

City of Coral Gables City Commission Meeting
Agenda Item H-1
October 25, 2016
City Commission Chambers
405 Biltmore Way, Coral Gables, FL

City Commission

Mayor Jim Cason
Commissioner Pat Keon
Commissioner Vince Lago
Vice Mayor Frank Quesada
Commissioner Jeannett Slesnick

City Staff

City Manager, Cathy Swanson-Rivenbark
City Attorney, Craig E. Leen
City Clerk, Walter J. Foeman
Deputy City Clerk, Billy Urquia
Finance Director/Chief Procurement Officer Diana Gomez
Parking Director, Kevin Kinney

Public Speaker(s)

Agenda Item H-1 [12:59:25 p.m.]

A Resolution accepting the recommendation of the Chief Procurement Officer to award the Parking Cashiers, Attendants and Supervisors for City Parking Facilities contract to LAZ Florida Parking, LLC, in the amount of \$\$525,642 annually, for a three (3) year period with the option to renew for two (2) additional one (1) periods, pursuant to Request for Proposals (RFP) 2016.02MP and Section 2-828 of the Procurement Code entitled "Contract Award."

Mayor Cason: Let's move onto H-1.

City Manager Swanson-Rivenbark: We are going to have Diana Gomez, Finance Director, but also acting as the Chief Procurement Officer present this item, assisted by one of the evaluation committee members, who is also our Parking Director.

Finance Director Gomez: Good afternoon. This is a Resolution accepting the recommendation of the Chief Procurement Officer to award the Parking Cashiers, Attendants and Supervisors for City Parking Facilities contract to LAZ Florida Parking, LLC, in the amount of \$525,642 annually, for a three (3) year period, with the option to renew for two (2) additional one (1) periods. The purpose of this contract was to provide trained parking cashiers, attendants and supervisors for City Parking facilities operate a central monitoring system for the City's automated facilities on a 24-hour a day, 7-day a week basis, and the contract holder must be able to utilize the existing monitoring equipment, or supplemented at their own expense. This matter was originally heard on the July 26, 2016 City Commission Agenda, however, although no protest was filed, concerns were raised by one of the proposers and the item was pulled from the agenda. Pursuant to Section 2-768(h)(1)(b) of the Procurement Code, the City Manager recommended that the evaluation committee reconvene in order to consider more information, which also included the response prepared by the Chief Procurement Officer. On October 13, 2016, the evaluation committee reconvened to review the additional information, as well as discuss, evaluate, score, and rank each proposal. Following deliberations the evaluation committee unanimously approved a motion recommending award to LAZ Florida Parking, Inc. the top ranked firm. The Chief Procurement Officer and the Parking Department concur with the recommendation of the evaluation committee to award this contract to LAZ Florida Parking LLC.

Mayor Cason: City Clerk has there been any appeals, anything?

City Clerk Foeman: No Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Cason: No appeals?

City Clerk Foeman: No.

City Attorney Leen: They file them with the Clerk and the time period has past.

Mayor Cason: OK.

Vice Mayor Quesada: But they still raise some issues that I want to go through, I mean they reached out to me and I've spoken to staff and actually I had spoken to the City Manager prior to the first time this came on the agenda and I discussed with her the points that were raised to me. I think that was one of the reasons why it was pulled so that everyone could research and make sure everything was done properly. So I want you guys to address the three main points that they brought up, so we can just clarify everything.

Finance Director Gomez: So the first one is SP-Plus Parking stated that LAZ Parking submitted the form, failed to submit the acknowledgement forms of a third addendum to the RFP. The omission by LAZ of not acknowledging addendum 3 was viewed as a non-material and did not affect the contractor's ability to perform under the contract, or create any kind of advantage to LAZ, so the firm was allowed to cure this omission by acknowledging the addendum. It should be noted that SP-Plus was also allowed to cure their RFP response submitting their experience modification rating. So little things like that we do always allow to be cleared, as long as it doesn't affect their ability to contract or change their submission. Another issue that they raised was that LAZ Parking Project Manager does not meet the minimum requirements; the minimum requirements are three years of project management and like parking facilities and Procurement took the position that the Project Manager Carlos Morenco does meet the minimum qualifications, they have over four years' experience at the City of South Miami parking as well. The other issue that they had was that LAZ Parking failed to itemize the cost of remote monitoring; and just want to say that they did in fact put it...

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes, that was the biggest concern that I had because my concern, sorry to cut you off, my biggest concern was that essentially LAZ was saying that they are going to give remote monitoring for free, and I believe SP-Plus said they were fifty cents or fifty-five cents an hour, so I was upset because I wanted to see some clarity because it was unclear from the documentation that was presented to us. So that was my big issue.

Finance Director Gomez: And they included, what they did was they included it as part of; it was included in their hourly price for staff.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Which was confusing because then it makes it seem, well if we are going to be completely remote monitoring does that mean we are going to be paying hourly rates for someone to be sitting in an office ten states away, or who knows where it could be, while the entity that came in the second position will be charging fifty cents an hour, so it's a huge discrepancy from what I saw in the documentation.

Parking Director Kinney: So the price sheet had two lines; one said, was basically the hourly rate for staff, the second line was price for remote monitoring 24-hour, 7-days a week, and there was a price on both lines for SP-Plus. LAZ Parking gave a price for the hours, and then on the line for remote monitoring it said included. Now we did allow them to explain what they meant by included when the interviews occurred. It works in this case because our current business model we will never have a fully automated system. In fact, if we reduce the hours by more than, and I probably don't have the percentage exactly right, but 15 percent, then that triggers a renegotiation of the rate. So we are telling the proposers that you are guaranteed this number of

hours, so LAZ if they did their calculations, they said OK, and we can afford to embed the fee in the hourly rate because we know we are going to get this minimum number of hours.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Well the big issue there, at least for me is, we'll never be 100 percent remote there will always be at least an attendant on site.

Parking Director Kinney: Under this contract we will always have people in the garage.

Vice Mayor Quesada: And I think it's important for the Commissioners to understand this, because I had a conversation with them earlier this morning. You know those attendants are dealing with the cleanliness as well, which is a concern that we've had in the past – Museum Garage, we've had issues with that elevator being incredibly dirty, the stairwells not having the most pleasant odors present. So that's why, at least at this point my opinion going 100 percent remote monitoring would be a mistake for us, just because it's not for working the machine which is nice to have someone there, because if its broken, or it eats your card or whatever someone can be there relatively quickly to open it up, but also for the cleanliness aspect of it.

Mayor Cason: Or if somebody comes and says, hey by the way something is going on, somebody is up there...your car or whatever. I agree that it's – I've been in there the thing wouldn't take my card and cars were backed up behind, so it's nice to have somebody come and say here, let me fix it for you.

Parking Director Kinney: Our business model is to actually have somebody physically present in the garage at all times. Now you may have to push the intercom to have somebody come to your location, but there should be somebody physically present in the garage at all times.

Mayor Cason: So those are the three elements and I think there is something new that I thought was useful this time, which wasn't available the first time around which was a series of e-mails discussing the operational issues that say my ticket kept getting blown off or kept recurring.

Vice Mayor Quesada: You know those e-mails I noticed there was only for like one or two months.

Parking Director Kinney: We picked six months, we just copied the e-mails for a six month period.

Vice Mayor Quesada: So you are saying there are operational issues more than just those six months?

Parking Director Kinney: I can't tell you there were at least eight e-mails every six months, but this is a frequent thing. My Assistant Director has weekly meetings with Standard Parking where he discusses issues, but that six months was just a normal six months out of the....

Vice Mayor Quesada: It's a representative sample of the other six months.

Mayor Cason: And that wasn't even available to the committee the first round, this was just something you held off to the side. So you went back a second time and it was again reiterated unanimously.

Finance Director Gomez: So the committee did rescore the proposals and this time, well four of the committee members, there was only four and the first one was five, but then one person was not available to come back to the second time around, and all four of them scored LAZ Parking as number one.

Mayor Cason: Anymore discussion? Have a motion on H-1.

Commissioner Keon: You know what I'd like you to include in here, we talked about it yesterday the maintenance issue that you specifically include the stairwells please.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Do we have someone from LAZ here? I just want to be very clear, some of the concerns we've had with cleanliness. I hope you guys know what you are getting into in other words, so we are going to expect you to, we are going to hold you to a high standard for cleanliness, because we've had issues with certain smells coming from stairwells before you visit a restaurant and drop \$200-\$300, it's the last thing, it's the first impression, it's the last thing we want people coming in or leaving to have those, so I hope you guys are up to it.

Mr. Macedo: Absolutely. We operate 396 Alhambra and Gables Grand just two blocks from here, and please go by and see the facilities.

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes, but these garages are different because these garages are the more social garages for individuals.

Mr. Macedo: Understood. We operate garages on South Beach so we know exactly.

Mayor Cason: Please don't allow any bats to settle in the attic.

Commissioner Slesnick: I understand you were selected by the committee because they expected higher, better things from you and that you are going to maintain and start some new methods of patrolling the garages and keeping them clean, so we expect great things from you.

Mr. Macedo: Absolutely. We appreciate the opportunity and we won't let you down.

Mayor Cason: OK. Do we have a motion on H-1?

Vice Mayor Quesada: So moved.

Mayor Cason: Vice Mayor makes the motion – second?

Commissioner Keon: I'll second.

Mayor Cason: Commissioner Keon seconds – City Clerk.

Commissioner Lago: Yes

Vice Mayor Quesada: Yes

Commissioner Slesnick: Yes

Commissioner Keon: Yes

Mayor Cason: Yes

(Vote: 5-0)

Mayor Cason: Thank you.

Commissioner Keon: Can I ask one question of the Parking Director? I noticed on the lot behind the Miracle Theater that the person in the cage that's taking the money often has to get out to manually open the gate, and I know the gate going in also often doesn't work and somebody has to come over and manually have that gate raised also, are we fixing those things?

Parking Director Kinney: It is a very old system, its 20 years old now. We have a few years ago proposed replacing that equipment because we were looking at redevelopment of that site, there has been a couple of choices not to spend the money, however recently the Manager and I have had a conversation and we are looking at alternatives to do something until we tear the garage down.

Commissioner Keon: The traffic backs up onto Andalusia and then it backs up into the garage, because people – it takes a long time to get in and out of that garage.

Parking Director Kinney: One of the issues that's happening because of Streetscape is there is more traffic on Andalusia, so I can tell you from personal experience that we spend a lot of time over there between 2 o'clock and 3 o'clock on Wednesday, Thursday, Friday, because you can't get out onto Andalusia, and that's part of the problem, but the equipment could maybe not completely solve the problem, but it could be...

Commissioner Keon: Could improve it. OK Thank you.

Mayor Cason: Thank you.

[End: 1:12:14 p.m.]