkMe app that shows you where parking is available. We've got a trolley app that shows you where the trolley is. We use PayByPhone, we put new equipment in all the garages so they run more efficiently, and we've established an eCommerce link, so that people who do buy permits from us can go online and pay and get their permit. And then lastly, I would say demand based

pricing is a key tool that we use to manage parking. And, I did want to give one example of something that has been impacted and how these principles apply to it. This is a track of hourly parking within the garages since 2004-2005. When I first came to the City -- I'm sorry that it's not quite as legible as I would like -- but essentially, in 2004-2005, there was just over 200,000 people a year that visited who were hourly parkers in the garages. Last year, it was nearly 900,000. There were a number of things that happened or that we specifically took action that allowed this to happen. One is, we prioritized the visitors. So, we reduced the number of permits we sold in garages that were popular with short-term visitors. Some of them, we reduced the number of permits by 20 percent. We prioritized the visitor. For example, at the Miracle Theater, when I came, if you went to a show at the Miracle Theater, sometimes it took 40 minutes to an hour to get out of Garage 1, because there would be such a large line. So, we shifted that. We prepay so that at the end of the show, the gate goes up, everybody drives out.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And, the lesson also is that we need to update those garages.

Parking Director Kinney: Yes. That garage was built in 1960 with 1960 designs, and it's not an efficient facility. Also, the fact that we use, you know, Freebee. We are concerned with the cleanliness of the garages. We're concerned with walkability; all of those things make short-term parking in the garages more comfortable. And you know, we installed new equipment in the garages, so that it's easier to use. We have a ParkMe app that shows you where the spaces are available. So, applying the principles in this case was one of the reasons.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: And having working elevators.

Parking Director Kinney: They are being replaced this year, finally.

Commissioner Quesada: What is the ParkMe app? What did you say?

Parking Director Kinney: ParkMe. If you go on the City app, there's a little icon that says Find Parking. And when you click on that, it takes you to an app that shows you not just the City facilities, but all of the paid facilities in the CBD.

Commissioner Quesada: Oh, it just tells you the actual facilities.

Parking Director Kinney: And in our facilities, when you click on the garage, it'll tell you how many spaces are available. And, it also mentions that we're the cheapest option.

Commissioner Quesada: Got it.

Vice Mayor Keon: When was the Museum Garage built?

Parking Director Kinney: It was -- if you -- 2004-2005, that was the year before the Museum Garage opened. So, that first jump, that's the opening of the Museum Garage.

Vice Mayor Keon: Was the Museum Garage, okay.

Parking Director Kinney: The Museum Garage.

Vice Mayor Keon: And, we haven't added any other garages, public garages, since?

Parking Director Kinney: No. In fact, we removed one, but we did...

Vice Mayor Keon: Right.

Parking Director Kinney: Recapture public spaces because they were put into the Palace Garage.

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: We are talking, Commissioner, about Parking Garage 7, as a concept...

Vice Mayor Keon: Yeah.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: On Minorca.

Vice Mayor Keon: Yeah.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: By the Public Safety Building.

Vice Mayor Keon: That will be good.

Parking Director Kinney: Just some quick statistics. City of Coral Gables has 8,413 public spaces. This number changes every day, but this is the number of -- roughly the number of managed parking spaces we have. We have five publicly managed garages. We have 30 parking lots. Annually, we park in our facilities about seven -- over seven million vehicles. Of those 7 million, 2,3478,485 vehicles last year were parked using PayByPhone. And...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: There was a question that I believe Mayor had and possibly one of the other Commissioners about why are we removing pay by cell. We're pay by plate. So, it is their plate number that is registered that will allow them to...

Parking Director Kinney: Right. During the storm and with some of the new installations, there was some delay. We lost a lot of signs. So, the PayByPhone signs, they're still going to be there. And, every space on-street and short-term parking spaces in the lots...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I thought...

Parking Director Kinney: Will have PayByPhone.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I thought you had to identify the space in which you're parked for PayByPhone.

Vice Mayor Keon: No.

Parking Director Kinney: No, no, no. It's completely off of your license plate.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: So, the officer...

Vice Mayor Keon: South Miami does.

Parking Director Kinney: Enters your license plate and it'll tell you...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: Tell the officer whether you've paid.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Vice Mayor Keon: Right, but South Miami uses one that you have to put in the space number.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: You have to put in the space.

Parking Director Kinney: Put in the space number.

Vice Mayor Keon: But not here.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Vice Mayor Keon: Yes, but not the City of Coral Gables.

Parking Director Kinney: We're just by your license plate.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

Vice Mayor Keon: Right.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Good.

Parking Director Kinney: And with the 2,378,000, our anticipation is we will be well over two and a half million this year. And next year, we'll probably be close to 3 million. That's a number that is growing.

Commissioner Quesada: Do we still have the contract with the County?

Parking Director Kinney: For the enforcement?

Commissioner Quesada: For the enforcement.

Parking Director Kinney: Yes. There has been some conversations about bringing that in-house.

Commissioner Quesada: So, those conversations, I remember having them four or five years ago.

Parking Director Kinney: Yes.

Commissioner Quesada: And obviously, we haven't done anything about that. Because they charge us what, about sixty...

Parking Director Kinney: About...

Commissioner Quesada: Sixty-five percent...

Parking Director Kinney: A little over half of what we make on a normal parking citation goes to the County.

Commissioner Quesada: Did you hear that?

Parking Director Kinney: Citation goes to the County.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Commissioner Quesada: It's a contract that I've wanted to get out of for five years.

Commissioner Lago: And, I'm happy you're saying that because then that makes two of us, because I have been talking with Kevin...

Commissioner Quesada: So, the question becomes...

Commissioner Lago: For some time about that issue.

Commissioner Quesada: Can we handle that enforcement side without using the County?



Parking Director Kinney: There are systems that are essentially -- the biggest piece of that is with Legal. We have to draft our own parking code.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: And who...

Commissioner Quesada: (INAUDIBLE)

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: And is this with the Clerk of the Courts?

Parking Director Kinney: This is with the Clerk of Courts, so the Clerk of Courts is getting...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, you're taking the funding away from something you wanted to help, just so you know.

Parking Director Kinney: It's about \$1.2 million.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah, Commissioner, but -- and this is -- I had a meeting with the Manager the other day and we discussed this. But, there is also additional opportunities that come with this. For example, we take control of the downtown. I'm waiting for staff to bring forward a piece of legislation, which will deal -- and I've been working with the Chamber on this and Mark. I think we've probably been dealing with it for the past year or so, and we're very close to bringing forth an ordinance to address the concern of all these trucks that are parking throughout the City that are resulting in unnecessary congestion and it's an ADA nightmare. So, right now, when you go to them and you try to move them off the street, you give them an \$18 ticket and they don't move. So, what we're trying to do is find a different way to address this issue. And we would need to take control...

Parking Director Kinney: Essentially, what we could do, if we managed it ourselves, is we could set the fine for blocking a traffic lane at whatever number we thought was appropriate. With the County, it's the \$23. That's what the fine is.

Commissioner Lago: And another thing we discussed, too, just to give you a quick idea -- because we have this opportunity on the dais today -- you're fining the truck when you hit them with a \$23 ticket. Now, what we're looking at is potentially fining the individual who's driving, so they have to think twice to park in the middle of the street and cause all of this exorbitant congestion...

Commissioner Quesada: Good point.

Commissioner Lago: Instead of using -- but we've had several iterations that Mark can talk to you about, because at one point we were talking about even hitting or fining the business owner who's getting that delivery. Then we got away from that and said let's move it in a different direction. Let's fine the driver, so that they force them to use the alleys.

Commissioner Quesada: So, can you -- can -- Craig is out, but Cristina, can you -- or Miriam...

Vice Mayor Keon: Miriam's here.

Commissioner Quesada: She was hiding over there. Can you guys just take a look at that contract to see what parameters there are to be able to get out of it? Just so that -- in order -- I don't want to waste more time on this portion of the conversation without knowing whether we can even get out of it or not.

Deputy City Attorney Ramos: Of course. We'll look at it.

Commissioner Lago: But Miriam, you did look at this already, didn't you?

Parking Director Kinney: There's a 90-day out...

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Commissioner Quesada: Oh, okay.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: And other cities, Miami, and also, Miami Beach, are also evaluating that.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah. I think it was Cristina -- Cristina, were you the one that was -- Stephanie was the one that was working on it. She has all the information. And we've had -- I mean, how many meetings have we had to discuss this already?

Parking Director Kinney: Well, we've talked about it two ways.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Parking Director Kinney: One is a code violation in our own code that we -- Code Enforcement would use. The other is the concept of creating our own parking ordinance.

Commissioner Lago: Commissioner, I'm going to be bringing this ordinance pretty soon. I know it'll be comprehensive and it'll deal with the issues that you're talking about.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: I agree, but will you continue.

Parking Director Kinney: Okay, if we could go back. The last item I would just mention here is that it's important to note that currently this year that was just completed, 81 percent of our revenue was transferred to the City electronically. The reason that's important is ten years ago -- or not even ten, five years ago, we processed between 25 and 30 million coins every year. And that number -- I hope you're wondering, wow, it was an amazing process to see bags -- thousand-dollar bags of quarters, thousand-dollar bags of quarters and multiple trips back and forth to the armored car. And I was appreciative of that revenue, but that's not an efficient way to do revenue control. And with the new technology, the new systems, 81 percent of our revenue automatically shows up in our account. Now, there are still reconciliation and auditing functions that have to be done, but we don't have people carrying bags -- you know, 80-pound bags of quarters back and forth all over the place. So, I mentioned 8,400 spaces. Most of our spaces are within the boundaries of this map; Navarre on the north -- I think -- what would that be? Let me see what would that be -- Catalonia on the south, and Douglas and Le Jeune. The reason this map is really important is this is where the most intense use of our parking system is. One of the things we're specifically here to talk about is centralized valet. The map is a map we use and Economic Development uses, which shows our facilities, other facilities that are open to the public, and, you know, where they're located. It also shows the centralized valet stands, which, today, are only on Miracle Mile. But, one of the things that we're bringing forward -- and is the concept of -- from Giralda on the north to Valencia on the south, making that whole district a centralized program. Now, there's a few reasons we want to do that, and this is something...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: There's a huge what?

Parking Director Kinney: There's a few reasons we...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Oh, a few reasons. I'm sorry.

Parking Director Kinney: Want to do that. I will tell you that Javier and I have met with the BID and with the Chamber, and there is a draft scope of service to essentially put out an RFP to

request a vendor to do it, but we're looking at branding. We want that district to have a Coral Gables brand. As a parking operator, that's not my area of expertise, but the Chamber and the BID and the Economic Development folks that is their area of expertise, so we're looking at hiring a contractor who can help us create the brand we want. We want every customer that comes into the core to have a consistent customer experience. Right now -- on the next slide, you'll see we've had up to 27 different valet stands with 8 different vendors, most of whom are controlled by the restaurant, not by a central authority. We would like to see the valet as a concierge service, customer service training. That's been a consistent conversation we've had with the BID and the Chamber. We want it so that you can park any place in the district and pick up any place in the district. That works fairly well on the Mile, but it only works on the Mile right now. We like integration of technology. We're going to be talking about smart tech -- our Smart Parking in a minute. But here, we're talking about a cashless option for people that are using valet. Also, an online option so that as the person managing the system, the Parking Department, can see what's actually going on on the street live, real time access to operational data. Now, I'm just going to put up here a -- I'm going to ask Tim to come up and share some of the things he's looking at. But, these are essentially facts for the downtown district as Tim talks to you. We've had, like I said, up to 27 valet stands. There are two that are not going to be impacted by centralized valet. That would be the Colonnade and the Hyatt. We don't think we should get involved in hotel services. So, -- but everything else, we're looking at the potential of a centralized system. Right now, we have eight different operators. It would be nice to deal with one operator. Our downtown on-street occupancy, there's -- there are blocks where, essentially, we hit a hundred percent every day. But, just to be on the safe side, I'm saying it's greater than 90 percent downtown. We have more than a hundred restaurants. Right now, we have 70 parking spaces dedicated to valet. If we could reduce the number of valet stands by half, you know, we could recover 36 spaces and those would be open to the public.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yes. How much do they pay us when they park in our garages?

Parking Director Kinney: Right now, that fee has been waived because of the construction. They were paying about \$4,500 a month to store cars in the garage.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: For how many spaces?

Parking Director Kinney: Well, that gave them 50 access cards. So, the number of spaces was hard to track. Although, now with the new system, we do track every car that comes in. Then, lastly, I would just say right now...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Those changes also -- because we wanted to make for the Mile \$5, right, for valet?

Parking Director Kinney: Yes.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, we wanted to reduce the price for the customer. And in order to do that, we had to look at what was the valet company getting and the reduction on the -- in the garages.

Parking Director Kinney: So, we waived our fees so they could reduce the price. Right now, on the Mile, just in rough numbers, 60,000 cars a year are valet parked. If we're looking at the whole district, we're estimating somewhere around 130,000. But those are just some basic facts. And I think you've heard me talk enough, so Tim, I will say, when we first looked at this before construction started, we asked Tim to take a look at it. And, we're also asking him to tell us where the most appropriate locations for the future centralized stands are, although that's not really his intent today. But, he's going to kind of talk you through the process and some of his thoughts.

Tim Haahs: Good afternoon, everyone. I'll try and make my remarks brief. As Kevin mentioned, we did a study in 2014 looking at some of the valet issues. We looked at 13 different

locations. We took a Saturday night, between 7 pm and 9 pm to do our observations and counts, made some recommendations, including the City really should consider centralized valet. We were just out last Saturday night for the new study, same time period, 7 to 9 pm, about 14 different locations. I'm going to share with you some of my observations, because it really starts to shed some light on how centralized valet can really improve things for the BID area. Some of the observations included we had one valet stand that didn't have an attendant from 7 to 9, yet, it was open. Many valet stands only had one attendant, and they had anywhere from two to five parking spaces. So, you can imagine one person getting a car, driving to the garage, people are waiting, cars are stuck. We've got backup and we have congestion. Many high-end cars stayed parked in the valet parking spaces, leaving maybe one space available, so people wouldn't have a place to pull in to drop off, so cars stop on the roadway. People get out of the car in the roadway, instead of the parking stall for the valet.

Commissioner Lago: May I ask you a quick question?

Mr. Haahs: Sure.

Commissioner Lago: I know the answer, but I just want to make sure I memorialize it. Do you know why they're doing that? Do you know why there's high-end cars that are parking in front of very nice restaurants in reference to the valet?

Mr. Haahs: Well, I have my belief on why...

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Mr. Haahs: Things are happening, but I can't tell you exactly what's happening with the handshake with the valet attendant, but...

Commissioner Lago: No, no. I'm just...

Mr. Haahs: So, these are things that Kevin had just brought up that are a little hard to control when you have eight different valet operators (INAUDIBLE)...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: The reason is that with very high-end cars, the alternative is to park it in front of the restaurant or to drive around the block and look for parking, because they don't want to give it to the valet.

Commissioner Lago: That would be...

Vice Mayor Keon: Because they pay to have their car remain on the street...

Commissioner Lago: Yeah.

Vice Mayor Keon: More than just the valet fee.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: As opposed to driving around for God knows how long.

Commissioner Lago: Yeah, but also, the issue is, too, I mean, if you valet, sometimes like I've been before those valet stands, you're getting a ticket that seems like it's been used for the last six months. So, they're recycling the tickets over and over again, so that's happening a lot.

Mr. Haahs: Right. Some of the other things include the valet stands are being used for food pickup. And, one restaurant that has a valet stand on the alleyway is struggling with that and is actually using the valet stand on Ponce -- their attendant has to stop traffic on Ponce, so people can back out of the alley. So, these are some of the things we just need to clean up a little bit. One of the things we're going to be doing is helping to develop some of the guidelines for the centralized valet parking. One of the considerations from our previous study and we think makes a lot of sense is really no valet stands on Ponce de Leon Boulevard. The blocks are too short.



The traffic volume's higher, and it brings operational issues. I mentioned we're going to be recommending guidelines, not standards. So, we have an example right away. We've changed Giralda now, between Ponce and Galiano, and they need valet. So, we're going to need to have a valet stand on Ponce for that location, but it's going to take an extreme thing, like a street closure, to allow for something like that. Some other potential guidelines we'll develop are possibly no valet stands within a certain distance from an intersection. We want to provide valet stands at the near side of intersections, not the far side. When they're on the far side and they get congested, backs up into the intersection. That's an operational problem. Probably provide one valet stand per block, and maybe, even as we look at the east-west streets, alternating between the north side and the south side as we go from west to east. So, these are just some of the examples that we've been starting to kick around internally in my office. We haven't shared that with staff yet. We're going to be meeting with staff and going through some of that and getting some of their input as well. One of the things I think is important too is the City needs to remain a little bit flexible as we start this process. There's going to be a learning curve. There's areas -- if we looked at the study area, east-west blocks, there's potential for 20 valet stands, if we go one per block. Some of these blocks really don't need a valet -- a centralized valet stand. You have Valencia, between Ponce and Douglas, for instance. There's really no restaurants there. But in the future, we may need to add some. So, we're probably at the end of the process. We'll have 12 or 14 that we'll start with for centralized valet.

Vice Mayor Keon: Why -- how did you -- why did -- did you pick that -- the parameters of that, because it's the BID parameters? Is that why that area was picked from Valencia to Giralda?

Parking Director Kinney: That's where we have the intensity of the restaurants. I mean...

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: There was thought on my part because I know there's a valet on (INAUDIBLE), but when you get up to Alcazar, there's really not the intensity of use. So, I'm

not sure how we would put in centralized valet. Now, in the future, I do think this might be a model for other locations where we have something we could define as a district. But right now, there are no valet on Alhambra, so it just seemed like the logical outline because of the number of restaurants that are in that district.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

Vice Mayor Keon: Does -- what's the new restaurant on the corner of where the (INAUDIBLE) is?

Unidentified Speaker: Azucar.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Azucar.

Vice Mayor Keon: Azucar. They don't have a valet?

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, they do.

Vice Mayor Keon: Yeah, they do have a valet.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: But they have -- on Alcazar.

Vice Mayor Keon: It's -- no, it's not.

Parking Director Kinney: No, it's on Aragon.

Vice Mayor Keon: Aragon -- no, no, no, no.

Parking Director Kinney: Oh.

Vice Mayor Keon: It's above Aragon.

Parking Director Kinney: Alcazar, Alcazar.

Vice Mayor Keon: It's Alcazar.

Parking Director Kinney: You're right, you're right.

Vice Mayor Keon: It is on Alcazar.

Parking Director Kinney: You're right.

Vice Mayor Keon: That's why I didn't know why you, like, didn't go to Alhambra or whatever.

Parking Director Kinney: Well...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: It's very interesting, though, because that has a little hotel that's going on too.

Parking Director Kinney: Yes.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, that they could also have multiple (INAUDIBLE)...

Vice Mayor Keon: They could combine it.

Parking Director Kinney: They added...

Vice Mayor Keon: That's true.

Parking Director Kinney: A space to the hotel loading zone...

Vice Mayor Keon: Okay.

Parking Director Kinney: To do theirs.

Vice Mayor Keon: Right.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright, any questions? So, you're going to present to us a comprehensive study, right?

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: This will be a competitive RFP. We'll have an evaluation committee. We'll review it and we'll bring you the ranked recommendations for your direction. One valet parking company managing all of that, because so often you all get complaints from residents that their car was harmed, and it turns out that it wasn't through the BID valet. It was through a separate restaurant valet, and then all we can do is cajole. This way, we can remove.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: It's much better.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright. We have a person that wishes to speak. Henry Camejo, VIP Parking. Good morning.

Henry Camejo: Good morning.

Commissioner Lago: Good morning.

Mr. Camejo: So, I'm Henry Camejo. I'm here on behalf of VIP Parking. I just want to comment on the RFP process. VIP Parking handles 10 of 19 stations in central -- in downtown Coral Gables area. We've been providing our services since 2005, when we created the centralized valet with the BID. And in November of 2015, right before streetscape began, we sat down with the BID and the Parking Department to try to figure out a rate that would be -- that would incentivize customers to come during construction. Therefore, we decided to try a \$5 rate during the holiday period of 2015. We started in November and then touched base again in January. The Parking Department granted us a subsidy to try to make up for the \$3 we were losing per car at our previous rate, which was \$8 per vehicle. In January of 2015, we noticed that the \$5 rate was not self-sustainable. Our business was losing a lot of money and we were not going to be able to keep that up for the duration of the construction. It's been two years now, and at \$5 per car, we've parked about 120,000 cars, and we've lost about \$360,000 during the streetscape project. We are heavily subsidizing our own operation on Miracle Mile from our other accounts around the City of Miami. And, out of the 19 proposed stations for centralized valet that will be affected, 10 of them are ours. We are the biggest operator right now in downtown Coral Gables. The other nine are divided by five different companies. I just want to make it clear that I'm not against the RFP process. I'm not against this whole centralized valet system that wants to be implemented. I'm against the timing of the RFP. We have made this sacrifice during the past two years and done all these adjustments we have to try to accommodate City's requirements and City's requests in hopes of seeing the light at the end of the tunnel, you know, at the end of streetscape, reaping the benefits of the newly-renovated streets, which are Giralda and Miracle Mile. Those are both controlled by VIP Parking. What we are asking, we just would like to ask for a recuperation period for this time of loss of the past two years during streetscape charging our discounted rate and subsidizing our own operation with our own profits from different locations to make up for our loss during streetscape. Regardless, we look forward to competing in the RFP when the time comes, and we hope for a fair consideration.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, sir. Cathy. Any...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: No. We have no particular comments on...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Yeah, but it's not fair to ask him to subsidize our, you know, the...

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: So, sir, what I would like to do then is, with respect -- we had a very good meeting, talked about it in hopes that that would get -- we said one of the best ways that they can -- they actually wanted, as I believe, the first two years of the centralized parking reserved for them, because of their experience and their previous commitment. And, we had said the best way that you're going to get ranked and number one is to do a phenomenal job during this experience, so that your performance will show that. I believe when we look at comparisons and numbers, I think that -- and I say this with respect -- the Parking Department will have a different view of the amount that was adjusted, the value that the Parking Department had. I don't think this is the appropriate venue, but that we will develop a report for them to review for us together to comment and then present to the Commission. I think that's the best way of dealing with it, so that we have all apples to apples comparisons.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright.

City Attorney Leen: Also, you know, Mr. Mayor, these types of requests are really in the nature of a petition to you. In my view, they're not legal claims. Typically...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: No, no, no, they're not.

City Attorney Leen: The Commission has sovereign immunity so...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: It's a fairness claim.

City Attorney Leen: Yes. It's a claim to you, sort of equitable. The City has sovereign immunity for that, but you have the option to address that. Generally, though, if we're going to do anything like that, we would still want a release or things like that.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: Well, and I would say, with accuracy, the information that we would be able to provide would be helpful for you when you make your decision.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Alright. Thank you very much.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Commissioner Mena: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: We'll take a break for lunch, and we'll be back at 2.

Vice Mayor Keon: Can we -- yeah, I think Mark Trowbridge from the Chamber wanted to speak.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Oh, Mark, you wanted to say something?

Mark Trowbridge: I do. Thank you very much. Mark Trowbridge, with the Coral Gables Chamber of Commerce, 224 Catalonia Avenue. I just wanted to make two observations. I think the first is to Kevin's earlier point. We are very happy to be engaged and involved in this process, and we'll be very happy to help with some of the branding. I am not the biggest fan of centralized valet as a term. I think that's more of an internal term, and I think helping people realize they only have to park once and they could pick their car up anywhere, we have to come up with some way to do that. I also want to thank the City as well working with us. Kevin came out and met with all restaurateurs and has followed up with many of those that have valet stands. I think it's important for them to understand how it may affect them. You heard some of

the parameters that we're looking at in terms of location and shared. If you think about it right now, there's one block in the city that has five valet stands in it. And we, obviously, know the challenges that brings, and it's on a one-way street. So, I appreciate that outreach. It's going to be an education process, especially because we're going to cut the number of stands down. And, some long-standing businesses that have been used to that may not ultimately prevail. So -- while that's not the scope today, we're going to be engaged in that process as we go forward, so thank you very much and...

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Thank you, Mark.

Mr. Trowbridge: Appreciate it.

Commissioner Lago: Thank you.

Mayor Valdes-Fauli: Okay. We'll be back at 2 o'clock.